



**NATIONAL CENTER FOR
EDUCATIONAL QUALITY
ENHANCEMENT**

**Accreditation Expert Group Report on Cluster of Higher Education
Programmes**

**Name of the Cluster of Educational Programmes according to the Fields of Study of the
Classifier**

Bachelor's Program: Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)

Bachelor's Program: Literary Studies (Major and Minor)

Master's Program: Comparative Literary Studies

Master's Program: Applied Linguistics

Doctoral Program: Linguistics and Literary Studies

Name of Higher Educational Institution

Ilia State University

Evaluation Date(s)

21-23. 12. 2022

Report Submission Date

Tbilisi

Contents

| | |
|---|----|
| I. Information on the Cluster of Educational Programmes | 4 |
| II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary | 6 |
| III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards | 12 |
| 1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme | 12 |
| 2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering | 36 |
| 3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them | 51 |
| 4. Providing Teaching Resources | 61 |
| 5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities | 85 |

Information on the Higher educational Institution

| | |
|--|---|
| Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form | Ilia State University Legal Entity of Public Law |
| Identification Code of Institution | 204861970. |
| Type of the Institution | University |

Expert Panel Members

| | |
|--|---|
| Chair (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country) | Anca-Luminita Greere, Babes-Bolyai University, Romania |
| Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country) | Zaal Kikvidze, LELP Akaki Tsereteli State University; Arn. Chikobava Institute of Linguistics, TSU, Georgia |
| Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country) | Nino Popiashvili, Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia |
| Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country) | Irma Kurdadze, Samtskhe-Javakheti State University, Georgia |
| Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country) | Nato Peradze, Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia |

1

I. Information on the Cluster of Educational Programmes

| | Programme 1 | Programme 2 | Programme 3 | Programme 4 | Programme 5 | Programme 6 | Programme 7 | Programme 8 |
|---|--|--|--|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Name of the educational programme | Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) Georgian Philology (Major/Minor) | Literary Studies (Major and Minor) Literary Studies (Major/Minor) | Comparative Literary Studies | Applied Linguistics | Linguistics and Literary Studies | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| Level of higher education | Bachelor's (6) | Bachelor's (6) | Master's (7) | Master's (7) | Doctoral (8) | | | |
| Qualification to be awarded | Bachelor of Arts in Georgian Philology | Bachelor of Arts in Philology | Master of Arts in Comparative Literary Studies | Master of Arts in Linguistics | Doctor of Philology | | | |
| Name and code of the detailed field | Literature and Linguistics 0232 | Literature and Linguistics 0232 | Literature and Linguistics 0232 | Literature and Linguistics 0232 | Literature and Linguistics 0232 | | | |
| Indication of the right to provide teaching of subject/subjects/group of subjects of the relevant level of general education¹ | | | | | | | | |
| Language of instruction | Georgian | Georgian | Georgian | Georgian | Georgian | | | |
| Number of ECTS credits | 240 ECTS | 240 ECTS | 120 ECTS | 120 ECTS | 42 ECTS | | | |

¹ In case of Integrated Bachelor's-Master's Teacher Training Educational Programme and Teacher Training Educational Programme

| | | | | | | | | |
|---|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|--|--|--|
| Programme Status (Accredited/Non-accredited/Conditionally Accredited/New/International Accreditation) Indicating Relevant Decision (number, date) | Accredited | Accredited | Accredited | Accredited | Accredited | | | |
|---|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|--|--|--|

II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary

● General Information on the Cluster of Education Programmes²

Five educational programs are grouped in the present cluster, which are administered by the Faculty of Arts and Sciences:

- Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level);
- Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level);
- Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level);
- Applied Linguistics (Master's level);
- Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

All programs have been recently revisited in light of the cluster grouping and in alignment with the order of the Minister of Education, Science, Culture and Sports of Georgia 69/n of 10 April, 2019 on the Development of Higher Education Programs in Accordance with the National Qualifications Framework and the Classifier of Fields of Study.

The programs grouped in the cluster consistently refer to linguistic and literary issues and are noted to be developed and implemented so as to foster the student's ability to critically analyze, comprehend, contextualize, comment and interpret the text; form the necessary sectoral and transferable competencies; contribute to the understanding and respect of cultural-worldview diversity, establishment of national and universal ideals.

The SAR lists important changes, namely in respect of an update on objectives of the programs, changes on the learning outcomes, structures and outline of the components of the programs, development of competency maps and diversification of material resources.

The cluster actively uses the platform www.elearning.iliauni.edu.ge and Turnitin and the electronic portal "Argus" which is confirmed to be improved and more versatile.

● Overview of the Accreditation Site Visit

The evaluation process relies equally on the self-assessment report (SAR) with the enclosed evidence submitted and the on-site visit where multiple interviews are arranged with key stakeholders such as senior management, teaching and administrative staff, students and other stakeholders (e.g. employers).

The evaluation process benefited by a SAR which was helpfully structured in response to the individual Standards and was well documented and contained evaluative statements allowing the panel members to form a comprehensive view of the institutional operations before the on-site visit.

The visit was conducted between 21-23 December 2022 according to a schedule agreed with the University, which saw multiple meetings being organized (in total 16 interviews) to discuss/clarify/confirm aspects highlighted by the SAR and to collect further evidence in support of the findings. The panel also conducted a visit of the facilities to ensure these were well represented. Also, some additional documents were requested during the visit, and supplied promptly.

² When providing general information related to the programme, it is appropriate to also present the quantitative data analysis of the educational programme.

- **Brief Overview of Education Programme Compliance with the Standards**

- The first standard substantially complies with requirements.
- The second standard complies with requirements.
- For the third standard, the Bachelor's level programmes substantially comply with requirements, the Master's level programmes comply with requirements, and the PhD programme substantially complies with requirements.
- The fourth standard complies with requirements.
- The fifth standard complies with requirements.

- **Recommendations**

- The Programs should revisit the learning outcomes and ensure that they all use formulations which are aligned with the Bologna tools and which are all commensurate to the level of education.
- The Programs should clearly list on the website the learning outcomes and ensure that what is publicly available matches the definitive documentation held by the program management and used for the purposes of NCEQE accreditation.
- The Cluster should devise evaluation mechanisms which have the capacity to maintain learning outcomes relevant, well-formulate and achievable and which verify the link between learning outcomes and curriculum development.
- The Cluster should consider introducing mandatory internships for students at the appropriate levels to ensure that labour market experiences are available to students and can help them shape their views about potential career options.
- The Programs should correct the gaps in the study courses regarding references to the main and supporting literature.
- The programs should ensure that the main and supporting literature is fully reflected in the subject of the study course syllabi.
- The Programs should ensure that any literature proposed (especially as core literature) considers the language pre-requisites announced for the program to ensure that students can, indeed, gain access to the content of the books, in original.
- The Cluster should ensure that where readers are used there is clarity on the percentages of allowed photocopying/multiplication and that these are within international limits so as to avoid any risk that might be derived in respect of copyright. The University should have oversight of and verify the resources which are generated as a reader.
- The Cluster should formulate clear responsibilities for the role of Heads for the various programs and ensure that any communication with students is tracked to ensure consistency and transparency.
- The English version of the website should be updated and information should be consistent with the Georgian content.
- The University should consider ways of quantifying, as part of the workload, the preparatory work that supervisors engage with prospective PhD candidates before their application process.
- The Cluster should ensure that the qualifications of the academic and invited staff, as well as academic reviews and scientific works, correspond to the field of philology and match the subjects which are taught and/or supervised. Exceptions for practice-based experience should be made where justifiable.
- The Cluster should ensure that supervisor of the bachelor's thesis is selected based on the specifics of the field the research topic belongs to. Where practice-based expertise needs to be involved, a supervisory team arrangement could be instituted.

- The Quality Assurance Service should develop mechanisms to identify the technical and content gaps in the syllabuses of the programs together with the heads of the programs and eliminate them.
 - The University should institute recruitment regulations, for both academic and invited staff, which pay specific attention to the alignment between the field in which the staff has a degree, or the direction of their research, and the content of the courses they are proposing to take on as teachers.
 - The University should consider proposing concrete targets which can be monitored in the decision to pause or close down a given program. Consideration needs to be given in terms of the impact a course closure may generate with respect to the whole cluster structure, and its potential to perform well.
 - The website should be maintained accurate and consistent across language versions, with public information reviewed frequently to ensure trustworthiness and coherence.
- **Suggestions for the Programme Development**
 - The University may wish to give increased attention to the cohesiveness of the programs in the cluster to allow for appropriate oversight of the areas of progression from one level to the next, in regards the treatment of subject-matter and the variety of perspectives.
 - The University may wish to link program goals with graduate attributes and career prospects in the presentation of the programs within the cluster, so as to increase the reception of the programs by a wide range of stakeholders and to highlight the labour market directions which are being considered.
 - The Programs may wish to increase the focus on using learning outcomes as a filter for the quality of teaching, learning and assessment activities, when determining if they need to be revised, modified, or enhanced.
 - The University may wish to make extended use of the database which currently collects major program changes (i.e. those approved by the council) and to allow for more minor changes to be logged so that there could be oversight and clear tracking of cumulative minor changes which could impact the whole cluster.
 - The University may wish to consider extending the remit of its ethical committee to scrutinise research proposals (at all levels of the cluster) and grant ethical approvals which would support publication initiatives.
 - The University may wish to consider developing a system for assessment moderation or second-marking to strengthen the consistency and fairness of assessment components, beyond the graduation assessments which are generally organized via committee.
 - The Cluster may wish to explore more innovative ways of guaranteeing continuity where associate or invited staff take on supervisory roles.
 - The university may wish to take a more holistic approach towards the calculation of workload where requirements should not be restricted exclusively to contact hours in the classroom. Multiple other activities, which are spent for the benefit of the institution, need to be quantified, including CPD and administrative work.
 - The Quality Assurance Service may wish to consider if an alumni survey could become beneficial for internal quality assurance of given programs within the cluster. This is also because alumni from one program could become students of the next level program and would have a broader perspective on cluster performance.
 - The Quality Assurance Service may wish to further harness the involvement of employers across multiple representational activities and specifically for program and cluster development.

- The Cluster may wish to propose joint developmental/training sessions or activities of good practice sharing which could combine the needs identified during the individual staff appraisals.
 - With the maturing of the quality assurance systems in the Georgian higher education context, the university may wish to decouple its internal quality assurance from the NCEQE accreditation assessments and set up its own cycle for internal quality assurance to run independent of any external processes.
 - The Quality Assurance Service may wish to embed the use of external experts to review programs on a regular basis not exclusively in preparation of NCEQE engagements.
- **Brief Overview of the Best Practices (if applicable)³**
 - The University is commended for creating a cluster which gives students educational options at all levels of study within the same subject areas and under the same institutional environment.
 - The cluster is commended for its flexible approach which privileges the individual student journey without destabilizing the capacity of all students to achieve the stated learning outcomes.
 - The university is commended for the use of the Argus platform which effectively supports the teaching, learning, assessment experience and the related administrative processes.
 - The cluster is commended for the support it offers to students in regards academic, health and career development.
 - The Quality Assurance Service is commended for the careful consideration of how quality processes need to change or be adjusted in order to serve well a clustering approach.
 - The cluster is commended for the degree to which external evaluations by invited experts contracted by the university inform the preparation for external quality assurance processes undertaken by NCEQE. External evaluators are both Georgian and foreign experts and they have found the programs in the cluster to be important and innovative in the Georgian university space, with internationalization representing a strong component.
 - **Information on Sharing or Not Sharing the Argumentative Position of the HEI**

The Panel wishes to thank the institution for the argumentative presented in response to the draft report and confirms it has given detailed consideration to all the points raised. Whereas, the Panel appreciates the response provided, it has not made any substantial changes, neither to the Recommendations or the Level of Compliance on the Standards, if factual inaccuracy was not present. The Panel has reached these decisions from the evidence submitted as part of the accreditation process and the visit held at the institution and is convinced that they can fully support the institution on its quality journey.

As the University has noted this to be a factual inaccuracy, indicating that the bachelor thesis is, in fact, mandatory for all students of this programme, under 1.4, the following Recommendation was deleted for the **Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)**: “The program should consider making the bachelor thesis mandatory, as this is an important component which can contribute to the achievement goals and learning outcomes.” However, it is important to note that this was not evident from the documentation presented or from the interaction with staff and students. As such, for the future, the Programme may wish to be more explicit in its presentation of mandatory components.

³ A practice that is exceptionally effective and that can serve as a benchmark or example for other educational programme/programmes.

- **In case of re-accreditation, it is important to provide a brief overview of the achievements and/or the progress (if applicable)**

The Panel noted that recommendations from previous accreditation visits were given attention and addressed with progress being notable, as detailed in the sections below.

Evaluation approaches for the accreditation experts:

The components of the accreditation standards are evaluated using the following two approaches:

1. Cluster and individual evaluation⁴
2. Cluster evaluation⁵

| Standard/Component | Assessment approaches: |
|---|------------------------|
| 1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme | |
| 1.1. Programme Objectives | Cluster and individual |
| 1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes | Cluster and individual |
| 1.3. Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes | Cluster |
| 1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme | Cluster and individual |
| 1.5 Academic Course/Subject | Cluster and individual |
| 2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering | |
| 2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions | Cluster and individual |
| 2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills | Cluster |
| 2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods | Cluster |
| 2.4. Student Evaluation | Cluster |

⁴ **Evaluation Approaches:** Describe, analyse, and evaluate the compliance of each educational programme grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the corresponding component of the standard. Also, you can specify information about an educational programme that is different from the common and basic characteristics of educational programmes grouped in the cluster.

⁵ **Assessment approaches: In case of necessity,** describe, analyse and evaluate compliance of each education programme in the cluster with the requirements of this component of the standard. Also, you can indicate the information on the education programme, distinguished from the general and major characteristics of the education programmes in a cluster.

| | |
|---|------------------------|
| 3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them | |
| 3.1. Student Consulting and Support Services | Cluster |
| 3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision | Cluster |
| 4. Providing Teaching Resources | |
| 4.1. Human Resources | Cluster and individual |
| 4.2. Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students | Cluster and individual |
| 4.3. Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff | Cluster |
| 4.4. Material Resources | Cluster and individual |
| 4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability | Cluster and individual |
| 5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities | |
| 5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation | Cluster |
| 5.2. External Quality Evaluation | Cluster |
| 5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review | Cluster |

III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the programme. The content and consistent structure of the programme ensure the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

Educational programmes grouped in a cluster are logically interrelated to each other in line with the study fields and evolve according to the respective levels of higher education.

1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level and an educational programme, and define the set of knowledge, skills and competences a programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the programme to the development of the field and society.

In the philology cluster of the Ilia State University SAR, the following programs are presented:

1. Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level);
2. Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level);
3. Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level);
4. Applied Linguistics (Master's level);
5. Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

The goals of the programs united in the cluster differ from each other according to the specifics and levels of the field, however, the common goals of the programs grouped in the cluster are to create, transfer and use knowledge in the field of philology for the development of science. The Panel has found that the goals of the programs in the cluster are in accordance with the mission of Ilia State University, the strategy of the Faculty of Sciences and Arts, which highlights the preparation of qualified, ethical and competitive professionals who are also active members of a civil society based on knowledge and values.

The programs in the philology cluster are divided into two main directions: linguistics and literary studies. Programs are offered at all three levels of higher education: bachelor's, master's, and doctoral, in a coherent sequence giving students the opportunity to progress from one level to the next within the same institutional environment. This can be helpful to students as it allows for continuity and familiarity; however, it also poses more responsibility on the cluster to ensure that any overlap is avoided and that where subject matter is repeated, the depth or breadth of its analysis is commensurate with the level and expectations of the students. This entails increased collaboration across the five programs in the cluster so that they truly operate in unison and students are able to derive net benefits of learning at each respective level. It also means that there has to be sufficient difference, both in content exposure and teaching staff to avoid limited perspectives being emphasized and on-directional opinions being promoted. For students it is important to be presented with variety so that they may form a comprehensive overview of the subject areas in the cluster.

The goals of the programs in the philology cluster are realistic, clearly defined, and achievable and are calibrated to the program focus and the teaching levels.

To enhance the understanding and implications for the program goals, the Panel considers it important for the University to link goals with likely graduate attributes and anticipated career prospects. This can allow a better reception of the program benefits by prospective and existing students and can create a stronger connection to the labour market, which allegedly may seem, in the eyes of some stakeholders, decoupled from the Philology domain. In fact, the Panel believes that the reality points towards multiple job roles which are well mapped to and effectively use philology graduate attributes, and pinpointing these as part of the definitive, public-facing cluster documentation would be highly beneficial to the University.

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The goal of the Bachelor's program of Georgian Philology of Ilia State University is to give the students broad theoretical knowledge of the phonetics-phonology, morphology and syntax of the Georgian language, to develop their skills of synthesis and analysis of the foundations, principles and basic theories of Linguistics and Literary Studies, and to give direction in the field of Terminology.

The goals of the program reflect the main issues that are important for the bachelor's program of Georgian philology. Georgian and Caucasian contexts are also emphasized. The mentioned issue is important because Georgian philology is deeply connected with both the general philological context and the regional Caucasian context.

Georgian language and literature courses, as well as general linguistics and literary studies courses and other related courses are taught at the Bachelor's program of Georgian philology. The goals of the Bachelor's program of Georgian philology are in accordance with the highest field characteristic of Georgian philology, are realistic and achievable.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program descriptions;
- Mission of Ilia State University; <http://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/mission>
- Strategy of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences of Ilia State University for 2018-2024;
- External Assessment Documents of the Program;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The Bachelor's program "Literary Studies" at Ilia State University aims to prepare a competitive specialist in the field of Literary Studies, who will be equipped with broad knowledge of the theory and history of literature and will be able to analyze and interpret literary works while also taking into account their genre, epoch and aesthetic features.

Bachelor's program in Literary Studies provides the student with the opportunity to study literary texts in a broader cultural, historical, and societal context. It aims to prepare a competitive specialist in the field of Literary Studies, who will be equipped with broad knowledge of the theory and history of literature and will be able to analyze and interpret literary works while also taking into account their genre, epoch and aesthetic features.

The program has been developed taking into account the goals and experiences of several European programs, according to which literature is considered as a rich experience in terms of culture and art.

The main direction in the development of the program is the study of ancient literature, European literature and Georgian literature. Also, analysis and interpretation of literary texts.

The objectives of the program are clearly defined, realistic and achievable, consistent with the mission and strategy of the university as well as the faculty.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program descriptions;
- Mission of Ilia State University; <http://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/mission>
- Strategy of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences of Ilia State University for 2018-2024;
- External Assessment Documents of the Program;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

The goals of the "Comparative Literary Studies" program of Ilia State University are to study literature as one of the main mediums of representation of cultural and value systems and to observe literature in both national and broad intercultural and global/transcultural contexts, which, on the one hand, helps to understand foreign culture, and On the other hand, it is a prerequisite to understand their culture in a single world cultural context.

Students will be introduced to the approaches and methods of comparative literature research within the framework of the program, and will use them to research current issues/problems in the field in an interdisciplinary and intercultural perspective; They will deepen their knowledge about the important historical stages and latest trends of world literature and comprehend their relation to socio-political contexts and philosophical-worldview paradigms; They will research the thematic, imagological, structural, epochal, genre and aesthetic aspects of Georgian literature in relation to the trends of world literature; They will improve academic communication skills by creating and presenting a research paper to the scientific community.

The SAR notes that students will be introduced to the approaches and methods of comparative literature research within the framework of the program, and will use them to research current issues/problems in the field in an interdisciplinary and intercultural perspective; They will deepen their knowledge about the important historical stages and latest trends of world literature and comprehend their relation to socio-political contexts and philosophical-worldview paradigms; They will research the thematic, imagological, structural, epochal, genre and aesthetic aspects of Georgian literature in relation to the trends of world literature; They will improve academic communication skills by creating and presenting a research paper to the scientific community. The Panel believes these are relevant for the program in question.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program descriptions;
- Mission of Ilia State University; <http://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/mission>
- Strategy of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences of Ilia State University for 2018-2024;
- External Assessment Documents of the Program;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 4 Applied Linguistics (Master's level)

"Applied Linguistics" Master's Program of Ilia State University aims to give the student deep and systematic knowledge of the theoretical and practical aspects of Applied Linguistics as well as to teach the student the issues of phonetics, morphology and syntax in terms of language typology and universals. Along with the learning theoretical issues of linguistics, the program envisages the development of language documenting and computer processing skills in students for analytical material.

