

# **REPORT**

On results of external expert commission work on assessing degree programs compliance with specialized accreditation standards

5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - ECONOMICS 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - MANAGEMENT

ALMATY TECHNOLOGICAL UNIVERSITY December 19-21, 2018

# INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RANKING External expert commission

Addressed to the IAAR Accreditation Council



#### **REPORT**

On results of external expert commission work on assessing degree programs compliance with specialized accreditation standards

5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - ECONOMICS 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - MANAGEMENT

ALMATY TECHNOLOGICAL UNIVERSITY

**December 19-21, 2018** 

# **CONTENT**

CONTENT	2
LIST OF SIGNS AND ABBREVIATIONS	3
INTRODUCTION	4
(III) EDUCATION ORGANIZATION PRESENTATION	5
(IV) PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE DESCRIPTION	6
(V) EEC VISIT DESCRIPTION	14
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH ACCREDITATION SPECIALIZED STANDARDS	
6.1 STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAM MANAGEMENT"	
6.2 STANDARD "INFORMATION MANAGEMENT AND REPORTING"	21
6.3 STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAMS DEVELOPMENT AND APPROVAL"	
6.4 STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAMS REGULAR MONITORING AND PERIODIC ASSESSMENT"	26
6.5 STANDARD "STUDENT-CENTERED TRAINING, TEACHING AND PROGRESS MONITORING"	27
6.6 STANDARD "TRAINEES"	29
6.7 STANDARD "TEACHING STAFF"	31
6.8 STANDARD" EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND STUDENTS' SUPPORT SYSTEMS"	35
6.9 STANDARD "PUBLIC INFORMING"	38
6.10 STANDARD "INDIVIDUAL SPECIALTIES STABDARD"	39
(VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS / BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD	41
(VIII) REVIEW OF THE RECOMMENDATION ON QUALITY IMPROVEMENT FOR EACH	
STANDARDSTANDARD	
STANDARD	42
Appendix 1. Evaluation table "SPECIALIZED PROFILE PARAMETERS" (5B050600 -	
"Economics", 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 - "Management", 6M050700 - "Management"	') .45
Appendix 2. Evaluation table "SPECIALIZED PROFILE PARAMETERS" (6D050600 - "Econon	nv".
6D050700 - "Management")	
obootion interest in the second of the secon	Эт

#### LIST OF SIGNS AND ABBREVIATIONS

RK – Republic of Kazakhstan

MES RK – Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan

JSC – Joint stock company

ATU – Almaty Technological University

BD - basic disciplines (BD)
GRS - grade rating system
HE - higher education
BA - undergraduate studies

MA – MA course

PhD – doctoral candidacy institution
HEI – higher education institution
EEC – external expert commission

ACEA – academic progress external assessment

SAC – State Attestation commission SLA – State and Local Administration

DHPE —— Department of higher and postgraduate education

DET — Distance Educational Technology

ICT \_\_\_\_\_\_ information and communication technologies

IC – individual curriculum – State Education Standards

SPED – State program of education development

SMC – scientific and methodological committee

SRW – scientific and research work
NLA – normative and legislative acts
NQL – National qualifications limits
NQS – National qualification system

DP – degree program TS – teaching staff

CIS – Commonwealth of Independent States

JDP – joint degree programs

ECTS European credits transfer system

USHEM — Unitary system of higher education management

ESG – European standards and Guidelines

TMA RTMC — Teaching and Methodological Association of the Republican Teaching and

Methodological Council

OR – office-registrator

E&B – Economics and Business faculty

E&M – Economics and Management department

KEU – Kirghiz Economic University named after M.Ryskulbekov (Bishkek)
 REU – Russian Economic University named after G.V.Plekhanov (Moscow)

JD – Job description

IPAT – Institute of personnel advanced training

IPATR – Institute of personnel advanced training and retraining

RSL - Russian State Library

JDP - Joint degree program

MOOC - Mass open online courses

#### **INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with the order of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating No. 118-18-OD dated November 27, 2018, on December 19 -21, 2018 an External expert committee assessed the compliance of the university's activities with the requirements of the IAAR specialized accreditation standards (February 24, 2017, No. 10-17-OD, Fifth Edition).at the Almaty Technological University

The report of the External expert commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the compliance of the activities of the Almaty Technological University within the framework of specialized accreditation with the IAAR criteria, EEC recommendations for further improvement of the degree programs parameters and degree programs profile parameter.

The EEC members:

- 1. Chairman Yuri Nikolaevich Pak, Doctor of Technical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Educational and Methodological Association of Higher Education Institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan at Karaganda State Technical University (Karaganda);
- 2. Foreign expert Mikhail Anatolyevich Morozov, Doctor of Economics, Academician of the Russian Academy of Natural Sciences, Professor of the Russian New University and the Russian Economic University named after G.V.Plekhanov (Moscow);
- 3. Foreign expert Damira Kemelovna Omuralieva, Doctor of Economics, Professor, Rector of Naryn State University named after S. Naamatov (Naryn, Kyrgyz Republic);
- 4. National expert Ardak Nauryzbaevna Sakhanova, Doctor of Economics, Professor, Vice-Rector for Strategic Development of the Kazakh University of International Relations and World Languages named after Abylai Khan (Almaty);
- 5. National expert Maya Zhetkergenovna Arzayeva, associate professor, candidate of economic sciences, head of the finance department of the Higher School of Economics and Business of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi (Almaty);
- 6. National expert Dametken Medikhanovna Turekulova, Doctor of Economics, Professor of the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade (Astana);
- 7. National expert Zhanerke Nauryzbaevna Shaigozova, Ph.D., associate professor of the Kazakh National Pedagogical University named after Abai, member of the Artists' Union of the Republic of Kazakhstan, UNESCO expert on art education (Almaty);
- 8. National expert Zhamilya Shafkatovna Kydyrova, Ph.D., head of the department of management and marketing of the South Kazakhstan State University named after M.Auezov (Shymkent);
- 9. Employer Daulet Temirkhanuly Asylbekov, head of the department of analytics and program implementation of the Chamber of Entrepreneurs of Almaty (Almaty);
- 10. Student Assem Nurgalikyzy Amanbek, undergraduate student in DP "6M050900 Finance" of the Kainar Academy, member of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan (Almaty);
- 11. Student Zholdasbek Gani, 4-year student of the specialty 5B050600 "Economics" of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi (Almaty);
- 12. Student Zhadra Sanatkyzy Muratbekova, 3-year student of the specialty 5B042100 "Design" of the Kazakh National Academy of Arts named after T. Zhurgenev (Almaty);
- 13. Observer Timur Erbolatovich Kanapyanov, PhD, head of international projects and public relations of the IAAR (Astana).

#### (III) EDUCATION ORGANIZATION PRESENTATION

The history of the Almaty Technological University (ATU) began in 1957 with the establishment of the Alma-Ata branch of the All-Union Correspondence Institute of the Food Industry. By order of the Council of Ministers of the RSFSR in 1966, the Almaty branch was incorporated into the Dzhambul Technological Institute of Light and Food Industry. By the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 573, the Alma-Ata branch of the Dzhambul Technological Institute of Light and Food Industry was reorganized into the Almaty Institute of Technology (AIT). In 1999, by the Order of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 1192 "Almaty Technological Institute" was reorganized into the Almaty Technological University CC. In 2003, it was re-registered as a joint-stock company - Almaty Technological University JSC.

Almaty Technological University is one of the leading institutions of higher education in Kazakhstan and Central Asia, which has been training specialists and scientific personnel for the food, processing, textile and light industries, the service industry and hospitality for 60 years. ATU systematically implements the principles of the Bologna Declaration, works according to the global multi-level model of higher education concerning Bachelor- Master- PhD degree; the university actively integrates into the global educational space and becomes more recognizable in the world.

Since 2005, ATU has been observing the Quality Management System (QMS) certified for compliance with the requirements of ISO 9001 - 2008 international standards. The effectiveness of the ATU QMS is confirmed by independent audits conducted by the Russian Register Certification Association - a member of the IQNet international certification network.

In 2010, ATU signed the Great Charter of Universities (Magna Charta Universitatum). The university is entrusted to coordinate the EU FP-7 program in the country in the field of Food and Biotechnology; ATU is a collective member of the International Association of Universities; International Student Exchange Association; Club of Rectors of European Universities; International Bibliographic Society; Union of Eurasian Universities; the EdNet Consortium.

In order to increase openness (publicity), autonomy, as well as consolidation and social advancement of university graduates of all generations, the University has a Board of Trustees and an Alumni Association. The University Scientific and Methodological Council, the Scientific and Technical Council and the Disciplinary Council function on a regular basis.

The activity of ATU is highly appreciated by various international and national structures: The University is accredited by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IAQAE); it was awarded the international award in the nomination EUROPEAN QUALITY (European quality) and Gold medals of the International Foundation for Excellence in Business Practice (Switzerland) and the Industry Promotion Association (France).

In the international ranking of universities of the CIS and Baltic countries, compiled by the Quacquarelli Symonds consulting company (England) and the Interfax International Information Group (Russia), ATU is in the Top - 91+ rating and ranks 7th among the universities of Kazakhstan; in the ARES-2017 international ranking (Academic Ranking of the World Universities-European Standard) demonstrates the category BBB +: Reliable quality of teaching, research activities and demand for graduates by employers (Good quality performance); in the QS University Rankings: Eastern Europe & Central Asia 2016, the ATU is in the top 10 universities in Eastern Europe and Central Asia; one of 5 top best technical universities of Kazakhstan; in the national business rating of enterprises ATU is on the 2nd place among the universities of Kazakhstan in the category "Liquidity ratio". Annually, ATU profile degree programs occupy the first places in the National Academic Ratings of degrees.

Currently, the University carries out educational activities in 23 undergraduate specialties, 18 master's programs and 11 doctoral specialties. Training is carried out in Kazakh, Russian and English languages.

In 2018, the contingent enrollment for the university's degree programs in all forms and levels of education was 2182 people (including 1984 students of bachelor's programs, 158 – of master's

programs, and 40 students of doctoral programs).

The contingent of bachelor degree students on 01.10.2018 was 6744 people, including 1048 students of distance learning technology; 253 students of master's program and 78 students of doctoral degree programs.

The educational process is provided by the teaching staff, including 478 teachers: 443 are full-time teachers. The percentage of the University teachers with academic degrees and academic titles is 53.2%.

The university includes: the Faculty of Food Production, the Faculty of Light Industry and Design, the Faculty of Economics and Business, the Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology, the Faculty of Distance Learning, the Kazakhstan-Switzerland Institute of Tourism, Hotel and Catering Business, Technological and Economic College.

Educational activities on the following degree programs: bachelor and master degree programs 5B050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 - "Management", 6M050600 - "Economics", 6M0500700 - "Management" are conducted in accordance with the annex to the license for educational activities No. 0137401 dated February 3, 2010, issued on the basis of the order of the Chairman of the Monitoring Committee in the field of education and science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan of June 22, 2016 No. 618.

Doctoral degree programs 6D050700 - "Management", 6D050600 - "Economics" are carried out according to the annex to the license for educational activities No. 0137401 dated February 3, 2010, issued on the basis of the order of the Committee on the Control of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 02, 2010 No 924.

#### (IV) PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE DESCRIPTION

In accordance with the order of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, on May 11-13, 2014, an external expert committee assessed the compliance of the following degree programs 5B050600 - "Economics", 6M050600 - "Economics", 5M050700 - "Management", 6M050700 - "Management" with IAAR specialized accreditation standards (dated April 26, 2012 No. 08-ML, second edition).

On May 20, 2014, by the decision of the Accreditation Council DPs 5B050600 - "Economics", 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 - "Management", 6M050700 - "Management" were accredited for a 5 year period. However, Ds 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management" according to the decision of the Accreditation Council were not accredited due to the lack of students' contingent.

Previous EEC members:

- 1. Chairman Bayzhan Nurbaevich Ualkhanov, PhD., coach of the personnel reserve "Kasipkor Holding" (Astana);
- 2. Foreign expert Hans-Christian Brauweiler, professor of business administration, accounting and auditing, expert of the Foundation for International Accreditation of Business Administration Programs (Germany);
- 3. Foreign expert Elena Viktorovna Subbotina, PhD., associate professor of the department "Touroperating", professor of the Russian International Academy of Tourism (Moscow, Russia);
- 4. Expert Marina Aleksandrovna Skiba, Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, Head of the Quality Control Department of the Kazakhstan University of Economics named after T. Ryskulov (Almaty);
- 5. Expert Saule Savovetovna Sagintayeva, Doctor of Economics, Professor, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade (Astana);
- 6. Expert Nadezhda Ivleva, Ph.D., Associate Professor, Head of the Tourism and Service Department of the Kazakh Academy of Sport and Tourism (Almaty);
- 7. Expert Olga V. Lashkareva, Ph.D., Associate Professor, Head of the Economic Theory Department of the Eurasian National University named after L.N.Gumilyov (Astana);
  - 8. Employer Kairat Ukeev, Managing Director of Alfish LLP (Almaty);

- 9. Student Almas Karimovich Zholdasbayev, 2nd year student of Finance specialty KazNU named after Al-Farabi (Almaty);
- 10. Agency Observer Ayman Bekbolatovna Nurakhmetova, head of the Agency's information and analytical project (Astana).

According to the EEC evaluation results, the following recommendations were given to the University concerning the following DPs 5B050600 - "Economics", 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 - "Management", 6M050700 - "Management":

1. According to the Standard "Degree program management": - To carry out the revision of the DP development plan with the aim of activities specifying, forecasting the perspective dynamics of the formation of a contingent of students

On the basis of the "Methodological guidelines for the development of a degree program development plan" approved by the scientific and methodological council of the university dated May 6, 2015, the E & M department revised the forms of the development plan for DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management ", 5B051000 -" State and local administration"(minutes of meetings: departments - No 11 from 15.06.16, SMC E & B faculty - No 6 from 06.25.2015, SMS ATU - No 2 from 18.11.15, and also revised and again approved at the SMC of the Faculty of E & B in December 2018 in accordance with the updated A TU-UKiA-MR-7.5.1-2017-08 " Methodological guidelines for the development of DP development plans" from 01.11.2018.

- Analysis and forecasting of the perspective dynamics of the formation of students' contingent concerning DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management", 5B051000 - "State and local administration" were carried out in the sections of "Analytical substantiation of the program" in the subsection "Information about students", presentation of Development Plans for DPs 5B050600 - "Economics", 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 - "Management", 6M050700 - "Management", 5B051000 - "State and Local Administration" were carried out with the invitation of the university management, all departments, employers at the SMC meeting of Economics and Business Faculty.

- To disseminate in the academic community the experience of specific sectors orienting of the DP programs, implemented by the university

In order to disseminate in the academic community the experience of economics specific sectors orienting of the DP programs, implemented by the university, teachers of the "E & M" department took part in various seminars and scientific and practical conferences, carried out by different national universities and the CIS countries ones. The teaching staff published 18 scientific articles on topical issues concerning light and food industry of Kazakhstan.

- To conduct a series of panel discussions to disseminate the experience of systemic interaction with employers

In order to share the experience of system interaction with employers, a series of panel discussions was held: on May 18, 2015, together with the Chamber of Entrepreneurs of Almaty, a Panel discussion "Dual Learning. Experience. Problems. Prospects "with the participation of ATU partners; December 12, 2016 – a panel discussion concerning the discussion of the DP graduates model for "E & M" department with the participation of representatives of "Asia Agrofood" JSC, "Aksai nan" LLP, "Coca-Cola" LLP, faculty of the Caspian University, KazAdi named after Goncharov. The panel discussions were held with the participation of employers and representatives of other universities in March and April 2017.

- To specify and formalize the mechanism for DP risks identifying and managing The mechanism for DP risks identifying and managing is formalized and specified in the album of process information cards (ATU – Uki A – IKP – 5.3 / 9.3-2017-01, p. 62, 64), as well as in the Strategic Development Plan of Almaty Technological University for 2018-2021 years, as well as in the DP development plans. For each DP, a working group was formed from the teaching staff of the department, who conducted a SWOT analysis, compiled a risk register. The results of the analysis and the register of risks were discussed at the meeting of the Department No. 4 on November 25, 2015.

Measures on leveling of the negative impact of risks concerning the DP program implementation were developed and discussed at the meeting of the Department No. 5 of December 15, 2015

- Update the teaching staff incentive system aimed at personal development, professional improvement and strengthening the contribution to the development of the light and food industries and the tourism and hospitality industry

During the visit, the expert group made sure that for moral and material incentives for teachers in the ATU, there is a regulatory document ATU-PPD-7.5-2013-34 Regulations on the moral and material incentives for teachers and staff. This regulatory document provides a system for encouraging faculty for personal development and professional development. This document is supplemented by "On the rating system for assessing the activities of teaching staff, departments and faculties" dated September 27, 2018 (instead of the previously operating "Determining the professional rating of teaching staff from May 31, 2014). Due to the high professional rating at the end of the 2014-2015 academic year, extra charges were established for teachers Zh.S., Kirbetova and Zh.A Abutalipova. Senior lecturers S.E. Savelyeva and Baskanbayeva R.K. awarded with the ATU Letters of commendation due to the high professional achievements. In 2015-2016 academic year, a salary increase was established for the Ph.D. Associate Professor M.M. Sauranova due to the high professional rating; G.K. Dzholdasbaeva and A. O.Ospanova, S.E. Savelyeva and T.B.Baiakhmetov were awarded with the Letters of commendation due to the good achievements in the work.

- Consider the possibility of opening a dual educational programs in accredited specialties Contracts with enterprises for conducting practical classes in the 2016-2017 academic year have been concluded for the implementation of elements of the dual education system:
- 1) BostionTransLogictics LLP for the discipline "Strategic Management" for 10 master degree students of the specialty 6M050700 "Management" (training trajectory "Strategic Management"); -10 people;
- 2) Eclat-kz LLP for the discipline "Planning of activities in the social sphere" for 7 third year students of the specialty 5B050600 "Economics";
- 3) Asia-Agrofood JSC for the discipline "Personnel Management" for the specialty 5B050700 "Management" for 9 third year students;
- 4) Alatau district Akimat of Almaty concerning "Theory of public administration" for 20 third year students of the specialty "State and Local administration".
- During the professional standards development, specify the training outcomes and the DP graduate model for all levels

The teaching staff and employers participate in the development and management of the degree program. On the basis of the survey of employers for the desired competencies of graduates, the models of an economist graduate and a manager graduate have been specified. Models of graduates by level of study were reviewed at the fifth meeting of the "E&M" Department, held on December 24, 2015 with the participation of P.P. Shevchik, the director of "AsiaAgroFood" JSC, Bakhytzhan Kuanysh, a deputy Akim of Auezov district, N. Malimbetova, the director of Eslat LLP,. The models were approved taking into account the competencies offered by them. February 9, 2016, the administration extended meeting with the participation of industry associations was held. The matter of the discussion was the "Development of professional standards with the participation of employers". The meeting was attended by A.A. Zhaurgaliyeva, SPPC Vice-President, P.P. Shevchik, the director of "AsiaAgroFood" JSC and others. The following decision was made: to develop competencies in the specialties of the department together with employers, as well as to take part in the development of professional standards jointly with the industry associations of employers.

