



**NATIONAL CENTER FOR
EDUCATIONAL QUALITY
ENHANCEMENT**

**Accreditation Expert Group Final Report on Cluster of Higher Education
Programmes**

Programme 1: Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Programme 2: Vocational Education (VET), PhD

Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University

Evaluation Date(s): 3-4 November 2022

Report Submission Date:

15 December 2022

Tbilisi

Contents

I. Information on the Cluster of Educational Programmes	4
II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary	5
III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards	10
1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	10
2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering	23
3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them	32
4. Providing Teaching Resources	37
5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	49

Information on the Higher educational Institution

Name of Institution Indicating its Organisational Legal Form	Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, (Legal Entity of Public Law)
Identification Code of Institution	204864548
Type of the Institution	University

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Stéphane Lauwick, Assemblée des directeurs d'IUT (ADIUT), France
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Tamta Lekishvili, LTD East European University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Ketevan Todadze, Ilia State University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Ekaterine Pipia, International Black Sea University
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Sophio Bazadze, LTD European School, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Mariam Aleksidze, Caucasus University, Georgia

I. Information on the Cluster of Educational Programmes

	Programme 1	Programme 2
Name of the educational programme	Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development MA Programme	Vocational Education PhD
Level of higher education	Level 7	Level 8
Qualification to be awarded	MA in Educational Sciences	Ph.D in Educational Sciences
Name and code of the detailed field	Education Science 0111	Education Science 0111
Indication of the right to provide teaching of subject/subjects/group of subjects of the relevant level of general education ¹		
Language of instruction	English	English
Number of ECTS credits	120	35
Programme Status (Accredited/Non-accredited/Conditionally Accredited/New/International Accreditation) Indicating Relevant Decision (number, date)	New	New

¹ In case of Integrated Bachelor's-Master's Teacher Training Educational Programme and Teacher Training Educational Programme

II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary

● General Information on the Cluster of Education Programmes²

Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University's Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences operates two programmes whose objectives are to train high-level specialists in Educational Sciences at MA and Ph.D levels, respectively, with a specific emphasis on Vocational Education and Training (VET). The two programmes have been assessed jointly in a cluster as both have been designed to meet the urgent demand of VET operators in Georgia and the sub-region to increase their ability to design and operate high-quality VET programmes and contribute to the management of those institutions that are relevant to such programmes.

Both programmes evince a very high level of internationalisation as they have been co-designed by specialists of Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University (TSU) and Educational Scientists from the Faculty of Humanities of Otto von Guericke University (OvGU), in Magdeburg, Germany, with a European funding contribution through the Erasmus+ project VoCasian.

The Quality Assurance documentation provided to the experts was abundant, relevant and up-to-date. Taking into account the time constraints, it was provided in a timely fashion by the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement. The seminal documents were available both in Georgian and English, thus providing experts with a generally good vision of both programmes.

Experts were given the opportunity to interview the whole range of stakeholders of the cluster, including top university management, course designers, internal and external stakeholders and students. The library was available for a visit by experts.

● Overview of the Accreditation Site Visit

The site visit took place on 3 and 4 November 2022 in a hybrid format due to the international nature of the programmes. Georgian experts were able to be present at the University. German partners, as well as some interviewees, were met thanks to a Zoom link provided by the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement (NCEQE). The chair of the expert group was connected via the same Zoom link.

On 1 November, the expert panel held a preparatory meeting with the representative of the National Centre for Educational Quality Enhancement. During this meeting, the necessary issues related to the evaluation were discussed and sufficiently clarified. The work of the panel went well. It was effectively supported by the representative of the NCEQE, who was physically present at the university. Efficient interpretation was provided.

The panel and, specifically, the chair express their heartfelt thanks to all involved in the preparation of the evaluation and the site visit. Thanks must also go to the representatives of NCEQE for their smooth and flawless organisation. The report was written by the whole team and several online meetings were

² When providing general information related to the programme, it is appropriate to also present the quantitative data analysis of the educational programme.

organised to make sure general consensus on comments and assessments was reached. The chair of the panel thanks the whole team for their active and efficient participation.

● **Brief Overview of Education Programme Compliance with the Standards**

<p style="text-align: center;">Standard 1</p> <p>Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme</p>	<p>Complies with requirements</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Standard 2</p> <p>Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering</p>	<p>Complies with requirements</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Standard 3</p> <p>Student Achievements, Individual Work with them</p>	<p>Complies with requirements</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Standard 4</p> <p>Providing Teaching Resources</p>	<p>Complies with requirements</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Standard 5</p> <p>Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities</p>	<p>Complies with requirements</p>

● **Recommendations**

Both programmes in the cluster evince a very high degree of compliance with requirements. A limited number of recommendations were made by the panel. They suggest the programme designers and operators should:

- Provide a better view of assessment criteria used in some syllabi;
- Consider rethinking their policy of including attendance (in some courses) in the marks given to students;
- Adjust the Human Resource Management course objectives to the course content;
- Make it clear how research proposals are assessed in the admission phase;
- Improve the degree of involvement of the academic staff in the process of programme development and assessment as in some interviews leaders of the courses found it difficult to relate the course learning outcomes to the overall programme learning outcomes.

● **Suggestions for the Programmes' Development**

Both programmes appear very carefully thought out, designed and constructed. The University provides a clear, relevant and healthy quality environment. As such, it is suggested that both programmes should keep operating on the positive bases that led to their development: powerful link with research, internationalisation of research and teaching and learning. Funding seems assured for the short- and middle-term.

Any increase in the number of students should be weighed against the staff available in Georgia and internationally, specifically the number of thesis supervisors.

It would be advised to use the outcomes of the students' work in research publications. Similarly, careful graduate tracking should allow all stakeholders to monitor the impact that they have on the ecosystem. Specific attention could be drawn on their impact in the sub-region (i.e. outside of Georgia)

to assess the potential role of the cluster as a regional leader. This could be strengthened by involving graduates in research, as well as teaching or mentoring future students.

The Panel made a suggestion which was addressed specifically to the University, not to the cluster or its programmes:

- It is suggested that the University should create a support mechanism aimed at detecting, and supporting students in their Ph.D work.

Secondly, the Panel made the following suggestions concerning the MA programme:

- it could be helpful to students to move the module on inclusivity and SEN learners to the compulsory component of the course;

- the Panel invites course designers to further highlight the promotion of scientific integrity in the programme's objectives;

- It would be better if the possible topics or questions for admission interviews and relevant evaluation criteria were published on the website;

- it would be advisable for the assessment methodology to cater for a greater diversity of abilities by including different types of assessment methods, such as oral assessments, to enable learners with different abilities and competences to perform equally;

Finally, concerning the Ph.D programme:

- the Panel suggests it would be better to get clear information regarding the number of supervisors and the number of students enrolled;

- it could be advisable to have "VET Teaching and Learning Methods" as a prerequisite to "Assistantship" and move it from the elective to the compulsory learning component;

- It would be better if the University published assessment criteria for research proposals and interviews with Ph.D candidates.

● **Brief Overview of the Best Practices (if applicable)³**

The panel especially commends course designers and the University for the following :

- The cluster is creating an ecosystem that is relevant to the nation and the region by making use of a holistic quality assurance approach that combines demanding internal assessment mechanisms akin to a self-accreditation process. This includes the reasoned study of indicators, a peer review by international experts and the involvement of stakeholders;

- Both programmes' curricula and syllabi are the fruit of a major, long-term, scientific cooperation between international experts;

- The body of preliminary scientific, high-quality research involved in the creation of the cluster is exceptionally high so that both programmes can be viewed as the fruit of up-to-the-minute fundamental and applied research;

- The Ph.D. programme delivery has adopted a co-teaching system which involves international specialists and Georgian scholars and results in efficient and successful cross-breeding for the benefit of students, the University and the region.

³ A practice that is exceptionally effective and that can serve as a benchmark or example for other educational programme/programmes.

- **In case of re-accreditation, it is important to provide a brief overview of the achievements and/or the progress (if applicable) N/A**
- **Information on Sharing or Not Sharing the Argumentative Position of the HEI**

Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University has been informed of the contents of the accreditation expert group's draft report and communicated to the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement that it fully shared the recommendations presented in the draft report. No further remarks or observations were made.

