

Accreditation Expert Group Report on Higher Education Programme

Higher Education Programme:

MEDICAL DOCTOR

HEI:

KUTAISI UNIVERSITY

Date for the Evaluation: September 5-6th 2019

Report Submission Date October 17th 2019

HEI's Information Profile

Name of Institution Indicating its	Kutaisi University, LTD
Organizational Legal Form	
HEI's Identification Code	212677094
Type of Institution	University

Higher Education Programme Information Profile

Name of the Programme	Medical Doctor (MD) Educational
	Programme
Level of Education	One-Cycle Undergraduate Medical
	Education
Qualification Granted Indicating Qualification	Medical Doctor (MD)
Code	One-Cycle Undergraduate
	0912
Language of Instruction	English
Number of Credits	360 credits
Programme Status (Authorized/	New
Accredited/New)	

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname,	Professor Olwyn Westwood
University/organization/Country)	Brunel University London, UK
Member (Name, Surname,	Professor Ia Pantsulaia
University/organization/Country)	Tbilisi State Medical University/Georgia
Member (Name, Surname,	Professor Tsotne Samadashvili
University/organization/Country)	Medical Director, Tblisi / Kutaisi, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname,	Mrs Mariam Tevzadze (Student expert)
University/organization/Country)	Tbilisi State Medical University/Georgia
Member (Name, Surname,	
University/organization/Country)	

Accreditation Report Executive Summary

General information on the education programme

The plans for this undergraduate programme in medicine are both exciting and innovative in its modes of delivery and integration of basic and clinical sciences. Clearly the leadership of the Faculty of Medicine and the Head of the programme have engaged with the basic sciences and the clinical colleagues within the hospitals and clinics to design the medicine. Now the Kutaisi University is tasked with:

- recruiting students who will be able to complete programme successfully
- maintaining the enthusiasm of the basic science and colleagues to deliver the programme in terms of knowledge, skills and professional development

The Medical faculty has taken advice from medical educators and experts both from within the country of Georgia, and external international advisors. This MD program has been configured on the ECTS system of credits (360 credits), being delivered as a full-time award over 6 years (12 semesters)

The MD curriculum has yet to recruit students but has been designed to be able to demonstrate the students' academic and clinical progression, building on knowledge and skills in previous academic years to ultimately achieve the required competences to practice medicine and gain the qualification. It is clear from our discussions that the leadership want to produce doctors who are critical thinkers, who understand the need for basic and clinical sciences integration.

The medical students will learn clinical and communication skills in the laboratory before they meet patients. Although the programme is being taught in English, all students are expected to be able to communicate in Georgian, even if it is not their first language in order that they will be able to communicate with patients. Within these simulated settings of the laboratories, students will be training on simulators and mannequins, and in patient-doctor role play. Clinical practice learning and teaching will happen in clinics (bed-side, in clinics, surgical theatres, seminar rooms for case-based learning). A range of assessment modalities will be used to test knowledge, including multiple-choice questions, written assessments. They will use Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) to evaluate of knowledge and skills progression and competence, using standardised patients and mannequins (simulators), initially and progressing to real patients in the later years of the programme

Brief overview of the accreditation site-visit

The Visiting NCEQE team

- 1. Visited the following clinics:
- Academian Z. Tskhakaia West Georgia National Center of Intervention Medicine
- LI Clinic
- Leri Khonelidze Clinic
- LG and Company Tuberculosis and Infectious Diseases Center of West Georgia (the only specialist center in West Georgia)
- 2. Had extremely helpful meetings and discussions with the following stakeholders

- The Kutaisi University administration and leadership, which included the Rector of the university and the Dean of the Faculty,
- The following heads of departments and representatives from
 - Quality Assurance Services
 - o Study Process Management and Student Services office
 - o Strategic Developments, Internationalization and Research Office
 - Human Resources Management and Recording Office
 - o Marketing and Public Relations
 - Information Technology Services
 - Student Self-Government
- The academics both clinical and basic sciences, as well as those responsible for Georgian Language
- Invited academic staff which included the clinical and basic sciences colleagues
- Current undergraduate and postgraduate students, and alumni were consulted from the following disciplines
 - o Economics,
 - Finance
 - o Business administration
 - o Tourism
- 3. The opportunity to visit the learning, teaching and assessment facilities and resources:
- Library,
- classrooms
- OSCE suite,
- Anatomy,
- Laboratories (biochemistry and histology),
- Computer suites

Summary of education programme's compliance with the standards

The programme is fully compliant with the standards of NCEQE

The Kutaisi University is enthusiastic and providing the resources to deliver the programme

- Library
- Computers
- OSCE suite
- Anatomy models and virtual reality for learning anatomy
- Full support of the local clinics and the clinicians have been involved by consultation with the design and content of this medicine programme

The programme has been mapped to the learning outcomes and competences required of a Georgian medicine undergraduate programmes

Summary of Recommendations

Few recommendations have been made because the MD programme will be recruiting students to register in 2020. However, given the MD programme aims, which are evolving in terms of academic staff recruitment, faculty and infrastructure developments needed, it would advisable for there to be a level of scrutiny to ensure that the Facultyleadership and colleagues are on target to deliver this ambitious and innovative programme. The NCEQE would be happy to return to Kutaisi University to discuss progress.

