Annex No. 1



# Accreditation Expert Group Report on Higher Education Programme

# Tourism and Hospitality Management Master's Programme

# LLC Caucasus University

Evaluation Date 2023-05-23

Report Submission Date 2023-07-12

Tbilisi

# Contents

I.	Information on the education programme	4
II. A	Accreditation Report Executive Summary	5
III.	Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards	7
	1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with Programme	
	2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adecuacy of Evaluation of Programme Mass	0
	3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them	18
	4. Providing Teaching Resources	21
	5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	29

# Information about a Higher Education Institution <sup>1</sup>

Name of Institution Indicating its	LLC Caucasus University			
Organizational Legal Form	Limited Liability Company			
Identification Code of Institution	205050567			
Type of the Institution	University			

# **Expert Panel Members**

Chair	Alina Katunian, Vilniaus kolegija/Higher				
	Education Institution, Lithuania				
Member (Davit Sikharulidze, Ivane	Davit Sikharulidze, Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi				
Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia)	State University, Georgia				
Member (Tamta Tskhovrebadze, International	Tamta Tskhovrebadze, International Black Sea				
Black Sea University, Georgia)	University, LLC , Georgia				
Member (Davit Tepnadze, Georgian Aviation	Davit Tepnadze, Georgian Aviation University,				
University, Georgia)	Georgia				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> In the case of joint education programme: Please indicate the HEIs that carry out the programme. The indication of an identification code and type of institution is not obligatory if a HEI is recognised in accordance with the legislation of a foreign country.

1. Information on the education programme					
Name of Higher Education Programme (in Georgian)	ტურიზმისა და მასპინძლობის მენეჯმენტი				
Name of Higher Education Programme (in English)	Tourism and Hospitality Management				
Level of Higher Education	Master				
Qualification to be Awarded <sup>2</sup>	Master of Hospitality Management				
Name and Code of the Detailed Field	1015 Travel, Tourism and Recreation				
Indication of the right to provide the teaching of subject/subjects/group of subjects of the relevant cycle of the general education <sup>3</sup>	-				
Language of Instruction	English				
Number of ECTS credits	120				
Programme Status (Accredited/ Non-accredited/ Conditionally accredited/new/International accreditation) Indicating Relevant Decision (number, date)	New				
Additional requirements for the programme admission (in the case of an art-creative and/or sports educational programme, passing a creative tour/internal competition, or in the case of another programme, specific requirements for admission to the programme/implementation of the programme)	-				

# I. Information on the education programme

 $<sup>^{2}</sup>$  In case of implementing a joint higher education programme with a higher education institution recognized in accordance with the legislation of a foreign country, if the title of the qualification to be awarded differs, it shall be indicated separately for each institution.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In case of Integrated Bachelor's-Master's Teacher Training Educational Programme and Teacher Training Educational Programme

# **II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary**

# General Information on Education Pogramme<sup>4</sup>

Scope of Tourism and Hospitality Management Master's study programme is as required 120 ECTS, each academic year divided into two semesters. The qualification to be awarded: Master of Hospitality Management. The content and structure of the programme do meet the requirements of the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation. The program will be executed with the participation of 19 academic and visiting staff members, with the appropriate qualification and research potential.

# Overview of the Accreditation Site Visit

The site visit took place on the 2023-05-23. During the site visit appeared meetings with the administration, self-evalution team, head of the study programme, academic and invited staff, students and alumni of the related study programme, employers, representative of the quality assurance office. During the inspection of the facilities the main resources and capacity were represented.

# • Brief Overview of Education Programme Compliance with the Standards

Generally the Tourism and Hospitality Management Master's programme meets the requirements of the Standards. Objectives and Learning Outcomes of the programme are realistic and achievable; Content of the study programme is relevant; Methodology and organization of teaching, adequacy of evaluation of programme mastering complie with the requirements; The programme staff consists of qualified persons, who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes; Programme utilises internal and external quality assurance services.