- Continue working with the professional community for professional standards developing and updating

In January 2016 the University management sent a letter to the NEU named after T. Ryskulov, asking to include prof. G.K. Dzholdasbaeva into the working group members for professional standards in "Economics" specialty for all levels of education. At the meeting of the TMA of RTMC, held on January 18, 2016 at the New Economic University

named after T.Ryskulov, the head of the "E&M" department Dzholdasbaeva G.K. took part in the session concerning "Economics" specialty. The matter of the creating a working group for professional standards development was considered.

- Analyze the possibility of opening a modular MBA program aimed at training managers for food, light industry and tourism and hospitality industry At the meeting of the Scientific and Methodological Council of the University, held on September 25, 2015, Protocol No. 1, the issue of preparing all necessary documents for the opening of MBA 6M052000 "Business Administration" was considered due to the graduates demand for this program. The package of documents was introduced into the licensing system of the DP MES RK on February 16, 2016. A motivated refusal was received from the State Institution "Committee for the Control of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan" dated 04/04/2016. Currently, the university plans to open this DP after the establishment of the DP register.
- To organize training courses for corporate clients together with the professional community ATU concluded the contracts for conducting advanced training courses with the following organizations: Food Master Trade LLP on April 6, 2016, Food Master-Shymkent LLP on December 18, 2014, APK Adal on November 23, 2015, KGKP Pavlodar Regional Museum (city of Pavlodar), Deloitte LLP, Ernst & Young LLP, Merkensky Cheese Plant LLP, Efes-Kazakhstan LLP, and so on .etc. In total, 10 contracts were concluded.
- "E&M" department together with the Institute of personnel professional training and retraining developed and approved the program of training courses at the meeting of the department; the program was also approved by the enterprises.

Professional training courses were conducted on the following topics: Planning and analysis of financial and economic activities of enterprise, Project Management, Enterprise Costs Management, Business communications manager, etc.

-- To intensify the activities of the Alumni Association, on a regular basis to conduct master classes for students at enterprises where graduates work

Thanks to close connections with the graduates in 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 academic years, the following results were achieved:

- excursions were organized and conducted for students of specialties 5B050600 "Economics", 5B050700 "Management", 5B051000 "State and local administration" and teaching staff of the department at specialized enterprises: HBC "Aksai" LLP (21.10.2014), "Coca-" Cola bottlers " LLP (February 18, 2014), Galan bottlers JSC (February 3, 2015), Obis Company LLP (October 14, 2015), Bakhus LLP (October 22, 2015), "Issyk" JSC (November 12, 2015), Chateau LLP (February 10, 2016), Kara Kemir LLP (March 28, 2016);
- participation of representatives of Eclat LLP companies, Makpal LLP, AsiaAgroFood JSC, GoldProdukt JSC, Obis Company LLP, representatives of Akimat of Alatau district in the ceremonial presentation of diplomas (25.06.2015) was ensured;

In order to activate the Alumni Association, graduates of the university held master classes at their places of work (Eclat LLP D. Rayymbekov, KurylysAkjol LLP A. Baskanbayeva, AsiaAgroFood G. Esengeldieva) etc.

- To increase the participation of employers in collective bodies of the university following employers were included collective bodies ATU: The in ATU Board of Trustees (2014-2015 academic year) – P.P. Shevchik, Director of AsiaAgroFood JSC; Scientific Board (2014-2015 academic year) - Chairman of the Board of Trustees R.G. Mnatsakanyan the Chairman of the Association of graduates of the ATU- D.G. Hovsepyan. Employers were included into the Teaching and Methodological Association of the National teaching and methodological council at ATU: R.R. Shaikenova, President of KTA and KagIR, V.K. Eroshkina, Director of the Association of Accountants and Auditors.

#### 1. On "Degree program specificity" Standard:

- To continue further harmonization of the content of the degree programs with the degree programs of the leading foreign and Kazakhstan universities

In order to harmonize the content of the degree programs with the DPs of the leading foreign and Kazakhstan universities, the following universities' working curricula were studied: KazNU named after Al-Farabi, Narhoz University, MSUPP, Moscow State University named after Lomonosov, KEU named after M.Ryskulbekov, REU named after G.V.Plekhanov; the analysis and comparison of the DP working curricula, developed by ATU Economics and Management department, were carried out concerning the working curricula of the universities, mentioned above. According to the results of the comparison and analysis, unclaimed and obsolete disciplines are excluded from the working curricula of specialties (Minutes of the meeting No. 5, December 24, 2015). Some new disciplines were included into the ATU working curricula: "Planning of activities in food and light industry enterprises", "Merchandising", "Business research", "Strategic and operational controlling", "Forecasting socio-economic development "," Strategic planning and budget processes in public administration "," Management of transnational companies ".

- Consider the possibility of creating joint degree programs in accredited specialties with foreign universities and attracting Kazakhstan research organizations to the educational process. Active work is carried out to develop international cooperation in the field of education, research, the exchange of the teaching staff and students, guest lectures, webinars, and panel discussions between ATU and KEU named after M. Ryskulbekov concerning the accredited specialties 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management" with DP of foreign universities as part of the bachelor's and master's programs.

In 2014-2015, 2015-2016 academic years 49 students of specialties 5B050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 - "Management", 5B051000 - "State and Local Administration" passed their training practice at KEU named after M. Ryskulbekov. A contract has been concluded and the JDP has been implemented since 2016 with the Russian Economic University named after G.V. Plekhanov.

- Consider the possibility of developing multilingual programs, continue the practice of guest lectures conducting

In order to implement multilingual programs, a step-by-step Action Plan for 2016-2020 has been developed (approved by the Rector of ATU, May 16, 2016). 9 teachers of the Economics and Management department were trained at various English language courses in the period of 2016-2017. 7 multilingual programs for the DP 6M050600 - "Economics" and 6M050700 - "Management" - "Modern strategic analysis", "Investment processes management", "Methodology of economic research" were developed in English.

Guest lectures for bachelor degree students, undergraduates and teaching staff of "Economics", "Management" and "State and local administration specialties" were conducted by scientists from: Zoltan Lackner, Corvinus University (Hungary); N.A. Kazakova, Doctor of Economics, Professor, Head of the Department of "Analysis of economic activity", the Russian Economic University named after G.V. Plekhanov.

- Consider the possibility of financing at the expense of the university funds for joint research of the teaching staff with universities-partners

The department of "Economics and Management" has concluded contracts for the implementation of scientific and research work at ATU expense ATU with KEU named after M. Ryskulbekov on the topic "Research of the educational services market of the CIS countries for the joint DP implementation" in the amount of 1800 thousand tenge. (Protocol No. 5, January 12, 2016) was approved at the meeting of the ATU Scientific Board and the Kazakh University of Technology and Business on the theme "Assessment of the innovative potential and development of the economy of the food industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan" in the amount of 1100 thousand tenge (Approved at the meeting of the ATU Scientific Board, Protocol No. 5, January 12, 2016). There are contracts, schedules and reports concerning the scientific and research work conducting.

- To intensify research in the field of teaching methods for the implementation of their own developments for DP academic disciplines

Systematic work is carried out on the introduction into the educational process of research results on the topic "Development of the socio-economic mechanism of sustainable development in the field of storage and processing of the agro-industrial complex of Kazakhstan". There are acts of

methodological research results implementation into the educational process (8 scientific monographs and scientific manuals).

- Expand the content of education taking into account globalization phenomena and the WTO upcoming entry

To expand the content of education, taking into account the globalization of the economy and the entry of Kazakhstan into the WTO, the following disciplines have been introduced into the ECC:

for DP 5B051000 - "State and local administration" - "Strategic planning of the national economy"; "Management of multinational companies".

for DP 5B050700 - "Management" - "World Economy", "International Business".

for DP 5B050600 - "Economics" - "International Marketing".

- To continue the work on introduction into the educational process the results of research carried out in the economy, light and food industries and tourism and hospitality industry

The result of the scientific research on the topic "Efficiency of white sugar production", conducted by Associate Professor of Economics and Management Department T.B. Bayahmetov, is used in the educational process to substantiate business plans for the discipline "Economics, organization and planning of production of food industry enterprises". The results of research on the topic of the thesis "Ensuring the competitiveness of light industry enterprises of the Republic of Kazakhstan" by S.E. Epanchintseva, PhD, is used for "Production Economics" discipline.

2. According to the "The teaching staff and teaching effectiveness" Standard: - Revise the DP development plans with the formation of personnel reserve and advanced training On the basis of the "Methodological guidelines for the development of a degree program development plan", approved by the scientific and methodological council of the University on May 6, 2015, the E&M department revised the forms of the development plan for DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management ", 5B051000 -" State and local administration "(minutes of meetings: departments - № 11, 15.06.16, SMC of "E&B" faculty № 6, 06.25.2015, SMS of ATU - № 2, 18.11.15, and also revised and reapproved at the SMC of "E&B" faculty meeting in December 2018 in accordance with the updated MI ATU-UKiA-MR-7.5.1-2017-08 "Methodological guidelines on the development of a DP development plans" dated 11/01/2018. Formation of personnel reserve and advanced training are reflected in the section "Analytical substantiation of the program" and in the section "Basic goals and objectives of a development plan with indications of terms and stages of its development; a forecast of the quantitative and qualitative composition of teaching staff until 2021, an internship at foreign universities taking into account the current dynamics and planned measures to improve the quality of the teaching staff.

The following teachers were trained on the target training were trained at in NEU named after T. Ryskulov: S.E. Epanchintseva, a senior lecturer, in doctoral studies in "Economics" and defended her doctoral thesis in 2014; senior teachers S.B. Kusainova and R.K. Baskanbaeva graduated from the magistracy in the field of "Economics and Management". The following teachers were included into the University teaching staff: K.B. Dauylbayev, a Doctor of Economics in 2015, B.K. Zharekeshev, a Doctor of Economics, in January 2015, in 2015, T.A. Taipov and E.M. Zholamanov, candidates of economic sciences, in January 2016 and February 2016 accordingly.

26 teachers were trained at the advanced training courses in 2014-2015 academic year; 27 teachers were trained in 2015-2016 academic year accordingly. - Revise and specify the form of the teaching staff individual plans, clarifying in it the execution tracking

Individual teaching staff plans were updated according to the "Rules of the educational process and practice" ATU-R-7.3.-2014-06-02-03 f.8.

In sections of the individual plan, such as educational, methodical, scientific, organizational, educational work, additional columns were introduced to track the duration of the planned type of work by the heads of departments.

Monthly and at the end of the semester, teachers fill in the columns on the implementation of the academic load for the month, semester and year in the specified forms; the department hands them to

the TM department. (F-7.1 / 7.3.-2014-06-02-02-08, F-7.1 / 7.3. -2014-06-02-02-09, F-7.1 / 7.3.-2014-06-02-02-10, F-7.1 / 7.3.-2014-06-02-02-11)

An individual teaching staff plan is monitored twice during the academic year:

- educational work by the head of the MD,
- educational and methodological work by the head of MD;
- scientific and research work by the head of the SRD;
- organizational and methodological work by the head of the department;
- educational and professional work by the vice-rector for EW;
- professional development by the director of the Institute of personnel advanced training and retraining.

A brief report is formed on the implementation of the individual plan for the academic year, indicating the reasons for non-fulfillment or partial implementation of the work assigned to teachers in the fall / spring semester. At the meeting, the department listens and discusses the report of the faculty on the implementation of the working plan for the first, second semester and for the entire academic year.

- Develop and implement a long-term plan for the development of academic mobility of teaching staff with foreign universities that are in the top 500 QS rankings

The department "E & M" developed a plan for the development of incoming and outgoing academic mobility of faculty for the period 2016-2018.

In terms of the development of EP in the framework of academic mobility of faculty, guest lectures are planned in foreign universities from 2018-2021. In order to develop international cooperation in the field of education and research, the exchange of teaching staff and students, negotiations are underway with Novosibirsk State University (NSU), which is in the top 500 QS rankings.

In September of 2016-2017 academic year within the framework of academic mobility, a course of lectures was conducted by L.D. Skopina, an associate professor of the department, "Application of economic and mathematical methods in economics" in the amount of 2 credits.

- To ensure the development of multilingual competence of teaching staff of accredited degree programs, including the certification of knowledge (IETLS, TOEFL, TESTDAF)

In order to implement multilingual programs, a step-by-step Action Plan for 2016-2020 has been developed (approved by the Rector of ATU on May 16, 2016). A Plan for a phased transition to a trilingual study of disciplines on educational levels in the context of the degree programs for 2016-2020 academic years was compiled, which was discussed and approved at a meeting of the Department of Economics and Management on May 29, 2016, protocol No. 10.

In order to ensure the quality of teaching staff, to involve well-known scientists and public figures, as well as experienced practitioners in the implementation of DPs. The practice of attracting well-known scientists, public figures and experienced practitioners to the educational process is being implemented (B.L. Syzdykov - Chairman of the Audit Commission of Almaty, P.P. Shevchik - Doctor of Economics, Director of AziaAgroFood JSC, Kh. B. Zharekeshev - Doctor of Economics, Professor, have many years of experience in a research institute, etc.)

- Create and implement programs for the young teachers development

The department, together with the Institute of personnel advanced training and retraining at ATU, developed a program for the young teachers development, organized advanced training courses at the Young Scientists School (YSS) in the disciplines of "Pedagogy", "Psychology", "Methods of Scientific Research", as well as at other universities and companies (I.P. Yuldasheva Z.K. PHP Coompany, (Uf); ADALKYZMETGROUP LLP, TJDTRANING CONSULTING, "Knowledge" Scientific and research center, (Kharkov). 30 young teachers were trained during the period of 2014-2017.

- On a systematic basis, organize training programs for faculty members at enterprises of relevant industries

The department works on a systematic basis on organizing internships for faculty members at light, food and hotel industries. Internship plans for teaching staff of the department was completed. 21

teachers of the Economics and Management department were trained during the reporting period at ATU partner enterprises.

#### 3. According to the "Trainees" Standard:

- Create a program of student's academic mobility development, with the aim of ensuring external and internal mobility to recognized Kazakhstani and foreign universities

In order to ensure the external and internal academic mobility of students and faculty, the University has developed a program for the development of academic mobility of the Almaty Technological University for 2015-2020. ATU-PSP-4.2.3-2015-02-02-01, August 25, 2015, approved by T.K. Kulazhanov, the Rector of ATU. On the basis of the University's academic mobility development program, a Working Plan for the Department of Economics and Management for the 2015-2016 academic year was developed; the 4<sup>th</sup> paragraph covers the international activities (minutes of the department meeting No. 11, June 15, 2015). 86 students were trained within the framework of external and internal academic mobility (Eotvosh Jozhef University (Hungary), Kazakhstan University of Technology and Business (Astana), Kyrgyz Economic University named after M.Ryskulbekov).

- Consider the possibility of attracting financial resources from employers and participating in foreign programs supporting academic mobility of students at recognized universities. The possibility of financing at the expense of employers' funds and participation in foreign support programs for expanding academic mobility of students at recognized universities was considered at the meeting of the Department of Economics and Management (Minutes No. 7 dated February 20, 2016), discussed and recommended for consideration at a meeting of the Board of Trustees (Protocol number 2 dated February 25, 2016). The "Economics and Management" department sent the letters, asking for students' academic mobility of supporting to the following employers: Ms. A.A. Abdikadirova, General Director of Becker and K LLP, K.A. Usipbekov, Director of ECLAT-KZ LLP, A.S. Zenkov, Chairman of the Management Board of RAHAT JSC, P.G. Selivanov, General Director of Maslodel LLP.

## - Develop support programs for gifted students

The ATU has developed a Social Package for students of ATU and technological and economic college, approved by the Rector on August 25, 2015. Section 14 "Encouraging students" provides for awards for participation in international competitions (from 30 to 60 thousand tenge); in international, republican scientific and practical conferences, and subject Olympiads of students and undergraduates (from 10 to 20 thousand tenge), in competitions for the best scientific work, discoveries, inventions of students and "Zhas Galym" undergraduates (from 5 to 20 thousand tenge, diplomas and awards). For participation in the Students Olympic Games during the period of study at the university, an educational grant of the rector is awarded. According to the results of participation in the competition "Grant for support of young scientists of ATU", the Rector's grant was awarded to student A.I. Matibayeva (scientific supervisor G.K. Dzholdasbaeva) - Protocol No. 1, December 25, 2015 of the meetings of the commission on summarizing the competition for the support of ATU young scientists.

- Include in the catalog the elective disciplines in English and ensure their study by students For DPs 6M050600 "Economics" and 6M050700 "Management", the elective discipline catalog includes the following disciplines in English: Modern Strategic Analysis, Investment processes, Methodology of economic research.

# 3. According to the "Resources Available for Degree Programs" Standard:

- To continue the acquisition of software similar to that used in the financial sector of the economy (Tax Committee)

The Economics and Management Department purchased and installed the following software: ProjectExpert, ProjectAudit, "Business Management", "CRM System", "Project Management", "Polygraphy Program", Information and legal support - subscription service of the "Law" database.

- continue to provide educational literature by foreign authors reflecting modern global trends in the management and economics of light and food industries and the tourism and hospitality industry, as well as their regulation at the state and local levels

The educational foreign authors' literature, reflecting modern global trends in the management and economics of the light and food industry and the tourism and hospitality industry, as well as their regulation at the state and local levels, has been acquired by Economics and Management. ATU Scientific library concluded agreements with Russian electronic resource bases (ELS "Lan", ELS "Znanium", ELS "IPRbooks", Polpred.com Media Review, etc.

Along with the library information program "MARK-SQL", the ATU library contains subscriptions to the ShprigerLink, Thomson Routers, Elzevier, Impact Factor databases, Polpred.

