

## **Accreditation Report and Recommendation**

Accreditation at

**L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University (ENU)**

**5B020200 “International Relations” (Bachelor), 6M020200 “International Relations” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course), 6M020200 “International Relations” (Profile Master course), 5B050200 “Political Science” (Bachelor), 6M050200 “Political Science” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course)**

### **I Procedure**

**Date of contract:** 7<sup>th</sup> September 2017

**Receipt of self-evaluation report:** 6<sup>th</sup> November 2017

**Date of the on-site-visit:** 12<sup>th</sup>-16<sup>th</sup> November 2017

**Chairman of the expert group:** Vladimir Nikolayevich Kosov, Doctor of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, professor of Kazakh National University named after Abai

**Attendance by ACQUIN:** Dr. Stefan Handke, Head of International Department, ACQUIN e.V. (Bayreuth, Germany);

Nina Soroka, Deputy Head of International Department ACQUIN e.V. (Bayreuth, Germany);

**Attendance by IAAR:** Timur Yerbolatovich Kanapyanov, Manager of International Projects and Public Relations, IAAR (Astana)

**Members of the expert group:**

Drafting of the report: December 2017

- Private lecturer Dr. Rolf Steltemeier, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology; Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Deputy Director General Representative European Affairs);
- Professor Dr. Reinhard Zintl, University of Bamberg, Trimberg Research Academy;
- Professor Galiya Ahmetvalievna Movkebayeva, Doctor of Historical Sciences, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University;
- Associate professor Arslan Amanbayevich Ivashov, Candidate of Philosophical Sciences, University of International Business (UIB);
- Representative of professional practice Zharas Omirbekovich Baybosynov, Head of the Department of Human Capital Development of the Chamber of Entrepreneurs in Astana

The **evaluation report** of the expert group is based on the self-evaluation documentation of the higher education institution and extensive discussions with the heads of the study programmes, faculty members, students, and employers.

**Evaluation criteria** are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) in the official version valid at the time the contract is concluded. At the same time the national context, particularly the national rules regulating the establishment of study programmes, has been taken into account.

*The applicant will receive the report in parts I-III to comment on it. Part IV entitled Recommendations for the Accreditation will be received by the relevant and responsible Standing Expert Committee and Accreditation Commission only.*

## **Table of Contents**

1. Initial Situation .....	6
2. Outcomes of the first accreditation.....	7
3. Description of the facts and assessment (in accordance with ESG) .....	8
Part 1. Standards and guidelines for internal quality assurance.....	8
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance.....	8
Assessment .....	8
Conclusion.....	11
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes.....	12
Study programmes “International Relations” (Bachelor and Master) .....	12
Assessment of the programme “International Relations” (Bachelor/Master).....	16
Study programmes “Political Science” (Bachelor and Master) .....	19
Assessment of the program Political Science (Bachelor/Master).....	24
Overall conclusion for Standard 1.2.....	27
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment .....	30
Description and assessment .....	30
Conclusion.....	37
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition and certification .	38
Assessment .....	38
Conclusion .....	42
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.5: Teaching staff.....	43
Assessment.....	43
Conclusion.....	49
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support .....	50
Assessment.....	50
Conclusion.....	53
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.7: Information management .....	54
Assessment.....	54

Conclusion.....	59
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.8: Public information.....	60
Assessment.....	60
Conclusion.....	63
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes .....	64
Assessment.....	64
Conclusion.....	66
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance .....	67
Assessment.....	67
Conclusion.....	67
4. Recommendation for the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN and Accreditation Council of IAAR .....	68
<b>Assessment of the implementation of Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), as amended.....</b>	<b>68</b>
Recommendation on accreditation .....	69

## 1. Initial Situation

The experts thank the organizers and the participating teachers and students whom they have met during the on-site visit in Astana for being available for discussions and providing information on programmes and higher education institution. This kind of participation is perceived as very valuable not only for evaluation of the programmes but also for a better understanding of the legal, social and cultural background of the higher education system of the Republic of Kazakhstan, particularly of L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University. The **evaluation of the expert group** is based on the self-evaluation report of the university and extensive discussions with the heads of the study programmes, faculty members, students, and employers as well as the depiction of university management during the on-site visit. The process of accreditation in Kazakhstan has a common goal of checking the quality of educational programmes and their compliance with European standards. In the context of international accreditations in European Higher Education Area, the **key evaluation criteria** are the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) that are revised on a regular basis. In addition, the accreditation procedure must take into account the relevant legislative requirements of the state concerned. To this end, an expert group has been appointed to ensure that all issues related to the evaluation procedure are taken into account (for example, technical considerations, structural and formal aspects as well as social factors). The certificate with the seal of ACQUIN is awarded based on accreditation of study programmes in Kazakhstan. The standing expert group consists of several academic field representatives as well as representatives of professional practice and students.

## 2. Outcomes of the first accreditation

Study programmes 5B020200 “International Relations” (Bachelor), 6M020200 “International relations” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course), 6M020200 “International Relations” (Profile Master course), 5B050200 “Political Science” (Bachelor), 6M050200 “Political Science” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course), 6M050200 “Political Science” (Profile Master course) were assessed and accredited for the first time by ACQUIN in 2012.

The conditions were fulfilled and the decision was made to accredit the educational programmes 5B020200 “International Relations” (Bachelor), 6M020200 “International Relations” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course), 6M020200 “International Relations” (Profile Master course), 5B050200 “Political Science” (Bachelor), 6M050200 “Political Science” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course), 6M050200 “Political science” (Profile Master course) until 30<sup>th</sup> September 2017.

For the proper implementation of the ACQUIN re-accreditation procedure, the term of accreditation of study programmes was tentatively extended until 30<sup>th</sup> September 2018.

### **3. Description of the facts and assessment (in accordance with ESG)**

The expert group assesses the quality of study programmes and their compliance with European standards (Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area - ESG). General statements contain information applicable to all programmes. Specific matters relevant to individual programmes are mentioned only in the case of deviations from general conclusions.

#### **Part 1. Standards and guidelines for internal quality assurance**

##### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance**

Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.

##### **Assessment**

Policy in the field of quality assurance of ENU is based on its mission, vision, and values; it is a part of the university strategic management and is implemented at all levels of the higher education institution. The policy on quality assurance is available in the public domain and is published on the ENU website and information stands of university departments as well as in the electronic document management system. Heads of all departments of the university make the policy known to all stakeholders (by using various kinds of information tools, for instance, explanations are available at all levels) and are responsible for planning, implementation and improvement of quality within their functional duties. All stakeholders are involved in quality assurance processes.

The university has its own Quality Assurance Department that ensures the implementation of its quality policy; this QA Department also maintains and improves its Quality Management System. The university has successfully undergone the procedure of the QMS re-certification. The certificate of compliance of QMS with ISO 9001:2008 standards has been obtained. It is valid until September 2018.



In accordance with the requirements of the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan, ISO 9001:2008 and university management processes, ENU has drafted internal regulatory documents that establish the mechanisms of the functioning of all educational processes. The main provisions of the policy are detailed in the following documents: “Academic Policy of the University”, “ENU Code of Business Ethics”, “Internal Quality Standards”, “Operational Plans for Chairs and Departments”, “Plans for the Development of Study Programmes”, and “Quality Assurance Procedures”.

“Quality Policy” (2017) emphasises the importance of a number of focus areas: internationalisation of education; principle of student-centredness; involvement of students in quality assurance processes; academic mobility of students, faculty members, and university staff; cooperation with employers.

Quality assurance of modular study programmes is carried out based on internal and external evaluations. The internal quality assessment of study programmes is provided by representatives with field and substantive expertise, procedure for reviewing and approval of modular educational programmes over the course of meetings of the department, Teaching and Methodological Commission of the faculty, Council of the faculty, Scientific and Methodological Council of the university as well as Academic Council of the university.

External assessment of the quality of study programmes is carried out through the final state examination of students, procedures of state attestation and institutional accreditation of the university as well as participation in national and international ratings of study programmes. Accreditation and rating results are made available to all interested parties, published in the media and posted on the website of external organisations. There are expert opinions on accredited study programmes. The objectives and competencies of study programmes are also available and published on the official website of the university.

The analysis of the self-assessment report as well as the results of meetings, held with undergraduate and graduate students and faculty members, confirmed that the priorities for the development of study programmes currently undergoing the accreditation process are in line with the national policy in the field of education which defines the requirements of the external environment (competition and demographic issues), resources (information resources and material resources) and labour market requirements.

To increase the motivation and responsibility of employees, to ensure the quality of performance and to determine the contribution of each employee to the strategic and operational goals of the university in 2016, the KPI pilot project was implemented at ENU; it is based on the principles of objectivity, transparency, attainability, and measurability of indicators. This project received a positive assessment of the university. KPI results are available on the official website of ENU. In 2017, corrections and amendments were made to the automated KPI system that took into account proposals from faculty members, heads of departments, and deans.

One of the strategic directions of the ENU is "the formation of the university as a research centre in the Eurasian space". The Quality Policy reflects the relationship between research and training, which involves research and implementation of its results in the context of education. Teachers take an active part in competitions for grant scientific research announced by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan; thus, conducting initiative research. Young scientists, undergraduate and graduate students are involved in the implementation of scientific projects. Subjects of theses, Master and Doctoral theses are determined by taking into account the subject of fundamental scientific research conducted by the teaching staff.

The policy supports such values as maintenance of academic honesty and freedom as well as prevention of protectionism, corruption, and discrimination. These values are reflected in the following documents: "ENU Business Ethics Code", "ENU Student Honour and Conduct Code, Rules of the Study Procedures", "Procedure for Checking the Students' Theses against Plagiarism". If disputes arise when students take interim and final examinations, a special Appeals committee is created to address these issues; such committees are governed by the "Regulations on Appeal".

Feedback from stakeholders is received through sociological surveys and questionnaires, for these procedures independent experts are involved.

The quality assurance policy also applies to the activities performed by contractors (outsourcing) on the following types of work at ENU: sociological studies conducted by outside organizations, external audits, maintenance work and renovation of premises. The requirements for contractors are stated in the technical specification of the services in question.

Thus, Quality Management System allows ENU to comprehensively monitor the effectiveness of its activities in the field of education; it ensures continuous monitoring of the quality of training and management by both the senior staff of the university and users of its services. Implementation of the “Policy in the Field of Quality Assurance”, functioning of the quality management system, internal and external assessment of the quality of educational programmes, upgrading the qualification and rating of the teaching staff, monitoring the quality of the services provided, analysing the educational resources and support systems for students with the aim of improving the material and technical base, and information resources contribute to the successful development and competitiveness of the university as well as its continuous improvement of the quality of the educational services provided.

Chairs that implement study programmes subject to this accreditation procedure carry out activities in accordance with the “Policy in the Field of Quality Assurance”. The goals of educational programs fully correspond to the mission, goals, and objectives of Eurasian National University and are available in the public domain.

All stakeholders participate in quality assurance processes and are responsible, within their competence, for the quality of the educational services provided.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts concludes that Standard 1.1 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

## **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes**

**Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.**

### **Study programmes “International Relations” (Bachelor and Master)**

#### **Basic information**

Educational programmes “International Relations” are offered at the Faculty of International Relations of ENU and arranged in the form of a Bachelor programme (5B020200) and a Master programme (6M020200). Both programmes were established at the higher education institution in 1998 and received the state license of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In addition, programmes were evaluated and accredited by ACQUIN in 2012.

Since ENU is one of the leading universities in the Republic of Kazakhstan, training of highly qualified diplomats and scholars in the field of international relations is part of the university's self-image and mission. Implementation and continuous development of discipline are carried out with the support of state institutions, for instance, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Its qualification goals reflect the needs of relevant professional practice within international organisations, international business corporations as well as other international business sectors and diplomatic fields that put the focus on Asia. Representatives of professional practice participate in the development and implementation of these programmes, mainly through participation in university councils.

The university does not set limits on the number of students entering the programmes on a fee basis. Seventy-seven students entered the Bachelor programme in the academic year of 2014; in 2015 their number dropped to 53, and in 2016 fifty-six students were enrolled. Over the same period, the enrolment amounted to 13-18 students for the Scientific and Pedagogical Master course and 8-13 for the Profile Master course.