The program envisages the inclusion of study courses from adjacent programs of Ilia State University, such as English studies, Romanistics, German studies, philosophy, etc.. This promotes teaching and research with intercultural and interdisciplinary components.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program descriptions;
- Mission of Ilia State University; <http://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/mission>
- Strategy of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences of Ilia State University for 2018-2024;
- External Assessment Documents of the Program;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

Ilia State University doctoral program "Linguistics and Literary Studies" aims to create scientific knowledge about the national, intercultural and transcultural aspects of linguistic, textual and discursive formations using current Western scientific approaches and methods.

The Doctoral Programme in Linguistics and Literary Studies serves the development of scientific research and critical thinking in young researchers on the basis of the latest theoretical and methodological knowledge, approaches and principles, and aims to prepare graduates who will: be able to generate new knowledge in one of the research areas of the programme thus contribute to the development of the fields of linguistics or literary studies; independently plan linguistic and/or literary research, select the appropriate methodology, compile a bibliography and conduct the research in compliance with the principles of academic integrity; create an original scientific work of proper form, which will contribute to the development of the field; share their knowledge at the level of international peer-reviewed publications; be prepared for pursuing successful careers within or outside academic spheres.

Doctoral students will rely on the latest theoretical achievements of some research fields of Linguistics or Literary Studies (Pragmalinguistics), Linguistic Semantics, Sociolinguistics, Psycholinguistics, Text Linguistics, Discourse Linguistics, Corpus Linguistics, Computational Philology, Structuralist and Post-structuralist Literary Studies, Psychoanalytical Literary Studies, Feminist and Gender Literary Studies, Cultural and Post-colonial Literary Studies, Empirical and Cognitive Literary Studies and others) conduct original research in the diachronic, synchronous and intercultural context to achieve this goal.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Programs descriptions;
- Mission of Ilia State University; <http://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/mission>
- Strategy of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences of Ilia State University for 2018-2024;
- External Assessment Documents of the Programs;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster:

- None identified

General suggestions of the cluster:

- The University may wish to give increased attention to the cohesiveness of the programs in the cluster to allow for appropriate oversight of the areas of progression from one level to the next, in regards the treatment of subject-matter and the variety of perspectives.
- The University may wish to link program goals with graduate attributes and career prospects in the presentation of the programs within the cluster, so as to increase the reception of the programs by a wide range of stakeholders and to highlight the labour market directions which are being considered.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes:

No recommendations or suggestions have been formulated for the individual programs.

Evaluation

| Component 1.1 - Programme Objectives | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies the requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|--|----------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level); | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level); | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 Applied Linguistics (Master's level) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes

- The learning outcomes of the programme are logically related to the programme objectives and the specificity of the field of study.
 - Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or sense of responsibility and autonomy which students gain upon completion of the programme.
-

The learning outcomes of the combined programs in the philology cluster include the learning outcomes of the bachelor's, master's and doctoral levels and are in accordance with the goals of the programs, the mission of the university, the national framework of higher education qualifications and the qualifications awarded. In addition, the Bachelor's program of Georgian philology is in accordance with the highest field characteristic of Georgian philology. The outline and structure of the programs presented in the cluster and the unity of all their components ensure achievement of all the learning outcomes envisaged by the programs, which is confirmed by the program learning outcomes map. The Panel considers the learning outcomes to be measurable, achievable and realistic.

Competency maps have also been produced and the University has indicated it has taken a strategic decision to propose learning outcomes as a measure of competence rather than to group them, as per Bologna recommendations, as knowledge and understanding, skills and aptitudes, values and attitudes. Whereas this may prove helpful in convey to the target audience in a more unequivocal way the likely competences which can be expected on graduation, the Panel must observe that there is a risk of comparability and compatibility which the University is running. Namely, learning outcomes and their Bologna structuring represent a tool for effective transferability within the European Higher Education Area and serves purposes of increased mobility and streamlined recognition across the educational systems of the EHEA. A decision that moves away from the standard structuring is likely to put undue pressure on transferability and may negatively impact the mobility and recognition for the students of the University. The Panel believes that a stronger emphasis on competence-based approaches could be obtained if graduate attributes were formulated and prospective labour market profiles, which graduates could access, were clearly identified. This would indicate that the programs, and the cluster, are actively considering how market insertion can be successful and are explicitly guiding their students towards some appealing roles which may be emerging on the labour market. With employability being a priority objective for any program will falls under the EHEA, such an approach by the cluster could also generate increased awareness of employment options. This could be coupled with curricular components emphasizing employability and labour market projections.

On consulting the website, the Panel observed that the English-language versions do not mirror the descriptions in the SAR and that learning outcomes are not expressed consistently; e.g. the Georgian Philology program lists elements the student will learn and uses nominal expressions to capture these; the Literary Studies bachelor uses verbs to focus on the abilities upon completion; the master's programs do not have learning outcomes presented, while the doctoral program presented no information.

Additionally, in respect to the learning outcomes listed for bachelor programs, the Panel noted that not all actions represented in the lists of learning outcomes do, indeed, target high-level thinking commensurate to level 6 and above as promoted by the EQF and the Dublin Descriptors.

The discrepancy in the treatment of learning outcomes runs the risk of generating confusion amongst students and other external stakeholders. The fact that the terminology of "learning outcomes" is used to describe different approaches and their formulation is not comparable poses a risk to the program, on the whole: (1) to the admission process, as students may not be clear on what they will be required to achieve on completion; (2) to the process of curricular design, with curricular content needing to align to the

declared learning outcomes; (3) to the teaching and learning process as classroom interaction needs to ensure that with each activity the student is one step closer to meeting the learning outcomes; and (4) on assessment, as assignments need to be drafted so that learning outcomes can be demonstrated.

The Panel considers it to be of high priority that the cluster takes a unified approach to the formulation and implementation of learning outcomes.

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The SAR indicates that the learning outcomes of the bachelor's program of Georgian philology consist of nine points. The program is based on and takes into account the sectoral characteristics of Georgian philology of higher education. The program includes two directions: Georgian linguistics and Georgian literature. The program is focused on imparting basic knowledge of Georgian philology. The learning outcomes of the program include issues of the structure and functioning of the Georgian language, basic theories of linguistics, knowledge of phonetics-phonology, morphology and syntax, issues of literary studies, teaching issues of literary theory and history, skills of reading and analyzing literary texts, the connection between the eras of world literature and Georgian literature, analysis of the literary text based on the principles of tolerance.

On the website the following are listed under learning outcomes: the fundamentals, principles, and basic theories of linguistics; morphological-syntactic structure of Georgian language morphology, syntax, and sentence; meaning of linguistic forms (semantics) and use (pragmatics); history of language development; computer programs related to language teaching and collection and processing of linguistic material, when appropriate courses are chosen; fundamentals and principles of literary studies; basic literary theories; theory of Georgian literature; Georgian cultural national context; defining types of texts and linguistic variations; linguistic analysis of linguistic formations (text, discourse) and lexical units (vocabulary); text editing; collection and processing of linguistic data using special technologies in case of choosing appropriate courses; creating audio recordings and annotating them at the elementary level in case of choosing the appropriate courses; creation of an elementary language structure in case of choosing appropriate courses; critical, self-reflective approach to the history of Georgian literature and culture; creating a sound, logical, persuasive, and important academic work at the basic level; the relationship between literature and the discourse of power.

The Panel will like to note three important issues: (1) the way these are formulated do not align either with the Bologna requirements or with a competency-model. The use of the nominal may deter students to think that the focus is on knowledge, with few elements of skills; (2) there are a few instances where it is noted "in case of choosing appropriate courses" this proves problematic as learning outcomes should be designed to be met by all students irrespective of their individualised journeys; learning outcomes are a measure of the qualification which all students receive at the end of the program and should be formulated accordingly, with electives playing an add on or grouped in batches to achieve a broader learning outcome; (3) under the Dublin Descriptors level 6 qualifications focus on critical thinking and high-level analysis, this means that "to describe, list or present" fall in a lower order of thinking according to Blooms taxonomy and would be used in lower level qualifications.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Program Objectives Map;
- Learning Outcomes Map;
- External assessments of programs by industry experts;

- Student and graduate satisfaction survey reports;
- Reports of focus groups conducted with potential employers;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The SAR states that the bachelor's program in literary studies consists of seven learning outcomes and describes these to focus on the basic concepts of literary principles and concepts; literary families and features of genres; eras and trends in the history of literature; the connection of a literary work with relevant historical, intellectual and cultural contexts; the analysis and interpretation of a literary work taking into account its genre, epochal and aesthetic characteristics.

The website, however, lists eight bullet points (with the last two items under one bullet point) and these are: explain the basic concepts, principles, and concepts of literary studies; describe the aesthetic and structural features of literary families and genres; analyze and interpret literary works; list important representatives of the literature of one or more countries and/or epochs and convey the story/theme of their paradigmatic works; connect literary works with the relevant historical, intellectual, cultural context; determine the place and importance of Georgian literature in the context of European and world literature; evaluate the significance and value of a literary work; implement a research project with minimum supervision using the approaches and principles applied in the field on the current issue/problem in literature studies; able to interpret the data obtained and make an effective presentation.

Whereas, broadly speaking, these cover the content expected of such a program, these learning outcomes are formulated by using verbs to determine what type of actions graduates would be able to perform on completion and some of the verbs would suggest a lower level of education, where “describe”, “list”, “connect” (i.e. identify) would be associated with learning outcomes set below level 6. These could be found in course learning outcomes where the content progresses, but at the level of the program, it would be expected that they would be replaced with applicability, criticality, evaluative capacities.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Program Objectives Map;
- Learning Outcomes Map;
- External assessments of programs by industry experts;
- Student and graduate satisfaction survey reports;
- Reports of focus groups conducted with potential employers;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

The learning outcomes of the Master's Program in Comparative Literature consist of four points. The learning outcomes reflect the basic theoretical models and concepts of general and comparative literary studies, as well as the skills of their application in the analysis of the work. The learning outcomes of the program reflect the independent research of thematic, imagological, structural, genre and aesthetic aspects of Georgian literature in relation to the trends of world literature, the ability to critically read the literary text and recognize the ethical issues raised in it.

However, one of the learning outcomes is expressed as: “Describes and conveys the main theoretical models and concepts of general and comparative literary studies and applies them to the comparative

analysis of literary texts”, with the description and conveyance elements suggesting memorization, recall and possibly systematization.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Program Objectives Map;
- Learning Outcomes Map;
- External assessments of programs by industry experts;
- Student and graduate satisfaction survey reports;
- Reports of focus groups conducted with potential employers;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 4 Applied Linguistics (Master's level)

The learning outcomes of the applied linguistics master's program are based on the linguistic part of the sectoral characteristic of Georgian philology higher education. The SAR indicates that the program consists of seven learning outcomes, which include theoretical issues as well as the applied aspect of linguistics; analysis of the morphology and syntax of Georgian and other languages will be studied in terms of language typology and linguistic universals; the graduate can discuss such aspects as language variation, language change in a synchronic and diachronic perspective, as well as collect and process analytical material, define and use field work and other methods.

When determining the learning outcomes of the program, the results of the employers' survey were taken into account, as a result of which the practical part of the program was strengthened. Ability elements are privileged in the formulations used.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Program Objectives Map;
- Learning Outcomes Map;
- External assessments of programs by industry experts;
- Student and graduate satisfaction survey reports;
- Reports of focus groups conducted with potential employers;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

The SAR indicates that there the doctoral program „Linguistics and Literary Studies“ includes seven learning outcomes, which cover the development of such competencies as: independent planning and implementation of original research in one of the theoretical and/or applied research directions of linguistics and/or literary studies with knowledge based on the latest achievements, using innovative methods and adhering to the principles of academic integrity; contribution to the development of field knowledge and professional practice in linguistics and/or literary studies, both by sharing research results at the level of an internationally refereed publication and by transferring knowledge in an auditorium, in order to share research, participates in local and/or international thematic conferences, workshops and other meetings; publishes scientific articles in peer reviewed journals; contributes to the development of field knowledge and professional practice in linguistics and/or literary studies through knowledge transfer using modern teaching methods and approaches.

However, the evidence ‘Map of Objectives and Learning Outcomes Eng’ lists 5 learning outcomes the doctoral program which are all focused on “ability” verbal formulations which are suggestive of knowledge and behavioral elements, but do not explicitly structure them as such.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Programs;
- Program Objectives Map;
- Learning Outcomes Map;
- External assessments of programs by industry experts;
- Student and graduate satisfaction survey reports;
- Reports of focus groups conducted with potential employers;
- Interview taken during the site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The programs should revisit the learning outcomes and ensure that they all use formulations which are aligned with the Bologna tools and which are all commensurate to the level of education.
- The programs should clearly list on the website the learning outcomes and ensure that what is publicly available matches the definitive documentation held by the program management and used for the purposes of NCEQE accreditation.

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

All programs are recommended to implement the general recommendations above.

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

Recommendation:

- The program should fully re-draft all its learning outcomes to ensure that: (1) formulations become aligned with the Bologna requirements; (2) all learning outcomes are achievable via core curricular activities (not electives); and (3) the focus is on critical thinking and high-level analysis as proposed by the choice of verbs under Blooms taxonomy.

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

Recommendation:

- The program should revise the learning outcome “describe and convey...” to ensure the emphasis is on how theoretical models and concepts can be made use of in practice and where they can benefit the graduate on their employment journey.

Evaluation

| Component 1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes

- Evaluation mechanisms of the programme learning outcomes are defined. The programme learning outcomes assessment process consists of defining, collecting and analyzing data necessary to measure learning outcomes.
- Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.

The mechanism for evaluating the teaching results of combined bachelor's, master's and doctoral programs in the philology cluster of Ilia State University includes the monitoring of the method of evaluating the implementation of the programs. An internal self-assessment mechanism has been developed for program assessment, which takes into account the involvement of various stakeholders (students, graduates, employers, external evaluators, heads of the programs, working teams and university administration) in the internal self-assessment process. Self-assessment tools are used to assess program learning outcomes, as well as quantitative and qualitative data collection, including student academic performance, student semester surveys, academic and visiting staff evaluations, direct assessment of program learning outcomes, employer feedback, external peer evaluations of programs, alumni surveys, and other.

The programs included in the philology cluster are regularly evaluated for improvement. The university has developed a program evaluation cycle, which is 5, 3 and 6 years for bachelor's, master's and doctoral programs, respectively. One reporting period includes two semesters for data collection and a third semester for analysis and decision making. In order to improve the programs, changes were made in the programs, including the program structure, the program content, the learning outcomes of the program, and the evaluation system. University and faculty administration, program promoters and staff involved in the program are involved in the evaluation of the learning outcomes of the program.

It is important to differentiate between two assessment directions/approaches: (1) relates to the appropriateness of the learning outcomes, whether they are aligned with market needs, whether they have the capacity to set a measure for students which is at the desired level of education, and whether they can

be attainable for that level, and (2) relates to how they are used in practice, whether they helpfully guide curriculum development and content creation, whether they can be related to in the teaching and learning process and whether assessment, as they are designed, allow students to demonstrate their achievement. Whereas the Panel observes that there is strong emphasis on the former, it would advise that the latter also become more prominent as part of the quality assurance assessment procedures employed. As such, learning outcomes could constitute a clear and permanent filter for any analysis and evaluation of teaching quality, of assessment setting and marking and graduation requirements. Equally, any training on matters related to teaching quality and assessment competences of staff would need to relay back and maintain a strong focus on learning outcomes. It is via these two directions, one externally-facing and one internally-facing, that a comprehensive assessment of learning outcomes is achieved.

Currently, the Panel noted multiple deficiencies with the learning outcomes (under 1.2) which should have been identified via the evaluation mechanism described. The fact that issues of formulation and usage are not identified suggests the mechanisms are not fully functional or sufficiently robust.

The “Policy and Procedures on Development, Approval, Amendment and Abolishment of Education Programmes” discuss changes made and list changes to learning outcomes as being major and requiring a formal approval process which sees the change discussed by the faculty / school council, the university academic council and the quality assurance office before it is submitted to the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement. The policy further states that “In order to systematize the revisions and modifications implemented in the programme, the faculty / school maintains a database, which reflects the changes made in the education programmes, indicating the relevant decisions (date and number of the minutes of the council meeting)”. It is unclear to the Panel if only decisions which reach the university academic council are included in this database or if this is used for purposes of tracking more minor changes which could cumulate into major change over time and would require an adjustment of learning outcomes. The Panel believes that it is important to have a clear mechanism by which oversight is obtained in respect of more minor changes, which could eventually see the program change sufficiently to require an adjustment at the level of the learning outcomes. This is now even more pertinent under the cluster arrangements as oversight of the cluster and the synergies between the learning outcomes presented in the cluster can be imperative to maintain currency and cohesion. As the cluster approach now requires supra-programmatic tools for quality assessment and evaluation, the database referred to in the policy seems appropriate for such oversight on changes.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Programs;
- Objectives and Outcomes Map;
- Learning Outcomes Map;
- Target benchmarks; Assessment Criteria for Educational Program of Ilia State University;
- Regulations of the implementation of educational programs of Ilia State University;
- Results of surveys/assessments of various interested parties to assess the program;
- Changes implemented in the programs as a result of the self-assessment of the programs;
- Regulations of the Assessment and Development Office of the Educational Process of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences.
- Interview taken during the site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The cluster should devise evaluation mechanisms which have the capacity to maintain learning outcomes relevant, well-formulate and achievable and which verify the link between learning outcomes and curriculum development.

General suggestions of the cluster:

- The programs may wish to increase the focus on using learning outcomes as a filter for the quality of teaching, learning and assessment activities, when determining if they need to be revised, modified, or enhanced.
- The university may wish to make extended use of the database which currently collects major program changes (i.e. those approved by the council) and to allow for more minor changes to be logged so that there could be oversight and clear tracking of cumulative minor changes which could impact the whole cluster.

Evaluation

| Component 1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

1.4. Structure and Content of Educational Programme

- The programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes.
- The programme structure is consistent and logical. The content and structure ensure the achievement of the programme learning outcomes. The qualification to be awarded is corresponding to the programme content and learning outcomes.

The combined programs in the philology cluster of Ilia State University were developed in accordance with the "Rules and procedures for developing, approving, amending and canceling the educational program" in force at the University. The structures of the programs are realistic and correspond to the

relevant levels of education. The structures of the programs united in the cluster are coherent, logical and contribute to the achievement of learning outcomes. Admission prerequisites are provided in the structure of the program.

Programs in the cluster are composed of compulsory, compulsory electives (which form part of a grouping) and individual electives. The university advocates the individualisation of the student journey and makes every effort to offer students options which correspond with their career plans. This is a strategic positioning which takes account of international approaches to higher education where flexibility and modularisation are becoming increasingly important. Still, the Panel scrutinized if the programs retain a critical mass of compulsory content to ensure that the learning outcomes can be achieved by all students without differentiation and it was satisfied that this does happen. It is important to note that any elective options may allow for additional learning and supplementary skills, which can be helpful to support career aims by individual students, however, the compulsory content is the one that underpins the learning outcomes; as such learning outcomes need to be based exclusively on compulsory content as their achievement is a marker of unity across all students being awarded the same qualification.

The University has confirmed that internships are not a mandatory feature of any of the programs in the cluster and that invitations may be launched to students to participate in projects which the university supports; however, this is not available to all students. Students who do engage in internships will be remunerated and are listed as research assistants in the respective projects. The cluster recognises the benefits to students noting that they get exposure to the principles of field work as well as data processing in practice and even take part in expeditions. The cluster also confirms that many practical activities are organized as part of individual courses, however these are still within the university environment, rather than in a labour market context. With the increase of opportunities for humanities graduates, especially applied linguistics graduates, it is important that students get the chance to experience the world of work and some job profiles before graduating – this can give them a stronger sense of where their options lie and how they wish to proceed in their career. Internships are also a valuable source of information from employers in respect of the content and the knowledge, skills and attitudes which the various programs prepare students with. Following an internship, internship providers/mentors can relevantly articulate which areas may be in need of adjustments to ensure the currency and alignment with trends on the market. It is clear that some of the graduates will wish to embrace research careers in university settings, however, many others may seek to find appropriate roles on the job market and it is the responsibility of the cluster to give such students the necessary experiences to allow them to confidently seek employment.

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The bachelor's program of Georgian Philology consists of 240 credits, which is divided into the following parts:

Free Component: General Module - 60 credits

- Introduction to Modern Thought I, II - 12 credits
- Academic Techniques - 6 credits
- Statistics - 6 credits
- Practical Courses in English Language - 24 credits
- Introductory Courses coded INTRO - 12 credits

Major - 120 credits:

- Compulsory Courses - 60 credits;
- Compulsory-elective Courses - (Linguistics block and Literary Studies block, at least 12 credits from each) - no less than 42 credits;
- Elective Courses - 18 credits;
- Instead of elective courses, students can choose compulsory-elective courses of the program.