Cluster 1 conclusions. According to the degree programs 5B050600 - "Economics", 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 - "Management", 6M050700 - "Management" from 32 recommendations are fully implemented 27 and 5 recommendations suggest improvement. During the visit, experts analyzed the recommendations fulfilled by the University. The report of the expert group on assessing the implementation of the recommendations of the EEC of the IAAR, made according to the results of specialized accreditation at the ATU on May 31 -1 June 2016, was also studied. According to the results of the accreditation procedure of the cluster 5B050600 - "Economics", 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 - "Management", 6M050700 - "Management", an external expert commission made recommendations on how to improve the quality of training bachelor degree students and undergraduates' studies students in the specialties of the cluster.

In order to fulfill these recommendations, an action plan was developed for their implementation, approved at a meeting of the Department of Economics and Management (Minutes No. 11 dated 06.16.2014), and at a meeting of the SMC of Economics and Management Faculty (Minutes No. 11 dated 06.27.2014).

The results of the implementation were reflected in the Report on the implementation of EEC recommendations submitted to the IAAR on time. During the visit, the expert group made sure that, in general, the ATU cluster indicated fully implemented the planned activities in accordance with the working plan for the implementation of the recommendations. The development plan forms of these DPs were revised, a number of panel discussions were held to share the experience of interaction with employers; contracts were concluded for conducting advanced training courses between ATU and Food Master Trade LLP from April 6, 2016, Food Master-Shymkent LLP from December 12, 2014, APC "Adal" dated November 23, 2015, State Enterprise of the Pavlodar Regional Museum (Pavlodar), Deloitte LLP, Ernst & Young LLP, Merken Cheese Plant LLP, Efes-Kazakhstan LLP, etc. (10 contracts).

Teaching staff individual plans were updated according to the "Rules of the educational process and practice" ATU-R-7.3.-2014-06-02-03 f.8. 7 multilingual programs for DPs 6M050600 - "Economics" and 6M050700 - "Management" were developed in English. In order to ensure the external and internal academic mobility of students and faculty, the University has developed a program for the development of academic mobility of the Almaty Technological University for 2015-2020.

It is important to note that most of the positions are fully implemented by the University, some recommendations are at the implementation stage, some are also reflected in the proposals of the external expert commission from December 19 to 21, 2018, that is, they are similar to those given in 2014, and so, they are considered partially fulfilled.

#### (V) EEC VISIT DESCRIPTION

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the approved Program of the visit of the expert committee on specialized accreditation of degree programs of the Almaty Technological University from December 19 to 21, 2018. In order to coordinate the EEC work, on December 18, 2018, an introductory meeting was held, during which powers were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods. In accordance with the requirements of the standards, the program of the visit covered meetings with the acting Rector, Vice-Rectors, heads of structural divisions, deans, heads of university departments, teachers, students, graduates,

employers and employees from structural departments, as well as interviewing and questioning teachers and students. 99 representatives took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 – Information about personnel and trainees, who took part in the meetings with EEC IAAR

Participants category	Number
FIRST VICE-RECTOR(ACTING RECTOR)	1
Vice - Rector	4
Heads of the structural subdivisions	24
Heads of the departments	4
Teachers	15
Students, master and doctoral degree students	38
Graduates	7
Employers	6
Total	99

A visual inspection was conducted in order to obtain a general idea of the organization of educational, scientific and methodological processes, material and technical base, determination of its compliance with standards, as well as for contacts with students and employees at their workplaces. The experts carried out an inspection of departments, departments and centers, science department, library, Technopark, Scientific laboratory, sports facilities, etc. during the inspection the experts were familiarized with the activities of the Food Industry Technopark, which is equipped with modern production equipment, providing complete technological cycle from the raw material to the production. The Technopark consists of the Training and Scientific Bread Center, the Training and Scientific Pasta Center, the Training and Scientific Mixed Feed Center, and the Training and Scientific center of fermentation productions.

On the basis of scientific centers, students of DPs5B050600 / 6M050600 / 6D050600 - "Economics", OP 5B050700 / 5M050700 / 6D050700 - "Management" acquire practical skills and abilities, as well as implement the results of scientific research in the process of graduation theses, master's theses, master and doctoral studies scientific and research works.

To enhance the practical training of students, the following disciplines are conducted: "Economic analysis of the activities of food and light industry enterprises", "Planning of activities at food and light industry enterprises", and so on. Student, trained on the Technopark base develop business plans for new technologies, new products, innovative projects offered by professors, leading teachers in the field of food production technology of ATU, calculate production costs, conduct various types of analysis using modern tools to develop a technology park development strategy.

During the excursion, the EEC members got known the condition of the material and technical base, visited the training bases of DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 / 6D050600 - "Economics" and 5B050700 / 6M050700 / 6D050700 - "Management":

№501 - economics and management training center, equipped with a stationary projector, interactive board, computer programs "Project Expert", "Production Management", "Cost Calculation", "Business Management", "CRM System", "Polygraphy", "Management projects ";

№ 504 - Laboratory of Active Teaching Methods, equipped with a stationary projector, interactive board, personal computers in which the licensed computer programs "Project Expert", "Production Management", "Cost Calculation", "Business Management", and "CRM System" for training the trainees' practical skills in business plans developing, product pricing calculating, raw materials stocks and finished products management, using software products and the latest software;

No. 514 - economics and management training center, equipped with a stationary projector and an interactive whiteboard;

№405, 407 - training rooms for economics and management, equipped with projectors, laptops. On December 20, 2018, the EEC members visited the examination on the subject "Enterprise

Economics" for 3rd year students of group 5B050600 - "Economics" -16-2, which was held in room  $N_{2}$  504-1. All 10 students of the group were present at the examination. The examiner was M.T. Baymoldayeva, a candidate of economic sciences, Associate Professor.

Examination questions on the discipline were prepared by A.R. Urkumbayeva, a lecturer; the questions were approved at the "Economics and Management" Department meeting, Protocol No. 3 dated October 26, 2018. The questions were posted in the AIS "Univer"; then examination cards were generated in the system in an automated mode. Before the examinations, M.T. Baymoldaeva, the examiner, received an examination sheet at the OR and examination cards at the E&B Dean's Office. The examinations started at 12.00, according to the schedule. All examinations procedures were carried out. The examinations questions content corresponded to the standard program and allowed assessing the results of training, as well as skills, abilities and competencies in this discipline. As a result of the examinations, students received the following grades: 2 students - (B +) 89 and 88 points, 1 student - (B) 80, 1 student - (B-) 77, 2 students - (C) 68 and 66 points, 2 student - (C -) 63 and 62 points, 1 student - (D +) 55.

On December 20, 2018, the EEC members attended the examinations on the subject "Business Planning of Innovative Projects" for undergraduates of the scientific and pedagogical direction of the 2nd course of the group 5M050700 - "Management", which was held in the room No. 408-1. All 5 students of the group were present at the examination. A.R.Urkumbayeva, a candidate of economic sciences, Associate Professor, examined the group.

The examinations questions on the discipline were prepared by A.T Baktgereyeva, a lecturer, and were approved at the meeting of the Department of Economics and Management; Minutes No. 3 dated October 26, 2018. The questions were posted the AIS Univer. Examination cards were generated automatically in the system. Before the examinations the examiner received an examination sheet and examination cards in the Postgraduate Education Department. The examinations started at 13.05, according to the schedule. All examinations procedures were carried out. Examination questions content corresponded to the standard program and allowed making an assessment of training outcomes, as well as skills, abilities and competencies in the discipline "Business Planning Innovative Projects". As a result of the examinations, undergraduates received the following marks: 2 undergraduates received a score of 85 points (B +); 1 undergraduate - 80 points (B); 1 undergraduate - 96 points (A).

Examination questions content correspond to the standard program and the content of the discipline's syllabus, and also allow making an assessment of training outcomes, as well as skills, competencies and competencies in relevant disciplines.

Experts from the EEC visited the base of the practice of DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 / 6D050600 - "Economics", DP 5B050700 / 5M050700 / 5D050700— "Management", namely AsiaAgroFood JSC located at the following address: 1, Suyunbai Str., Shamalgan railway station, Karasay District, Almaty Region, Republic of Kazakhstan, 040930.

During the visit, the experts got acquainted with the material and technical base of "AsiaAgroFood" JSC, where the students of the accredited DP undergo professional practice. "AsiaAgroFood" JSC is one of the largest enterprises in the food industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which includes a flour mill equipped with modern equipment from Buhler (Switzerland), a starch and treacly mill with imported equipment, a baking shop, and a zephyr production site. The productivity of the company is 400 tons of flour per day. The company produces high-grade, first grade and second grade flour, "Kazakhstan" flour, wheat bran, granulated wheat, grain waste.

Flour mill products are sold both domestically and internationally. During the EEC visit, the experts got acquainted with the material and technical base, the production infrastructure, the organizational structure of the company, the training center of the department on the basis of the enterprise with an area of  $60m^2$ , equipped with office furniture, office equipment, etc.

In the training center, students undergo professional practice, defend the results of the practice in the form of a conference with the participation of the managers from the enterprise and the university, as well as in individual disciplines such as Production Management, Production

Arrangement for of Economics and Management have their practical training on the basis of the enterprise.

In addition, the company provides all the necessary analytical information, financial and accounting data, and marketing research results, cost estimates, which students study, analyze and use in the process of theses, master's projects, dissertations, and practice reports.

During the professional practice, students master practical skills and competencies in the specialty. New modern programs for planning, forecasting, monitoring and management of all activities of the enterprise are provided at the department and services of the company.

#### (VI) COMPLIANCE WITH ACCREDITATION SPECIALIZED STANDARDS

#### 6.1 STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAM-MANAGEMENT"

# The evidential part

Training in ATU JSC, based on degree programs (DP) for higher education according to the cluster specialties, is implemented:

- in three levels of training: "Management" specialty undergraduate studies (5B050700), MA course (6M050700), doctoral candidacy (6D050700);
- in three levels of training: "Economics" specialty undergraduate studies (5B050600), MA course (6M050600), doctoral candidacy (6D050600).

The training of DP for specialists in the OP of undergraduate education is carried out on the basis of the state license of the MES of the RK series AA №0000214 dated July 23, 2004 and AB series № 0137369, dated 03.02.2010; there is no limitation concerning the validity period of the license.

Training in DPs MA courses 6M050600 - "Economics", 6M050700 "Management" has been carried out since 2010 on the basis of the state license of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Belarus series AB No. 0137401 dated 03.02.2010 with a validity period - without limitation (www.atu.kz). Education in the MA courses is carried out in full-time form lasting 2 years - for the scientific and pedagogical areas and 1 year - for the profile direction. Awarded academic degree is a Master of Economics and Business. Training of students is organized in Kazakh and Russian languages.

Doctoral studies in DP 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - "Management" have been carried out since 2010 on the basis of the state license of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Belarus series AB No. 0137401 dated February 3, 2010 and are valid without limits (www.atu.kz). Doctoral studies are carried out in full-time with 3 year duration. Awarded academic degree - Doctor of Philosophy PhD.

Training of specialists in ATU is carried out according to the Classifier of specialties of higher education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The university has demonstrated the existence of a policy in the field of quality of education, approved by the University Scientific Board (protocol 9 of April 29, 2017). This document is posted on the University website **www.atu.kz** and is available for interested parties.

The implementation and development of accredited programs is determined, first of all, by the mission, the Strategic Development Plan of ATU JSC.

The strategic development plan of ATU JSC for 2017–2021, approved by the Scientific Board of the Institute (protocol No. 9 dated April 29, 2017), was developed to meet the requirements of a rapidly changing educational environment and is aimed at systemic improvement of training, taking into account the level of science and conditions proposed by reality.

The quality assurance policy reflects the connection between research, teaching, learning, and takes into account both the national and intra-university context.

To manage business processes, ATU JSC is guided in its activities by standards and ECTS directives and uses a Quality Management System that meets the requirements of international

standards. To support the main business processes at the university, a complex of internal regulatory documents has been developed, which regulates the implementation of DP.

The necessary information, personnel, financial and material and technical resources, as well as regulatory and legal documentation, ensuring the implementation of educational programs, are available to manage the DP.

For the development and regular correction of DP, expert councils are created with the involvement of specialists from both the internal and external environment, including students, teaching staff and employers. The representativeness of employers, involved in the development sign and implementation of each degree program, is demonstrated.

The DP management operates on the principles of openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff and employers.

Development plans of DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 / 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 / 6D050700 - "Management" are developed in accordance with the Strategic Development Plan of the University for 2017-2021, with Methodological Recommendations for the development of development plans for DP ATU-UKiA-MP- 7.5.1-2017-08 dated 12.18.2017 (with amendments and additions by 01.11.2018), with the participation of the DP head, employers from the real sector, financial, state structures, faculty teaching staff and students.

DP development plan contains:

- information about the degree program, education levels of students, teaching staff, analysis of the internal and external environment;
- a description of the DP achievements, the main goals, objectives of the DP, planned indicators for the period of 2017-2021 for the preparation of relevant personnel;
  - information on the modernization of the content of higher and postgraduate education;
- information on increasing the research potential, improving the civil and patriotic education of young people.

The DP development plan provides data on resource provision, the mechanism for DP implementation is substantiated, and the graduate models for each DP are presented.

The development plans of accredited degree programs were updated and approved at a meeting of the SMC of the Faculty of Economics and Business (Minutes No. 2 dated October 30, 2018).

The development plans of accredited DPs were analyzed by experts and contain the results of the labor market monitoring, employers' needs, as well as the positioning parameters of

the DP development plan, the basic indicators of the DP development plan are monitored.

DP managers interviewing and analysis of the submitted documentation confirmed the uniqueness of the accredited DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050600 - "Management" in comparison with the similar degree programs of other universities. The DPs provide flexible trajectories that have:

- sectoral focus on light and food industry;
- training in modular degree programs;
- Programs of dual-diploma education concerning DPs 5B050600 "Economics" (5B050600 "Economics" (ATU) and "Management" (REU named after GV Plekhanov);
- branches of the departments on the basis of the practices of "AsiaAgroFood" JSC, "Bakhus" LLP, "Aksai nan" LLP, "Yeast Plant" LLP.

All this allows the department to implement elements of dual education; to organize students of accredited DPs undergo the professional practice directly on the bases of enterprises and contributes to the best DP graduates job placement, creating conditions to meet the needs and interests of the region.

Information about the DP management mechanism, changes in this process is reflected on the official website of the university. Information on all sections is available for all interested parties.

At the Department of Economics and Management a risk register was developed, covering both internal and external factors of negative impact on the educational process. It was developed in order to effectively manage accredited DPs, basing on the Album of Process Information Cards, approved by the Rector of ATU from April 25, 2017. Also, measures for risk leveling have been developed; supporting documents on the implementation of planned works are presented. In particular, in order to

manage the risks associated with the process of non-compliance of the undergraduate degree program with the current needs of the labor market, risk reduction measures were developed, such as:

- development of new practice-oriented courses of disciplines in collaboration with employers;
- the formation of DP on a modular approach on the basis of the competence-based approach;
- holding panel discussions with DP employers, where issues related to the formation of EDQ and the development of new DP trajectories and the DP orientation towards the formation of students' professional competencies were discussed;
  - development and approval of MDP.

The DP management attracts employers to external reviewing of EDQs, MDPs, and graduates' models. For the accredited DP, the reviewing of the content of degree programs was carried out by P. Shevchik, Doctor of Economic, the director of "AsiaAgroFood" JSC, Finogenova A.V., Director of the Budget Planning Department of the Entrepreneurship Development Fund Damu JSC, S.A. Adilkhanova, Director of the Manas Hotel, Tenizbaeva G., Chief Economist Bahus JSC, A.B. Moldashev, Director of KazNIIEPK B. and so on.

EEC experts were convinced about the transparency of the degree program management system, by means of interviewing of employers, students, teachers, studying internal regulatory documents, regulating the implementation of DP and information on, posted on the site.

The necessary information, personnel, financial and material and technical resources, as well as regulatory and legal documentation, ensuring the implementation of degree programs, are available for the DP management.

The DP management has been trained in the following programs of "Education Management": Head of the Department G.K Dzholdasbaeva took advanced training courses on the theme "Head of the Department of Modern Higher Education Institutions" from March 14–15, 2018; G.O. Zhanguttina, Dean of the Faculty of Economics and Business; - "Management in universities", "Fundamentals of project management."

## Analytical part

The Commission notes that:

- on accredited cluster specialties, some work has been done to strengthen the documentation of all major business processes governing the implementation of the DP;
- an analysis of information on the implementation of the DP is carried out by considering these issues at the meetings of the department, the teaching and methodological committee and the Scientific Board of the University;
  - Plans for the DPs development for 2017–2021 have been developed.

The university provides the transparency of the degree program management system. So, on the website of the university in the sections "Rector's Blog", "Guide", "Structure", "Faculties" there is information about the leadership of the university (rector, vice-rector of relevant areas, deans, and heads of graduating departments). Entering the rector's blog, anyone can directly ask him questions. Students, employees and interested persons can personally contact the head of departments, deans, vice-rectors, and rector in a special time.

At the same time, the uniqueness and advantage of DPs 6D050600 - "Economics" and OP 6D050700 - "Management" in comparison with the similar degree programs of other universities have not been confirmed; this opinion was confirmed during interviewing of the DPs managers and in the analysis of the documentation submitted. The DP management did not demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the DPs development plan, its consistency with the national development priorities and the development strategy of the educational organization. A specific program for introducing innovations in the DPs is not presented, especially considering the experience of orienting the DPs implemented at a higher educational institution to specific sectors of the economy, respectively, the process of monitoring the implementation of introduced innovations in the DPs has not been systematized.

Analysis of the documents studied, as well as the results of interviews with students, teaching staff, graduates and employers, led to the conclusion that the content of academic disciplines in the

framework of the degree programs does not always take into account changes in the labor market, requirements of employers and social demands of society. In this regard, there is a need to revise the content of academic disciplines. Also, in order to enhance the practical orientation of the courses offered, it is necessary to develop elements of dual education at senior courses.

EP management was unable to demonstrate how innovation was implemented. During the meeting with teachers there were no examples of the implementation of specific innovations. During the conversation it was also turned out that the scientific and innovative activities of teachers were not always closely related to the subjects taught. This can also be seen on the topics of published works. In terms of the doctoral studies DP development, the mechanism for the implementation of the degree programs was not sufficiently substantiated; expert evaluations and results of the audit of the DP content were not presented.