The number of applicants varies from 70 to 100 students per year and is considered to be a positive tendency. The dropout rate varies from 2 to 6 per year and is very low. Only a part of the students receives a state grant, so 60-100 percent of students must pay for their studies on their own.

### **The objectives and concept of the programme “International Relations” (Bachelor)**

The Bachelor programme is conceptualised for eight semesters; for the theoretical part students receive 204 ECTS credits (129 Kazakhstani credits). As part of the undergraduate programme, the university seeks to prepare students for work in the field of international relations, diplomacy and foreign policy as well as international economic relations and international legal regulation of the international system. In these areas, students should be able to analyse complex issues and acquire basic competencies to solve problems in international relations of the middle level.

The university points out that over the course of the training students study theoretical disciplines and have several practices. The educational process of the program is aimed at making full use of the creative potential of students and enhancing their skills of independent study and research. In this regard, when allocating credits for disciplines taught at senior years of the programme, most of the ECTS credits are awarded for seminars and lectures that are organized in the form of posing problem questions on a particular topic. Assessment methods include the full range of written, oral and practical exams, projects and essays that are used to assess student academic performance and to confirm the achievement of learning outcomes at the end of the course or module.

The structure of the programme consists of modules that are divided into "general compulsory disciplines" (28 Kazakhstani credits), "core disciplines" (69 credits) and "profile disciplines" (32 credits). In addition to these theoretical components, students must undergo practical training (at least 6 credits) and physical education (8 credits) as well as pass a state final examination (3 credits). Thus, the final number of credits amounts to at least 146 Kazakhstani credits which correspond to 240 ECTS credits.

The curriculum of the students' training consists of the modules shown below. Over the course of the first two semesters, students' timetables include “Kazakh (Russian) Language”, “Foreign

Language”, “Introduction to International Relations”, “Social, Political and Economic Processes in Central Asia”, “Modern History of Kazakhstan”, “Information and Communication Technologies”, and the so-called “Academic Practice”. Throughout the third and fourth semesters, more attention is paid to international relations in the context of the following subjects: “Foreign Language for Special Purposes”, “Diplomatic and Consular Service”, “Methodology for the Conduction of Diplomatic Negotiations”, “History of International Relations in a New Era”, “Fundamentals of Analysis of International Relations” and “Professional Practice” (Internship). The fifth semester is designated for the study of “Diplomatic Documentation” and “Seminars on the Analysis of Modern International Relations”; in the sixth semester the students are offered: “Foreign Policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan”, “Multilateral Diplomacy” and more “Professional Practice” (Internship). Over the course of the remaining two semesters, students are engaged in “Current Problems of International Relations”, “Professional Practice” (Internship), “Pre-graduation Practice” and “Final State Examination”. The Bachelor thesis is part of both the “Pre-graduation Practice” and “Final State Examination”.

While general compulsory disciplines are the same for all study programmes, core and profile disciplines focus mostly on the field of international relations. Therefore, ENU has the opportunity to independently determine some of the basic modules necessary for the creation of the profile of the university. The main modules include “Core Analytical Skills Module for the Specificity”, “Basic Diplomatic Competence Module”, “Applied Analytical Skills Module”, “Diplomacy and Foreign Policy”, “International Relations and International Economic Processes”, “International Relations and International Legal Processes” as well as “Eurasian Space: Ethnocultural and Religious Interaction”.

As for the elective subjects, the university offers subjects covering a wide range of issues directly related to the field of applied international relations. Modules cover aspects of economic, cultural, legal, and some interdisciplinary topics. Forty-nine Kazakhstani credits are awarded for them; therefore, the main elective disciplines are crucial for creating the profile of the curriculum as well as for employment of students, since these disciplines are mainly recommended by certain employers.

### **The objectives and concept of the programme “International Relations” (Master)**

ENU offers Master programme in two versions: Scientific and Pedagogical Master course with 59 Kazakhstan credits for theoretical training that lasts for four semesters and Profile Master course that includes just two semesters with 28 Kazakhstani credits for theoretical training. Students of the Science and Pedagogical Master course are trained for further employment at the higher levels of the civil service and work in the field of international relations. There they should be able to organise and manage employees and solve problems in the field of diplomatic practice and international projects. In addition, students acquire competencies for conducting independent research and solving problems in the field of international relations using a variety of social and scientific methods. They also acquire didactic skills that allow them to teach at universities and combine research and teaching activities.

The educational programme consists of modules that are divided into general compulsory disciplines (20 Kazakhstani credits, including elective subjects with 12 credits) and profile disciplines (22 credits, 20 of them for elective disciplines). In addition to these theoretical components, students must complete pedagogical and academic practices (at least 6 credits), conduct research (7 credits), and pass the state final examination (4 credits). Thus, the total number of credits amounts to at least 59 Kazakhstani credits which in turn correspond to 120 ECTS credits.

The training is conducted in the course of four semesters; in their first year students study the following subjects: “Pedagogy”, “Psychology”, “Foreign Language for Academic Purposes”, “Theory of International Relations”, “Research Methods in International Relations”, “Research Work of Master students”, “History and Philosophy of Science”, “Foreign Language (for Professional Purposes)” and “Educational and Methodological Support of the Educational Process in the Field of International Relations”. The second year is devoted to “Pedagogical Practice”, “Research work of Graduate Students”, “Pre-graduation Practice”, the so-called “Comprehensive exam” and “Writing and Defending the Master thesis”.

While general compulsory disciplines are the same for all educational programmes, profiling disciplines focus mostly on international relations. The main modules include “Methodology of Master Studies”, “Scientific Research Module”, “Practice of Diplomatic Activity” and “Management of International Projects”. As for elective subjects, the university offers subjects covering a wide range of issues related to the field applied international relations. Modules cover

aspects of economic, cultural, legal, and some interdisciplinary topics, similar to Bachelor programme. Nevertheless, disciplines more closely integrate scientific methods, theories of international relations and research issues.

Particular attention is paid to the area of research in the Profile direction of the Master programme. Students get acquainted with the advanced theories and methodologies of empirical research in the field of international relations. Over the course of two semesters of studies, they complete core disciplines (8 Kazakhstani credits, including elective subjects with 3 credits) and profile disciplines (10 credits, 9 of them for elective disciplines). In addition to these theoretical components, students must complete the so-called “Professional Practice” (Internship) (minimum 2 credits), conduct research (4 credits) and pass the final state examination (4 credits). Thus, the total number of credits amounts to at least 28 Kazakhstani credits, which in turn corresponds to 60 ECTS credits.

Students complete the programme in one academic year, in their first semester they study “Foreign Language (for Professional Purposes)”, “Management”, “Psychology”, “Methods of Research in International Relations”, and “Theory of International Relations”. The second semester is devoted to completion of “Professional Practice”, conduction of “Experimental Research of the Student”, including the writing the Master thesis, the so-called “Comprehensive Exam” and “Completion and Defense of the Master thesis”.

### **Assessment of the programme “International Relations” (Bachelor/Master)**

From the point of view of the group of experts, the higher education institution developed the curriculum “International Relations” (bachelor’s degree) with a pronounced applied nature which corresponds to the objectives of the Bachelor programme. Starting on this level, students are discussing the geopolitical aspects and the special role of Kazakhstan in the world, which makes sense for an independent country that simultaneously plays the role of a strong regional power. Over the course of training, theoretical basis covers all important theories such as Idealism, Constructivism and even Marxism; students get acquainted with a variety of methods, for example, SWOT analysis (analysis of strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and threats), content analysis, etc., which emphasizes strong link of the programmes with practice. Based on this and the fact that civil servants receive training for employment in the



public service, students need to be able to express their thoughts in Russian, Kazakh and English, as well as in other languages such as Chinese, Spanish, French, German or Italian.

The implementation of the programme corresponds to the national requirements covering compulsory disciplines which are determined by the Ministry of Science and Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The rest of the programme is built based on the own ideas of the higher education institution which is positively assessed by the group of experts. Also, a positive impression is created by the close link established between theory and practice, since students have enough time to get professional practice during the training program. Participation in academic mobility programmes is possible due to the fact that the compulsory components of the programme can be studied in the format of distance learning.

As for the content of the disciplines, the group of experts believes that the educational programme attaches sufficient importance to the topics and issues of diplomacy and international relations. Given the fact that civil servants for national ministries should first receive the appropriate level of training, conducting academic research is not a priority. Nevertheless, students should know the tools necessary to conduct research in the field of international relations. That is why the competence in the field of academic writing should be developed at an earlier stage of training. For this, the subject “Academic Writing” should be included into the Bachelor study programme.

The Master programme “International Relations” is designed for graduates of the Bachelor programme who want to deepen their knowledge of international politics and become experts in the field of political and diplomatic specifics of the Central Asian region. When compared with the Bachelor programme it is obvious that the content and described learning outcomes are very similar. Nevertheless, the conversations over the course of the on-site visit by the group of experts showed that teachers and students can convincingly explain the difference between the Bachelor and Master programmes. In addition to applied research methods and theoretical content, the Master programme differs from the Bachelor programme in its method of instruction. Students of the undergraduate programme mostly follow prescribed study programme; graduate students work more independently and are engaged in independent projects in smaller groups.

Since the Master programme is offered in training options for either one or two academic years, it is hardly possible to integrate windows for the participation in academic mobility programmes into these educational programmes. However, it should be emphasised that students can gain practical experience over the course of the practice and have the opportunity to travel abroad for shorter periods of time if they receive funding from special programmes (for instance, the Bolashak scholarship).

The objectives of study programmes in the field of “International Relations” are justified and very convincing when taking into consideration the national labour market and its requirements. The undergraduate and graduate programmes are aimed at specific groups and provide the enrolled students with the necessary competencies in the field applied international relations, such as foreign affairs, NGO activities and related sectors. In addition, graduates of the Master programme can independently conduct research, although the programme is not designed to prepare students for employment in academic research because it is applied in both modes of studies.

The group of experts is aware of the uniqueness of the curricula offered at ENU as students have access to international organizations and diplomats in Astana. The programme is also taught in English which has been a unique experience in Kazakhstan at the time of the creation of these study programmes.

Programmes include aspects of various subject fields, such as history, philosophy, social sciences and others. Thus, the current problems of globalization and international relations are being considered. Qualified specialists are trained to work for the benefit of the country and allow Kazakhstan to maintain contacts with all regions of the world and participate in international events.

The expert group established that international relations are traditionally separated from political science in Kazakhstan, and historically, programmes use a different methodology. Nevertheless, programmes “International Relations” and “Political Science” have much in common and are closely related to each other. The same can be said about the staff involved in the teaching of programmes. On this basis, an opinion was expressed that the current structure is of an irrational nature as the study programmes “International Relations” and “Political Science” are offered at two separate faculties. Due to the close scientific links and parallel

approaches of the programmes “Political Science” and “International Relations”, it is recommended to unite them within one faculty/department in order to improve the terms of cooperation.

The study programmes “International Relations” (Bachelor and Master) correspond to the general strategy of the university, and the group of experts appreciates the creation and continuous development of these programmes at ENU.

It should be emphasised that the group of experts found that ENU managed to improve the programmes over the course of the last five years as compared to the time of the previous accreditation. Recommendations were taken into consideration in the field of more transparent presentation of training programmes and providing students with more opportunities for independent work. Based on improved transparency, students can understand that they will have to work a lot during their studies at the undergraduate level as well as for the Master programme. At the same time, the group of experts got the impression that students manage to cope with all their duties on time, they even have enough time to participate in extracurricular activities at ENU and outside the university.

Although applied nature seems to be the main feature of the programmes, they can be improved by increasing the number of courses on methodology, organisation of research and the correct use of theories from international relations for the analysis of practical puzzles.

### **Study programmes “Political Science” (Bachelor and Master)**

#### **Basic information**

Study programmes “Political Science” at ENU are offered at the Faculty of Journalism and Political Science, both as Bachelor (5B050200) and Master programmes (6M050200). These two programmes are successfully implemented and are licensed by the authorities of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In addition, the study programmes were assessed and accredited by ACQUIN in 2012.