Minor/Free Component - 60 credits

Mandatory study courses of the Bachelor of Georgian Philology program ensure the development of basic competencies, taking into account the two main directions of Georgian Philology, the fields of language and literature. Courses in the field of linguistics and literature are included within the compulsory-elective blocks of the program. It is possible to deepen knowledge in the fields of lexicology, stylistics, the old Georgian language, Kartvelian languages (Megrelian, Laz, Svan), computational linguistics within the framework of the Linguistics block. It is also possible to deepen knowledge by discussing Georgian literary texts, as well as by studying Western and ancient literature within the Literary Studies block. Within the framework of elective courses, students have the opportunity to study issues of Caucasian folklore or journalistic writing.

The bachelor's thesis is optional in the program, however, depending on the goals of the program and learning outcomes, it is important for the graduate student at the bachelor's level to have the experience of creating an extensive written work using scientific methods.

The bachelor's program of Georgian philology corresponds to the bachelor's level and ensures the achievement of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- Competency Maps;
- Rules and procedures for elaboration, approval, modification and suspension of educational programs
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The volume of the Bachelor's program in Literary Studies is 240 credits and the standard duration of study includes 4 academic years. Credits stipulated in the program are accumulated according to the following scheme:

Free Component: General Module - 60 credits

- Introduction to Modern Thought I, II - 12 credits
- Academic Techniques - 6 credits
- Statistics - 6 credits
- Practical Courses in English Language - 24 credits
- Introductory Courses coded INTRO - 12 credits

- Major - 120 credits:
- Compulsory courses of the Literary Studies program - 48 credits
- Compulsory-elective courses of the Literary Studies program - 60 credits (at least 6 credits from each block of compulsory-elective courses)
- Elective courses of the Literary Studies program - 12 credits (a student can take compulsory elective courses of the program instead of elective courses)

Minor/Free Component - 60 credits.

Compulsory courses offered within the program ensure the development of basic competencies necessary for a Bachelor's degree and include the following topics: History of Georgian literature from a paradigmatic point of view, ancient literature and history of Western literature; Interpretation and analysis of literary text and specifics of creative writing.

The structure of the program does not take into account a practical component, which is important for synchronizing the learning outcomes of the program.

The bachelor's program in Literary Studies corresponds to the bachelor's level and ensures the achievement of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- Competency Maps;
- Rules and procedures for elaboration, approval, modification and suspension of educational programs
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

The master's program in comparative literature consists of 120 credits. The structure of the program includes the following components:

- Compulsory Courses - 36 credits;
- Compulsory-Elective Courses- 42 credits;
- Elective Courses - 18 credits;
- Master's Thesis - 24 credits.

During the first and second semesters, students study compulsory courses, research methods, theoretical courses, and in the following semesters they work on research papers and carry out master's research, submit and create master's thesis. The subjects included in the structure of the program reflect the field of philology, its specificity.

The structure of the program does not take into account a practical component, which is important for synchronizing the learning outcomes of the program.

The Master's program in Comparative Literature corresponds to the bachelor's level and ensures the achievement of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- Competency Maps;
- Rules and procedures for elaboration, approval, modification and suspension of educational programs
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 4 Applied Linguistics (Master's level)

The master's program in applied linguistics consists of 120 credits. The structure of the program consists of the following components:

- Compulsory Courses - 30 credits;
- Compulsory-Elective Courses - 48 credits;
- Elective Courses - 12 credits;
- Master's Thesis - 30 credits.

In the Applied Linguistics master's program, students will study linguistics research methods, issues of language typology, issues of the origin of grammar, and the relationship between language and technology. Students have the opportunity to improve their knowledge of the English language, learn Latin, etc. Students write their master's thesis in the last semester.

The Master's program in Applied Linguistics corresponds to the Master's level and ensures the achievement of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- Competency Maps;
- Rules and procedures for elaboration, approval, modification and suspension of educational programs
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

The volume of the educational component of the doctoral program - "Linguistics and Literary Studies" is 42 credits (ECTS) and the standard duration of education is 3-5 years.

The structure of the training component of the program consists of the following components:

- Compulsory Components - 12 credits;
- Compulsory-Elective courses - 6 credits;
- Elective Components - 24 credits.

Assistantship of the professor is a mandatory component of the doctoral program. In the mandatory/elective courses of the program, the courses "Literary Studies Theories" and "Linguistic Research Methods" are offered, which doctoral students choose according to their research field (literary studies or linguistics).

The program offers optional courses in both linguistics and literary studies. The educational component of the doctoral program is diverse and tailored to the program's goals and learning outcomes. The training courses from both Linguistics (including digital linguistics) and Literary Studies are balanced in the elective courses block. In addition, the course "Writing for Academic Publication", which is among the elective courses, helps the student to develop the skills necessary for publishing a scientific article.

The structure of the program includes a series of colloquiums starting from the first semester of teaching. Colloquiums provide systematization of the research process.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Programs;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- Competency Maps;
- Rules and procedures for elaboration, approval, modification and suspension of educational programs
- Interview taken during the site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The cluster should consider introducing mandatory internships for students at the appropriate levels to ensure that labour market experiences are available to students and can help them shape their views about potential career options.

General suggestion of the cluster:

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

Recommendation(s):

- The program should consider making the bachelor thesis mandatory, as this is an important component which can contribute to the achievement goals and learning outcomes.

Evaluation

| Component 1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

1.5. Academic Course/Subject

- The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject.
- The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.
- The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.

The study courses of the combined programs in the philology cluster of Ilia State University correspond to the learning outcomes. The number of credits of the study courses corresponds to the content, results and workload of the study course.

Modern and relevant literature is presented in most of the study courses, although it is also worth noting that there is a technical malfunction in one part of the study course syllabi, in particular, in the compulsory and optional study courses of the combined programs in the philology cluster: "Caucasian Mythology", "Practice in Georgian Morphology", "History of Censorship", great novels", "Introduction to Caucasiology", "Literary criticism", "Creative writing", etc. The works specified in the syllabi, in the list of basic and auxiliary literature are not indicated in the study topics, and on the contrary, the study topics indicate literature that is not indicated in the mandatory and/or auxiliary literature, also, the bibliographic data of the books is not indicated in full.

Study courses united in the philology cluster: "Language Policy in Multiethnic Countries", "Morphology I", "Morphology II", "Tergdales", "News, Interview and Information Article", "Public Speech", "Literature in "Immigration: Pariah, Immigrant, Jew", the syllabuses do not indicate in the topic, according to which papers this or that topic will be studied, or the topic is missing according to the weeks.

Also, the study courses "Georgian Languages (Megrelian)", "Caucasian Mythology", "History of Censorship", Introduction to Caucasian Studies", "Reportage, Portrait and Analytical Writing",

"Important Stages of Philosophical Thought in Europe and Its Influence on Literature", "World Literature Stories and Motives", "Linguoculturalism" and others. In the main and additional literature, Russian-language works are indicated (including works translated into Georgian), although the knowledge of the Russian language is not defined as a prerequisite.

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The Bachelor's program of Georgian philology is in accordance with the sectoral characteristics of Georgian philology. The study courses of the program include important issues for both branches of Georgian philology: Georgian language and Georgian literature. The program's courses of study correspond to the bachelor's level, as well as learning objectives and outcomes.

In the bachelor's program of Georgian philology, the general module is a mandatory component, which includes general university introductory courses, theoretical and practical courses focused on writing skills, foreign language, in particular, English language study courses. Mandatory study courses for the field of philology also include introductory and deepened study courses in linguistics and literary studies. Mandatory study courses also include field study courses in the direction of language and literature, including practical and theoretical courses. The study courses include the teaching of Kartvelian languages: Georgian, Megrelian, Laz and Svanetian. In literature courses, the teaching of cultural studies, the analysis of literary text, the teaching of periods of Georgian literature and others are taken into account. The program includes study courses in Caucasian studies. The program offers optional study courses in the direction of both languages and theoretical and deepened courses.

During the observation of the program, technical and content issues were identified, which require improvement in the preparation of syllabi, references to sources, and thematic guidelines.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- The rule defining the assessment, granting of credits, rating and payment for additional/repetitive courses/components of students/professional students of Ilia State University;
- The Regulations of the Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Degree of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences;
- Analysis of students' academic performance.
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The study courses of the bachelor's program in literary studies correspond to the bachelor's level, as well as the learning goals and outcomes. The study courses ensure the achievement of learning goals, are focused on the field of philology, in particular, on the field of literary studies. The program defines the development of knowledge and skills that can be achieved through study courses. Compulsory-elective courses of the program are combined in thematic blocks: "Literary Periods", "Literary Themes and Literary Motives", "Literature and Other Media", "Great Writers and Great Works". The courses included in the mentioned blocks cover a wide range of topics and give students the opportunity to deepen their knowledge about the topics they are interested in, based on their own interests.

During the observation of the program, technical and content issues were identified, which require improvement in the preparation of syllabi, referencing sources and thematic guidelines.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- The rule defining the assessment, granting of credits, rating and payment for additional/repetitive courses/components of students/professional students of Ilia State University;
- The Regulations of the Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Degree of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences;
- Analysis of students' academic performance.
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

The "Comparative Literary Studies" master's program corresponds to the master's level, as well as to the objectives and learning outcomes of the program. Study courses ensure the achievement of learning goals, are focused on the field of philology, in particular, on the field of literary studies. The program defines the development of knowledge and skills that can be achieved through study courses. The program is focused on the teaching of literary studies methods, it will teach students the problems of comparative literature studies, the important issues of the field are reflected in the study courses. A mandatory component of the program is the master's thesis. Issues of academic integrity are considered within the program.

The study courses of the program are focused on the field of literary studies. Literary text interpretation, methods of literary studies, academic writing for literary studies, contextualization of Georgian literature and other study courses include important issues of teaching in the field of literary studies. Current and modern issues, methods, theories of literary studies, such as the theory of narratology, drama theory, feminist criticism of literature, poet-colonial theory, etc., are reflected in the program. Also, both literary periods and currents, as well as the works of individual authors, are taught through the program's study courses. For example, Homer, Galaktion, etc. Elective courses include: 20th Century Anglo-American Poetry, Anglo-American novel, Literature of Romance countries and its role in the formation of European cultural heritage, Contemporary Spanish-Language Literature: Magical Realism, Contemporary French-Language Literature: Magical Realism, Italian literature - from Ottocento's literary inheritance to the present day, Portuguese literature in Georgian translations, Postmodernist art and post-totalitarian space, Visual signs and contemporary culture, Cultural Anthropology: Theory and Research, Georgian mythological stories, Georgian historical writing of the Middle Ages, Postmodern aesthetic theories, Identity theory, Cultural researches, Academic English.

During the observation of the program, technical and content issues were identified, which require improvement in the preparation of syllabi, references to sources, and thematic guidelines..

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- The rule defining the assessment, granting of credits, rating and payment for additional/repetitive courses/components of students/professional students of Ilia State University;
- The Regulations of the Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Degree of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences;
- Analysis of students' academic performance.
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 4 Applied Linguistics (Master's level)

The "Applied Linguistics" master's program corresponds to the master's level, as well as the goals and learning outcomes envisaged by the program.

Study courses ensure the achievement of learning goals, are focused on the field of philology, in particular, linguistics. The program defines the development of knowledge and skills that can be achieved through study courses. Important issues of the field are reflected in the study courses. A mandatory component of the program is the master's thesis. Issues of academic integrity are considered within the program.

During the observation of the program, technical and content issues were identified that require improvement in the preparation of syllabi, referencing sources and thematic guidelines. In the course syllabus "Linguoculturology (Language and Culture Studies)", in 6 (six) of the thirteen themes, the Russophone textbook published in Russia (В. А. Маслова, Лингвокультурология, Москва, 2010) is referred to as a primary source, whereas knowledge of Russian does not appear in the prerequisites and preconditions for admission. Moreover, the course title 'Linguoculturology' as a term occurs only in texts composed by Russian and pro-Russian authors. In the course syllabus "Text Analysis and Big Data Mining: Named Entity Recognition", there is no list of basic and additional readings; it states the following: "Readings will primarily come from online resources. There will be reading assignments from the following textbook: Jurafsky, Dan, and James H. Martin. Speech and Language Processing: An Introduction to Natural Language Processing, Computational Linguistics, and Speech Recognition. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 2nd edition. (ebook available on www.coursesmart.co.uk)". However, this website which is provided for consultation of references is far from being an academic website and its content is questionable even in terms of adequacy and decency. The Panel presupposes that this is a mistake; still for students to be directed towards such information is highly problematic and becomes debatable for the integrity of the program. Immediate action for correct is required.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- The rule defining the assessment, granting of credits, rating and payment for additional/repetitive courses/components of students/professional students of Ilia State University;
- The Regulations of the Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Degree of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences;
- Analysis of students' academic performance.
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

The study courses of the Doctoral Program in Linguistics and Literary Studies correspond to the doctoral level. The program includes the fields of linguistics and literary studies, students choose the desired direction from the mentioned fields based on the field of study and their interest and prepare a research paper. The study courses provide the teaching of modern knowledge and methodology in the field. Courses of study correspond to the objectives and learning outcomes of the doctoral program.

The program offers students courses that allow the doctoral candidate to deepen his/her knowledge of scientific innovations and research methodologies in the field connected to his/her research topic. For this purpose, the program provides a compulsory-elective block, which combines methodological courses in accordance with the research directions of the program, and an elective block, in which field courses

from both Linguistics and Literary Studies are offered. In addition, the doctoral student has the opportunity to have a seminar with a professor in an adjacent field based on his/her research interest and learning needs.

Evidences/Indicators

- Educational Program;
- Syllabi/Concepts;
- The rule defining the assessment, granting of credits, rating and payment for additional/repetitive courses/components of students/professional students of Ilia State University;
- The Regulations of the Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Degree of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences;
- Analysis of students' academic performance.
- Interview taken during the site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The programs should correct the gaps in the study courses regarding references to the main and supporting literature.
- The programs should ensure that the main and supporting literature is fully reflected in the subject of the study course syllabi.
- The programs should ensure that any literature proposed (especially as core literature) considers the language pre-requisites announced for the program to ensure that students can, indeed, gain access to the content of the books, in original.

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Programme 4 (Applied Linguistics (Master's level))

Recommendation:

- A list of basic and additional readings should be included in the syllabi and a website with relevant academic content should be provided; the current bibliography recommendation (as noted above) is unacceptable for an academic institution of high standing and becomes highly problematic as it has the potential to undermine the University's reputation and integrity in relation to its stakeholders.

Suggestion(s):

- The program may wish to reconsider the course information which relates to the term 'Linguoculturology'.

Evaluation

| Component 1.5 Academic Course/Subject | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

| 1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|--|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering

Prerequisites for admission to the programme, teaching-learning methods and student assessment consider the specificity of the study field, level requirements, student needs, and ensure the engagement achievement of the objectives and expected learning outcomes of the programme.

2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions

The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programme to achieve learning outcomes.

As far as individual programmes within the cluster have their own respective requirements, various kinds of admission preconditions and procedures have been applied. Preconditions for successful entrants have been clearly defined and formulated with respect to specific needs of individual programmes within the cluster. The preconditions are adequate and fair. Based on the SAR and other enclosed documents and interviews during the site visit, it can be stated that the programme admission preconditions and procedures are transparent and fair, and freely available.

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The prerequisites for admission to Ilia State University's Bachelor's Programme of Georgian Philology comply with the current legislation, and are transparent and fair. Applicants, having successfully passed the Unified National Examinations (Georgian language, foreign language, literature/history), are admitted to the Bachelor's Programme of Georgian Philology.

Admission conditions to the Bachelor's Programme and related details are posted on the websites of the National Assessment and Examination Centre and of Ilia State University.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Self-evaluation Report
- Admission Procedure and Assessment System of the Educational Program
- Mechanism and Methodology of Planning Student Contingent of Ilia State University
- Website of Ilia State University: www.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interviews taken during the site visit

Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The prerequisites for admission to Ilia State University's Bachelor's programme of Literary Studies comply with the current legislation, and are transparent and fair. Applicants, having successfully passed the Unified National Examinations (Georgian language, foreign language, literature/history), are admitted to the Bachelor's Programme of Literary Studies.

Admission conditions to the Bachelor's Programme and related details are posted on the websites of the National Assessment and Examination Centre and of Ilia State University.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Self-evaluation Report
- Admission Procedure and Assessment System of the Educational Program

- Mechanism and Methodology of Planning Student Contingent of Ilia State University
- Website of Ilia State University: www.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interviews taken during the site visit

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

The prerequisites for admission to Ilia State University's Master's programme of Comparative Literary Studies comply with the current legislation, and are transparent and fair. For admission to the Master's Programme, applicants must hold a Bachelor's degree or an equivalent in various fields, among them: Humanities (022), Languages (023), interdisciplinary programmes and qualifications including Arts and Humanities (028), Social and Behavioural Sciences (031), Journalism and Information (032), interdisciplinary programmes and qualifications including Social Sciences, Journalism, Information Management (038), Art (021), Business and Administration (041), Law (042), Information and Communication Technologies (061).

After having successfully passed the Unified National Master's Examinations, an applicant takes on university entrance (oral) exams: English language proficiency (B2) and Literary Studies. Successful applicants are admitted to the Master's Programme of Comparative Literary Studies.

Admission conditions to the Master's Programme and related details are posted on the websites of the National Assessment and Examination Centre and of Ilia State University.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Self-evaluation Report
- Admission Procedure and Assessment System of the Educational Program
- Mechanism and Methodology of Planning Student Contingent of Ilia State University
- Website of Ilia State University: www.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interviews taken during the site visit

Programme 4 Applied Linguistics (Master's level)

The prerequisites for admission to LEPL Ilia State University's Master's programme of Applied Linguistics comply with the current legislation, and are transparent and fair. For admission to the Master's Programme, applicants must hold a Bachelor's degree or an equivalent in various fields, among them: Humanities (022), Languages (023), interdisciplinary programmes and qualifications including Arts and Humanities (028), Social and Behavioural Sciences (031), Journalism and Information (032), interdisciplinary programmes and qualifications including Social Sciences, Journalism, Information Management (038), Art (021), Business and Administration (041), Law (042), Information and Communication Technologies (061).

After having successfully passed the Unified National Examinations, taken on university entrance (oral) exams: English language proficiency (B2) and Linguistics. Successful applicants are admitted to the Master's Programme of Applied Linguistics.

Admission conditions to the Master's Programme and related details are posted on the websites of the National Assessment and Examination Centre and of Ilia State University.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Self-evaluation Report
- Admission Procedure and Assessment System of the Educational Program
- Mechanism and Methodology of Planning Student Contingent of Ilia State University
- Website of Ilia State University: www.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interviews taken during the site visit

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

The prerequisites for admission to Ilia State University's Doctoral Programme of Linguistics and Literary Studies comply with the current legislation, and are transparent and fair. The basic prerequisite is a Master's degree or an equivalent either in the humanities or social sciences. The entire procedure consists of four phases: 1. An applicant gets registered and submits required documents, including the Doctoral Research Application Form with a brief description of proposed research theme, objectives, research questions and their relevance, methodology, expected outcomes, etc., 2. An applicant either passes a university entrance exam in English (at least B2) or submits a relevant certificate., 3. The Doctoral Research Application Form is assessed by a committee and approved by the faculty board., 4. An applicant takes an oral examination in his/her subject field. The entire procedure has been thoroughly described in the special document "Admission Procedure and Assessment System of the Educational Program." As soon as admission competition is announced, information about admission is posted on the University's website (www.iliauni.edu.ge).

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Self-evaluation Report
- Admission Procedure and Assessment System of the Educational Program
- Mechanism and Methodology of Planning Student Contingent of Ilia State University
- Website of Ilia State University: www.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interviews taken during the site visit

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Evaluation

| Component 2.1 Programme admission preconditions | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills

Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

All the programs included in Ilia State University's cluster essentially contribute to the development of students' practical, research and transferable skills. Relevant components within individual programmes facilitate development of these skills. It is noteworthy that, in the process of the development of appropriate skills, students are guided by exclusively high-ranking academics, both affiliated and invited staff; besides, centres and institutes of the University are actively engaged in the process, alongside various partner organizations (libraries, archives, publishers, research institutes, etc.) with which Ilia State University has signed memoranda. It is particularly noteworthy that the programmes within the cluster offer an interesting and productive mixture of curricular and extracurricular activities.