Evaluation approaches for the accreditation experts:

The components of the accreditation standards are evaluated using the following two approaches:

1. Cluster and individual evaluation⁴
2. Cluster evaluation⁵

Standard/Component	Assessment approaches
1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	
1.1. Programme Objectives	Cluster and individual
1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster and individual
1.3. Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster
1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	Cluster and individual
1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Cluster and individual
2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering	
2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions	Cluster and individual
2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills	Cluster
2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods	Cluster
2.4. Student Evaluation	Cluster
3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	
3.1. Student Consulting and Support Services	Cluster
3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Cluster
4. Providing Teaching Resources	
4.1. Human Resources	Cluster and individual

⁴ **Evaluation Approaches:** Describe, analyse, and evaluate the compliance of each educational programme grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the corresponding component of the standard. Also, you can specify information about an educational programme that is different from the common and basic characteristics of educational programmes grouped in the cluster.

⁵ **Assessment approaches: In case of necessity,** describe, analyse and evaluate compliance of each education programme in the cluster with the requirements of this component of the standard. Also, you can indicate the information on the education programme, distinguished from the general and major characteristics of the education programmes in a cluster.

4.2. Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students	Cluster and individual
4.3. Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff	Cluster
4.4. Material Resources	Cluster and individual
4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability	Cluster and individual
5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	
5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.2. External Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review	Cluster

III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the programme. The content and consistent structure of the programme ensure the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

Educational programmes grouped in a cluster are logically interrelated to each other in line with the study fields and evolve according to the respective levels of higher education.

1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level and an educational programme, and define the set of knowledge, skills and competences a programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the programme to the development of the field and society.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Both programmes have been developed together in a logical suite. They are the fruit of the University's strategic ambition of responding to the needs of the stakeholders by providing highly educated professionals for the development of a quality VET education in the nation and beyond. The design of both programmes has followed the same methodology: an analysis of the demand for highly trained VET experts in Georgia was first performed; the University pooled the resources of its Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences; sought the expert collaboration of Otto von Guericke University's Faculty of Humanities by participating in an Erasmus+ project which delivered the learning outcomes for the two programmes.

Both programmes have come to fruition using the outcomes of research in educational sciences provided by both universities. Course designers from both universities are all steeped in the latest research in the field of educational sciences. External evaluators are satisfied that, complying with its mission, the University has strategically contributed to creating a research-based ecosystem that aims at developing the VET solutions the country needs.

The two programmes are therefore linked and avail the University with a staggered strategy to meet the needs of stakeholders. As such, the group of programmes constitutes a logical evaluation cluster.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

The University must be commended for providing extensive documentation in English as well as in Georgian for the MA Programme. This appears sufficient to assess the general organisation of the programme, its learning outcomes and, more generally its intents and purposes.

The syllabi evince a wide-reaching and comprehensive approach that includes all aspects of VET, VET institution management and course design. Altogether, candidates are presented with the necessary resources to advance their comprehension of the subject in general. The documentation is clear.

Course designers have placed educational science at the forefront of the programme. In the mandatory part of the curriculum, students are presented with solid theoretical background knowledge. Subjects range from the theory of pedagogy, learning and teaching, to an advanced reflection on lifelong learning, E-learning. While the main concepts and debates on VET are highlighted, students are also presented with the interests of the stakeholders of VET, national and international contexts. Aptly, the programme provides courses on communication, personal development as well as an introduction to such practical know-how as budgeting and fundraising, and aims at training graduates to work in an agile, adaptable and creative manner.

In keeping with the international-minded, research-based approach of the cluster, the programme equips students with the necessary methodology to undertake their own research-informed learning: critical thinking, independent study and creative management are emphasised.

The programme has also been viewed by its designers as a way to feed new talent and competencies to Georgia's VET landscape. For example, it will contribute to the creation of a platform for the exchange of human resources and employers working in the field.

Evidences/Indicator

- SER
- Strategic Development Plan of Tbilisi State University
- The World Bank: Workforce Skills in the Eyes of the Employers
- Programme and syllabi (all annexes, including mandatory and elective courses)
- SER, Annex 11 – Questionnaire for employers
- Joint Higher Education Programmes
- Cooperation Agreement between OvGU and TSU
- Interview with University Management
- Doctoral an MA Thesis Regulatory Documents (in Georgian for MA)

Vocational Education (VET), PhD

Description and Analysis

The Ph.D programme could be seen as a logical continuation of the MA, yet it has clearly been designed to have its own justification and independence. It must be stressed that although the two programmes are evaluated in a cluster, their own identity and validity are evident from the start.

The Ph.D rightly has a wider scope and concerns itself with the advancement of research while including a sizable teaching and learning component (rated at 65 ECTS, of which 10 are electives). Although the University has no doctoral school as such, the programme makes it possible for doctoral candidates to achieve learning in subjects related to research methodologies and regional background. Its admission criteria also include the provision that candidates not holding a Master's degree should have validated significant experience (3 years) in the field. The programme is therefore given a threefold mission: furthering the production and use of up-to-date research, equipping practising

citizens with the latest knowledge and responding to the demands of the country and sub-region. The programme thus has a commendable lifelong learning mission.

It is a remarkably ambitious programme for which designers have spared no effort in internationalisation. It certainly complies with the mission of the University to provide excellent and meaningful quality programmes.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation ⁶

Component 1.1 — Programme Objectives	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies the requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

⁶ Evaluation is performed for each programme separately.

1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes

- The learning outcomes of the programme are logically related to the programme objectives and the specificity of the field of study.
 - Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or sense of responsibility and autonomy which students gain upon completion of the programme.
-

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Both programmes have been ascribed a list of learning outcomes. Course designers have however taken two differing paths for both programmes in the cluster. The MA has a set of 4 outcomes, while the Doctoral programme presents its outcomes as a list of knowledge elements, know-how or skills, and autonomy and responsibility. Strangely, target competencies seem to be just an element in the programme's learning outcomes. This panel takes the view that competencies are overarching elements; knowledge, theory, know-how, skills and attitudes all contribute to building the competencies that graduates should eventually obtain from following the course.

While the learning outcomes of the MA seem to correspond to the positioning of the programme at Level 7 in both European and Georgian Qualification Frameworks, it is somewhat puzzling that the Ph.D should take an altogether different tack without providing any explanation for that choice.

The panel takes the view that both cluster relevance and the Doctoral programme's positioning would gain by using a unified approach.

Finally, although in interviews all actors have stressed their objective of preparing graduates to respond to the future needs of VET, the panel takes the view that some guidance should be provided in the documentation available to teachers and generally actors and stakeholders of both programmes to share the academic team's view of how they can all contribute to "future proof" them. Once again, the objective is clear: it would be helpful if researchers principally, and actors generally, shared their vision of what are the "future skills" needed and how, in the face of that difficult task, that objective can be met.

The benchmarks used by both programmes are clearly spelt out.

Finally, it must be noted that doctoral students in related fields are invited to teach in the MA and Ph.D programmes, thus giving young researchers the opportunity to get first-hand experience in high-level teaching.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

The set of four overarching outcomes correspond to a Level 7 programme and correspond to the relevant Dublin Descriptors. The SER as well as the interviews with the various stakeholders and designers of the programme, have emphasised their use of the outcomes of the latest research-

informed thinking applied to all contexts. Communication, an opening on group dynamics and other soft skills are included in the programme. The MA thesis writing is a major undertaking that trains learners in developing their self-directed learning skills. This important work can be carried out with the German partner university in Magdeburg.

The course has been adapted to take into account new, post-pandemic teaching methods: an introduction to the issues of e-learning has been added, showing the ability of programme designers to adapt to fast-changing conditions.

Although in interviews with students as well as other actors it seems that modern issues like inclusion and diversity are satisfactorily taken into account, it may be regretted that the module on inclusivity and SEN learners is only an elective as VET education has to face the same challenges as other sectors, if only because of its proximity to the world of work.

