**NATIONAL CENTER FOR
EDUCATIONAL QUALITY
ENHANCEMENT**

Accreditation Expert Group Report on Higher Education Programme

Tourism, First Level

LEPL Iakob Gogebashvili Telavi State University

28.06.2023

Report Submission Date

Tbilisi

Contents

Information about a Higher Education Institution [1]

Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form	Iakob Gogebashvili Telavi State University LEPL
Identification Code of Institution	231187168
Type of the Institution	University

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname, HEI/Organisation, Country)	Remigijus Kinderis, Klaipėdos valstybinė kolegija/Higher Education Institution, Lithuania
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organisation, Country)	Tamta Tskhovrebadze, International Black Sea University, LLC. Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organisation, Country)	Valeri Arghutashvili, LEPL Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organisation, Country)	Giorgi Arkania, LEPL Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia

I. Information on the education programme

Name of Higher Education Programme (in Georgian)	ტურიზმი
Name of Higher Education Programme (in English)	Tourism
Level of Higher Education	First level (Bachelor)
Qualification to be Awarded[2]	Bachelor of Tourism
Name and Code of the Detailed Field	1015 Travel, Tourism and Leisure
Indication of the right to provide the teaching of subject/subjects/group of subjects of the relevant cycle of the general education[3]	-
Language of Instruction	Georgian
Number of ECTS credits	240 ECTS

---

[1] In the case of joint education programme: Please indicate the HEIs that carry out the programme. The indication of an identification code and type of institution is not obligatory if a HEI is recognised in accordance with the legislation of a foreign country.

[2] In case of implementing a joint higher education programme with a higher education institution recognized in accordance with the legislation of a foreign country, if the title of the qualification to be awarded differs, it shall be indicated separately for each institution.

[3] In case of Integrated Bachelor's-Master's Teacher Training Educational Programme and Teacher Training Educational Programme

Programme Status (Accredited/ Non-accredited/ Conditionally accredited/new/International accreditation) Indicating Relevant Decision (number, date)	Accredited, Decision №316 18.11.2011
Additional requirements for the programme admission (in the case of an art-creative and/or sports educational programme, passing a creative tour/internal competition, or in the case of another programme, specific requirements for admission to the programme/implementation of the programme)	-

II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary

▪ **General Information on Education Pogramme[4]**

LEPL Iakob Gogebashvili Telavi State University is an autonomous state higher educational institution. Teaching language here is native Georgian. Getting education at the university is available via renewed programmes covering Bachelor's, Master's and Doctoral cycles. The institution covers vocational educational programmes as well.

In the educational space of Telavi State University, the direction of tourism is one of the important ones, which started functioning in 2011. Very quickly, taking into account modern requirements, it became the main part of the strategic development of the university.

On November 18, 2011, according to the decision of the Council of Accreditation of Educational Programs (No. 316), the tourism bachelor educational program was granted accreditation. "Tourism" bachelor programme covers 4 (four) years, the number of credits - 240. In order to be compatible with the framework of higher education qualifications and the classifier of study areas (1015 Travel, Tourism and Leisure), the qualification was defined - 1015.1.1 Tourism.

▪ **Overview of the Accreditation Site Visit**

The accreditation visit took place on 16-17.05.2023. Before the visit, the experts' panel received a Self-Evaluation Report (SER in English and Georgian), the Programme description documents accompanied by detailed syllabi of all programme components (in Georgian) and documents regarding University Services, CVs and documentation regarding the academic staff, etc. (in Georgian).

During the visit, the panel had the chance to meet and interview representatives of the university and faculty administration, the programme director, the SER work team, staff from the Quality Assurance office, academic staff (both affiliated and invited), bachelor thesis supervisors, students and graduates of the programme, as well as social partners. All participants were very cooperative and willing to participate in discussion in an open and frankly way. Requests from the panel regarding the provision of additional information were handled professionally and efficiently during the visit.

The experts' panel would like to express sincere thanks for the cooperation of all participants and their participation in fruitful discussions during the visit.

• **Brief Overview of Education Programme Compliance with the Standards**

The programme meets various Georgian, European and International Standards and is in compliance with all regulations and standards based on review of facilities, documents, interviews with broad representation of leadership, students, graduates, faculty and stakeholders excluding standard "Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme" which substantially complies with the requirements of this standard.

▪ **Recommendations**

The expert's panel provides the following recommendations for improvement and they are highlighted under different headings below:

  o Refine the purpose of the programme by making them more unique and specific;
  o Learning outcomes should be reviewed with attention to the latest findings of tourism business, technology, scientific achievements, and the needs of the country's region;

---

[4] When providing general information related to the programme, it is appropriate to also present the quantitative data analysis of the educational programme.

- o Increase the number of credits allocated for the preparation of bachelor's theses and set higher requirements for its preparation: structure, citation, etc.
- o Increase the number of credits for the internship in the company, and perhaps realize in a few semesters as a motivational tool for students, getting to know their future profession and career opportunities faster.
- o To give students the opportunity to learn hotel, restaurant, travel planning or airline ticket reservation programmes (in practical way working with software);
- o Pay attention to ensuring the qualitative and quantitative parameters of bachelor's theses as scientific writing work (citation, scope, validity of methodology, etc.). Communication and coordination between students and supervisors in the process of working on a bachelor's thesis should be increased. Supervisors should provide more information to students about the norms of academic writing.