See Recommendation above on inclusion of mandatory internships to strengthen the practical components and give students a better grasp of the world-of-work.

A number of syllabi contain readers composed by multiple relevant sources combined through photocopying. Whereas this may seem a helpful way of giving students access to more resources, it must be noted that the practice of readers can carry risks associated to a copyright and that copyright infringement can take place if insufficient oversight is afforded to the process of composing readers. In interviews it was noted that the University allows up to 40% photocopying of any given book (the argumentative response to the draft report confirms the 40% allowable limit), which the Panel notes to be substantively above the 10% allowable through European legislation. The University will know what legislation is applicable in Georgia, and indeed quotes Article 22 on Reprographic reproduction of works by libraries, archives and educational institutions in its argumentative response to the draft report and notes that Georgian legislation does not indicate a specific permissible limit; however, in the spirit of academic responsibility and respect for academic effort by international scholars to produce works which advance scientific domains, it is important that University regulations align with international educational practices in this matter. Readers are less and less used internationally, and where they are maintained in

usage, institutional copyright policies are in effect to guide staff and students in respect of the requirements which need to be followed.

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The programme is designed reasonably and effectively enough in order to facilitate development of students' practical, research and transferable skills. Critical analysis, principles of academic work, and quantitative reasoning are the transferable skills developed by means of the courses such as 'Introduction to Contemporary Thought', 'Academic Techniques'; of course, there are programme-specific courses facilitating development of students' research skills ('Field Linguistics and Computational Processing of Language', 'Kartvelian Languages (Georgian, Megrelian, Laz, Svan)'). A significant aspect about these courses is that they are in compliance with the National Qualifications Framework and Learning Field Classifier. One of the strongest aspects is the fact that corpus linguistic projects and relevant resources are made available for BA students.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Syllabi of courses
- Self-evaluation Report
- Concept of Bachelor's thesis
- Concept of Master's thesis
- Concept paper of Assistantship (PhD)
- Concept paper of Colloquium (PhD)
- Concept paper of Prospectus (PhD)
- Concept paper of Doctoral thesis
- Competency maps
- Memoranda between Ilia State University and partner organizations
- Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulations of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences
- Interviews taken during the site visit

Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The programme is designed reasonably and effectively enough in order to facilitate development of students' practical, research and transferable skills. Critical analysis, principles of academic work, and quantitative reasoning are the transferable skills developed by means of the courses such as 'Introduction to Contemporary Thought', 'Academic Techniques'; of course, there are programme-specific courses facilitating development of students' research skills ('Analysis of Literary Texts', 'Creative Writing', 'Paradigmatic History of Georgian Literature'). A significant aspect about these courses is that they are in compliance with the National Qualifications Framework and Learning Field Classifier. One of the strongest aspects is the facts that corpus linguistic projects and relevant resources are made available for BA students.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Syllabi of courses
- Self-evaluation Report
- Concept of Bachelor's thesis
- Concept of Master's thesis
- Concept paper of Assistantship (PhD)

- Concept paper of Colloquium (PhD)
- Concept paper of Prospectus (PhD)
- Concept paper of Doctoral thesis
- Competency maps
- Memoranda between Ilia State University and partner organizations
- Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulations of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences
- Interviews taken during the site visit

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

The programme is designed reasonably and effectively enough in order to facilitate development of students' practical, research and transferable skills. It is a peculiar programme meant to enable students to master research approaches and methods of comparative literary studies in order to explore various literary problems from interdisciplinary and intercultural perspectives. It is noteworthy that the syllabi of the courses included in the programme are designed rather effectively, ensuring a student's both mastering theoretical knowledge in the field and acquiring relevant research skills for conducting full-scale research activities within a framework of his/her Master's thesis as an ultimate product of their academic activities within the programme.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Syllabi of courses
- Self-evaluation Report
- Concept of Bachelor's thesis
- Concept of Master's thesis
- Concept paper of Assistantship (PhD)
- Concept paper of Colloquium (PhD)
- Concept paper of Prospectus (PhD)
- Concept paper of Doctoral thesis
- Competency maps
- Memoranda between Ilia State University and partner organizations
- Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulations of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences
- Interviews taken during the site visit

Programme 4 Applied Linguistics (Master's level)

The programme is designed reasonably and effectively enough in order to facilitate development of students' practical, research and transferable skills. The programme concentrates on enabling students to become skilled in eliciting, collecting, and processing linguistic data, that is, to become a professional linguist. The courses like 'Language Documentation', 'Typological Analysis of Georgian', 'Grammatical Analysis of Megrelian-Laz', 'Grammatical Analysis of Svan', 'Word Meaning and Methods for its Study', etc., alongside application of a wide array of available technological, library, and electronic resources and involvement in linguistics research project implemented by academics of the University, provide for students' step-by-step growth as efficient professionals capable of conducting independent scholarly research.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Syllabi of courses
- Self-evaluation Report

- Concept of Bachelor's thesis
- Concept of Master's thesis
- Concept paper of Assistantship (PhD)
- Concept paper of Colloquium (PhD)
- Concept paper of Prospectus (PhD)
- Concept paper of Doctoral thesis
- Competency maps
- Memoranda between Ilia State University and partner organizations
- Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulations of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences
- Interviews taken during the site visit

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

The programme is designed reasonably and effectively enough in order to facilitate development of students' research and transferable skills. In order to provide for the development of research skills, the programme includes an effective component of doctoral colloquia, also ensuring periodic feedback. As for transferable skills, we should address the component of Assistantship which is well-designed and, hence, contributes to doctoral students' further professional development. It is noteworthy that training courses offered by the "Personal and Professional Development Center" (PPDC) were added to the updated version of the programme.

There is a significant precondition for the defense of one's doctoral thesis: a doctoral student has to publish an article in an international peer-reviewed journal (or present a proof that it is accepted for publication). It should be noted that this is a successful practice at Ilia State University and the cluster has provided the Panel with a list of articles which meet this criterion. Students have confirmed that they are well supported with this requirement and that they can access funds for the preparation of the article at the required standards, including for native-language proof-reading. The Panel was interested if research proposals undergo an ethical approval process as more journals are keen to confirm ethical approval has been granted by institutional authorities before publication. The Panel understands that for now the University ethical committee is not entrusted with ethical research approvals but mainly deals with disciplinary matters. It is believed that the university and its PhD students, as well as its academic research staff, could be better positioned to approach international journals if ethical approvals were also considered for humanities research, including within the philology cluster.

It should be emphasized that the documents such as 'Concept Paper of Assistantship,' 'Concept Paper of Colloquium,' 'Concept Paper of Prospectus,' 'Concept Paper of Doctoral Thesis' are clearly and adequately formulated and are readily available for PhD students.

Another significant aspect for a successful operation of the doctoral programme is the diverse international mobility opportunities for its beneficiaries (exchange programmes). Moreover, the Office for International Relations promotes both out-going and in-coming mobility of researchers and professors, which students have indicated support their research journey.

It was confirmed that any delay in PhD thesis defence is generally the result of personal constraints on the student, not lack of support on the part of the University and the supervisors, which students have indicated are extremely careful to motivate them along the way.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Syllabi of courses

- Self-evaluation Report
- Concept of Bachelor’s thesis
- Concept of Master’s thesis
- Concept paper of Assistantship (PhD)
- Concept paper of Colloquium (PhD)
- Concept paper of Prospectus (PhD)
- Concept paper of Doctoral thesis
- Competency maps
- Memoranda between Ilia State University and partner organizations
- Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulations of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences
- Interviews taken during the site visit

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The cluster should ensure that where readers are used there is clarity on the percentages of allowed photocopying/multiplication and that these are within international limits so as to avoid any risk that might be derived in respect of copyright. The University should have oversight of and verify the resources which are generated as a reader.

General suggestions of the cluster:

- The University may wish to consider extending the remit of its ethical committee to scrutinise research proposals (at all levels of the cluster) and grant ethical approvals which would support publication initiatives.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

The General Suggestion is most pertinent to the PhD program, but it can equally apply across the other levels of the cluster.

Evaluation

| Component 2.2. The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable Skills | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|--|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor’s Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor’s Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master’s Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master’s Programme - Applied Linguistics) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| | | | | |

2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods

The programme is implemented by using student-centered teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

Bachelor's, Master's and doctoral programs grouped in the cluster apply the student-centered approach and method of study, enabling a student to assume responsibility on his/her own studies in association with a professor, to participate actively in building up their own knowledge and opportunities, to be self-confident and creative. The teaching and learning methods applied within the programmes grouped in cluster give students an opportunity to retrieve and collect new information, compare old and new knowledge, draw conclusions and think independently, to construct knowledge, analyze and interpret facts, developments and concepts.

Teaching and learning methods correspond to an appropriate level of studies thus facilitating achievement of learning outcomes for individual courses and the programmes, overall. Each curriculum and syllabus list respective teaching and learning methods to be applied.

The University considers a variety of student roles: active student, research student, independent student, student team member, student researcher, etc. Hence, relevant teaching and learning methods are determined based on students' conditional roles and are student-centered. During determining the learning outcomes of educational programmes of the cluster, human and material resources of the University have been considered. Problem-based and research-based approaches become more and more intensive from the Bachelor's to the doctoral level. Students' needs and interests have been considered when making choices among various methods. Interests and needs vary according to a level; methods may be different within a level, and, in such a case, alternative methods are considered to ensure involvement of students with various kinds of needs and interests. Bachelor's, Master's and Doctoral programmes give students an opportunity to develop an individual curriculum based on one's academic background (Child Development Institute of Ilia State University has been instrumental in these activities). It is noteworthy that this is an opportunity and not an obligation. The University academic staff are involved in international projects, within the framework of which, in the programmes grouped in the cluster, new training courses and up-to-date electronic and technological teaching and learning methods are introduced and applied.

Evidences/Indicators

- Curricula
- Course syllabi
- Self-evaluation Report
- Rules and procedures for developing, approving, amending and cancelling the educational programme
- Programme assessment criteria
- Interviews taken during the site visit

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Evaluation

| Component 2.3. Teaching and learning methods | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

2.4. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.

The programs included in Ilia State University's cluster demonstrate reliable methods of student evaluation and overall, correspond to the general requirements of the standard in question. The components and methods of assessment employed in individual courses correspond to the specificity of subjects. The syllabi of academic courses provide methods of assessment for each of the components, for instance, the criteria for group activities, midterms, presentations, projects, essays are presented in detail. The minimal requirement for the final exam should not exceed 60% of the total point of the exam.

The assessment of students on individual courses at Ilia State University is based on 100-point system, which is distributed in the following way:

- (A) Excellent - 91-100
- (B) Very good - 81-90
- (c) Good - 71-80
- (D) Satisfactory - 61-70
- (E) Sufficient - 51-60
- (FX) Did not pass - 41-50 - the student needs more time for the exam and is allowed to retake it.
- (F) Fail - 40 points or less. - This means that the work of students dedicated to the subject is not sufficient and they have to retake the course.

The assessment of individual subjects is known to the students in advance via the Argus system and is also being discussed during seminars. The students have emphasized the objectivity and transparent side

of assessment, they receive feedback from lecturers about their mistakes, strong and weak points, which eliminates the possibilities of complaints.

If students find their midterm/final exam grades not objective, they have a right to file an appeal within 2 days. The process is usually conducted under the supervision of the dean. The field specialist or appeal commission, that consists of at least 3 members, will discuss whether the assessment was right and present the conclusion within 3 days. The results are uploaded on the Argus system.

The university monitors plagiarism not only in BA, MA and PhD theses but in academic courses as well. It employs the platforms such as Moodle and Turnitin integrated in eLearning which check the plagiarism level in academic papers that later is also reviewed by the lecturer/teacher individually to make a final decision whether the paper can be considered plagiarised or not. The Panel appreciates that the cluster maintains a stage of human scrutiny and final decision-making as an automatic decision based exclusively on similarity percentages can often be misleading, especially for languages which are only now findings that the performance of plagiarism software is improving.

Furthermore, Ilia State University has received funding as a coordinating university under Erasmus + project - Responsible Conduct of Research - Research Integrity and Ethics in Georgian Universities (ETHICS) to implement high quality research.

The evaluation of a bachelor's thesis is based on a 100 point scale, the minimal requirement being 51. The assessment is distributed in the following way:

(A)Excellent - 91-100

(B)Very good - 81-90

(C) Good - 71-80

(D) Satisfactory - 61-70

(E) Sufficient - 51-60

(FX) Did not pass - 41-50 - which means that a bachelor's student needs more time to present the research and is allowed to present the thesis one more time based on the individual work.

(F)Fail - 40 points or less. - which means that the work done by a bachelor's student is not sufficient and one has to study the topic/subject again.

The assessment components of bachelor's thesis are the following:

1. The evaluation of the first midterm by the supervisor - maximum points -20, minimal requirement - 11
2. The evaluation of the second midterm by the supervisor - maximum points - 20, minimal requirement - 11
3. The evaluation by a reviewer/reviewers - maximum - 30, minimal requirement -15
4. The evaluation of the BA thesis by the members of the commission - maximum 30, minimal requirement - 15

The evaluation of a master's thesis is based on a 100 point scale, the minimal requirement being 51. The assessment is distributed in the following way:

(A)Excellent - 91-100

(B)Very good - 81-90

(C) Good - 71-80

(D) Satisfactory - 61-70

(E) Sufficient - 51-60

(FX) Did not pass - 41-50 - which means that the master's student can present the revised thesis in the following semester.

(F)Fail - 40 points or less. - which means that the master's student loses the right to present the same thesis and they have to retake the course.

The assessment components of master's thesis include:

1. The evaluation by the supervisor - 30 points, minimal requirement - 16;
2. The evaluation by a reviewer/reviewers - 40 points, minimal requirement - 21;
3. The defense of the master's thesis - 30 points, minimal requirement - 16.

The assessment forms are logical and take into consideration the representation of the research topic, literature review; the formulation of research questions, aims, hypothesis; methodology and its correspondence to the aim of the study; analysis and interpretation; discussions and summary; language and style. The requirements of each component are presented in detail, which contribute to the objectivity of evaluation.

Application for Ph.D. studies involves several stages, one of them being oral examination. The evaluation form includes two main criteria: presentation and discussion, each being assessed with a 5 point rating scale. The total rating point is calculated by the arithmetic average of the rating points of each criterion. During the oral examination, Ph.D. applicants should give a ten-minute powerpoint presentation on the doctoral research application, which will be judged according to coherence and clarity of focus. Discussion section includes discussions on issues such as: research topic, research questions, methodology, literature review, research objective, hypotheses, expected results.

The assessment of the research project happens according to the following criteria:

- Research topic / problem - how clearly the research issue/problem is defined;
- Research questions and hypothesis - How well the research questions are formulated, how well the research questions/hypotheses correspond to the aim of the research;
- Methodology - How correctly is methodology selected and how clearly is the methodology described;
- Literature Review - How well the sources are selected and how accurately it reflects the existing knowledge about the research problem, how well the review reflects the need to create new knowledge;
- Aim of the research - to what extent the aim of the research is based on the literature review, how correctly and clearly it is formulated;
- Expected results - How clearly is the contribution of the research results to the development of the field formulated;
- Language and style - How consistent is the reasoning and discourse/discussion, how well the applicant employs academic style and style standards.

Each criterion is assessed according to the five-point rating scale. The grades are ranked from the highest to the lowest, the total rating grade of the doctoral application will be calculated by the arithmetic average of the rating grades of each criterion. The minimum total rating grade of the doctoral research application is 3.

The preparation for the dissertation involves several stages: Defense of prospectus in the second semester of studying; Students also received feedback from their supervisors about dissertation within the colloquiums, which are held once a semester. For the defense of the dissertation, the primary version of it is sent to the supervisor, who provides feedback according to several criteria: determining the issue, methodology, analysis, conclusions, interpretations, organization and style. It also includes

recommendations. In the second stage, the Ph.D. student sends the secondary version of the dissertation based on the recommendations given by the supervisor, who will decide if the thesis is suitable for the defense and needs additional corrections. The faculty provides all necessary forms for the evaluation of Ph.D. dissertation, such as: the form of review of the dissertation by the supervisor, the submission form of the dissertation to the supervisor, the submission decision form for the defense of the dissertation, the defense form of the dissertation. The evaluation forms clearly state necessary regulations and criteria for the thesis.

The reviewers of the Ph.D. thesis may be university professors/associate professors/assistant professors/professors-emeritus/research or invited persons from a local or international educational/research institution/research institute, who have a Ph.D. degree, an up-to-date knowledge of the field and have actively participated in scientific researches or/and have published an academic paper that corresponds to the theme of the dissertation. If the dissertation is written in a foreign language, then the reviewers should be competent in the particular language.

Ph.D. dissertation is assessed based on the following system:

1. Excellent (Summa cum laude) - an excellent work;
2. Very good (magna cum laude) - a result that exceeds the requirements in many ways;
3. Good (cum laude) - a result which exceeds the requirements;
4. Average (bene) - an average dissertation that meets the requirements;
5. Satisfactory (rite) - a result, that despite its errors, meets the requirements;
6. Unsatisfactory (insufficient) - unsatisfactory dissertation that fails to meet the requirements due to significant errors;
7. Completely unsatisfactory (sub omni canone) - a result that does not meet the requirements at all.

The defense of the dissertation is public and involves an external evaluator. Furthermore, the doctoral students are obliged to publish an academic article in an international peer-reviewed thematic journal/journals, which are included in internationally recognized lists (Clarivate Analytics, Scopus, Master Journal List, Ulrich's Index, EBSCOHost, ERIH PLUS, Latindex Catalogue). The publication should be relevant and correspond to the topic of the dissertation. This is done to ensure higher quality of the research. The Ph.D. alumni have highlighted the support from Ilia State University, administration and their academic supervisors.

Apart from the above-mentioned assessment methods, the students employ the academic style of Ilia State University. The book presents detailed information about the structure and requirements of different academic papers, including master's thesis, Ph.D. thesis, academic article, academic presentation, references, etc. It is available online on the page of ISU. As for the regulations and requirements concerning academic thesis, they are available to students in advance.

Ilia State University systematically sends surveys to students to provide feedback on the effectiveness of programs. The students provide feedback on different topics, interaction with lecturers, whether the results of midterms/exams, etc. are uploaded on the Argus system on time, etc. The results of the survey are employed as recommendations for the enhancement of programs. Additionally, according to the Ilia University self-assessment document, the effectiveness of BA and MA courses is monitored with statistical analysis of student's academic performance using such means as average and median, frequency and standard deviation. The system of academic performance has been developed in 2022.

It should also be stated, Personal and Professional Development Center of ISU develops various training courses and programs for the development of academic and administration staff. Additionally, staff have

indicated to the Panel that they can apply for other training opportunities, including participation in conferences, and the university will consider funding such requests. As such, the Panel concludes that both students and staff are well supported for appropriate teaching, learning and assessment experiences.

Finally, staff in the cluster have confirmed that assessment is by individual staff members for the components of the respective courses that they teach. The Panel wishes to note that international practice is increasingly advocating moderation and second marking (especially where external examining is not available) as means of guaranteeing the consistency and fairness of the assessment process. The Panel appreciate that this is not always possible practice for multiple reasons which may have to do with logistics or reduced staff members which can cover a particular course content; however, the university may still wish to explore extending the arrangements where 2 or 3 assessors contribute to a final grade, e.g. for graduation theses assessment to standard course work or final examinations, as this could strengthen the robustness of the assessment process.

Evidences/Indicators

- The concept of Bachelor's thesis;
- The concept of Master's thesis;
- The concept of Ph.D. dissertation;
- Educational programs;
- Courses syllabi;
- The rule defining the assessment, granting of credits, rating and payment for additional/repetitive courses/components of students/professional students of Ilia State University;
- Academic performance analysis document; reports from students and graduates of ISU
- Provided documents during the site-visit - consultations with coordinator, administrative staff;
- Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulations of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences;
- Electronic portal "Argus"
- Platforms - elearning.iliauni.edu.ge and turnitin.com
- Statute of the Personal and Professional Development Center.
- Project - Responsible Conduct of Research - Research Integrity and Ethics in Georgian Universities (ETHICS)
- Program Assessment Criteria.
- Self-evaluation report of ISU
- Interviews taken during the site visit

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

- The university may wish to consider developing a system for assessment moderation or second-marking to strengthen the consistency and fairness of assessment components, beyond the graduation assessments which are generally organized via committee.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Evaluation

| Component 2.4 - Student evaluation | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

| 2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them

The programme ensures the creation of a student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; promotes maximum student awareness, implements a variety of activities and facilitates student engagement in local and / or international projects; proper quality of scientific guidance and supervision is provided for master's and doctoral students.