Vocational Education (VET), PhD

Description and Analysis

The documentation provided is complete, especially the 106-page *PhD Programme, Vocational Education, 2022*. The learning outcomes for the programme are clearly listed and accurately listed as a set of knowledge, skills, and autonomy and responsibility. Indeed, the link with research, its use in the definition of the programme's contents as well as its advancement, and the indispensable internationalisation of graduates are correctly taken into account. To anticipate the next evaluation, the panel suggest observing the graduates as recognised agents of innovation who are able to "extend the frontier of knowledge" by using "new and complex ideas" [Dublin Descriptors, 2005] nationally and internationally in order to analyse the impact of the programme.

Also, taking stock of the present context of increased questioning of scientific values and the worldwide challenge posed by so-called "alternative truth" movements and policies, the panel invites course designers to further highlight the promotion of scientific integrity in the programme's objectives and show how the programme provides active training for these future teachers, trainers or VET managers on promoting – indeed defending – democratic values.

Evidences/Indicators

- SER
- Interviews with programme designers
- PhD Programme, Vocational Education, 2022
- Course documentation, especially all syllabi

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s): N/A

Suggestion(s) : N/A

Vocational Education (VET), PhD

Recommendation(s): N/A

Suggestion(s): The panel invites course designers to further highlight the promotion of scientific integrity in the programme's objectives.

Evaluation

Component 1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), PhD	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes

- Evaluation mechanisms of the programme learning outcomes are defined. The programme learning outcomes assessment process consists of defining, collecting and analysing data necessary to measure learning outcomes.
- Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilised for the improvement of the programme.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The SER shows the matrices used to evaluate both programmes. They cross-reference learning outcomes and courses taught. This traditional approach is useful to guide teachers in defining their course contents and evaluation. The SER rightly points to the need of training staff in using learning outcome assessment to improve the process of course design.

The assessment of both programmes' learning outcomes will be used to improve the programmes themselves. In this evaluation, being the first one carried out, the mechanisms and tools involved have not been described, although the SER states that the University's Quality Assurance intends to develop

a specific tool to do so in the framework of the HERD project, an Erasmus+ funded project operated by the university with international partners and the National Science Foundation (LEPL).

This evaluation being the first for the cluster, important information concerning students' employment, type of contracts and missions has not been collected yet.

Specific benchmarks have been used consistently for both programmes: the so-called Salzburg II recommendations published by the EUA under the auspices of the EHEA concern the Ph.D. programme, while the MA makes relevant use of UNESCO's UNIVOC reference for course designers.

The SER provides a description of the methodology, frequency and staff involved for the future appraisal of the programmes (every year) and the contents themselves (every semester). In both cases, the students' feedback is taken into account.

Student evaluation is carefully organised, described and communicated to students in each course syllabus under the heading Assessment system. Various forms of formative and summative evaluation methods are used.

According to the SER, attendance is registered in the electronic journal and communicated to the students. Attendance as a separate assessment component was detected in the course "Effective Communication & Group Dynamics, Inclusion in TVET": "*Attendance (total 5 points): 0 attendance - 0 points; 1 - 2 attendance: 1-2; 3 - 5 attendance: 3; 6 – 8 attendance: 4; 9-10 attendance: 5*" Although attendance is limited to 5 points (out of 100) the Panel finds that this practice contradicts the legal disposition of Order n° 3 of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia. The panel generally takes the view that attendance should not be separately evaluated as an assessment component as it cannot be said to correspond to a learning outcome (or component of it). While recognising the importance for students to attend all taught classes, the assessment of attendance and its translation into marks or grades might be viewed as discriminatory by students who cannot attend all classes for social, pecuniary or health reasons, especially in the context of a programme that has a high number of taught hours. The panel recommends finding innovative ways of encouraging students to attend all classes without including attendance in the final marks.

The syllabi generally indicate the assessment ranges used. The panel noted that some of them could be narrower, the better to guide students.

The writing of a thesis (MA-thesis, Doctoral thesis) is a major undertaking for each programme and a substantial piece of formative assessment, including for the MA. The panel was able to sample some of the students' work for their theses. The Quality Assurance service and the faculty publish the necessary documentation to offer students sufficient guidance; this was confirmed during interviews. The subjects which the panel has been able to see show the wide-reaching scope of the work done, involving as it does concrete and general reflections on local and international subject-matter.

The University provides a clearly-defined programme planning mechanism for course designers. It ensures that all programme creators at TSU can use guidelines and the corresponding tools to create, design, implement and quality assure courses. These recommendations provide a framework for implementing a methodology of continuous improvement that includes students and graduate surveys in order to evaluate the courses, their learning outcomes and their delivery modes. Similarly, the University has issued clear guidelines for the improvement of programmes.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

While the communication on assessment criteria is generally clear, some syllabi do not give a clear-cut or full view of the criteria used. The panel recommends that these instances be amended. In addition, the panel noted that the assessment methodology in the majority of the syllabi for the MA programme checked only written competences: it would be advisable to cater for a greater diversity of abilities by including different types of assessment methods to enable all the learners with different abilities/competences perform equally.

Evidences/Indicators

- SER
- Documentation provided by the QA service
- The Programme Planning and Elaboration, notably Annexes 9 to 14
- Procedures for planning, elaboration, assessment and development of educational programs
- Direct evaluation of program learning outcomes
- Interviews with programme designers
- All course syllabi
- Order N3 of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia, 5 January 5, 2007

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s): - The panel recommends that all syllabi give a full view of assessment criteria used.

- The panel recommends not to include attendance as an assessment component.

Suggestion(s): It would be advisable to include different types of assessment methods to enable learners with different abilities and competences to perform equally.

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

1.4. Structure and Content of Educational Programme

- The programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes.
- The programme structure is consistent and logical. The content and structure ensure the achievement of the programme learning outcomes. The qualification to be awarded is corresponding to the programme content and learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The cluster has benefitted from a very careful design methodology: the documents offered by the University through its quality assurance service and the Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences are very clear and provide excellent guidance for the creation of new programmes. In addition, the proof of the needs for training in the field of VET management, course design and teaching at both MA and Ph.D level are abundantly supplied.

The curricula are inspired by research and firmly planted in an international outlook, which is very relevant to an MA course and even more so to a Ph.D.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

The MA programme is developed in line with university rules relative to second-level higher education programmes. Its components (the courses) are well described.

The structure of the MA is the fruit of far-reaching cooperation between the University and experts from Otto Von Guericke University in Germany. The latest research and international experience and cooperation have been used to design the programme. UNESCO's UNIVOC expertise, relayed by the German experts, suggest the latest issues of VET are covered which leads to a fairly intensive programme. In interviews, students expressed their satisfaction concerning both the objectives and the realisation of the courses.

The programme's structure appears logical and fit-for-purpose. The panel would however advise to move the module on inclusivity and SEN learners to the compulsory component of the course as it feels all educators should be able to address the diverse needs of all learners.

At the end of each course, teachers calculate the workload given to students. The panel noted that although the quantity of taught hours seemed appropriate to the programme and the level, any further addition should be carried out taking into account the need for students to keep enough time for personal study, reflection and work on their theses.

Vocational Education (VET), PhD

Description and Analysis

Just like the MA, the Ph.D programme is the fruit of a rich, far reaching international collaboration. The University is well equipped to create such high-level courses and provides the necessary framework for a quality Ph.D programme to be developed.

The structure of the programme is balanced and logical for a Ph.D programme : research takes up a lot of the students' time and effort, yet course designers have maintained a taught component that equips students with a wide complement of knowledge and skills. The progression in the course design appeared logical although the Panel suggested that the course "VET Teaching and Learning Methods" could be used as a prerequisite to "Assistantship." It could therefore be chosen to move it from the elective to the compulsory learning component.

In interviews with doctoral students, the panel noted that a number of candidates (those students with suspended status) had undertaken their course up to 10 years ago. The length of their study raises the question of whether they are active or not in the course, and most importantly, if they have ways of keeping abreast of the latest developments in their research field, failing which their work (past, present and potentially future) runs the risk of losing its innovative value. The panel thought that as they were included in the interviews, they were deemed relevant to the programme. It is therefore suggested that the University –not the programmes or the faculty– should create a support mechanism aimed at detecting, then supporting lagging students to ensure that all of them are able to complete their work. That issue could be advanced in the current reflection about the creation of a doctoral school at university level.