- The first standard complies with requirements.
- The second standard complies with requirements.
- The third standard complies with requirements.
- The fourth standard complies with requirements.
- The fifth standard complies with requirements.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> When providing general information related to the programme, it is appropriate to also present the quantitative data analysis of the educational programme.

# Recommendations

• Seeking the sustainable implementation of the program it is recommended to increase the number of affiliated staff members.

# Suggestions for Programme Development

- To strengthen the research and publications in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation.
- To enrich the study programme with the tourism and hospitality reservation system(s) training software.
- Actively participate in the research activities with the research colleagues inside and outside the organization, publish the articles in the highly rated scientific journals.
- Seeking to develop the study programme it can be suggested create the scheme enabling to involve more master students into the research activities, together with the teaching staff of the University.
- It is suggested to plan and motivate staff to actively work on researches in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation, aiming to create the relevant scientific production, perform the research based international cooperation.
- Seeking to develop the study programme in the future in would be suggested to analyze the option of creation of the Tourism and Hospitality laboratory, which could be helpful in accelerating the tourism and hospitality startups, tourism research, usage of the technologies in the sector.
- Take into consideration motivational system for the academic staff seeking to increase the scientific productivity in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation.
- Brief Overview of the Best Practices (if applicable)<sup>5</sup>

# Information on Sharing or Not Sharing the Argumentative Position of the HEI

University agrees and shares the recommendations and suggestions provided by the experts, taking into consideration number of affiliated staff members, research in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation, enrichment of the study programme.

# • In case of re-accreditation, it is important to provide a brief overview of the achievements and/or the progress (if applicable)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> A practice that is exceptionally effective and that can serve as a benchmark or example for other educational programme/programmes.

# III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

# 1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the HEI. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the programme. The content and consistent structure of the programme ensure the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

# **1.1 Programme Objectives**

Programme objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level and educational programme, and define the set of knowledge, skills and competences a programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the programme to the development of the field and society.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

A master's program in tourism and hospitality management was developed at the School of Tourism of Caucasus University Ltd. The program has four specific goals, which can be described as achievable. The first goal is to provide in-depth knowledge of tourism and hospitality and improve employment prospects, both in the local and international labor markets; The second objective serves to develop professional skills in tourism and hospitality management by introducing researchoriented learning. The third objective is to produce professionals equipped with the knowledge and skills to manage hospitality and tourism operations in a complex environment. The fourth objective serves to develop problem-solving skills through data analysis and information technology management.

The purpose of the program is clearly defined. From the objective, it can be seen that the program is focused on qualified personnel who will have theoretical and practical knowledge in the field of tourism and hospitality. The purpose is consistent with the HEI's mission. takes into account labor market demands and trends. Internationalization of the program is given in the strategic development plan of the university, where internationalization is declared as a priority direction. The given program is public and is posted on the university website.

## Evidences/Indicators

- Tourism and hospitality management education master's program.
- Analysis of the demands of labour market and employers.
- University website
- Interview results

## **Recommendations:**

o None

#### Suggestions for the Programme Development

None

## Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially with requ	complies irements		comply ements
1.1 Programme Objectives								

#### **1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes**

≻ The learning outcomes of the programme are logically related to the programme objectives and the specifics of the study field.

➤ Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or the responsibility and autonomy that students gain upon completion of the programme.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The Tourism and Hospitality Management Master's Program has 8 learning outcomes. Program Learning outcomes are measurable. Active verbs are used when formulating learning outcomes. Evaluation indicators are defined for each learning outcome. The learning outcomes are realistic and achievable, as the University has sufficient human and physical resource to achieve the learning outcomes. The structure and content of the program, including the literature used in syllabus, enable the achievement of learning outcomes. When developing the learning outcomes, the sectoral characteristics of the field of tourism are taken into account and are based on the qualification framework. The results of the labor market research are also taken into account and correspond to the requirements of the fields of professional employment of the graduates.

