



განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი  
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

## Higher Education Institution Authorisation Experts' Final Report

East-West Teaching University LLC

### Expert Panel Members

Chair: Prof. Milan Pol, (Chair), Masaryk University, Czech Republic

Co-Chair: Prof. John Spencer, Emeritus Professor, Newcastle University, Newcastle upon Tyne, United Kingdom

Members:

Prof. Irma Manjavidze, Tbilisi State Medical University, Georgia

Salome Khubulava (Student Expert), Tbilisi State Medical University, Georgia

Prof. Khatuna Saganelidze (Employers Representative), New Vision University Hospital, Georgia

Tbilisi

2019

## Authorisation Report Resume

### General information on the educational institution

East-West Teaching University LLC (EWUNI) is a very young institution. It was founded in April 2017 on the basis of the project that was implemented in 2002-03 under the guidance of the American University, Washington D.C. This initiative brought to a closer relation some universities of South Caucasus and Turkey, and consequently, the idea to establish EWUNI came up through the initiative of several Georgian personalities, also leaders of Khazar University, Azerbaijan.

The EWUNI aims to establish two one-cycle medical education programmes, one in Georgian, one in English. Intended enrolment is 150 students, comprising 125 foreign and 25 Georgian students every year). The EWUNI defines itself as a Teaching University. At the moment, there are 18 academic staff members (4 professors, 11 associate professors, 3 assistant professors) assigned to the EWUNI, and 11 affiliated academic staff (3 professors, 6 associate professors, 3 assistant professors). The number of invited staff is 35, with administrative support provided by 17 staff members.

The total budget of EWUNI is declared to be 3.5 million GEL, out of which research activities will be supported by 61.5 thousand GEL, and the library by 8.5 thousand. The main campus is intended to be built in the grounds of Tbilisi Balneological Resort, and is currently under refurbishment and new construction.

### Brief overview of the evaluation process for authorization: SER and site visit

Before the site visit, the panel had a chance to read the main documents issued by the EWUNI, mainly, but not only the self-evaluation report (SER), and via email discussed the nature of the process, division of roles etc. The evaluation panel meeting at the premises of NCEQE in Tbilisi followed (April 30, 2019) and more specific discussions took place with the use of already prepared mapping grids and some other materials. The site visit was organized for the period May 1-3, 2019. Over the course of the 3 days the panel conducted a series of interviews with people across the EWUNI structure and beyond, visited the premises of the Balneological Resort and several medical institutions that are intending to co-operate, especially within the clinical parts of the programmes. Throughout the whole process the work of the panel was very effectively supported by Ms Lali Giorgidze.

### Overview of the HEI's compliance with standards

In general, the panel agreed that the level of compliance with individual standards varied at EWUNI.

Standard 1: substantially complies with requirements

Standard 2: partially complies with requirements

Standard 3: does not comply with requirements

Standard 4: partially complies with requirements

Standard 5: partially complies with requirements

Standard 6: partially complies with requirements

Standard 7: partially complies with requirements

### Summary of Recommendations

**Standard 1:**

Ensure the mission of the institution is shared widely within the community of EWUNI.  
Ensure strategic and action plans include a focus on EWUNI's contribution to the development of society and knowledge dissemination (by means of public lectures, social and cultural events, lifelong learning facilitation activities, consultation processes, for instance).  
Specify more concretely main activities for the action plan (2019-2021) in case of Strategic goal N1.  
Describe performance criteria in the Action plan 2019-2021.  
Make sure there are mostly measurable outcomes of their main goals in the Action plan.

**Standard 2:**

Ensure structural units implement their functions effectively and in a coordinated manner.  
Ensure leadership/management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution.  
Develop a clear and effective policy of support of international mobility of students and staff.  
Ensure regulations of all structural units are developed.  
Ensure appointment procedures are transparent.  
Ensure advisory functions of Academic Council can be effectively met.  
Ensure clarity of functions and responsibilities of structural units is sufficient.

Ensure sure all staff are familiar with QA documents.  
Work on developing EWUNI's own specific QA strategy.  
Ensure EWUNI documents are developed independently and not copied from materials of other institutions.

**Standard 3:**

Revisit the structural organization of EWUNI such that the Program Development Board/Group assumes a central role in development, implementation and delivery of the program, with formal representation from relevant Departments and clearer lines of accountability  
Enhance participatory process for programme planning, design, development and delivery.  
Ensure further programme development is based on the most recent Sectoral Benchmarks of Higher Education in Medicine.  
Clarify EWUNI's approach to and understanding CBL  
Develop a systematic approach to crafting problems/cases for both the problem-based groups, and for case-based learning.  
Develop a communication skills curriculum that integrates horizontally and vertically.  
Expand choice of electives in both the English and Georgian programmes.  
Develop a comprehensive assessment blueprint.  
Initiate work in the following areas of assessment as a matter of urgency: creating a question bank of validated questions; training for teachers in question writing and OSCE station construction; recruiting and training standardized patients for OSCEs; developing and piloting an OSCE circuit to explore the logistics and practicalities; training OSCE examiners; defining criteria for assessing oral examinations, portfolios and log-books; developing a system for appropriate standard-setting of all assessment methods to be used.  
Re-think the process of constructing exam papers such that a senior academic has oversight.  
Establish a senior academic post to oversee the design, development, delivery and quality assurance of the assessment schedule.  
Ensure academic, invited and management staff are fully conversant with the assessment system.

**Standard 4:**

Review the academic staff procedures for appointment to academic positions.  
Ensure involvement of academic staff in the university management process.  
Elaborate a professional development strategy for all staff, academic, affiliated, invited and administrative.  
Set benchmarks for staff and the work completed by them.  
Specify workload scheme of invited staff to avoid overload.

**Standard 5:**

Improve The Rule of Recognition of education in Learning Process document especially recognition of credits from different programme  
Develop the environment for the student with special needs  
Develop clear student admission regulations, especially for foreign students.  
Develop regulations for internal university exam for language competencies.  
Develop the regulations for specific examination types (for example OSCE).  
Clarify the unit responsible for student budget controlling.

Clarify criteria for getting and loosing EWUNI scholarships.  
Revisit strategy for providing career support service, involving staff with medical backgrounds.

**Standard 6:**

Increase the scientific skills credits in the curriculum according to the latest Sector Benchmarks.  
Establish a specific unit which will have background and experience in medical research process development.  
Clarify and develop the means by which research activity in the University will link with activity in clinical centers and will inform the teaching programme.  
Clarify the plan for research budget usage.  
Provide sufficient research infrastructure and equipment.  
Define the priorities of university research.  
Develop a programme of training for academic personnel for increasing scientific and research skills.  
Clarify in more detail clear research evaluation criteria and rules for different academic personnel and students.  
Establish the Department of Research Development as intended.

**Standard 7:**

Ensure education spaces especially for basic subjects are adequate.  
Ensure equipment for educational spaces is improved.  
Ensure there are also available recreational (social) spaces for the students within the institution.  
Ensure there is an adequate amount of equipment (such as manikins) to support teaching clinical skills and procedures to the proposed number of students  
Improve significantly library resources so that it will serve the needs of the number of students to be enrolled, both Georgian and international.  
EWUNI must develop its own Information Technology Management Policy.  
Ensure adequate online facilities are available for students at all clinical sites.  
Make funds available and sufficient to effectively perform activities described in strategic and action plans.

**Summary of Suggestions**

**Standard 3:**

Consider ways of introducing early patient contact.

Consider offering some elective options earlier in the program.

Engage a psychometrician to help measure the validity, reliability, and fairness of exams at least for one full cycle of the programme.

Consider sending selected faculty on an assessment course.

**Summary of the Best Practices**

N/A

**Summary Table of Compliance of HEI with Standards and Standard Components**

	Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1.	<b>Mission and strategic development of HEI</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
1.1	Mission of HEI	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
1.2	Strategic development	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.	<b>Organisational structure and management of HEI</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.1	Organisational structure and management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.2	Internal quality assurance mechanisms	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.3	Observing principles of ethics and integrity	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.	<b>Educational Programmes</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X
3.1	Design and development of educational programmes	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.2	Structure and content of educational programmes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.3	Assessment of learning outcomes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X
4	<b>Staff of the HEI</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
4.1	Staff management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
4.2	Academic/Scientific and invited Staff workload	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5	<b>Students and their support services</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
5.1	The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
5.2	Student support services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
6	<b>Research, development and/or other creative work</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.1	Research activities	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.2	Research support and internationalisation	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.3	Evaluation of research activities	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.	<b>Material, information and financial resources</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	
7.1	Material resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.2	Library resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X
7.3	Information resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.4	Financial resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>

## Signature of expert panel members

1. Milan Pol (Chair)

prof. PhDr. Milan Pol, CSc.  
Digitálně podepsal  
prof. PhDr. Milan  
Pol, CSc.  
Datum: 2019.07.03  
11:19:01 +0200

2. John Spencer (Co-chair)



3. Irma Manjavidze (Member)



4. Khatuna Saganelidze (Member)



5. Salome Khubulava  
(Member)



## Compliance of the Applicant HEI with the Authorisation Standard Components

### 1. Mission and strategic development of HEI

Mission statement of a HEI defines its role and place within higher education area and broader society. Strategic development plan of HEI corresponds with the mission of an institution, is based on the goals of the institution and describe means for achieving these goals.

