განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

+

Accreditation Expert Group Report on Higher Education Programme

Bau International University, Batumi
MD English one cycle programme

Date(s) of Evaluation
24/02/2020

Report Submission Date
20/03/2020

Tbilisi
2020

HEI's Information Profile

Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form	BAU International University, Batumi
HEI's Identification Code	445434888
Type of Institution	Teaching University

Higher Education Programme Information Profile

Name of the Programme	Medicine
Level of Education	Level 7
Qualification Granted Indicating Qualification Code	Medical Doctor (MD) 0912
Language of Instruction	English
Number of Credits	360 ECTS
Programme Status (Authorized/ Accredited/New)	Accredited

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Mahmoud Hafez, Prof. & Head of Orthopedic Dept., October 6 University, Cairo, Egypt. Consultant Orthopedic surgeon, NHS, UK. Visiting Professor, Cardiff University, UK
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Khatuna Saganelidze, New vision University, Evgeni Mikeladze St, Tbilisi 0159, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Ivane Abiatari, Ilia State University, Cholokashvili Ave. 3/5, Tbilisi 0162, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Mrs. Mariam Abuladze, New vision University
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	

Accreditation Report Executive Summary

- **General information on the education programme**

BAU International University, Batumi offers educational programme "Medicine" conducted in the English language. The university features "anatomy theatre", anatomy laboratory for cadavers, laboratories for teaching histology, microbiology, molecular genetics and biochemistry and the centre of "clinical skills". The teaching process is led in a partnership with Bahcesehir (Istanbul) University.

The aim of the educational programme is to equip students with theoretical knowledge as well as with clinical skills that will prepare them for their future medical career. The educational programme lasts for six years and leads to the qualification of Medical Doctor.

- **Brief overview of the accreditation site-visit**

Preparation was done on 23rd of Feb with a visit to the affiliated hospital and evaluation of the facilities. The full members of the panel attended the site visit to the university on 24th Feb 2020 from 10 am to 6:30 pm. The panel was accompanied with Mr. Lasha Macharashvili, Specialist at Academic Programme Accreditation Division.
During this visit, we had the following:

1- Meeting with the University Head of Administration and the Rector
2- Meeting with the Self-Evaluation Team (Head of Administration, Head of Qulity Assuarance, Programme Leader, Academic Personnel, Students support Service and International Marketing and The Lawyer)
3- Meeting with the head of the Programme
4- Meeting with the Academic Staff (a group of professors, associate & assistant professors)
5- Meeting with Invited Staff
6- Meeting with Head of Qulity Assuarance and Assistant Qulity Assuarance
7- Meeting with Employers
8- Meeting with a group of students with different grades (from 1 to 5) from different countries (Georgia, Syria, Turkey, Egypt, Afghanistan and Kurdistan)
9- **At the end, I presented the main findings of the site-visit with summary of the positive encounters and the opportunities for improvement.**

This is the summary of positive findings:

- It has been found that the medical school has moved to a new location few months ago (Nov 2019) and now they are affiliated to a nearby hospital. I was personally impressed that they managed to settle in this new location despite the short period between the new move and the site visit for accreditation. The new location is reasonably good and has campus with free spaces and gardens with the potential for further extensions. It also has the required facilities to run the program for medicine. We have seen good infra structure and facilities such as cadaveric lab with one complete cadaver and good opportunity for dissection and demonstration. There were also well-equipped labs in the following specialties: Histology, Biochemistry, Microbioogy and Pathology. There were several models to be used for clinical examination. There was a reasonably equipped library with new textbooks covering different specialties and few computers and we have been told that there is electronic library connected to BAU University in Turkey. There was an exam room with several computer disks (>30) and the PC was protected in a unique way which was impressive. We met the

academic staff and invited staff. They were all satisfied with the employment conditions and their salaries. They also gave us the impression that they are patriotic. The students were also satisfied

This is the summary of the opportunities for improvement:

We noticed that the school has got small number of students (<100) and there are only 2 students in grade 5. This situation has been there for few years in spite of the facilities and the potential this university has. The inability to attract more students is unexplained. The dean is not a medical graduate, she is a biologist. Although, she is very active, experienced academic, it would have been better to have a dean with medical qualification. The number of clinical staff is relatively small. However, there is an acceptable excuse that they have only 2 students in grade 5 and none in grade 6. This must increase in the years to come. The site of the university is relatively far away from the city center and from the accommodation of the students who were settled in places that were close to the old site of the university. Also, there is difficulty for the students to buy the necessary items such as drinking water when the teaching is finished late in the evening and shops are closed. It will be good for the university to have its dedicated hospital in the future rather than the affiliation to different hospitals. The students requested inviting international tutors to be among the invited faculty of the university.