3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services

Students receive consultation and support regarding planning of the learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the programme and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the programme.

Based on the official documents and interviews, Ilia State University pays a considerable amount of attention to the consultation and academic integrity of its students, which can be demonstrated by the existence of Argus, the system which serves as the main platform for communication between students, academic staff and administration. The students are regularly notified about scheduled meetings, conferences, events, internships, exchange programs; It is also used as the main program with which students can choose various courses, check their exam results and overall activities, feedbacks from lecturers; they can assess their own strengths and weaknesses that is beneficial for improving overall academic performance. The students during the site visit emphasized the feedback from lecturers to be objective and transparent and praised the platform for its efficiency.

The school provides effective ways of student integration in academic life. Newly enrolled students are given opportunities to become familiarized with the university system and learning process. They can also approach the coordinator, the members of the administration and lecturers for counseling depending on the individual needs. Furthermore, additional information for the newly enrolled can be found on the website of Ilia State University, which provides a PDF file with all necessary information including academic calendar, standards, payment methods, Argus, the Department of Student Relations, International exchange programs, etc. Apart from this, there are informative meetings with newly admitted students, who are given Argus password and e-mail so their involvement in academic processes starting from the very beginning of the first semester. As for the Ph.D. level, the International Doctoral School provides support for the doctoral students to enter into co-tutelle agreements with international partner institutions.

The interviews with BA (Georgian Philology and Literary Studies), MA (Applied Linguistics and Comparative Literature) and PhD (Linguistics and Literary Studies) students and alumni also emphasized the participation of the school in different activities.

The students received assistance for the improvement of their general academic performance, as well as career development. The Department of Student Affairs of Ilia State University organizes employment activities, such as: Marie Burduli Employment Month (twice a year) during which students and graduates have opportunities to attend various meetings held with the representatives of different organisations, the list of which exceeds 120 according to the Ilia State University Website. Unijobs - employment support programme that allows students and graduates receive information about career opportunities, programs which match their sphere of interest. They are provided with information about vacancies, meetings, workshops on a daily basis; the employment week for doctoral students organised by the International Doctoral School and the Department of Student Affairs. 15 organizations took part in the employment week, the employers met with the Ph.D. students and graduates of different programmes, held informative meetings, held job interviews and offered further collaboration.

The university has implemented numbers of projects connected to employment:

- BOOSTER - Career Development Accelerator - the goal of the project is to develop the most required skills of the 21st century, such as: critical thinking, collaboration, creativity, communication, etc.
- Nova Idea - annual grant project, which gives the opportunities to students to receive funding/co-funding of 10 000 GEL. The competition involves several stages. It is also noteworthy that the students of Ilia State University have approached Nova Idea to support the initiatives connected to the Ukraine.
- Iliiuni + - intended for students and graduates of ISU. Implemented since 2015 at the initiative of the Public Relations Office and in cooperation with the Department of Student Affairs, the project aims at developing and promoting career opportunities. The students selected through competition can attend one of the courses of the Cyber Laboratory Unilab of Iliiuni.

Among other projects can be named: Awareness raising projects, TOURMODE, ADS GEORGIA, RCHEULI, etc.

Apart from the employment months, for academic and career advancement of students, the university offers: student clubs, which help them to engage in university activities. This includes: Debate club, Dance Student Club of Iliiuni, History Student Club of Iliiuni, What?Where?When? - The Student Club of Iliiuni, etc. Students can join different types of clubs depending on their interest which also contributes to acquiring various skills necessary for their development. Contact Information about the clubs is presented on the official website of ISU.

Of noticeable importance is the role of Academic Writing Center in developing writing skills, which offers different informative and learning activities as well as vast resources in both Georgian and English. The students of all levels have an opportunity to receive consultation on topics connected to various aspects of academic writing. Zoom seminars are held on topics, such as: how to write a review of the academic paper, how to formulate the structure of homework and title, how to write literature review, etc. ISU's library has regular training meetings about the usage of University's resources and electronic system.

The library allows students to register and attend the below-mentioned training courses:

- General Training - On the Use of Library Resources and Services;
- On the Use of the Electronic Catalogue;
- On the Use of Library Resources;
- On the Use of Library Services;
- On the Use of Electronic Databases;
- On the Use of the Mendeley Program;
- On the Use of the Electronic Learning Platform - eLearning

The enhancement of overall academic performance is also achieved by different international exchange programs supervised by the Department of Foreign Relations. It holds informative meetings with students who are notified about these programs via Argus, electronic mail and social network. Furthermore, during the site visit, the students emphasized the organization and flexibility of the Ilia State University system of exchange programs. According to the provided documents, 20 students, including Ph.D. students, have taken part in international exchange programs via Erasmus+ starting from the 2016/2017 academic semester. The universities included: The University of Glasgow, University of Kent (Great Britain), University of Groningen (The Netherlands), The University of Upsala (Sweden), Paul Valery University Montpellier 3, Paul Valery University Montpellier 4 (France), Humboldt University of Berlin,

University of Dusseldorf (Germany), The University of Granada (Spain), etc. The University also offers the exchange program of Mavlena. The Department of Foreign Relations holds regular informative meetings with students, consults them individually, supports in preparation for appropriate documents and ensures student's awareness on international procedures.

The school takes an active part in organizing international events and entering international agreements. For instance, it has organized the event dedicated to the 100 year anniversary of Thomas Eliot's "Wasteland", where students also had an opportunity to interact with an American professor; Co-tutelle agreements for the doctoral students. The information about international events are usually sent on Argus and published on the official website of Ilia State University. The Ph.D. alumni stated that the school provides possibilities for all students to participate in international projects and programmes and that they are regularly reminded of all the opportunities available. Students noted that if they do not participate it is definitely not because of a lack of communication and support from the university but due to personal constraints which may intervene in their academic journey.

Apart from the above mentioned activities that are provided by the school, ISU has introduced a mentoring program on Ph.D. level since the Fall semester of 2022 academic year. The function of the mentor is to help students in career development, they will share their educational and professional experience, however, they do not have the same functions as the scientific supervisor.

Ilia State University also offers consultations for students who suffer from psychological issues, such as: depression, anxiety, low mood, problems connected with stress, etc. If such cases are identified or students request support, they are consulted by the graduates of Mental Health Master's Degree Programme accompanied by the regular supervision.

The Programs are generally co-led by 2 or more heads. The Panel explored how this co-leadership arrangement was working and whether responsibilities were clearly allocated to ensure that students and other stakeholders knew exactly who to approach for what issue. Whereas the Panel were told by both staff and students that irrespective of the questions they have, there is always someone on had to provide an answer, the Panel noted a variable, less formal approach where students may contact whichever of the heads to obtain an academic or procedural clarification. The heads confirmed that there were no written job descriptions for their roles with clearly attributed responsibilities and that the role of head was unremunerated and they believed it was working well especially as a result of their collegiate interactions and frequent collaborations. However, it was indicated that there was no record kept of the interactions with students, nor was there any formal consistency checks across answers provided. A risk arises here as students may be faced with variable positions, which could get confusing if a problem persists and the different heads are approached individually.

The programs have not reported international students, however the university does have Erasmus+ agreements set up and international students are likely to visit. The English version of the website is far from sufficiently developed and the information on learning outcomes was frequently found to be inconsistent or non-existing. This poses a hindrance to international exchanges, as well as the internationalization agenda of the university, as foreign students would check the compatibility of their own study program with what is on offer at the university and it may be that students are turning away because the information is not readily available. For example, the PhD webpage in English is under construction, at the time of writing the report, this means that an area which could well receive international attention from prospective students is unavailable to them from an information perspective.

Evidences/Indicators

- International Relations Office Statute - <https://iliauni.edu.ge/uploads/other/62/62039.pdf>
- Scientific Research Coordination Office - <https://bit.ly/3LfTXiC>
- The Center for Academic Writing - <https://writingcentre.iliauni.edu.ge/ge/>
- Student clubs - <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/studentebistvis/studenturi-klubebi>
- Employment months - Marie Burduli Employment Month - <https://iliauni.edu.ge/en/studentebistvis/marie-burdulis-saxelobis-dasaqmebis-tve>
- Unijobs - <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/siaxleebi-8/axali-ambebi-36/unijobs-dasaqmebis-xelshewyobis-programa.page>
- Nova Idea - <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/siaxleebi-8/konkursebi/studenturi-proeqtebis-sagranto-konkursi-nova-idea-2022-ukrainis-mxardasacherad.page>
- Iliia University Library - <http://library.iliauni.edu.ge>
- Iliia State University library - Training courses for students - https://library.iliauni.edu.ge/?page_id=21201&preview=true
- International Exchange Programs - <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/units/foreignrelations/gacvliti-programebi>
- International Exchange Programs - the activity of students of BA, MA and Ph.D. level
- The center of Psychological Consultation - <https://iliauni.edu.ge/en/studentebistvis/iliaunis-studentta-fsiqologiuri-konsultirebis-centri>
- Student Affairs Department Statute
- Rules of Academic Supervisors and Working Group activities;
- Student Psychological Consultation Center - <https://bit.ly/3MoRMxu>
- Career Development in the International Doctoral School - <https://internationaldoctoralschool.iliauni.edu.ge/ge/dasaqmebis-kvireuli-doqtorantebistvis-2/>
- International Doctoral School - <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/units/developmentoffice>
- Development Office - <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/units/developmentoffice>
- Portal “Argus”
- Portal “Elearning”
- Self-evaluation report of ISU
- Interviews taken during the site visit

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The cluster should formulate clear responsibilities for the role of Heads for the various programs and ensure that any communication with students is tracked to ensure consistency and transparency.
- The English version of the website should be updated and information should be consistent with the Georgian content.

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Evaluation

| Component 3.1 Student consulting and support services | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|--|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision

☑ A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctorate students to perform the scientific-research component successfully.

☑ Within master's and doctoral programmes, ratio of students and supervisors enables to perform scientific supervision properly.

Based on the documentation provided by Iliia State University, MA students have the right to choose the academic supervisor/co-supervisor by themselves in the third semester. The university provides the necessary forms for the agreement with the academic supervisor, research plan, conclusion and assessment forms for the supervisor.

The supervisors of MA thesis are required to have academic activity that corresponds to the general topic of research of the student. They should possess the relevant knowledge of the field, have actively participated in scientific researches and published an academic paper that corresponds to the topics of the MA thesis. The student can also be supervised by the Ph.D. student of the relevant direction who has defended a prospectus in this field or published a paper; or scholar who has a doctoral degree and relevant academic publication in international databases during the last two years.

As for the PhD level, the student selects their supervisor in research application before the submission of the application to the university. This can be the University Professor, Associate Professor, Professor Emeritus with a doctoral degree, who has research experience that corresponds to the topic of the dissertation of the student and has an up-to-date knowledge of the field. PhD student may also have a co-supervisor from a foreign country on the basis of agreement with the Subject Specific Committee.

The students and alumni of the MA and Ph.D. programs emphasized the involvement of supervisors, who guided the writing process of their master's and PhD thesis. Their supervision has been crucial for their personal development as researchers and describe the research process as useful.

PhD students/ alumni also described the preparation time for the application of documents for PhD studies and the research period for Ph.D. dissertation. They singled out the role of their supervisors in assisting them while choosing the right title for the research, topic, methodology, framework, literature but still retaining their academic freedom and flexibility. The supervisors also assist the Ph.D. candidates/alumni in publications, proofreading, giving feedback, helping with translators, and generally in the integration in local and international scientific networks, activities.

Iliia State University has developed a standard according to which on Ph.D. level one academic supervisor is allowed to have a maximum of 5 doctoral students. As for the master's programmes, there are 5 students per supervisor as well. Exceptions can be made if there are special cases. The number of students admitted to master's programs is: 15-20 on Comparative Literature, 8-10 - Applied Linguistics, 2-3 - the Ph.D. program. As for the academic staff, their numbers are 18, 13 and 25 respectively.

Time distribution for the preparation of MA thesis is individual, however, according to the concept document of MA thesis, students should have at least 2 hour-long consultations with their academic supervisor per week, which also depends on the specificity of research. Ph.D. students receive cyclic evaluation on progress, research design, are provided with assistance in the project management.

While working on MA thesis with supervisors, students should decide the topic and aim of the thesis. They should retain their academic independence and conduct the research, attend the consultations with the supervisor actively and consider the feedback for the improvement of the study. The supervisor also guides students in participating in scientific projects, events and assists them while delivering/presenting the results of studies.

Iliia State University holds inquiries with final semester master's students about the supervision done by their supervisor/co-supervisor. On the Ph.D. level, the given inquiry is conducted within the focus group. In spring 2022, the Quality Assurance Team developed a new questionnaire on the component of MA thesis and the assessment of supervisors by Ph.D. students. In the conducted survey (2020) among MA graduates of Applied Linguistics, the participants characterized the feedback from their supervisors as effective. The same results can be observed among the graduates of Comparative Literary Studies who filled the questionnaire. 2021 survey demonstrated that all participants from the programme of Applied Linguistics actively communicated with their supervisors and received feedback from which helped them in the writing process. Additionally, they emphasized the objectivity and transparency of the assessment system. As for the programme of Comparative Literature, the participants stated that the organization of administrative processes was done well, almost all of them (1 out of 11 participants did not defend the thesis) had regular consultations with scientific supervisors.

As for the doctoral students and alumni, the survey showed that all of them gave a positive feedback to their supervisors. They have emphasized their roles in publishing academic papers and described the research process as very valuable and crucial. Ph.D. alumni talked about the support from the administration and generally, Iliia State University. During the site visit, one of the alumni also stated the support she got from the university for using the digital tool, such as Catma for their Ph.D. thesis.

The university also provides the information about academic staff and their publications on the website of Iliia State University.

| Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | |
|--|------|
| Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors | 8 |
| //Number of doctoral thesis supervisors | |
| Number of master's students | 86 |
| //Number of doctoral students | |
| Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students | 0.09 |
| Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students | |

| Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | |
|---|------|
| Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors | 11 |
| //Number of doctoral thesis supervisors | |
| Number of master's students | 15 |
| //Number of doctoral students | |
| Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students | 0.73 |
| Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students | |

| Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | |
|--|------|
| Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors | 7 |
| //Number of doctoral thesis supervisors | 7 |
| Number of master's students | |
| //Number of doctoral students | 12 |
| Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students | |
| Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students | 0.58 |

The Panel were told that all categories of staff could take on supervision, including associate and invited staff, who are on limited-time contracts. It was confirmed that renewals are not guaranteed, therefore the Panel believes the cluster needs to take special care to avoid any risk to the student supervisory experience so that continuity may be maintained with the supervisor or supervisory team which was originally proposed.

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

According to the presented documentation, the maximum amount of PhD students per academic supervisor is 5. The academic supervisor can be the University Professor, Associate Professor, Professor Emeritus with a doctoral degree who has research experience relevant to the dissertation topic of the doctoral student. They should possess an up-to-date knowledge of the field, actively participate in scientific researches or/and has published academic papers relevant to the dissertation topic of the PhD student. PhD student may also have more than one academic supervisor having an academic degree of a Doctor or an academic position. The co-supervisor, holding a doctoral degree, can also be from another academic institution or a foreign country on the basis of agreement with the Subject Specific Committee or international cooperation. The information about academic interests and publications of supervisors is available online on the official Website of Ilia State University.

The university provides necessary documentations: application for the doctoral research, which among the components such as: the title of the research, research problems, literature review, the aim of the study, research questions, hypothesis, methodology, expected results, also includes the confirmation form of the academic supervisor / co-supervisor whether they agree on supervising the PhD applicant, etc.

During the site-visit, PhD students and alumni emphasized the involvement of their supervisor in academic activities. The alumni talked about the suitability of academic environment. Of particular importance is the assistance done by a supervisor. The regular consultations helped them in: choosing the right title, methodology, design of the research project, integration in the local and international academic

circles, publication of academic article in an international peer-reviewed journal. One of the PhD students highlighted the regularity of consultations with their supervisor: weekly consultations were also necessary for time management, motivation and workload distribution.

The university monitors the quality of supervision done by academic staff and supervisor. The questionnaire (2021) of PhD alumni and active students demonstrates their involvement in different activities, such as: publishing an academic article, the alumni stressed their assistance in publishing process, as well as the significance of regular consultations and receiving feedbacks from supervisors.

The Panel would like to note the commitment shown by the supervisors, but raise an issue which could have longer-term repercussions. PhD candidates will contact supervisors before they are admitted and they will work together on the proposal to be submitted with the PhD application. Supervisors have confirmed this is not part of their workload calculations, but, indeed, such preparatory work can take substantial amount of time which the university needs to account for. The Panel understand that this a characteristic of the Georgian higher education sector; still, care needs to be afforded to ensure that it poses benefits rather than works to the detriment of the student. It is important that students have access to the expertise of all the staff members when they choose their dissertations/theses topics, however it might be that a team arrangement could safeguard against discontinuity or an additional clause in the contract which may retain the member of staff until they have completed any supervisory responsibilities.

Evidences/Indicators

- Concept of Master's thesis;
- Concept of PhD dissertation
- Concept of PhD dissertation
- Application forms for PhD
- Portal "Argus"
- Information about academic staff online - <https://faculty.iliauni.edu.ge/metsnierebatha-da-khelovnebis-phakulteti/>
- Mechanism and methodology of planning student contingent of Ilia State University
- The ratio of supervisors and master's/doctoral students
- Report of graduate students
- Report of the Doctoral student and alumni focus group.
- Personal files and researches of academic staff
- Information about academic staff online - <https://faculty.iliauni.edu.ge/metsnierebatha-da-khelovnebis-phakulteti/>
- The Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulation of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences.
- The ratio of supervisors and doctoral students
- The mechanism and methodology of planning student contingent of Ilia State University
- Self-evaluation report of ISU
- Interview taken during the site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

- The cluster may wish to explore more innovative ways of guaranteeing continuity where associate or invited staff take on supervisory roles.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

Recommendation(s):

- The University should consider ways of quantifying, as part of the workload, the preparatory work that supervisors engage with prospective PhD candidates before their application process.

Evaluation

| Component 3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

| 3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

| | | | | |
|--|---|----------|---|---|
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | □ | X | □ | □ |
|--|---|----------|---|---|

4. Providing Teaching Resources

Human, material, information and financial resources of educational programme/educational programmes grouped in a cluster ensure the sustainable, stable, efficient and effective functioning of the programme and the achievement of the defined objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

- Programme staff consists of qualified persons who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes.
- The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability.
- The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programme. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation.
- Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff with relevant competence.

The combined programs in the philology cluster of Ilia State University are implemented by academic and invited staff, most of whom are recognized scientists in the field, have scientific degrees and are qualified researchers, have scientific works completed in the last 5 years, participate in various local and international forums, publish works. Academic and invited staff who do not have a scientific degree or scientific experience also participate in the programs united in the philology cluster, their scientific experience is not confirmed in the personal files provided by the university. The university points out that the academic and scientific staff involved in the program, who do not have an academic qualification in the field of philology, nor scientific experience, are selected with practical experience. This is especially important during the supervision of various types of scientific theses at the bachelor's level, including bachelor's theses, because according to the regulations on the bachelor's program, it is not specified in detail what qualifications the supervisor of the bachelor's thesis should have, but the following is mentioned: 'The student must choose the supervisor/co-supervisor of the bachelor's thesis. The supervisor/co-supervisor can be selected from the professors and researchers of the relevant field'.

Associate and invited staff confirmed their contracts are limited in time and renewal is not guaranteed. The Panel understands this is the specificity of the Georgian higher education sector, still it needs to note that special management decisions need to be in place to ensure the risk to continuity is reduced, this in respect teaching specific courses and the availability over time of the same content, in respect supervisory tasks and also in respect counselling tasks, with the Panel understanding that such tasks do fall under the duties of the associate and invited staff, also. The risk to the continuity of the student experience needs to be appropriate recognized and relevantly actioned.

In respect workload, it was confirmed that calculations exclusively refer to number of teaching hours or contact time, whereas assessments, continuous professional development activities, including for research purposes, or even allocated administrative responsibilities may not be quantified or remunerated under the workload matrix. The Panel believes it is important for the university to take a holistic

approach to workload and ensure staff are not just appraised on additional, non-classroom activities, but that these also form part of their contractual matrix.

The heads of the program are recognized researchers in the field of philology and are fully capable of dealing with the content under the program, for revision and enhancement purposes. However, the Panel noted that the co-leadership arrangement for the function of head of program needs to be revisited (see Recommendation above) as more formalization is required to ensure consistency and transparency of communication with students.