#### 1.1 Mission of HEI

Mission Statement of the HEI corresponds to Georgia's and European higher education goals, defines its role and place within higher education area and society, both locally and internationally.

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The mission of East-West University LLL (EWUNI) is written in an acceptable way. It clearly formulates EWUNI’s role and ambitions for both national as well as international contexts in the field of medicine and health care. The mission is targeted at “expansion of the knowledge, skills, values and perspectives“ (SER, p. 16), it has focus on personal and professional development, as well as development of the university environment. It declares an ambition to ensure competitiveness of the students/graduates in the labour market, to promote intercultural dialogue, and to “contribute to the development of education-based civil society“ (SER, p.16). This way, it basically defines the characteristics of this HEI based on its type and main directions of work (since EWUNI is defining itself as a “Teaching University”, the research focus is understandably not strongly present in the mission statement).

The vision is in line with EWUNI’s mission and the same can be said about the main goals and values as described in the SER, namely: academic freedom, honesty and thinking; equality and fairness; co-operation and reliability; responsibility and accountability; transparency of university management; development of innovative approaches to teaching, research and professional activities (note that research is mentioned here); constant protection of professional ethics principles; protection and development of social responsibility principles; respect for human rights and freedoms; and intercultural dialogue and internationalisation (SER, p. 17).

It is not clear to what extent the mission is a result of a wider discussion within the EWUNI and beyond, and consequently to extent it is shared by the community of the institution. The draft was elaborated by a specially established working group and we were assured during some interviews that this draft was made public. But at other interviews it was apparent that not all participants were aware of the EWUNI’s mission (for instance, some of those belonging to academic and/or invited staff as well as some representatives of employers).

The mission is clearly linked with other development materials and activities of EWUNI.

**Evidences/indicators**

SER

Interviews

Mission New Version (Annex 1.3)
<b>Recommendations:</b> Ensure the mission of the institution is shared widely within the community of EWUNI.
<b>Suggestions:</b>
<b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b>
<b>Evaluation</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</li> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</li> </ul>
<b>1.2 Strategic Development</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ HEI has a strategic development (7-year) and an action plans (3-year) in place.</li> <li>○ HEI contributes to the development of the society, shares with the society the knowledge gathered in the institution, and facilitates lifelong learning</li> <li>○ HEI evaluates implementation of strategic and action plans, and duly acts on evaluation results.</li> </ul>
<b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b> <p>EWUNI has drafted both a Strategic Plan (7-year plan), and an Action Plan (3-year plan). These plans can be viewed as based on the EWUNI ´s mission, vision and values.</p> <p>EWUNI ´s representatives declared that the strategic and action documents were elaborated with the use of methodology that led to a wide range of consultations with relevant stakeholders (incl. external experts). The strategy is also partly based on the SWOT analysis of medical education HE programmes in Georgia, and on analysis of EWUNI ´s own situation and potential. The 7-year plan outlines 6 strategic goals (university recognition and participation in community development; introduction and implementation of student-oriented instruction; introduction and development of efficient university management system; internationalisation development; introduction and development of educational programme; and development of the infrastructure). Each of these goals is elaborated into a set of sub-goals and also the description of how to achieve them is provided as a part of the plan, with formulated “expected outcomes”. These sub-goals/planned activities are in line with the strategic goals, i.e. they seem to guarantee achievement of the strategic goals. These activities are not concretely stated, though, for instance in case of Strategic goal N1. In general, performance criterial for these goals are not described in the Action plan. Main outcomes for each goal are stated, some of them having higher, some lower potential for measurability in the Action plan. The aims are relatively complex, formulated clearly and in a sufficient level of detail.</p> <p>The 3-year Action plan (2019-2021) generally outlines a timeline with more specific activities related to the strategic plan.</p> <p>The mechanisms of internal monitoring and evaluation of the progress with regards to the plans were further developed in the strategic documents. These mechanisms are concrete, clear and logical.</p> <p>These documents should serve as a basis for institutional development in the main areas of EWUNI ´s operation. Yet some areas still remain on the edge of EWUNI ´s focus, for instance those through which the university can contribute to the development of society and knowledge dissemination (social, cultural, and other events; activities facilitating lifelong learning; activities related to consultation services; and the like). Similarly to the mission development, in some interviews it became clear that the level of awareness regarding the strategic and action plans largely differs across the EWUNI ´s community which raises a question about effectiveness of the participatory methodology of development of these plans.</p>
<b>Evidences/indicators</b>

SER 'New Strategic Plan' (Annex 1.2) University Action Plan (Annex 1.2) Interviews
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>Ensure strategic and action plans include a focus on EWUNI's contribution to the development of society and knowledge dissemination (by means of public lectures, social and cultural events, lifelong learning facilitation activities, consultation processes, for instance).</p> <p>Specify more concretely main activities for the action plan (2019-2021) in case of Strategic goal N1.</p> <p>Describe performance criteria in the Action plan 2019-2021.</p> <p>Make sure there are mostly measurable outcomes of the main goals in the Action plan.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>N/A</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>N/A</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>

## 2. Organizational Structure and Management of HEI

Organizational structure and management of the HEI is based on best practices of the educational sector, meaning effective use of management and quality assurance mechanisms in the management process. This approach ensures implementation of strategic plan, integration of quality assurance function into management process, and promotes principles of integrity and ethics

### 2.1 Organizational Structure and Management

- o Organizational structure of HEI ensures implementation of goals and activities described in its strategic plan
- o Procedures for election/appointment of the management bodies of HEI are transparent, equitable, and in line with legislation
- o HEI's Leadership/Management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution
- o Considering the mission and goals of HEI, leadership of the HEI supports international cooperation of the institution and the process of internationalization.

#### **Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The organizational structure of the HEI is described in the Statute of the HEI, which outlines the functions and roles of the structural units. Detailed description of each structural unit is given in the Statutes of each structural unit. However, there are several points to be underlined that may be affecting the efficiency of the organizational structure.

Firstly, there are some inconsistencies in relation to the structure in the HEI's Regulation and the Organizational Structure submitted by the HEI. Another concern is that the regulations of several structural units of management are not yet developed. For, example the HEI's Regulation (Article 8.5, p7) states that the HEI needs to define the rule of selection of the members of the Advisory Board, which then must be approved by the Rector. It has to be noted that the rule for assembling the Advisory Board has not yet been developed by the HEI. Similarly, according to the Article 10.10 (pp9-10) the Academic Council approves the educational programs, which has not been done so far. This is because there is not as yet a functioning Academic Council. According to Article 10, point 10.1 (p9) of the Regulation of the HEI, the members of the Academic Council are

Rector, Chancellor, the QA Department Head, and a Chairman of the Student Self-Government. These are the individuals who represent the members of the administrative staff and it is not clear why it has not been so far possible for the Academic Council to start functioning. Even though the HEI's regulation states that the members of the Academic Council can be academic personnel, employers etc., a transparent procedure for appointing them has not yet been defined. Neither is it clear what the criteria are for selecting the members of the Academic Council other than 'under the University Rector's order' (p9). The Regulation states that these members are approved by the Rector, which against the background of an absence of selection criteria indicates a lack of transparency of appointment procedures. A further concern is the independence of the Academic Council in decision-making. According to the HEI's regulation the Council is chaired by the Rector, and the other members of the Council are the Heads of several structural units also appointed by the Rector. Also, according to the HEI's regulation the Academic Council is a collegial advisory structural unit. Considering the fact that its members are the Heads of the structural units of the HEI, it raises doubts whether the members can effectively carry out their advisory functions. Even though the HEI has established several structural units that are important for its functioning, the concerns outlined above in relation to the Academic Council and Advisory Board may be significantly hindering achievement of HEI's goals.

As for the clarity of the functions and responsibilities of the structural units, the HEI has made an attempt to define these but there are some ambiguities which require clarification. For example, according to the HEI's regulation (Article 10.10, point I, p10), the Academic Council determines the maximum workload of academic personnel, ways of workload, criteria of payment on hourly basis for academic and invited personnel and submits to the University Rector for approval. The same functions are also apparently undertaken by the Chancellor, based on the HEI's regulation (Article 9.2, point b, p8) which states that the Chancellor 'Determines salary for academic, administrative, assistant and invited personnel.'..

Another concern in relation to the clarity of functions and responsibilities of the structural units was related to the functions of the library outlined in the Library Regulation. It has to be noted that the Georgian version of the East-West Teaching University Library Regulation (particularly the section on library objectives and functions) coincides with the functions and objectives of the National Library of the Parliament of Georgia as outlined in the Regulation of the State National Library of Georgian Parliament, which is accessible online [http://www.nplg.gov.ge/user\\_upload/konkursi/konkursi\\_2018/bibliotekis\\_debuleba.pdf](http://www.nplg.gov.ge/user_upload/konkursi/konkursi_2018/bibliotekis_debuleba.pdf). The main objective of the HEI Library, as stated in Article 3, paragraph 1 (p1, Regulation of Library) is "the implementation of library policy in the country, education, science and culture development, national heritage protection and popularization, development of civil society and promotion of democracy building processes." This is exactly the wording used in National Library document, and these broad functions would appear to be beyond the scope of activities and the roles of a private HEI library.