Standard 2:

- To ensure there is a diversification of the assessment methods which test appropriately the specific learning outcomes of the discipline.
- To expand the number of experts that you collaborate with in order to have the expertise in medical education methods,

Standard 3:

• To expand the number of International partnerships to increase the opportunities for students and the academics in exchange opportunities, as well as a business plan and resources for the sustainability of internationalization

Standard 4:

- The recruitment and training of OSCE examiners early on in the programme so that they are ready and trained for summative assessments.
- Faculty development in the different medical education methods
- To enhance the teaching and language skills of academic and affiliated staff, improve the professional development of academic staff.

Summary of Suggestions

Standard 1

- To evaluate the data of student progress and link it to ethnicity and gender to ascertain any possible links between attainment and these demographics parameters.
- Georgian language courses as mandatory would assist their integration with their peers, patients, clinical personnel, and for day-to-day living in Georgia. Likewise, all students should be expected to communicate and learn in English as much of the medical literature is in this language
- It would be advisable that as student numbers increase, that the leadership within the
 faculty ensures that there are enough academics and invited staff to teach the students
- It would be helpful for the Faculty to have regular reviews of their progress in order to assure that they, and the students are on track for success. The methods by which the programme has been designed means that academic and clinical progression as well as professional development will be tested and assured for graduation.
- That the number of OSCE stations and hours of testing is reviewed for acceptable reliability and validity of assessment of competence

Standard 2

- To provide colleagues with opportunity to meet medical educators at conferences for the sharing of good practice
- To ensure that the university-based systems for gaining student feedback are robust for the students when they start their clerkships.

Standard 3

• To expand the number of International partnerships to increase the opportunities for students and the academics in exchange opportunities, as well as a business plan and resources for the sustainability of internationalization.

Standard 4

- To increase the number of affiliated academic staff and to ensure there are appropriately qualified academics.
- Kutaisi University to be aware of the need for budget availability for the longevity of the MD programme.
- To ensure that any reading material (hard copy or online) are readily accessible to students.
- Faculty development is needed to ensure the different medical education methods are performed accurately
- A recruitment and training of OSCE examiners early in the programme to ensure adequate numbers who are trained are available for the summative assessments.

Standard 5

- To ensure that the university-based systems for gaining student feedback are robust for the students when they start their clerkships.
- That the programme team have a regular programme of review to evaluate and refine the programme in response to feedback from the many stakeholders, i.e., students academic and administrative colleagues, clinical staff, and ultimately the employers of the first MD graduates

Summary of best practices(If Applicable)

Standard 2:

• The quality assurance department is following best practice in their sharing and consultation with stakeholders including students. The meetings with stakeholders ensure that all are aware of the need for information for continuous improvement of the academic programmes.

Standard 5:

- The university listens to the student voice through evaluations and the Student Self-Government, and responds to their feedback on programmes and the general everyday activities of the university
- In case of accredited programme, summary of significant accomplishments and/or progress (If Applicable)

Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis in order to improve the programme.

1.1 Programme Objectives

 Programme objectives define the set of knowledge, skills and competences the programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution to the development of the field and the society.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The MD programme is new to the Kutaisi University and is due to commence in 2020, so should graduate its first cohort of students in 2026. This is a university, and the MD programme will be aligned to be the mission, objectives and strategy

The visiting NCEQE team have seen the evidence and are satisfied from discussions with the Dean, Head of the MD programme and academic faculty (which will be referred to as the Medical Faculty in this document) that the curriculum has been mapped to the learning outcomes and competences required of a Georgian medicine programme. The MD programme has been mapped to the revised benchmark statements for medicine and is therefore compliant with the accreditation standards for the national qualification framework.

The general outline for the MD programme is in 4 phases

- I Phase The Basics of Medicine (I-II Course)
- II Phase Health and Disease (III course)
- III Phase basic clinical rotations (IV-V course)
- IV Phase Preparation for residency (VI course)

With respect to the hours of study for the MD program curriculum, it is linked to the ECTS system, and thus the objectives of the programme are achievable in the 6 years (12 semesters). The students on the MD programme (English) will be recruited from within Georgia as well as other countries. Therefore, Georgian language courses will be mandatory to assist their integration with their peers, patients, clinical personnel, and for day-to-day living in Georgia. Likewise, all students will be expected to communicate and learn in English as much of the medical literature is in this language.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues

- One Step Educational Program for MD (English Language)
- The University Mission;

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

• Georgian language courses as mandatory would assist their integration with their peers, patients, clinical personnel, and for day-to-day living in Georgia. Likewise, all students should be expected to communicate and learn in English as much of the medical literature is in this language

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

X Complies with requirements

- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

1.2. Programme Learning Outcomes

- ➤ Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or the sense of responsibility and autonomy, students gain upon completion of the programme;
- Programme learning outcomes assessment cycle consists of defining, collecting and analyzing data;
- Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

This is a new MD programme which has yet to recruit its first cohort of students, therefore it was refreshing to see the enthusiasm to engage in new and innovative medical education methods for the integration of the basic and clinical sciences.