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The number of academic and invited staff at the program is borderline adequate with regard to the number of students (19/358). Balance between academic and invited staff of the program (15/4). Turnover rate is as follows: Departed academic staff - 2, new academic staff - 5, added invited staff - 2. The Bachelor's program is led by three professors. The majority of academic and invited staff are recognized scientists in the field, have scientific degrees and are qualified researchers, have scientific works completed in the last 5 years, participate in various local and international forums, publish works. Academic and invited staff who do not have a scientific degree or scientific experience also participate in the program, their scientific experience is not confirmed in the personal files provided by the university. The university points out that the academic and scientific staff involved in the program, who do not have an academic qualification in the field of philology, nor scientific experience, are selected with practical experience. Also, the program confirms such cases when the heads of the study course do not have an academic censure or research in the topic defined by the study course. This is especially important at the bachelor's level during the supervision of various types of scientific papers, including bachelor's theses.

| Programme 1 (Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)⁶ | | | | |
|--|----------------------------------|--|---|--|
| Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff) | Number of Programme Staff | Including the staff with sectoral expertise⁷ | Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction⁸ | Among them, the affiliated academic staff |
| Total number of academic staff | 15 | 14 | 14 | 15 |
| - Professor | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 |
| - Associate Professor | 6 | 5 | 5 | 6 |
| - Assistant-Professor | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| - Assistant | - | | | |
| Invited Staff | 4 | 1 | 1 | - |

⁶ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

⁷ Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

⁸ Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

| | | | | |
|------------------|---|--|--|---|
| Scientific Staff | - | | | - |
|------------------|---|--|--|---|

Evidences/Indicators

- Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results
- Personal files of administrative and support staff;
- Mechanism and methodology of planning of student contingent of Ilia State University;
- Concept of Master's thesis;
- Administrative and support staff job description;
- Academic personnel labor agreement samples;
- Academic and invited staff ratio to the number of students enrolled in the program;
- Number of administrative and assisting personnel;
- Regulation on conducting a competition for academic positions and employment conditions for academic personnel at Ilia State University;
- Regulation on hiring teaching personnel;
- Announced competitions;
- Rules and procedures for developing, approving, amending and cancelling the educational programs of Ilia State University;
- Rules on the duties and activities of the heads Academic Program and Working Groups;
- Workload scheme of academic, scientific and invited staff;
- Electronic portal Argus <http://argus.iliauni.edu.ge>;
- University website www.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

The number of academic and invited staff at the bachelor program of Literary Studies is very good with regard to the number of students (17/54). Academic staff (13) and invited staff (4) of the program, along with the staff turnover rate (departed academic staff - 4, new academic staff - 3, departed invited staff - 1, added invited staff – 3, that ensures sustainability of the program. The program is led by two professors. The majority of academic and invited staff are recognized scientists in the field, have scientific degrees and are qualified researchers, have scientific works completed in the last 5 years, participate in various local and international forums, publish works. The program also includes academic and invited staff who do not have a scientific degree or scientific experience, their scientific experience is not confirmed in the personal files provided by the university. The university points out that the academic and scientific staff involved in the program, who do not have an academic qualification in the field of philology, nor scientific experience, are selected with practical experience. Also, the program confirms such cases when the heads of the study course do not have an academic censure or research in the topic defined by the study course. This is especially important at the bachelor's level during the supervision of various types of scientific papers, including bachelor's theses.

| Programme 2 (Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)⁹ | | | | |
|--|----------------------------------|---|--|--|
| Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff) | Number of Programme Staff | Including the staff with sectoral expertise¹⁰ | Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction¹¹ | Among them, the affiliated academic staff |
| Total number of academic staff | 13 | | | 13 |
| - Professor | 5 | 5 | 5 | |
| - Associate Professor | 6 | 6 | 6 | |
| - Assistant-Professor | 2 | 2 | 2 | |
| - Assistant | - | | | |
| Invited Staff | 4 | 1 | 1 | - |
| Scientific Staff | - | | | - |

Evidences/Indicators

- Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results
- Personal files of administrative and support staff;
- Mechanism and methodology of planning of student contingent of Ilia State University;
- Concept of Master's thesis;
- Administrative and support staff job description;
- Academic personnel labor agreement samples;
- Academic and invited staff ratio to the number of students enrolled in the program;
- Number of administrative and assisting personnel;
- Regulation on conducting a competition for academic positions and employment conditions for academic personnel at Ilia State University;
- Regulation on hiring teaching personnel;
- Announced competitions;
- Rules and procedures for developing, approving, amending and cancelling the educational programs of Ilia State University;
- Rules on the duties and activities of the heads Academic Program and Working Groups;
- Workload scheme of academic, scientific and invited staff;
- Electronic portal Argus <http://argus.iliauni.edu.ge>;
- University website www.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interview taken during the site visit.

⁹ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

¹⁰ Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

¹¹ Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

The number of academic and invited staff involved in the master's program of Literary Studies is adequate to the number of students (21/86). The ratio of academic and invited staff (18/3) to the rate of turnover of academic and invited staff included in the program (new academic staff - 2, departed invited staff - 3, added invited staff - 2, that ensures sustainability of the program. Ratio of graduate students to their supervisors (8/86) corresponds to the methodology defined in the concept of the master's thesis and is in accordance with the workload of the supervisors. The master's program is led by two professors, the majority of academic and invited staff are recognized scientists in the field, have scientific degrees and are qualified researchers, have scientific works completed in the last 5 years, participate in various local and international forums, publish works. However, the program confirms such cases when the heads of the study course do not have academic censure or research in the subject matter defined by the study course.

| Programme 3 (Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)¹² | | | | |
|--|----------------------------------|---|--|--|
| Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff) | Number of Programme Staff | Including the staff with sectoral expertise¹³ | Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction¹⁴ | Among them, the affiliated academic staff |
| Total number of academic staff | 18 | | | 18 |
| - Professor | 11 | 11 | 11 | |
| - Associate Professor | 4 | 4 | 4 | |
| - Assistant-Professor | 3 | 3 | 3 | |
| - Assistant | - | | | |
| Invited Staff | 3 | 2 | 2 | – |
| Scientific Staff | | | | – |

Evidences/Indicators

- Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results
- Personal files of administrative and support staff;
- Mechanism and methodology of planning of student contingent of Ilia State University;
- Concept of Master's thesis;
- Administrative and support staff job description;
- Academic personnel labor agreement samples;

¹² In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

¹³ Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

¹⁴ Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

- Academic and invited staff ratio to the number of students enrolled in the program;
- Number of administrative and assisting personnel;
- Regulation on conducting a competition for academic positions and employment conditions for academic personnel at Ilia State University;
- Regulation on hiring teaching personnel;
- Announced competitions;
- Rules and procedures for developing, approving, amending and cancelling the educational programs of Ilia State University;
- Rules on the duties and activities of the heads Academic Program and Working Groups;
- Workload scheme of academic, scientific and invited staff;
- Electronic portal Argus <http://argus.iliauni.edu.ge>;
- University website www.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 4 Applied Linguistics (Master's level)

The master's program Applied Linguistics includes 21 academic and invited staff, the number of students is 15. Academic and invited staff ratio (13 / 8) and turnover rate (new academic staff - 4, departed academic staff - 2, added invited staff – 4, that ensures sustainability of the program. Ratio of graduate students to their supervisors (11/15) corresponds to the methodology defined in the concept of the master's thesis and is in accordance with the workload of the supervisors. The master's program is supervised by two professors. Academic and invited staff are recognized scientists in the field, have scientific degrees and are qualified researchers, have scientific works completed in the last 5 years, participate in various local and international forums, publish works.

| Programme 4 (Applied Linguistics (Master's level))¹⁵ | | | | |
|--|----------------------------------|---|--|--|
| Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff) | Number of Programme Staff | Including the staff with sectoral expertise¹⁶ | Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction¹⁷ | Among them, the affiliated academic staff |
| Total number of academic staff | 13 | | | 13 |
| - Professor | 8 | 8 | 8 | |
| - Associate Professor | 5 | 5 | 5 | |
| - Assistant-Professor | | | | |
| - Assistant | - | | | |
| Invited Staff | 8 | 8 | 8 | – |
| Scientific Staff | - | | | – |

¹⁵ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

¹⁶ Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

¹⁷ Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

A total of 27 affiliated professors are involved in the doctoral program of Linguistics and Literary Studies. The number of academic staff involved in the programs is adequate in relation to the number of students (27/12). The program staff turnover rate (new academic staff - 6, departed academic staff - 2) ensures the sustainability of the program. The number of doctoral students corresponds to the workload of the supervisors, which is ensured by the semester load scheme of the academic staff involved in the program developed by the faculty.

The doctoral program is headed by four professors. Academic and invited staff are recognized scientists in the field, have scientific degrees and are qualified researchers, have scientific works completed in the last 5 years, participate in various local and international forums, publish works.

| Programme 5 (Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level))¹⁸ | | | | |
|--|----------------------------------|---|--|--|
| Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff) | Number of Programme Staff | Including the staff with sectoral expertise¹⁹ | Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction²⁰ | Among them, the affiliated academic staff |
| Total number of academic staff | 27 | | | 27 |
| - Professor | 14 | 14 | 14 | |
| - Associate Professor | 10 | 10 | 10 | |
| - Assistant-Professor | 3 | 3 | 3 | |
| - Assistant | - | | | |
| Invited Staff | - | | | - |
| Scientific Staff | - | | | - |

Evidences/Indicators

- Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results
- Personal files of administrative and support staff;
- Mechanism and methodology of planning of student contingent of Ilia State University;
- Concept of Master's thesis;
- Administrative and support staff job description;
- Academic personnel labor agreement samples;
- Academic and invited staff ratio to the number of students enrolled in the program;
- Number of administrative and assisting personnel;

¹⁸ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

¹⁹ Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

²⁰ Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

- Regulation on conducting a competition for academic positions and employment conditions for academic personnel at Ilia State University;
- Regulation on hiring teaching personnel;
- Announced competitions;
- Rules and procedures for developing, approving, amending and cancelling the educational programs of Ilia State University;
- Rules on the duties and activities of the heads Academic Program and Working Groups;
- Workload scheme of academic, scientific and invited staff;
- Electronic portal Argus <http://argus.iliauni.edu.ge>;
- University website www.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interview taken during the site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The cluster should ensure that the qualifications of the academic and invited staff, as well as academic reviews and scientific works, correspond to the field of philology and match the subjects which are taught and/or supervised. Exceptions for practice-based experience should be made where justifiable.
- The cluster should ensure that supervisor of the bachelor's thesis is selected based on the specifics of the field the research topic belongs to. Where practice-based expertise needs to be involved, a supervisory team arrangement could be instituted.

General suggestions of the cluster:

- The university may wish to take a more holistic approach towards the calculation of workload where requirements should not be restricted exclusively to contact hours in the classroom. Multiple other activities, which are spent for the benefit of the institution, need to be quantified, including CPD and administrative work.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

Recommendation(s):

- The program should ensure that academic and visiting staff in the bachelor's program of Georgian philology have academic credentials and/or research in Georgian philology and the fields they teach.

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 Literary Studies (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

Recommendation(s):

- The program should ensure that academic and visiting staff have academic credentials and/or research in the fields they teach.

Suggestion(s):

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

Recommendation(s):

- It is recommended that academic and visiting staff implementing the Comparative Literature Master's Program have academic credentials and/or research in the fields they teach.

Evaluation

| Component 4.1 Human resources | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students

Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of research.

Master's and doctoral programs grouped in the philology cluster of Ilia State University have qualified managers with experience in relevant fields. The university has developed standards for master's and doctoral programs, which specify the requirements for supervisors of master's theses. In addition, the university has clarified the procedure for the completion of the Master's thesis of the Faculty of Sciences and Arts, which states:

The scientific supervisor/co-supervisor for the master's student of Comparative Literary Studies can be:

- Academic staff involved in the implementation of the program are equipped with the latest knowledge based on the specifics and development of the field, have actively participated in scientific research

and/or have published a scientific work that corresponds to the general topic/direction of the master's thesis;

- A doctoral student (with the status of co-supervisor) of the relevant field, who has a defended a prospectus and/or has published a publication that meets the requirements of the doctoral program.
- Scholar of a relevant direction or field who has a doctoral academic degree as well as publication in journals stored in international bases in the last two years (SCOPUS, EBSCOHost, etc.).

Programme 3 Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)

| Programme3 (Comparative Literary Studies (Master's level)²¹ | | | |
|---|-------------------|--|---|
| Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses | These supervisors | Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction ²² | Among them, the affiliated academic staff |
| Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses | 8 | 8 | 8 |
| - Professor | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| - Associate Professor | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| - Assistant-Professor | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| Invited Staff | 1 | 1 | – |
| Scientific Staff | - | - | – |

The scientific supervisors of the master's program in comparative literature have published scientific papers in international peer-reviewed publications, have been involved in local and international projects.

The university has specified the procedure for completing the Master's thesis of the Faculty of Sciences and Arts, which states:

The scientific supervisor/co-supervisor for the master's student of Comparative Literary Studies can be:

- Academic staff involved in the implementation of the program are equipped with the latest knowledge based on the specifics and development of the field, have actively participated in scientific research and/or have published a scientific work that corresponds to the general topic/direction of the master's thesis;
- A doctoral student (with the status of co-supervisor) of the relevant field, who has a defended a prospectus and/or has published a publication that meets the requirements of the doctoral program.

²¹ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

²² Theses supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

- Scholar of a relevant direction or field who has a doctoral academic degree as well as publication in journals stored in international bases in the last two years (SCOPUS, EBSCOHost, etc.).

The program provides students with relevant knowledge and scientific research experience.

Evidences/Indicators

- Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results
- Concepts of bachelor's, master's and doctoral dissertation work;
- Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulation of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences;
- Personal files of the academic and invited staff.
- Personal files of the academic and invited staff and web page: faculty.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 4 Applied Linguistics (Master's level)

| Programme 4 (Applied Linguistics (Master's level))²³ | | | |
|--|-------------------|--|---|
| Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses | These supervisors | Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction ²⁴ | Among them, the affiliated academic staff |
| Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses | 11 | 11 | 11 |
| - Professor | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| - Associate Professor | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| - Assistant-Professor | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| Invited Staff | - | | - |
| Scientific Staff | - | | - |

The scientific supervisors of the master's program in applied linguistics have published scientific papers in international peer-reviewed publications, have been involved in local and international projects.

The university has specified the procedure for completing the Master's thesis of the Faculty of Sciences and Arts, which states:

The scientific supervisor/co-supervisor for the master's student of Applied Linguistics can be:

- Academic staff involved in the implementation of the program are equipped with the latest knowledge based on the specifics and development of the field, have actively participated in scientific research and/or have published a scientific work that corresponds to the general topic/direction of the master's thesis;

²³ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

²⁴ Theses supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

- A doctoral student (with the status of co-supervisor) of the relevant field, who has defended a prospectus and/or has published a publication that meets the requirements of the doctoral program.
- Scholar of a relevant direction or field who has a doctoral academic degree as well as publication in journals stored in international bases in the last two years (SCOPUS, EBSCOHost, etc.). The program provides students with relevant knowledge and scientific research experience.

Evidences/Indicators

- Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results
- Concepts of bachelor's, master's and doctoral dissertation work;
- Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulation of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences;
- Personal files of the academic and invited staff.
- Personal files of the academic and invited staff and web page: faculty.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interview taken during the site visit.

Programme 5 Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level)

| Programme 5 (Linguistics and Literary Studies (Doctoral level))²⁵ | | | |
|---|-------------------|--|---|
| Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses | These supervisors | Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction ²⁶ | Among them, the affiliated academic staff |
| Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses | 7 | 7 | 7 |
| - Professor | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| - Associate Professor | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| - Assistant-Professor | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Invited Staff | - | | - |
| Scientific Staff | - | | - |

The scientific supervisors of the doctoral program have published scientific papers in international peer reviewed publications, have been involved in local and international projects. It should also be noted that on the basis of the co-tutelle signed with the University of Gottingen, 2 supervisors from partner universities are involved in the process of guiding doctoral students.

Iliia State University has developed the Dissertation Council and Doctoral Regulations of the Faculty of Science and Arts, according to which the qualifications of the scientific supervisor are specified. The scientific supervisor must be a university professor, associate professor, assistant professor, professor-emeritus, who has a doctorate academic degree, scientific-research experience relevant to the research

²⁵ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

²⁶ These supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

topic of the doctoral student, is equipped with the latest knowledge in the field, has actively participated in scientific research and/or has published A scientific paper (in the artistic fields - a creative/performance project) that corresponds to the general topic/direction of the doctoral student's dissertation.

The doctoral program provides doctoral students with qualified supervisors.

Evidences/Indicators

- Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results
- Concepts of bachelor's, master's and doctoral dissertation work;
- Dissertation Committee and Doctoral Regulation of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences;
- Personal files of the academic and invited staff.
- Personal files of the academic and invited staff and web page: faculty.iliauni.edu.ge
- Interview taken during the site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

Evaluation

| Component 4.2 Qualification of supervisors of master's and doctoral students | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|--|-----------------------------------|---|---|--|
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

4.3 Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff

- The HEI conducts the evaluation of programme staff and analyses evaluation results on a regular basis.
 - The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.
-

The academic and invited staff of the programs in the philology cluster of Ilia State University are recognized researchers in the field and representatives of creative circles.

In the university works a mechanism for the evaluation of academic and invited staff developed at the HEI, which includes particular methods and instruments of evaluation. The mechanism provides the assessment of academic staff activities related to research and teaching, and in the case of invited staff - the assessment of participation in the teaching process. The evaluation results are used for further professional development of staff, for the encouragement of their motivation and promotion.

The university supports the research activities of academic and visiting staff.

Personal and professional development center (PPDC) was established at the university in order to promote the development of academic and visiting staff, which provides study modules related to the improvement of the learning process for the staff involved in the teaching process, which are developed on the basis of the best international experience related to active learning methods.

The university has a scientific research coordination service, which provides important support to professors. Professors and teachers involved in the program participate in exchange programs, local and international scientific grants, publish papers in local and international refereed publications. The university has established a special award for young researchers - the Pascal award, which is awarded to a young researcher for an exceptional scientific work published in the field. The university also provides internal grant funding.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-assessment report
- Interview results

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):

Evaluation

| Component 4.3 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|--|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

4.4. Material Resources

Programme is provided with necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

With the presented documentation, interviews and viewing the material and technical base, it is clear that the infrastructure of Iliia State University which combines computer resource centers, fully equipped lecture halls, university library with diverse fund and rich electronic resources, including international electronic databases, the university network for student registration and learning process management Argus and distance learning platforms Turnitin and E-learning (www.elearning.iliauni.edu.ge) ensure the achievement of program learning outcomes and are used both in distance/electronic and in classroom teaching.

Iliia State University Library is represented by various resources, it is an information resource center, which makes information resources easily accessible through a variety of services. Specifically, the infrastructure of the university library is represented by the following reading halls: Iliia Hall (multi-functional), Sulkhan Saba Orbeliani Hall (multi-functional), Dutch Language and Culture Center Hall, George Tsereteli Oriental Hall, Botanical Institute Hall, Austrian Center Hall, Italian Language Center Hall, in Sulkhan-Saba Orbeliani hall is group work space, a corner with relevant equipment and multimedia resources. Also, there are two computer resource centers, where computers are available with open access. In the library space, in particular, in two computer resource centers there is a copying and two printing locations (in total three photocopiers). Book repositories, which are located near the halls, as well as separately.

According to the presented statistics, 133 computers and 160 projectors serve 501 students at the programs included in the cluster. All library staff members are provided with an appropriate work space. All spaces under the supervision of the library are equipped both with cable internet, and WiFi access in open access mode.

Library operates through operation rules, which along with other instructions are available at the library website and is visible in halls and other spaces.

Interviews with library representatives, academic staff, and students show that Ilia State University Library offers continuously updated bookstore fund to its customers.

The library standards are written and posted on the website: <https://library.iliauni.edu.ge/chven-shesakheb/standartebi/>.

According to professors, invited staff, library representatives, any books that are needed in the educational process - after writing the appropriate statement in the name of the dean, when the list of necessary books is filled, then it will be given to the relevant department, so that a tender can be announced and the HEI can purchase the necessary textbooks in a specified quantity.

The mentioned fund makes latest trends in various spheres accessible to interested persons, which in turn contributes to the achievement of learning outcomes of educational programs. Information on new books is regularly posted on the website and social network, so that users remain informed about the availability of new resources.

Based on a close cooperation with the faculty, the identification of literature envisaged by the academic syllabi and their accessibility is guaranteed in the library book fund.