A number of dissertations examined by a random choice showed that a significant part of them is not related to the profile of the university. Choosing the topic of master's theses should be more careful. It should be relevant, consistent with the current state of science and technology, as a rule, be associated with the research plans of the relevant departments and the ATU as a whole. The list of topics is developed by the graduating department, reviewed by the ATU Scientific and Technical Council and approved by the Vice-Rector for Science. The above topics do not quite meet these requirements. We recommend connecting topics with the main fields of ATU preparation (for example, light industry and food industry) in the economic and managerial direction of training masters, because the uniqueness and individuality of DP data is related to the sectoral specificity of ATU as a whole.

There is no data on the internal quality assurance system of the DP, including its planning, management and monitoring, their improvement, decision-making based on real recommendations of the representatives of the labor market for doctoral programs. In this regard, the university needs to intensify work on the doctoral studies DPs planning, management of innovations within the doctoral studies DP framework on the basis of professional improvement and strengthening the contribution to the development of the light and food industries and the tourism and hospitality industry, which will contribute to the uniqueness of these DPs.

The self-assessment report of the accredited DP did not provide information on the conformity of professional qualifications of the management. As a result of an interview with the DP management, it was revealed that the university had not developed the practice of training university managers in educational management programs. During interviews and meetings with vice-rectors, with heads of structural divisions on December 19, 2018, it was found out that only two or three people attended the courses on "Management of Education", and the corresponding certificates were not presented.

When visiting the graduating department on December 20, 2018, it was found out that all 6 invited foreign teachers, participated in the educational process were the representatives from the near abroad (Russia). It does not promote to the profiling of disciplines in English. Representatives of foreign countries could conduct disciplines in English. Only two teachers of the department have the Intermediate level of English, all the rest have an Elementary one. This level of proficiency in English provides no opportunity for conducting specialized disciplines in English. In order to implement multilingual programs, a step-by-step Action Plan for 2016–2020 was developed (approved by the Rector of the ATU dated May 16, 16). But there is a somewhat formalized approach to its implementation. 9 teachers of the Economics and Management department were trained at various English language courses in the period of 2016-2017, but these courses provided only Basic English. Several multilingual programs have been developed for the DPs 6M050600 "Economics" and 6M050700 "Management", for example "Modern Strategic Analysis", "Methodology of Economic Research" in English, but their quality is satisfactory.

According to the results of the teaching staff survey:

- 14.9% of the faculty evaluate "relatively poorly" the possibility of combining teaching with scientific research;
- 23.4% of faculty members rate the possibility of combining teaching with applied activity "relatively poorly".

According to the results of the survey, the level of availability and responsiveness of the university management is "fully satisfied" - 70.7%, "partially satisfied" - 24.1%, "partially not satisfied" - 3.4% according to the students opinion.

**Strengths / best practice according** to DP 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700 - "Management":

- 1. The management took into account the recommendations of the EEC of the IAAR since the last procedure of external quality assurance.
- 2. The DP's management ensured the transparency of the development of DP development plan based on an analysis of its functioning.

EEC recommendations for the DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. To systematize the process of monitoring the implementation of innovations implemented in the DP. The DP management shall promote the creation of greater opportunities for combining teaching with science and innovation activities.
- 2. To practice the training of university managers and accredited DPs in educational management programs.
- 3. To take complex measures on the gradual transition of the university to trilingual education and introduce the practice teaching of specialized subjects in English.

Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. The DP management shall continue the systematic work on the definition and formation of the uniqueness of the degree programs in accordance with the national priorities of the country's economic development and in connection with the transition of Kazakhstan to the digital economy.
- 2. A culture of quality assurance in the context of doctoral programs should be developed, that is, to demonstrate the results of the satisfaction assessment, to show the impact of changes on the image of the university and this DP.
- 3. In order to reduce possible risks in the DP management, it is necessary to continue the study of changes in the internal and external environment.

EEC conclusions on the criteria for the DP 5B050600 / 6M050600 – "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 – "Management": strong - 2, satisfactory - 11, requiring improvement – 4

**EEC conclusion on the criteria for** the DP 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - "Management": **satisfactory - 9, requiring improvement - 8** 

## 6.2 STANDARD "INFORMATION MANAGEMENT AND REPORTING"

# The evidential part

Almaty Technological University has implemented information management processes, including information collection and analysis processes. The university has a department of information technology management, which is responsible for information and technical support of the accredited degree programs.

Dissemination of information and receiving feedback is carried out through meetings of collegial bodies, working groups created to solve actual problems.

The following information technologies were implemented in the management of ATU: information site <a href="www.atu.kz">www.atu.kz</a>, educational portal "Univer" <a href="http://univer.atu.kz/user/login?ReturnUrl=%2f">http://univer.atu.kz/user/login?ReturnUrl=%2f</a>, Republican Inter-University Electronic Library (RIEL) <a href="http://rmebrk.kz/">(http://rmebrk.kz/</a>), corporate mail <a href="https://biz.mail.ru/login/atu.kz">(https://biz.mail.ru/login/atu.kz</a>), Documentolog electronic document management system <a href="http://doc.atu.kz/user/login?back=%252F">http://doc.atu.kz/user/login?back=%252F</a>, application for teacher individual plans developing "Report Designer" <a href="http://report.atu.kz/login.php">http://report.atu.kz/login.php</a>.

For the timely input of reliable data in the AIS "Univer" and the subsequent formation of reporting information responsible persons are identified in the university. The periodicity of input and accuracy of information in the AIS "Univer" is governed by university regulations. In order to disseminate internal information, the university has a single corporate mail <a href="https://biz.mail.ru/login/atu.kz">https://biz.mail.ru/login/atu.kz</a>.

The program https://www.teamviewer.com/en/ is installed for conducting online lectures for the students of distance learning. The recording of video lectures by teachers is organized for all lectured undergraduate studies disciplines of accredited degree programs that are located in the distance learning system <a href="http://distance.atu.kz/">http://distance.atu.kz/</a>. MOOC was also developed for individual disciplines of accredited degree programs that are posted on the local ATU server <a href="http://open.atu.kz/courses/course-v1:ATU+EiM01+2018 C2/about">http://open.atu.kz/courses/course-v1:ATU+EiM01+2018 C2/about</a>. The Department of Science Management constantly informs faculty and management by means of corporate mail about upcoming scientific conferences, competitions, seminars, and also monitors students' scientific achievements and faculty. The university has access to the scientific databases Web of Science <a href="http://apps.webofknowledge.com">http://apps.webofknowledge.com</a>, Thomson Reuters <a href="https://link.springer.com/">https://link.springer.com/</a>.

The career center on regular basis works with employers, Almaty employment center of, as well as with other enterprises (AsiaAgroFood JSC, Eclat LLP, etc.), organizes annual job fairs, monitors employment and career growth of graduates.

In order to prevent the loss of information, a system of physical, software and hardware information protection functions at the university.

The information is analyzed in the following categories: contingent of students, level of academic achievement, satisfaction of students with the DP content, availability of educational resources, employment of graduates.

To monitor the implementation of the MDP plan and implement corrective actions, reports from the heads of departments and questionnaires are used. Evaluation is made in all areas of educational, teaching and methodological, information, scientific, educational activities and material and technical support of the educational process. Evaluation of the effectiveness of the DP implementation is considered at meetings of the university administration, the Scientific Board, the teaching and methodological committee of the faculty, the SMC of the university and the department, is issued in the form of protocols. In assessing the DP activities, students are involved as a consumer of educational services.

## Analytical part

According to the analysis of compliance with the criteria of the "Information Management and Reporting" standard for the accredited DP, the commission notes the following: the university has an information and reporting management system. Data is stored in electronic and paper format in accordance with the nomenclature.

The databases available at the university allow creating the variety of analytical reports. Regular surveys of students, personnel, teaching staff and employers are conducted; according to the results appropriate measures are taken to eliminate deficiencies and improve the DP.

Feedback has been established with the students, which allows identifying their satisfaction with the quality of the DP implemented. During the conversation with the students, they noted that there was an opportunity to address the management concerning various problems.

Interviews with teachers and students showed that suggestions and recommendations from shareholders found a response in management decisions.

During the EEC visit, the university did not fully demonstrate how preventive and corrective measures were developed based on the analysis and evaluation of control indicators, as well as an assessment of their effectiveness. Also, information was not fully provided on how management sets the periodicity, forms and methods for evaluating the DPs management, the activities of collegial bodies and structural subdivisions, and the implementation of research projects. The DP management did not provide examples of how the collected information influences the improvement of the internal quality assurance system, the specific facts of students' participation in the processes of collecting and

analyzing information, and making decisions based on them. Students, employees and teaching staff were not sufficiently involved in the processes of collecting and analyzing information and making decisions based on them. The DP's management told about examples of work of the Alumni Association; thanks to close connection with alumni, excursions for students were organized and conducted, the participation of representatives of various companies of graduates in the development of DPs was ensured, master classes for graduate students were held at their work places, etc. But at the meeting with graduates of the DP, it was not possible to obtain complete information about the activities of the Alumni Association, the work of graduates in the development of these DPs. It was impossible to track the graduates' career growth.

The leadership of the doctoral candidacy DP did not fully define the criteria for improving the characteristics of the degree programs; process optimization; improvement interaction with related units; effectiveness achievement methods were not presented.

The DP management also failed to present a complete analysis of joint programs with foreign educational organizations; EEC members note insufficient cooperation with foreign universities to create joint doctoral programs. The model of the graduate does not fully reflect the proposals of the shareholders. Not all students, employees and teaching staff are involved in the process of information analysis and decision-making based on them, which was clearly seen in meetings with these groups.

The EEC notes that an internal assessment of the doctoral programs quality management of the accredited DP is carried out formally.

The system of regular reporting does not reflect all levels of the structure for the department effectiveness evaluation as well as its research.

#### **Strengths / Best Practices**

- strengths are not marked by EEC members

EEC recommendations concerning DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. To develop methodological materials on the formulation of the assessment tools of the DP training outcomes by the beginning of 2019-2020 academic year.
- 2. Make a plan and organize introductory courses for DP managers on training outcomes planning, organizing the educational process on degree programs in accordance with the Credit technology of teaching (CTT) and implementing the basic principles of the Bologna process.
- 3. EP management shall develop a specified graduate model taking into account the wishes of the shareholders and the DP development plan, taking into account the specifics of specialties in accordance with the NQF, the NQS and the Dublin descriptors and assign those responsible for the execution of the plan.
- 4. To intensify work on the involvement of all categories of university staff: students, employees and teaching staff into the process of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.

Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

1. To enhance the profile of the program, it is necessary to analyze the trends in a particular specialty from the point of view of domestic and international characteristics and criteria by the new academic year beginning.

EEC conclusions on the criteria for the DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management": satisfactory - 14, requiring improvement - 3. EEC conclusions on the criteria for the DPs 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - "Management": satisfactory - 12, requiring improvement - 5.

#### 6.3 STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAMS DEVELOPMENT AND APPROVAL"

#### The evidential part

The development and approval of degree programs at the university is carried out in accordance with the provisions of legal acts in the field of higher and postgraduate education. Accredited DPs are provided with educational and methodological documentation in accordance with Kazakhstan requirements: state compulsory education standards; standard and working curricula of specialties; standard and working curricula of disciplines. Evaluation of the quality of the degree programs is based on an analysis of curricula, elective courses catalog, modular degree programs, educational and methodological complexes of the DP, educational and methodological complexes of disciplines, schedules, individual plans for students, internal regulatory documents governing the implementation of the degree programs, and questioning students.

The university degree programs content planning is based on the modular and competence-based approaches based on the results of the annual analysis of the degree programs, taking into account the students' points of view, faculty and employers, and recommendations of corporate partners.

Bachelor degrees DPs form the competences of six groups: general education, socio-ethical competences, economic competences, organizational and managerial competencies, professional competencies, language skills and ability to adapt.

MA courses and doctoral candidacy accredited degree programs form the expected training outcomes based on the National Qualifications Framework, as well as Dublin second level descriptors, which are expressed through three groups of competencies: general education, being broad-minded person, emotional intelligence; expert and analytical competence; research competence / design research competences.

The university has the following types of curricula: a standard curriculum (SC), a working curriculum (WC), an individual curriculum (IC). Curricula are developed on the basis of standard curricula for the DP for the entire period of study and the State Compulsory Educational Standards and Rules for the organization of the educational process on the credit technology of education. In accordance with the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the curriculum maintains the ratio of the volume of general disciplines (GD) cycles, basic disciplines (BD), and chief subjects (CS) disciplines.

The content and structure of accredited DPs are formed in accordance with the requirements of the Model Rules for the Activities of Organizations of Higher and Postgraduate Education, approved by the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 17, 2013 No. 499, the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, approved by the Government Resolution of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 1080 dated August 23, 2012, and process of credit technology training, approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science No. 152 of 04/20/2011, with appropriate changes to them.

Formation of individual educational trajectories of the student is carried out with the help of an adviser for each academic year on the basis of SES of RK, SC and ECC. For each accredited DP a MDP is developed, which shows the work content of disciplines cycles in Kazakhstan and ECTS credits, as well as in hours, pointing out lectures, practical (seminar) classes, independent work of students under the guidance of a teacher and independent work of the student, all kinds of professional practice, intermediate attestation.

MDP of the accredited DP is formed by the departments with the participation of employers and practitioners, a mandatory examination of their content and quality of compilation by employers is carried out. The educational trajectories of the bachelor degree DP are as follows: 5B050600 - "Economics" - "Enterprise Economics", "Economics and Enterprise Management", "Economics and Legal Support in Business"; 5B050700 - "Management" - "Organization Management" and "Project Management". Beginning with 2016-2017 academic year, the Department of Economics and Management provides training in dual-diploma education in accordance with the agreement concluded

in 2016 with the REU named after G.V. Plekhanov on the DP 5V050600 - "Economics" (ATU) / 03.03.02 Management (REU named after G.V. Plekhanov).

## Analytical part

The analysis of accredited DPs for compliance with the criteria of the "Development and Approval of the Educational Program" standard shows that the content of the degree programs, the sequence of their implementation, the depth of development for all DP training require improvement in accordance with regulatory documents and labor market demands.

The survey of faculty members, conducted during the visit of the EEC of the IAAR, showed a high assessment (97.9%) of the attention of the university administration to the content of the DP. The content of the DP "very well" meets the needs of 61.7% of the faculty, "good" - 36.2%.

The survey of students showed that the level of responsiveness to feedback from teachers regarding the educational process is fully satisfied - 84.5%; partially - 8.6%; 79.3% were completely satisfied with the quality of teaching, 15.5% were partially satisfied, 1.7% were partially dissatisfied, and 3.4% were not satisfied.

During the meeting with the faculty on December 19, it was not possible to fully clarify the features of the development and approval of the DPs at various levels - undergraduate, graduate and doctoral studies.

During meetings with students of the DP on December 20, 2018, it became clear that students were not aware of what types of professional certification are possible under the DP "Economics", how students could pass it, respectively, the professional certification of students was not sufficiently carried out.

Analysis of the studied documents of doctoral degree programs, as well as the results of interviews with doctoral students, faculty, led to the conclusion that the content of academic disciplines in the framework of the degree programs did not always take into account changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and social demands of society. In this regard, there is a need to revise the content of the DP.

The commission notes that contracts signed with foreign partners are in the nature of intentions and do not constitute evidence of the existence of joint educational programs. From the 2016-2017 academic ear, the Department of Economics and Management provides training in dual-diploma education in accordance with the agreement concluded in 2016 with the REU named after G.V. Plekhanov on DP 5V050600 - "Economics" (ATU). However, it was not possible to clarify the procedure for concluding agreements on the JDP, the requirements for partner universities and the administration of the DP in them; it does not show how the assessment of the quality of education obtained in a partner institution takes place. And this is the only joint DP with a foreign education organization. It is necessary to increase the number of JDP.

As for the doctoral candidacy programs, academic mobility to foreign partner universities was not implemented.

#### **Strengths / Best Practices**

- The classification received upon completion of the DP of undergraduate and graduate programs is clearly defined, explained and corresponds to a certain level of the NQS.
  - The work content of the DP is clearly defined in Kazakhstan credits and ECTS.

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. The management of the faculty shall strengthen the work in the preparation of students for professional certification in DP, as the approach of professional standards and the opening of certification centers.

Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

Faculty management should work to ensure the assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the DP.

- 2. The management of the University on a regular basis should conduct the assessment of the DP.
- 3. When forming the cycle of the Chief subjects, it is necessary to use the inclusion of practice-oriented disciplines as a priority, consider the possibility of introducing elements of dual training in DP.
  - 4. To update the content of the DP in the light of the latest achievements of science.
- 5. The management of the DP should develop joint programs with foreign educational organizations.

EEC conclusions on the criteria for the DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management": strong - 2, satisfactory - 9, requiring improvement - 1. EEC conclusions on the criteria for the DPs 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - "Management": strong - 1, satisfactory - 6, requiring improvement - 5.

# 6.4 STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAMS REGULAR MONITORING AND PERIODIC ASSESSMENT"

The evidential part

The university self-assessment report provides the necessary information on the ongoing monitoring and periodic assessment of the degree programs of the accredited cluster.

To determine the level of satisfaction of internal needs, the leading teachers of the department "Economics and Management" each academic period organize and conduct a survey of students, which is carried out by means of a computerized survey of students of the University at the UNIVER AIS. The following types of student questionnaires were conducted: "The quality of teaching in the trainee's opinion", "Satisfaction of students with the content and quality of the educational process in the discipline", "Teacher in the trainee's opinion", "Satisfaction of the teaching staff with the university", "Satisfaction of employers with the quality of graduates". Analysis of the survey data indicates that the average score for DPs 5B050600- "Economics", 5B050700- "Management" was 4.68 out of 5, i.e. students' satisfaction with the content and quality of the educational process in the disciplines is 93.6%.

According to DPs 6M050600 - "Economics", 6M050700 - "Management", the average score is 9.7 out of 10, i.e., students' satisfaction with the content and quality of the educational process in the disciplines is 97%.

According to DPs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management", an average score of 9.2 out of 10, i.e. students' satisfaction with the content and quality of the educational process in the disciplines is 92%. The results of the analysis of the survey are periodically discussed at meetings of the department, faculty SMC and at the University Scientific Board.

As a communication channel for innovative proposals, traditional feedback forms are used: meetings with the management and the rector's blog.

## Analytical part

The EEC confirms that the university management has demonstrated its openness and accessibility for students, faculty members, employers: reception hours for personal matters are defined, meetings with the rector are held on a systematic basis. The department works closely with foreign and Kazakh universities: Russian Economic University named after G.V.Plekhanov (RF), Kyrgyz Economic University named after M. Ryskulbekov (KR), University of Applied Sciences (Germany), Technical University of Dresden (Germany), etc.