- Summary of education programme's compliance with the standards

    - The education programme is substantially compliant with the standards. The evaluation scores of different standards range between fully compliant and partially complaint.

- Summary of Recommendations

    - The recommendations are listed under each standard

- Summary of Suggestions

    - The suggestions are listed under each standard

- Summary of best practices (If Applicable)

- In case of accredited programme, summary of significant √ and/or progress (If Applicable)

Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis in order to improve the programme.

1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives define the set of knowledge, skills and competences the programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution to the development of the field and the society.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

MD programme of "BAU International University, Batumi" aims at preparing a qualified doctor with deep theoretical and evidence based scientific knowledge, clinical skills, ability to use innovative technology and liberal values in compliance with national and international standards. Moreover, it aims at establishing professional ethical values, research skills. The programme will facilitate integration of graduates into the world`s educational and healthcare communities. As the mission of "BAU International University, Batumi" is educational politics of international standards, preparation of highly qualified personnel, with scientific vision and equipped with knowledge of innovative technologies and liberal values, we can conclude that the programme objectives are in compliance with the Universitiy`s mission. The contribution to society is illustrated by preparing future doctors with professional ethical values, research skills and ability of renewal of knowledge. During development of the programme, the institution took into the consideration local labour market demands and reflected programme internationalization issue. The MD programme is in compliance with Turkish medical education standard, particularly with the partner University – BAU Istanbul curriculum, which makes the exchange process easier between these two universities. Internationalization policy is a priority for BAU International Batumi, a member of BAU Global educational network. University supports student and staff mobility, is involved in joint project development, as evidenced by Erasmus + project, where the university is a project coordinator.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- Programme objectives, mission
- Analysis of employers' demands
- Website
- Interview results.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

√ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

1.2. Programme Learning Outcomes

- Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or the sense of responsibility and autonomy, students gain upon completion of the programme;
- Programme learning outcomes assessment cycle consists of defining, collecting and analysing data;
- Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The program underwent the last accreditation in 2015. Since then, several changes were made to ensure the compliance with international standards and updated benchmarks of the medical field. More specifically, credit distribution, teaching methodologies, learning outcomes and assessment were modified. At this point, it is difficult for experts to evaluate the otcomes of these changes due to the recent implementation of a new assessment system (portfolios, OSCE-s and so on) and teaching methodologies. Also It is hard to judge the effectiveness of a new program according to a few students. Only several students are in clinical component of teaching and just 2 in the highest (X) semester . Plus, university has no alumni yet. Thus, it is very difficult to evaluate how sucessfully program outcomes are reached.

The learning outcomes and competencies general as well as specific are in compliance with medicine sector benchmarks of higher education and they are as follows:

1. Defines (describes) normal structure and the function of the human body from molecular to system Level, the reasons and mechanisms of changes of diseases and the structure and the function of the human body based on the evidence-based knowledge.
2. Assesses clinical presentations, orders investigations, lists the commonly seen diseases in the society and interprets clinical, laboratory and radiologic findings of these diseases and makes differential diagnosis, list the highly effective treatment options based on scientific data, can choose among them and prescribe medications.
3. Has necessary knowledge for diagnosis ad preliminary treatment of life-threatening diseases/conditions and has the ability to perform first aid and resuscitation measures.
4. Knows and applies legal instruments and ethical principles of physician`s practice; Is able to decide properly in the case of ethical conflicts under the light of that knowledge, while practicing, respects universal ethical rules of not doing harm, utility , justice and autonomy;

approaches patients neutrally, extrajudicially and with no discrimination and embraces his approach as an ethical responsibility.