It was good to hear from the Head of the Quality Assurance Services of the thorough ways in which programmes are evaluated by the university for the information gained will serve well the Medical Faculty as they seek to attain best practice in all areas of the programme.

The Medical Faculty_has identified and taken advice from national, and international experts and it would be good to see these same people playing an active role in faculty development. It would appear that currently some of the invited staff to have contracts with other medical schools as far away as Tblisi. It would be advisable that as student numbers increase, that the leadership within the faculty ensures that there are enough academics and invited staff to teach the students. A deciding factor for the Kutaisi medical graduates will be their performance in the National Examinations.

The methods of assessment proposed for the programme are appropriate and the Medical Faculty will need to ensure that they test the learning outcomes which are in turn mapped to the curriculum. It would be good practice for the Medical Faculty to use examination blue-prints (where the questions were mapped to learning outcomes) to assessments. There was no mention of whether the MD programme was going to use criterion-referencing methods (standard-setting) for competence-based assessments. It would be helpful to hear more about how the academics will trained in marking of students' work and the quality assurance mechanisms for the assessment process. Therefore, it would be helpful for the Faculty to have regular reviews of their progress in order to assure that they, and the students are on track for success. The methods by which the programme has been designed means that academic and clinical progression as well as professional development will be tested and assured for graduation

It is possible that this MD programme (English) may attract overseas students, and thus the possibility that once graduated, they may return to their native country to practice medicine rather than remain in Georgia. Therefore, the visiting NCEQE team would suggest that the Georgian labour market demands would not be for discussion.

Nonetheless given the range of ethnicities within the student population, the Medical Faculty would be advised to evaluate the data of student progress and link it to ethnicity and gender to ascertain whether there is any links between attainment and these demographic parameters

It will be essential that there are clear channels of communication across the Faculty of Medicine, i.e. academics, invited staff and affiliated colleagues (campus- and clinic-based). We were assured by the Head of the Programme that there will be a regular cycle of review, and information gleaned from this will be used for developments. This information will be used in conjunction with the academic outcomes of the students. To note that the clinical programme learning will need to be coordinated by administrative support for students and the affiliated clinical academics of the Kutaisi University.

The Medical Faculty described their proposed assessments which include:

- in-course (written assignments, projects, presentations)
- end-of-course assessments, and we were assured that since all subject benchmarks were mapped in the curriculum, there will be evidence of competence
- Clinical skills assessments will happen at the clinics where students will be observed and given immediate feedback on performance.
- OSCE assessments will be used with at least 8-stations and the use of real patients in the later years of the programme, but the expert team would suggest a review of the number of OSCE stations and hours of testing to assure competence is assured.

As the Kutaisi University is a small institution, there will be opportunities for medical students, as with their peers in other disciplines, to raise concerns to the Dean, Head of programme and the Rector as well as through the Student Self-Government. Moreover, the student voice is listened to through student surveys and representation on committees.

Visits to Clinics

The visiting NCEQE team wishes to thank the clinical partners of Kutaisi University for spending time with us to explain their relationship for the education of medical students. We were able to visit 4 clinics and meet the academics, clinical tutors, and administrators responsible for ensuring the delivery of practice-based learning in the clinics. We attended the following areas of clinical excellence:

- Academian Z. Tskhakaia West Georgia National Center of Intervention Medicine
- LJ Clinic
- Leri Khonelidze Clinic
- LG and Company Tuberculosis and Infectious Diseases Center of West Georgia (the only specialist center in West Georgia)

The visiting team was impressed by the obvious dedication of the clinical and administrative staff to provide an excellent clinical learning experience for the medical students. The clinics are well equipped and offer the extensive range of clinical specialties for the students to rotate through. This includes the inpatient care and outpatient clinics, the array of investigative tools (CT scanners, MRI scanners, laboratory pathology). Considerable investment is also underway in surgery which will offer an even greater learning experience for medical students. Likewise, the current infrastructure facilities for learning and teaching, conferences and simulated practice. Student have a decent command of the English language which helps their studies, since significant areas of the literature are in English. Clearly the medical students have a worthwhile time here for many return to take up residency posts after graduation, and some return from residency in the Ukraine to work in Kutaisi

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues
- One Step Educational Program for MD (English Language)

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

- To evaluate the data of student progress and link it to ethnicity and gender to ascertain whether there is any links between attainment and these demographic parameters.
- It would be advisable that as student numbers increase, that the leadership within the faculty ensures that there are enough academics and invited staff to teach the students
- It would be helpful for the Faculty to have regular reviews of their progress in order to assure that they, and the students are on track for success. The methods by which the programme has been designed means that academic and clinical progression as well as professional development will be tested and assured for graduation.
- That the number of OSCE stations and hours of testing is reviewed for acceptable reliability and validity of assessment of competence

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation
o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes
compliance with this specific component of the standard
X Complies with requirements
□Substantially complies with requirements
□ Partially complies with requirements
□ Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not Comply
	Requirements	complies with	Complies with	with Requirements
		requirements	Requirements	
Educational	X			
programme				
objectives,				
learning outcomes				
and their				
compliance with				
the programme				

2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering

Programme admission preconditions, programme structure, content, teaching and learning methods, and student assessment ensure the achievement of programme objectives and intended learning outcomes.