- ▪ **Suggestions for Programme Development**

The expert 's panel provides a few suggestions for improvement:
- o The university is advised to prepare a clear communication and marketing strategy, which would allow to provide more information about this study programme to potential students, because the number of students is critically low;
- o The university is advised revise and update the content of subjects to respond to the novelty of tourism business and science;
- o To increase students' motivation in studies by involving them in international programmes and projects and enabling them to act there;
- o It is desirable for the institution to have more specific budget parameters and do more work to attract students to the tourism undergraduate educational programme**;**
- o It would be suggested to more thoroughly implement risk assessment and risk management instrument within the PDCA system and share among the staff of the programme to create a virtuous cycle of continuous improvement.

- ▪ **Brief Overview of the Best Practices (if applicable)[5]**

- ▪ **Information on Sharing or Not Sharing the Argumentative Position of the HEI**

Experts panel did not take into consideration argumentitive position of the university and left it without any change.

- ▪ **In case of re-accreditation, it is important to provide a brief overview of the achievements and/or the progress (if applicable)**

---

[5] A practice that is exceptionally effective and that can serve as a benchmark or example for other educational programme/programmes.

III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the HEI. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the programme. The content and consistent structure of the programme ensure the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level and educational programme, and define the set of knowledge, skills and competences a programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the programme to the development of the field and society.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The reviewed programme is a bachelor level programme in Tourism in Georgian. The programme has 3 strategic objectives which are presented in the SER (p.7) and these goals are formulated too abstractly and do not fully reflect the main issues of internationalization of educational programme, depending on the peculiarities of the field of study.

The study programme complies with the mission and vision and main fields of the strategic development (strategic goals), of the LEPL Iakob Gogebashvili Telavi State University (http://tesau.edu.ge/files/uploads/4/9/Strategic_Development_Plan_2018-20251.pdf):

"… improvement-development of higher educational programmes in compliance with the labour market demands…", "…promotion of student teaching, student life, employment, and career enhancement…".

For the development of the Tourism programme, there was cooperation with the practitioners of the field and other stakeholders and implementation of international projects. This further increased the chance to bring the theoretical and practical parts of the curriculum closer to labour maker needs.

During the meeting with the employers, it was confirmed that this programme is necessary for the development of the region and the development of tourism in it as well. The information provided by employers and alumni reveals and justifies the importance of the programme's contribution to the field and society.

The programme goals are public, accessible (http://tesau.edu.ge/files/1/2/%E1%83%A2%E1%83%A3%E1%83%A0%E1%83%98%E1%83%96%E1%83%9B%E1%83%98.pdf) and shared by the persons involved in the programme.

Evidences/Indicators
- o   Bachelor programme "Tourism"
- o   Mission, goals, strategy of Telavi State University www.tesau.edu.ge ;
- o   Analysis of the demands of labour market and employers;
- o   Interview results.

Recommendations:

- o   Refine the purpose of the programme by making them more unique and specific.

Suggestions for the Programme Development

- o   -

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
1.1 Programme Objectives	☐	x	☐	☐

1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes

➢ The learning outcomes of the programme are logically related to the programme objectives and the specifics of the study field.

➢ Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or the responsibility and autonomy that students gain upon completion of the programme.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The learning outcomes are clear and explicit and are relevant to achieving the objectives of the Tourism programme. They are achievable and realistic and are relevant to the objectives of the programme which, as mentioned earlier, should be more specific and focus on novelty of sciences and practice findings. The programme is compatible with the level of knowledge, skills and values defined by the descriptor of the Bachelor level of qualification in the higher education qualification framework.

The SER states that: 'the development of learning outcomes of the programme was carried out on a collaborative basis, in the process of which all parts were involved: academic/guest staff, students, graduates, employers, and the results were periodically presented/introduced to interested persons" (SER p.8.). The mentioned information was confirmed in meetings with stakeholders who also noted that programme learning outcomes are consistent with employment demands and with peculiarities of the field of study and labour market. However, in the same meetings it was noted that the study programme should pay more attention to ensuring English language competences and increasing the duration of internship, as an opportunity to strengthen practical competences and consolidate learning outcomes and reflect the latest findings of tourism business, technology, and scientific achievements (the latter observation is evident when analysing syllabus and theses).

Moreover, students and alumni noted that the results of the Tourism study programme are/were clear to them, and the acquired competences help them to advance their careers.

Programme has developed learning outcomes map, which describes achievement of each learning outcome through the components of the programme. Procedures for evaluating learning outcomes include primary and / or secondary labour market research and consultations with lecturers, comparative analysis of similar programmes and application of international practices, and graduates' survey. Achievement of the learning outcomes involves the analysis of the students' post-course results within compulsory modules.

Evidences/Indicators

- Bachelor programme "Tourism";
- Map of programme objectives and learning outcomes;
- Analysis of labor market and employer demands;
- Interview results.

Recommendations:

- Learning outcomes should be reviewed with attention to the latest findings of tourism business, technology, scientific achievements, and the needs of the country's region.