The relationship between learning outcomes and training courses, as well as the progress towards achieving learning outcomes (introduction, development courses, practical courses, master courses) are provided through the learning outcomes map and are logically connected to each other.

Stakeholder interviews revealed that academic staff, students and staff were more or less involved into the developing the learning outcomes of the programme.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Tourism and hospitality management educational master's programme
- Map of programme objectives and learning outcomes.
- Analysis of labor market and employer demands.
- University Website: https://www.cu.edu.ge/ka
- Interview results.

#### **Recommendations:**

o None

# Suggestions for Programme Development

o None

#### Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
1.2 Programme	$\checkmark$					
Learning						
Outcomes						

# 1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes

- Evaluation mechanisms of the programme learning outcomes are defined; the programme learning outcomes evaluation cycle consists of defining, collecting and analyzing data necessary to measure learning outcomes;
- > Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The higher education institution has appropriate mechanism for the evaluation of the learning outcomes, according to its regulations and standards for accreditation. The Quality assurance units at the university and school levels count on fitting procedures for collecting and analyzing data through clear protocols. The evaluation group is suitably organized with members with diverse roles to get comprehensive views. The methods, including direct and indirect mechanisms on a regular basis, are highly appropriate.

Feedback schemes are sufficient and very-well crafted. Programme has appropriate benchmarks for each learning outcome. The HEI ensures regular assessment and monitoring of the results and comparison with the defined benchmarks. As well as the procedure involving the assessment results for the proper improvements of

the program. The scheme of the evaluation includes the relationship between the programm's learning outcomes, all mandatory courses of the programme and the research component.

The programme staff gets assistance in the development of skills necessary for elaboration, measurement and analysis of the learning outcomes; The evaluation of the learning outcomes of the programme with the teaching course/research component is supposed to be performed after the completion of the teaching course and the research component. The monitoring process of the achievement of learning outcomes is based on the evaluation of the corresponding learning outcome for each study course, be determining the components that will be used during this process, i.e. quiz, test, midterm exam, essay, presentation, final exam, etc. As for the indirect mechanisms, the programme related data (enrollment, mobility and graduation rates, employment rate dynamics) will be collected and the surveys of all stakeholders conducted yearly basis. Therefore, consistency and periodicity, as well as the peculiarities of the study area and education level are properly considered. The HEI ensures familiarization of stakeholders with the analysis of evaluation of learning outcomes.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- o Tourism and Hospitality Management Educational Programme
- Mechanism of Learning Outcomes Evaluation
- Quality Assurance surveys
- Interview results

#### **Recommendations:**

o None

#### Suggestions for the Programme Development

o None

#### Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes						

# 1.4. Structure and Content of Education Programme

The Programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of education programmes.

The Programme structure is consistent and logical. The content and structure of the programme ensure the achievement of programme learning outcomes. The qualification to be granted is consistent with the content and learning outcomes of the programme.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Based on the self-evaluation report of the educational master program, the documentation attached to it, and the information obtained as a result of the accreditation site-visit, it was revealed that the program was compiled using the methodology of planning and development of educational programs. The content, structure volume and complexity of the program are consistent with the level of education; It is built in accordance with the rules established by Georgian legislation and in accordance with ECTS - the European system of transfer and accumulation of credits;

The awarded qualification of the Master of Tourism and Hospitality management educational program is Master of Hospitality Management with the volume of 120 ECTS. One academic year is defined by 2 semesters.

The educational program includes the following components: compulsory courses - 75 credits, master's thesis - 30 credits, optional course - 15 credits. The structure of the program is consistent, the study courses are logically distributed according to semesters. Compulsory courses are represented by subjects related to the field of tourism and business, such as hospitality and guest services management, strategic marketing in hospitality and tourism, principles of destination management, event administration, food service operations management, hospitality/tourism information technology, entrepreneurship in the hospitality industry, critical human resource issues In the hospitality industry, financial analysis in the hospitality industry. As part of the program, students are offered internships in the hospitality industry. Academic writing techniques and qualitative and quantitative research methods are also taught within the program. The teaching of the mentioned courses will help the masters to complete effectively the master's thesis.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results ;
- Tourism and hospitality management master educational program.
- Curriculum map.
- Website <u>https://www.cu.edu.ge/ka</u>
- Interview results.