The HEI's charter, where the structure and structural units functions are described, doesn't contain the Scientific Research Development Council, which is mentioned in Research Development Strategy document (Article 5, p.3), which states that "the decision on financing research activities is made by the collegiate body of the University - Scientific Research Development Council, on the basis of submitted research proposal by author as well as structural units responsible for the development of research".

.The electronic document processing system is currently developed and does not seem to be fully in operation at the moment.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

University Structure (Annex N.21)

New Regulation of East-West Teaching University

Library Regulation (Annex N2.2.3)

Regulation of the Department of Learning Process Administration (Annex N2.2.4)

<p>Regulations of the Department of International and Public Relations (Annex N2.2.5)  Research Development Strategy (Annex 6.1)  Interviews  University Business Continuity Plan (Annex 2.5)  University Code of Ethics and Code of Student Ethics (Annex 2.10, N2.4, N2.12)</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b>  Ensure structural units implement their functions effectively and in a coordinated manner.  Ensure leadership/management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution.  Develop a clear and effective policy of support of international mobility of students and staff.  Ensure regulations of all structural units are developed.  Ensure appointment procedures are transparent.  Ensure advisory functions of Academic Council can be effectively met.  Ensure clarity of functions and responsibilities of structural units is sufficient.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b>  Non-binding suggestions for further development</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b>  Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b>  Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard</p> <p> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements </p>
<p><b>2.2 Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Institution effectively implements internal quality assurance mechanisms. Leadership of the institution constantly works to strengthen quality assurance function and promotes establishment of quality culture in the institution.</li> <li>○ HEI has a mechanism for planning student body, which will give each student an opportunity to get a high quality education.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>. EWUNI intends to implement internal quality assurance through the establishment of a Department of Quality Assurance and Strategic Development. However, since EWUNI is a newly established HEI and there are no students yet, it is difficult to conclude anything about quality assurance mechanisms and outcomes. The following is planned by HEI to regulate the QA and the information flow needed. The "Quality Mechanisms" document includes the PDCA approach applied by department of the quality assurance and strategic development for the improvement of quality. As well as the developing the concept of quality culture and short-term and long-term plans for quality assurance, as the way of successful implementation of the quality assurance process.</p> <p>The part of document, dedicated to implementation - checking, includes the course of study process, implementation of educational activities defined by the syllabus of the components provided by the program, periodic monitoring of student academic performance, and etc. The document also includes the periodic assessment of educational programs, such as SWOT analysis, including student satisfaction research, assessment of relevant human resource, and etc.</p> <p>It is also mentioned that the HEI, in the future, will have a special portal in Internet space, where both students and staff are able to express their opinions, assessments and etc.</p>

<p>Considering that HEI is newly established and the student body is not yet presented, it is expected that the most of EWUNI's staff representatives are not involved in the implementation of internal quality assurance mechanisms, as they did not seem to be familiar with "Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms" Document. Moreover, the EWUNI "Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms" Document matches with the similar documents of other organizations (<a href="https://www.ibsu.edu.ge/images/quality/G_Regulation_Quality_Mechanisms.pdf">https://www.ibsu.edu.ge/images/quality/G_Regulation_Quality_Mechanisms.pdf</a>), e.g. the paragraph of "Establishment of quality culture" matches with the Paragraph 2. Quality Culture Concept, introduced in the aforementioned link. Although it could be argued that using another institution's regulations verbatim, in part or whole, is an example of shared best practice, it is important that this is attributed.</p>
<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b>  SER  'New Strategic Development Plan' (Annex 1.2)  University Structure (Annex N2.1)  New Regulation of East-West Teaching University  Internal quality assurance mechanisms (Annex N2.8)  University Structural Units Provisions (Annex 2.4)  Interviews</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b>  Ensure sure all staff are familiar with QA documents.  Work on developing EWUNI's own specific QA strategy.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b>  Non-binding suggestions for further development</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b>  Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b>  Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard</p> <p> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements </p>
<p><b>2.3. Observing Principles of Ethics and Integrity</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o HEI has developed regulations and mechanisms that follow principles of ethics and integrity. Such regulations are publicly accessible.</li> <li>o Institution has implemented mechanisms for detecting plagiarism and its prevention.</li> <li>o HEI follows the principles of academic freedom.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b>  EWUNI has developed separate codes of ethics for staff and for students, containing ethical and behavioral rules, as well as relevant procedures for managing violations of these regulations.  The Code includes General regulation, Principles of University Ethics, as well as general rules of behavior of employee and the students.  EWUNI has also developed an anti-plagiarism policy, containing appropriate regulations and responding mechanisms, although the aforementioned mechanisms are not yet completely functioning. As it was aforementioned in previous standards, the documents of different sources are used, although not mentioned as the reference, as the result the anti-plagiarism policy has to be already implemented.</p>

Some of the EWUNI documents use the texts from other relevant websites (without mentioning them) which raises a question about originality of sources and procedures as a whole.

**Evidences/indicators**  
 2.10, N2.4, N2.12 University Code of Ethics and Code of Student Ethics  
 Interviews

**Recommendations:**  
 Ensure EWUNI documents are developed independently and not copied from materials of other institutions.  
 .  
 As it was aforementioned in previous standards, the documents of different sources are used, although not mentioned as the reference, as the result the anti-plagiarism policy has to be already implemented.

**Suggestions:**  
 Non-binding suggestions for further development

**Best Practices (if applicable):**  
 Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

**Evaluation**

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

**3. Educational Programmes**

HEI has procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling educational programmes. Programme learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in line with the National Qualifications Framework. A programme ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes

**3.1 Design and Development of Educational Programmes**

HEI has a policy for planning, designing, implementing and developing educational programmes.

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

EWUNI has established a methodology for the planning, design and development of educational programmes, as outlined in the self-evaluation report. A Program Development Board/Group with a wide remit (SER, p46) comprising medical academics, including invited teaching staff, was established on the recommendation of the Group of Experts' Final Report from October 2018 (pp14 & 17). However, the appointment of '*a medical educationalist experienced in the delivery of a PBL integrated curriculum....and/or developing and delivering OSCE examination*' has not been undertaken. Further, apart from a Memorandum with the Education Centre of David Tvildiani Medical University, the nature of any other external input from the medical educational community including the EU-funded e-PBL-net project, was unclear.

The Program Development Board/Group does not feature on the University's organizational diagram (N2.1), and relationships between it and those Departments whose activities are crucially relevant to its work i.e. in both developing and delivering the program, notably the Quality Assurance and Strategic Development, Learning Process Administration, Library and IT Departments) were unclear. There is also reference in documentation to a 'Permanent Council of the Program' (p46, SER) and to a 'Program Implementation Group' (p49, 'SER') as well as a 'Modular Implementing Group' (p9, Educational Program document), none of which feature (by those names) in any other documents, nor in the organisational diagram.

The success of a complex and novel programme will depend on very close working between relevant Departments along with continual monitoring; the role of the Program Development Board/Group will change

over time, but it will remain central to the core business of the medical school for many years to come, indeed in perpetuity since change is a constant process in modern curricula. Thus in organisational terms the Program Development Board/Group should assume a more central role with clearer representation and lines of accountability.

Notwithstanding, the Program Development Board/Group has been overseeing the development of the curriculum and syllabi.

Based on details provided in the syllabi documents and interviews, the program planning process appears to have been participatory, with many stakeholders involved. Colleagues in Khazar University in Azerbaijan had been able to contribute to development of the programme, mainly it seems through on-line communication. EWUNI has also developed regulations and procedures for approving, amending and annulment of programmes, and the policies give due consideration to legal and other interests of students in the event of amendments or annulment of the programme. The two syllabi are similar, and have different authors - for the Georgian Program it is Prof. Shalva Petriashvili, and for the English Prof. Giorgi Tsilosani. The content is the same, but elective courses in the Georgian program are not clarified.

In the SER it is stated that EWUNI took into consideration of labour market analyses, but we could find no evidence of this, other than a survey and SWOT analysis of 16 authorized HEIs with medical education programmes.

Despite progress made, from both an organisational and an educational perspective, the full implications of developing and delivering a spiral, integrated, problem-based and case-based curriculum do not appear to have been fully appreciated by all members of the academic team.

**Evidences/indicators**

Interviews

Final report on East-West Teaching University Authorization, October 2018 (pp. 13-20)

SER

Diploma in Medicine One-Cycle Educational Program

The Rule of Educational Program Elaboration, Cancellation and Amendment

University Structure (Annex N2.1)

'New Strategic Plan' (Strategic goal N5, pp. 32-34, Annex 1.2)

University Development Strategic Plan (Annex 1.2)

University Action Plan (Annex 1.2)

University Quality Assurance Mechanism (Annex 2.8)

Rules of working on university programs (Annex 3.1)

Syllabuses & curriculum spreadsheet (Annex 3.2)

Academic Calendar and Schedule (Annex 3.5)

**Recommendations:**

Revisit the structural organization of EWUNI such that the Program Development Board/Group assumes a central role in development, implementation and delivery of the program, with formal representation from relevant Departments and clearer lines of accountability.

Enhance participatory process for programme planning, design, development and delivery.

**Suggestions:**

Non-binding suggestions for further development

**Best Practices (if applicable):**

Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

**Evaluation**

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

Complies with requirements

- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

### 3.2 Structure and Content of Educational Programmes

- o Programme learning outcomes are clearly stated and are in line with higher education level and qualification to be granted
- o With the help of individualized education programmes, HEI takes into consideration various requirements, needs and academic readiness of students, and ensures their unhindered involvement into the educational process.

#### Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

EWUNI has created two one-cycle programmes, one in English, the other in Georgian, which conform to current legislation and comprise 360 credits within the ECTS (Standard 3.2, bullet point 1). The programmes are organized around six major topics, with the aim of integrating basic and clinical sciences. Syllabi for 64 subject areas including learning outcomes (in line with the higher education level and qualification to be granted, Standard 3.2, bullet point 2), details of hours and allocated credits, pre-requisites, teaching and learning methods, and assessment were available, as well as a detailed calendar-style curriculum map and draft timetable. To reiterate what was stated in the 'Final Report on East-West Teaching University Authorization 2018', if successfully delivered and assessed these will achieve the educational standard for authorization. However, a number of issues remain of concern:

(1) **Facilities.** There are as yet no appropriately equipped facilities for teaching basic medical sciences including human anatomy, biochemistry, physiology, histology and embryology and cytology. These facilities are apparently still under construction at the intended main campus at the Tbilisi Balneological Resort. It was thus impossible for any assessment of the adequacy of such facilities to be made.

(2) **Curriculum content.** It was not clear where students would gain clinical experience in pediatrics.

(3) **Problem-based learning (PBL).** It appears from the draft timetable that each week theoretical lectures in the room with the capacity for 150 will be followed by group work on Tuesday-Friday, with up to 4 groups working in parallel, and 2 further groups on Saturday. Apparently these groups will have approximately 20 students, although each group may be split in half for some activities. It should be noted that facilitating a group with over 10 members to ensure full active participation in a process such as PBL becomes increasingly challenging for tutors as group size increases). These sessions are presumably what are referred to in the syllabi as '*practicals and trainings*'. The description of '*practical lessons*' was as follows: '*consistent studying of theoretical material through solving the specific problems; that presents the ground to develop the skill to independently use the information. The teacher pays particular attention to the problem solving methods, to set up plans, sketches and schemes, to use proper methods of calculation, etc.*' with the additional element of '*verbal presentations*' (described as follows '*demonstrate the knowledge of theoretical topics, discussion on specific subjects that is possible to be conducted in narrative or question-answer form.*'). PBL groups will apparently meet three times per week. However, there was no mention of how the PBL problems were going to be crafted and coordinated to ensure '*logical connection between all of its components*' (Standard 3.2, bullet points 4 & 7), except that the cases would be '*taken from real life experiences.*' (Program Document). Finally there is no mention of any induction sessions in group working and the PBL process for students at the start of the programme, which is the norm.

(4) **Case-based learning (CBL).** Although, as with PBL, there are many different 'versions' of CBL, an approach used not only in medical education but also in a wide range of other disciplines, it is a method that is much more structured than traditional 'bedside' teaching. The latter usually uses cases of patients under active care, and is often ad-hoc and opportunistic, depending on what cases are available. In interviews, there appeared to be some confusion or misunderstanding between these two models. Also, as with PBL, one of the key issues in

developing a CBL curriculum is writing cases in a coordinated way to ensure all learning outcomes are covered, to identify gaps, and thus to enable the development of a spiral curriculum, as is the aim of EWUNI. There was no evidence that this process had started (Standard 3.2, bullet point 7).

(5) **Clinical skills training.** The latest version of the Sector Benchmarks state that clinical skills training should comprise 10 ECTS credits. However, EWUNI curriculum documentation explicitly ascribes clinical skills only 4 credits, as follows: Clinical Skills 1 & 2, one credit each; Clinical Skills 3, 2 credits (Curriculum spreadsheet and Syllabi). From the syllabi, it seems that students will also have opportunities to learn clinical skills and procedures in other modules but the Sector Benchmarks stipulate that “clinical skills training should comprise 10 ECTS credits in clinical skills centre or laboratory.” It was also unclear how, if at all, clinical skills training, whether in a skills lab or in other modules, will integrate horizontally and vertically (a key element of a spiral curriculum). The Sector Benchmark document lists the mandatory skills-set that must be taught over the 6 year programme, but where and when the specific skills arise in the curriculum is not clear from the syllabi. Finally, the fact that the first clinical skills module is not until Term V is of concern, as such training should commence as early as possible.

EWUNI intends to base clinical skills training (and OSCE examinations) at ‘Mediclub Georgia’. Expert group was told that Mediclub Georgia has been providing this service to other Universities for some time. However, as far as the expert group could see, at present the amount of equipment available at that site does not meet the standards outlined in the Sector Benchmarks and little consideration appears to have been given, as yet, to how student groups would be organized and managed.

(6) **Communication skills training.** Communication skills training is an essential component of a medical curriculum, and features throughout the Sector Benchmarks. Formal communication skills training (for example involving video, standardised/simulated patients, role play) was not evident anywhere in the programme documentation. Furthermore, the existence of two parallel programmes, with a cohort of Georgian-speaking students, will have implications for the development of a communications curriculum and will need to be carefully considered, as will assessment of communication in OSCEs.

(7) **Early patient contact.** Although not specifically referred to in Sector Benchmarks, early patient contact is considered a hallmark of a modern, patient-oriented, integrated curriculum, helping contextualize basic and clinical science and contributes to developing communication and clinical skills, professionalism and clinical reasoning skills. For example, ensuring early patient contact is one of the standards in the World Federation for Medical Education Standards for Basic Medical Education (Q2.5.3). There was no reference to patient contact in EWUNI programme documentation other than by implication in some early modules, for example Fundamentals of Clinical Diagnosis. For example, the stated purpose of this module is ‘to introduce the students to methods of patient examination’ which of course implies patient contact. However it is not clear from the syllabus description whether real or simulated patients will be involved, whether the ‘practical trainings’ will be on campus or in clinical environments.

(8) **Electives.** Although EWUNI has made some progress towards developing an elective programme (Standard 3.2, bullet point 5), choice is limited at present. There were also no details available for electives in the Georgian programme. In addition, the first elective slot in the curriculum is not until Term V and it could be argued that elective work should be introduced as early as the first academic year. A small additional point is that ‘Healthcare Management’ (ED34) and ‘Quality and Safety’ (MD44), which currently appear as elective modules, could be considered core topics in a modern medical curriculum.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Interviews with the Self-Evaluation Team, representatives of the Quality Assurance and Strategic Development Department, Head of Program and Program Board representatives, Academic and Invited Staff

Final report on East-West Teaching University Authorization, October 2018 (pp. 13-20)

Diploma in Medicine One-Cycle Educational Program

The Rule of Educational Program Elaboration, Cancellation and Amendment

‘New Strategic Plan’ (Strategic goal N5, pp. 32-34)

N2.1 University Structure

NCEQE Sector Benchmarks of Higher Education document

<p>Syllabuses &amp; curriculum spreadsheet (Annex 3.2)  Draft timetable (3.5 Academic Calendar)  Site visits to: Medclub Georgia; Tbilisi Balneological Resort; St Joachim and Ana Medical Centre; and Alexandre Aladashvili Clinic.  University Development Strategic Plan (Annex 1.2)  University Action Plan (Annex 1.2)  Universal Quality Assurance Mechanism (Annex 2.8)  Rules of working on University Programs (Annex 3.1)  University Educational Programs (Annex 3.2)  Rules for determining individual training vessels and competences (Annex 3.4)  Academic Calendar and Schedule (Annex 3.5)  SER  World Federation for Medical Education Standards for Basic Medical Education  <a href="https://wfme.org/standards/bme/">https://wfme.org/standards/bme/</a> (Q 2.5.3)</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b>  Ensure further programme development is based on the most recent Sectoral Benchmarks of Higher Education in Medicine.  Clarify EWUNI's approach to and understanding of CBL  Develop a systematic approach to crafting problems/cases for both the problem-based groups, and for case-based learning.  Develop a communication skills curriculum that integrates horizontally and vertically.  Expand choice of electives in both the English and Georgian programmes.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b>  Consider PBL induction session(s) for new students  Consider ways of introducing early patient contact.  Consider offering some elective options earlier in the programme.</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</li> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</li> </ul>
<p><b>3.3 Assessment of Learning Outcomes</b></p> <p>HEI has law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment, which promotes the improvement of students' academic performance.</p>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>EWUNI has planned an assessment schedule, using a range of methods, that, if implemented effectively, will be able to adequately test students' performance, both formative and summative (Standard 3.3, bullet point 1&amp;2). The main assessment/evaluation methods to be used, as listed in the Educational Program Document, are as follows: (1) MCQs (as far as could be ascertained, these will be of the 'Single Best Answer' format); (2) mini cases with an oral examination; (3) <i>'reports and presentations within a certain course'</i> – no further details given; (4) <i>'direct observation'</i> of student's performance in clinical settings; (5) <i>'Problems analysis and synthesis and making conclusions'</i> – no further details given; (6) OSCE <i>'using simulators or persons acting on patient's role'</i>; and (7) portfolio and log-books. Individual module syllabi describe the particular assessment/evaluations to be deployed, their relative weighting and implications for student progress.  EWUNI documentation describes an effective appellation system, but obviously this cannot be assessed as the programme has not yet been implemented.</p>

Apart from the list of possible methods to be used and individual module details, there is apparently no overall assessment/evaluation blueprint.