Suggestions for Programme Development

-

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	☐	x	☐	☐

1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes

- ➤ Evaluation mechanisms of the programme learning outcomes are defined; the programme learning outcomes evaluation cycle consists of defining, collecting and analyzing data necessary to measure learning outcomes;
- ➤ Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Mechanisms for evaluating the learning outcomes of the programme are defined (SER p.9). Programme has developed learning outcomes map, which describes achievement of each learning outcome through the components of the programme. Procedures for evaluating learning outcomes include primary and / or secondary labour market research and consultations with lecturers, comparative analysis of similar programmes and application of international practices, and graduates' survey. Achievement of the learning outcomes involves the analysis of the students' post-course results within compulsory modules.

During meetings with the programme director and representatives of quality insurance (QA) staff was provided evidence of this. Also was convinced that the learning outcomes of teaching and scientific-research component are evaluated in a consistent and transparent manner with the periodicity specific to the characteristics of the field and the programme have guidelines for each learning outcome.

During the meeting with academic staff, programme director and representatives of QA staff it was stated that learning outcomes of teaching and scientific-research component are evaluated in a consistent and transparent manner with the periodicity specific to the characteristics of the field and academic staff of the programme are familiar with the methods of evaluation of learning outcomes.

The representatives of HEI ensure familiarization of stakeholders with the analysis of evaluation of learning outcomes during the annual meetings with them.

Based on the information received during the meetings, it can be stated that programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme after discussions in the faculty.

Programme has developed learning outcomes map, which describes achievement of each learning outcome through the components of the programme. Procedures for evaluating learning outcomes include primary and / or secondary labour market research and consultations with lecturers, comparative analysis of similar programmes and application of international practices, and graduates' survey. Achievement of the learning outcomes involves the analysis of the students' post-course results within compulsory modules.

Evidences/Indicators
- o Curriculum map;
- o Educational programmes;
- o Interview results.

Recommendations:
- o -

Suggestions for the Programme Development
- o -

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	x	☐	☐	☐

1.4. Structure and Content of Education Programme
- ➤ The Programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of education programmes.
- ➤ The Programme structure is consistent and logical. The content and structure of the programme ensure the achievement of programme learning outcomes. The qualification to be granted is consistent with the content and learning outcomes of the programme.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes. The content, volume and complexity of programme corresponds to learning

cycle. The programme Tourism is designed in accordance with the legislation of Georgia and ECTS - European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (SER, p.10-11). University regulations are in place for programme evaluation and continuous development that provide the involvement of students and stakeholders. Quality assessment at the university regarding programme development is based on surveys of graduates, employers, labour market, academic and invited staff and comparative analysis of similar programmes, as well as internal evaluation of achievement of learning outcomes.

Programme content and structure are consistent with the qualification to be awarded and ensure the achievement of programme learning outcomes and the structure of the programme ensure the individuality of the programme, however, the programme is not unique or innovative, in other words, it does not reflect the progress of science and technology in the field of tourism. From the experts' point of view the programme does not consider new research findings and modern scientific achievements.

The internationalization dimension is very important in programme, especially in tourism field of study. Internationalization aspects should be more clearly visible in course descriptions and bachelor theses as well. The practical component is extremely important for the "tourism" bachelor programme. Accordingly, in a number of courses, practical and/or seminar hours are provided, which help the student to develop sectoral competencies and skills, but it is not as significant as an internship. 6 ECTS credits are not enough for Tourism programme students to develop practical skills, much more time should be allocated in the study plan and it was stated by students, alumni and socials partners as well, during the meeting. Students of the programme should demonstrate practically all the results of studies in their final work, but too few ECTS credits are allocated for this.

Experts familiar with the bachelor's theses noticed their low scientific level and missed the presentation of a stronger research methodology and the development of the practical part of research and proposals.

Programme development is a collaborative process and engages all stakeholders: students, academic staff, graduates and employers. All of them during meetings with experts mentioned that they receive invitations to participate in surveys for programme improvement and meetings and discussions, but do not always participate in them.

The HEI ensures the publicity and availability of the information on the programme. This information can be found in university website, but it is not enough to attract more students to the study programme.

Evidences/Indicators
- o Educational programme with the enclosed syllabi;
- o Curriculum map;
- o Website;
- o Interview results.

Recommendations:
- o Increase the number of credits allocated for the preparation of bachelor's theses and set higher requirements for its preparation: structure, citation, etc.

- Increase the number of credits for the internship in the company, and perhaps realize in a few semesters as a motivational tool for students, getting to know their future profession and career opportunities faster.

Suggestions for the programme development:
- The university is advised to prepare a clear communication and marketing strategy, which would allow to provide more information about this study programme to potential students, because the number of students is critically low.

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	☐	x	☐	☐

1.5. Academic Course/Subject

➢ The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject.
➢ The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.
➢ The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

For each course, a very detailed subject descriptor (Syllabus) has been developed. Each descriptor contains the following: course objectives, intended learning outcomes, teaching methods used to achieve learning outcomes, detailed description of weekly content, corresponding literatures, and individual work, assessment methods for each component of assessment work, as well as clear criteria linking student achievement to grades (rubrics), and suggested literature.