Evidences/Indicators

- SER
- Documentation provided by the University through its QA service, notably
- Programme Planning and Elaboration documents, especially Annexes 1, 3, 4 and 5
- Peer Review of the Educational Programme
- Interviews

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestion of the cluster:

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s): The panel would advise to move the module on inclusivity and SEN learners to the compulsory component of the course.

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s): N/A

Suggestion(s): - It could be advisable to have “VET Teaching and Learning Methods” as a prerequisite to “Assistantship” and move it from the elective to the compulsory learning component.

- The University could create a support mechanism aimed at detecting, and supporting students in their Ph.D work

Evaluation

Component 1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

1.5. Academic Course/Subject

- The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject.
- The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.
- The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

For both programmes, the content of courses and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the target learning outcomes. Syllabi generally include a high number of bibliographic references. The

documents relative to the cluster are detailed, carefully given in a readily-accessible format and provide the necessary guidance to students and invited teachers and researchers.

There are more invited teacher-researchers than TSU staff for the cluster. In the cooperation arrangement between OcGU and TSU, German specialists give a high number of lectures thus creating a kind of Georgian-German twinning, a transfer of know-how for the programme tuition. This is important for the future of both MA and Ph.D as such cooperation, though in this case based on very solid roots, may diminish as new forms of funding are sought.

Quite realistically, both programmes include provisions for work-based experience: two internships for the MA, an assistantship for the Ph.D. Moreover, the programmes supplement their compulsory modules with a number of electives for 10 ECTS.

Logically, the research component of the Ph.D. has no ECTS.

Panel members have found both programmes to be logically organised; it seems students find it easy to situate themselves in the learning process. As such, the QA of both course designs promote success.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

Mandatory courses constitute half of the workload; they are split into basic and advanced studies to create a logical progression throughout the two-year Master's programme. In addition, students are given work experience through two internships that are well described in the documentation.

In keeping with the objective of training students for research, an MA thesis is valued at 20 ECTS. Documentation is also provided for. The panel views the MA thesis as relevant to the Master's role in participating in the regional and national development of VET in Georgia. In the sample subjects given to the panel, the panel found a good balance between regional issues and wider reflections. In all, 35 ECTS out of 120 allow work-based learning and practical opening to the issues of VET.

Evidence of programme monitoring has been found in the adaptation of the programme to novel post-pandemic learning practices and methodologies through the inclusion of a course on e-learning.

The "Human Resource Management" course objectives refer only to quality assurance issues aimed at *"provid[ing] the student with in-depth knowledge of the basic provisions of quality assurance in TVET: concepts, terms, national and international accreditation standards, assessment tools, processes, procedures and methodology. The course should help students understand what a quality culture is and how it can be established in vocational educational institutions"*. The same objectives are noted in "Quality Assurance in TVET". In this instance, it is recommended that authors align course objectives and course content.

Vocational Education (VET), PhD

Description and Analysis

The course component is limited to 35 ECTS, out of which 25 ECTS are allocated for compulsory courses and 10 ECTS for an elective component, thus allowing students to concentrate on the research component of their Ph.D. There is some lack of clarity due to a misprint on page 3 of the document *PHD Programme*: while Mandatory courses are given for 25 ECTS, the list of these mandatory courses totals 35 ECTS. Part of the evaluation is provided by the presentation of 2 (or 3, according to one interview) papers linked to the student’s doctoral subject.

Evidences/Indicators

- SER
- PhD Programme, Vocational Education, 2022
- Documentation on courses: syllabi
- Interviews with students

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s): It is recommended to adjust the Human Resource Management course objectives to the course content.

Suggestion(s): N/A

Vocational Education (VET), PhD

Recommendation(s): N/A

Suggestion(s): N/A

Evaluation

Component 1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering

Prerequisites for admission to the programme, teaching-learning methods and student assessment consider the specificity of the study field, level requirements, student needs, and ensure the engagement achievement of the objectives and expected learning outcomes of the programme.

2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions

The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programme to achieve learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Prerequisites for admission to programmes grouped in a cluster are defined according to the legislation of Georgia and *The regulatory rules of the university activity and educational process of Tbilisi State University*.

Tbilisi State University has defined procedures for planning, elaboration, assessment and development of educational programmes. There are regulations governing the study process, which also outline the procedures for admission at TSU for Georgian and foreign citizens and the student mobility rules.

The University has an *Educational Programmes Catalogue*, which is published on the university website. It includes information regarding admission preconditions for each of the programmes. It should be mentioned that the University website is undergoing some changes so part of the documents, for example, admission preconditions, are accessible only in the old version of the website. As soon as the updated website www.tsu.ge is ready, the updated programme catalogue will be public and accessible.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

Applicants to the Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development MA program must hold a Bachelor's degree in any field of study. They should pass the Unified Master's Examination Type B. They should provide proof of mastery of the English language at B2 level by the university-organised exam or an internationally recognized certificate.

The University organises admission interviews for successful candidates. This interview is supposed to check the applicants' motivation, their leadership and interpersonal skills. The possible interview questions and evaluation criteria are not accessible on the website yet.

As the programme is jointly taught by German lecturers, preference will be given to the candidates with German language skills.

The citizens of foreign countries are able to obtain student status without sitting for the unified national exams based on the rules established by the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia. Students from other higher education institutions can be admitted to the program based on mobility rules following the legislation of Georgia and the University's student mobility rules.

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Description and Analysis

Vocational Education PhD programme applicants must hold a Master's degree or an equivalent qualification in any field. They should prove their knowledge of English at C1 level by the university examination or internationally-recognized certificate (TOEFL IBT 110; IELTS 7,0). Those candidates whose Master's degree is in any field other than education should have minimum 3 years' experience in the field of Vocational Education and Training.

All applicants should present their CV and a two-page motivation letter, which will reveal the applicant's areas of interest as well as their scientific goals, and will explain the reasons for studying at the PhD program. Applicants should also present a recommendation letter from the Head of Programme and obtain the doctoral dissertation scientific supervisor's consent. These are gained after the applicant presents his or her Research proposal or Vision for the development of the research topic in writing.

Thus, the prerequisites for admission to the programme are logical and correspond to the content and expected learning outcomes of the programme.

Evidences/Indicators

- Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA
- Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D
- Procedures for planning, elaboration, assessment and development of educational programmes
- Minimal doctoral standards
- Student mobility rules and procedures
- University website www.tsu.ge
- Self-assessment report of accreditation of educational programmes grouped in a cluster

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s): N/A

Suggestion(s): It would be better if the University would publish the possible topics or questions for an admission interview and its evaluation criteria on the website.

Vocational Education, VET, Ph.D

Recommendation(s): The University should make it clear how research proposals are assessed in the admission phase.

Suggestion(s): It would be better if the University published assessment criteria for research proposals and interviews with Ph.D candidates

Evaluation

Component 2.1 Programme admission preconditions	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills

The programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/ creative/performing and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The development of students' research and practical skills is crucial to both programmes. There are several courses in the programmes contributing to achieve these skills. In order to develop research skills in accordance with the learning outcomes of the courses, a meaningful ratio of theoretical learning and practical work is provided in the course syllabi.

Research topics will be defined according to the needs of the market. As was clearly seen during the interviews, all of the stakeholders, TVET institutions, employers and VET scientists are eager to offer research topics to the students, so the programmes make it possible to develop the students' practical and research skills. The relevant syllabi describe the activities and projects that the students (either individually or in 4-5-student groups) must complete.

The university has signed memorandums with VET organisations who are eager to cooperate and provide the students with research projects and practical tasks. As was made clear during the interviews, the stakeholders are actively involved in discussing the possible research areas and practical activities. This was confirmed during the interviews with stakeholders.

The programme has developed a co-teaching system together with the specialists from the University of Magdeburg, so the students will benefit from this diverse teaching atmosphere too. This will also enhance the quality of research, diversify research interests, immerse students in the international scientific space, and facilitate the creation and introduction of new knowledge in the field. Students from other Ph.D programmes mentioned during the interviews that they had the opportunity to meet German students and discuss each other's research interests.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

The Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development Master's programme goals are to train researchers, leaders and practitioners. The programme's learning outcomes state that the graduates will be able to independently conduct research in the fields of TVET and human resource development.