5. Carries out a consultation with the patient, performs comprehensive and focused history taking and complete and detailed physical examination.
6. Applies commonly used interventions ad practical procedures in diagnosis and treatment, refers the patients to the related socialist doctor when necessary.
7. Has effective communication skills with patients, patient relatives and third persons; adopts the principle of understandably and explanatorily informing patient about their disease and its treatment, of informed consent and patient confidentiality.
8. Evaluated psychological and social aspects regarding patient's disease based on basic knowledge if behavioral and social sciences.
9. Uses information and information technology effectively in medical context; interprets information sources properly, differentiates evidence-based information, is able to plan and perform original scientific research and evaluates the data obtained; masters basic research process in medicine and follows scientific and technologic developments of her/his field.
10. Determines the risks that can be faced by individuals with the disease or injury and in advance identifies people under those risks or at early stages of the disease and takes the necessary precautions; adopts that the primary responsibility of a physician is to protect human health through prevention and healing diseases and bears responsibility for entering into a cooperation with other related health workers and organizations in order to protect health of individuals and the society.
11. Uses the principles of lifelong learning.
12. Demonstrates professionalism.

The programme presented by the university is annexed by Learning Outcomes and Competencies Map (according to modules/courses). Where the relevancy, attainability and compatibility of the learning outcomes with educational' practical and clinical components of the educational programme are highlighted. This reflects the interrelation of the learning components with the learning outcome(s) as well as with the assessment components and the teaching methods necessary for achieving those outcomes.

Evidences/indicators

- Programme learning outcomes;
- Educational programme;
- Programme objectives;
- Map of programme objectives and programme learning outcomes;
- Analysis of employers' demands;
- Documentation certifying the involvement the programme stakeholders in the establishment of programme learning outcomes;
- Website;
- Survey results;
- Interview results

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

✓ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☐Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme	✓			

2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering

Programme admission preconditions, programme structure, content, teaching and learning methods, and student assessment ensure the achievement of programme objectives and intended learning outcomes.

2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions
Higher education institution has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements Students who can be enrolled on the program must be graduates from secondary education. Georgian citizens are enrolled trough unified national examination system based on the set rule of Ministry of education, science, culture and sports of Georgia. Georgian and foreign citizens must prove knowledge of English as a prerequisite for admission. For Georgian applicants the threshold for English within unified national exam is fixed individually for each year (this year it is 70% according to the university web-page). Foreign citizens must submit English knowledge certificate of at least B2 level, or pass internal testing unless they are graduates of English medium secondary or high education programs in English speaking countries. During the site visit we have identified, that English competency testing is performed with the instruments provided by BAU Istanbul University, which has international language school and which is the partner institution of BAU Batumi University. Those students who cannot qualify because of English, university provides 6 or 12-month language bridging courses after which they can repeat the test. Besides language tests, students undergo interviewing, where communication abilities, motivation to studies and background information is collected. For the selection of international students besides above mentioned preconditions university uses grades of secondary school. This is an accepted and commonly used practice, however in future university may consider introduction of core subject placement tests for international applicants as

well. This might be useful especially when the number of applicants will go high – as university aims to increase number of students.
The information about admissions and preconditions, studying process and environment for both Georgian and foreign citizens is given in MD program document and available on the BAU Batumi website (http://bauinternational.edu.ge/en/future-students), thus are transparent and publicly accessible. Additionally, during the site-visit interviews, students positively responded to the admission criteria, clarity and transparency of admission preconditions and procedures.

Evidences/indicators

- MD program;
- University website;
- Interviews with: self-evaluation group, Dean, students.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

In the long run, university may consider implementation of placement test for international students in core subject(s).

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

✓ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.2 Educational Programme Structure and Content

Programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes. Programme content takes programme admission preconditions and programme learning outcomes into account. Programme structure is consistent and logical. Programme content and structure ensure the achievement of programme learning outcomes. Qualification to be granted is consistent with programme content and learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Presented MD educational program of BAU International University of Batumi was recently updated according to the new guidelines of national benchmark. Program was developed according to university's program implementation rule and quality assurance procedure. For the reformation of the program, university used data from students and employer surveys. As well as practical experience of medical faculty of BAU Istanbul University. Program development group redesigned learning outcomes which was shared among academic personnel, employers and program advisory board for the evaluation. The final drafts of the program documents were prepared based on the feedback of these stakeholders. For each of the program learning outcome particular benchmark is set, which can be used for the achievement measurement. Study courses from the program structure are used as an instruments for this benchmarks. Programme structure is logical and can achieve programme learning outcomes.