It can be stated that the content and scope of the academic subjects separately and together ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes. Each specified subject gets 5 ECTS with the appropriate number of hours for lectures and seminars. Subjects are distributed rationally among the semesters seeking to achieve learning outcomes. Academic subjects cover the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation, but could be more reflective of the requirements related with the trends in the global tourism market, especially Hospitality sector, for example, using of GIS in the analysis of recreational areas, management of tourism logistics processes using digital tools, robotics in the hospitality industry and others. After the site visit it can be declared that study materials are up to date and ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the Tourism and Hospitality Management master's programme.

Evidences/Indicators
- o Educational programme with the enclosed syllabi;
- o Curriculum map;
- o Interview results.

Recommendations:
- o –

Suggestions for the programme development
- o The university is advised revise and update the content of subjects to respond to the novelty of tourism business and science.

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
1.5. Academic Course/Subject	x	☐	☐	☐

Compliance of the Programme with the Standard

1. Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme	Complies with requirements	☐
	Substantially complies with requirements	x
	Partially complies with requirements	☐
	Does not comply with requirements	☐

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adecuacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering

Prerequisites for admission to the programme, teaching-learning methods and student assessment consider the specificity of the study field, level requirements, student needs, and ensure the achievement of the objectives and expected learning outcomes of the programme.

2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions

The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programme to achieve learning outcomes.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Programme admission preconditions and procedures are consistent with the existing legislation, and programme admission preconditions are logically linked to programme content, level of education, the qualification to be awarded and the instruction language. The admission requirements of existing educational programmes are published on university's website.

HEI defines the methodology of planning the student body for the educational programme, which considers the specificity of the programme and the resources of the institution and ensures the smooth administration of educational processes. Admission of students to the programme is in compliance with the methodology of student body planning.

Evidences/Indicators
- o Educational programme;
- o Website;
- o Interview results

Recommendations:
- o –

Suggestions for the programme development
- o –

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions	x	☐	☐	☐

Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The programme has been designed in accordance with university's rules for planning and designing educational programmes. It is structured in accordance with Georgian legislation and the ECTS system. The programme content is appropriate for a Bachelor level degree.

The content and structure of the Tourism programme is designed to ensure the achievement of the programme learning outcomes. The components of the programme are logically structured, with prerequisites that are consistent with course content and an appropriate range of elective courses. The practical component of the programme (in subjects) is organised and planned in accordance with the learning outcomes of the programme and corresponds to the level of education. In the framework of a practice component and performance project, a student is supervised by a qualified person in the field who evaluates student's activity - this was confirmed during a meeting with students and alumni. However, the content of the programme itself should be revised, bringing in more recent scientific and technical achievements and focused on the peculiarities and needs of the tourism sector. In the content of the study programme, too little attention is paid to internships and working with hotel, restaurant management software, travel planning and administration software, avia ticket reservation systems, etc.

During a meeting with stakeholders, it was convinced that they were involved in designing the programme, asking them to express their opinions during surveys and meetings as well.

The memorandums and their appendices signed with employers envisage the number of students, objectives, outcome and duration of practice and support the achievement of the programme learning outcome. It is worth noting that employers are ready to accept more students and for a longer period of internship.

During the meeting with students, academic staff and social partners, the experts got acquainted with the good practice of the implementation of this study programme - project activities (with research aspects) and internationality (mobility). The students, teachers and social partners of the programme are engaged in research, mobility projects carried out by the university and are very satisfied with it.

Evidences/Indicators
- Interview results;
- Memorandums.

Recommendations:
- To give students the opportunity to learn hotel, restaurant, travel planning or airline ticket reservation programmes (in practical way working with software).

Suggestions for the programme development
- –

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
2.2. The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/ performing and transferable skills	☐	x	☐	☐

2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods

The programme is implemented by use student-oriented teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes, and ensure their achievement.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Studying methods in general are suitable for achieving learning outcomes, including classical and modern methods that encourage activity and self-expression of students (SER, p.15-1 and Syllabus). The teaching and learning methods used in the programme are indicated clearly in the relevant syllabus of every component. The methods were chosen considering the requirements of the level, the content of the course and the learning outcomes. According to the SER and information given by students and teachers during the meetings and the Course syllabi, methods of achieving the learning outcomes are as follow: lecture, seminar, written work, discussion/debate, collaborative work, brain storming, E-learning and others.

The teaching-learning methods of each study course of the bachelor's program in tourism correspond to the determined level of education, the content of the courses, and the learning outcomes are in compliance with field characteristic requirements and ensure their achievement.

In the process of implementing the particular courses distributed in the study programme, relevant teaching-learning methods are used to achieve learning outcomes, such as discussion/debate; teamwork; problem-based learning; case studies; brainstorming; role-playing, and situational games; induction; deduction; analysis; synthesis; verbal or oral; written work; explanation; action-oriented learning, etc. It should be noted that teaching-learning methods are logically selected in the courses. It is consistent with the content of the teaching courses and ensures the achievement of determined learning outcomes. The map of study courses, learning outcomes assessment methods, and map of learning outcomes are presented in the programme, which allows to systematically evaluate the methods and activities applied in specific teaching courses.