2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions

Higher education institution has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions.

Description and Evaluation

The Faculty of Medicine at Kutaisi University has a totally transparent in its preconditions and procedures for accessing to the programme. These were developed to comply with the regulations of the: (a) Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport of Georgia, and

- (b) Kutaisi University's "Rules for Accepting the Students".
 - The basic prerequisite includes a level of English language at B2.
 - In accordance with outcomes of results of the Unified National Examinations; the minimum competency limit in English language is 80%.
 - The applicants are required to confirm the English language B2 level, or have an International Certificate IELTS (> 5.0), TOEFL (> 45),

There are regulations on student mobility, i.e. following successful completion of an academic year. The admissions criteria and information are available in English and Georgian on the university's website.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues
- One Step Educational Program for MD (English Language)
- The University website.

T) .	•
Recommend	latione.
иссопписис	ишонь.

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

X Complies with requirements

- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- \square Does not comply with requirements

2.2 Educational Programme Structure and Content

Programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes. Programme content takes programme admission preconditions and programme learning outcomes into account. Programme structure is consistent and logical. Programme content and structure ensure the achievement of programme learning outcomes.

Qualification to be granted is consistent with programme content and learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The Medical Doctor programme has been developed following the guidance of the Kutaisi University (Guide for Planning, Implementing, Evaluating and Developing of Educational Programmes).

The design of the curriculum has been a collaboration between the Dean of the Faculty, Head of Programmes, together with the basic sciences and clinical academics, and being aware of the needs of the Georgian Health economy in terms of knowledge and skills needed for the 21st century doctor. Indeed the curriculum has horizontal and vertical themes, and these may be categorised into

- Knowledge
- Communication and Clinical Skills
- Professional development which includes the Medical Ethics, Clinical Reasoning cases, professional behavior, personal awareness and self-care to prevent 'burn-out' working in the multi-disciplinary teams.

The detail of the curriculum was evaluated widely by the internal university quality assurance procedures and by external reviewers (Georgian and International)

The programme structure is as follows:

- Phase I Fundamentals of Medicine (I-II years) 120 ECTS
- Phase II Health and Disease (III year) 60 ECTS
- Phase III Core Clinical Clerkships (IV-V years) 120 ECTS
- Phase IV Transition to Residency (VI year) 60 ECTS

With the integrated nature of this curriculum students study the basic and clinical sciences in all years

Phase I - Fundamentals of Medicine (I-II)

The main areas of study include structure and function of human body, main concepts of biomedical sciences. (Human anatomy, Life Sciences principles and research, neurosciences, the medical arts and humanities, introduction to clinical skills, public health

Phase II - Health and Disease (III)

The main areas of study include the introduction to Clinical Medicine, i.e. diagnostic reasoning and clinical skills, pharmacology, and pathology together with the identification of the signs and symptoms of diseases for a differential diagnosis through clinical case based learning and problem solving

Phase III - Core Clinical Clerkships (IV-V)

The main areas of study happen in clinical practice which is Internal Medicine (system-based), Surgery, Obstetrics and Gynecology, Emergency Medicine, Pediatrics, Psychiatry, Radiology, Ear, Nose and Throat. At the end of the clerkships students are assessed via an integrated exam (MCQ/OSCE).

In Phase II and III there is the Professional Development for developing the appropriate behaviours and skills of a doctor both in the laboratory and in clinics.

Phase IV - Transition to Residency (VI)

This is the final year of the programme when student prepare for practicing medicine with senior clinical attachments in Internal Medicine, Surgery, Obstetrics/Gynecology, Infectious Diseases, Family Medicine, Ophthalmology, Geriatrics, Pediatrics and Emergency Medicine.

In fact the assessment methods is same for all disciplines (fundamental or clinics). For example all require write the essay, which is evaluated maximum2 points. Expert panel think that each subject need various assessment system based on specificity teaching method and not unified system.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues
- One Step Educational Program for MD (English Language)
- The University Mission;

Recommendations:

 To ensure there is a diversification of the assessment methods which test appropriately the specific learning outcomes of the discipline.

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

O Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education programmes

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress



o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

Complies with requirements

X Substantially complies with requirements

- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

2.3 Course

- > Student learning outcomes of each compulsory course are in line with programme learning outcomes; Moreover, each course content and number of credits correspond to course learning outcomes;
- > Teaching materials listed in syllabi are based on the core achievements in the field and ensure the achievement of intended programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The visiting NCEQE team has evaluated the MD program documentation, and also had in-depth discussions with the various stakeholders involved in the development of the programme. It is clear that the different courses throughout the 4 phases of the programme demonstrate academic progression through the level, depth and complexity of the learning, and have the appropriate learning objectives which are to be assessed are tested according to the learning outcomes.