The self-assessment report provides information on the forms of participation of shareholders in the monitoring of the DP.

At the same time, in the course of interviewing focus groups, visiting departments and analyzing the documentation provided, representatives of the EEC note that in practice the mechanisms for participation in the planning, management and monitoring of DPs do not work fully. The issue related to the monitoring and periodic evaluation of the DP, in particular, the content of the programs in the light of the latest scientific achievements in specific disciplines to ensure the relevance of the taught discipline is not disclosed.

Also, the doctoral programs do not track the personal growth and development of the student in the process of mastering the program; the methods used for this are not identified. The DP management did not provide examples that prove the effectiveness of student assessment procedures. It would be advisable to clarify the question of how the university determines the need to change the content of curricula and educational programs. What tools are used to detect change? It should be noted insufficient use of mechanisms for the commercialization of innovation results.

The EP management did not provide evidence of the participation of doctoral students, employers and other shareholders in the review of the DP, how they are involved in the review of the DP of the doctoral program and at what stages.

# **Strengths / Best Practices**

- EEC Members did not reveal strengths.

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. On a regular basis to monitor the labor market, the external environment, employers' requests during the development and updating of the content and structure of the DP.

Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. Continue work on improving the content and structure of the DP. To intensify the work on updating the degree programs, with the publication of all the changes made on the university website, taking into account the specialization of the University and the involvement of all interested parties.
- 2. The DP management shall systematize the revision of the content and structure of the degree programs with the participation of faculty, students and employers.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria for** the DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management": **satisfactory - 9, requiring improvement - 1.** 

**EEC** conclusions on the criteria for the DPs 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - Management: satisfactory - 6, requiring improvement -4.

# 6.5 STANDARD "STUDENT-CENTERED TRAINING, TEACHING AND PROGRESS MONITORING"

The evidential part

The administration provides equal opportunities for DP students, regardless of the language of instruction, to form an individual degree program aimed at the formation of professional competence.

Regardless of the language of instruction, students are equal in provision with syllabuses, EMCD, scientific and educational literature, TIW, TIWT, consultations and information resources. The departments ensure the harmonious development of students taking into account the intellectual development and individual characteristics.

DP's management seeks to ensure attention to various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning trajectories and using various forms and methods of teaching and learning.

For the purpose of student-centered teaching in the departments, various teaching methods and technologies are used, taking into account the variety of forms of information assimilation. The following active and innovative teaching methods have been introduced in the educational process: a

method for analyzing specific situations; discussion method; learning in collaboration, lecture-conversation, lecture-visualization, lecture-dispute, brainstorming; project method; role play method. Students receive information about the possibilities of forming an individual educational trajectory through the automated system "Univer", as well as with the help of curators / advisors. Monitoring the progress of students on the educational trajectory is carried out on the basis of a system for evaluating the results of students. Monitoring is carried out on the basis of reports of the faculty of the department.

Monitoring and assessment of the training outcomes and their implementation is ensured by the following procedures:

- independent computer testing in the automated system "Univer" in the DP following disciplines provides an objective assessment of knowledge and shows the dynamics of their level;
  - survey of employers on the quality of DP graduates training.

Assessment of knowledge, skills and professional competencies, students of the credit technology of education, is carried out on a 100-point scale with the conversion of the final result into alphabetic and digital equivalent. In grading, attendance, level of activity in the classroom, systematic performance and level of independence of all types of tasks, the ability to correctly formulate the problem and find alternative solutions are taken into account. All academic achievements of students are reflected in the transcript.

Appeal of the results of students' academic progress is carried out by means of the work of the Appeal Commission. Graduation works of students are tested to avoid plagiarism. A classic feedback tool for teaching quality research (content, forms, and methods) is the questioning of students. Feedback forms are: Rector's blog on the website (atu.kz), "Rector's Mail", "Helpline", office (Documentolog 5), as well as meetings with the leadership of the university, faculty, and head of the department

# Analytical part

Students express satisfaction with the quality of teaching. The Commission notes that the University seeks to develop objective tools for assessing students' knowledge, using the recommendations of the latest version of ECTS and conducting a clear anti-corruption policy. At a meeting with experts from the IAAR, employers emphasized the need to introduce practice-oriented disciplines in the elective disciplines catalogs, as well as to involve practitioners more widely in the educational process. EEC certified the formation of educational trajectories of students through the program AIS "Univer".

On the basis of scientific centers, students of an accredited degree program master practical skills and abilities, as well as implement the results of scientific research in the process of performing diploma theses, master's theses, scientific research projects, scientific research projects and others. To strengthen the focus of practical training of students on the industry-specialization of the university, the following disciplines are conducted: "Economic analysis of the activities of food and light industry enterprises", "Planning of activities in food and light industry enterprises", etc., focused on the profile of the university. Trainees on the basis of Technopark work out the use of economic analysis and economic and mathematical forecasting in technological processes. In general, both students and faculty members expressed positive opinions about the implementation of the accredited DPs, which later confirmed the results of the survey. However, we consider it necessary to note that at the university, within the framework of the programs being accredited, there is a need to develop and implement new own researches within the framework of teaching methods with the aim of developing student-centered training.

#### **Strengths / Best Practices**

EEC members have not identified best practice.

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. To conduct own research in the field of academic subjects teaching.

EEC conclusions on the criteria for the DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management": satisfactory - 9, requiring improvement - 1. EEC conclusions on the criteria for the DPs 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - "Management": satisfactory - 9, requiring improvement - 1.

#### 6.6 STANDARD "TRAINEES"

#### The evidential part

DP management demonstrates the policy of forming a contingent of DP students from the admission to the graduation and ensures the transparency of its procedures. For the formation of a contingent of students, the faculty of the department conducts a professional orientation work at schools of Almaty and Almaty region. For newly enrolled students, an adaptation week is organized, which is implemented by the efforts of academic advisors. The analysis of the contingent of students in DP 5B050600, 6M050600 – "Economics": over the last 3 academic years there is some fluctuation, but in the 2018-2019 academic year there is an increase in the contingent of students. According to DP 6D050600 - "Economics": the number of students increased from 1 to 4 doctoral students. The analysis of the contingent on the DP 5B050700, 6M050700 - "Management" for the period under consideration has a tendency to increase, as it can be seen from table 2.

Degree program	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
	academic	academic	academic	academic
	year	year	year	year
5B050600 "Economics"	119	138	133	155
6M050600 "Economics"	9	9	21	16
6D050600 "Economics"		1	3	4
5B050700 "Management"	92	93	123	139
6M050700 "Management"	1	9	14	16
6D050700 "Management"	-	-	- /	2

Table 2 – Trainees' contingent concerning degree programs

In the structure of the contingent of students, the largest ratio is occupied by students of the undergraduate degree - more than 86%. Since the doctoral program admission was carried out only on a grant basis, and grants for the ATU were not allocated, and only with the introduction of a paid doctoral program, it was possible for teachers of the department to enter the doctoral program with a significant discount.

From 2014 to 2018, within the framework of the program of internal and external academic mobility in the accredited DP, 86 students took part, who studied in the following universities: the Russian Economic University named after G.V. Plekhanov, University of Etwos Jozsef, Hungary, KEU named after M.Ryskulbekov, Kazakh Agrotechnical University named after S.Seifullin, Astana, Kazakh University of Technology and Business (Astana), TarSU named after Dulati (Taraz), Almaty Academy of Economics and Statistics.

In 2017-2018 academic year, 30 first year undergraduates of "Economics" and "Management" had scientific training in the Almaty Academy of Economics and Statistics. From 5 to 18 February 2018 doctoral candidacy students of DP 6D050600 "Economics" B.T. Imanbekova and of DP 6D050700 "Management" E. Daribayeva, and Zh. Yesilbaeva had a scientific internship at the REU named after G.V. Plekhanov. Students are informed about the programs of external and internal mobility by means of website atu.kz.

During the last academic years, 4 foreign students from the near abroad, in particular from

Uzbekistan and Tajikistan, were trained in the accredited DP. It is necessary to work on their growth, creating special adaptation programs.

Procedures for admission of students from other universities, credit recognition and credit transferring are based on the principles of the Lisbon Conference on recognition. Admission of students from other universities is carried out in accordance with the Rules of Transition and Rehabilitation, approved by order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 20, 2015 No19. When transferring students from other universities, the academic difference in the working curricula, according to the disciplines studied during previous academic periods, is determined.

During 2016-2018 academic year, REU professors conducted guest lectures for the teaching staff and students of accredited DP: N.A. Kazakova, Doctor of Economics, Professor, on the topic "Express analysis and risk assessment in business"; D.A. Shtykhno, Ph.D., on the topic "Management decisions (methods of adoption and implementation)"; M.A. Ponomarev, Ph.D. on the theme "Practical management" in the amount of 2 credits; I.M. Kornilov, Doctor of Historical Sciences, lectured on the discipline "History" in the amount of 2 credits; D.K. Balakhanova Ph.D. lectured in the 1st semester of 2018-2019 on the theme "Management decision-making methods" in the amount of 2 credits.

In 2016-2017 academic year, a senior lecturer Savelyeva S.E. held online lectures on the theme "Macroeconomics" for 2 year students the REU named after G.V. Plekhanov in the amount of 2 credits; G.K. Dzholdasbaeva, Doctor of Economics and K.B.Daulbayev also conducted online lectures for the students. In 2017-2018 academic year the job placement indicator concerning the bachelor degree DP 5B050700 "Management" and DP 5B050600 "Economics" was 85%. For the master degree programs the indicator was 100%.

Table 3 - Indicators of the DPs graduates job placement (2015-2018 academic years, bachelor and master degrees programs)

Specialty	Number of	Placed in a job	%
~ potanis	graduates	1 14004 111 41 00	
5B050600 – "Economics"			
2015-2016	5	4	80
2016-2017	25	21	84
2017-2018	20	17	85
6M050600 – "Economics"			
2015-2016	8	8	100
2016-2017	9	9	100
2017-2018	21	21	100
5B050700 – "Management"			
2015-2016	14	11	79
2016-2017	10	8	80
2017-2018	13	- 11	85
6M050700 – "Management"			
2015-2016	-	_	-
2016-2017	10	10	100
2017-2018	6	6	100

The university has a Career Center, which contributes to the provision of students with places of practice, as well as to the job placement of the graduates of the accredited DP. The University concluded contracts with more than 40 organizations: Algabas Group LLP, BakanTrade LLP, AsiaAgroFood LLP, Aksai-nan LLP, Food Master LLP, Talgar Alcohol LLP, Bayserke Agro LLP, Almaty Et "LLP, "Rakhat" JSC, "Bent" JSC, Akimat of Alatau district, Akimat of Almaly region, Akimat of Enbekshikazakh district, Akimat of Balkhash district, Akimat of Karasai district. In 2016-2017 academic year contracts were concluded with the Almaty Expertise LLP companies, Baysat LLP,

Akimats of Alatau, Bostandyk, Enbekshikazakh district, Altyn-Dirmen LLP, Asia Wind Service LLP, and Audit Commission for the city of Almaty. The production branches of the department are located at AsiaAgroFood JSC, BastionTransLogistics LLP; the Career Center regularly monitors the degree of satisfaction with graduates and students of the programs, services and activities provided by the Career Center.

"Young Economist" club and "School of young managers" were establish at the department in 2016 in order to ensure the integration of theory and practice between higher education, science and production, as well as intellectual and personal development of students, increasing their social activity. All students of the accredited DP are involved into the work of these clubs. In 2017, the ATU Endowment Corporate Fund was established.

Examinations are traditionally held within the deadlines set by the academic calendar of the university. The examinations were prepared in accordance with a set of activities for the examinations organization and conduction by the structural units responsible for organizing the educational process: Deans, Educational and Methodological Department, Registrar Office, Information Technology Center, Testing Center.

#### Analytical part

At the same time, the commission notes that the university has developed an academic policy containing the main issues of the educational and organizational activities of students.

As a result of the survey, the availability of academic counseling was satisfied (96.6%); accessibility of health services (89.7%); availability of library resources (98.2%); existing educational resources (93.1%); overall quality of curricula (94.8%); the relations between student and teacher (96.5%).

The administration of DP provided information on external academic mobility of undergraduate programs, but did not demonstrate that the university provided opportunities for internal and external mobility of undergraduates and doctoral students accredited by the DP. During meetings with students, it was found out that the measures taken by the university management to assist in obtaining external grants for training are insignificant.

Due to the lack of graduates in accredited programs, monitoring of the job placement and professional activities was not conducted.

#### **Strengths / Best Practices**

- The university provides graduates with a certificate of qualification;
- A good support mechanism for gifted students has been developed.

**EEC Recommendations for** DP 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics, 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. To provide special adaptation and support programs for international students.
- 2. To develop a targeted academic mobility program and step up the internal and external academic mobility of undergraduates and doctoral students, taking into account the analysis of students' financial capabilities and the support provision.

EEC conclusions on the criteria for the DP 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management": strong - 2, satisfactory - 10.

**EEC** conclusions on the criteria for the DP 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - Management: strong - 1, satisfactory - 8, requiring improvement - 3

#### 6.7 STANDARD "TEACHING STAFF"

#### *The evidential part*

The personnel policy of the Almaty Technological University is a complex of work arising from the mission and strategy in order to form and efficiently use motivated and highly productive personnel able to adequately respond to the external and internal environment, which are reflected in documents such as the ATU's corporate culture code the honor and behavior of the student ATU, Human Resource Management, internal work regulations (ATU-OUP-DP-7.1.2-2018-01-02). Recruitment and staff advanced training are carried out in accordance with the rules of competitive vacancies and in accordance with established qualification requirements. The faculty of the department performs the duties in accordance with the JD.

The quantitative and qualitative composition of the faculty will meet all the requirements for licensing.

Assessment of teachers' competence to determine compliance with the position held is carried out by full-time employees of competitive filling of teaching staff and certification, according to the requirements of the competition commission developed by ATU, the Regulation on competitive replacement of teaching staff and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Regulation on certification of teaching staff, developed on the basis of regulatory requirements of the Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Table 4 – Personnel, involved into the realization of "Economics" DP

	5B050600 – "Economics"			
Academic degree and academic rank	2016-2017	2017-2018 2018-2019		
Professor, Doctor of sciences	2	2 3		
Associate professor, candidate of sciences	12	12 12		
PhD doctor	1	1 1		
Master, senior lecturer	12	12 13		
Senior lecturer	1	1		
Master, lecturer	1	1 2		
TOTAL	29	29 31		
Academic degree ratio, %	53,3	51,7 51,6		

According to DP 6M050600 - "Economics", 8 lecturers have academic degrees; the academic degree ratio is 100%.

According to the DP 6D050600 - "Economics" 5 lecturers have academic degrees; the academic degree ratio is 100%.

Table 5 - Personnel, involved into the realization of "Management" DP

Academic degree and academic rank	5B050700 – "Management"		
	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
Professor, Doctor of sciences	2	2	2
Associate professor, candidate of sciences	12	12	12
PhD doctor	2	2	2
Master, senior lecturer	10	10	10
Senior lecturer	1	1	2
Master, lecturer	1	1	
TOTAL	28	28	28
Academic degree ratio, %	57,1	57,1	57,1

According to DP 6M050700 - "Management", 8 lecturers have academic degrees; the academic degree ratio is 100%.

According to the DP 6D050700 - "Management" 4 lecturers have academic degrees; the academic degree ratio is 100%.

The DP management demonstrates an awareness of responsibility for their employees and providing them with favorable working conditions and changing the role of the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centered education: rating wage system and material incentives for its results; free access to the library and information resources of the university; providing an opportunity to improve their qualifications at the expense of the university in accordance with the decision of the university administration; organization of multi-level English language courses; creation of conditions for use of computer and office equipment, technical means of training, other equipment; facilitating participation in Kazakhstani and international competitions of scientific works and competitions for individual grants; publication of teaching materials of staff; providing material support to undergraduates and doctoral students; rewarding with letters and thanks of top management of the university in the field of educational and scientific activities, social work and honest work of many years.

The department teaching staff works to improve their professional skills in various areas. So, according to the results of 2016-2017 academic year, there were 38 certificates of attendance of advanced training courses; in 2017-2018 academic year there were 51 certificates. Head of the Department G.K. Dzholdasbaeva completed advanced training courses at KazNU named after Al-Farabi, concerning the economic disciplines, including "Economics of small and medium enterprises", "Strategic marketing" (certificate No. 1025); M.M. Sauranova, S.M. Momynkulova, A.O. Navmanova, Zh.K. Akpanov, and G.I. Aithodzhaeva in attended course on the topic "Technology of building a cash No. 1107, 1109. management system" (certificates 1112, ADALKYZMETGROUP; K.B. Dauylbaev attended a methodical seminar "Organization" educational process based on updated content in educational institutions" (certificate 103, I, I) at Eurasian Law Academy named after D.A. Kunaev; B.M. Murzabekova and A.T. Baktgreeeva attended and completed an advanced training course on the topic "Modern Economics and Education: Problems, Opportunities and Prospects for Development' (certificates No. 3207, 3209) at the Almaty Academy of Economics and Statistics (certificates No. 3207, 3209).

The DP management ensures the completeness and adequacy of the indicative working plans of teaching staff for all types of activities, monitoring the effectiveness and efficiency of indicative plans, and evidence has been demonstrated that teachers have completed all types of planned workload. The workload of the teaching staff of specialties includes educational, educational and methodological, scientific, organizational and methodological work and improvement of professional competence. Teaching and methodological complexes were developed for all disciplines taught by the department.

The lecturers developed on-line lectures on the subject "Economics of Hospitality Enterprises", "Macroeconomics", "Entrepreneurship", "Management", "Marketing", "Economic Policy", "International Economics", "Business Studies" and so on. Aytkhodzhaeva G.I., Abutalipova Zh.A., Kusainova S.B., Ospanova A., Kirbetova Z.S., Naimanova A.O., Momynkulova S.M. Savelieva S.E., Myrzahmetova B.M. and others got certificates "E-course: development, promotion and application". The certificates were obtained for the video lessons of MOOC; video lessons were posted on http://eduardo.studio/. Associate Professor of the "Economics and Management" Department Urkumbayeva A.R. developed the MOOC on the discipline "Organizational Behavior"; she got the first prize for this work and was awarded by the management in November 2018

Head of the Department G.K. Dzholdasbaeva is an expert of the MES RK on checking the quality of the content of developed test questions, an expert in specialized accreditation of the IAAR. In 2017 G.K. Dzholdasbaeva was awarded with the title of "The best teacher of the university in 2017"; for special merits in the field of education, she was awarded the medal "Honored Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan".