The teaching-learning methods listed above are flexible and take into account the individual needs of students. Teaching-learning methods ensure the active engagement of students in the teaching process and are directed to the development of various skills of the student, including critical and analytical.

It should be underlined, that the institution constantly participates in various grant projects in order to improve the teaching-learning methods/forms and research component and also offers pieces of training to academic and invited staff.

Evidences/Indicators

- o Tourism Undergraduate education programme and programme annexes;
- o Documentation confirming the qualification of the programme head;
- o Visit to HEI, interviews with the administration and staff involved in the implementation of the programme.

Recommendations:

- o –

Suggestions for the programme development

- o –

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
2.3. Teaching and learning methods	x	☐	☐	☐

2.4. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The university has a system for evaluating students' academic performance and comparing them with the data of the student ranking scale developed by the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS). The bachelor students' evaluation system considers active participation of students in the learning process and it is based on the principle of continuous evaluation of the acquired knowledge. Regarding the learning component of the programme, students are evaluated based on their performance during the semester, several interim assignments and grades of their final evaluation. Allocation of grades to different assessments depends on the nature of the course but in all cases, a clear rubric is laid out in the course syllabus.

After the end of each study course, in case of a positive assessment, the student is given a credit; The components and criteria for mid-term and final assessments are determined by the syllabus of each programme's study course.

The assessment structure, within the subject/study course, is divided into two elements - mid-term assessment and final exam, each specific assessment is based on the total results of both elements. The general evaluation criteria will be developed by the relevant quality assurance structure.

Forms of assessment provided by the syllabus of each study course of the programme may include such components as: oral exam, written exam, oral survey, written survey, homework, theoretical work, practical work, individual presentation, group presentation, etc.

In order to assess the achievement of learning outcomes in the component provided by the syllabus of the training course, the following means may be used: presentation, task performance, participation in discussion/debate, team work, case analysis, etc.

The maximum score for each subject is 100 points. The minimum threshold for a positive assessment in the subject is 51 points. When evaluating students, not only their success in the final exam should be taken into account, but also the results shown during the entire course. The evaluation system of the Higher Education Institution is in accordance with the legislation.

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with established procedures; it is fair to every student, transparent, reliable and is tailored to each course and explained in the respective course syllabi. The bachelor's thesis is completed within the framework of the bachelor's programme in tourism. The student can choose the topic according to his desire within the field of tourism. The bachelor's thesis is checked for plagiarism (Turnitin) before defence.

The interview with students made it clear that the evaluation criteria are transparent and understandable to students and are presented and explained to them during the first teaching week of each course. Students also have the opportunity to appeal their marks or give their opinion regarding a specific subject, syllabi or any other ideas they might have. The teaching staff provides feedback to students after each assignment. Students receive feedback on learning outcomes as well as on improving their own strengths and areas for improvement. Evaluation components, methods, and criteria are transparent, accessible, and known in advance to the student as well.

Students and alumni during the meeting with experts responded positively to the cooperation with the teachers, their flexibility and friendliness. In case of inefficiencies regarding the tasks or their assessment, they could always turn to the teachers for clarification and help.

The expert group that analysed the bachelor theses, points out that compliance with the rules of academic literacy must be considered as a threshold criterion in evaluation process. The quality of cooperation between the student and the supervisor should be improved. The supervisor should more effectively provide the student with information about the norms necessary for the performance of the bachelor's thesis.

Evidences/Indicators
- o Interview results.

Recommendations:
- o Pay attention to ensuring the qualitative and quantitative parameters of bachelor's theses as scientific writing work (citation, scope, validity of methodology, etc.). Communication and coordination between students and supervisors in the process of working on a bachelor's thesis should be increased. Supervisors should provide more information to students about the norms of academic writing.

Suggestions for the programme development
- o –

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
2.4. Student evaluation	☐	x	☐	☐

Compliance with the programme standards

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering	Complies with requirements	☐
	Substantially complies with requirements	x
	Partly complies with requirements	☐
	Does not comply with requirements	☐

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them

The programme ensures the creation of a student-centred environment by providing students with relevant services; promotes maximum student awareness, implements a variety of activities and facilitates student involvement in local and/or international projects; proper quality of scientific guidance is provided for master's and doctoral students.

3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services

Students receive consultation and support regarding the planning of learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the programme and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the programme.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Telavi State University has such means of providing information and counselling to students as:

1) Systematic provision of consultations to students by relevant structural units of Higher Education Institution and persons involved in the program;

2) Higher Education Institution and faculty quality assurance services inform students of the prerequisites of the educational program/study courses, credit accumulation, etc. details;

3) Faculty support staff monitors students' personal affairs and provides relevant information to students as needed;

4) The syllabi of the school course provide for additional time for student counselling by the lecturer;

5) Student career growth and development service helps students in such directions as: finding information about potential employers and creating a single database; coordinating relations with employers and establishing regular contacts with them in order to exchange information; sending data of students to specific vacancies, as well as finding internship or other employment opportunities for them; regular analysis of labour market dynamics and monitoring of available vacancies; helping and promoting students in relations with employers; arranging targeted meetings with employers; Research on students and graduates to promote their career, personal and academic development. During the interviews, it was revealed that a large number of students and graduates are employed, Higher Education Institution has close contact with employers and effectively helps students in terms of employment. However, it should also be noted that the course of the interviews made it clear that some employers are not familiar with the programme and did not participate effectively in its development.