The credits awarded for different phases reflect the expectations for the number of contact hours of teaching, private self-directed and independent study. Naturally when the student are fully immersed in clinical learning in the clerkships, the number of hours of clinical practice will be greater for each ECTS credit, than was evident in the more didactic approach to learning earlier in the programme.

The proposed use of medical education methods is to be applauded but colleagues in the leadership of the Faculty of medicine need to be mindful of the need for faculty development for colleagues to be competent in these methods, i.e. developing learning materials and training for problem-based learning, case-based learning, OSCE examiner training, and assessment item-writing (writing single best answer questions, OSCE stations). Therefore, it will be essential for the Medicine Faculty to expand the collaborators to ensure expertise in these methods.

Library resources: the medical students should have access to learning materials (books and journals, databases) on campus and by remote access. It is appropriate that the library stocks will be updated in consultation with the academics. Training will be needed for the use of software and databases for learning and academics must ensure that when they are suggesting reading for students, that it is freely available to avoid anxiety.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues
- One Step Educational Program for MD (English Language)
- The University Mission;

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

 To provide colleagues with opportunity to meet medical educators at conferences for the sharing of good practice

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

X Complies with requirements

- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

2.4 The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performance and transferable skills

Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performance and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

This is a straightforward requirement that the Faculty of Medicine will have to comply with for accreditation since the Georgian professional regulator will want to see evidence of the student competence in defined clinical skills. Thus, faculty leadership have assured the NCEQE team that they have highlighted the development of practical, research and transferable skills, particularly the core competences required for the medical profession

Clinical skills: It is in the curriculum documents that students will learn the practical skills in the clinical skill modules via laboratory teaching facilitated by clinical trainers and physicians as well as in the clinical rotations within the Kutaisi University's partner clinics.

Scientific/research skills: It is expected that the MD programme will include 13 creditson research methods, planning projects, data analysis and presentation, as well as learning how to write scientifically, together with research applications in medicine. The Kutaisi University is taking these elements seriously and has therefore equipped a laboratory for research and developed an internal research grant scheme with a prerequisite that university students take part in research.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues
- One Step Educational Program for MD (English Language)
- The University Mission;

Recommendations

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

X Complies with requirements

- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

2.5 Teaching and learning methods

Program is implemented using student centered teaching and learning (SCL) methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course content, student learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The Faculty of Medicine is forward-thinking and the proposed MD programme reflects this, and with this ambitious programme comes the need to deliver the learning and training in the practical skills of examinations, clinical procedures and clinical communication. The infrastructure of the MD programme is developing well with is clinical skills laboratories, OSCE suite, anatomy models and virtual reality.

Proposed methods to use used include:

- Lectures,
- Clinical demonstration
- Problem-solving and critical thinking
- Case-based learning
- Problem-based learning
- Role-play in clinical scenarios.
- Simulation

Within the clinics the students will also be able to learn through:

- Surgical rotations
- Bedside teaching
- Team working
- Research Projects
- Practical assessment of patients in clinics

This is a good programme, and as already stated, very ambitious and so there will need to be appropriate faculty development to deliver this programme. Likewise, to assure the longevity of the clinical teaching in the clinics, we would recommend service level agreements and memorandums with the flow of financial resources to ensure good working relationships between the Kutaisi University and clinic-based academics.

Mechanisms for gaining and evaluating student feedback on their clinical placements will need to be attended to, to ensure that the student experience is monitored and amended in response to student feedback.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues
- One Step Educational Program for MD (English Language)
- The University Mission;

Recommendations:

 To expand the number of experts that you collaborate with in order to have the expertise in medical education methods,

Suggestions for programme development:

 To provide colleagues with opportunity to meet medical educators at conferences for the sharing of good practice

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

Complies with requirements

X Substantially complies with requirements

- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

2.6. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with established procedures. It is transparent and complies with existing legislation.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The quality assurance department of Kutaisi University has a proactive approach to student evaluations. The questionnaires are constructed scientifically and in consultation with student interns within the quality assurance department. Student questionnaires are delivered online, the quality assurance office evaluated the data which is shared with the Rector and the relevant academics within the departments. Open and closed questions are used with the open comments section analyzed for any themes. Following the analysis, any changes which are needed are shared with students via email as well meetings and reports with all stakeholders.

It was recognized that the student-completion of questionnaires was variable. Therefore, the quality assurance office takes a proactive approach by sharing with students why their opinions matter, what happens to the questionnaires and the data as well as sharing with them the changes made in response to the student opinion. It would be good practice to ensure that the university-based systems for gaining student feedback are robust for the students when they start their clerkships

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

• To ensure that the university-based systems for gaining student feedback are robust for the students when they start their clerkships.

Best Practices (if applicable):

• The quality assurance department is following best practice in their sharing and consultation with stakeholders including students. The meetings with stakeholders ensure that all are aware of the need for information for continuous improvement of the academic programmes.