According to the mission and vision of ENU, study programmes in the field of “Political Science” contribute to the professionalisation and modernisation of the public sector in Kazakhstan. Therefore, research and teaching concern political institutions and political processes in the context of the modern world and the Republic of Kazakhstan, ethno-political processes,

interethnic and interconfessional tolerance, social policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, international and national security problems.

The qualifying goals of the programmes reflect the needs of relevant professional practice in the field of politics, civil service, and society of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Representatives of professional practice participate in the development and implementation of programmes, mainly through participation in university councils and the signing of bilateral agreements.

The university does not set limits on the number of students entering programmes on a fee basis. In 2014-2016 academic years, about 15-16 students entered the Bachelor programme. Over the course of the same period, the number of students enrolled in Master programme, which is offered only within the Scientific and Pedagogical Master course, has been reduced from 11 to just 3 students.

The number of first-year students amounts to 18-30 students a year and is considered to be a relatively low indicator, but the dropout rate is also quite low with just 1 student per year. A significant part of students receives state grants; the ratio of students receiving state funding and paying for the studies themselves is the exact opposite when compared with the study programmes "International Relations".

### ***The objectives and concept of the programme "Political Science" (Bachelor)***

The Bachelor study programme is designed for eight semesters for which students receive 153 Kazakhstani credits which correspond to 240 ECTS credits. The programme also includes practice in the amount of 3 credits in the second semester, practice in the amount of 3 credits in the fourth and sixth semesters and practice and pre-graduation practice of 6 credits in the eighth semester.

According to the documentation on self-assessment, undergraduate students of "Political Science" study all sectors of public life connected with politics, analyse political phenomena in order to identify their common features and particularities, find the most effective forms of political organization and the best ways to solve problems. The professional analyst needs to be able to determine the status of the main participants of political events within their roles, to reveal the balance of political forces and possible trends of the changes.

The university points out that over the course of study, students master theoretical disciplines and complete several practices. The structure of the programme consists of modules that are

divided into general compulsory disciplines (28 Kazakhstani credits), core disciplines (69 credits) and profile disciplines (32 credits). In addition to these theoretical components, students must undergo practical training (at least 6 credits), physical education (8 credits), and pass the final state examination (3 credits). Thus, the total number of credits amounts to at least 146 Kazakhstani credits which in its turn correspond to 240 ECTS credits.

Over the course of the first two semesters, students engage with “Kazakh (Russian) Language”, “Foreign Language”, “Theory of Politics”, “History of Political Doctrines”, “Modern History of Kazakhstan”, “Information and Communication Technologies”, “Political Power”; they also complete the so-called “Academic Practice”. During the third and fourth semesters, more attention is paid to political science in the following subjects: “Foreign Language for Special Purposes”, “Philosophy”, “Political Systems and Regimes”, “Methods of Political Research” and “Professional Practice” (Internship). The fifth semester is intended for studying the following subjects: “World Political Processes”, “Comparative Political Science”, and “Applied Political Science”; “Theory of International Relations” is covered in the sixth semester and “Professional Practice” (Internship) continues. Over the course of the remaining two semesters, students are engaged in “Pre-graduation Practice” and “Final State Examination”. The Bachelor thesis is part of both the “Pre-graduation Practice” and the “Final State Examination”.

While the general compulsory disciplines are the same for all educational programs, the main and profile disciplines focus mostly on political science. Therefore, ENU has the opportunity to independently determine some basic modules necessary for shaping the profile of the university. The main modules include: “Module of General Education”, “Module of Social and Ethical Competencies”, “Module of Economic, Organisational and Managerial Competencies”, “Fundamentals of Political Science: Theory and Practice”, “Analysis of Political Processes and Political Decision-making”, “Applied Political Science”, “Methods of Political Research” as well as “Eurasian Space: Cultural and Religious Interaction”.

As for the elective subjects, the university offers disciplines covering a wide range of issues related to the field of applied political science. Modules cover aspects of economic, cultural, legal as well as some interdisciplinary topics. Forty-nine Kazakhstani credits are awarded for these modules; therefore, the basic elective disciplines are crucial for the profile of the curriculum as well as for the prospects of the employment of students because these disciplines are mainly recommended by employers.

### ***The objectives and concept of the programme “Political Science” (Master)***

The Master programme is offered only as the Scientific and Pedagogical course with 59 Kazakhstani credits (120 ECTS credits) for theoretical training, and it lasts four semesters. In addition to theoretical training, the Master programme provides 3 credits for pedagogical practice, 3 credits for research practice, 7 credits for research work and 4 credits for a state final examination.

In comparison with the Bachelor programme, the Master programme is more focused on the scientific, analytical and research aspects. Students have more academic freedom in scientific activity and conduct research in the chosen area. Graduates are expected to be able to use gained knowledge in the context of professional fields of modern political science, apply methodology of political science for planning, organise and conduct scientific research of political processes both independently and as part of scientific teams. In addition, they should be able to engage in teaching activities in the field of political science.

Completion of practice by students is one of the most important and compulsory forms of organisation of training. It is aimed at consolidation and deepening of theoretical knowledge and acquisition of skills of independent work; it also allows students to gain understanding of the level of acquired competencies.

The scientific and pedagogical direction of the Master programme prepares students for the employment in senior civil service positions and for work in NGOs, government and international organisations, mass media or other sectors of society.

There they should be able to organise and manage professional work of employees and solve problems in the field of national and regional policy. In addition, students acquire competencies necessary for conducting independent research and solving problems in the field of political issues through social and scientific methods. They also acquire didactic skills that allow them to teach at universities and combine research and teaching activities.

The educational programme consists of modules that are divided into general compulsory disciplines (20 Kazakhstani credits, including elective subjects with 12 credits) and profile disciplines (22 credits, 20 of them for elective disciplines). In addition to these theoretical compo-

nents, students must complete pedagogical and professional practices (at least 6 credits), conduct research (7 credits), and pass the final state examination (4 credits). Thus, the total number of credits amounts to at least 59 Kazakhstani credits which correspond to 120 ECTS credits. The training is conducted over the course four semesters, in the first-year students' timetables include the following subjects: "Pedagogy", "Psychology", "Academic Writing", "State Policy", "Research Work of Master Students", "History and Philosophy of Science", and "Foreign Language (for Professional Purposes)". The second year is devoted to "Pedagogical practice", "Research work", "Pre-graduation practice", the so-called "Comprehensive exam", and "Final certification".

While general compulsory disciplines are the same for all study programmes, profile disciplines focus mostly on political science. The main modules include the "Methodology of Master Studies", "Methodology in Political Science", "Public Policy", and "World Politics and Security". As for elective subjects, the university offers subjects covering a wide range of issues directly linked to the field of applied political science, mainly focusing on politics-related issues. Modules cover aspects of economic, cultural, legal, and some interdisciplinary topics; same as for the Bachelor programme. Nevertheless, disciplines integrate scientific methods, theories of political science, and research issues.

The Master programme is designed for Bachelor graduates who want to deepen their knowledge of political science and become analysts and consultants in the field of politics. When compared with the Bachelor programme, it is obvious that the content and described learning outcomes are very similar. Nevertheless, the conversation over the course of the on-site visit to the university showed that teachers and students can convincingly explain the difference between the Bachelor and Master programmes. In addition to applied research methods and theoretical content, the Master programme differs from the Bachelor programme in the teaching methods used. Students of the undergraduate programme mostly follow the prescribed training programmes; graduate students work more independently and conduct own projects in small groups.

The group of experts recommends the development of the Master programme in such a way that would allow them to transfer the objectives of the general programme from Bachelor to Master. After learning a broad perspective relevant to the field of political science, students should be prepared for the employment as political analysts over the course of the Master

programme. They also need to possess the competence to solve political problems based on a number of ideas, for instance, political cycles, as well as to analyse the political agenda, implementation and evaluation strategies.

Since the Master programme is offered only as the training option that includes two academic years, it is hardly possible to integrate the window that would allow students to participate in the academic mobility programmes. However, it should be emphasised that students can gain practical experience over the course of professional practice and have the opportunity to travel abroad for shorter periods of time if they receive funding through special programmes (for example, the Bolashak scholarship).

### **Assessment of the program Political Science (Bachelor/Master)**

The study programme for Bachelor students of Political Science has an applied nature, focusing on consultations provision to politicians, ministries, and state institutions. Thus, students are acquainted with the use of mass media, analytical methods of political analysis and (public) management. Based on the mission of the university to prepare students for the national and international labor markets, the programme meets the requirements of employers in Kazakhstan. This emphasis on job opportunities inevitably narrows the scope of political science studied as an academic discipline. Following this idea of political science as a "science for policy" is justified, but this approach needs to be more clearly indicated when marketing the programme, especially in its descriptions available to the general public.

To understand the general trends in political science at ENU, the group of experts tried to find out whether the university should follow the concepts of "science of politics" or "science for politics." Based on the responses of teachers and students, it was possible to determine that the applied nature in terms of policy analysis and political activity is crucial for these programmes at ENU. Therefore, political science is not taught as a subject that includes a range of commonly associated individual disciplines, such as "Political Theory", "International Relations", "Political Sociology" and "Comparative Politics"; and this is precisely the approach recommended by the group of experts. Currently, political science at ENU is implemented as a kind of policy analysis programme that puts an emphasis on political aspects.

Considering the current focus of the study programme at the ENU, the group of experts, nevertheless, recommends making changes in the future. To develop the science of politics in



Kazakhstan, compatible and competitive with "Political Science" in North America and Western Europe, the university should provide students with more methodological competencies and a broader view of the state structure, politics and political endeavours.

Despite recommendations for further development, the current implementation of the programme corresponds to the national requirements determined by the Ministry of Science and Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and applicable mandatory disciplines. The rest of the program is built based on the university's own ideas, which is positively assessed by the group of experts. Additionally, a positive impression is created by the connection between theory and practice, since students have enough time to practice during the training programme. Participation in academic mobility programs is possible due to the fact that the compulsory components of the program can be completed in the format of distance learning.

As for the content of the disciplines, the group of experts believes that the study programme sufficiently pays attention to topics and issues of political analysis and the foundations of political science. Given the fact that civil servants for national ministries should, first of all, receive the appropriate level of training, conducting academic research is not a priority. Nevertheless, students should familiarise themselves with the tools necessary for carrying out research in the field of political science. That is why the competence in the field of academic writing should be developed at an earlier stage of training. In this context, the subject "Academic Writing" should be included in the educational program of a bachelor's degree at an earlier stage of training.

The objectives of educational programmes in the field of Political Science are justified and very convincing against the background of the data of national labour market requirements. The undergraduate and graduate programmes are aimed at certain groups and provide the enrolled students with the necessary competencies in the field of applied work in the public sectors, such as government affairs, NGO activities and related fields. In addition, graduates of the Master programme can independently conduct research, although the programme is not designed to prepare students for employment in the field of academic research because it is of an applied nature.

The university makes efforts to form programmes as full-fledged social sciences. Nevertheless, training in empirical methods needs to be given even more attention and should be taught more comprehensively over the course of the Bachelor programme.

From the point of view of the group of experts, the general objectives and purpose of educational programmes on the specialty "Political Science" should be described more accurately. In connection with the current emphasis of study programmes and labour market requirements in Kazakhstan, the focus of the Master programme should be on approaches and methods of political analysis, and the Bachelor programme, in turn, needs to be expanded.

The expert group found that political science is traditionally separated from international relations in Kazakhstan, and historically, programmes use a different methodology. Nevertheless, programmes "International Relations" and "Political Science" have much in common and are closely related to each other. The same can be said about the staff involved in the teaching of these programmes. Based on this, an opinion was expressed on the irrationality of the existence of programmes of international relations and political science in two separate faculties. Due to the close scientific links and parallel approaches of the programmes "Political Science" and "International Relations", it is recommended to unite in one faculty in order to improve the terms of cooperation.

The study programmes "Political Science" (Bachelor and Master) correspond to the overall strategy of the university, and the expert group highly appreciates the creation and continuous development of programs at ENU.

It should be emphasized that the group of experts found that ENU managed to improve the programs within the last five years from the time of the previous accreditation. Recommendations on the use of foreign literature, a more transparent presentation of the curriculum and giving students more opportunities for independent work were taken into account. Due to the improved transparency, students can understand that they will have to work a lot during their studies at the undergraduate level, as well as the master's program. At the same time, the group of experts got the impression that students manage to cope with all their duties in a timely manner, they even have enough time to participate in extra-curricular activities at ENU and outside of the university.