The library also prepares reading material "Reader" both in printed and electronic form (see Recommendation under 2.2). Printed Readers are available in reading halls, and online ones - on relevant portals, which can only be accessed through university e-mail. A reader is prepared based on a request made by a professor, or a head of the course. The mentioned resources are processed according to the library rules and are placed in the online catalog search of the library.

Access to the collections of international and academic electronic libraries and databases is also well provided in the library of Ilia State University. The library, continuously offers customers the latest updates and holds a rich electronic library, which are included in recognized international lists, are available:

- Scopus
- JSTOR
- ScienceDirect
- Clarivate Analy[1] tics (Journal Citation Reports)
- PROQUEST
- ProQuest Dissertations
- EBSCO Discovery Service
- SAGE.
- Taylor and Francis
- Funding Institution
- eHraf World Culture
- Humanities Source, etc. (<https://library.iliauni.edu.ge/elibrary/sametsniero-bazebi/>)

Accordingly, the statistics of the use of international bases by students and professors is very high.

In order to use electronic resources even more easily and efficiently, the library has provided a unified search system, in which all the above-mentioned resources can be searched at the same time on the 'onewindow principle'.

One of the priorities of the Iliia State University Library is to interact with customers based on a variety of means of communication. Among the services offered by the library, training sessions have an important role: Using scientific electronic databases; Using library resources and services; and Training to use e-learning portal; - for both students and lecturers. In addition to the training sessions conducted by the library staff, the library also offers to the university community different training sessions with the participation of partner organizations and international experts, working and orientation meetings.

A specially created portal "Argus" - a choice environment assurance system, operates at the university with the purpose of management and support of the educational process. The university registers all students in this system, offers them teaching courses, posts electronic learning materials and syllabi. On Argus the students can choose courses, check received evaluations and accumulated credits.

Through the Facebook page of the Iliia State University Library, students have the opportunity to use the following services: "Ask a librarian", "Reserve a book", "Reserve group work space", "Interlibrary service", "Check debt", "Printing service" and others.

The academic personnel of the university has personal working spaces, which are used for individual and group consultations with the students.

It is also important to mention the involvement in international projects:

In 2018, the first major project of the international doctoral school was launched - the Karl Friedrich Lehmann-Haupt International Doctoral Program (LHIDP), which is implemented in cooperation with the Georg-August University of Göttingen. Participating doctoral students are given the opportunity to benefit from the scientific-academic guidance of Georgian and German professors and, upon successful completion of their doctoral project, receive a doctoral degree from both a Georgian and a German university. The mentioned project is implemented with the support Volkswagen Foundation and Shota Rustaveli National Scientific Foundation.

The university research institutes are involved in the implementation of bachelor's, master's and doctoral programs united in the cluster:

- Institute of Linguistic Studies
- Institute of Comparative Literature.

Iliia State University Linguistic Research Institute, implements research projects with the support of university, national and international scientific foundations: Digital Humanities Computational linguistics, digital epigraphy, digital prosopography; Study of Georgian sign language; typological research of Georgian languages, electronic documentation; Textology, research of ancient Georgian verbal heritage, publication; A study of the social history of the Georgian language; Research on issues of standardization of Georgian as a second language and Georgian as a foreign language in order to prepare textbooks; Research, translation, publication of Georgian-European sources of the Middle Ages and modernity.

The corpus of the Georgian language, which was created in 2009-2015, is a mega-project of the Linguistic Research Institute. At this point, the corpus includes more than 100,000,000 word-forms.

Also, the Linguistic Research Institute implements interdisciplinary projects in various fields of general and applied linguistics and Georgian studies. Major fields of research are: Corpus linguistics, Natural language processing, Computational lexicography, Study of Georgian Sign Language, Study of Kartvelian Languages, Sociolinguistics, Textology, Old Georgian Philology, Study of Georgian as a foreign language and Georgian as a second language.

The involvement of the institute's representatives in international projects is also impressive. In 2022 the academic staff of the Institute of Linguistic Studies has been participating in the European scientific and technological cooperation project CA21167 - Universality, diversity and idiosyncrasy in language technology (UniDive); In 2018-2019 - in the joint program of Oxford University and Shota Rustaveli National Scientific Foundation, etc.

During the implementation of the program, modern linguistic computer support is used, such as IPA help, Praat, AntConc 3.2.1, ToolBox, Syntax Tree Editor, ELAN, Oxygen, TEIPublisher, BootCat, memoQ, OmegaT, VLC media player, Trados, etc.

Within the framework of the Institute of Linguistic Studies there is a the direction of prosopography of Georgia, which includes the prosopographic base of the First Republic of Georgia (1918-1921) and the analysis of social clusters.

The direction of prosopography of Georgia is also important, which includes the prosopography base of the First Republic of Georgia (1918-1921) and the analysis of social clusters. <https://prosopography.iliauni.edu.ge/>

It is very important to mention the "Georgian Epigraphic Corpus Project" as well. The aim of the project is to familiarize the epigraphic community with the international standards of publishing electronic epigraphic corpus and to start a discussion about this issue. <https://epigraphy.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/>

At this stage, linguistic and technological standards for modeling the old and middle Georgian language are being developed. http://corpora.iliauni.edu.ge/?q=ka/proeqtis_shesaxeb

In terms of internationalization, The Wardrop Collection Online (WCO) greatly enriches Ilia's library services, it represents the first attempt to publish Georgian manuscripts held in the Wardrop Collection at the Bodleian Library online. The purpose of the repository is to present the collection created by Sir Oliver Wardrop and his sister Marjorie Wardrop in an online format and to annotate the manuscripts and documents preserved in it in accordance with modern standards in digital humanities.

The Wardrop Collection Online project was implemented within the framework of the joint research program of the University of Oxford and SRNSFG in Georgian Studies. As a result of the cooperation with the Ilia State University, the availability of the NoSQL database in the online space was ensured. <http://manuscript.iliauni.edu.ge/>

Programme 1 Georgian Philology (Major and Minor) (Bachelor's level)

For this programme, university has the material and technical base, it is clear that the infrastructure of Ilia State University which combines computer resource centers, fully equipped lecture halls, university library with diverse fund and rich electronic resources, including international electronic databases, the university network for student registration and learning process management Argus and distance learning platforms Turnitin and E-learning (www.elearning.iliauni.edu.ge) ensure the achievement of program learning outcomes and are used both in distance/electronic and in classroom teaching. There are also involved: Institute of Linguistic Studies; Institute of Comparative Literature.

Evidences/Indicators

- Electronic portal "Argus" <http://argus.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- University library and scientific databases: <http://library.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Electronic learning portal: <http://elearning.iliauni.edu.ge/>;

- Agreement on Turnitin Service License Transfer - available at Ilia State University Library.
- Ratio of the technical equipment to the expected number of students - available at Ilia State University Material Resources Department;
- Documents confirming the infrastructure, technical equipment and bookstores - are available at Ilia State University Library and Material Resources Department;
- Agreements concluded with international electronic databases.
- Institute of Linguistic Studies: <https://research.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/institution/19-lingvistur-kvlevata-instituti>
- Prosopographic base: <http://prosopography.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Epigraphy Corpus: <https://epigraphy.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/>
- Georgian Language Corpus: http://corpora.iliauni.edu.ge/?q=ka/proeqtis_shexeb
- The Wardrop Collection: <http://manuscript.iliauni.edu.ge/>

Institute of Comparative Literature: <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/institutebi-451/shedarebitliteraturis-instituti-472>

Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor))

There are for programme 2 has the material and technical base is necessary. It is clear that the infrastructure of Ilia State University which combines computer resource centers, fully equipped lecture halls, university library with diverse fund and rich electronic resources, including international electronic databases, the university network for student registration and learning process management Argus and distance learning platforms Turnitin and E-learning (www.elearning.iliauni.edu.ge) ensure the achievement of program learning outcomes and are used both in distance/electronic and in classroom teaching.

There are also involved: Institute of Linguistic Studies; Institute of Comparative Literature.

Evidences/Indicators

- Electronic portal "Argus" <http://argus.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- University library and scientific databases: <http://library.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Electronic learning portal: <http://elearning.iliauni.edu.ge/>;
- Agreement on Turnitin Service License Transfer - available at Ilia State University Library.
- Ratio of the technical equipment to the expected number of students - available at Ilia State University Material Resources Department;
- Documents confirming the infrastructure, technical equipment and bookstores - are available at Ilia State University Library and Material Resources Department;
- Agreements concluded with international electronic databases.
- Institute of Linguistic Studies: <https://research.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/institution/19-lingvistur-kvlevata-instituti>
- Prosopographic base: <http://prosopography.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Epigraphy Corpus: <https://epigraphy.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/>
- Georgian Language Corpus: http://corpora.iliauni.edu.ge/?q=ka/proeqtis_shexeb
- The Wardrop Collection: <http://manuscript.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Institute of Comparative Literature: <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/institutebi-451/shedarebitliteraturis-instituti-472>

Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies)

For Programme 3 implementing it is necessary too have material and technical base, it is clear that the infrastructure of Ilia State University which combines computer resource centers, fully equipped lecture

halls, university library with diverse fund and rich electronic resources, including international electronic databases, the university network for student registration and learning process management Argus and distance learning platforms Turnitin and E-learning (www.elearning.iliauni.edu.ge) ensure the achievement of program learning outcomes and are used both in distance/electronic and in classroom teaching.

There are also involved: Institute of Linguistic Studies; Institute of Comparative Literature.

Evidences/Indicators

- Electronic portal "Argus" <http://argus.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- University library and scientific databases: <http://library.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Electronic learning portal: <http://elearning.iliauni.edu.ge/>;
- Agreement on Turnitin Service License Transfer - available at Ilia State University Library.
- Ratio of the technical equipment to the expected number of students - available at Ilia State University Material Resources Department;
- Documents confirming the infrastructure, technical equipment and bookstores - are available at Ilia State University Library and Material Resources Department;
- Agreements concluded with international electronic databases.
- Institute of Linguistic Studies: <https://research.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/institution/19-lingvistur-kvlevata-instituti>
- Prosopographic base: <http://prosopography.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Epigraphy Corpus: <https://epigraphy.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/>
- Georgian Language Corpus: http://corpora.iliauni.edu.ge/?q=ka/proeqtis_sheaxe
- The Wardrop Collection: <http://manuscript.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Institute of Comparative Literature: <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/institutebi-451/shedarebitliteraturis-instituti-472>

Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics)

Results of study for programme 4, there is necessary to have material and technical base, it is clear that the infrastructure of Ilia State University which combines computer resource centers, fully equipped lecture halls, university library with diverse fund and rich electronic resources, including international electronic databases, the university network for student registration and learning process management Argus and distance learning platforms Turnitin and E-learning (www.elearning.iliauni.edu.ge) ensure the achievement of program learning outcomes and are used both in distance/electronic and in classroom teaching.

There are also involved: Institute of Linguistic Studies; Institute of Comparative Literature.

Evidences/Indicators

- Electronic portal "Argus" <http://argus.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- University library and scientific databases: <http://library.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Electronic learning portal: <http://elearning.iliauni.edu.ge/>;
- Agreement on Turnitin Service License Transfer - available at Ilia State University Library.
- Ratio of the technical equipment to the expected number of students - available at Ilia State University Material Resources Department;
- Documents confirming the infrastructure, technical equipment and bookstores - are available at Ilia State University Library and Material Resources Department;
- Agreements concluded with international electronic databases.
- Institute of Linguistic Studies: <https://research.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/institution/19-lingvistur-kvlevata-instituti>

- Prosopographic base: <http://prosopography.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Epigraphy Corpus: <https://epigraphy.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/>
- Georgian Language Corpus: http://corpora.iliauni.edu.ge/?q=ka/proeqtis_shesaxeb
- The Wardrop Collection: <http://manuscript.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Institute of Comparative Literature: <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/institutebi-451/shedarebitiliteraturis-instituti-472>

Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies)

For implementig this program is necessary to have material and technical base, it is clear that the infrastructure of Ilia State University which combines computer resource centers, fully equipped lecture halls, university library with diverse fund and rich electronic resources, including international electronic databases, the university network for student registration and learning process management Argus and distance learning platforms Turnitin and E-learning (www.elearning.iliauni.edu.ge) ensure the achievement of program learning outcomes and are used both in distance/electronic and in classroom teaching.

There are also involved: Institute of Linguistic Studies; Institute of Comparative Literature

Evidences/Indicators

- Electronic portal "Argus" <http://argus.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- University library and scientific databases: <http://library.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Electronic learning portal: <http://elearning.iliauni.edu.ge/>;
- Agreement on Turnitin Service License Transfer - available at Ilia State University Library.
- Ratio of the technical equipment to the expected number of students - available at Ilia State University Material Resources Department;
- Documents confirming the infrastructure, technical equipment and bookstores - are available at Ilia State University Library and Material Resources Department;
- Agreements concluded with international electronic databases.
- Institute of Linguistic Studies: <https://research.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/institution/19-lingvistur-kvlevata-instituti>
- Prosopographic base: <http://prosopography.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Epigraphy Corpus: <https://epigraphy.iliauni.edu.ge/ka/>
- Georgian Language Corpus: http://corpora.iliauni.edu.ge/?q=ka/proeqtis_shesaxeb
- The Wardrop Collection: <http://manuscript.iliauni.edu.ge/>
- Institute of Comparative Literature: <https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/institutebi-451/shedarebitiliteraturis-instituti-472>

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):

Evaluation

| Component 4.4 Material resources | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the programme needs.

Financial resources necessary for the program implementation are considered by the unified university budget in a manner that corresponds to a certain program needs. Allocation of the financial resources provided by the budget is economically achievable. The programs are financially stable and their budget includes: the costs necessary for the development of the program, the costs of financing resources, the costs of personnel and other relevant costs related to the implementation of the program.

In addition, it should be noted that the educational process of the program is mainly provided by the academic staff of the faculty, whose salary expenses are included in the central budget of the university, and the specific doctoral program does not require additional expenses.

The cost of updating the library resource is also included in the central budget of the university. Expenses required for the program will be covered from the main budget of the faculty and/or university.

Programme 1 Georgian philology (main and additional specialty)

Based on the analysis of the presented documentation and the information received through the interviews, the amount of expenditure required for the implementation of the program amounts to 267,300 GEL. Student tuition fees are financed by the state as a priority direction. The cost of one academic year is 67,350 GEL, including: literature and other library resources 14,000 GEL, and infrastructure renovation and maintenance costs 35,250 GEL.

Programme 2 Bachelor's program - Literary studies (main and additional specialty)

The amount of expenditure required for the implementation of the program is 56,250 GEL. The annual income of 25 students enrolled in unified national exams is -56,250 GEL. The cost of one academic year is 22,600 GEL, including: literature resources - 3,000, and infrastructure renewal and maintenance costs are 6,000 GEL.

Programme 3 Master's program - Comparative Literature

The amount of expenditure required for the implementation of the program is 90,000 GEL. The income of 24 students enrolled in unified national exams is -108,000 GEL for two years. The cost of the full academic year is 39,400 GEL, including: literature resources - 5,400, and infrastructure renewal and maintenance cost is 8,500 GEL.

Programme 4 Master's program - Applied Linguistics

The amount of expenditure required for the implementation of the program is 45,000 GEL. The income of 10 students enrolled in unified national exams for two years is 108,000 GEL. The cost of a full academic year is 30,000 GEL, including: literature resources - 5,400, and infrastructure renovation and maintenance cost is 8,500 GEL.

Programme 5 Doctoral program - Linguistics and Literary Studies

Studying in the program is fully financed by Ilia State University for three years, therefore, studying for students is free. According to the representatives of the HEI administration, the study lasts for 3-5 years, within 3 years the doctoral student must complete his studies and must cover all the stages stipulated by the statute - must adhere to the prospectus, if he fails to enter within the period stipulated by the statute, he will have to go through additional semesters and in such a case, self-financing .

Also, after two years, the doctoral student must publish an article in an international journal (in the journals available in the international databases established by them and published by HEI, which are also highly rated journals). Even if he fails to meet this requirement, he will have to finance his studies himself.

As for the costs of implementing the program, the necessary cost for the implementation of the full program is 57,000 GEL, including the salary cost - 30,600. It is important that the educational process of the program is mainly provided by the academic staff of the faculty, whose salary costs are included in the central budget of the university. It does not require expenses.

Evidences/Indicators.

- Budget of Ilia State University,
- Budgets of educational programs.

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes:

Evaluation

| Component 4.5 Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|-------------------------------|--|---|--------------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

| 4. Providing Teaching Resources | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|--|-------------------------------|--|---|--------------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development.

5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation

Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance department(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of programme quality assurance, developing assessment instruments, and implementing assessment process. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

The educational programs of the cluster use internal quality assessment mechanisms, which are carried out in accordance with the quality policy developed and in effect at the university. The presented documentation and the interviews conducted within the visit show that issues related to internal quality assurance are coordinated by the Quality Assurance Service of the Faculty of Sciences and Arts of Ilia State University/University Management department, whose main task is to raise the quality of the educational process, to develop the necessary tools and methods for evaluating the quality of the educational process, to plan the periodicity of the evaluation, to provide evaluation and based on the obtained data to give recommendations to improve the quality of the educational process. The quality service has 11 specialists who coordinate these processes. The heads of the programs in the cluster, along with the Head and the senior specialists of the Quality Assurance Service of the Faculty collaborates with the Quality Assurance Service of the University in the process of planning of the evaluation of program quality, developing of the evaluation instruments and implementing the evaluation.

The self-evaluation process is important for the university's internal quality assurance mechanisms and is based on studies of students in cluster programs, alumni (focus group reports where relevant), feedback from employers, and external evaluation of master's and doctoral programs.

Based on the data collected using the internal self-assessment tools, the heads of the program together with the program working group, will develop internal self-assessment reports, which include the determination of the strengths and weaknesses identified as a result of the self-assessment during the reporting period and the planning of relevant activities/interventions for the purpose of improving and developing the program.

In order to ensure the above, the quality assurance service relies on regulatory provisions of the activity.

The University has well-planned and implemented procedures, on the basis of which the current processes are evaluated. Based on the evaluation results, further development and improvement based on the "Plan, Implement, Test, Develop" principle.

It is important to note that participation in stakeholder surveys not only provides valuable feedback, but also shares responsibility for program improvement. The interviews have confirmed high percentages of student response to the surveys conducted. The alumni, however, indicated that no surveys had been conducted for their stakeholder group, however the QA department indicated that for graduates focus groups were deemed more relevant. Employers confirmed that their involvement was both in surveys and subsequent discussions allowing them to be instrumental to the curriculum re-design process.

Educational program evaluation is a regular process, for which both direct and indirect methods are used; Both quantitative and qualitative data, which is confirmed by the package of documents presented and the information mentioned in the interviews. The Quality representatives indicated in the interviews that the data they hold on record is fairly new as during the pandemic consistent data was a problem; however now the

data is slowly building up and allows them to get a clear perspective of areas of weakness and strength. The Panel noticed that the policy on Development, Approval, Amendment and Abolishment of Education Programmes indicates the procedures for closure but does not propose any objective triggers for this. In future the quality office may wish to institute such triggers for easier operationalization of the policy.

The interviews also showed that the survey of interested parties cover their satisfaction with the quality of services to students and staff, the material and technical base, the use of library funds, etc. It was confirmed that more recently surveys were re-designed to be made more relevant for the areas under scrutiny (whereas previously the same survey template was used across all services).

The collegial evaluation system is actively working, which is a contributing factor in the process of developmental evaluation of educational programs. During the interview with the invited lecturers, it was revealed that their lectures were actively attended by the head of the program and the representative of the quality service - especially in the first period of the start of work. Teaching observations are conducted by notice or unannounced and lecture demonstrations are also organized for mentoring and developmental purposes. Such practices are supported by an evaluation rubric, which is consistently used.

The Panel observed that the syllabi of the programs presented in this cluster contain certain types of technical and content gaps, therefore, during the collegial attendance, as well as in the evaluation process of the programs, it is desirable to identify technical and content gaps together with the heads of the programs in order to improve the quality and eliminate them. The Quality Assurance Service should consider developing certain mechanisms in this regard. It would also be important to pay attention to the field in which the academic and invited staff has a degree or the direction of their research according to the courses to be read. (see Recommendations above)

During the interview, it was also revealed that the assessment of academic staff's scientific activity plays a role in the review and adjustment processes. The annual report form, which staff fill out each academic year, combines different types of activities, both scientific and creative. The received data is then processed by the faculty council and the quality service, after which suggestions are made to the staff according to areas for improvement. According to the identified needs, activities are planned individually with the academic staff. The scientific and practical hours to be spent by the staff are detailed in the staff contract. (please also see Recommendation on workload) The Panel noted that the cluster can also consider proposing joint developmental/training sessions or activities of good practice sharing which could combine the needs identified during the individual staff appraisals.