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes
compliance with this specific component of the standard
X Complies with requirements

\square Substantially $\mathfrak o$	complies	with	requirem	ents
---------------------------------------	----------	------	----------	------

□ Partially	z com	plies	with	requirer	nents
- I al tiall	,	PIICO	****	requirer	IICIICO

□ Does	not comp	lv with	reauirem	ents
_ D000	not comp.	., ,,,,,,,	requirem	CIICO

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with	Substantially	Partially Complies	Does not Comply
	Requirements	complies with	with	with
		requirements	Requirements	Requirements
Teaching		X		
methodology and				
organization,				
adequate				
evaluation of				
programme				
mastering				

3. Student achievements and individual work with them

HEI creates student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; programme staff ensures students' familiarity with the named services, organizes various events and fosters students' involvement in local and/or international projects.

3.1. Student support services

Students receive appropriate consultations and support regarding the planning of learning process, improvement of academic achievement, employment and professional development.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The NCEQE visiting team met with students and alumni and it was evident that they are well-supported in their studies as well as mechanisms available for student to pay their tuition fees in installments.

The Kutaisi University has a robust and well-developed services for student support. Some of the examples of support cited by the students and alumni included:

- Proactive and facilitation of social events
- Supporting students through tutorials (one to one, and groups)
- Opportunities for internships
- Information on possible opportunities to engage in research, conferences, projects, events
- Accessibility of academics for students so that any issues are attended to
- The non-Georgian students given courses in Georgian language and culture to facilitate integration with their peers.
- Training in English language as much of the learning materials may be in English.

An area for development for Kutaisi University is the expansion in international partnerships to increase the opportunities for students and the academics in exchange opportunities, as well as a business plan and resources for the sustainability of internationalization.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues

Recommendations:

 To expand the number of International partnerships to increase the opportunities for students and the academics in exchange opportunities, as well as a business plan and resources for the sustainability of internationalization

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation
o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes
compliance with this specific component of the standard
□ Complies with requirements
X Substantially complies with requirements
□ Partially complies with requirements
□ Does not comply with requirements
3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student supervision
Master's and Doctoral students have qualified thesis supervisors.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements
Not applicable as this is a MD programme (one-cycle)
Evidences/indicators
Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development:
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation
o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes
compliance with this specific component of the standard
□ Complies with requirements
Substantially complies with requirements
□ Partially complies with requirements
□ Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard -

Standard	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not Comply
	Requirements	complies with	Complies with	with Requirements
		requirements	Requirements	
Student		X		
achievements and				
individual work				
with them				

4. Providing teaching resources

Programme human, material, information and financial resources ensure programme sustainability, its effective and efficient functioning, and achievement of intended objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

The medicine programme has the appropriate student to staff ratio of programme staff who are qualified to lead and teach on the programme. They have the academic acumen to help the students to achieve the programme learning outcomes.

An action plan has been constructed to assure that academics are recruited whilst keeping in line with the resources available. With 100 medical students per academic year of study there are:

- 17 academics
- 37 visiting staff some of whom are clinically active

With the mix of both clinical and scientific academics and visiting staff there are good role models for the medical students

Kutaisi University is aware of the need for faculty development. There are funds available for faculty development for attending conferences, and 1000GEL per semester per professor for international publications. There are national and international collaborations, e.g. Professor T Gibbs (President of the Association for Medical Education in Europe) as well as with external institutes, Neuropsychology Centre (Open Door).

The Head of Programme is a medical academic who is highly competent and able to lead this programme, having also international qualifications, experience and collaborators in medical education. With his team he is inspiring a proactive for the medicine programme to keep pace with international standards as well as the national standards of Georgia.

The Head of the Faculty of Medicine is also very forward-thinking, has recruited likeminded colleagues and is attracting collaborators from outside Kutaisi because of their commitment to medical education. This includes the integration and the basic and medical sciences throughout the whole of the medicine programme, as well as assuring professional development of the medical students, i.e. knowledge, skills and professional attributes.

There is the range of different administrative and support staff of appropriate competence to support the studies of the medical students in:

- Careers advisors
- Coordinators for the overseas students
- Student services office

During interview process the expert panel has notice that some academic staff need more training in modern teaching methods as well as English language. The main part of academic staff will be research about 55% from work load, however it is very difficult to realize the research activities without fully and modern equipped labs.

The expert panel suggested that the number of academic personnel will need to be increased, as student numbers increased and to be mindful of the disciplines needed to deliver the MD programme, both within the Kutaisi University and in the partner clinics and hospitals.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues
- Methodology for determining academic, scientific and invited personnel numbers to deliver the program;
- Number of academic / scientific / invited personnel in relation to the number of students enrolled in the program;
- Academic / scientific / invited personnel loading scheme and individual loading indicator of academic position (which envisages a person's load) and etc.;
- Staff schedule:
- Loading forms.