## **Overall conclusion for Standard 1.2**

Development of modular study programmes is carried out based on regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the requirements of international standards within the Bologna process. The structure and content of working curricula correspond to the standard curricula and the catalogue of elective disciplines.

The objectives of the study programmes are defined in accordance with the programmes of the institutional strategy are consistent with the mission of the university, the needs of society and correspond to the levels of the National Qualifications Framework.

In determining the objectives of the study programmes, the results of training and competencies, the needs of stakeholders, the results of questionnaires of students and employers, the recommendations of foreign experts and accreditation agencies are taken into account (the results of the questionnaire are presented on the official website of ENU).

The disciplines included in the curriculum of the study programmes have been developed in accordance with the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS). The content of the modules is well balanced, consistent and focused on obtaining the expected learning outcomes.

When forming elective disciplines for purposes and content, labour market requirements, their correspondence to global development trends and science achievements, employers' requests and training profile are taken into account. The Master program focuses on the scientific-analytical and research aspects of education, students have academic freedom in conducting scientific activities and research in the chosen direction. Assessment of educational achievements and the level of preparation of graduates is provided with the use of a scoring system.

Considering the recommendations made by experts for the first-time accreditation by ACQUIN, new modules and disciplines were included in the programmes, for instance, "Introduction to Comparative Research Methodology", "Methods of Political Research", and specifically for the Master programme, "Academic Writing".

The organisation and completion of all types of practices are carried out in accordance with the state compulsory educational standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan, see "Quality Management System. Procedure. Professional practice. PRO ENU 705-12". Practice programmes

have been developed for each type of practice. Over the course of the past two years, there has been a trend towards an increase in the conclusion of tripartite agreements for practice. Students, faculty members, alumni, and employers are involved in the process of development of study programmes.

The university created conditions for the effective promotion of students on an individual educational trajectory, including consultations provided by a number of advisers, curators, and mentors. These conditions ensure the availability and effective functioning of the system of individual assistance and counselling of students on the issues of the educational process. The academic policy is available on the university's website, in the Platonus system; students have access to all educational and methodological information.

Thus, the development and approval of the study programmes are carried out in accordance with the approved procedure outlined in the Instruction for the development and approval of study programmes at ENU. The availability of normative documentation and methodological guidance ensures transparency and effectiveness of the development, approval and implementation of study programmes. The study programmes correspond to the objectives and the expected learning outcomes. The qualification obtained as a result of the programme development is clearly defined and explained, it also corresponds to a certain level of the National Qualification Framework and, therefore, the Framework of Qualifications in the European Higher Education Area.

Positive changes in the content of study programmes undergoing the accreditation process over the past five years are as follows:

- a significant increase in the volume of elective subjects (up to 75% of the total theoretical education), which contributes to the expansion of academic freedom of Master students;
- active assistance of employers to the improvement of vocational education through the recommendations of the most relevant disciplines;
- expert assessment of implemented programmes is carried out by Kazakhstani and foreign partners;
- growth of the number of practices, which allows increasing the level of adaptation of graduates in the chosen field of professional activity.
- The recommendations of the previous accreditation procedure are fulfilled.

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.2 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

## **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment**

**Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.**

### **Description and assessment**

In the cluster of programmes assessed in the context of this accreditation, the managers of study programmes have a clear idea of the principles of student-centered learning as well as objectivity in assessing knowledge, encouraging learners to work actively in the joint construction of the educational process. To ensure the above-mentioned processes at ENU the following documents were developed: “Rights and Duties of Students of ENU”; “Code of Honour and Conduct of the Students of the L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University”; “ENU Code of Business Ethics”.

There is a system of encouraging the scientific activity of students and faculty members. This system is described in the following regulations: “On measures to encourage faculty, staff and Students to Get Published in Scientific Journals Included in the Web of Science Databases”; “Regulations on the Competition of Innovative Projects for Students and Young Scientists of L.N. Gumilyov ENU”. Successful work of students and faculty members concerning the above provisions is encouraged by a cash bonus which motivates them to conduct independent research. Also, in order to stimulate the scientific activity of students, competitions are held annually, for instance, competition of scientific works of young scientists of ENU. Best participants of this competition are awarded with a diploma and a cash prize. There is also the republican competition of research works of students.

A positive aspect is the presence of several educational trajectories of the study programmes undergoing the accreditation process. For example, since 2011 the Bachelor programme in the field of International Relations includes three trajectories: “International Relations and International Economic Processes”, “Diplomacy and Foreign Policy”, “International Relations and International Legal Processes”. The Master programme in International Relations also has three trajectories: “Practice of Diplomatic Activity”, “World Politics and International Processes”, “International Security and Cooperation”.

Students in the first semester of training choose a trajectory, according to which the individual curriculum of the student is formed for the next 4 years. Over the course of the first year, the department of poly-linguistics forms lists of students with the IELTS certificate (6.0 and higher), and an additional exam in English is also conducted. The students who have achieved the established threshold for English language grades have the opportunity to study in multi-lingual groups and to participate more actively in academic mobility programmes.

According to the catalogue of elective disciplines, formed in automated information system Platonus, students study the description of disciplines and select elective disciplines depending on the chosen direction of study programmes.

The individual curriculum of students is developed, taking into account the sequence of the study of disciplines. The needs of students are taken into consideration when determining the elective courses for a specific study programme. Students have the opportunity to choose elective disciplines and teachers. Enlisting into elective disciplines is carried out based on the suggestions of the special advisers. They introduce students to the contents of disciplines, and teachers conduct presentations for a more detailed acquaintance with the discipline. Students can independently choose the disciplines and teachers for a given academic year online; they also can view and upload their individual curriculum, teaching materials for disciplines, transcripts. They are also able to monitor current, interim and final examinations in a specific electronic journal; to pass online tests for disciplines during the period of interim assessment; can file an appeal for examinations that took the form of computer testing. The students can get acquainted with the criteria for assessing the students' knowledge, the methodology for calculating the GPA, the rules for examinations, and appeals in the electronic library available at the university.

Work on inclusive education is underway. In terms of this issue, all information can be obtained on the website. In ENU sufficient conditions for the access of students with disabilities to the electronic library, learning to network information databases, which contain educational-methodical complexes disciplines, special educational needs at the request of the students are taken into account when scheduling classes. For example, for the convenience of students with disabilities, the class schedule is located on the ground floor.

In the context of the implementation of study programmes "International Relations" (Bachelor and Master) interactive forms of classes are widely used: business games, simulations of

negotiations on the international level. Over the course of study, two main criteria are usually used to typify the methods of active learning: the presence of an imitation model of the process under study and the professional activity. For example, students play the role of Foreign Ministry staff members who are part of the working group for an important international conference and summit. Role-playing games are also practiced. For example, students imitate participation in the international conference in the role of official representatives of participating countries.

In the context of the implementation of study programmes “Political Science” (Bachelor and Master) multimedia didactic tools are used: recordings of video lectures and video content for the illustration of teaching materials. Faculty staff actively uses multimedia (slide) presentations, software and information products in the educational process. The teachers of the department of political science successfully use innovative technologies and modern methods of teaching: work with databases, trainings, case studies, business games, presentations on topics, preparation and defense of essays, guided discussion, use of schemes, short demonstrations, role plays, and work in small groups. The lecture material is accompanied by interactive techniques - the "four corners method", the construction of schemes, filling out tables, viewing videos. To develop the skills of scientific activity of students, several forms of independent work are used, for instance, critical analysis of an article on a topic, preparation of a scientific review, preparation of a scientific article, formation of a database on a topic. To consolidate analytical skills and capacities of practical exercises, such tasks as situational and factor analysis, content analysis and event analysis as well as cognitive mapping are actively used. The main points of using computer technologies in the learning process are the formation of the ability to analyze information using a number special programmes, the capacity to create databases, master the language of information requests, work with electronic texts and tabular data and transform them into a graphical form for research purposes. Over the course of training, visual information is used (illustrative material and demonstration material such as diagrams, tables, concepts). A common tool is the creation of multi-media presentations on the results of the analysis, a mini-study of a particular topic or issue. Integrated classes are used in combination with the multimedia presentations, video recordings, and animated slides, both for lectures and in practical classes.



The level of knowledge of the students of study programmes is assessed in the educational process, intermediate and final examination and is recorded by the teacher by posting the current (weekly) and interim (twice a semester) knowledge assessment in the automated information system Platonus as well as the note for the exam (at the end of the semester). Criteria and methods for assessing knowledge of specific disciplines are determined by teachers in the curricula of disciplines and are brought to the attention of students by placing the study cases of the discipline in the automated information system of the university. Tools, mechanism and evaluation criteria are stated in the syllabi of each teacher, in the rules of the educational process and the guide. For the examinations at the end of the semester there are different forms of control used: 1) Oral examination (cards). This examination form can be conducted in three languages (Kazakh, Russian, English) - the choice of language is given to the student 2) Written paper. 3) Computer testing. The number of examinations depends on the amount of credits for the specific discipline. Before entering the session, the system calculates for the student his passing score for each discipline (admission rating). Each student can see his/her received points in the e-journal. The share of the current assessment amounts to 60% of the final score. Depending on the received score, the student prepares for the exam and has an estimate in his mind for his overall note. The admission to the examination is made up of the first rating (P1) and the second rating (P2), which, respectively, are made up from the sum of the current assessments earned by the student for the theoretical course for all types of training in discipline and boundary control (PK1 and PK2). The final assessment of the discipline has its logical sequence, reflecting the work of the student throughout the determined academic period.

The current normative documents take into account the mitigating circumstances for students in case of them not being able to attend training sessions and examinations or bad marks for the discipline. If there is a good reason for not being able to attend an exam, the student prepares a special request paper to the dean of the faculty, explaining the situation and attaching the necessary documents. The dean drafts the order with the schedule of individual catching up for missed classes or examinations. The student, based on the order of the faculty, can pass the examination on an individual basis, sooner or later than other students. In cases when students need to travel abroad (foreign-born citizens), get individual treatment, participate in programmes of academic mobility, get a maternity/paternity leave or due to other

family circumstances. Each exam is conducted with an independent examiner present as well as the teacher responsible for the implementation of the educational programme. Mark for the exam is put on the exam sheet on the day of the examination; it is signed by the teacher, the independent examiner, and the student himself/herself. For every examination, an appeal committee is formed, which, in case of an appeal, examines its validity and decides on the final mark. When passing the exam in form of computer testing, a student has the right to appeal a set number of test questions in the Platonus system. The system automatically issues a report on the appealed questions and the teacher who drafted the test tasks for the discipline, examines each issue separately, checking the appropriateness of the test task. After that, the system itself adds points to the student's examination score. The principles for assessing the knowledge of students are set out in the "Regulations on the organization of the educational process on the credit technology of education", as well as in the "Regulation on monitoring and evaluation of educational achievements of students of ENU". It is confirmed that the university creates conditions for students to access the above-mentioned documents. Each year, the assessment of the extent of students' satisfaction with the quality of implementation and the content of study programmes is conducted. At the end of each semester, an anonymous questionnaire is conducted among undergraduates and graduates who completed the theoretical training course, providing them with the possibility of commenting it for each discipline. The survey is conducted on [https://my.enu.kz/page\\_anketa](https://my.enu.kz/page_anketa) in Kazakh and Russian languages. This is done to determine the degree of satisfaction of students with the quality of the subjects taught, which includes: the quality of teaching lectures, seminars and laboratory classes, the quality of assignments and the time for their implementation, educational and methodological support.

Evaluation of students is conducted in accordance with established rules, which provide for, among other things, various life situations. A systematic questionnaire of students about the quality of the teaching of disciplines is carried out. There is a special box for complaints and suggestions at ENU. An official meeting of the deans of study programmes that are being accredited and their deputies on scientific and educational work with the student body is held annually.