Criteria for assessing student performance are transparent in that they are documented in syllabi and other relevant documents. For example, assessment for both basic and clinical modules will follow a 60%-40% split (the final exam is the sum of mid-term assessments, comprising 60%, and final assessments, comprising 40%). Formative assessment methods will include quizzes, an oral exam, and assessment of student's performance in the learning environment. It is stated that '*student modules will be evaluated daily*' (Diploma in Medicine One-Cycle Educational Program, p13) – whilst this is laudable, it may not be sustainable, especially with large group size. In most modules assessment of attendance will constitute 5% of the total, but not in all, for example MD61 Nervous Diseases; MD62 Obstetrics, MD63 Paediatrics and MD59 Infectious Diseases. These modules also specifically state that '*daily performance and clinical skills*' will be assessed, whereas clinical skills are not mentioned in other (clinical) modules. In another module (MD54, Protection of Life 4) the mid-term elements add up to 65% and at least two others (MD55 Cycle of Life Geriatrics, and MD57 Neurosurgery) have slightly different criteria and weightings for the various elements of assessment.

There was no mention in any module syllabi as to where and how portfolios would be used in assessment, and what role log-book records would play.

Regarding written summative exams it is stated in the SER (p51) that '*the exam form, the number of topics and assessment criteria are defined by the lecturer*', and elsewhere that the lecturer must submit their questions to the Learning Process Department (also referred to, confusingly, as the 'Teaching Process Management Service') '*within a week before the start of the exams, but not later than 3 days*. (p51, SER); the Department will then apparently compile the exam paper (p3, Regulation of the Department of Learning Process Administration). It was not clear whether there would be any further academic input or oversight in compiling exam papers, for example to ensure a fair balance of subject coverage. Neither was there mention of any quality assurance procedure to be used in assuring a fair and reliable examination, for example amending or even rejecting questions that are ambiguous, irrelevant, nor any standard setting procedures.

Noting that writing questions, for example 'Single Best Answer' questions, is a skill in its own right, the expert group were assured that many of the academic staff of the EWTU have many years of experience in pedagogical activities at various medical universities and have the expertise to undertake the exercise. However, the group noted that work towards creating a bank of quality-controlled questions had yet begun as the University had not yet been authorized. (Final Report on East-West Teaching University Authorization, October 2018).

A common assessment method, apparently to be deployed in most modules in the programme, is an oral examination of students' knowledge and understanding. The oral exam format is notoriously prone to bias, affecting its reliability. Thus training of examiners and monitoring of their performance is thus important to ensure a fair, meaningful and defensible assessment.

From interviews and site visit to Medclub Georgia it seemed that understanding about the OSCE exam was (still) limited. The process of organizing and running an OSCE is complicated and resource-intensive and involves writing and piloting OSCE cases, deciding on an appropriate marking scheme and standard-setting, recruiting and training volunteer standardised/simulated patients, and training examiners; and, 'on the day', actually delivering and marking the exam. It was unclear from documentation when in the program the OSCE exam(s) might be staged and who would be responsible for organizing them.

The grading system is the same across all modules and stages of the programme. It should be noted that current approaches to assessment recognise that actual 'cut marks' of examinations (whatever format) may differ from exam to exam, according to the difficulty of individual components, thus necessitating standard setting procedures both in preparing and moderating exams. To reiterate the Final Report on East-West Teaching University Authorization (October 2018) 'the validity and rigor of all assessment needs to be established and quality assured in a continuous manner to guarantee a fair, open and consistently valid process' (Standard 3.3 bullet point 3,4&5) and this might be best achieved by involving a psychometrician to help measure the validity, reliability, and fairness of exams at least for one full cycle of the programme.

The overall impression was of an assessment schedule in the early stages of evolution, but one that was not yet fully 'joined up' and may not fully align with the teaching. The absence of an overall assessment blueprint was evident. It was also apparent that no single academic (or indeed group) had an overview of the entire assessment schedule. Assessment of a medical programme is complex, and its organization has major organizational and resource implications. It is common practice in medical schools to establish an academic post to oversee the

design, development, delivery and quality assurance of the assessment schedule. Such an office should have formal representation on key committees, for example on the Program Development Board and Quality Assurance & Strategic Development group. An eligible person to take up such a post might be found within existing faculty, but an alternative approach would be to engage with an external academic consultant whilst 'in-house' expertise is amassed.

**Evidences/indicators**

Interviews with the Self-Evaluation Team, representatives of the Quality Assurance and Strategic Development Department, Head of Program and Program Board representatives, Academic and Invited Staff  
Final report on East-West Teaching University Authorization, October 2018 (pp. 13-20)  
SER (pp. 39-47)  
Diploma in Medicine One-Cycle Educational Program  
'New Strategic Plan' (Strategic goal N5, pp. 32-34, Annex 1.2)  
N2.1 University Structure  
NCEQE Sector Benchmarks of Higher Education document  
Regulation of the Department of Learning Process Administration (Annex N2.2.4)  
Site visit to 'Mediclub Georgia'  
University Development Strategic Plan (Annex 1.2)  
University Action Plan (Annex 1.2)  
Universal Quality Assurance Mechanism (Annex 2.8)  
Rules of working on university programs (Annex 3.1)  
University Educational Programs (Annex 3.2)  
Syllabuses & curriculum spreadsheet (Annex 3.2)  
Academic Calendar and Schedule (Annex 3.5)  
SER

**Recommendations:**

Develop a comprehensive assessment blueprint.  
Initiate work in the following areas of assessment as a matter of urgency: creating a question bank of validated questions; training for teachers in question writing and OSCE station construction; recruiting and training standardized patients for OSCEs; developing and piloting an OSCE circuit to explore the logistics and practicalities; training OSCE examiners; defining criteria for assessing oral examinations, portfolios and log-books; developing a system for appropriate standard-setting of all assessment methods to be used.  
Re-think the process of constructing exam papers such that a senior academic has oversight.  
Establish a senior academic post to oversee the design, development, delivery and quality assurance of the assessment schedule.  
Ensure academic, invited and management staff are fully conversant with the assessment system.

**Suggestions:**

Engage a psychometrician to help measure the validity, reliability, and fairness of exams at least for one full cycle of the programme.  
Consider sending selected faculty on an assessment course.

**Best Practices (if applicable):**

Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

**Evaluation**

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

#### 4. Staff of the HEI

HEI ensures that the staff employed in the institution (academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support) are highly qualified, so that they are able to effectively manage educational, scientific and administrative processes and achieve the goals defined by the strategic plan of the institution. On its hand, the institution constantly provides its staff with professional development opportunities and improved work conditions.

##### 4.1. Staff Management

- HEI has staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of educational process and other activities defined in its strategic plan.
- HEI ensures the employment of qualified academic/scientific/invited/administrative/ support staff.

##### **Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

EWUNI has created a Department of Human Resource Management accountable to the Chancellor, and has elaborated a strategy for staff management. The main principles of human resources are to recruit appropriately qualified staff, including through collaboration with Khazar University in Azerbaijan (apparently four professors will join the EWUNI faculty from Khazar, SER). Job descriptions have been developed for academic, invited and administrative staff, and expected qualifications are in line with requirements as stated in relevant documents.

The academic management guide elaborates procedures for the integration of new employees into the work environment, their involvement in the work of the University, and defines principles of remuneration and encouragement, but at this stage of the University's development we could not fully evaluate the process.

Procedures for hiring staff are transparent as are the principles of remuneration that take into consideration performance of the employees. Special regulations define the status of affiliation and interviewed staff generally understand their contract details.

At present 78 people appear to be involved in developing the programme: 18 academic and 11 affiliated staff, 38 invited staff, and 22 administrative staff (NEW DOC.staff, Annex 4.3). Amongst the academic staff there are 12 PhDs, and 26 PhDs amongst invited staff. Majority of staff overall are female (64%); but from academics the majority are males. The majority of University staff are between 30-40 years of age.

Amongst academic staff there are 2 persons with an MD (1/3 of total) and are elected at the position of associate professor.

The involvement of the staff in decision-making processes is not clear and was not clarified during the interviews.

Academic and invited staff had various training sessions in another University on topics such as 'Learner-centered teaching methods', 'Problem-based learning in medical education', "How to create cases". However, although EWUNI aims to provide further opportunities for professional development of staff, and has a dedicated budget for this, in interviews administrative and QA staff could not clarify exactly what kind of training or other life-long learning opportunities will be available.

It was not clear to what extent EWUNI has 'set benchmarks for staff and the work completed by them', but the HEI has plans to evaluate staff performance and satisfaction and the planned procedure seems to be well thought over.