Recommendations:

- The recruitment and training of OSCE examiners early on in the programme so that they are ready and trained for summative assessments.
- Faculty development is needed to ensure the different medical education methods are performed accurately

Suggestions for programme development:

 To increase the number of affiliated academic staff and to ensure there are appropriately qualified academics.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programm	nes
compliance with this specific component of the standard	

□ Complies with requirements

X Substantially complies with requirements

- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

4.2 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff

There has been an action plan to assure that academics are recruited whilst keeping in line with the resources available. With 100 medical students per academic year of study there are:

- 17 academics
- 37 visiting staff some of whom are clinically active

With the range of clinical and scientific academics and visiting staff there are good role models for the medical students

Kutaisi University is aware of the need for faculty development. There are funds available for faculty development for attending conferences, and 1000GEL per semester per professor for international publications. There are national and international collaborations, e.g. Professor T Gibbs (President of the Association for Medical Education in Europe) as well as with external institutes, Neuropsychology Centre (Open Door)

Given the exciting ways in which the programme is constructed and delivered, there are local training programmes which serve to equip the academics and invited staff with the skills to deliver the medicine programme.

At the end of academic year, Kutaisi University evaluates the academic and invited staff teaching, research and administrative activities based on principle 40 (teaching)/55 (research)/5 (administrative). At the same time, the minimum limit of competence for each component is set at 75%/ 20% /60%.

According this regulation expert panel notice that Kutaisi University focuses mostly on the level of involvement of academic and invited personnel in scientific research activities. However minimal limit in this component is very low 20%.

On the other side, Kutaisi University annually examines the general satisfaction of academic and invited staff. The survey based on assessment of various aspects of the university's activities. The general satisfaction questionnaire of academic and invited staff is conducted through internal corporate email and is anonymous.

After the evaluation process Human Resources Service will analyze the data and will carry out the specific development programs or activities of professional development. However, during interview with academic staff expert panel reveal that especially affiliated academic personnel need more experience in teaching methods and English language. As regards invited personnel they have more competence in teaching and English language. Thus we recommend that this evaluation system need more improvement.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues
- Human Resource Management Policy;
- Budget of Faculty of Medicine;
- Policy and procedures of scientific research activities;
- Documentation confirming participation in the International Conference of Personnel;
- Plagiarism regulations.

Recommendations

• To enhance the teaching and language skills of academic and affiliated staff, improve the professional development of academic staff.

Suggestions for programme development:

• A recruitment and training of OSCE examiners early in the programme to ensure adequate numbers who are trained are available for the summative assessments.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

Complies with requirements

X Substantially complies with requirements

- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

4.3. Material Resources

Programme is provided by necessary infrastructure and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Kutaisi University has 20 auditoriums (1 - 100 students, 3 - 40 students, 2 - 35 students, 3 30 students, 5 - 20 students, 4 - 15 students). The University also has 3 exam rooms (2 with 30 - 30 computers and OSCE examination center) and medical laboratory.

During visit expert panel view that UNIK has appropriate infrastructure to deliver the medicine programme, but this is constantly under review. There has been a recent new build for the university library

Library: 218books and these are in hard copy as well as electronic books and journals available. The Dean of the medicine faculty provides the list of books required each academic year and these are purchased. There are computers available in the library, and also web-access which the students may use via their hand-held devices.

The Library Reading Hall comprises 50 students and equipped with 5 computers. In order to enrich the library funds, 54000 GEL is spent. 97 new units have been purchased. Kutaisi University has access to Hinari, AGORA, OARE, ARDI, GOAL, electronic bases. Agreements concluded with the bases (see the agreement with the bases). To help student satisfaction to be maintained, it would be advisable to ensure that any reading material (hard copy or online) are readily accessible tostudents

The leadership within the faculty are forward-thinking and aware of the need for 21st century delivery of clinical medicine via virtual reality, and informatics.

Evidences/indicators

Self-Evaluation Report

- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues
- Material, technical and library resource;
- University Auditoriums, Computer Classes, Scientific Lab, Exam Centers and Clinical Center;
- Textbooks in the library;
- Library electronic databases;
- Agreements and Memorandums signed with Clinics;
- Documents certifying ownership of infrastructure, technical equipment and bookstores;
- Documents confirming participation in the international electronic library network.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

• To ensure that any reading material (hard copy or online) are readily accessible tostudents

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

X Complies with requirements

□ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

□ Does not comply with requirements

4.4. Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to programme needs.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

There were in-depth discussions between the NCEQE expert team and the Kutaisi University leadership and we have been assured of a commitment to funding the MD programme in terms of academics, learning infrastructure and placement opportunities in the partner clinics.

The NCEQE team would wish to make all at Kutaisi University aware of the need for budget availability is critical to the longevity of the MD programme in terms of the following areas:

- The faculty available to deliver the Medicine programme in both the university building and the clinics
- The infrastructure investment for models and other equipment to deliver the anatomy and clinical skills teaching
- The consumables budget to ensure equipment is available to deliver the programme
- The library budget for adequate supply of books and journals (online / hard copy)
- The student support infrastructure for an intense programme of study

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

• Kutaisi University to be aware of the need for budget availability for the longevity of the MD programme

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the che	eckbox which mostly	y describes you	ur position rela	ited to the p	rogrammes
compliance with this spe	cific component of t	the standard			

X Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially	v complies	with red	uirements

□ Partially	complies	with red	nnirem	ents
\square 1 at train γ	COMPLICS	** 1 1 1 1 1 1	quii Cii	ıcııw

□ Does not comply with requ	uirements
-----------------------------	-----------

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not Comply
	Requirements	complies with	Complies with	with Requirements
		requirements	Requirements	
Providing		X		
teaching				
resources				

5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development on a regular basis.