When having a discussion with the management, experts wanted to know how the faculty staff and doctoral students are involved in ENU development projects that serve the goal of

becoming the research university. The management of the university pointed out that currently more than 130 projects are being implemented at the university, and in most of them students are involved - these are the so-called business incubators. This suggests a great potential for involving students in research practice. In their spare time students can attend "research clubs". After posing a question "What does the student-centered approach mean for the university?", the following answers were received: the approach is related to students' assessment and their careful selection at the level of admission to the university; the continuous development of study programmes is carried out through the feedback provided by students and employers. Also, the student-centered approach can be attributed to the issue related to the uniqueness of the educational programmes "International Relations" and "Political Science" in comparison with the programmes of other educational institutions. Regarding "Political Science", the answer was: "the teaching of political science has an applied and practical nature, which is reflected in the acquisition of practical competences by students. The requirements of the labor market are also taken into account, namely, the demand of the ministerial institutions for graduates of universities in Astana." The representatives of the university constantly emphasized the so-called "Astana Factor". As for the study programme "International Relations", the leadership of the university emphasized the fact that students have access to international organizations and diplomatic services. The training is conducted in English, which was a unique feature in Kazakhstan when the above-mentioned study programme was established. The faculty of international relations annually takes part in the project "UN Model". When asked about the restriction of the development of the study programmes in connection with the availability of compulsory disciplines, the management highlighted that up to 70% is included in the elective block, and that the strategy of the university is sufficiently flexible in selecting the disciplines for the study programme. This fact allows the ENU to respond to the external developments by introducing into the study programmes that are being accredited the relevant and in-demand courses and modular programmes. The following recommendation of the expert group was supported by the faculty members during the discussions over the course of the on-site visit: to offer the study programmes "International Relations" and "Political Science" on a single faculty/department, which in turn could enhance the satisfaction of the needs of students and teaching staff for more related professional interests of this two study programmes. When interviewing the teaching staff about the examination

forms, it was found that the faculty members use a combination of oral examinations, written papers and computer testing. But the trend is that the number of written exams increases, since the choice of the form of the exam depends on the specific course. Over the course of the interview, students stated that they are mostly satisfied with their studies at ENU, in particular, with the fact that academic mobility is widely represented at the university. There are several bilateral agreements between ENU and other universities in the world. Academic mobility is very well supported by the university, especially with such countries as Lithuania and Germany. The group of experts asked about the forms of consultation support, the students noted that freshmen are advised very well; there are special advisors and curators appointed. This process is observed at all levels of education, from undergraduate to doctorate students (PhD). The students also stated that they want to have more foreign lecturers. Students of all programmes (Bachelor and Master) noted that they can publish scientific articles, which speaks in favor of good conditions created in the university to carry out this activity. Also, according to the students of ENU, special conditions have been created for studying foreign languages. When asked about the possibility of an appeal of the examination result, they said with full confidence that this opportunity really exists. For this purpose, a special appeal committee is created, and it examines each appellate case separately. Thus, the appeals system is transparent and objective. When talking to students and teachers, the group of experts received an unambiguous answer to the posed question on different forms of examinations - oral, written, test. But the university as a whole has a pronounced tendency to increase written examinations.

The expert group recommends strengthening the empirical training methods in the undergraduate programme and teaching them at a more modern level.

It is recommended to include a wider range of different sub-disciplines, such as comparative political science, political theory, international politics, policy analysis and political sociology into the Bachelor programme.

The goals and objectives of the Bachelor programme in "Political Science" should be described more clearly. As for the needs of the labour market, the Master programme should focus on approaches and methods of "policy analysis".

It is in the interests of the students to expand the study programme by allowing them to acquire the competencies of academic writing in the beginning of the Bachelor programmes. Therefore, it is more expedient to include “Academic Writing” into the Bachelor programme. It is highly recommended to focus on attracting foreign teachers. A more flexible schedule for more efficient use of time for the scientific work of students and teachers must be designed. On the level of the university, there is a need to adopt a document on the policy of academic honesty.

### **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.3 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition and certification**

**Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.**

#### **Assessment**

ENU has implemented clear rules and procedures for ensuring the consistent development of the academic career of the students and their progress along the educational trajectory. ENU evaluates the conditions and mechanisms for effective promotion of the student on an individual educational trajectory. The policy of the student body composition involves the admission of several students who obtained the required number of points based on the results of the Unified National Testing and Complex Testing (for graduates of general secondary schools) of Higher-education Applicants (for graduates of general secondary schools, colleges) based on a state order (grant) and a fee basis. Enrollment of students is carried out based on the results of comprehensive testing and based on interviews. The order of admission to the ENU is determined by the "Rules for Admission to the University" approved by the Academic Council. These rules are approved and published. When enrolling students, the university is guided by the republican and internal normative documents of the university. Information on the rules and procedures for admission is available on the ENU website in the "Admissions" section. The body of students is based on the state educational order as well as those paying tuition at their own expense and other sources. Citizens of Kazakhstan, foreign citizens with a secondary general, technical and vocational (primary and secondary vocational), post-secondary education, citizens of Kazakhstan, foreign citizens in the order established by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as international treaties ratified by the Republic of Kazakhstan are admitted to the University. Admission of citizens to the university is based on the results of a unified national testing or comprehensive testing. The admission of foreign citizens to the university is carried out according to the allocated quota based on the state educational order in the international higher educational institutions created based on interstate agreements, and on a tuition fee basis. Enrollment of first-year students is carried out

by the Admission Committee of the university in the period from 10 to 28 August. The conditions for admission to the Master programme are determined by the Rules for admission to the Master and PhD studies of ENU which were developed in accordance with national regulations.

The body of students of the Master programme is formed based on a competition based on the results of entrance examinations in a foreign language conducted by the National Testing Center of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as by an examination in the specialty conducted by the ENU Subject Commission. Enrollment in the number of university students by transfer from other universities is carried out during the winter and summer holidays. When enrolling by transfer, the student's GPA should not be lower than the corresponding rate established at the university. Recognition of higher education documents received in other states in international or foreign educational institutions (their branches) is based on the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 13 December 1997 "On the Ratification of the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region" (Lisbon Convention). The life cycle of students in ENU is regulated by the following procedures and documents: "Individual Curriculum"; "Regulations on the Re-certification and Re-assessment of Academic Subjects"; "Regulations on the Appeals Commission on the Results of Interim Attestation and Final State Attestation"; "Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process on the Credit Technology of Teaching at ENU"; "Regulation on Monitoring and Evaluation of Students' Learning Achievements".

The main tool for informing students of the procedures regulating their learning life cycle is the official website of ENU, automated information system Platonus, personal profile and ENU services, which students can use to find out the information that interests them. In automated information system Platonus there are opportunities to collect and monitor information about the academic achievements of students - current academic performance, assessment and final control which in turn is analyzed by the Departments that offer programmes that are being accredited. Students can spend at least one semester abroad by participating in academic mobility programmes. Academic mobility is carried out based on bilateral agreements between ENU and foreign universities. Students can take part at the following academic mobility programmes: Erasmus + and Academic exchange program MEVLANA. The order of participation and conditions of financing are published on the website of the university.

Academic mobility is also carried out within the framework of ENU contacts and agreements with partner universities. Financing of expenses (except for training) associated with academic mobility is carried out in the following areas:

- Financing of Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan allocates financial sources within the established norms for study abroad that cover living expenses (120 days of rental), travel to and from the place of study, the cost of issuing a visa and medical insurance for a participant of the academic mobility programme.
- Self-financing. In this case, only training is free. The remaining expenses are covered by the participants themselves, including living expenses, transportation costs, visa and medical insurance. The above information is published on the ENU website.

The university provides the procedure for recognizing periods of study within the framework of academic mobility, based on the re-counting of students' credits. The organization of academic mobility at the university is carried out by the Department for International Cooperation in conjunction with the departments. The Department for International Cooperation solves the tasks of implementing student mobility programmes, namely, selection of foreign universities, selection and training of candidates, assistance in the preparation of documents for those travelling within the academic mobility programme. Departments, in turn, assist the student in the selection of disciplines at the foreign higher education institution, determining the disciplines for distance learning - an obligatory component of the study programme, and carrying out of the transfer of credits upon the return of students. To determine the degree of mastering of study programmes by students, preparedness for solving professional problems, continuing education within Master studies (or PhD), the final state certification is carried out, including the passing of the state examination and defense of the Master thesis. The final attestation of students is carried out within the deadlines approved in the academic calendar. To pass the state exam, students (Master students) can complete the working curriculum for the specialty. The themes of final qualification work and scientific supervisors for all levels of education are approved by the order of the rector. All degree theses are checked for plagiarism and peer reviews by external experts, which are also approved by the order of the



rector. When meeting with representatives of various departments of ENU, the group of experts found out that at the Bachelor level the electronic database "antiplagiat.ru" is used. Master and PhD theses are sent to the National Center for Scientific and Technical Information in Almaty. For the final certification, a state attestation commission is created, which consists of leading professors and associate professors, a technical secretary and a chairman who is one of the external experts. Upon completion of the work of the state attestation commission, the chairman submits a report, which contains a qualitative and quantitative analysis of the state attestation commission results and recommendations for improving the quality of training for the profession. As a result of the completion of the study programme by the state attestation commission decision, the student receives a state diploma with an attachment (transcript), which reflects the results of the training, and is awarded an academic bachelor's or master's degree in the specialty. The transcript is issued in three languages: Russian, Kazakh and English. The annex indicates the structure, content and information on the results obtained. A positive moment is the issuance of the Diploma Supplement at the ENU - the European Diploma Supplement. ENU for the first time in Kazakhstan began to issue this supplement in 2012. The form of the supplement was designed by the Banknote Factory of the Republic of Kazakhstan. This form has several degrees of protection to provide protection against tampering and plagiarism. The application consists of 8 mandatory sections and is issued in English and Kazakh / Russian.

The level of the number of students who took part in the programmes of incoming and outgoing academic mobility is quite high. Before passing an internship or academic mobility, students must pass the examinations for the knowledge of a foreign language (English or the language of the country of internship or academic mobility) or provide an IELTS certificate above the level of 6.5. Conditions for selecting applicants and the requirements for them, the necessary documents for academic mobility, are clearly spelled out on the website of ENU. The source of recognition of the results of academic mobility is the transcript of the student and his/her thesis in one of three languages (Kazakh, Russian, or English). Based on the transcript, the conformity of disciplines is compared according to the Individual curriculum and in case of finding a difference, the student must catch up the necessary disciplines during the

summer or fall semester. Based on the transcript and the final report of the student, conclusions are made about the level of professional competencies he has mastered. Information on the competencies of the Master student can be found on the website of the university.

In each semester, information meetings are held with the leadership of the university and representatives of the migration service. This procedure is clearly spelled out on the website of the university. Students from other countries, along with all students, participate in ongoing surveys of satisfaction with the quality of educational services, and leave their feedback about their studies at the university.

### **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.4 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

**ESG Part 1. Standard1.5: Teaching staff**

**Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff.**

**Assessment**

The presented data on the personnel potential for the study programmes of this cluster represent the ability of ENU to ensure development of educational programmes undergoing the accreditation procedure. Indicators on the qualitative and quantitative composition of faculty members confirm the availability of human resources necessary for the implementation of study programmes and corresponding qualification requirements for licensing educational activities.

In 2016-2017 academic year the total number of faculty members amounted to 34 people teaching at the Department of International Relations, among them 11 Doctors of Sciences, 13 Candidates of Science, two teachers with a PhD, seven teachers with a Master's degree, three teaching assistants. Over the course of the 2017-2018 academic year the human resources reserve was created at the Department of International Relations; it consists of 3 people who are currently studying for a doctorate in International Relations.

The share of teachers of the Department of International Relations with academic degrees in 2014-2015 academic year was 73.52%; in 2015-2016 academic year - 73.52%, in 2016-2017 academic year - 76.85%, the number of faculty staff members who are holders of academic degrees reached 26 people, including 16 full-time employees.

**Table of quantitative and qualitative indicators of faculty members for study programmes**

5B020200 “International Relations”, 6M020200 “International Relations”

Academic year	Total number of faculty members	Among them Doctors of Sciences		Among them Candidates of Science		Among them holders of PhD		Among them holders of Master degree	
		Qty	in %	Qty	in %	Qty	in %	Qty	in %
<b>Department of International Relations</b>									
2014–2015	41	9 (21.95%)		16 (39.02%)		1 (2.43%)		13 (31.7%)	

2015–2016	38	8 (21.5%)	13 (34.56%)	3 (7.12%)	14 (36.43%)
2016–2017	34	11 (32.35%)	13 (38.23%)	2 (5.88%)	7 (20.58%)

Classes are taught in Kazakh (79.41%, 27 of 34 people), Russian (82.35%, 28 of 34 people), and English (32.35%, 11 of 34 people).