Based on the above, the internal quality assessment mechanisms used by the educational programs included in the cluster are sound. The Panel concluded that the directions of work of the quality assurance service are student-oriented and serve to improve the quality of teaching and research.

During the meetings, it was clear to the Panel that the academics and invited persons of the bachelor's, master's and doctoral educational programs are familiar with these mechanisms and consider their use effective for the program and self-development.

Deficiencies identified by internal quality mechanisms are actively discussed by the self-evaluation working group, as well as at faculty council meetings, valuable recommendations are developed, based on which appropriate changes are made, and finally approved by the Academic Council of the University.

While under the pandemic, in order to ensure the learning results of the program, before the transition to distance learning, the Quality Assurance Service of the State University of Higher Education developed

the "Regulatory Document for the Quality Assurance of Electronic Learning", on the basis of which academic and invited staff reworked the training courses, the methodology of effectively managing the teaching process.

Overall, it was important for the Panel to see that the Quality Assurance Service and the university had given consideration to what a cluster approach for accreditation meant to their internal structures and whether any changes or adjustments need to be made to be able to successfully embed a cluster perspective. It was clear that some of the following issues were under debate, such as more effective oversight, synergies across content and content progression, as well as staff engagement and how the experience of staff working on multiple programs in parallel in the cluster could be harnessed to benefit the developments across the cluster. This is, of course, a process at the beginning, but the Panel noted the thinking processes that were already guiding future approaches. This is specifically relevant because it appeared to the Panel, and this was confirmed by interviews that review processes were generally connected to NCEQE accreditation processes, with self-evaluation activities and intensified stakeholder engagement happening at the time when an NCEQE assessment was being prepared. While the Panel appreciates that the Georgian context operates on a cycle which is externally driven, eventually more emphasis will need to be placed on an internally determined cycle where stakeholder engagement activities are not a result of NCEQE activities, but rather a constant and repetitive feature of the internal context which generates data and information that can feed into external processes, as and when needed. Not least, noteworthy is the approach driven internally by the institution to employ external expertise to inform development in preparation of external quality assurance undertaken by NCEQE. This approach could become a valuable feature of internal quality assurance to be conducted at regular intervals as part of program monitoring and review procedures.

The Panel found that the potential for the cluster to take on an approach with strong constant stakeholder engagement was present, as from the interviews it was clear that the employers were extremely willing to put their time, knowledge and expertise towards supporting the programs in the cluster to develop. Similarly, students who were confirmed to sit in the Council across all agenda items represented a mature stakeholder group. It was surprising to the Panel that the cluster decided not to have direct interaction with students for the drafting of the self-assessment report, but management staff did confirm that student representative views were captured via the surveys administered.

For a robust internal quality assurance system to be in operation, the Quality Assurance Service would need to give dedicated attention to the information which is released about the programs, individually, and as cluster formation. Consequently, the English version of the website needs to be consistent with other documentation. At the time of the report, multiple discrepancies were identified, including the facts that the names of the programs were not correctly presented, i.e. for the master's programs there was a Linguistics program (not Applied Linguistics) and an English, German, Romance Philology and Comparative Literature program (not Comparative Literary Studies). Also, the website did not present a clustering approach and did not link up programs in a cluster via the descriptions it offered.

Finally, the Panel appreciated that the Quality Office was considering benchmarking approaches and had attempted some internal benchmarking, with external benchmarking not yet being a feature of the Georgian higher education environment.

Evidences/Indicators

- Regulation of quality assurance service;
- Activity rules of program heads;
- Internal quality assurance concept of Ilia State University;

- Minutes of meetings;
- Research report on the evaluation of the academic staff of the Faculty of Science and Arts;
- Student and graduate research reports;
- Reports of focus groups of employers;
- Evaluations of external experts;
- Analysis of internal and external evaluation of the program

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The Quality Assurance Service should develop mechanisms to identify the technical and content gaps in the syllabuses of the programs together with the heads of the programs and eliminate them.
- The university should institute recruitment regulations, for both academic and invited staff, which pay specific attention to the alignment between the field in which the staff has a degree, or the direction of their research, and the content of the courses they are proposing to take on as teachers.
- The university should consider proposing concrete targets which can be monitored in the decision to pause or close down a given program. Consideration needs to be given in terms of the impact a course closure may generate in respect the whole cluster structure, and its potential to perform well.
- The website should be maintained accurate and consistent across language versions, with public information reviewed frequently to ensure trustworthiness and coherence.

General suggestions of the cluster:

- The Quality Assurance Service may wish to consider if an alumni survey could become beneficial for internal quality assurance of given programs within the cluster. This is also because alumni from one program could become students of the next level program and would have a broader perspective on cluster performance.
- The Quality Assurance Service may wish to further harness the involvement of employers across multiple representational activities and specifically for program and cluster development.
- The cluster may wish to propose joint developmental/training sessions or activities of good practice sharing which could combine the needs identified during the individual staff appraisals.
- With the maturing of the quality assurance systems in the Georgian higher education context, the university may wish to decouple its internal quality assurance from the NCEQE accreditation assessments and set up its own cycle for internal quality assurance to run independent of any external processes.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):

Evaluation

| Component 5.1 Internal Quality Evaluation | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | <input type="checkbox"/> | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

5.2. External Quality Evaluation

Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

The Panel found that the university had given attention to previous accreditation assessments in relation to individual programs and was now actively moving to a cluster approach so as to align with the procedures proposed by the NCEQE. It was clear to the Panel, from the presented documentation and interviews, that during the preparation of the programs presented in the cluster, for the purpose of external quality assurance, the results of the external evaluation established by the legislation of Georgia (accreditation, monitoring, authorization) are fully abided by. All types of information are shared regarding the conduct of an external evaluation and legal consequences are considered.

To support the external process, a survey of employers' opinion was planned and implemented by the program heads and program working teams, supplemented by a subsequent focus group. As such labor market requirements were taken into account, via the qualitative data collected and relevant changes were made to the structure and content of the programs in the cluster.

Additionally, external experts were also commissioned, who were asked to produce written reports with developmental feedback.

Programme 1 Georgian philology (main and additional specialty) and Programme 2 Bachelor's program - Literary studies (main and additional specialty)

Through the interviews and provided documentation, it was revealed that the programs take into account the recommendations given by the accreditation experts in the learning outcomes map in 2011. These referred to: fully reflecting the learning outcomes written in the syllabi, modernizing the syllabi,

strengthening the English language component in the programs, which is shared and reflected in the new version of the program.

For example: a student of the bachelor's program from the first semester of the first year goes through a practical course of English language for four semesters.

During interviews with employers, it was noted that they had a recommendation to strengthen the program with more opportunities to develop practical skills in students, for which the morphology course was divided into two parts (nouns and verbs) and in the new program this course is presented over two semesters. Both morphology courses are prerequisites for the "Georgian Language Syntax" course.

Also, in order to develop the practical component, mandatory-elective courses were added to the program: "Practice in Morphology of the Georgian Language", "Georgian Languages: Megruli", "Georgian Languages: Lazuri", "Georgian Languages: Svanuri", "Dialectology of the Georgian Language". Greek and Latin languages are also presented as electives in the program.

According to the employers, the literature of all eras from antiquity to the present is presented in the bachelor's program - Literary Studies. However, they believe that it would be good to add a grammar course because students do not get proper grammar knowledge in school and this affects their writing skills. This recommendation was taken into account by the program heads.

In addition, on the recommendation of employers, from the spring semester of 2023, elective courses will be added to the undergraduate program: "Stylistics of the Georgian language", "Reportage, portraiture and analytical writing", "News, interview and informative article".

Evidences/Indicators

- Reports of focus groups of potential employers;
- External peer evaluations of programs;
- Working group meeting minutes;
- Documents for the admission to the programs;
- Conclusions of accreditation experts/Council Minutes
- Analysis of internal and external assessment.

Programme 3 Master's program - Comparative Literature

During the interview process, as well as during the study of the presented documentation, it was revealed that the recommendations given by the accreditation experts in 2011 are taken into account - the learning outcomes written in the syllabi are reflected in the learning outcomes map. Teaching and learning methods are described in detail in the training courses, and information about the evaluation criteria used within the training course is provided to the students through the electronic educational process management system "Argus".

The program was also evaluated by an external evaluator. According to the evaluator the "Comparative Literary Studies program is one of the first and innovative ones in the Georgian university space, and it practically has no analogues, while there is a great experience of similar programs in Western universities. The program ensures cultural openness, political-state freedom".

Based on the evaluation and recommendation of employers, it is preferable for master's to work at local primary sources, e.g. In the funds of the Museum of Literature, program managers shared this recommendation and. Within the framework of the program, memorandums of understanding were

signed with the National Archives of Georgia, the National Center of Manuscripts, the Institute of Georgian Literature named after Shota Rustaveli, G. Leonidze State Museum of Georgian Literature, publishing houses, which will allow students to have access to various necessary archive materials and manuscripts in the research process. In addition, from the spring semester of 2023, an optional study course: "Language and Style" will be added to the program at the master's level.

Evidences/Indicators

- Reports of focus groups of potential employers;
- External peer evaluations of programs;
- Working group meeting minutes;
- Documents for the admission to the programs;
- Conclusions of accreditation experts/Council Minutes
- Analysis of internal and external assessment.

Programme 4 Master's program - Applied Linguistics

In the process of updating the program, the recommendations issued by accreditation experts in 2012 were taken into account:

- The general rule of admission to the program is written in the university master's program standard, which is also defined in the description of the applied linguistics program. Enrollment in the program requires passing an exam in English, however, no specific level of language competence is specified anywhere. It is desirable to determine the English language proficiency at the B2 level as a prerequisite for admission to the master's program.
- A similar program of applied linguistics has not yet been implemented in Georgia. In order to achieve the targeted results, it is desirable for the university to invite appropriate qualified academic staff from other foreign universities to share their experience.
- In order to fully achieve the goals set by the program, it would be better for the academic staff participating in it to work more actively on the improvement of Georgian-language teaching resources, on the implementation of translations of relevant literature, thereby reducing the scarcity of resources in the field.
- From the memoranda signed by the university, it can be seen that within the Master's Program of Applied Linguistics, activities are being carried out in terms of internationalization, however, it is desirable that these contacts be further increased and expanded.

Recommendations were taken into account in the program as follows:

English language proficiency at B2 level was defined as a prerequisite for admission to the program.

An expert from the USA whose research fields are computational linguistics and natural language processing is delivering courses as an invited lecturer in the program.

A recommendation on the improvement of Georgian language learning resources was taken into account, in particular, during the period of operation of the Applied Linguistics program, a number of online resources were created (Georgian Language Corpus (KEC), Epigraphic Corpus (EC), Wardrobe Online Collection (WOC), Kartli Life Corpus (KTC), Old and Contemporary Georgian language converters, etc.), an annotated corpus and dictionary of Megrelian language are created, etc.

In 2021, Professor Irina Lobzhanidze's monograph Principles of Morphosyntactic Annotation and Morphological Analysis of the Finite Position of the Georgian Language was published; Prof. Emeritus

Shukia Aphridonidze's monograph *Forms of Address in New Georgian Language* was prepared. *Structure and Functioning*.

In order to increase internationalization and international experience, professors from foreign universities were invited at various times, specifically from University of Maryland; University of Paris 8; University of Chicago, Slovak Academy; King's College London; etc., as well as academic personnel were sent abroad with various programs (e.g. University of Leuven, University of Oxford, etc.); The deepening of internationalization also takes place by participating in various international projects (e.g. Since 2022, the academic staff of the Institute of Linguistic Studies participates in the project of European scientific and technological cooperation CA21167 - Universality, diversity and idiosyncrasy in language technology (UniDive), in 2018-2019 - in the joint program of Oxford University and Shota Rustaveli National Science Foundation, etc.).

Master's program Applied Linguistics was evaluated by an external expert, Professor at the University of Göttingen. According to their expert view, the amount of credits included in the program, the distribution of compulsory and optional courses are consistent with the standard practice of similar programs; corpus linguistics courses relevantly explore the basics of corpus linguistics: Corpus research, programming, data analysis, digital epigraphy; and, the choice of elective courses, including classical language offerings, is important to the program. The expert also welcomes the program's prerequisites, especially the acceptance of students from different fields, which is a common trend, especially in humanities.

In the interviews with employers, as well as in the study of documentation, it was revealed that employers positively evaluate the content of the program and the training courses of the curriculum within the Master's program of Applied Linguistics.

Employers formulated a suggestion: the program enable students to learn the issues of phonetics, morphology and syntax in terms of language typology and universals - a focus on phonology may also be desirable.

The results of the survey were discussed by the working group of the program. Phonetics and phonology are studied separately in some European universities. Whereas, Applied Linguistics program, only offers separate topics across different courses. Therefore, it was no longer necessary to separate phonology.

In addition, in the prerequisites for admission to the program, the necessity of basic linguistic knowledge in the direction of Georgian was recommended, which is provided for: the basic linguistic knowledge in the direction of Georgian is checked at the master's entrance exam, where the applicant must distinguish the sentence morphologically and syntactically.

Evidences/Indicators

- Reports of focus groups of potential employers;
- External peer evaluations of programs;
- Working group meeting minutes;
- Documents for the admission to the programs;
- Conclusions of accreditation experts/Council Minutes
- Analysis of internal and external assessment.

Programme 5 Doctoral program - "Linguistics and Literary Studies"

Analysing the received information, which was revealed during the interview and document review, the doctoral program was prepared based on the recommendations provided and shared by different expert stakeholders.

The working group of the "Linguistics and Literary Studies" program fully took into account the recommendations issued by the Accreditation Council in 2011 - for the effective implementation of the program, about the number of staff implementing logistics, and the program has academic heads, a specialist and coordinator of the faculty's quality assurance service.

The teaching method and format are also distinguished. For foreign professors involved in the program, the "Argus" electronic management system is available - also in English.

During the preparation of the program, according to the heads of the program, the interdisciplinary doctoral program of social and humanitarian sciences of the Faculty of Sciences and Arts of Ilia State University, which, according to the directions, included eight qualifications, was established as an independent doctoral educational program.

Based on the report on the dissolution of the interdisciplinary program, on April 20, 2022, unplanned monitoring of the doctoral program "Linguistics and Literary Studies" was carried out.

Based on the conclusion of the expert group of accreditation and the argumentative position presented to the center by the State University of Ilia, as well as hearing the oral position of the interested party at the session, the council shared the assessment reflected in the expert report.

The Council considered that the doctoral educational program of "Linguistics and Literary Studies" corresponds to the "National Qualifications Framework" and "Classifier of Study Areas" approved by the Order No. 69/N of the Minister of Education, Science, Culture and Sports of Georgia dated April 10, 2019.

In November 2021, the Quality Assurance Service conducted an employer survey.

Employers expressed recommendations for further development of the program. According to their observations, within the framework of the program, it is desirable to focus on the "improvement of machine translation programs and enrichment of materials", because the lexicographic material in the

Georgian language is not processed enough.

The employers positively evaluated the practice of cooperation with the international doctoral school and experts provided within the framework of the doctoral program. However, according to them, it would be more desirable to strengthen this direction.

In addition, the program requires doctoral students to publish at least one article in internationally peer-reviewed journals.

The program is supported by an international expert council, members of which help doctoral students to prepare and publish scientific articles. In addition, the program envisages close cooperation with the international doctoral program, within the framework of which the doctoral student is given the opportunity to have a foreign co-supervisor.

Iliia State University implements exchange programs funded by the European Commission within the framework of "Erasmus+", which involves individual mobility in partner universities. Doctoral students have the opportunity to participate in exchange programs and carry out joint research projects with partner universities.

Doctoral program of Linguistics and Literary Studies was evaluated by an external evaluator, Professor of Caucasian Studies, Malmö University. The expert highlighted the several strong aspects of the program. Namely: the expert appreciates the fact that not only graduates of philology, but also those with master's degrees in other relevant fields of Humanities and Social Sciences can apply to the program. They also note that the presented program is flexible in the sense that it offers students two areas of specialization that makes the program more attractive for applicants. The program clearly describes the ways of international research collaboration, that also represents one of its strong points.

The expert concludes by positively evaluating the doctoral program of linguistics and literary studies and supporting its implementation. Their assessment does not include recommendations for the improvement of the program.

Evidences/Indicators

- Reports of focus groups of potential employers;
- External peer evaluations of programs;
- Working group meeting minutes;
- Documents for the admission to the programs;
- Conclusions of accreditation experts/Council Minutes
- Analysis of internal and external assessment.

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):

Evaluation

| Component 5.2 External Quality Evaluation | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|--|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review

Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematic data collection, study and analysis. Evaluation results are applied for the programme improvement.

Based on the interviews and the analysis of the presented documentation, it can be seen that in the development of the programs included in the cluster, a great role is given to the internal self-evaluation of the educational programs of Ilia State University, which is related to the preparation of the internal self-evaluation report of the educational programs in the cluster, in order to identify the strengths and areas for improvement as a result of the evaluation of the programs implemented in the university, and the received Planning targeted interventions for further improvement based on data processing and analysis.

Accordingly, the following studies are conducted to generate assessment data - the analysis of students' academic performance, the semester survey of students - in relation to the courses, employer survey, evaluation of visiting and academic staff involved in the program based on student survey.

According to the QAS representatives, the analysis of target marks for the program is conducted on an ongoing basis and considers the semesterly results of the students' academic performance.

Also assessments of employers and external expert/experts take a more regular approach.

In order to develop the dynamics of the program presented in the cluster, the self-assessment report presented in each subsequent reporting period will contain an analysis of the comparison of the results with the data of the previous reporting period. According to the QAS representatives, one reporting period for the evaluation of the educational program includes three semesters: fall and spring semesters - for data collection and the following semester - for data analysis, which is the most important in the process of determining the needs of the program.

It should also be noted that the full evaluation cycle of the program is five years (three reporting periods) in the case of the bachelor's program, and three years (two reporting periods) in the case of the master's program.

During the implementation of the doctoral program, this duration is 6 years (four accounting periods).

The report developed as a result of the evaluation of the program will be submitted to the faculty/school board for consideration and approval of the activities defined for the development of the program - before the end of the reporting period (third semester).

It should be noted that, based on the decisions made by the Faculty/School Council, the Head of the Faculty/School Quality Assurance Service prepares a summary report on all programs presented in the cluster and then delivers it to the Quality Assurance Service of the University and the Vice-Chancellor. After which, based on the received reports, the quality assurance service of the university will prepare a summary report, and the final instance is the academic council, where the presented document will be reviewed and approved.

According to the QAS representatives, the improvement of the internal evaluation mechanism for the implementation of the programs, the development of additional tools and the increase of the capacity of the internal quality assurance system are ongoing and fairly new for the cluster approach, without there being sufficient data for a full cycle review as data collection was paused during the pandemic.

Also, working meetings with deans of faculties/schools, heads of quality assurance service, a series of trainings for employees of quality assurance service are being held intensively - improving the specificity of internal mechanisms, use of self-assessment tools and effective use of data analysis.

Evidences/Indicators

- Quality Assurance Department Statute;
- The rule on the program implementation evaluation;
- Electronic portal "Argus" <https://argus.ge/ge/>;

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster:

- The Quality Assurance Service may wish to embed the use of external experts to review programs on a regular basis not exclusively in preparation of NCEQE engagements.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):

Evaluation

| Component 5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

| 5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not comply with requirements |
|---|----------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | X | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Attached documentation (if applicable): N/A

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

| Contents Standard | 1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme | 2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering | 3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them | 4. Providing Teaching Resources | 5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities |
|--|---|--|---|--|--|
| Programme 1 (Bachelor's Programme - Georgian Philology (Major and Minor)) | Substantially complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Complies with requirements |
| Programme 2 (Bachelor's Programme - Literary Studies (Major and Minor)) | Substantially complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Complies with requirements |
| Programme 3 (Master's Programme - Comparative Literary Studies) | Substantially complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Complies with requirements |
| Programme 4 (Master's Programme - Applied Linguistics) | Substantially complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Complies with requirements |
| Programme 5 (Doctoral Programme - Linguistics and Literary Studies) | Substantially complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Complies with requirements | Complies with requirements |

Signatures

Chair of Accreditation Experts Panel

Full name, signature

Anca-Luminita Greere



Of the member(s) of the Accreditation Experts Panel

Full name, signature

Zaal Kikvidze



Full name, signature

Nino Popiashvili



Full name, signature

Irma Kurdadze



Full name, signature

Nato Peradze