##### **Evidences/indicators**

University Structure (Annex N2.1)

University Regulations (Annex 1.5)

Guide for the Academic Management of the University (Annex 1.4)

'New Strategic Plan' (Annex 1.2)

University Action Plan (Annex 1.2)

Universal Quality Assurance Mechanism (Annex 2.8)

University academic, affiliated and invited staff (Annex 4.1)

Structural Units (Annex 2.4)

Proposals for Competition Commissions (Annex 4.2)

University staff (Annex 4.3)

Job descriptions (Annex 4.4)

Labor Agreements (Annex 4.5)

Forms, Contracts (Annex 4.5)

SER Interviews
<p><b>Recommendations:</b>  Review the academic staff procedures for appointment to academic positions.  Ensure involvement of academic staff in the university management process.  Elaborate a professional development strategy for all staff, academic, affiliated, invited and administrative.  Set benchmarks for staff and the work completed by them.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b>  Non-binding suggestions for further development</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b>  Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b>  Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard</p> <p> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements </p>
<p><b>4.2. Academic/Scientific and Invited Staff Workload</b></p>
<p>Number and workload of academic/scientific and invited staff is adequate to HEI's educational programmes and scientific-research activities, and also other functions assigned to them</p>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b>  University has a workload scheme for academic staff, which is divided into academic activities, research activities, consultation and involvement in university activities.  The experts' team was concerned about workload of some staff with affiliations in other Universities. For example, from the official document registry, it appears that one academic person has already 27 hours in a week at two other universities. During interviews, when asked about workload and affiliations, some members of invited staff expressed the opinion „if EWUNI gets authorization, we will decide and we will choose”, thus at the moment it is not so easy to evaluate actual workload.  Contracts of academic staff define their primary affiliation.  The ratio of academic/scientific staff to the total number of administrative and support staff is 0.82 and the target for 2021 is 0.6. The ratio of academic and scientific personnel to the number of invited personnel is 0.27 now, with a target of 0.52. EWUNI is therefore planning to increase numbers of academic and invited staff.  EWUNI intends to recruit 150 students in total for both programmes. There are only 4 invited teachers for anatomy teaching, and one invited teacher from Azerbaijan. Regarding teaching other basic subjects only one or two academic or invited staff are mentioned in documentation. EWUNI acknowledges the need to increase the number of teachers.</p>
<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b>  University Regulations (Annex 1.5)  University Regulations of the University (Annex 2.7)  University Academic Management Handbook (Annex 1.4)  'New Strategic Plan' (Annex 1.2)  Universal Quality Assurance Mechanism (Annex 2.8)  University academic, affiliated and invited staff (Annex 4.1)  Structural Units Provisions (Annex 2.4)  University staff (Annex 4.3)  Job descriptions (Annex 4.4)</p>

Labor Agreements (Annex 4.5) Forms (Annex 4.5) SER Interview results
<b>Recommendations:</b> Specify workload scheme of invited staff to avoid overload.
<b>Suggestions:</b>
<b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b> Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions.
<b>Evaluation</b> Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard  <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

## 5. Students and Their Support Services

HEI ensures the development of student-centered environment, offers appropriate services, including career support mechanisms; it also ensures maximum awareness of students, implements diverse activities and promotes student involvement in these activities. HEI utilizes student survey results to improve student support services

<b>5.1. The Rule for Obtaining and Changing Student Status, the Recognition of Education, and Student Rights</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ For each of the educational levels, HEI has developed regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting, issuing educational documents as well as recognition of education received during the learning period.</li> <li>○ HEI ensures the protection of student rights and lawful interests.</li> </ul>
<b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b> East-West Teaching University has developed the regulations for obtaining, suspending, and terminating student status. Mobility process and qualification granting of student are also explained in the self-evaluation document and Annex 5.1 "Rules for regulating the learning process". The document "Rule of Recognition of Education in Learning Process" explains the regulation for recognition of educational (credits) acquired in other HEIs, which should be carried out by university recognition commission. But it was unclear whether the Dean's office was aware of the credit recognition system. . The Rule of Recognition of Education in Learning Process document (Article 3, point 8) says that if the student has already received a degree for completing another programme, course credits from that programme cannot be recognized by the HEI. This potentially violates the students' rights and the law of Georgia on Higher Education (Article 50 <sup>1</sup> ) since, although ultimately the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement recognizes a particular qualification, HEIs are also entitled to recognize such courses if they are relevant to programme objectives.  The document "Rules for regulating the learning process" and "Instruction of establishing Language Competencies" (Annex 5.3) explains the regulations for English language competencies for both programmes, English and Georgian, namely B2 level for the English programme and B1 for the Georgian programme. This Rule also outlines the list of certificates which will be considered to confirm the competence for language competencies. Relevant language competence can also be verified by the internal University exam. It is stated

that a special commission created by the Rector will provide training, approval and organization of examination issues. However, this commission has not yet been created and the University has not prepared examination questions. During the interview neither QA, nor Program Development Group appeared to have any plan as to how to deliver and manage such an internal exam for foreign students. . .

EWUNI in the document annex 5 Regulations Article 29 point 2 has mentioned that for Students with special needs will be created an environment for full realization of their capabilities. University has lift and a sanitary unit adapted for people with special needs but unfortunately the classrooms have several steps without any ramps The expert panel was concerned that EWUNI may not have the facilities to process a large group of students at the same time, and that foreign student may come to Georgia to write the language exam - but in case of their negative result, they will have to leave the country, which may not be comfortable for applicants considering the travelling costs. It remains unclear what the regulations or plans would be for students with low competencies in the English language (less than B2).

University has an Examination Instruction (Exam Conduct Instruction) document which explains the exam conducting system. However, the process is not fully explained for specific examination types, such as the OSCE. It was unclear whether the examination regulations or rules were fully understood by the Department of Quality Assurance and Strategic Development.

In the document "Action plan with budget" money is allocated for student self-government system and student career support services, but it is unclear who will control the budget. From interviews it seemed the Dean was not aware of the budget for the medical programme and students.

The University has provided in Document "Examination Instruction (Exam Conduct Instruction)" the appeal process. Implementation of all the rules, procedures and regulations mentioned above are very difficult to access since students are not enrolled yet.

**Evidences/indicators**

SER

Interviews

Instruction of Establishing Language Competencies

Examination Instruction (Exam Conduct Instruction)

Rule of Recognition of Education Accepted during Learning

Rule of Production and Distribution of Diploma

Rules for regulating the learning process

University Code of Ethics and Code of Student Ethics (Annex 2.10)

The Rule of Elaborating the Individual Curriculum

Action plan with budget (Annex 1.2)

**Recommendations:**

Improve The Rule of Recognition of education in Learning Process document especially recognition of credits from different programme

Develop the environment for the student with special needs

Develop clear student admission regulations, especially for foreign students.

Develop regulations for internal university exam for language competencies.

Develop the regulations for specific examination types (for example OSCE).

Clarify the unit responsible for student budget controlling.

**Suggestions:**

Non-binding suggestions for further development

**Best Practices (if applicable):**

Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p>Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p><b>5.2 Student Support Services</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o HEI has student consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance</li> <li>o HEI has career support service, which provides students with appropriate counselling and support regarding employment and career development</li> <li>o HEI ensures students awareness and involvement in various university-level, local and international projects and events, and supports student initiatives</li> <li>o HEI has mechanisms, including financial mechanisms to support low SES students</li> </ul>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>The Department of Learning Process Administration is responsible for student support, and has two staff, the Head of Department and manager. It should be mentioned that the Head has problems communicating in English, and noted that the majority of the proposed student intake will be undertaking the English language programme.</p> <p>In the SER it is mentioned that EWUNI has a career support service delivered by the Department of Learning Process Administration. In the document 'New Regulation of EWUNI' the basic tasks and functions of this Department are stated as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Consult the students on educational issues;</li> <li>• Promote and develop career service for students and graduates, have relationship with employers, students and graduates; promote and coordinate student projects and innovative initiatives.</li> </ul> <p>The Department staff currently in place do not have a medical background so it would be very difficult to consult students about either educational or, particularly, career development issues.</p> <p>In the SER and in "Rules for regulating the learning process" it is mentioned that the University wants to established EWUNI grants and EWUNI scholarships. The amount and procedures of the scholarships are determined by the Act of Rector, unfortunately the criteria are not clear for getting the scholarships, and they were not clarified during the interviews.</p>
<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b></p> <p>SER</p> <p>Regulation of EWTU University (Annex 2.2)</p> <p>Regulation of the Department of Learning Process Administration (Annex 2.4)</p> <p>Interviews</p> <p>Rules for regulating the learning process</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>Clarify criteria for getting and losing EWUNI scholarships.</p> <p>Revisit strategy for providing career support service, involving staff with medical backgrounds.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>Non-binding suggestions for further development.</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions</p>

**Evaluation**

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

- Complies with requirements  
 Substantially complies with requirements  
 Partially complies with requirements  
 Does not comply with requirements

**6. Research, development and/or other creative work**

Higher Education Institution, considering its type and specifics of field(s), works on the strengthening of its research function, ensures proper conditions to support research activities and improve the quality of research activities

**6.1 Research Activities**

- o HEI, based on its type and specifics of its fields, carries out research/creative activities.
- o Ensuring the effectiveness of doctoral research supervision
- o HEI has public, transparent and fair procedures for the assessment and defense of dissertations which are relevant to the specifics of the field

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

EWUNI has formulated a strategy for research development. Pursuant to the common university goals and plans, for the purpose of promoting and developing scientific researches, a Department of Research Development (also referred to as 'Development Service of Research') will be established in due course to facilitate and develop scientific research. Before establishing the department, research support will be carried out by the Department of Quality Assurance and Strategic Development. The research strategy document states that this will be in collaboration with the 'Education Program Development Working Group', which is presumably the same as the Learning Program Development Group; however in the SER it is stated that 'Teaching Process Management Service', presumably the same as the 'Learning Process Management Group', will be involved (SER, p84). Co-operation with economic agents is envisaged, too. Interviews suggested that many staff had little or no awareness about plans for research development and support.