Duration of single step MD educational program is six academic years and implies gathering of 360 ECTS credits. One ECTS credit equals to 30 hours. Over 22 ECTS credits are allocated for the development of basic clinical skills. 20 ECTS credits are dedicated to the development of research skills.

Program is assembled on the principle of horizontal and spiral integration and has interdisciplinary modular system. Each semester during the first five semesters consists with four interdisciplinary modules, which are mainly covering body systems, and longitudinal semester courses. Each basic medical module has hours allocated for basic clinical practice, thus program has elements of vertical integration, when student start clinical visits already from the first semester. Clinical disciplines are taught in from of rotations. Final year is mostly dedicated to clinical internships. It is good point, that primary health care training is involved in these internships. Research skills are developed in different components of the program throughout the curriculum. Courses such as: academic writing, research methodology and biostatistics, research project I and II are courses where students acquire basic research skills and work on scientific projects. During the site-visit we were able to see, that student work on clinical cases from early stage on, as well as their involvement in research activities was also obvious.

Program allocates high number of credits for international students to learn Georgian language. Georgian students can choose among English or German language courses. In total program offers elective courses of 33 ECTS credits in different semesters. Vast majority of these courses are of medical field. University utilizes medical portfolio for students, which is conducted throughout whole study period and used as an instrument of monitoring and evaluation of life-long learning and professionalism.

Overall, curriculum integration can be named as a hybrid, which means involvement of different elements and different levels of integration at different stage. Students learn normal and abnormal structure/function of the body based on systems within separate modules. PBL and CBL methods are used to increase integration among basic disciplines. Clinical attachments are introduced as early as first study year, and basic sciences are offered in later stage semesters. It can be suggested, that program is varying between 'correlation' and 'multi-disciplinary' step of integration ladder.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- MD Programme and learning outcomes
- Map of learning outcomes
- Course syllabi
- Site-visit interviews with: dean, academic personnel, students.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

✓ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.3 Course

- Student learning outcomes of each compulsory course are in line with programme learning outcomes; Moreover, each course content and number of credits correspond to course learning outcomes;
- Teaching materials listed in syllabi are based on the core achievements in the field and ensure the achievement of intended programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

MD program has two types of courses: integrated modules and single discipline courses. Every program component syllabus has own learning outcome map as an attachment. In that format course specific learning outcomes are structured in three different domains (knowledge, skills, responsibilities) and their link with teaching format/methods and assessment methods are demonstrated. In addition, relation of course learning outcomes to program learning outcomes (field specific or general) is given. This format serves as a good instrument for the structuring of the program components and measurement of outcome achievements.

Number of credits for each course is individual and adequately corresponds to the workload of the discipline. Distribution of contact and independent hours is generally logical. Syllabi are informative and includes details about course objectives, study format, teaching and assessment methods, assessment criteria, required teaching resources and description of course topics. Teaching materials listed in syllabi are based on up-to-date information and is adequate for the achievement of intended programme learning outcomes. Although, there have been found several spelling mistakes within syllabi.

It`s odd that both 5 credit and 3 credit clinical courses are being taught for 2-2 weeks. Re-evaluation of student's workload and calculation the contact hours is required. It is needed to re-evaluate the workload of certain clinical courses, such as "otorhinolaryngology". How is it possible to fit 90 contact hours, 3 credit course in only one week, especially when it is outlined that during 6 days students have to attend 15 hours of lectures, 8 hours of seminars, 18 hours of Teaching in Clinical Environment (TCE) and 3 hours of examinations. The same situation in clinical course `Ophthalmology`, where there are even more lectures (22 hours) In one week, plus seminars, practical studies and examinations.

In some of the integrated module syllabi (mainly in first year) the integration of topics between disciplines is not well defined and title of the course in not accurate. This was also discussed during the site-visit interviews and some examples were given. Academic personnel had their opinion in this matter, however we suggest, that there is a room for improvement of these issue.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- MD program course syllabi
- Site-visit isnterviews with: Dean/head of the program, academic personnel, invited personnel

Recommendations:

- Review titles of some courses.
- Themes could be better synchronized within particular syllabi
- Re-evaluation of student's workload and calculation of contact hours

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation ☐ Complies with requirements ✓ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.4 The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performance and transferable skills

Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performance and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Program learning outcomes are addressing development of scientific research skills (LO #9), practical skills (e.g. LO#6) and transferable skills (general learning outcomes). Curriculum covers several research oriented courses dedicated to research methods and project implementation and writing. Student must complete his/her individual research work by the end of his/her studies. Overall volume of the research oriented courses is 20 ECTS credits. University has very well established and equipped several laboratories (for histology, microbiology, molecular biology, etc.; equipped with good number of quality microscopes, incubators, freezers, laminar flow hoods, centrifuges, etc.) and library infrastructure, where they can reach high quality scientific data bases through their partner – Istanbul university account. Practical lab works are distributed among different basic disciplines (e.g. histology, immunology, etc.). During the site-visit it we have seen clinical labs where students were also involved in practical/research activities. One 5th year student has already published one paper, and two students won second place prize on international student research conference. University has internal research grant for academic personnel, which supports initiation of research projects within the institution.

During the interview with the Rector, she mentioned the fields of research that he University is working, mainly pharmaco-genetic, stem cells and personalized medicine. These are advanced fields of the medical research and definitely it will bring some excellence to the institution, however it is not clear how students can be involved in that particular projects, therefore we have them feedback, that basic research for students should take priority.

Anatomy sessions have practical classes using cadaver. University just recently introduced cadaver and started its implementation in study process. We have seen partially dissected cadaver during the site-visit.

During the clinical rotations only around half of the time is dedicated to practical work within the clinical disciplines, however program provides clinical practice year (clinical internships) in 11th and 12th semesters, where all major clinical disciplines are covered and time is completely dedicated to practice in clinical environment.

MD program is oriented to develop life-long learning, professionalism, and other important transferal skills. These are utilized via teaching and assessment methods such as for instance PBL and journal club. Students are working with medical portfolio, which among medical competences aims to evaluate student's LLL and personal development. The portfolio was just recently introduced, therefore we could not see long term results, however it can serve as the useful tool for the stimulation and assessment of important transferal competencies.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- MD educational program

- Course syllabi
- University website
- Site-visit nterviews with: Rector, Dean/Head of the program, academic personnel, students

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

- Use of cadaver in anatomy practical classes

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

✓ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.5 Teaching and learning methods

Program is implemented using student centered teaching and learning (SCL) methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course content, student learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

MD educational program of BAU university Batumi uses wide range of teaching and learning methods. Every individual course syllabus has learning outcome map, where link between outcome, teaching method and assessment method is shown. In other words, it demonstrates which teaching methods can facilitate achievement of particular learning outcome from the domains of: knowledge, skills and autonomy and responsibilities. This format gives opportunity to assess correspondence of teaching methodology to learning outcomes as well.
Most of the course syllabi demonstrates following teaching formats: 'lectures', 'seminars', 'teaching in clinical environment' (for clinical components with real patient scenarios) and 'teaching in simulated environment' (for practical components with cadaver or simulated scenarios). For clinical teaching we visited several affiliated hospitals in Batumi. Main base for clinical activities is the multiprofile hospital Medina, which is located in the same campus as university itself. Clinical rotations are diversified in different clinics and mainly linked to the teachers who work there.
For practical teaching we have seen cadaveric lab with one complete cadaver and good facilities for this section and demonstration. Teacher who works with cadaver was trained in Turkey and recruited by the university specifically for the development of the practical course. There were also well-equipped labs in the following specialties: Histology, Biochemistry, microbiology and Pathology (slides). There were several models to be used for clinical examination and skills.
Case based learning is based on PBL and CBL methods which foresees individual and team work activities within the seminars. We have learned, that stuff was recently trained in PBL tutoring.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- MD educational programme
- Course syllabi

- Site-visit observations
- Site-visit interviews with academic and invited personnel

Recommendations:

- The library should contain all the books which are indicated as the obligatory literature.
- The pathology lab should contain macro specimens (pathological parts in jars and not only slides)

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

✓ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.6. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with established procedures. It is transparent and complies with existing legislation.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Student assessment is based on 100 score system. 60 points are allocated to intermediate evaluations and 40 points to final exam. Intermediate evaluation assessment methods used are: written exam, MCQs, Lab work, PBL, CBL, presentation, Mini-CEX, DOPS. These methods are linked with the assessment of different domain LO. Methods such as: oral exam, OSCE, project, written exam are used for final examination. In most syllabi midterm and final evaluations have individual passing thresholds. For formative assessment of student, medical portfolio is used (was implemented only in current semester), which is used not only grading but giving specific feedbacks to students and mentoring. It aims to evaluate students' performance in prolonged time-period assessing following competencies: Medical expertise, patient care, communication, professional attitudes. Students will be assessed from multi source (360) (teacher, patient, nurse). Portfolio can be very successful instrument for the program, but university executes it in paper-based format, which will be absolutely difficult when university will increase the number of students.