The scientific research component of the program is very well developed. It includes the courses "Research methodology 1", 5 credits, "Research methodology 2", 5 credits, "SPSS", 5 credits, "Educational Laboratory", 5 credits, "Internship per research (MA thesis) interest", 10 credits, and "Master's Thesis", 20 credits.

During the course "Educational Laboratory", students are required to work in groups and conduct research, prepare policy documents, analytical documents, and other products for their selected project. Thus, they will gain first-hand experience working in real-life situations.

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Description and Analysis

The Vocational Education Ph.D programme's goals include the training of researchers who will: research challenges and analyse the relevant needs of the VET sector based on the scholarly knowledge of the field of education sciences; create innovative scholarly products based on the analysis and synthesis of the latest scientific achievements in the field of education sciences.

To achieve the learning outcomes of the Vocational Education Ph.D programme, various educational activities are planned in the course syllabi. Mandatory courses include "Research methods and methodology in VET education 1", 5 credits, and "Research methods and methodology in VET education 2", 5 credits.

The development of the student's research skills is facilitated by the scientific-research component of the programme. This component includes "Research project 1", "Research project 2", and "Ph.D Thesis".

The Ph.D Programme's goals also include the training of specialists who should: engage in academic and scholarly activity on the international level in the field of VET and education sciences; effectively manage the learning process in VET providers on the fundamental knowledge of the regularities of the teaching-learning process; manage the teaching process efficiently in vocational and higher education based on the fundamental knowledge of the regularities of the teaching-learning process.

Ph.D students have a 5-credit mandatory course of "Assistantship". During the period of assistantship, the students have to perform various activities such as leading seminars, lecturing, evaluating students' work, or supervising bachelor theses. The student learns to manage the teaching and learning process. This assistantship hones his / her practical and academic skills.

Evidences/Indicators

- Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA
- Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D
- Support letters from Magdeburg University
- Programme self-evaluation document
- Interview with people involved in the development and implementation of the programme
- Interview with stakeholders and Ph.D students.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):**Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D****Recommendation(s):****Suggestion(s):****Evaluation**

Component 2.2. The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/ performing and transferable skills	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), PhD	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods

The programme is implemented by using student-centred teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

Cluster and individual evaluation**Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component**

The programmes in the cluster are implemented using student-centred teaching and learning methods. It was mentioned during the interviews that the use of problem-based learning (PBL) is planned in all of the courses of the programmes. Most student assignments will concern real-life problems provided by stakeholders to enable hands-on research within the Master's and Ph.D programmes.

The 28 programme provides a list of various teaching/learning and research methods. However, teaching and learning methods are not uniform in the syllabi. Teaching methods are chosen in courses taking into account the course learning outcomes and content. The lecturer has the academic freedom to determine the methods and activities necessary to achieve the learning outcomes.

The programme description states that the Socratic method will be used in teaching and learning. The following methods and activities are mainly used in various courses: case-based learning (CBL), problem-based learning (PBL); brainstorming; discussion and debates; working in teams; independent work; analysis and synthesis; practical tasks (oral and written); role activities; demonstration and explanation; methods of induction and deduction.

Most of the course syllabi show the use of interactive teaching methods, which ensure student engagement. Case-based learning (CBL) is an active teaching method that is included in many courses. Also, the programme description states that flipped classrooms will be intensively used throughout the program.

The above-mentioned methods are student-oriented and correspond to the content of the courses and the learning outcomes.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Evidences/Indicators

- Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA
- Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D
- Syllabi
- Programme self-evaluation document
- Interviews with academic staff, students, graduates

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 2.3. Teaching and learning methods	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
-------------------------------------	---	--------------------------	--------------------------	--------------------------

2.4. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

For each programme, a student evaluation system is set up and each syllabus describes the evaluation method and form used; the teaching methods are made clear and are adapted to the learning outcomes of the course. The evaluation of learning outcomes is made easier for teachers and students alike as teaching methods are adapted to each course's objective. The evaluation system is approved by Order N3 of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia dated January 5, 2007 and the student's learning results and achievements are evaluated accordingly.

The educational programmes include two assessment forms –intermediate (one-time or multiple) and final assessment, the sum of which represents the final assessment (100 points). The assessment component integrates different assessment methods (test, essay/essay, demonstration, presentation, discussion, the performance of practical/theoretical tasks, working in a working group, role-playing technology, participation in discussions, etc.)

During their interview, academic staff mentioned that each evaluation form and component had a specific share in the final evaluation from the total evaluation score (100 points), which is reflected in the specific syllabus and is communicated to students at the beginning of the academic semester. Each professor decides how to distribute the points according to the components, depending on the different activities and the specifics of the subject.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Students confirmed that a Master's thesis is mandatory and has a significant role in summing up the knowledge acquired, and that they use it in their research. The master's thesis will be evaluated according to the faculty regulations of thesis defence. The commission will assess the paper with a number of criteria and according to the system of evaluation.

The criteria are:

- topicality of the issue;
- novelty of the research;
- theoretical-methodological relevance;
- logic and argumentation;
- adequate interpretation;
- relevance of the conclusions to the obtained results;
- set goal and research tasks, transparency/clarity of the text, text structure, academic citation style.

The evaluation system allows for five types of positive evaluations:

- a) (A) Friadi -91-100 evaluation points;
- b) (B) Very good -81-90 points of the maximum assessment;
- c) (C) Good -71-80 points of the maximum assessment;
- d) (D) Satisfactory -61-70 points of the maximum assessment;
- e) (E) Sufficient -51-60 points of the maximum assessment.

And two types of negative grades:

- f) (FX) Failed -maximum grade 41-50
- g) (F) Failed -maximum grade 40 points and less

Specific questions were directed to the students on the issue of attendance evaluation: during the interview, students mentioned that they really appreciate this practice because they consider it not so much as the evaluation of their attendance but as an evaluation of how active they are during the sessions.

Ph.D programme - Vocational Education

The knowledge of Ph.D students is evaluated by a 100 points system, provided below, where the minimum evaluation equals 51 points. The evaluation is within a range of 60 points (31 points is considered to be a positive evaluation), whereas the seminar presentation is evaluated within a range of 40 points (20 points is considered to be a positive evaluation), on the basis of predetermined criteria. Ph.D students are strictly requested to publish two scientific-research projects, which are an integral part of the research towards their Ph.D dissertation.

The dissertation is evaluated anonymously by the members of the Thesis Defence Commission with a 100-point system. For the final evaluation of the dissertation, the commission for the calculation of the ballots of the Thesis Defence Commission calculates a mean arithmetic score based on 100 points, which will be compared with the Latin evaluation according to a clear and relevant scheme that ranges from “summa cum laude” (excellent) to “sub omni canone” (completely unsatisfactory) in increments of 10 points. The evaluation is deemed positive if it is over 51 points.

Evidences/Indicators

- Interview with MA and PhD students
- MA Programme and Curriculum
- Ph.D Programme, VET
- Programme supervisor
- Statute of the Dissertation Council
- Order N3 of The Minister of Education and Science of Georgia

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 2.-4 - Student evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), PhD	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them

The programme ensures the creation of a student-centred environment by providing students with relevant services; promotes maximum student awareness, implements a variety of activities and facilitates student engagement in local and / or international projects; proper quality of scientific guidance and supervision is

provided for master's and doctoral students.

3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services

Students receive consultation and support regarding planning of the learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the programme and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the programme.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Students receive guidance from each professor if needed. Professors are free regarding the consultation and students can contact them anytime and directly ask for any information related to their course. The building which houses both programme features several spaces designed to facilitate student / academic consultation.

Moreover, students confirmed that they have access to TSU's Career support services, supporting internships and future employment opportunities. They receive emails on a daily basis regarding new conferences, new job opportunities and any activities in which they may wish to be involved.

The interview revealed the positive attitude of students towards academic staff. They are always open to sharing all kinds of information and advice with students in order to improve the educational program and learning processes. Additionally, students have access to all information related to conferences, internships, and training which are held inside the University. A Moodle Free Online Learning Management System (e-learning.tsu.ge) is provided to help students access all the above-mentioned.