6) Students receive information through such means as: Higher Education Institution website ((www.tesau.edu.ge), e-mail, social network (Facebook) and telephone communication).

The Higher Education Institution programme provides students with a variety of opportunities in terms of participation in international projects/programmes. Students have the opportunity to participate in events organized by Iakob Gogebasjvili Telavi State University and other Georgian universities (scientific forums, conferences, seminars, etc.). However, it should be noted that the scale of student participation in international projects/programmes should be increased, and Higher Education Institution has the potential to do so. Higher Education Institution should take steps to ensure that more students take advantage of this opportunity. First of all, Higher Education Institution should further encourage the process of teaching foreign languages. Also, it would be desirable if the

participation of students in scientific conferences and other events would be additionally encouraged with various awards. This will significantly increase students' motivation.

Evidences/Indicators
- o   Interview results;
- o   Educational programme, programme annexes;
- o   Website.

Recommendations:
- o   –

Suggestions for Programme Development
- o   To increase students' motivation in studies by involving them in international programmes and projects and enabling them to act there.

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services	x	☐	☐	☐

3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision

➢ A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctoral students to perform the scientific-research component successfully.
➢ Within master's and doctoral programmes, ration of students and supervisors enables to perform scientific supervision properly.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Not applicable.

Compliance with the programme standards

3. Students Achievements, Individual Work with them	Complies with requirements	x
	Substantially complies with requirements	☐
	Partly complies with requirements	☐
	Does not comply with requirements	☐

4. Providing Teaching Resources

Human, material, information and financial resources of educational programme ensure sustainable, stable, efficient and effective functioning of the programme and the achievement of the defined objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

➢ Programme staff consists of qualified persons, who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes.

➢ The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability.

➢ The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programme. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation.

➢ Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff of appropriate competence.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Based on the self-evaluation report of the educational programme, the documentation attached to it, and the information obtained as a result of the accreditation visit, we note that 25 academic and invited staff are involved in the implementation of the tourism undergraduate educational programme including 15 affiliated academic and 10 invited staff. As a result of the study of the documentation presented by the higher educational institution and the interviews, it was established that the "Methodology for determining the ratio of staff to students and the marginal quota of students" and the "Rule for determining the number of academic/invited staff involved in the programme have been developed and are operating in the institution.

The selection of the academic staff implementing the programme in the institution is carried out by competition. As a result of checking the documents confirming the qualifications of professors and invited staff involved in the implementation of the programme presented by HEI, as well as interviews with academic and invited staff at the institution we note that the persons implementing the programme are involved in it according to the legislation and internal regulations of HEI. Qualification of personnel is in compliance with their qualification requirements, functions and current legislation. The higher educational institution has developed a semester workload scheme for the academic and invited staff involved in the implementation of the educational programme, which ensures the conduct of the educational process defined by the educational programme, as well as the performance of scientific-research activities and other functions assigned to them. The number of counselling hours is also determined by the study programme syllabi. The number of academic and invited staff is adequate to the number of students. The ratio between academic and invited staff ensures the sustainability of the programme. The expert group wants to draw the attention of HEIs to the workload of teachers and the difficulties of relocation when cooperating with several universities. In the future, this may cause difficulties in the organization of the study process.

As a result of the study of the document presented by the higher educational institution: About the quantitative data of the educational programme, and the conducted interviews, we note that the rate of academic and invited staff turnover ensures the sustainability of the programme.

The study of the documentation presented by the HEI and the results of the interview with the head of the programme, showed that the heads of the programmes have the necessary professional knowledge, experience, abilities and competence for the development and implementation of the programme. Supervisors are actively involved in the evaluation and development of the programme, its implementation, counselling of students and various events planned within the framework of the programme. The visit to the institution revealed that the educational programme is implemented with the support of the university administration and all relevant structural units. The qualifications of the administrative and support staff correspond to the rights and duties assigned to them and the functions to be performed.

Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise[6]	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[7]	Among them, the affiliated staff
Total number of academic staff	25			
- Professor		5	5	5
- Associate Professor		10	10	10
- Assistant-Professor				
- Assistant				
Visiting Staff	10	2	8	-
Scientific Staff				-

Evidences/Indicators

o Visit to the HEI and interviews with the staff involved in the implementation of the programme;

o CV, diplomas and list of works of academic, invited staff;

o Tourism Undergraduate education programme and programme annexes;

o Documentation confirming the qualification of the programme head.

Recommendations:

o –

Suggestions for Programme Development

o –

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
4.1 Human Resources	X	☐	☐	☐

4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students

---

[6] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

[7] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

The Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of research.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Not applicable.