5.1 Internal quality

The quality assurance department of Kutaisi University has a proactive approach to student evaluations. The questionnaires are constructed scientifically and in consultation with student interns within the quality assurance department. Student questionnaires are delivered online, the quality assurance office evaluated the data which is shared with the Rector and the relevant academics within the departments. Open and closed questions are used with the open comments section analyzed for any themes. Following the analysis, any changes which are needed are shared with students via email as well meetings and reports with all stakeholders.

It was recognized that the student-completion of questionnaires was variable. Therefore, the quality assurance office takes a proactive approach by sharing with students why their opinions matter, what happens to the questionnaires and the data as well as sharing with them the changes made in response to the student opinion.

This will need to be extended and monitored carefully particularly for the students who are on clerkships on the clinics associated with the Kutaisi University. Nonetheless, it was good to hear from the Head of the Quality Assurance Services of the thorough ways in which programmes are evaluated by the university for the information gained will serve well the Medical Faculty as they seek to attain best practice in all areas of the programme.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well as the administrative colleagues

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

- To ensure that the university-based systems for gaining student feedback are robust for the students when they start their clerkships.
- That the programme team have a regular programme of review to evaluate and refine the
 programme in response to feedback from the many stakeholders, i.e., students academic and
 administrative colleagues, clinical staff, and ultimately the employers of the first MD
 Graduates

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

X Complies with requirements

- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

5.2 External quality

Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Medicine is scrutinized and quality assured by a number of external agencies which includes:

- Accreditation and authorization process by the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement,
- External stakeholders the future employers of the medicine graduates
- Potential employers who review the content and delivery of the MD programme
- National and international reviewers who have been involved in the scrutiny throughout the MD programme design phase.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Interviews with Stakeholders: Leadership of the Kutaisi University, Dean of the Faculty of

Medicine, Head of MD Programme, academics, affiliated professors and invited staff as well
as the administrative colleagues
Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development:
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation
o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes
compliance with this specific component of the standard
X Complies with requirements
□ Substantially complies with requirements
□ Partially complies with requirements
□ Does not comply with requirements

5.3. Programme monitoring and periodic review

Programme monitoring and periodic review is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematically collecting and analysing information. Assessment results are utilized for programme improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Kutaisi University has developed "Guidelines for Planning, Implementation, Evaluation and Development of Education Programs" and "Guidelines for Internal Studies of Quality Assurance Service". Based on the quality mechanism defined in these regulations UNIK authorities will be carried out the Program Monitoring and Evaluation. According from interview process and attached documents Kutaisi University has only 2 external reviews for this program, 1 from Batumi State University

Kutaisi University also give the questionnaires to stakeholders for evaluation the need of program improvement. The people involved in the monitoring and evaluation process are: academic, scientific, invited administrative, support personnel, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders.

The polls consist of detail information about: Student and Employee satisfaction, Course and lecturer evaluation; students participating in international projects, assessment of leadership and work progress. The survey will be conducted twice in year. In addition to the surveys, to improve the program, the following information will be processed:

student learning outcomes; student enrollment, student's rank rate, student and graduate employment, students' involvement in university's scientific activities as well as international mobility of students and personnel

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

That the programme team have a regular programme of review to evaluate and refine the
programme in response to feedback from the many stakeholders, i.e., students academic and
administrative colleagues, clinical staff, and ultimately the employers of the first MD
graduates

Best Practices (if applicable):

The university listens to the student voice through evaluations and the Student Self-Government, and responds to their feedback on programmes and the general everyday activities of the university.

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

Evaluation
o Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes
compliance with this specific component of the standard
X Complies with requirements
□Substantially complies with requirements
□ Partially complies with requirements
□ Does not comply with requirements

Standard	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not Comply
	Requirements	complies with	Complies with	with Requirements
		requirements	Requirements	
Teaching quality	X			
enhancement				
opportunities				

Enclosed Documentation (If Applicable)

HEI's Name: Kutaisi University

Higher Education Programme Name: Medical Doctor (One Cycle)

Number of Pages of the Report: 33 pages

Programme's Compliance with the Standard

Standard	Complies with	Substantially	Partially Complies	Does not
	Requirements	complies with	with	Comply with
		requirements	Requirements	Requirements
1. Programme objectives are clearly	X			
defined and achievable; they are				
consistent with the mission of the				
HEI and take into consideration				
labour market demands				
2. Teaching methodology and		X		
organization, adequate evaluation				
of programme mastering				
3. Student achievements and		X		
individual work with them				
4. Providing teaching resources		X		
5. Teaching quality enhancement	X			
opportunities				

Expert Panel Chair's

Name, last name, signature

Professor Olwyn Westwood

Expert Panel Members'

Name, last name, signature

Professor Ia Pantsulaia

U. Bzelellun

Olo no

Professor Tsotne Samadashvili

Mrs Mariam Tevzadze

3.078