University has an electronic examination room with several computer disks (>30) and the integrated PCs protected in a unique way, which looked useful and impressive. This examination center is used for written exams and MCQs. Oral exams are used as final exam of integrated modules. OSCE exam is used in core clinical subjects. We have seen nicely organized 10 OSCE stations prepared for the examination. We have also find out, that university academic staff has been already trained in OSCE planning and managing.

During the site-visit administration mentioned, that their electronic student assessment system does not work properly, due to difficulty with integrated subjects. This is a challenging issue and seems to be ok for now, however university should invest in development of sufficient electronic system for near future, especially if they aim to increase number of students.

Assessment criteria are well described in course syllabi, they are mostly adequate, transparent and legal.
Evidences/indicators ▪ Self-evaluation report ▪ MD educational program ▪ Course syllabi ▪ Site-visit observations ▪ Site-visit interviews with academic personnel
Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development: - It could be useful to use external examiners in particular exams / evaluations - It is important, that by the time university develops electronic system for medical portfolio - It is suggested, that university develops more appropriate electronic student assessment system.
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation ✓ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering	✓			

3. Student achievements and individual work with them

HEI creates student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; programme staff ensures students' familiarity with the named services, organizes various events and fosters students' involvement in local and/or international projects.

3.1. Student support services
Students receive appropriate consultations and support regarding the planning of learning process, improvement of academic achievement, employment and professional development.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The information about admissions, studying process and environment is available at BAU batumi webpage (http://bauinternational.edu.ge/en/future-students). A student is able to receive a consultation and support in planning of an educational process, improvement of academic performance, employment and career development. The workload of academic/scientific/invited/administrative/assisting staff includes hours for student advising. Each student is provided with a personal university email address where he/she receives the information about the educational as well as cultural events and other activities planned at the university. Students are given a general schedule for a semester in the beginning of a semester, while more detailed schedule of the week is given before the week starts. Many invited personal lives in Tbilisi and is able to come to Batumi once per week. Due to this issue, instead of evenly distribution of subject teaching hours for a week, sometimes students have to attend 8 hours of the same subject in one day.

Students are satisfied with the accessibility of the information and support services. The University takes into the consideration students cultural and religious differences and respects them - as indicated by the availability of prayers room and considerate schedule and learning environment during religious events which was highlighted during the interview.

Students are confident that their voice is heard and respected, as evidenced by the action of the administration during several issues:

- Due to a distance from a city center, university is accommodating students with a free transportation to and from the university.
- University helps the freshmen to find a place to stay (sends a renting options to them before even coming to Georgia)
- University changes the lecturers when students complains are reasonable;
- University changes the teaching methodology when students complains are reasonable;

As BAU Batumi is a part of BAU Global network, students have an opportunity to participate in local and international projects, events, conferences and research fellowships; they can also participate in international exchange programmes; Although, during interview , students mentioned that they recieved only a few lectures from Turkish professors, they`d like to increase international involvement in teaching as well as to hear the experience of other countries as well.

Evidences/indicators

- Planned and completed student support services;
- Workload, functions, responsibilities and job descriptions of people conducting student support services;
- Information accessibility;
- Survey results conducted by BAU Batumi;
- Interview results

Recommendations:

- There should be indicated (based on the Georgian law) on what positions its' graduates can work after the completion.

Suggestions for programme development:

- Need for the improvement of the electronic system of the educational process management;
- Need to increase the involvement of international academic or invited personal.