4.3 Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff

➢ The HEI conducts the evaluation of programme staff and analyses evaluation results on a regular basis.
➢ The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

In order to evaluate the research activities of the staff implementing the tourism undergraduate education programme at Telavi State University and to improve the research results, an internal evaluation mechanism has been developed - "scientific productivity evaluation system", which envisages the study of academic staff productivity according to the activities of one full calendar year. The system includes five categories:

1. Publications:
2. Participation in Scientific Forums;
3. Participation in Scientific Projects
4. Scientific research activities carried out with students;
5. Other scientific research activities;

As it became clear from the interviews, the summary results of the evaluation and the feedback sent by the Quality Assurance Service to the academic and invited staff individually. It is significant that, as a result of the audit activity evaluation, the institution often offers various training courses to academic and invited staff to improve the teaching quality. Also, the staff has the opportunity to publish articles with the financial support of the university in high-rated journals indexed in local and foreign scientific bases; They also have the opportunity to participate in international scientific conferences, professional qualification training. As a result of the interviews, it was revealed that the institution actively supports the academic staff in obtaining/financing and implementing scientific-research and grant projects.

As a result of the interviews with the academic and invited staff, we note that the mechanisms and methods of their evaluation by the Quality Assurance Service are known to them in advance and they unequivocally positively evaluate the mentioned process, they participate actively and contribute to the management of the process. The active involvement of students in the process of evaluating lecturers and training courses is also significant, which was revealed during the interviews with them. In the higher educational institution, there is an international relations service, which ensures the cooperation of both students and professors with foreign educational and scientific institutions. It is worth emphasising the fruitful work of the mentioned service, which is reflected in the institution's active involvement in international grants and projects.

Evidences/Indicators

- o Visit to HEI, interviews with the administration and staff involved in the implementation of the programme;
- o Academic and visiting staff evaluation results, evaluation response reports;
- o CV, diplomas and list of works of academic, invited staff.

Recommendations:
- o –

Suggestions for the programme development
- o –

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
4.3 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff	X	☐	☐	☐

4.4. Material Resources

Programme is provided by necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Based on the self-evaluation report of the educational programme, the documentation attached to it and the information obtained as a result of the accreditation visit, we note that the infrastructure and technical equipment of the higher educational institution quantitatively and qualitatively ensure the achievement of the goals and learning outcomes of the educational programme. Auditoriums and conference halls in HEI are equipped with appropriate inventory and information-communication means. The university has computer classes equipped with modern computers. The library of the institution has mandatory literature defined by the syllabi, the latest scientific periodicals. During the visit to the library, the mandatory literature, envisaged by the syllabi, was checked by the principle of selectivity. It is worth noting the high qualification of library employees and the electronic sources of educational literature adapted to students.

It is significant that the electronic catalogue of the library and the electronic literature search system EIFL, available on the university's website, are freely accessible to any user of the library of the higher educational institution.

The tourism undergraduate programme submitted for evaluation by the higher educational institution is provided with appropriate material and technical resources. The students are informed about the opportunity to use the available resources, and the procedures for their use.

Evidences/Indicators

- o Visit to the HEI, inspection of the material and technical base. Interviews with the administration and staff involved in the implementation of the programme;
- o TESU Library (http://tesau.edu.ge/biblioteka);
- o Actual state of material and technical basis.

Recommendations:
- o –

Suggestions for the programme development
- o –

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
4.4 Material Resources	X	☐	☐	☐

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in the programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the programme needs.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Based on the self-evaluation report of the educational programme, the documentation attached to it, and the information obtained as a result of the accreditation visit, it is confirmed that the budget of the tourism educational programme ensures its sustainability. The presented budget envisages the development/training of academic and invited, administrative and support staff involved in the implementation of the programme, as well as the development/training of students, the development of the educational programme, the financing of research, conferences and the publication of articles, the development of study materials and the library.

The institution's budget for the programme is calculated for 100 students, although the number of active students is 42 in total. According to the Self-evaluation document: The financial provision of the undergraduate educational program of "Tourism" in the university is carried out centrally (according to the expenditure categories of the university's budget); the budget of the programme integrated with the university's budget, which ensures the financial stability and sustainability of the programme, and the fulfilment of the agreements signed with the academic staff. It is desirable for the institution to have more specific budget parameters and do more work to attract students to the tourism undergraduate educational programme.

The expenses provided for in the programme budget ensure the development of the programme and promotion of its quality implementation. The allocation of financial resources stipulated in the programme budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the programme needs.

Evidences/Indicators
- o Visit to HEI, interviews with the administration and staff involved in the implementation of the programme;
- o Programme budget.

Recommendations:
- o –

Suggestions for the programme development
- o It is desirable for the institution to have more specific budget parameters and do more work to attract students to the tourism undergraduate educational programme.

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
4.5. Programme/ Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability	x	☐	☐	☐

Compliance with the programme standard

4. Providing Teaching Resources	Complies with requirements	x
	Substantially complies with requirements	☐
	Partly complies with requirements	☐
	Does not comply with requirements	☐

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilises internal and external quality assurance services and also, periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed

and utilized for informed decision making and programme development.

5.1 Internal Quality Evaluation

Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance department(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of programme quality assurance, developing assessment instruments, and implementing assessment process. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Internal Quality Assurance mechanisms at Iakob Gogebashvili Telavi State University are defined by the regulation of the Quality Assurance Office. Internal quality assurance includes the systemic surveys and evaluations of curricula, services, and resources. QA Office focuses on semester and annual surveys, involving all stakeholders to analyse assessment results to maintain effective monitoring and identify development tendencies. In accordance with the evaluation of the submitted documents and accreditation site visit findings, programme evaluation is consistent and assessment results are utilized for programme improvement.