In honor of the 60th anniversary of the Almaty Technological University Dzholdasbaeva G.K., Savelyeva S.E. and Sauranova M.M. were awarded letters of commendations of the MES RK.

Savelieva S.E.got a thank- you- letter of MES RK. Kusainova S.B. was awarded "Letter of commendation" of the MES RK. For impeccable and long-term work in the education system, the Kazakhstani industry professional union of workers in education and science, associate professor Bayakhmetov T.B. and senior teacher Savelieva S.Ye. were awarded with "Letter of Commendation". Professor K. Dauylbaev was awarded with the medal "For merits in the development of science of the Republic of Kazakhstan", senior teacher Baskanbayeva R.K. was awarded with the ATU "Letter of Commendation".

Research works are planned on the basis of the proposals of each teacher, taking into account the scientific novelty, relevance, timeliness and modern requirements. The plan of the research work of the department is discussed and approved at the beginning of each academic year.

During the reporting period, faculty members according to the accredited DP completed 4 research topics registered in the National Center for Scientific and Technical Information JSC on the following issues: "Problems of improving the functioning of flour milling enterprises of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (state registration 0115PK00295 number, headed by Dzholdasbaeva G.K.), "Economic efficiency resuscitation of Aksu Sugar Plant", (No. 0116RK00059 of state registration, headed by Bayakhmetov T.B.)," Problems of increasing the competitiveness of light industry enterprises of the Republic of Kazakhstan "(No. 0116RK00060 of state reg., headed by Epanchintseva S.E.), "Evaluation innovative potential of development of food industry of Kazakhstan economy" (State registration number 0116RK00058, headed by Dzholdasbaeva G.K.). The results of research work are introduced into the educational process.

In 2015-2017, Professor G.K Dzholdasbaeva took part in a joint research grant with the University "Narhoz", as the main researcher on the topic "Development of the socio-economic mechanism for sustainable development in the field of storage and processing of the agro-industrial complex of Kazakhstan" (grant of the MES RK). According to the results collective scientific works were published such as "Socio-economic mechanism of sustainable development of the storage and processing of the agro-industrial complex of the Republic of Kazakhstan", "Efficiency of the enterprises of the milling industry"; a textbook by Dzholdasbaeva G.K.: "State regulation of agro-industrial complex in the conditions of sustainable development" was introduced into the educational process for DP 5B050600 - "Economics" and 5B050700 - "Management" in the discipline "State regulation of economy".

Also Professor Dzholdasbaeva G.K. takes part in a research project on budget program 267 "Increasing Accessibility of Knowledge and Research" under subprogram 101 "Program-targeted financing of research and activities" (grant from the Ministry of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan) on the theme: №1-2018 "Development of equipment and technology safe long-term storage of sugar beets in a controlled gaseous environment" for 2018

Professor K. Dauylbaev is a developer of the research work on the theme "Development of the concept of an optimal mechanism for regional economic management of the agro-industrial complex" under the leadership of D.A. Kaldiyarova. Contract No. 240 dated March 6, 2017 Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management "Zhetysu State University named after. I. Zhansugurov.

Doctoral student of the DP 6D050600 - "Economics" E.B. Daribayeva takes part in the funded research project: "Development of methodological approaches to assessing the resource potential of agricultural production, the definition of regional specialization in agriculture and recommendations on the formation of state policy on its effective use" carried out in KazNAU during 2018-2020.

Every year, faculty members take part in various cultural, mass, physical and recreational activities of the city Akimat, the Nur Otan party, a dedication to students, in the student spring "Day and moon". Students and teachers of the department participate in competitions in the following sports - basketball, football, volleyball, chess, where they win the top places. The teachers of the department participate in volunteer projects. Students and senior teachers Ospanova A., Agybaeva NB, and Zhuzbaeva A.T. visit Almaty Orphanage No. 1 on a regular basis in order to help, provide support and present theatrical performances.

### Analytical part

During the visit, EEC experts found out that the department has a low level of academic mobility, which may lead to a lack of access to resources of third-party of higher education institutions.

In this regard, the management of accredited DPs needs to increase the level of academic mobility of teaching staff.

The DP's management did not adequately present an action program aimed at the development of young teaching staff with specific examples; the requirements for teaching staff's IT competence at the university were not described.

#### **Strengths / Best Practices**

- Strengths are not identified by members of the EEC.

EEC Recommendations for DP 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. To consider the feasibility of developing a program for the young teachers development.

Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

1 To intensify faculty in internal and external academic mobility programs.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria for** the DP 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management": **satisfactory - 12**.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria for** the DP 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - "Management": **satisfactory - 11, requiring improvement - 1** 

# 6.8 STANDARD"EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND STUDENTS' SUPPORT SYSTEMS"

## The evidential part

The University has a material and technical base that provides for all types of practical training and research work of students, stipulated by the degree programs. The educational process is carried out in three educational buildings with a total area of 66,775.5 m<sup>2</sup>. All buildings, in which classes are held, comply with sanitary standards, fire safety requirements and the requirements of state obligatory standards of the implemented specialties.

There are specialized auditoriums that help the effective functioning of the DP. For example, the room number 501 is equipped with a stationary projector, interactive board, and with the following computer programs: "ProjectExpert", "Production Management", "Calculation of cost", "Case Management", "CRM System", "Polygraphy", and "Project Management". Room No. 514 is equipped with a stationary projector, an interactive whiteboard. Room No. 405 is equipped with projectors, laptops. There is a laboratory - the center of active teaching methods (№ 504), equipped with a stationary projector, interactive board, personal computers, in which the licensed computer programs "ProjectExpert", "Production Management", "Cost Calculation", "Business Management", "System CRM" are installed.

All training centers, laboratories are decorated in modern design and equipped with high-performance computers in the amount of 42 units. The number of seats is 42.

The laboratory conducts such disciplines as "Enterprise Management", "Planning of activities in food and light industry enterprises", "Business planning", "Enterprise cost management", etc.

Medical care for students is provided by the Municipal Enterprise on the basis of the right of economic management "City Student Polyclinic". For these purposes, the university has a health center with a treatment room. 3 general practitioners and 7 nurses from the city student polyclinic serve the University students.

Since 2015, the University has been using the "Anti-plagiarism" system for plagiarism prevention. All theses and projects, master's and doctoral theses are tested by means of this system. In order to ensure reliable PC protection, licensed "Eset endpoint antivirus" software was purchased,

which is successfully used on personal computers to protect data from malicious virus attacks. Evaluation of the quality of the functioning of the IPC "Univer", revealed a good filling of the IPC "Univer" with the educational-methodological complexes of the DP disciplines. The facilities of the IPC are applied to account for the daily attendance of students, etc.

The territory of the university is equipped with free WI-FI. In general, the University has the educational equipment and software necessary for the organization of the educational process. To provide educational and scientific processes with the necessary literature, the Scientific Library is regularly updated according to the qualification requirements of the DP (Order of the MES of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 17, 2015 No. 391, as amended on November 16, 2018 No. 634).

Library holdings of teaching, methodological and scientific literature for accredited degree program are 88778 units, including 34534 units in Kazakh

Table 5 – Library holdings of teaching, methodological and scientific literature

		Traditional of	carrier		-		e- carri	er	
Specialty name and code	Trainees contingent	Teaching and methodological literature, name/copy.	Teaching and methodological literature, including in Kazakh.	Scientific literature, name/copy	Teaching literature in English, name/copy	Teaching staff publications, works, name/copy	e-editions	e-editions, including in Kazakh	Per 1 student
5B050600 "Economics"	120	3085/16113	1362/7227	62/5223	8/39	12/1785	10947	4381	100
6M050600 'Economics"	16	95/12245	44/9469	34/5300	5/5	5/50	525	13	100
6D050600 'Economics''	4	84/5845	35/1568	7/27	7/11	5/65	1320	548	100
5B050700 'Management	93	2433/11739	1624/5215	42/9484	7/15	15/995	6629	2454	100
6M050700 'Management'	10	103/13059	51/7140	7/75	11/15	6/60	478	11	100
6D050700 'Management	2	52/6528	27/3915	5/50	5/5	3/45	148	51	100
Total:	244,25	5852/65529	3143/34534	157/20159	43/90	46/3000	20047	7458	100

The students' provision with the educational literature in general disciplines cycle, basic disciplines cycle and chief subjects cycle for 2018 is 100% completed, including licensed external electronic resources, for example, the contents of "Economics and Management", "State and Municipal Management", "Economics and Management" in ELS ZNANIUM (Moscow), Lan (St. Petersburg), IPRbooks (Saratov).

A unified library and information service system was created with a consolidated catalog with online access from any workplace. Acquisition of educational and methodical literature is carried out at the request of departments; the scientific library contains all necessary materials for training: educational, technical, reference and general literature, various periodicals. The library uses "RMEL"

(Contract No. 11 dated January 5, 2016 until 2020); IP Media LLC (Contract No. 4511/18 dated October 11, 2018); "Publishing House LAN" LLC (Contract No. Pr-5027 of November 9, 2018), ZNANIUM LLC (Contract No. 2572 ebs of November 8, 2017); RSE on PVC "Ulym Ordasy" (Contract No. 5 dated 12.27.2017); RNTB JSC (Contract No. 12-07 / 2 dated April 16, 2018), additional agreement on dissertations of the RSL (Contract No. 12-07 / 2 dated September 27, 2018) Access to foreign databases is provided to EBSCO information resources, COM, Web of Knowledge, which includes a polythematic abstract of bibliographic database of the Web of Science, to electronic scientific information resources of the Springer publishing house, which serves as the leading international search and assessment tool that allows searching for the necessary literature and provides access to electronic versions of the textbooks, teaching and methodological materials, including the materials, worked out by the University teaching staff.

The information portal, providing a wide range of information sources in the ATU, is the university's website - http://www.atu.kz. The website of the Scientific Library of ATU is http://library.atu.kz .: is presented by the newly developed information sections: "Faculties", "Teachers", "Electronic Document Delivery", "Consolidated Catalog", "Trainees", "Donors", "Ask the librarian", "External resources", "User profile", which is regularly updated, adapted to the needs of users, is logically structured.

In general, the material, technical, informational and library resources, used to organize the process of training and education, are sufficient to fulfill the stated mission, goals and objectives and meet the requirements of the accredited degree programs.

All theses, master's theses and projects are necessarily tested for plagiarism according to the order of the Rector.

In general, the material, technical, informational and library resources, used to organize the process of training and education, are sufficient to fulfill the stated mission, goals and objectives and meet the requirements of the accredited degree programs

#### Analytical part

EEC confirms the availability of support systems for students, including support through the website of the university. During meetings with trainees and teaching staff, it was revealed that, unfortunately, most of the respondents did not have financial opportunities to attend training, internships, and advanced training at leading universities in the world, therefore, it is advisable to attract students and teaching staff to the best online courses.

The Commission emphasizes that the introduction of the anti-plagiarism system allows minimizing plagiarism at the University when graduation papers are written by students. All scientific and educational-methodological works of the teaching staff subject to publication also pass through the "Anti-plagiarism" system.

As a result of the visual inspection of objects of the material base, the members of the EEC convinced that the university had all the necessary educational and material assets to ensure the educational process of the accredited degree programs. The buildings and facilities of the university complied requirements. with current sanitary standards and fire safety According to the results of the survey, the availability of library resources is fully satisfied - 91.4%, "partially satisfied" - 8.6% of students; study rooms, classrooms for large groups - 84.5% (15.5%); cabinets for small groups - 81% (15.5%); rest rooms for students - 60.3% (24.1%); computer classes and Internet resources - 82.8% (17.2%) of trainees; available computer classes - 86.2% (12.1%); scientific laboratories - 72.4% (12.1%). Full satisfaction of students with the provision of hostel is 74.1% (13.8%).

#### **Strengths / best practice:**

- 1. Sufficiency of material and technical resources and infrastructure.
- 2. Access to educational Internet resources.
- 3. The functioning of Wi-Fi on campus.

EEC recommendations for DP 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. To develop technological support for students and teaching staff by creating conditions for students to participate in the best online courses at leading universities.

**EEC** conclusions on the criteria for the DP 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700– "Management": strong - 3, satisfactory - 7.

**EEC** conclusions on the criteria for the DP 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - "Management": strong - 3, satisfactory - 7

#### 6.9 STANDARD "PUBLIC INFORMING"

#### The evidence part

Effective feedback with the trainees is carried out by:

- feedback service on the students' personal pages, teaching staff in the educational portal of the University "Univer", where the student gets access to the academic calendar, the curriculum of his specialty and the formation of an individual curriculum (information about disciplines and teachers), information resources and databases of the University libraries, studied disciplines educational materials provided by teachers. The student can familiarize himself with the results of the current, intermediate and final control in his personal account. At the end of the academic periods, the student receives full information about the studied disciplines progress (transcript).
  - Service of the official website of the university the Rector's blog.

The main means of the public informing (future students, their parents, students, graduates and employers) is the official website of the university. Social networks are also actively used (Instagram, Vkontakte, Facebook). On the pages of the above social networks there is information about the "Economics and Management" department and personal pages of the teaching staff. Information boards, posters, stands, as well as signs with the names of the faculty and departments are placed in the lobby of the university to inform applicants. Also, for conducting recruitment activities in secondary schools and private schools in Almaty and Almaty region, presentations and videos were developed containing information about the university, the DPs, admission conditions, etc. The university holds an annual job fair that allows graduates and employers to establish contact for the necessary personnel selection. The organization and conduct of professional practice, employment assistance, employment monitoring and analysis of students' career growth is carried out by the Career Center and the Department of Economics and Management; graduates annually participate in "Job Fairs", which are held on a city scale. Information about graduates' job placement opportunities is published on the website atu.kz in the "Students" section in the "Job placement and Practice" subsection.

The university annually re-publishes an advertising information booklet, shoots a video of the university's accredited degree programs, makes image products with the university logo, posts information about the department, its degree programs, about the implemented JDP for the undergraduate programs on "Economics" (ATU) and "Management" (REU named after GV. Plekhanov) on the website.

The university holds meetings with the Rector, Vice-rectors, students groups, employers, teachers and university staff, where each meeting participant can ask any question of interest to each of the leaders and get reliable information

The university management feedback with the public is carried by means of the Rector's blog. After the next appeal or question is published on the blog, the answer is published during the working day.

#### Analytical part

The EEC notes the lack of audited financial statements on the university website in terms of the DP.

Analysis of the information presented in the media showed an insufficient level of informing the public about the DP implemented.

A survey of students, conducted during the visit of the EEC of the IAAR, showed that the students' satisfaction with the information about courses, degree programs, and academic degrees was fully satisfied - 86.2%, partially satisfied - 12.1%, and not satisfied - 1.7% of students.

#### **Strengths / best practice:**

- 1. Availability of information about the qualification possibility at the DP completion
- 2. Availability of information on passing scores and training opportunities provided for students.
- 3. Availability of information and links to external resources on the results of external evaluation procedures.
- 4. The participation of the university and implemented the DP in a variety of external assessment procedures.

EEC recommendations for DP 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. Financial statements in the context of the DP shall be posted on the official website of the University.

EEC conclusions on the criteria for the DP 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management": strong - 4, satisfactory - 8, requiring improvement - 1. Conclusions WEC on the criteria for the DP 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - "Management": strong - 4, satisfactory - 8, requiring improvement - 1

#### 6.10 STANDARD "INDIVIDUAL SPECIALTIES STABDARD"

#### The evidential part

In accordance with the "Classifier of training areas with higher postgraduate education of the Republic of Kazakhstan", approved by Order No. 569 of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018, the accredited DPs refers to "Business, Management and Law", "Business and Management" sphere. The development of accredited DPs is aimed at graduates obtaining the necessary theoretical and practical training.

The educational process at the accredited DP levels is carried out by annually updating teaching materials, updating the thesis topics, and also introducing new elective disciplines. Students have access to all library resources that are updated and replenished annually, and the electronic database http / library.ATU.kz also functions.

Monitoring of the impact of introducing innovations into the training process on learning outcomes is carried out through internal audit activities by experts of the Rector's control committee (RCC), who, when assessing the professional level of teaching staff, evaluate the teaching methods used by them, through advanced training of teaching staff in courses, trainings, the system of mutual attendance of studies at methodical seminars - at various levels.

The faculty staff uses innovative teaching technologies using case-study methods and MOOC. The teachers were trained in the case studies development, the results of which were used to prepare case studies for the DP disciplines, and also to integrate the MOOC disciplines into the individual disciplines of accredited degree programs that are posted on the local ATU server http://open.atu.kz/courses/ course-v1: ATU + EiM01 + 2018\_C2 / about.

In order to familiarize students with the professional environment and current issues in the field of specialization, as well as to master practical skills based on theoretical training, the degree program provides for various types of practices: training, professional, and pre-diploma. All types of practices are conducted in accordance with the standard curriculum, according to the academic calendar and are methodologically provided.

On the recommendation of Tenizbayeva G.S., an economist for planning and analysis of "Bakhus" JSC, the following elective disciplines were included for the DP 5B050600- "Economics": "Business statistics", "Accounting and auditing". A.A. Kerimbekov, a representative of "Damu Fund"

JSC, suggested including 2 disciplines for the DP 5B050700 - "Management" in 2018-2019 academic year: "Organization Theory", "Brand Management".

The department concluded contracts for professional practice, which defines the obligations of the parties. Students are trained in accordance with the order of the Rector of the university, which indicates the base of practice, the time of its passage and the heads of practice at the enterprise. At the end of the practice, students submit reports on the approved form.

DP 6M050600 - Economics, 6M050700 - Management determined the bases of practice: AgrofudAsia LLP, BAHUS JSC, Aksai-nan LLP, Food Master LLP, Talgar Alcohol LLP, Bayserke Agro LLP, Almaty ET LLP, Rakhat JSC, Bent JSC, Almaty Expertise LLP, Baysat LLP, Altyn-Dirmen LLP, Asia Wind Service LLP, IP Aytykin M.Kh., Temir Stroy LLP, Sayakhat LLP, Demalys-K LLP, Mega Vector LLP, Tran-Bars Sauda Uyi LLP, MVT LLP, Tikturila LLP, TRAVEL EXPRSS LLP, LLP RP Group, KIT-P LLP, Asten Auto LLP, Zhauyrova M.S. IP, Algabas Group LLP, Bakan Trade LLP, etc. with which tripartite agreements were concluded.