• Need to include students in the self evaluation team. • Need for evenly distributed teaching hours.
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation √ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student supervision
Master's and Doctoral students have qualified thesis supervisors.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements Not applicable because there is no postgraduate studies in this programme
Evidences/indicators
Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development:
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation ☐ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Student achievements and individual work with them	√			

4. Providing teaching resources

Programme human, material, information and financial resources ensure programme sustainability, its effective and efficient functioning, and achievement of intended objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

- Programme staff consists of qualified people who have necessary competences in order to help students achieve programme learning outcomes;
- The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Balance between academic and invited staff ensures programme sustainability;
- The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation;
- Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff of appropriate competence.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

BAU, Batumi staff is engaged in the programme in accordance with existing legislation and internal regulations of higher education institution. Georgian as well as foreign personnel with high academic qualification and vast clinical and teaching experience are involved in realization of the one-cycle higher education programme medicine at BAU. The HEI has developed a Regulatory Document on the Loading of Academic and Invited Personnel which also schematically illustrates the teaching, scientific work, and other activities of academic staff in recruiting academic staff.

The programme is realized by 16 staff members, among them 2 are professors, 5 -associate professors, 5- assistant professors and 4-assistants. In addition, 67 invited professors are involved in the programme realization. It should be noted that both the academic and the invited staff are at the same time the lecturers of other higher education institutions (both local and Tbilisi lecturers), so the teaching process is conducted in their spare time and in some cases an eight-hour lecture per day.

The university has few students at this stage, and there are only a few of them on the clinical rotations, but nevertheless, the student schedule does not follow the weekly workload written in the syllabus due to the lack of lecturers. As the number of students increases, the number of lecturers present and their workload at other universities will endanger the sustainability of the programme.

The qualification of academic staff is proved by scientific papers written during the past 5 years, which proves staff's competence in the relevant field; Each lecturer who is appointed on an academic position possesses PhD academic degree and has experience in developing/realizing the learning courses. the personnel leading clinical educational disciplines have continual clinical practice defined by the sector benchmarks.The qualification of invited staff or teachers is proved by relevant knowledge, experience and competencies necessary in order to help students achieve programme learning outcomes; Although, there were cases where the qualification of staff did not quite match the subject they were teaching. We studied provided human recourses list very carefully and during interview with lecturers, we found out that their name was assigned to the subjects they were not aware of (e.g. course: Internal medicine).

University supports and co-finances scientific trips for the academic and administrative personnel at higher education establishments across of Europe and Asia; Supports scientific work publishing in different scientific journals, offers the university funding opportunities for scientific projects to the academic personnel; Co-finances verbal presentations at international conferences.

Evidences/indicators

- Job descriptions;
- Qualification requirements;
- Personal files of the staff;
- Survey results conducted by HEI;
- Budget
- Interview results.

Recommendations:

- The HEI should present the scheme for workload of the personnel.

Suggestions for programme development:

- Need to more accurate selection of a lecturer and a course they are teaching;
- Need to discuss the future courses with invited lecturers before assigning their name on human recourses list.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements

✓ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

4.2 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff

- HEI conducts the evaluation of programme academic, scientific and invited staff and analysis evaluation results on a regular basis;
- HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The university takes care of the professional development of the staff, and several lecturers have been on the exchange programme at the Bayu University in Turkey. Staff has been trained in OSCE and various teaching methodologies.

BAU Batumi conducts and actively utilizes the evaluation and staff satisfaction survey of the programme staff. The evaluation includes their teaching performance, diversity of teaching habits and research work. Evaluation results are used for the professional improvement of academic, scientific and invited staff and are taken into the consideration when promoting and supporting the staff. University provides material and financial resources to increase the involvement of academic, scientific and invited staff in the scientific and research work and their participation in international projects and conferences.

Evidences/indicators

- The results of the staff evaluation and also the results of staff satisfaction surveys and their utilization in staff management and development;
- Staff statistical data;
- Survey results ;
- Supporting mechanisms for fostering scientific and research work;
- Interview results.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

✓ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

4.3. Material Resources

Programme is provided by necessary infrastructure and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

In BAU International university, Batumi functions Basic subjects are being thought in the main newly renovated building featuring well equipped lecture rooms, computer classes, laboratories, simulation center, the library and rooms for administrative staff.
Library has enough space and comfortable studying environment for all students and has enough printed and electronic recourses for core literature indicated in the programme.
Laboratories are set with modern equipment and reagents, high quality microscopes, each student has the possibility to work and conduct experiments individually with them, there is a wide choice of dry specimen for the microscope with samples of norm as well as pathology.
The Simulation center is equipped with different anatomical models and simulators one cadaver.
Theoretical part of clinical subjects are being though in the main building, while practical part in being held in different affiliated hospitals which are contacted by BAU Batumi.