Two teachers of the Department are professional diplomats who has worked in the system of external relations since Soviet times, and currently continue their work at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In the 2016-2017 academic year, 21 full-time teachers worked at the Department of Political Science, among them 5 professors, 7 associate professors, 8 senior lecturers and 1 teacher with a Master degree. The degree holders of the full-time faculty of the department for the reporting period is 66%. Seventy-two percent of teachers of the department teach in Kazakh. The procedure for the selection of teaching staff for teaching in a foreign language is made in accordance with the ENU Regulations on teaching in a foreign language. An obligatory condition for selection is the availability of diplomas or certificates of foreign universities, IELTS certificates (6.5 and above) or TOEFL (550 and higher). Four teachers of the Department of Political Science have the right to teach In polylingual groups.

**Table of Quantitative and qualitative indicators of faculty members for study programmes 5B050200 “Political Science”, 6M050200 “Political Science”**

Academic year	All faculty members	Degree holder			Degree holder	Master
		Doctor	Candidate	PhD		
2014-2015	25	5	10	3	72%	7
2015-2016	26	3	10	3	61,5%	10
2016-2017	24	3	9	3	62,5%	9
5B050200– Political Science						
2016-2017	24	3	9	3	62,5%	9
6M050200– Political Science						

2016-2017	15	3	9	3	100%	-
-----------	----	---	---	---	------	---

Personnel policy is an integral part of the HR strategy. The procedures for hiring and managing the professional growth of employees are carried out on the basis of the national legislation and internal documentation of the university.

The university has developed a provision on the procedure for recruitment (“Position of Competitive Substitution of Faculty Members and scientific employees of Higher Educational Institutions of 7 August 2015. No. 635”), based on the Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", “Model Qualification Characteristics for Teachers and Equivalent Persons” approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal documents of the university. Recruitment of the faculty is organized by the university on a competitive basis, which testifies to the objectivity of the recruitment. The competition for vacant positions of faculty and researchers as well as information on vacant posts is announced through the mass media and the ENU media (website, newspaper).

The motivation of teachers and the stimulation of employees is carried out in accordance with the comprehensive assessment and material incentive for achievements within the faculty of the university via an automated information system of the KPI. KPI is based on the principles of legality, objectivity, transparency, attainability, and measurability of indicators. When calculating faculty members’ scores, three main criteria are taken into consideration: educational and methodological work, scientific work and commercialization of research results, and educational and socio-organizational work.

According to the results of the evaluation of the results of the KPI for the 2016-2017 academic year, 10% of the faculty of the Department of International Relations and 30% of the teachers of the Department of Political Science received material rewards for their high level of performance indicators.

Also, in order to encourage scientific activity and strengthen the connection between the educational process and scientific research, the following incentive measures regulations have been developed and approved: regulations on the promotion of faculty, staff and students on the results of publications in scientific journals included in the Web databases of Science; rules for the distribution of the load by types of educational work in terms of reducing/decreasing

the pedagogical load of the faculty members of ENU are a personnel of the university, having in the previous calendar year publications in journals indexed by the Thomson Reuters database, etc.

In accordance with these provisions, two teachers of the Department of Political Science, who published their work in the scientific journals of the Web of Science database, were rewarded with material bonuses.

The teaching staff of the faculty in the educational process widely uses various innovative methods of teaching, such as the case-study method, explicative methods (content analysis, event analysis, cognitive mapping), presentations, brainstorming, SWAT analysis, critical thinking, business games, etc.

The quality of faculty members teaching is confirmed by the availability of scientific publications in domestic and foreign journals, teaching materials and educational and methodological developments in the taught modules for the specialty, demonstration of pedagogical skills over the course of the attestation.

Over the period from 2013 to 2017, teachers published 5 monographs, 25 textbooks and teaching material books, more than 150 articles in domestic and foreign scientific journals (among them 9 publications were included in the Thomson Reuters database, 25 articles were enlisted into the Scopus database), and more than 230 publications in the materials of domestic and foreign conferences.

Faculty members take part in various scientific projects, for example, "Investigation of the interaction of the Republic of Kazakhstan with the world community in the fight against international terrorism" (2014-2017) and "Analysis of the state of the expert assessment of the foreign policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan by the European academic community" (2014-2017).

To achieve goals of the academic policy, the University invites foreign professors. Criteria for inviting a foreign scientist are the authority of the scientist in the international academic community confirmed by his work experience, qualitative publications, recommendations of scientists in the field of international relations as well as the correspondence of the scientific interests of the invited expert with the priority areas of the research work of the department.

Over the period of 2016-2017 academic year, 10 foreign professors were invited to lecture and participate in the scientific events organized by the Department of Political Science. Professor of the Institute for Political Science at the University of Warsaw taught the course “Political Science: Research Design”; Doctor of Political Science, Professor from Moscow (Russia) conducted a seminar on the topic: “International security regimes”. Professor of the University of Zagreb (Croatia) held a scientific seminar for teachers and doctoral students of the Department of Political Science on the topic “Grant opportunities within the EU Erasmus + programme”, Professor from Hudson Center (USA) read a series of lectures for students of the Department of Political Science on US foreign policy, etc.

As for the long-term basis, two foreign professors worked at the department during this period: 1 from Ukraine with the topic of “Socio-demographic and migration processes” (3 credits, 135 hours) in 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 academic years and 1 professor from the University of Louisville (USA) with the topic “Methodology of Modern Political Studies” (3 credits, 135 hours) in 2014-2015 academic year.

The training and further development of the faculty members is carried out through doctoral studies, short-term courses, seminars, internships at leading universities in Kazakhstan abroad. The analysis shows a high proportion of teaching staff who have undergone such training. This is due both to the active position taken by the teachers in participating in the competition for various republican and international grants and to the specific nature of the study programme that requires constant professional development. All teachers are required to undergo training at the national and international level once every 5 years. Annually, the plan for further training of the faculty staff is drafted, monitoring of the courses of increase at the expense of the budget funds of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan is monitored. Improvement of professional skills is carried out based on the Professional Development Program for Teachers of Higher Education Institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, developed by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2013.

Teachers participating in the implementation of Bachelor and Master programmes 5B020200, 6M020200 “International Relations” and 5B050200, 6M050200 “Political Science” have completed courses of further training: at the International Center for Advanced Studies and Scien-

tific Information (Dusseldorf, Germany), Technical University (Dresden, Germany), Universities of Lucerne (Lausanne and Bern, Switzerland), Maastricht University, (Maastricht, Netherlands), Edu Council International Council for Educational Achievements (Brussels, Belgium). As for the Department of Political Science, in 2016-2017 academic year more than 70% of full-time staff participated in seminars, master classes, advanced training courses, including those organized in foreign countries. Aikenova D.M., PhD, senior lecturer received the Erasmus+ grant within the academic mobility programme for 17 – 21 May 2016 and had training at the University of Wroclaw, Poland. The senior lecturer Dermen Kaliollauly successfully completed the further training courses at the University of Lanzhou from 8 - 21 August 2016.

Teachers also can improve their qualifications by getting a PhD. For example, 4 lecturers of the Department of International Relations participating in the implementation of study programme 5B020200 “International Relations” over the period of 2012 to 2016 received PhD from ENU by studying 6D020200 “International Relations”. Two teachers from the Department of International Relations participating in the implementation of study programmes 5B020200 “International Relations” also completed their studies/are enrolled in 6D020200 “International Relations” PhD programme at ENU. Completion of further training is confirmed by appropriate certificates. Since one of the most important issues is the language competence of teachers, the university provides an opportunity to visit English language courses for teachers free of charge.

In general, the data indicate a constant increase in the level of qualifications of the teaching staff, intensification of research activities. The following results are reflected in scientific articles, monographs, manuals, dissertations, and scientific projects.

Strengths of the study programmes are: the alignment of the staff potential of the faculty strategy with the specifics of the study programmes, incentive system for professional and personal development of the teaching staff, practice of inviting foreign teachers, practicing diplomats, parliament deputies, government members to offer classes, monitoring of the activities of the teaching staff, systematic assessment of the competence level of teachers, a comprehensive evaluation of the quality of teaching.

Room for improvement of the study programmes is seen in the insufficient number of research grants, both based on national grant programmes and initiative research, a decrease



in the rate of attraction of foreign and domestic teachers to conduct joint research in the implementation of educational programs, a low number of publications with a high impact factor.

In order to further develop and improve ENU activities in terms of the implementation of study programmes, the group of experts recommends to increase the level of faculty members participation in republican and foreign research competitions to receive and implement grant programmes, to continue work on joint research in the implementation of study programmes involving leading foreign and domestic universities and research institutes, to strengthen integrated training in empirical methods within the Bachelor programme “Political Science”, to increase the number of published articles in high-ranking journals, to provide conditions for a more active engagement of faculty members in the social life (role of teaching staff in the education system, the development of science and region, creation of a cultural environment, participation in exhibitions, creative competitions, charity programmes, etc.); consider the possibility of adjusting the curriculum of the teaching staff to provide more time for research.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.5 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

## **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support**

**Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.**

### **Assessment**

The material and technical base available at the university meets the requirements of sanitary norms and the requirements of general state educational standards for study programmes. Repairs and preparation of premises, renovation of furniture, boards, blinds, repair and renovation of air conditioners are carried out on an annual basis for each new academic year. Before the onset of the heating season, the heating system is prepared for trouble-free operation in the winter.

Currently, 21 rooms, 1 computer class, 3 language laboratories for 20 seats each, 3 special lecture audiences (room 339 named after the diplomat N. Tyuryakulov, room 319 for the Center for European Information, room 316 for Diplomatic Protocol and Etiquette, room 336 for Resource Center for the Study of the Integration of Latin American and Eurasian Associations. The Department of International Relations has 10 computers, 2 multifunctional devices, 5 printers, and 2 scanners. With the support of the management of the university, the department acquired a modern version of the software "SPSS STATISTIKA" in the amount of 10 licenses. This programme is used in the training of doctoral students when they study the discipline "Quantitative Methods for the Study of International Relations" as well as in the implementation of the research work of doctoral students and independent work of the doctoral student.

The Department of Political Science is in a separate building. The total area is 4491 m<sup>2</sup>. The total territory of premises amounts to 2878 m<sup>2</sup>. There are rooms (184.1 m<sup>2</sup>), a sports hall (535 m<sup>2</sup>), a gym (85.9 m<sup>2</sup>), an assembly hall (307.6 m<sup>2</sup>), other classrooms (1206.4 m<sup>2</sup>), a canteen (31.5 m<sup>2</sup>), sanitary facilities (75 m<sup>2</sup>), and other technical premises (1457.7 m<sup>2</sup>).

There is one computer class equipped with 13 computers, 5 assigned to the department, an educational television and radio studio, 1 video camera, and 1 projector.

All study rooms are equipped with necessary furniture, video and computer equipment, white and multimedia boards, projectors, visual stands. Computer classes are provided with access

to the Internet and a local network of the university. The bandwidth of the Internet network is 100 Mbps.

Financing of study programmes is planned on an annual basis. Expenses are carried out in accordance with the expenditure structure approved in normative acts adopted by the authorized bodies in the field of education. Funded are such areas as a payroll fund, the purchase of educational literature, current repairs, utilities, payment for office supplies. The financial policy of ENU is balanced and aimed at maintaining the quality of educational programmes.

A unified system of library and information services, procurement of educational and methodological literature on applications of departments and faculties has been introduced at the university. The Chairs closely cooperate with the library on the acquisition of necessary educational literature in the form of applications and monitoring of new literature for the applicable specialty. The university purchases a diverse range of informative literature for various profiles. The student body of study programmes that undergo the accreditation process can use the funds of the scientific reading room "Otyrar". Capacity of the hall is 350 seats.

The fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on basic and profiling disciplines, used in the educational process of the study programmes allows to ensure a high-quality level of training. There are 4 subscriptions available for students: a study subscription, a subscription of scientific literature, a subscription of foreign literature and a subscription of fiction. They also have access to seven reading rooms with 700 seats.