In addition, the VoCasian project will initiate a VET graduate school, which will support further Ph.D and Master students as well. Students have access to the National Library under the TSU umbrella, which is adapted for students who need research space for their research projects and thesis research.

In terms of enhanced mobility, special grants and a Erasmus+ KA1 mobility grant will be made available through the cooperation with the OvGU Magdeburg. Furthermore, a number of conferences which take place at TSU will be accessible to students to be used as platforms to present their findings. The publishing of research data will be funded if the impact of the paper is high enough.

Additionally, there are international students from Ukraine, Armenia, Azerbaijan. Academic staff also involve international students in the teaching process and in projects.

Evidences/Indicators

- Syllabi
- Educational Programme, Ph.D
- Programme and Curriculum (MA)
- Interviews with students and graduates
- Site visit

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 3.1 Student consulting and support services	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

3.2. Master’s and Doctoral Student Supervision

- A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctorate students to perform the scientific-research component successfully.
- Within master's and doctoral programmes, the ratio of students and supervisors enables them to perform scientific supervision properly.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The University publishes clear and relevant documentation concerning all aspects of thesis supervision. MA Students voiced their satisfaction regarding thesis supervision: they highly valued the specialist guidance made available to them by the academic team. They are qualified specialists in their fields and students obtain the right guidance from them. Students confirmed that academic staff have teaching experience. The supervisor of the dissertation is selected according to scientific research experience on the relevant research topic. The teaching method is appropriate to international standards. Some of the students who were beneficiaries of the Erasmus+ exchange programme mentioned that they get more than enough information about the programme from academic staff.

During the interview, students expressed that they need a structured unit for student support. This is confirmed in the Self-Evaluation Report as an 'Area for improvement'.

The report on the work of the doctoral student's supervisor is submitted to the faculty administration at the end of each semester within the set timeframe, which in turn ensures the review of the report.

One of the prerequisites for enrolment into the doctoral program is to present a research project that includes: the title of the dissertation; the research objectives; research question / questions; a hypothesis; the proposed research methodology; and a presentation of the literature review. A research proposal is not a "scientific research project" that is part of a dissertation, but a kind of structured research plan that will help the student write a dissertation in the future. Unfortunately, Ph.D students who participated in the interview were not "active" students. They mentioned that they needed some kind of incentive from the University, academic staff or just somebody from the university to increase their motivation to start working on their thesis, research and finish their Ph.D. One of the Ph.D students said that the head of the programme pushes students to continue working on their thesis but somehow this is not enough.

In addition, during the interview, there was a question regarding the quantity of enrolled Ph.D students for the future and the suitable quantity of supervisors. The head of the program mentioned that they are expecting an enrolment of almost 15 students over 3 years, i.e. 5 students per year. However, from the presented documentation, there is a notably irrelevant number of supervisors for 15 Ph.D students.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Ph.D programme - Vocational Education

It should be mentioned that when meeting the students from a similar programme, five out of nine were related to the university in terms of labour contract, and just one of the Ph.D students had Active status –the rest had Suspended status and were enrolled in the programme up to ten years ago. In the Panel's view, this raises the issue not so much of the supervision organised by the team in charge of the Ph.D programme but of the need for the University to devise some means of identifying then supporting those students who become inactive. The issue is particularly relevant to the Ph.D programme which purports to enrol professionals with several years' experience in their field: one can surmise that they have many occasions for outside work (project work, consulting) attracting them away from their research agenda.

Description and Analysis -

Data related to the supervision of master's and doctoral students Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	
Number of Master's thesis supervisors	5
Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	8
Number of Master's students	10
Number of doctoral students	5
Ratio - supervisors of Master's theses/Master's students	0.50
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	1.60

Evidences/Indicators

- Interview with students
- Enrolment procedures (Ph.D)
- Doctoral and MA Thesis regulatory documents
- Minimal Standards for Ph.D, notably Annexes 1, 3 and 4

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s): It would be better to get clear information regarding the number of supervisors and the number of students enrolled. Please clarify the quantity of supervisors and enrolled students.

Evaluation

Component 3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
--	----------------------------	--	--------------------------------------	-----------------------------------

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4. Providing Teaching Resources

Human, material, information and financial resources of educational programme/educational programmes grouped in a cluster ensure the sustainable, stable, efficient and effective functioning of the programme and the achievement of the defined objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

- Programme staff consists of qualified persons who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes.
- The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability.
- The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programme. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation.
- Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff with relevant competence.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

During the interviews with the key stakeholders, it was clear to the Expert Panel that the leadership of the programmes at TSU is committed to the curriculum and goals of the programme. Both programmes are staffed by academic and invited lecturers: the choice of academics and teachers appears to have been logically made according to their expertise, their involvement in the latest research, but also their real-world experience.

The balance between academic and invited staff ensures the programmes' sustainability, as is evident from curricula, programme hourly calculation, the staff list, and the rule of calculation of workload for academic and invited staff. Academic staff selection criteria described in the self-evaluation report are in accordance with the requirements of the legislation and the regulations in force at TSU.

Personal files (CVs and resumes) and a list of academic and invited staff provided by the University confirm that qualifications and data are in compliance with the requirements and the number of students. All this ensures that the educational programmes' learning outcomes and the proper performance of the functions assigned to academic staff, including the implementation of research projects, are achieved.

Faculty service administrative and support staff provide complete services to students enrolled in the programmes. The teaching and research process of the programmes is tailored to the interests of the students so that they have the opportunity to incorporate other activities in line with their learning process, including part-time employment. Students have pointed out that they can have direct contact with the programme heads in both programmes. They said that other staff, including personnel in administration who provide support for educational activities were also very helpful.

To summarise, the programmes will be implemented by competent, experienced academic staff with suitable teaching and research qualifications who possess the competencies necessary to produce relevant learning outcomes and ensure the success of all students .

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

The Master's degree involves 24 academics from TSU and international institutions (TSU academic staff - 10, visiting professors - 14, including 2 foreigners).

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA				
Number of staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise ⁷	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction ⁸	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	24	17	21	13
- Professor	3	3	3	3
- Associate Professor	5	3	4	4
- Assistant Professor	6	5	6	6
- Assistant				
Invited Staff	8	6	3	
Scientific Staff	2			

⁷ Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

⁸ Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

One of the main characteristics of the teaching team convened for the MA is the diversity of experience of the teachers. Academic experience is supplemented by a lot of international experience, project management know-how, expertise in economics, finances and business administration, etc. In this respect, the MA programme answers positively to the diversity of needs expressed by VET providers and recruiters generally.

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Description and Analysis

The Ph.D programme involves 14 academics, 6 from TSU and 8 invited foreign professors and teachers. The ratio of TSU to international experts (6 to 8) confirms the international opening of the programme and the University's ability to attract high-quality international researchers.

The co-heads of the Ph.D programme are professors (one TSU academic, one professor from OvGU) with relevant qualifications. The Heads of the programmes have been involved in the programme development process.

The following table has been informed from the staff's CVs. Only 12 were provided in the SER. Staff members from both universities (TSU, OvGU) have been considered as affiliated given the documented agreements between both institutions.

Vocational Education, Ph.D				
Number of staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise ⁹	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction ¹⁰	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	12	11	11	12 (7 TSU + 5 OvGU)
- Professor	4	4	4	1 TSU 3 OvGU
- Associate Professor	5	5	5	2 TSU
- Assistant Professor	2	2	2	2 TSU 2 OvGU
- Assistant				
Invited Staff	1			
Scientific Staff				

Evidences/Indicators

- Rules and conditions for affiliation of the academic staff (Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor, Assistant)
- Interviews with students
- SER, Annex 16_2: Programme Supervisor and Support Staff Function
- Personal files of academic and invited staff
- All CVs of academic personnel

⁹ Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

¹⁰ Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

- Rules for loading academic and invited staff
- TSU-Research Productivity
- Research Productivity List, by Lecturer

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 4.1 Human resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), PhD	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students

Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of research.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Personal files (CV's and resumes) and a list of academic and invited staff provided by the University confirm that students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific experience in the field of research. The topic of the Master's thesis is chosen after mutual agreement between the Master's student and his or her supervisor. Staff accommodate graduate students as much as possible to their schedule, and students can, if necessary, contact their supervisors. Papers are checked by the specialised plagiarism tool *Turnitin*. Students use the university's library and other resources. If necessary, the thesis supervisors will also provide the students with relevant material.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

The team of academics involved in the Master's degree programme has strong qualifications: their CVs show that they share considerable international experience as well as varied expertise⁴¹ in the field of educational sciences but also in related areas such as economics, business administration and, relevantly for VET, engineering. It must be noted that some teachers involved in the programme are Ph.D students. The link between the MA programme and the Ph.D. is strengthened through these experts. Their CV show their range of qualifications and expertise acquired through formal studies and specific training sessions, but also thanks to a wide range of work experience, in companies, or NGOs, in a large variety of instances.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA			
	Thesis supervisors	Including the supervisors holding Ph.D degree in the sectoral direction ¹¹	Among them: affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's theses	5	5	5
- Professor	3	3	3
- Associate Professor or Assistant Professor	2	2	2
Invited Staff			
Scientific Staff			

Both academics' and experts' CVs make it clear that the MA has a strong international dimension. On top of having a strong academic base, the academics and invited teachers can offer a learning that is project-focused, experience-based. This enhances one of the main merits of the programme, namely its ability to allow an international dialogue between academic theory and practice.