EWUNI intends to be a teaching university, but the one-cycle medical programme should provide sufficient education about research for students to pursue research activities after graduation. According to the latest Sector Benchmarks, a minimum of 10 credits should be provided for developing scientific skills in a curriculum, within a six year programme. EWUNI appears to be providing only 2 credits in 'Fundamentals of Scientific Research I' and 4 credits in 'Biostatistics.'

The claim is made in the SER (p81) that collaboration of EWUNI with two 'ultra-modern centers' (namely Alexandre Aladashvili and the Tbilisi Balneological Resort) 'is clear proof that the educational process in the University will be linked to practical and research activities'. However, it is unclear how EWUNI will achieve this in practice.

Furthermore from documentation and the interview with the Head of Finance it was clarified that "the university will allocate relevant funds to each affiliated personnel (for professors up to 3000 GEL, associate professors amounts up to 2000 GEL, assistant professors amounts up to 1500 GEL) to support the involvement of their affiliated academic staff in international studies. This amount may be used to carry out research activities, finance scientific publications, participate in scientific conferences, etc.", but interviews revealed that some with academic and invited staff that they were not familiar with this regulation.

**Evidences/indicators**

Interviews

Research Development Strategy (Annex 6.1 'NEW DOC')

Regulation of the Department of Learning Process Administration (Annex N2.2.4)

SER

Syllabuses & curriculum spreadsheet (Annex 3.2)

Diploma in Medicine One-Cycle Educational Program

**Recommendations:**

Increase the scientific skills credits in the curriculum according to the latest Sector Benchmarks.  
Establish a specific unit which will have background and experience in medical research process development.  
Clarify and develop the means by which research activity in the University will link with activity in clinical centers and will inform the teaching programme.

**Suggestions:**

Non-binding suggestions for further development

**Best Practices (if applicable):**

Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

**Evaluation**

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

**6.2. Research Support and Internationalisation**

- o HEI has an effective system in place for supporting research, development and creative activities
- o Attracting new staff and their involvement in research/arts-creative activities.
- o University works on internationalization of research, development and creative activities.

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

EWUNI has a Research Development Strategy, ultimately aimed at supporting academic personnel in research activity. In the SER (p83) EWUNI states that it plans to spend 350,000 GEL for development of research activities. The 'Academic 7-year Financial report', however, indicates a projected expenditure for 'scientific research and creative work' a total of 214,000 GEL (26000 GEL/year 2019-2022, and 34,000 GEL 2023-2026). Interviews failed to clarify how the University plans to use this money.

In the action plan for 2019-2021 Strategic Goal N4 (Internationalization development), there is a notice regarding internationalization of research activities. For integrating research results in learning process the proposed budget for 3 years is 152,196 GEL deployed annually in increasing amounts starting at 22,680 GEL. Also, Strategic Goal N5 (Introduction and the development of educational programmes) specifies that 259,040 GEL will be spent on integrating research results in the learning process during the same period, again increasing annually, and it is mentioned in the action plans. Also, the plans include support of academic and scientific staff on finding sources of research funding, drafting research proposals and their submission.

Priorities for research will apparently be determined by the Academic Council, but since this body is not currently active, no details were available about priorities, specific research topics or programmes in the documentation. Educational research (focused on the implementation of a novel curriculum in Georgia) was discussed in interviews as one potential focus. Further, in interviews it was mentioned that research will be conducted according to the market demand.

During interviews the Head of the Programme (English) mentioned future plans for internationalization of research, joint projects, further involvement in international projects and programmes, such as ERASMUS+, but these plans at this stage are speculative. EWUNI does not at present have laboratories for research in the basic medical sciences for either students or research-active staff.

The EWUNI Strategic Plan in the section on University Resources (pp19-20) states 'The existing material-technical base of the university and scientific-research resource responds to the national and international requirements in the educational sphere' but during the visit we could not see any research infrastructure.

It seems that, at the moment, no specific research training has been planned for academic personnel, although the Research Development Strategy mentions that EWUNI university will provide annual trainings in a range of

<p>topics.</p> <p>Finally, the annual allocation of 26,000 GEL cannot be sufficient to support and internationalize scientific and research activities.</p>
<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b></p> <p>SER Interviews Research Development Strategy (Annex 6.1 'NEW DOC') 'New Strategic Plan' (Annex 1.2) Academic 7-year Financial report of EWUNI (Annex 1.3)</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>Clarify the plan for research budget usage. Provide sufficient research infrastructure and equipment. Define the priorities of university research. Develop a programme of training for academic personnel for increasing scientific and research skills.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>Non-binding suggestions for further development</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p>Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p><b>6.3. Evaluation of Research Activities</b></p>
<p>HEI has a system for evaluating and analyzing the quality of research/creative-arts activities, and the productivity of scientific-research units and academic/scientific staff.</p>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>The Research Development Strategy states that indicators for the assessment of scientific research of academic and scientific personnel will be:</p> <p>a) scientific papers in university journals and papers in other journals publications in Georgia or abroad, especially papers in impact-factor journals; b) University grants and research projects; c) participation in other research projects and grants; d) participation in scientific conferences; e) published textbooks and monographs, lecture notes; h) number of citations.</p> <p>This is a relatively complex set of activities and they cover the core of the research performance of the academics. No further elaboration of these indicators was available, though, for example what will be appropriate indicators for different staff (full professor, associate professor, assistant professor, etc.), the minimum number of scientific papers or participation in scientific conferences in a year, etc. In the Research Development Strategy it is stated that "Involvement in scientific research is an important indicator of quality assessment of the academic staff of the university. This indicator is one of the most</p>

<p>important at the end of academic year when assessing the work of academic staff, for which the University Quality Assurance Service has a special form”.</p> <p>Research support will initially be overseen by the Department of Quality Assurance and Strategic Development and the ‘Teaching Process Management Group’, but it is important that these functions be devolved to a specific structural unit whose responsibilities should include evaluation of research activity, as per the plans to create a ‘Development Service of Research’ (SER, p85).</p> <p>Overall, it is difficult to evaluate the development and implementation of relevant procedures and regulations since there are no research activities as yet.</p>
<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b></p> <p>Interviews SER Research Development Strategy (Annex 6.1 ‘NEW DOC’) Regulation of the Department of Learning Process Administration (Annex N2.2.4) ‘New Strategic Plan’ (Annex 1.2)</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>Clarify in more detail clear research evaluation criteria and rules for different academic personnel and students. Establish the Department of Research Development as intended.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>Non-binding suggestions for further development</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p>Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI’s compliance with this specific component of the standard</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>

## 7. Material, Information and Financial Resources

Material, information and financial resources of HEI ensure sustainable, stable, effective and efficient functioning of the institution, and the achievement of goals defined through strategic development plan.

<p><b>7.1 Material Resources</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o The institution possesses or owns material resources (fixed and current assets) that are used for achieving goals stated in the mission statement, adequately responds to the requirements of educational programmes and research activities, and corresponds to the existing number of students and planned enrolment.</li> <li>o HEI offers environment necessary for implementing educational activities: sanitary units, natural light possibilities, and central heating system.</li> <li>o Health and safety of students and staff is protected within the institution.</li> <li>o HEI has adapted environment for people with special needs</li> </ul>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>EWUNI has presented lawful agreements and an excerpt from the public registry. These documents evidence that Ltd Tbilisi Balneological Resort will lease 1040 square meters (sq. m.) to the HEI, for teaching purposes. According to the Public Registry excerpt, Alexandre Aladashvili Clinic will allow EWUNI to use only 152.01 sq. m. of clinic space, while Ltd Property Management will allow the HEI to use 700 sq.m of space from the business center building located on Aghmashenebeli Street.</p> <p>It should be noted that during the site visit to the A. Aladashvili Clinic, the representatives of the clinic showed</p>

the experts' panel the space allocated for students, the area of which was considerably bigger than the area indicated in the agreement (152.01 sq. m). This circumstance has made it a bit difficult to evaluate the appropriateness of this provision.

The existing space (the size and number of classrooms) at Tbilisi Balneological Resort is not yet sufficient for delivering the educational programmes, considering the number of the students to be admitted (up to 150 annually) and the schedule of classes in the programme, as documented in the curriculum spreadsheet. Furthermore it is likely to prove insufficient for carrying out research activities. As yet, there are no recreational spaces designated specifically for EWUNI. The Agreement with the Balneological Resort states that an area to be converted into a 5-stars spa hotel will be available for use as a recreational space by students. But the proposed number of students to be provided for, as well as usual profit-orientation of luxury spa hotels, raises doubts as to the practicality of this arrangement.

Based on the documentation presented by the HEI it has only 23 personal computers in total. These personal computers are in several classrooms and in the library and are to be used by the staff too.

Regarding health and safety of staff and students, EWUNI has made an attempt to safeguard these but the efforts are not sufficient to fully meet the basic requirements. The sanitary units meet basic requirements. There is an approved evacuation plan and fire inventory. However, although the HEI made an agreement with LTD Universal Group on implementing a fire alarm system and the Fire Safety Certificate presented by the HEI states that alarm system is installed on the third floor of the building, the presence of smoke sensors was not evident on this floor. There are two exits from the building of the HEI. One is through the entrance hall of the Balneological Resort, but neither exit represent additional emergency exits with doors opening outwards, as required by approved safety standards. The HEI presented invoices on purchasing the security video cameras. The Security and Health Safeguarding Regulation of the HEI states that there is a Security Department in the HEI. The section of the Resort housing the HEI has a central heating system but there is no ventilation and air-conditioning system on the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor. The HEI also presented a certificate (in Georgian) about a ventilation system confirming that it is functioning satisfactorily. But this Certificate was issued by the Balneological Resort itself and thus cannot be considered an acceptable source for confirming effective working of the ventilation system in the building. The HEI has made an attempt to make the environment adapted for people with special needs, but the building still is not in compliance of the basic requirements. This is because even though there is a lift and a sanitary unit adapted to people with special education needs, most of the classrooms are not currently accessible for individuals with special needs, having several steps and no ramps.