In order to conduct professional orientation work and job placement, advisers maintain periodic communication with graduates, who periodically hold panel discussion, open days and curator hours with undergraduate students.

ATU holds job fairs annually. As a result of this preliminary work, students, even before graduation, get an idea of the labor market, existing vacancies and the requirements for them. Close work is being done with enterprises, companies of the real sector and enterprises of light and food industries. Examples of the graduates' successful job placement were presented.

#### Analytical part

Based on the results of the analysis, the EEC members came to the following conclusion. A visit to the dean's office, department, laboratories, special classrooms showed that teaching on the degree programs is carried out through the use of interactive and innovative teaching methods, software, multimedia presentation of the lecture, consideration of situational tasks, non-standard (creative) problem solving, role plays, interactive whiteboard. The content of the lecture material highlights foreign best practices, gives examples of modern achievements in the relevant field. In order to improve the educational process, experts recommend activating the academic mobility of teaching staff and master classes in the workplace.

EEC states that the full-time teachers of the DP have a long working experience at the enterprises in the field of the DP specialization. This information was also confirmed during the meeting with the faculty.

#### **Strengths / best practice:**

- No strengths identified.

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. To develop a plan for conducting practice-oriented classes, master classes at employers for the accredited DP.
  - 2. To consider the possibility of opening branches of departments at the enterprises.

**EEC** conclusions on the criteria for the DPs 5B050600 / 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 / 6M050700 - "Management": satisfactory - 6.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria for** the DPs 6D050600 - "Economics", 6D050700 - "Management": **satisfactory - 6.** 

#### (VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS / BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

#### STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAM MANAGEMENT"

- 1. The management took into account the recommendations of the EEC of the IAAR since the last procedure of external quality assurance.
- 2. The DP's management ensured the transparency of the development of the DP development plan based on the analysis of its functioning.

#### STANDARD "INFORMATION MANAGEMENT AND REPORTING"

- Strengths are not marked by members of the EEC.

#### STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAMS DEVELOPMENT AND APPROVAL"

- 1. The classification obtained at the completion of the DP for undergraduate and graduate programs is clearly defined, explained and corresponds to a certain level of the NQS.
  - 2. The work content of the DP is clearly defined in Kazakhstan credits and ECTS.

## STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAMS REGULAR MONITORING AND PERIODIC ASSESSMENT"

- Members of the EEC did not reveal strengths.

## STANDARD "STUDENT - CENTERED TRAINING, TEACHING AND PROGRESS MONITORING"

- Members of the EEC have not identified the best practice.

#### STANDARD "TRAINEES"

- 1. The university provides the DP graduates with documents on the confirmation of qualifications.
  - 2. A good support mechanism for gifted students has been developed.

#### STANDARD "TEACHING STAFF"

- Members of the EEC did not reveal best practice.

#### STANDARD "EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND SUPPORT SYSTEMS SYSTEMS"

- 1. Sufficiency of material and technical resources and infrastructure.
- 2. Access to educational Internet resources.
- 3. The functioning of Wi-Fi on campus.

#### STANDARD "PUBLIC INFORMING"

- 1. Availability of information on the qualification possibility at the DP completion
- 2. Availability of information on passing scores and training opportunities provided for students.
- 3. Availability of information and links to external resources on the results of external evaluation procedures.
- 4. The participation of the university and implemented the DPs in a variety of external assessment procedures.

#### STANDARD "INDIVIDUAL SPECIALTIES STANDARDS"

- Members of the EEC did not reveal best practice.

### (VIII) REVIEW OF THE RECOMMENDATION ON QUALITY IMPROVEMENT FOR EACH STANDARD

#### STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAM MANAGEMENT"

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. To systematize the process of monitoring the implementation of innovations implemented in the DP. The DP management shall promote the creation of greater opportunities for combining teaching with science and innovation.
- 2. To practice the training of university managers and accredited DPs management in educational management programs.
- 3. To take complex measures on the gradual transition of the university to trilingual education and introduce the practice of specialized subjects teaching in English.

Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. The DP management shall continue the systematic work on the definition and formation of the uniqueness of the degree programs in accordance with the national priorities of the country's economic development and in connection with the transition of Kazakhstan to the digital economy.
- 2. A culture of quality assurance in the context of doctoral programs should be developed, that is, to demonstrate the results of the assessment of satisfaction, to show the impact of changes on the image of the university and this DP.
- 3. In order to reduce possible risks in the management of the DP, to continue the study of changes in the internal and external environment.

#### STANDARD "INFORMATION MANAGEMENT AND REPORTING"

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. To develop DP by the beginning of 2019-2020 academic year.
- 2. Create a plan and organize introductory courses for DP managers on the planning of learning outcomes, organizing the educational process on degree programs in accordance with the CTT and implementing the basic principles of the Bologna process.
- 3. DP management shall develop a refined graduate model and DP development plan, taking into account the specifics of specialties in accordance with the NQF, SQS and Dublin descriptors and designate those responsible for the execution of the plan.
- 4. To intensify work on the involvement of all categories of University staff: students, employees and teaching staff in the process of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.

Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. To enhance the profile of the program, it is necessary to analyze the trends in a particular specialty from the point of view of domestic and international characteristics and criteria by the beginning of a new academic year.
  - 2. To improve the model of the graduate, taking into account the wishes of the shareholders.
  - 3. The DP management shall develop joint programs with foreign educational organizations.

#### STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT AND APPROVAL"

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. The management of the faculty shall strengthen the work in the preparation of students for professional certification in DP, as the output of professional standards and the opening of certification centers.

Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. Faculty leadership should work to ensure the assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the DP.
- 2. The management of the University on a regular basis shall conduct the examination of the DP.
- 3. When forming the cycle of the chief subjects, it is necessary to use the inclusion of practice-oriented disciplines as a priority, consider the possibility of introducing elements of dual training in DP.
  - 4. To update the content of the DP in the light of the latest achievements of science.
- 5. The leadership of the DP shall strengthen the work on the development and implementation of joint degree programs with foreign educational organizations.

## STANDARD "DEGREE PROGRAMS REGULAR MONITORING AND PERIODIC ASSESSMENT"

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. On a regular basis to monitor the labor market, the external environment, employers' requests in the development and updating of the content and structure of the DP.

## Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. Continue work on improving the content and structure of the DP. To intensify the work on degree programs updating, with the publication of all the changes made on the university website, taking into account the specialization of the University and the involvement of all interested parties.
- 2. The leadership of the DP shall systematize the revision of the content and structure of the degree programs with the participation of faculty, students and employers.

## STANDARD "STUDENT CENTERED TRAINING, TEACHING AND PROGRESS MONITORING"

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. To conduct own research in the field of DP academic subjects teaching.

#### STANDARD "TRAINING"

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. To provide special adaptation and support programs for foreign students.
- 2. Develop a target program for internal and external mobility of undergraduates and doctoral students, taking into account the proposals for affordable internal and external academic mobility of DP students.

#### **STANDARD "TEACHING STAFF"**

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. Consider the feasibility of developing a program for the young teachers development.

Additional recommendations on doctoral programs 6D050600 - "Economics" and 6D050700 - "Management":

1. Intensify faculty in internal and external academic mobility programs.

## STANDARD "EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND STUDENTS'SUPPORT SYSTEMS" EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. To develop technological support for students and teaching staff by creating conditions for students to participate in the best online courses at leading universities.

#### STANDARD "PUBLIC INFORMING"

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

1. Financial statements in the context of the DP shall be posted on the University official site.

#### STANDARD "INDIVIDUAL SPECIALTIES STANDARDS"

EEC recommendations for DPs 5B050600, 6M050600, 6D050600 - "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700, 6D050700 - "Management":

- 1. To develop a plan for conducting practice-oriented classes, master classes at employers for the accredited DP.
  - 2. To consider the possibility of opening branches of departments in enterprises.

# Appendix 1. Evaluation table "SPECIALIZED PROFILE PARAMETERS" (5B050600 - "Economics", 6M050600 - "Economics", 5B050700 - "Management", 6M050700 - "Management")

Nº	№	Evaluation Criteria	orga	Position of organization education		
			Strong	Satisfactory	Suggest improvement	Unsatisfactory
Star	ndar	d ''Management of the degree program''				
1	1.	University should have a published quality assurance policy.		+		
2	2.	The quality assurance policy should reflect the link between research, teaching and learning.	_	1		
3	3.	University should demonstrate the development of a culture of quality assurance, including in the context of the DP.		+		
4	4.	Commitment to quality assurance should relate to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint / double-diploma education and academic mobility.		+		
5	5.	The DP's management ensures the transparency of the development plan of the DP based on the analysis of its functioning, the real positioning of the university and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of the state, employers, stakeholders and students.				
6	6.	The DP's management demonstrates the functioning of the mechanisms for the formation and regular review of the DP development plan and monitoring its implementation, evaluation of the achievement of learning objectives, compliance with the needs of students, employers and society, decision-making aimed at continuous improvement of DP.		+		
7	7.	DP management should involve representatives of groups of stakeholders, including employers, students and faculty members in the formation of the DP development plan.		+		
8	8.	The DP management must demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the DP development plan, its consistency with the national development priorities and the development strategy of the educational organization.			+	

9 University should demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for the business processes within the DP, the unambiguous distribution of job responsibilities staff, separation of functions of collegial bodies.  10 10 DP management must provide evidence of the transparency of the degree program management system.  11 11. DP management must demonstrate the successful functioning of the internal quality assurance system of the DP, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, making decisions based on facts.  12 12 DP management must implement the risk management.  13 13 DP management should ensure the participation of the representatives of stakeholders (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegial bodies of the degree program management, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the degree program.  14 14 University should demonstrate the management of innovations in the framework of the DP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.  15 15 DP management must demonstrate evidence of openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested persons.  16 16 DP management must be trained in educational management programs.  17 17. DP management should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in preparing for the next procedure.  18 1. The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the units and departments, research.							
degree program management system.  11 11. DP management must demonstrate the successful functioning of the internal quality assurance system of the DP, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, making decisions based on facts.  12 12 DP management must implement the risk management.  13 13. DP management should ensure the participation of the representatives of stakeholders (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegial bodies of the degree program management, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the degree program.  14 14. University should demonstrate the management of innovations in the framework of the DP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.  15 15. DP management must demonstrate evidence of openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested persons.  16 16. DP management must be trained in educational management programs.  17 17. DP management should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in preparing for the next procedure.  18 1. The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	9	9.	for the business processes within the DP, the unambiguous distribution of job responsibilities staff, separation of functions of collegial		+		
internal quality assurance system of the DP, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, making decisions based on facts.  12 12 DP management must implement the risk management.  13 13. DP management should ensure the participation of the representatives of stakeholders (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegial bodies of the degree program management, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the degree program.  14 14. University should demonstrate the management of innovations in the framework of the DP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.  15 15. DP management must demonstrate evidence of openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested persons.  16 16. DP management must be trained in educational management programs.  17 17. DP management should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in preparing for the next procedure.  18 1. The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	10	10.			+		
13. DP management should ensure the participation of the representatives of stakeholders (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegial bodies of the degree program management, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the degree program.  14. University should demonstrate the management of innovations in the framework of the DP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.  15. DP management must demonstrate evidence of openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested persons.  16. 16. DP management must be trained in educational management programs.  17. DP management should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in preparing for the next procedure.  18. 1. The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19. 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20. 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	11	11.	internal quality assurance system of the DP, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, making decisions		+		
of stakeholders (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegial bodies of the degree program management, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the degree program.  14 14. University should demonstrate the management of innovations in the framework of the DP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.  15 15. DP management must demonstrate evidence of openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested persons.  16 16 DP management must be trained in educational management programs.  17 17. DP management should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in preparing for the next procedure.  Total for the standard  2 11 4 -  Standard "Information Management and Reporting"  1 The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	12	12	DP management must implement the risk management.			+	
framework of the DP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.  15	13	13.	of stakeholders (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegial bodies of the degree program management, as well as their		+		
accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested persons.  16 16. DP management must be trained in educational management programs.  17 17. DP management should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in preparing for the next procedure.  Total for the standard  2 11 4 -  Standard "Information Management and Reporting"  18 1. The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	14	14.	framework of the DP, including the analysis and implementation of			+	
programs.  17 17. DP management should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in preparing for the next procedure.  Total for the standard  2 11 4  Standard "Information Management and Reporting"  18 1. The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	15	15.	accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other		+		
the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in preparing for the next procedure.  Total for the standard  2 11 4  Standard "Information Management and Reporting"  18 1. The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	16	16.				4	
Standard "Information Management and Reporting"  18 1. The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	17	17.	the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in		/		
18 1. The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	Tota	al fo	the standard	2	11	4	-
collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.  19 2. DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	Stan	<u>ıda</u> r	d "Information Management and Reporting"				
processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.  20 3. Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	18	1.	collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and		+		
all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness	19	2.	processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.		+		
	20	3.	all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness			+	

35		The university should define and document the procedures for the development of DP and their approval at the institutional level.		+		
St	and	ard ''Development and approval of degree programs''				
		the standard	<b>-</b>	14	3	-
T	1.6	- 4h4 JJ		1.4	2	
34	17.	DP management should contribute to the provision of all necessary information in relevant fields of science.		+		
33	16.	Students, employees and faculty must document their consent to the personal data processing.		+		
32	15.	Employment and career growth of graduates.		+		
31	14.	availability of educational resources and support systems for students;		+		
30	13.	the students satisfaction with implementation of the DP and the quality of education at the university;	4	+		
29	12	level of performance, achievements of students and deductions;		+	6	
28		dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types;		+		
27	10.	key performance indicators;		+		
		the activity, including in the context of the DP.  Information collected and analyzed by the university should take into account:		1		
26		The university should evaluate the performance and effectiveness of		+		
25		The university should provide a measure of the degree of satisfaction of the needs of faculty, staff and students in the framework of the DP and demonstrate the evidence to eliminate the identified deficiencies.		+		
24		DP management must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for communication with students, employees and other interested parties, including the existence of mechanisms for resolving conflicts.		+		
23		An important factor is the involvement of students, employees and teaching staff in the process of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.		+		
22	5.	The University must demonstrate the determination of the order and protection of the information, including defining the persons responsible for the accuracy and timeliness of the information and analysis of data.		+		
21	4.	The university should establish the frequency, forms and methods for evaluating the management of DP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural divisions, senior management, the implementation of research projects.			+	

36	2.	DP management must ensure that the developed DPs comply with the established goals, including the expected learning outcomes.		+		
37	3.	The DP management should ensure the availability of developed models of graduate of DP, describing learning outcomes and personal qualities.		+		
38	4.	DP management must demonstrate the conduct of external examinations of the DP.		+		
39	5.	Qualifications received at the end of the DP should be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of the NSC.	+			
40	6.	The DP management must determine the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.		+		
41	7.	An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification.			+	
42	8.	The DP management must provide evidence of the participation of students, faculty and other stakeholders in the development of DP ensuring their quality.		+		
43	9.	The complexity of the DP should be clearly defined in Kazakhstan credit and ECTS systems.	+			
44	10.	The DP management must provide the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes to the level of education (bachelor, master, doctorate).		+		
45	11.	The structure of the DP should provide for various activities corresponding to the learning outcomes.		+		
46	12.	An important factor is availability of joint DPs with foreign educational organizations.		+	L	
Tota	l foi	the standard	2	9	1	-
		ard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of ograms"		1		
47	1.	The university should conduct monitoring and periodic evaluation of DP in order to ensure the achievement of the goal and meet the needs of students and society. The results of these processes are aimed at continuous improvement of the DP.	1		+	
		Monitoring and periodic evaluation of DP should consider:				
48	2.	the content of the programs in the light of the latest achievements of science in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline being taught;		+		
49	3.	changes in the needs of society and the professional environment;		+		
50	4.	load, performance and graduation of students;		+		
51	5.	effectiveness of student assessment procedures;		+		

52 53	6. 7.	expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with training in DP; educational environment and supporting services		+		
	, .	and their compliance with the objectives of the DP.		+		
54	8.	The university and the administration of DP must provide evidence of the participation of students, employers and other stakeholders in the revision of the DP.		+		
55	9.	All stakeholders should be informed about any planned or taken action in respect of DP. All changes made to the DP should be published.		+		
56		DP management must provide a review of the content and structure of the DP, taking into account the changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of the society.		+		
		the standard		9	1	-
	ındar ress''	rd "Student-focused learning, teaching and assessment of				
57	1.	The DP's management must ensure respect and attention to the various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths.		+		
58	2.	The administration of DP must ensure the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning.		+		
59	3.	An important factor is the availability of own research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines DP.			+	
60	4.	The DP's management must demonstrate the presence of a feedback system on the use of various teaching methods and evaluation of learning outcomes.		+		
61	5.	DP management must demonstrate support for the students' independence with simultaneous guidance and assistance from the teacher.		7		
62	6.	DP management must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to students' complaints.	7	+		
63	7.	The university should ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for assessing learning outcomes for each DP, including the appeal.		+		
64	8.	The university should ensure the conformity of the evaluation procedures of students with DP to the planned learning outcomes and program objectives. Criteria and assessment methods in the framework of the DP should be published in advance.	-	+		
65	9.	The university should determine the mechanisms to ensure that each graduate of the PF learns the learning outcomes and ensure their completeness.		+		
66	10.	Assessing persons should possess modern methods of assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.		+		
Tota	l for	the standard	-	9	1	-

Standar	rd "Students"				
0 0 (1	The university should demonstrate the policy of forming a contingent of students from admission to graduation and ensure the transparency of its procedures. The procedures governing the life cycle of students from admission to completion) must be defined, approved, published.		+		
S	The DP's management must demonstrate the implementation of special adaptation and support programs for new-comers and foreign students.		+		
	The university should demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention.		+		
a Ii N	The university should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers ENIC / NARIC to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.		+		
n	OP management must demonstrate the presence and application of a mechanism to recognize the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal education.		+		
iı	The university should provide an opportunity for external and nternal mobility of students of DP, as well as assist them in obtaining external grants for training.		+		
p	OP management should make the maximum amount of effort to provide students with practical training places, to facilitate the employment of graduates, to maintain communication with them.		+		
c	The university should provide graduates of DP with documents confirming their qualifications, including the achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion.	/			
	An important factor is the monitoring of the employment and professional activity of graduates of DP.		+		
e	The DP management should actively encourage students to self- education and development outside the main program extracurricular activities).		+		
	An important factor is the presence of a valid alumni association association.		+		
	An important factor is the presence of a support mechanism for gifted students.	+			
Total for th	ne standard	2	10	-	_
Standard	d ''Teaching staff''				