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Description and Analysis

¹¹ Thesis supervisors having a Ph.D degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

Vocational Education, Ph.D			
	Thesis supervisors	Including the supervisors holding Ph.D degree in the sectoral direction ¹²	Among them: affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Doctoral theses	8	8	8
- Professor	4	4	1 TSU 3 OvGU
- Associate or Assistant Professor	4	4	2 TSU 2 OvGU
Invited Staff			
Scientific Staff			

Academics involved in the Ph.D programme are less numerous than in the MA programme, as is logical for a highly specialised programme enrolling 5 students a year. Their CV and research credentials show that they have considerable experience in their field. Academics from Georgia and Germany have united their forces to create a student supervision model that is informed by the co-teaching implemented for the programme.

Evidences/Indicators

- SER, Annex 16 – 2: Guidelines for Supervisors
- Interviews with academic and invited staff, students
- Guidelines for thesis
- Academics' CVs
- Staff lists of publications
- Academic staff Evaluation

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

¹² Thesis supervisors having a Ph.D degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 4.2 Qualification of supervisors of master's and doctoral students	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.3 Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff

- The HEI conducts the evaluation of programme staff and analyses evaluation results on a regular basis.
- The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Description and Analysis

TSU has implemented academic and invited staff scientific productivity evaluations and regularly conducts and analyses their results. The Scientific Research and Development Service of the Faculty annually analyses and evaluates scientific productivity, which is reported in detail in the annual reports of the Department of Scientific Research and Development. Therefore, the faculty takes care of the professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff, as well as facilitates their scientific/research activities. For this purpose, it organises training for them, with the participation of the invited experts; permanently updates the library book stock with the latest literature relevant to the programmes; the faculty's scientific conferences; sends academic personnel to international conferences, congresses and symposia; delivers oral and/or poster reports.

The University supports research, initiates joint research projects with the academic staff of partner universities, and promotes the involvement of as many academic staff as possible. Informational meetings and training have been conducted for the academic and invited staff of TSU, aiming at providing detailed information on the formalities of obtaining research funding and communicating on

research findings. The University also conducts surveys for academic, scientific, and invited staff and students to take action on what can be improved for further development.

Academic staff participate in exchange projects with the world's top-ranked universities to enhance their professionalism. In parallel with raising professional skills, they conduct public lectures and carry out scientific research activities with foreign colleagues. Several activities are planned to fulfil current needs and to improve the competencies of programme implementers.

Within the framework of the Ph.D Programme "Vocational Education", the partner universities (Tbilisi State University, Magdeburg University) actively care for the development of staff. This was evident during the introductory meeting with the academic and invited staff. TSU holds international scientific conferences almost every year. Additionally, the university organises meetings with leading scientists from different fields to share experiences to improve research content.

The academic staff of the school regularly participates in Erasmus+ mobility programmes. TSU provides administrative support for the implementation of local and international grant projects, funding for practical courses/training, staff involvement in international projects, exchange programmes, international conferences and workshops, all of which contribute to the strengthening of internationalisation.

Evidences/Indicators

- Interviews with the academic and invited staff
- Memoranda, agreements
- Academic staff Evaluation
- Annual Scientific Reports of TSU's Faculty of Psychology and Educational sciences
- University website

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 4.3 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.4. Material Resources

Programme is provided with necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Description and Analysis

During the site visit, the expert panel explored the University's infrastructure, equipment and technical resources available to students and academic staff.

The programme has a library that has and maintains sufficient and appropriate print and electronic books/journals which are available for students, invited and academic staff.

The library has a reading hall equipped with appropriate inventory. In the reading hall, students have the opportunity to use the internet and various international electronic resources. The library has electronic catalogues. The compulsory literature and/or relevant readers specified in the syllabi of the programmes are available to students in the Digital Library of TSU (Ebooks.tsu.ge). The students of TSU have access to the latest scientific literature and publications in electronic databases from the computer network of Tbilisi State University and from outside the university network. The above-mentioned electronic resources are also available at the University.

The librarian demonstrated how to find the required learning materials. The expert panel asked for a couple of authors and learning books, and these were identified and provided.

During the tour, the expert panel found that study auditoriums, laboratories, staff rooms, computer resource centres, administrative spaces, spaces for group work and others were available, all of which ensure the sustainability of the educational and administrative process.

University material and technical resources include multimedia projectors, computers, audio-video equipment, etc. There is a modern computer lab and computer equipment relevant to the academic programme.

Computers are provided with the appropriate software tools/applications. Auditoriums and computer classes are equipped with access to local area networks and the internet. The University has its own internal electronic platform (lms.tsu.gr), through which assessments are entered into an electronic journal. The students' attendance, activities, and oral assessments are registered in this database. The University has an Electronic Learning Management System through which students are informed about their assessments, attendance, activity, oral exams, quiz assessments; they have the opportunity to get acquainted with the programme, the syllabi, to create their individual profile. Moreover, it is also possible to prepare electronic and printed readers, fully copyrighted, upon the instruction of the course supervisor, under the conditions of the library.

The university website ensures that information is easily available to all students and staff. They are informed about the possibility of using resources and are informed of the rules of their use.

To summarise, both programmes are provided with the necessary infrastructure and technical equipment required for achieving their learning outcomes.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

Both the SER and students noted that the building housing the programme provided satisfactory spaces for working and carrying out personal work individually or in groups. Spaces are also available for student / staff consultation. The library is well-equipped and funded.

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Description and Analysis

The equipment needed for students enrolled in the Ph.D programme doesn't need to be highly specialised: the University's library provides all necessary resources. In addition, the visit of the library demonstrated that the library offers ample space for study and research, and also the recognition of the students' specific status as student-researchers. In interviews, the students stressed that studying and having access to all the material they needed was made easy by the staff at the library.

Evidences/Indicators

- Material and technical resources of the University
- Library Resources, Catalogue
- University website
- Site tour of the University
- Students' interviews

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 4.4 Material resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in the programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the programme needs.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Documents provided by the University show that the Faculty have established a clear budget for both programmes and that they are in accordance with University recommendations. This gives the panel the feeling that the strategic engagement of the University towards its stakeholders for both programmes is assured.

It must also be emphasized that the two programmes, and their students, have access to external funding via a diversity of international projects (European Commission through Erasmus+, World bank, GIZ). Both programmes thus appear to benefit from funding opportunities, nationally and internationally.

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Description and Analysis

The programme's budget allocation takes into account all costs incurred by the University for training, research and maintenance. It shows a surplus.

Vocational Education (VET), PhD

Description and Analysis

The budget of the programme was presented to the expert panel. The budget documents give information that the overall budget ensures the remuneration of the academic staff and invited lecturers involved in the implementation of the programme, the maintenance and improvement of the physical and technical base of the programmes. It can also support the participation of the academic staff implementing the programme in various international capacity building activities and students in various international scientific activities. The fee-based Ph.D programme aims to create national and international interest over time which will ensure the financial sustainability of the programme. The budget provides readiness for continual renewal and includes costs for the improvement of literature and access to databases. In interviews with international partners, it was made clear to the panel that the international funding through GIZ would be available even after the VoCAsian project funding ends.