Programme quality assurance is based on the PDCA - "plan –do – check - act" principle. Programme evaluation ensures inclusiveness of programme staff that collaborate with the internal QA and share the principles and mechanisms to ensure proper internal quality evaluation of the programme.

 Students, graduates, employers, academic and invited staff are involved in the internal quality assessment process. The QA office cooperates and encourages the involvement of all stakeholders to ensure the constructive evaluation process, therefore, a self-evaluation report of the programme is jointly prepared especially with the active involvement of academic and administrative staff. The self-assessment process and relevant task distribution among the working group has ensured to identify the weaknesses and relevant possibilities for future developments, however, it would be feasible if the risk-based thinking and risk management instrument was better implemented in the PDCA system and shared among the staff of the programme to create a virtuous cycle of continuous improvement.

Assessment surveys are used by internal quality evaluation processes for purposively identifying the problems and ensuring quality improvement interventions. These surveys are targeted to identify the needs, and wants of the students, as well as general satisfaction for assessing the administration of the programme and availability of services.

Evidences/Indicators
- o Self-Evaluation Report;
- o Quality Assurance Department Regulation;
- o Survey reports and forms;
- o Interview results.

Recommendations:
- o –

Suggestions for the programme development

o It would be suggested to more thoroughly implement risk assessment and risk management instrument within the PDCA system and share among the staff of the programme to create a virtuous cycle of continuous improvement.

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
5.1 Internal quality evaluation	x	☐	☐	☐

5.2 External Quality Evaluation
Programme utilises the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

External quality assurance at TESAU is carried out through Accreditation and Authorization Processes, maintained by the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement. The University reviews the recommendations and suggestions and the findings are introduced to the faculties. The QA office ensures compliance of the developments with the received recommendations.

The educational programs of the university are periodically evaluated by external experts. Tourism Programme was prepared with the active consideration of the local experts' experiences and positions, therefore ensured compliance with the sectoral benchmark requirements. Professors from Davit Aghmashenebeli University and European University, despite the minor recommendations, have positively evaluated the program as well as underlined its perspectives and importance for preparing qualified professionals in the region, structure and content of the program, teaching methodology and human resources.

Evidences/Indicators
o Self-Evaluation Report;
o Quality Assurance Department Regulation;
o Evaluation Reports of External Experts;
o Benchmarking Document
o Interview results.

Recommendations:
o –

Suggestions for the programme development
o –

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
5.2. External Quality Evaluation	X	☐	☐	☐

5.3 Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review

Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematic data collection, study and analysis. Evaluation results are applied for the programme improvement.

Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

For programme development and service improvement, the QA Office at the university ensures constant monitoring and periodic assessment. The assessment and evaluation process involves internal and external actors. Surveys with academic and administrative staff, students, graduates, and employers are central tools for program monitoring and periodic review. The monitoring process is based on the principles of transparency and sharing, participation and accountability. At the end of every compulsory course, students evaluate the course by completing a course evaluation form, if the student response rate is too low to get representative results, focus groups are used for ensuring validity. Necessity-based and need assessment surveys are used to identify improvements and priorities, to ensure an effective monitoring process. Results of the evaluation process are distributed among the stakeholders and are used for the programme improvements. At the end of each semester, the Quality Assurance Department monitors the students' academic performance, The evaluation results are used to assess the programme efficiency is and if necessary, to modify and improve it.

The University ensures benchmarking for the local and international practices. The program development group has benchmarked two universities similar programs in Georgia – European University and Georgian National University, as well as international institutions - Varna University of Management, University of Wroclaw, William Angliss Institute. Many common courses and features have been observed that affected the elaboration process of the programme and incorporates both, international and local practices and requirements.

Evidences/Indicators
- o Self-Evaluation Report;
- o Quality Assurance Department Regulation;
- o Evaluation Reports of External Experts;
- o Benchmarking Document ; Interview results.

Recommendations:
- o –

Suggestions for the programme development
- o –

Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
5.3. Programme monitoring and periodic review	x	☐	☐	☐

Compliance with the programme standards

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	Complies with requirements	x
	Substantially complies with requirements	☐
	Partially complies with requirements	☐
	Does not comply with requirements	☐

Attached documentation (if applicable):

Name of the Higher Education Institution: Iakob Gogebashvili Telavi State University

Name of Higher Education Programme, Level: Tourism, Bachelor level

Compliance with the Programme Standards

Evaluation Standards	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
1. Education Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	☐	x	☐	☐
2. Teaching Methodology and Organisation, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering	☐	x	☐	☐
3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	x	☐	☐	☐
4. Providing Teaching Resources	x	☐	☐	☐
5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	x	☐	☐	☐

Signatures:

Chair of Accreditation Expert Panel

Remigijus Kinderis

signature

Accreditation Expert Panel Members

Tamta Tskhovrebadze

 signature

Valeri Arghutashvili

ignature

Giorgi Arkania

Signature