The library reference and retrieval systems are represented by traditional (card) catalogues and an electronic catalogue (KABIS). Starting in 2010, the "KABIS" information system functions within the library where the search for textbooks is conducted according to any available data: Universal Decimal Classification, Library and Bibliographic Classification, Author, Title, ISBN, etc. The university can receive and exchange information with domestic and foreign universities, libraries and organizations quickly via electronic mail and on the Internet network. Students and teachers have access to the catalogues of the Republican Intercollegiate Electronic Library, the Kazakh National Electronic Library and the following world databases and resources: Springer Link, Taylor and Francis, Routledge, Thomson Reuters, ELSEVIER, POLPRED com, Russian State Library, Nazarbayev University Library, Republican Scientific and Pedagogical Library and libraries of universities of Kazakhstan as well as foreign university libraries (Lomonosov Moscow State University, Sofia University of St. Kliment Ohridski, etc.). From

computers of ENU academic buildings as well as from the Otyrar library students can log in and view journals from the Thomson Reuters and Springer databases. This access is provided as part of the subscription. In addition to these ENU bases, a contract has been concluded with the SCOPUS database.

The access to the SciVal Funding system is open and provides access to information on allocated foreign grants from more than 5,000 sources of funding. The SciVal Funding system allows ENU scientists look for foreign partners for the implementation of joint scientific projects. ENU has developed a multifunctional electronic portal designed to provide all participants in the educational process with a "single access point" to electronic services and information resources related to the organization of learning and management processes; access to the library materials is provided both through the traditional and electronic subscription. This access to electronic resources is provided through the website <http://enulib.enu.kz/>.

The university has departments and offices for the provision of educational, consultative assistance (educational, personal and academic) to students. The support services system includes: The Department of Academic Affairs, the Department of Social and Civil Development, the Scientific Library, the Health Center, the Youth Policy Center and the Sports Club. Also, at the university there are the Educational and Information Center "Eurasia Akparat", the Newspaper "Eurasia University", TV station "Eurasia-TV". The "Eurasia-TV" channel is aired every Friday, the duration of the programme is 15 minutes. News on the channel is broadcast in two languages. There is also an active radio station "Eurasia FM".

A necessary social policy is being carried out and aims at creating conditions for the study and leisure of students and teaching staff. For these purposes, the following infrastructure facilities operate: ENU Medical Center, student cinema, student homes, sports grounds, public catering facilities, and a legal clinic. ENU management is implementing measures to provide social support to students, such as providing discounts on tuition fee and opportunity to live in the student dormitories (providing accommodation for certain categories of students free of charge), payment of monetary compensation to orphans and foster children: monthly food compensation is estimated at 1,579 tenge per day; a one-time outfit purchase for the autumn and winter period is 100,000 tenge; travel card for public transport 1 time per quarter in the amount of 50% of the cost of a transportation card (4,500 tenge), payment of material assistance through a student trade union committee.

For nonresident students, a hostel is provided, most of the students in need of housing are provided with a dormitory.

In general, the educational process for study programmes undergoing the accreditation process is provided with all the necessary teaching materials, material equipment and computer technology for an effective and meaningful learning process. The material and technical base and resources of the university allow providing high-quality training and preparation of specialists within Bachelor and Master programmes 5B020200 and 6M020200 “International Relations” as well as 5B050200 and 6M050200 “Political Science”.

Strengths of the study programmes include the modern scientific and educational material and technical base and resources as well as accessibility of the resources of the library, specialized offices, and social facilities of the university.

To further develop and improve the implementation of study programmes undergoing the accreditation process at ENU, it is recommended to carry out further work to improve the material and technical base, update the software, and continue to develop the hard copies availability of the current educational and scientific literature in Russian, Kazakh and English for these study programmes.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.6 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

## **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.7: Information management**

**Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.**

### **Assessment**

Management of educational programmes at ENU is carried out based on collection, analysis and use of relevant information. The university provides this process based on modern information and communication technologies and software, determines the scope and structure of periodically updated information and responsible persons for the reliability and timeliness, completeness of information and its safety. Information resource is automated information system "Platonus" that is created to support the assessment of students' knowledge within the rating system, to assess the examinations taken in the form of computer testing, to fill out the rating journal, to monitor students' knowledge and fill the electronic journal by teachers. Access to the automated information system "Platonus" is carried out through the personal account of the student. Also, the system of electronic document circulation "ARTA Synergy" was launched at ENU in 2011. Maintenance of the mission, goals, objectives and assessment of their effectiveness is carried out in accordance with the internal regulatory documents such as "Analysis of the quality management system by the top management PRO-ENU 501-17". According to these procedures, the university collects and analyses data to assess the effectiveness of the activity, determine the degree of implementation of the mission, goals and objectives, and opportunities for continuous improvement of the service provided - the implementation of the study programmes at all levels. In the context of educational management, the following documents are applied to the study programmes: Decisions of Collegiate Management Bodies (such as the Scientific and Methodological Council, the Scientific Council, the Scientific and Technical Council, rectorate) as well as orders of rector and vice-rectors, documents for students, orders for staff, Bachelor, Master, PhD, and documents related to planning, analysis, reporting, finance and accounting. The procedures for exchanging information have been developed in internal regulatory documents. For the exchange of information within the university there are the following means available: communication facilities

(telephones, e-mail, Internet, local network, faxes, etc.); information and normative documents (norms, journals, books, reference books); archives; computer and photocopiers. For the analysis of compliance with the Quality System, information on the audit results of PRO-ENU 501-17 is used. The collection, analysis, use of information for management of the study programmes in terms of basic processes and the results of the audit are fully automated. Databases of specialties of all levels are formed. The analysis on the part of top management is carried out in the areas of the management system, it affects the decisions that are made on policy changes, quality objectives, increases the effectiveness of processes; improves the products in relation to customer requirements, needs and resources. The decisions made are always recorded. To fulfill its public mission, ENU regularly publishes quantitative and qualitative information on study programmes of all levels implemented at the university and on the results of the university activities on the official website. Assessment of key performance is carried out in accordance with the KPI map of faculty "FP ENU 14-01-16." Data are collected throughout the academic year, and the assessment is carried out by the relevant authorities. In all departments of the university, clerical work is conducted in accordance with the approved nomenclature of cases, preservation and archiving of documents is ensured, work is underway to transfer to the electronic document flow "I-ENU 03-16 clerical work". The presence of an internal information and educational portal, a ramified corporate network, allows access to all information resources from any computer. The Scientific Library uses the Kazakhstan Automated Matrix Library and Information Program (KABIS) - a database which serves to automate the main library processes and create an electronic catalogue of the library stock as well as the full-text database. To ensure security in the process of interaction with information systems, the exchange of data between users and systems has been transferred to the secure HTTPS access mode. Assessment of the performance and effectiveness of the implementation of educational programmes occurs in the form of the feedback provided by employers, motions, extension of the practice base, expert opinions on the study programmes and implementation of the practical component that are included in the automated database. The indicator of successful implementation of the study programmes is the successful completion of different types of practice and the percentage of graduates employed. The collection and analysis of information on the activities of the teaching staff ensure a high level of students' satisfaction with the implementation of the study programmes, and with the work of the internal

quality assurance system. Considering the technical capabilities of the automated information system "Platonus" at the end of each examination session, the Office of the Registry presents a report that reflects the results of academic achievements and the completion of professional practices of students, and the necessary actions taken as a result of the evaluation. GPA is calculated by the system automatically based on the results of a given student's progress. Deans and heads of departments, student support services work in the system with the following reports: a card file of students and teachers; the report of a body of students on levels of training, specialty, courses, forms of training, language variations, forms of payment; the report of the body of students on a national structure, age categories, gender, countries of origin; report on the regions of origin of students; statistics on the movement of students; reports on students with academic debts; reports on the formation of student applications for disciplines; reports on the workload of the syllabi; reports on the load of test tasks; orders for the body of students; reports on the results of the session; reports on GPA trainees. Based on the analysis of the facts, the management of educational programs takes the appropriate managerial decisions - for example, prepares overview of the promotion of teaching staff and students for effective scientific work and nominates best students for the award of Presidential scholarships. In accordance with the mission of ENU, the method of online questioning through automated information system "Platonus" was defined as a method of information gathering; satisfaction of interested persons in the quality of the information received and in its completeness is investigated by means of the analysis of questionnaires for students and teaching staff. The order of implementation of automated information systems is defined in "PRO ENU 606-13". The Department of Academic Affairs is a key element in the collection and processing of information concerning the educational process. For the current and boundary control of students' knowledge, the "Computer Testing System" is used, which makes it possible to produce a simultaneous independent procedure for monitoring the knowledge of students, which is necessary for the increase of the level of academic achievement, student satisfaction, and the implementation of the study programmes. The received data on internal and external information undergo the stage of analytical processing. Analytical calculations are used to summarize the results and the effectiveness of the study programmes. The use of internal and external information allows ENU to react quickly to changes and deviations in the



implementation of the study programmes. Management of information about the employment of graduates of the university is carried out by the Career and Business Partnership Department. To facilitate the employment of graduates, the department places their CVs on ENU website, monitors the labor market and vacancies in various specialties, organizes an annual "Job Fair" with the potential employers being invited. The department publishes information about existing vacancies in his profile in the social network "Facebook". The information on the department is collected by the responsible person. Employment of graduates refers to information that affects the effective management of the study programmes at all levels as well as other areas of basic processes and procedures. The procedure for registering consent to the processing of personal data is consistent in accordance with the documented procedures of the ENU Quality Management System. ENU information software includes the following software tools: INFOKIOSK.ENU, ARTA SYNERGY, Platonus, Mail.enu, moodle.enu, kpi.enu, electronic library-ENULIB, corporate mail. Information terminals (the so-called kiosks) are installed in the academic buildings of ENU. On the Registry Office conducts collection and analysis of various indicators of the student body based on various reports formed via the automated information system "Platonus". Once a year, the statistical report "3-NC" and "1-NC" is drafted, these are the annual reporting documents for the national statistical agency. Based on the results of the sessions, the system generates a report of the results of the examination session. Based on the report, qualitative and quantitative analyses of students' progress in the courses are conducted, the results of which are heard and discussed at the meetings of the departments, Council of the faculty, university administration and university. The university has created and successfully operates an internal information and educational portal ([www.enu.kz](http://www.enu.kz)).

The general information part of the portal contains information about the university, its subdivisions and the events taking place at the university. Departments include information on the processes of study programmes implementation as well as activities related to the strategy of ENU development. Processing, assessment and analysis of information received from all stakeholders (students, faculty staff members, employers) is carried out by the Study Programmes Committee and the Quality Assessment Department. The Quality Assessment Department, on top of the collection of information through automated questionnaires on the Platonus system, carries out sociological studies that result in reports that are analysed by the

university management, discussions are held at the university and department level and are reflected in the minutes of the meeting of the departments. Students, staff and employers are involved in the processes of collecting and analysing information as well as making decisions as part of collegial bodies at the department and faculty level. Proposals are submitted to the EMS and approved by the Academic Council of the university. The management of study programmes uses information analysis to identify and forecast risks. The results of the analysis are reflected in the operating plans and reports of the departments. The system, collection, analysis and use of information is carried out for improvement of the study programmes that undergo accreditation and re-accreditation procedures. Job descriptions, regulations, internal regulatory documents serve as a guarantee for the collection and analysis of information within the legal framework, the regulation of the responsibility of officials for the reliability of information posted in the automated information system "Platonus" and ARTA Synergy. The results of the collection and analysis of information on issues of all levels are discussed at the meetings of the department and published on the official website. These materials help to ensure the quality of information management of the implementation of the study programmes.

Over the course of the interviews, the group of experts managed to find out that sociological surveys of students are constantly conducted, and their results are known to the rector, deans, academic councils and teaching staff. There are indicators of faculty members performance on the KPI system. The information on graduates and their employment is systematically collected. Also, the university has created the Alumni Association, and it is well established. When the group of experts talked to students, it was found out there is an annual job fair where employers present their organisations. Awareness of students on this issue shows the cooperation of the departments with employers. Also, during the conversation with the students, it was confirmed that the university works with the representatives of the Alumni Association who participate in Master classes and university conferences. The positive highlight of the system is the sociological surveys that show students' satisfaction level with study programmes not only among students of accredited specialties but also among graduates in general. There is an availability of educational resources in the form of databases of electronic international and national libraries, including Thompson Reuters and Scopus. There are printed editions and electronic catalogues on the literature for study programmes of ENU.