Tbilisi Balneological Resort (owned by one of the Founders) offers a wide range of services, including diagnostic facilities. However, apart from (presumably) supporting two modules (MD51 Health resort and physiotherapy, and MD52 Rehabilitation and physiotherapy), it was unclear how the programme would otherwise make use of this resource, other than the statement that '*students will have access.*'

Visits were made to four other sites, namely St Joachim and St Anne Medical Centre, Alexandre Aladashvili Clinic, the Matrix Auditorium, and Medclub Georgia. In discussion with the Founders we were told that 18 other clinical sites were being considered for purchase.

St Joachim and St Anne Medical Centre has 80 beds, 40 of which are obstetric, as well as several other clinical departments and wards, out-patients and classrooms.

Alexandre Aladashvili Clinic (also owned by Founders) has 132 beds, with a wide range of clinical disciplines represented, diagnostic facilities, outpatients, an emergency room, operating theatres and intensive care.

Matrix Auditorium (also owned by one of the Founders) is essentially a business centre, but contains an auditorium holding up to 600 people which will be useful for ceremonies, but will be practicable for teaching smaller groups.

Medclub Georgia, which opened in 2010, provides a wide range of ambulatory services but is also a training center for adult and pediatric basic and advanced resuscitation skills. This is intended to be the location for clinical skills training, and for the OSCEs. There are two large conference rooms which can be divided up into smaller units. The expert group was told that capacity for managing groups of students will depend on scheduling. The amount of equipment such as manikins and other clinical skills equipment available at the moment seemed inadequate to support clinical skills training for anything other than a small group of students. Finally, there seemed to be confusion about what would be involved in organizing and running an OSCE.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Memoranda of Understanding with clinical sites

<p>Interviews Site visits Interviews with the Self-Evaluation Team, representatives of the Quality Assurance and Strategic Development Department, Head of Program and Program Board representatives, Academic and Invited Staff, Library and IT staff Final report on East-West Teaching University Authorization, October 2018 (pp. 13-20) Self-assessment document (pp. 39-47) Diploma in Medicine One-Cycle Educational Program 'New Strategic Plan' (Strategic goal N5, pp. 32-34) University Structure (Annex N2.1) Regulation of the Department of Computer Technologies and Program Maintenance Regulation of the Department of Financial and Material Resources Library Regulation document</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b> Ensure education spaces especially for basic subjects are adequate. Ensure equipment for educational spaces is improved. Ensure there are also available recreational (social) spaces for the students within the institution. Ensure there is an adequate amount of equipment (such as manikins) to support teaching clinical skills and procedures to the proposed number of students</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b> Non-binding suggestions for further development</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b> Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b> Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p><b>7.2. Library Resources</b></p> <p>Library environment, resources and service support effective implementation of educational and research activities, and HEI constantly works for its improvement.</p> <p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b> EWUNI library comprises a reading room for a maximum of 25 people as well as a large for book archive, and a small room for group meetings for up to 10 people. The library area is possibly too small to support effective teaching and learning, considering the number of students to be enrolled by EWUNI during the roll-out of the programme (~600 students). The number of books was very small (approximately 20-25 books at present, very few in Georgian, although purchase of textbooks in Georgian has been budgeted for in 2020/2021), and in any case students will not be able to take any for home reading. The HEI's policy is to use mostly e-books and online resources for teaching and learning, which students will be able to access off-site. Yet there are only 4 personal computers currently in the library which, again, would not be sufficient for the planned number of students to be enrolled by the HEI even during the first year (150). EWUNI has developed regulations for using the library, informative instructions and e-catalogue. Quality assurance of the library's service will utilize user surveys and will be overseen by the QA and Strategic Development Department. At present there is no official library representation on the Program Development Board/Group. The experts' panel concluded that, at the moment, the HEI's library resources could not effectively support the</p>

educational and research activities proposed by EWUNI, with potential adverse effects on the achievement of learning outcomes.
<b>Evidences/indicators</b> Site visit Interviews SER E-catalogues Library Regulation (Annex N2.2.3)
<b>Recommendations:</b> Improve significantly library resources so that it will serve the needs of the number of students to be enrolled, both Georgian and international.
<b>Suggestions:</b> Non-binding suggestions for further development
<b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b> Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions
<b>Evaluation</b> Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</li> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</li> </ul>
<b>7.3 Information Resources</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o HEI has created infrastructure for information technologies and its administration and accessibility are ensured</li> <li>o Electronic services and electronic management systems are implemented and mechanisms for their constant improvement are in place</li> <li>o HEI ensures business continuity</li> <li>o HEI has a functional web-page in Georgian and English languages.</li> </ul>
<b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b> The HEI has started to establish information technology infrastructure. It has developed an Information Technologies Management Policy, which regulates information technologies management procedures, its development and use in teaching and learning. However this document appears to be a cut-and-pasted -pasted version of the Information Technologies Management Policy of Avrasya Batumi International University, which is available <a href="http://avrasyabatumi.ge/Resource/PDFs/IT/%E1%83%9E%E1%83%9D%E1%83%9A%E1%83%98%E1%83%A2%E1%83%98%E1%83%99%E1%83%90120.pdf">http://avrasyabatumi.ge/Resource/PDFs/IT/%E1%83%9E%E1%83%9D%E1%83%9A%E1%83%98%E1%83%A2%E1%83%98%E1%83%99%E1%83%90120.pdf</a> online. In particular, the sections on the aims of the policy, communications and operations management, which comprises about 99% of the policy document etc. appears to be copied. EWUNI has a teaching and learning process management portal which is still under development. The official web-site of the HEI provides potentially useful information for interested parties but it will need to be updated. Because the HEI is not fully functioning it is difficult to evaluate the effectiveness of any processes, but the fact of plagiarizing the IT Management Policy from another institution raises concerns in relation to carrying out activities effectively in this area by the HEI. The IT department consists of 2 staff members, and is accountable in the current organizational structure to the head of administration, the Chancellor. The intention is to use mainly open source applications to support the programme, but a bespoke platform ('Teaching Process System') is being developed and a demonstration was given. Wi-Fi will be available at the Tbilisi Balneological Resort. During site visits the experts' panel was not shown any computer facilities that might be available for students on clinical placements. Given the proposed reliance on on-line resources it will be crucial to ensure adequate provision.

<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b></p> <p>SER Technologies Management Policy Interviews Regulation of Department of Computer Technologies and Program Maintenance</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p>Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Fully complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>EWUNI must develop its own Information Technology Management Policy. Ensure adequate online facilities are available for students at all clinical sites.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>Non-binding suggestions for further development</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions</p>
<p><b>7.4 Financial Resources</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o Allocation of financial resources described in the budget of HEI is economically achievable</li> <li>o Financial standing of HEI ensures performance of activities described in strategic and mid-term action plans</li> <li>o HEI financial resources are focused on effective implementation of core activities of the institution</li> <li>o HEI budget provides funding for scientific research and library functioning and development</li> <li>o HEI has an effective system of accountability, financial management and control</li> </ul>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>The structure of EWUNI is represented by the Department of Financial and Material Resources Management Department, which designs the budget short-term and long-term strategic development plan. The financial resources described in the budget seem to be economically achievable, diversified and ensure effective risk management.</p> <p>The 2019-2021 action plan (by strategic goals) indicates that the university plans for the first year spending 750,000 GEL for achieving the goals, however, the figures outlined in the presented financial document do not confirm this. For example:</p> <p>Strategic goal N1. Ensure University recognition and participation in community development, first year - 52,800 GEL</p> <p>Strategic goal N2. Implementation and development of student-oriented system, first year - 12,000 GEL</p> <p>Strategic goal N3. Introducing and development of efficient university management system, first year - 22,250 GEL</p> <p>Strategic goal N4. Internationalization development, first year - 367,280 GEL</p> <p>Strategic goal N5. Introduce and the development of educational programmes, first year 1 - 42,443 GEL</p> <p>Strategic goal N6. Development of the infrastructure, first year - 253,280 GEL</p> <p>According to the financial report, a large part of the total budget (1,302,000 GEL) goes on salaries (494,578 GEL), rent (237,513 GEL) and utility, fuel and other taxes.</p> <p>HEI budget provides funding for scientific research and library functioning and development. However, 8667 GEL (in a year) will certainly not be enough for any kind of research, but seem to be sufficient to perform main activities described in strategic and action plans.</p>

<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b></p> <p>SER</p> <p>Interviews</p> <p>'New Strategic Development Plan' (Annex 1.2)</p> <p>Action plans with budgets (documents 1.7 in Annex 1.2)</p> <p>Financial reports</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>Make funds available and sufficient to effectively perform activities described in strategic and action plans.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>Non-binding suggestions for further development</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p>Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>