## **Recommendations:**

o None

## Suggestions for the programme development

o None

## Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	•	complies irements		

## 1.5. Academic Course/Subject

➤ The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject.

➤ The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.

 $\succ$  The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

It can be stated that the content and scope of the academic subjects separately and together ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes. Each specified subject gets 5 ECTS with the appropriate number of hours for lectures and seminars. Subjects are distributed rationally among the semesters seeking to achieve learning outcomes. Academic subjects cover the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation, and meet the requirements related with the trends in the global tourism market, especially Hospitality sector. After the site visit it can be declared, that study materials are up to date and ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the Tourism and Hospitality Management Master's programme. Analyzing the content and structure can be stated that resources are sufficient and up to date, well aligned with the course content and aims, including the literature and sources.

## **Evidences/Indicators**

- Syllabuses
- Rules for the implementation of educational programs
- Order approving the student grading system for undergraduate, graduate and doctoral programs.

#### **Recommendations:**

o None

#### Suggestions for the programme development

None

#### Evaluation

Component	Complies	with	Substantially	Partially	complies	Does	not	comply
1	1				1			1 /

		requirements	complies	with	with requirements	with requirements
			requirements			
1.5.	Academic	$\checkmark$				

## Course/Subject

#### Compliance of the Programme with the Standard

I. Educational		1 0	Complies with requirements	$\checkmark$
objectives, and their co	learning ompliance	outcomes with the	Substantially complies with requirements	
programme	omphance	with the	Partially complies with requirements	
1 0			Does not comply with requirements	

# 2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adecuacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering

Prerequisites for admission to the programme, teaching-learning methods and student assessment consider the specificity of the study field, level requirements, student needs, and ensure the achievement of the objectives and expected learning outcomes of the programme.

## 2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions

The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programme to achieve learning outcomes.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The admission procedure to the master programme in Tourism and Hospitality Management complies with the existing legislation and university regulations. Programme admission preconditions are logically linked to programme content, learning outcomes, level of education, the qualification to be awarded and the instruction language. According to the programme and self-evaluation document, admission requirements refer to the results of Unified Master's examination and interview. The format of the interview is defined in accordance with the rules established by the Council of the Caucasus School of Tourism. The evaluation criteria of the university examination and the necessary information for enrolling in the programme are to be posted in advance on the university's website. Management has assured the expert panel that admission preconditions will be accessible and public, when the programme gets accreditation.

One of the prerequisites for enrolling students in programme is confirmation of B2-level knowledge of the English language by successfully passing the internal university exam. An individual may be exempted from the exam if submits a document confirming English language proficiency. Enrolment procedures for the programme is also defined for mobility and international applicants in compliance with the procedures determined by the Georgian law.

The University has defined the methodology of planning the student body for the educational programme, which considers the specificity of the programme, the resources of the institution and ensures the smooth administration of educational processes. The quota for the first intake is also defined – 10-15 students.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- o Tourism and Hospitality Management Educational Programme
- Web-page: www.cu.edu.ge
- Interview results

## **Recommendations:**

o None

## Suggestions for the programme development

o None

# Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially with requi	-	ot comply uirements
2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions							

## 2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills

Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The Master's Program in Tourism and Hospitality Management ensures the development of students' practical, research and transferable skills in accordance with the learning outcomes. This is confirmed by various characteristics. In particular, internship in tourism sector is considered among the mandatory components within the program. The university has signed memoranda, within the framework of which organizations are ready to accept students and graduates for internships. Students acquire practical skills in accordance with the requirements of the labor market in travel companies, the National Tourism Administration, travel agencies, hotels, museums. The development of practical skills is served by the various courses of the program through the completion of case studys and projects.