79	1.	The university should have an objective and transparent personnel policy, including recruitment, professional growth and staff		+		
		development, ensuring the professional competence of the entire state.				
80	2.	The university should demonstrate the compliance of the staff potential of faculty with the development strategy of the university and the specifics of the DP.		+		
81	3.	DP management must demonstrate an awareness of responsibility for its employees and provide them with favorable working conditions.		+		
82	4.	DP management must demonstrate the changing role of the teacherin connection with the transition to		+		
		Student-focused training.				
83	5.	The university should determine the contribution of teaching staff to the implementation of the university's development strategy, and other strategic documents.		+		
84	6.	The university should provide the opportunities for career growth and professional development of the DP teaching staff.		+		
85	7.	The DP management should involve practitioners of the relevant industries in teaching.		+ 1		
86	8.	The DP management should provide targeted actions for the development of young teachers.		+	1	
87	9.	The university should demonstrate the motivation of professional and personal development of DP teachers, including the promotion of both the integration of science and education, and the use of innovative teaching methods.		+		
88	10.	An important factor is active use of information and communication technologies faculty in the educational process (for example, on-line learning, e-portfolio, MEP, etc.).		+		
89	11.	An important factor is development of academic mobility in the framework of the DP, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers.			+	
90		An important factor is involvement of teaching staff in the community (the role of teaching staff in the education system, in the development of science, the region, creating a cultural environment, participation in exhibitions, creative competitions, charity programs, etc.).				
		the standard	-	12	-	-
Sta supp	ndaı ort"	d "Educational resources and systems student				
91	1.	DP management must demonstrate the adequacy of material and technical resources and infrastructure.	+			
92	2.	The DP management must demonstrate the existence of procedures for supporting various groups of students, including information and counseling.		+		

		The DP's management must demonstrate the compliance of information resources with the specifics of the DP, including compliance:				
93	3.	technological support for students and teaching staff in accordance with degree programs (for example, online training, modeling, databases, data analysis programs);		+		
94	4.	library resources, including the fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general educational, basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases;		+		
95	5.	access to educational Internet resources;	+			
96	6.	examination of the results of research, final works, theses on plagiarism;		+		
97	7.	WI-FI functioning on the territory of the educational organization.	+			
98	8.	The university should ensure that the educational equipment and software used for the development of DP, were similar to those used in their respective industries.		1		
99	9.	The university should ensure compliance with safety requirements in the learning process.		+		
100	10	The university should strive to take into account the needs of various groups of students in the context of DP (adults, workers, foreign students, and students with disabilities).		+		
Total	of s	tandard	3	7		-
Sta	ndaı	rd "Public Awareness"				
		Published institution under DP information must be accurate, objective, relevant and should include:				
101	1.	implemented program with an indication of the expected learning outcomes;		+		
102	2.	information about the possibility of assigning qualifications at the end of the DP;	+			
103		information about teaching, learning, assessment procedures;		+		
104		information about the scores and training opportunities provided by students;	+			
105		information about the opportunities. graduate employment		+		
106	6.	DP management should use a variety of ways to disseminate information (including the media, web resources, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and stakeholders.		+		
L	1	I .			l	L

107	7.	Public awareness should provide support and clarification of national development programs of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education.		+		
108	8.	The university should publish audited financial statements on its own web resource.			+	
109		The university should demonstrate the information on the web resource describing the university as a whole and in the context of the DP.		+		
110	10.	An important factor is the availability of adequate and objective information about the faculty of the DP, in the context of personalities.		+		
111	11.	An important factor is public awareness of cooperation and interaction with partners in the DP, including research / consulting organizations, business partners, the social partners and organizations		+		
112	12.	The university should post information and links to external resources on the results of external assessment procedures.	+			
113		An important factor is the participation of the university and implemented DP in a variety of external assessment procedures.	+			
Total	for	the standard	4	8	1	-
Stand	lard	s in the context of individual specialties				
SOCI	IAL	SCIENCES, ECONOMICS AND BUSINESS		7		
		Educational programs in the field of "SOCIAL SCIENCES, ECONOMICS AND BUSINESS", such as "Finance", "Accounting and Audit", etc., must meet the following requirements:				
114		The DP's management must demonstrate that the teaching within the program is conducted on the basis of modern achievements of world science and practice in the field of specialization, as well as using modern and advanced teaching methods;	A	+		
115		The DP management must guarantee students access to the most up-to-date and up-to-date data (statistics, news, scientific results) in the field of paper specialization (newspapers, statistical data collections, textbooks) and electronic media;		+		
116		Objectives, respectively, and the learning outcomes should be aimed at students obtaining specific skills in demand in the labor market;		+		
117		DP management must demonstrate that graduates of the program possess these skills and that these skills are really in demand in the market;		+		

119	6. The DP management must demonstrate an analysis of the labor market and give examples of successful employment of graduates.  for the standard	r	+	
119	·	r	+	
	knowledge, such as work experience, training at enterprises participation in practicing specialists in lectures and seminars, etc.;	,	+	
118	5. DP should include a significant number of disciplines and activities aimed at obtaining practical experience of applying theoretical	1		

Appendix 2. Evaluation table "SPECIALIZED PROFILE PARAMETERS" (6D050600 - "Economy", 6D050700 - "Management")

N:	. No	Evaluation Criteria	Position of the organization of education			
	•		Strong	Satisfactory	Suggest improveme	Unsatisfactory
Star	ıdar	d "Management of the degree program"				
1	18.	University should have a published quality assurance policy.		+	9	
2	19.	The quality assurance policy should reflect the link between research, teaching and learning.		+		
3	20.	University should demonstrate the development of a culture of quality assurance, including in the context of the DP.		+		
4	21.	Commitment to quality assurance should relate to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint / double-diploma education and academic mobility.		+		
5	22.	The DP's management ensures the transparency of the development plan of the DP based on the analysis of its functioning, the real positioning of the university and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of the state, employers, stakeholders and students.		+		

6		The DP's management demonstrates the functioning of the mechanisms for the formation and regular review of the DP development plan and monitoring its implementation, evaluation of the achievement of learning objectives, compliance with the needs of students, employers and society, decision-making aimed at continuous improvement of DP.		+	
7	24.	DP management should involve representatives of groups of stakeholders, including employers, students and faculty members in the formation of the DP development plan.	+		
8	25.	The DP management must demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the DP development plan, its consistency with the national development priorities and the development strategy of the educational organization.		+	
9	26.	University should demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for the business processes within the DP, the unambiguous distribution of job responsibilities staff, separation of functions of collegial bodies.	+		
10	27.	DP management must provide evidence of the transparency of the degree program management system.	+		
11	28.	DP management must demonstrate the successful functioning of the internal quality assurance system of the DP, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, making decisions based on facts.	+		
12	29.	DP management must implement the risk management.		ь	
13	30.	DP management should ensure the participation of the representatives of stakeholders (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegial bodies of the degree program management, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the degree program.		+	
14	31.	University should demonstrate the management of innovations in the framework of the DP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.		+	
15	32.	DP management must demonstrate evidence of openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested persons.	+		
16	33.	DP management must be trained in educational management programs.		+	

17	34.	DP management should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure was taken into account in preparing for the next procedure.			+	
		Total for the standard	-	9	8	-
Sta	anda	rd "Information Management and Reporting"				
18	18.	The University should ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.		+		
19	19.	DP management must demonstrate the systematic use of the processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.		+		
20	20	Within the DP there should be a system of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the units and departments, research.			+	
21	21.	The university should establish the frequency, forms and methods for evaluating the management of DP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural divisions, senior management, the implementation of research projects.			+	
22	22.	The University must demonstrate the determination of the order and protection of the information, including defining the persons responsible for the accuracy and timeliness of the information and analysis of data.		+		
23	23	An important factor is the involvement of students, employees and teaching staff in the process of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.		/	+	
24	24.	DP management must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for communication with students, employees and other interested parties, including the existence of mechanisms for resolving conflicts.		+		
25	25.	The university should provide a measure of the degree of satisfaction of the needs of faculty, staff and students in the framework of the DP and demonstrate the evidence to eliminate the identified deficiencies.		+		
26	26.	The university should evaluate the performance and effectiveness of the activity, including in the context of the DP.			+	
		Information collected and analyzed by the university should take into account:				

27	27.	key performance indicators;		+		
28	28.	dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types;		+		
29	29.	level of performance, achievements of students and deductions;		+		
30	30.	the students satisfaction with implementation of theDP and the quality of education at the university;		+		
31	31.	availability of educational resources and support systems for students;		+		
32	32.	Employment and career growth of graduates.			+	
33	33.	Students, employees and faculty must document their consent to the personal data processing.		+		
34	34.	DP management should contribute to the provision of all necessary information in relevant fields of science.	7	1		
		Total for the standard	-	12	5	-
	Stan	dard "Development and approval of degree programs"				
35	13.	The university should define and document the procedures for the development of DP and their approval at the institutional level.		+		
36	14.	DP management must ensure that the developed DPs comply with the established goals, including the expected learning outcomes.	_	+	6	
37	15.	The DP management should ensure the availability of developed models of graduate of DP, describing learning outcomes and personal qualities.		7		
38	16.	DP management must demonstrate the conduct of external examinations of the DP.			+	
39	17.	Qualifications received at the end of the DP should be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of the NSC.		+		
40	18.	The DP management must determine the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.			+	
41	19.	An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification.			+	
			Ì	1		
42	20.	The DP management must provide evidence of the participation of students, faculty and other stakeholders in the development of DP, ensuring their quality.			+	

43	21.	The complexity of the DP should be clearly defined in Kazakhstan credit and ECTS systems.	+			
44	22.	The DP management must provide the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes to the level of education (bachelor, master, doctorate).		+		
45	23.	The structure of the DP should provide for various activities corresponding to the learning outcomes.		+		
46	24.	An important factor is availability of joint DPs with foreign educational organizations.			+	
		Total for the standard	1	6	5	-
	<b>ndar</b> gree	rd "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation programs"				
47	11.	The university should conduct monitoring and periodic evaluation of DP in order to ensure the achievement of the goal and meet the needs of students and society. The results of these processes are aimed at continuous improvement of the DP.		1	+	
		Monitoring and periodic evaluation of DP should consider:				
48	12.	the content of the programs in the light of the latest achievements of science in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline being taught;		1	+	
49	13.	changes in the needs of society and the professional environment;		+	6	
50	14.	load, performance and graduation of students;	A	+		
51	15.	effectiveness of student assessment procedures;	7	+		
52	16.	expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with training in DP;		+		
53	17.	educational environment and supporting services and their compliance with the objectives of the DP.		+		
54	18.	The university and the administration of DP must provide evidence of the participation of students, employers and other stakeholders in the revision of the DP.			+	
55	19.	All stakeholders should be informed about any planned or taken action in respect of DP. All changes made to the DP should be published.		+		

56	20.	DP management must provide a review of the content and structure of the DP, taking into account the changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of the society.			+	
		Total for the standard	-	6	4	-
	ndard ress''	"Student-focused learning, teaching and assessment of				
57	11.	The DP's management must ensure respect and attention to the various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths.		+		
58	12.	The administration of DP must ensure the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning.		+		
59	13.	An important factor is the availability of own research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines DP.			+	
60	14.	The DP's management must demonstrate the presence of a feedback system on the use of various teaching methods and evaluation of learning outcomes.	\ =	+		
61	15.	DP management must demonstrate support for the students' independence with simultaneous guidance and assistance from the teacher.		+		
62	16.	DP management must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to students' complaints.		+		
63	17.	The university should ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for assessing learning outcomes for each DP, including the appeal.	A	+		
64	18.	The university should ensure the conformity of the evaluation procedures of students with DP to the planned learning outcomes and program objectives. Criteria and assessment methods in the framework of the DP should be published in advance.		+		
65	19.	The university should determine the mechanisms to ensure that each graduate of the PF learns the learning outcomes and ensure their completeness.		+		
66	20.	Assessing persons should possess modern methods of assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.		+		
		Total for the standard	-	9	1	-
Sta	andaı	rd "Students"				

67	13.	The university should demonstrate the policy of forming a contingent of students from admission to graduation and ensure the transparency of its procedures. The procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion) must be defined, approved, published.		+		
68	14.	The DP's management must demonstrate the implementation of special adaptation and support programs for new-comers and foreign students.		+		
69	15.	The university should demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention.		+		
70	16.	The university should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers ENIC / NARIC to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.		+		
71	17.	DP management must demonstrate the presence and application of a mechanism to recognize the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal education.		)	+	
72	18.	The university should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of students of DP, as well as assist them in obtaining external grants for training.			+	
73	19.	DP management should make the maximum amount of effort to provide students with practical training places, to facilitate the employment of graduates, to maintain communication with them.	4	+		
74	20.	The university should provide graduates of DP with documents confirming their qualifications, including the achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion.		+		
75	21.	An important factor is the monitoring of the employment and professional activity of graduates of DP.			+	
76	22.	The DP management should actively encourage students to self-education and development outside the main program (extracurricular activities).		+		
77	23.	An important factor is the presence of a valid alumni association / association.		+		
78	24.	An important factor is the presence of a support mechanism for gifted students.	+			

		Total for the standard	1	8	3	-
Sta	ndar	d ''Teaching staff''				
79	13.	The university should have an objective and transparent personnel policy, including recruitment, professional growth and staff development, ensuring the professional competence of the entire state.		+		
80	14.	The university should demonstrate the compliance of the staff potential of faculty with the development strategy of the university and the specifics of the DP.		+		
81	15.	DP management must demonstrate an awareness of responsibility for its employees and provide them with favorable working conditions.		+		
82	16.	DP management must demonstrate the changing role of the teacher in connection with the transition to	1	+		
	1	Student-focused training.	\	+		
83	17.	The university should determine the contribution of teaching staff to the implementation of the university's development strategy, and other strategic documents.		+		
84	18.	The university should provide the opportunities for career growth and professional development of the DP teaching staff.		*		
85	19.	The DP management should involve practitioners of the relevant industries in teaching.		+	6	
86	20.	The DP management should provide targeted actions for the development of young teachers.	4	7		
87	21.	The university should demonstrate the motivation of professional and personal development of DP teachers, including the promotion of both the integration of science and education, and the use of innovative teaching methods.		+		
88	22.	An important factor is active use of information and communication technologies faculty in the educational process (for example, on-line learning, e-portfolio, MEP, etc.).		+		
89	23.	An important factor is development of academic mobility in the framework of the DP, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers.			+	
90	24.	An important factor is involvement of teaching staff in the community (the role of teaching staff in the education system, in the development of science, the region, creating a cultural environment, participation in exhibitions, creative competitions,		+		

		Total for the standard	-	11	1	-
	dard	"Educational resources and systems student				
supp	ort"					
91	1.	DP management must demonstrate the adequacy of material and technical resources and infrastructure.	+			
92	2.	The DP management must demonstrate the existence of procedures for supporting various groups of students, including information and counseling.		+		
		The DP's management must demonstrate the compliance of information resources with the specifics of the DP, including compliance:				
93	3.	technological support for students and teaching staff in accordance with degree programs (for example, online training, modeling,		+		
		databases, data analysis programs);				
94	4.	library resources, including the fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general educational, basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases;		+		
95	5.	access to educational Internet resources;	+			
96	6.	examination of the results of research, final works, theses on plagiarism;	Â	7		
97	7.	WI-FI functioning on the territory of the educational organization.	4			
98	8.	The university should ensure that the educational equipment and software used for the development of DP, were similar to those used in their respective industries.		+		
99	9.	The university should ensure compliance with safety requirements in the learning process.		+		
100	10.	The university should strive to take into account the needs of various groups of students in the context of DP (adults, workers, foreign students, and students with disabilities).		+		
	1	Total of standard	3	7	-	-
Stan	dard	"Public Awareness"				

		Published institution under DP information must be accurate, objective, relevant and should include:				
101	1.	implemented program with an indication of the expected learning outcomes;		+		
102	2.	information about the possibility of assigning qualifications at the end of the DP;	+			
103	3.	information about teaching, learning, assessment procedures;		+		
104	4.	information about the scores and training opportunities provided by students;	+			
105	5.	information about the opportunities. graduate employment		+		
106	6.	DP management should use a variety of ways to disseminate information (including the media, web resources, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and stakeholders.		+		
107	7.	Public awareness should provide support and clarification of national development programs of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education.		+		
108	8.	The university should publish audited financial statements on its own web resource.			+	
109	9.	The university should demonstrate the information on the web resource describing the university as a whole and in the context of the DP.	A	+	6	
110	10.	An important factor is the availability of adequate and objective information about the faculty of the DP, in the context of personalities.		+		
111	11.	An important factor is public awareness of cooperation and interaction with partners in the DP, including research / consulting organizations, business partners, the social partners and organizations		+		
112	12.	The university should post information and links to external resources on the results of external assessment procedures.	+			
113	13.	An important factor is the participation of the university and implemented DP in a variety of external assessment procedures.	+			
		Total for the standard	4	8	1	-
Sta	ndar	ds in the context of individual specialties				

SOCI	AL SCIENCES, ECONOMICS AND BUSINESS				
	Educational programs in the field of				
	"SOCIAL SCIENCES, ECONOMICS AND BUSINESS",				
	such as "Finance", "Accounting and Audit", etc., must meet the following requirements:				
114	. The DP's management must demonstrate that the teaching within the program is conducted on the basis of modern achievements of world science and practice in the field of specialization, as well as using modern and advanced teaching methods;		+		
115	The DP management must guarantee students access to the most up-to-date and up-to-date data (statistics, news, scientific results) in the field of paper specialization (newspapers, statistical data collections, textbooks) and electronic media;		+		
116	Objectives, respectively, and the learning outcomes should be aimed at students obtaining specific skills in demand in the labor market;	/	+		
117	DP management must demonstrate that graduates of the program possess these skills and that these skills are really in demand in the market;		+		
118	DP should include a significant number of disciplines and activities aimed at obtaining practical experience of applying theoretical knowledge, such as work experience, training at enterprises, participation in practicing specialists in lectures and seminars, etc.;	_	+		
119	The DP management must demonstrate an analysis of the labor market and give examples of successful employment of graduates.		+		
	Total for the standard	-	6	-	-
	TOTAL	9	82	28	-