Evidences/Indicators

- Programme budgets: SER, Annex 10, in Georgian
- University Guidelines for Budget Design: Programme Planning Annex 6
- Confirmation of Ph.D support, Prof Bünning, OvGU
- Confirmation of Magdebourg University Support
- Confirmation of support by GIZ
- Self-Evaluation report
- Meeting with the heads of programmes

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 4.5 Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

4. Providing Teaching Resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), PhD	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, the programme utilises internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilised for informed decision making and programme development.

5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation

Programme staff collaborate with internal quality assurance department(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of programme quality assurance, developing assessment instruments, and implementing assessment processes. Programme staff utilises quality assurance results for programme improvement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Issues related to internal quality assurance at Ivane Javakishvili Tbilisi State University (TSU) are coordinated by the quality assurance service of the university. The goals of internal quality assurance are to continuously improve educational activities and strengthen the culture of quality. With this focus, the university has developed a number of regulations and frameworks related to the elaboration and development of educational programmes, as well as the procedure for the peer review of educational programmes and the mechanisms for measuring the university's rankings and ratings.

Quality assurance operates in accordance with the "plan-do-check-act" (PDCA) cycle and is used as follows: (1) programme development and approval, (2) implementation according to the curriculum; (3) monitoring, evaluation and analysis (survey of students and academic staff, analysis of the results of students' academic performance, etc.); (4) Considering the results and modifying the programme.

The quality assurance service and the faculty are involved in the process of continuous monitoring of the educational process. Monitoring is mainly carried out through surveys of target groups, systematic observation of sessions and Peer Review of Educational Programmes. A peer review system involves the formative assessment of educational programmes, and operates as a kind of simulation of the accreditation process. The processes are transparent, collegial and supported by the faculties. Recommendations and advice received during the assessment process are reflected in the educational programmes.

Survey forms include the assessment of such issues as: satisfaction with educational programmes; learning outcomes; assessment of management processes; infrastructure needs for development; assessment of academic staff; etc. Taking into account the results of the obtained information, data is processed, strengths and weaknesses are revealed, problems are identified, and ways of solving them are selected.

The Quality Assurance Service of the Faculty of Psychology and Educational sciences provides regular consultations to academic, scientific, invited, administrative and support staff on issues related to internal and external quality assurance, authorisation and accreditation.

To monitor and evaluate the electronic/distance learning process, and to ensure the adaptation of internal quality assurance mechanisms and their proper implementation, the following documents have been prepared by the Quality Assurance Service: E-learning guide, manuals for creating homework and quizzes on the Moodle platform, and tutorials on the use of Breakout Rooms and Poll in the Zoom platform. Also, needs-based training was organised.

From the self-evaluation report and the interviews conducted by the expert group, the degree of involvement of the academic/invited staff in the programme development and learning outcomes evaluation process was not completely clear. On the one hand, the self-evaluation report provides a very general description of the procedures and detecting the contributors to the process is difficult. On the other hand, the absolute majority of the academic/invited staff during the interviews were representing the leaders of elective courses of the programs, which in turn do not directly participate in attaining the programme learning outcomes. In some cases, leaders of the courses were not able to

relate the course learning outcomes to the overall programme learning outcomes. Additionally, in some cases, leaders of the courses were not aware of the course target benchmarks, determined in their own modules.

The involvement of employers was fully confirmed during the interviews and their contribution is a valuable asset for the programmes' development. The contribution to and the engagement of administrative staff in this process was obvious.

Various events and training sessions are conducted by the quality assurance service in order to improve the development of programmes and the teaching process at the university.

To summarise, the internal quality assurance mechanisms are very well established in the university and some of them can be considered as best practices, however the degree of involvement of stakeholders, in particular, students and academic and invited personnel, can be improved to ensure the quality of the program.

Evidences/Indicators

- Programmes and syllabi;
- Self-Evaluation Report;
- Internal Quality Assurance;
- The Elaboration and the Development of Educational Programmes;
- Peer Review of the Educational Programme;
- Direct evaluation of program learning outcomes;
- Annex. 4 – Maps;
- Annex 13 – QA Assurance;
- Annex 3 – Program Planning Methodology;
- Annex 14 – Survey;
- Annex 16 – Other;
- Annex 8 – Labour Market Research;
- Annex 6 – Program Planning, Elaboration;
- Annex 16 – 2 – Support Staff Fonctions
- QAS Annual Report, 2021
- Interview Results.

General recommendations of the cluster: It is recommended to improve the degree of involvement of the academic staff in the process of the programmes' development and assessment.

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 5.1 Internal Quality Evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

5.2. External Quality Evaluation

Programme utilises the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Tbilisi State University actively uses external assessment tools for program accreditation in the process of developing higher education programs. The university closely cooperates with the National Centre for Educational Quality Enhancement of Georgia. In addition to the external evaluation carried out during authorisation/accreditation, the university collaborates with local and international experts in the field to evaluate the programme. Most significant quality assurance documents are presented both in Georgian and English.

The National Centre for Educational Quality Enhancement is registered on EQAR, which means that its procedures have demonstrated their compliance with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area.

TSU is a participant in the project “Private Sector Development and Technical Vocational Education and Training in the South Caucasus”, co-funded by GIZ and the process of developing both educational programmes is supported by local and international collaborators, including Magdeburg University, Germany. The latter is the main contributor to the strengthening of the programmes in terms of engagement of international experts such as academics and invited personnel for both programmes,

not forgetting financial support. Similarly, the content of the programmes and the syllabi are developed on the basis of mutual collaboration and experience sharing.

The quality assurance instruments of the programme include a developmental peer review of the programme, with the purpose of improving the programme and the research environment.

Evidences/Indicators

- Programmes
- Self-Evaluation Report (SER)
- Program External Evaluation
- QAS Annual Report, 2021
- Interview Results
- EQAR list of accredited agencies

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 5.2 External Quality Evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), PhD	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review

Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematic data collection, study and analysis. Evaluation results are applied for the programme improvement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Information and rules on monitoring and periodic evaluation of the educational programme are found in the regulations; in particular, according to the mentioned document, the procedures for initiating, approving, modifying and the periodic evaluations of the programme are defined.

For each programme, a Programme Development Committee is established, which is responsible for evaluating and analysing the achievement of the outcomes. Accordingly, the assessment of programme outcomes is carried out periodically by direct and indirect methods.

The direct methods of evaluating the results involve the assessment of the students' academic performance.

The indirect method of evaluating the results involves studying the responses of all stakeholders of the programme: a) Students; b) Academic/invited staff involved in the implementation of the programme; c) Employers; d) Graduates of the programme. The following instruments of the programme learning outcomes assessment are introduced:

- Questionnaires: a) Evaluation of educational courses and/or process by the students in the LMS electronic database; b) Assessment of student satisfaction in the LMS electronic database;
- Focus groups: organising meetings with students and participating in the discussion of conceptual issues related to the implementation of the programme;
- Internal Discussions: a) Meetings with the head of the programme and members of the Quality Assurance Service, etc.; b) Involvement in the work of the supporting (Curriculum) Committee of Planning; Working out and Development of Educational Programmes, etc.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program Regulations
- Self-Evaluation Report (SER)
- University Guidelines and Recommendations, notably SER, Annex 3;
- Programme Planning and Elaboration : specifically Annexes 9 to 14
- Interviews with the Quality Assurance Service, students and staff

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A)

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): N/A

Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation

Component 5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), Ph.D	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational Education (VET), PhD	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Attached documentation (if applicable): N/A

Name of the higher education institution: Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University

Name of Higher Educational Programmes, Levels:

- Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA

- Vocational Education, Ph.D

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

Content Standard	1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy, Evaluation of Programme Mastering	3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	4. Providing Teaching Resources	5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities
Vocational Education / Training and Human Resources Development, MA	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Vocational Education (VET), PhD	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements

Signatures

Chair of Accreditation Experts Panel

Stéphane Lauwick,



Of the member(s) of the Accreditation Experts Panel

Mariam Aleksidze



Tamta Lekishvili



Sophio Bazadze



Ekaterine Pipia