Evidences/indicators

- Library, material and technical resources;
- Technical equipment – number of students ratio;
- Documents certifying the possession of infrastructure, technical equipment and library resources;
- The core literature indicated in the programme is available at the library;
- Survey results;
- Interview results.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation ✓ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

4.4.Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability
The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to programme needs.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements BAU international University, Batumi conducts only one programme - one-cycle higher education programme medicine. So the income and outcome of budget completely fits the programme`s needs. Main source of income for the university is the students fees, funding from local and international organizations, long-term obligations/loans towards BAU Global subsidiary company. Accorging to agreement, BAU Batumi starts to pay the loan only in 2023, which gives the University the opportunity to completely use the income for university's benefit and development. Part of the loan money was used to construct the new building and the infrastructure development. Budjet of 2019-2024 includes 1181000 GEL for infrastructure development : mostly to equip the simulation center with more simulators, anatomical models , cadavers and to add more educational recourses to the library and laboratories. 669000 GEL is intended for academic and ivited staff education and training.
Evidences/indicators • Funding sources; • budget; • Programme/faculty/school budget; • Interview results.
Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development:
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation ✓ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Providing teaching resources	√			

5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development on a regular basis.

5.1 Internal quality

Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance service(s) available at the higher education institution when planning the process of programme quality assurance, creating assessment instruments, and analysing assessment results. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The University has quality assurance department. Due to the fact that university carries out just one program (one cycle higher education program in medicine) , quality assurance department is focused only on medical program quality management. above mentioned department performs periodic surveys and according to the analyses of survey result executes needed actions. quality assurance is based on the "plan –do – check - act" principle.

During the interview, the head of Qulity Assuarance has demonstrated a very active role. He was accompaned by his new assistant. He seems to be quite expereinced and keen to imporve quality.

It has been found that the medical school has moved to a new location few months ago (Nov 2019) and now they are affiliated to a nearby hospital. I was personally impressed that they managed to settle in this new location in spite of the short period between the new move and the site visit for accreditation. The new location is reasonably good and has campus with free space and gardens with the potential for any further extensions. It also has the required facilities to run undergraduate programme for medicine. Staff responsible for internal quality assurance seems to be in control and they planned the process of programme quality assurance, creating assessment instruments, and analysing assessment results.

The student schedule does not follow the weekly workload written in the syllabus due to the lack of lecturers. As the number of students increases, the number of lecturers present and their workload at other universities will endanger the sustainability of the program.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- Programme objectives
- Website

- Interview results

Recommendations:

The rule of taking the exam second time should be brought to compliance to the existing legislation

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

☐ Complies with requirements

✓ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

5.2 External quality

Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

External quality assurance is performed by National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement according to accreditation standards and plan, as well as by BAU International Turkey staff direct involvement, by taking into consideration their recommendations.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- Website
- Interview results

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

It is advisable to invite experienced faculty at national or international level to act as external quality assurance body

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

✓ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

5.3. Programme monitoring and periodic review

Programme monitoring and periodic review is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematically collecting and analysing information. Assessment results are utilized for programme improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

During the interview we noticed harmony and team working between different personnel both academic and admin. Programme monitoring and periodic review seems to be conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative staff, students.

Taking into the consideration the fact, that academic as well as invited staff is also employed in other universities, it is safe to assume that they constantly share the examples of good practice and the university finds the way to implement it in the medical program. Good example of such practice is involvement of cadavers in teaching process. University managed to change government`s regulatory law and established cadaver-based teaching model in university.

Also, according to lecturers and students recommendations contact hours of Georgian language have been increased.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- Programme objectives
- Website
- Interview results

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

√ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	√			

Enclosed Documentation (If Applicable)

HEI's Name: BAU International University, Batumi

Higher Education Programme Name: Medical Doctor (English) one cycle educational programme

Number of Pages of the Report: 26

Programme's Compliance with the Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1. Programme objectives are clearly defined and achievable; they are consistent with the mission of the HEI and take into consideration labour market demands	√			
2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering	√			
3. Student achievements and individual work with them	√			
4. Providing teaching resources	√			
5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	√			

Expert Panel Chair's

Prof. Mahmoud Hafez

Expert Panel Members' Name, last name, signature

Prof. Khatuna Saganelidze

Prof. Ivane Abiatari

Mrs. Mariam Abuladze