There are purchasing order for new books based on requests of teachers and students. Students are informed that written works are checked for plagiarism which can also be reflected in their assessments.

As a recommendation to the university, the group of experts suggests the room for improvements of the library resource base by purchasing new and relevant literature related to “Political Science” and “International Relations”. When going through syllabi and catalogues of elective disciplines, experts discovered a lot of items of old literature which contradicts the nature of study programmes undergoing the accreditation process as they are closely related to pressing problems of world politics and international relations.

### **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.7 based on the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

## **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.8: Public information**

**Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.**

### **Assessment**

Informing the public of the city of Astana and the Republic of Kazakhstan as a whole on study programmes "International Relations" is carried out by all by the press services of the university. All faculties of ENU maintain their own websites. The website of the Faculty of International Relations is available in three languages (Kazakh, Russian and English).

The applicable information on the general requirements for admission to the university for "International Relations" is published within the "Admissions" section on the faculty website. A more detailed description of the educational programmes for undergraduate, graduate and PhD studies as well as information on professional competencies, awarded qualifications, specialisation, specificity of programmes and the labor market, requirements for admission and tuition fees are available on the web page of the department. The Objectives Matrix, the Description of the Model of the Study Programmes, the Quality Assurance Guide for the Study Programmes, the Quality Assurance of the Study Programmes are published in the PDF format, and they provide detailed information for prospective applicants on the tab page of the Department of Study Programmes.

Direct communication with university perspective and current students is carried out through accounts in social networks on VK, Facebook, Instagram, etc. This work is actively carried out during the admission period as well as before the meeting of the rector with the public or his meeting with the faculty members and the student community of the university.

Information about the study programmes, the educational process and the activities of the Department of International Relations are published on the faculty and university website, as well as on popular social networks and video portals (for instance, Facebook and YouTube) in the form of video presentations on the programmes it offers.

Head of the department, candidate of historical sciences, acting professor Ayman Makhsotovna Azmukhanova notes that every year to get acquainted with the study programmes during the admission process, a video address is prepared together with the teaching staff; it is then published not only on the faculty website, but also on social networks.

The person responsible for the website of the faculty is the holder of Master degree in International Politics, senior lecturer of the International Relations Department Aibolat Dalelkhan. He made a remark that the faculty website performs the function of selling-point (this way public can learn about the study programmes). Therefore, puts all the information related to the study programme appear on the website of the faculty in a timely manner. He also notes that he always tries to answer all questions from prospective students and their parents in as much detail and as quickly as possible.

An important direction of the activity of the department is the annual career-oriented work. In the context of this career-oriented work teachers provide information on the activities of the department, about the study programmes and the expected results of studies, qualifications awarded, teaching, assessment procedures, passing scores and training opportunities as well as information on job opportunities for graduates in the form of presentations. Over the course of vocational guidance work, students of the senior classes of general education schools are shown a video address from the dean of the faculty and the head of the department. They also receive informational flyers on the study programme "International Relations". Days of Open Doors are held for high school students at the city and republican level as well as a job fair that is organised for university graduates with the participation of potential employers.

According to the practice and employment curators: associate professor Aliya Muratovna Kusainova Ph.D. and candidate of historical sciences, associate professor Leyla Kamidullaevna Akhmetzhanova, during the conclusion of contracts with organisations where students can gain professional experience from, the recommendations of future employers are always taken into account and every possible support is provided to students who want to conclude tripartite agreements with organizations . The above activities allow employers to learn more about the study programme "International Relations".

Promotion and distribution of information about the study programmes of the Department of International Relations is also carried out through the faculty members of the Department of

the department who participate in foreign scientific internships abroad. The faculty members often give interviews on national and foreign TV channels on various topics of world politics and participate in debates. For example: Professor of the Department "International Relations", Amirzhan Alievisov, Ph.D. who was the head of the headquarters of the specialised train "Teuelsiz Kazakhstan" that was used for the popularization of the national idea "Mengilick Yel", noted that, despite the fact that speeches of the faculty members were not a direct promotion of the specialty, they have contributed to the popularization of the Department of International Relations and increases the demand for specialty.

As one of the senior lecturers of the Department of Political Science notes, public information at the department "Political Science" is published in different ways.

Firstly, it is the website of the faculty and the main website of the university. Here interested parties can find all the necessary information about the educational programme and faculty as well as news and events, achievements of the department and all applicable information about the places where student can complete their practice.

Similarly, the Department of Political Science actively uses social networks to communicate and inform current and prospective students, for example, the department has accounts in such social networks as Facebook, VK, LinkedIn ...

On those websites all news and congratulations, announcements of forthcoming conferences and master classes are published, as current and prospective students do not always visit official sites and these pages serve as source of current events.

Another source of information is the maintained contacts with foreign universities partners, for example, the placement of textbooks and teaching materials in foreign universities, we give the opportunity to foreign students and students from Kazakhstan who are studying abroad to get acquainted with the scientific work of our professors.

Student of the second year of the Master programme "Political Science" M.I, Galyamova says "the website is one of the ultra-innovative tools for finding necessary and useful information for teachers and current and prospective students. Personally, I like the "Announcements" section, where I can find a fair selection of news about upcoming scientific conferences. This is very useful for those who are going to participate in such events and subsequently publish their articles. In addition, it should the blog of the rector should be highlighted as everyone can post his question and receive an exhaustive answer in a timely manner. I would also like

to emphasise the presence of feedback from active students about the educational process at ENU which serves as a motivation for the realisation of its potential for both prospective and current members of the university students, faculty stud, etc.

The only thing that can be regarded as a recommendation is to add 1 contact number to the university contacts so that interested parties can contact the reception more quickly. "

All interviewed teachers and students unanimously stressed that, in general, the work carried out for the informing of the public of the "International Relations" and "Political Science" meets the criterial mark-ups of Standard 8 "Public information".

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.8 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

## **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes**

**Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.**

### **Assessment**

To ensure effective implementation of study programmes and create an enabling learning environment at ENU the following tools are applied: questioning of all persons interested in the quality of training; active cooperation with employers on quality assurance issues; internal university quality monitoring system and the activities of the faculty, department and university structures for quality control and assurance.

The university regularly reviews the Strategy and Policy in the field of quality, monitors their implementation. To ensure quality assurance, the university complies with the requirements of the normative regulations of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, implements international requirements and procedures for improving the quality of education, analyses the effectiveness of planning and reporting, conducts sociological monitoring of the implementation of the mission and strategy, attracts stakeholders - social partners, employers, teaching staff, observes the principle of openness of university management for proposals.

The development of strategic documents is also carried out based on the results of the analysis of the external and internal environment, identified risks, compliance of resources, labour market needs and specifics of the market of educational services. The discussion annually takes place at the meetings of the departments, Councils of the Faculties and the Academic Council of the university. In this context, opinions and proposals of employers and students are taken into account.

The departments annually monitor, assess and revise the study programmes, taking into account the views of the representatives of the students, employers who are members of the Study Programmes Development Committee.



The Quality Assessment Department carries out ongoing monitoring and regular evaluation in the form of an online questionnaires. The questionnaires are conducted with the purpose of finding out the quality of educational services, reveal the degree of satisfaction of students with the quality of the subjects taught (the quality of teaching lectures, seminars and laboratory classes, the quality of assignments and the time for their implementation, teaching and methodological support) and receiving suggestions from students related to this issue. The survey is conducted twice a year and is available here: [https://my.enu.kz/page\\_anketa](https://my.enu.kz/page_anketa) in the Kazakh and Russian languages. The results are analysed by the departments and taken into account.

The analysis of the questionnaires showed that, in general, students of study programmes undergoing the accreditation process are satisfied with the quality of the educational services provided.

Chairs analyse the progress of students, the conformity of the forms of evaluation of students learning and the results of the discipline, the assessment of the adequacy of the labour intensity of disciplines is conducted, the results of which, if necessary, introduce changes in the work load of the respective disciplines.

The interests of employers are taken into account by monitoring the analysis of their satisfaction with study programmes based on the results of internships, the results of the employment of graduates, scientific and practical forums held at the university with the participation of representatives of professional sectors, and the involvement of employers in the development of modular Master programmes. Employers are satisfied with the competencies of graduates.

All suggestions of students and other stakeholders are reflected in the minutes of the expanded meeting of the departments, the changes introduced are reflected in the study programmes, catalogue of elective subjects and the learning and methodical materials for the subject. Proposals concerning the work of support services are sent to the relevant structural units of the university.

The analysis of the self-assessment report, the results of the meetings with Bachelor and Master students, and teaching staff showed that the departments monitor, regularly assess and revise the study programme strategy with regards to the requirements and recommendations

of the ministry of Science and Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, ACQUIN accreditation agency, and other stakeholders.

Thus, the monitoring, regular evaluation and revision of the study programmes allows the staff of the ENU to adjust study programmes in a timely manner, taking into account the achievements of modern science, the trends of change in the labour market and ensure the training of competitive professionals.

It is recommended to introduce and implement permanent feedback documentation used on a regular basis for acquisition of students' opinions based on the results of surveys and out of these ongoing activities.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and comes to the conclusion that Standard 1.9 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

## **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance**

**Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis.**

### **Assessment**

ENU conducts external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the State General Education Standard and European Standards and Recommendations (ESG) on a regular basis. The university carries out procedures for the accreditation of study programmes through national and foreign accreditation agencies and publishes information on accredited educational programmes on its webpage. Also, the university regularly conducts procedures for institutional accreditation.

Quality Management System of ENU is subjected to constant examination regarding its compliance with all the requirements of ISO 9001: 2008.

### **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.10 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

#### **4. Recommendation for the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN and Accreditation Council of IAAR**

*(The university does not receive this part of the report)*

#### **Assessment of the implementation of Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), as amended.**

The study programmes 5B020200 “International Relations” (Bachelor), 6M020200 “International Relations” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course), 6M020200 “International Relations” (Profile Master course), 5B050200 “Political Science” (Bachelor), 6M050200 “Political Science” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course) have been evaluated on compliance with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG).

The group of experts makes a conclusion that Standard 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), Standard 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), Standard 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), Standard 1.5 (Teaching staff), Standard 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), Standard 1.7 (Information management), Standard 1.8 (Public information), Standard 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes), Standard 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) have been fulfilled.

The group of experts points out that the recommendations from the first-time accreditation procedure are properly taken into account.

### **Recommendation on accreditation**

The group of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes 5B020200 “International Relations” (Bachelor), 6M020200 “International Relations” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course), 6M020200 “International Relations” (Profile Master course), 5B050200 “Political Science” (Bachelor), 6M050200 “Political Science” (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course) without conditions but with the following recommendations:

### **Recommendation for the study programme "International Relations" (Bachelor and Master)**

1. Competencies in the field of academic writing should be developed at an earlier stage of training. To this end, the subject "Academic Writing" should be included into the Bachelor programme.
2. Because of the close scientific links and parallel approaches of the programmes "Political Science" and "International Relations" it is recommended to unite them into one faculty to improve the conditions for cooperation.

### **Recommendation for the study programme "Political Science" (Bachelor and Master)**

1. Because of the close scientific links and parallel approaches of the programmes "Political Science" and "International Relations" it is recommended to unite them into one faculty to improve the conditions for cooperation.
2. Competencies in the field of academic writing should be developed at an earlier stage of training. To this end, the subject "Academic Writing" should be included into the Bachelor programme.
3. It is recommended to put more emphasis on teaching empirical methods; they should be taught more comprehensively in the undergraduate programme.
4. The general objectives and purpose of educational programmes "Political Science" should be described more precisely. In accordance with the current emphasis of study

programmes and labour market requirements in Kazakhstan, the focus of the Master program should be placed on approaches and methods of political analysis.

5. Training provided within the Bachelor programme should be expanded as it should include various disciplines, such as comparative politics, political theory, international politics, political analysis and political sociology.