Within the framework of the educational program, students complete a master's thesis, which serves to develop research skills and allows the student to demonstrate the theoretical and practical knowledge acquired in the teaching process.

Various extra-curricular activities such as scientific research conferences are carried out in the Caucasus Tourism School every year. The purpose of the conference is to provide students with the necessary skills in this direction, to encourage students to engage in scientific research activities in the future; Although some activities are taken by the university to develop research skills, the involvement of students in research processes is weak and needs to be strengthened.

Within the framework of the school, business game competitions are held in which the students of the tourism school participate. For example, students of the Caucasus School of Tourism actively participate in the "Students' League" competition organized by the World Tourism Organization, where they use the acquired knowledge to overcome specific challenges.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- Master's program in tourism and hospitality management;
- Memoranda signed with companies
- Self-assessment report
- Interview results

#### **Recommendations:**

o None

## Suggestions for the programme development

o None

## Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	•	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
2.2.The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills				

## 2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods

The programme is implemented by use student-oriented teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes, and ensure their achievement.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The teaching-learning methods of each academic course of the master's program of tourism and hospitality management correspond to the level of education, the content of the course, the learning relevant teaching-

learning methods are used to achieve the learning outcomes during the course implementation, such as: verbal, oral method, written method, demonstration method, discussion / debate method, group (collaborative) working method, case studies, role-playing and situational game method, explanatory method, as well as practical methods, etc. In the process of teaching and learning, the methods complement each other. The teaching-learning methods of a specific study course are outlined in the syllabus of the relevant study course.

Depending on the objectives of the program, the teaching and learning methods for each academic course are selected taking into account the content of the relevant study material and the learning outcomes to be achieved. Specific methods of teaching and learning are presented in detail in the syllabi of the courses, taking into account their content and specificity.

The teaching-learning methods of the program are flexible and take into account the individual needs of students. The teaching-learning methods of the program ensure the active involvement of students in the learning process and are aimed at the development of various skills by the student, including critical and analytical skills;

The Master's program in Tourism and Hospitality provides for the completion of a master's thesis that contributes to the development of research skills.

# Evidences/Indicators

- Master's program in tourism and hospitality
- Syllabus
- Interview results

## **Recommendations:**

o None

# Suggestions for the programme development

o None

## Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	 complies irements		comply ements
2.3. Teaching and learning methods	$\checkmark$						

# 2.4. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The student evaluation scheme presented in the educational program is realistic and achievable as evidenced in the self-evaluation report (SER), Program and syllabi and interviews at site visit. The evaluation system is based on requirements of Georgian legislation. Within the framework of each course, individual methods, forms and components of student evaluation are presented and written out in every syllabus and assessment of course objectives and learning outcomes achieved through specific and measurable criteria and rubrics.

Students are evaluated according to two sets of evaluation: summative and formative. The aim of the summative assessment is to accurately evaluate the student's performance. It monitors quality of learning and the level of the student's achievement in relation to the goals set by the course. The formative assessment is oriented on the student's development. It gives students appropriate feedback on their achievements.

The evaluation system includes 100 points and envisages: a) Five types of positive grades: A = 100 points of assessment; A = 100 points of assessment; A = 100 points of maximal assessment; A = 1000

a.d) (D) Satisfactory – 61-70 points of maximal assessment; EPa.e) (E) Sufficient – 51-60 points of maximal assessment; EPa.e) two negative grades: EPa.e) (FX) Did not pass – 41-50 points of maximal assessment, which means the student needs to work harder and is allowed to retake the exam one more time after working independently;

b.b) (F) Fail -40 points or less of maximal assessment, which means the student's work is insufficient and he/she has to retake the course. StepStudents are awarded credits on the basis of the final evaluation comprising the scores of the interim and final exam assessments.

The attainment of student's learning outcomes considers the interim and final evaluations, for which relative proportions out of the total score (100 points) and a minimum competence level are allocated. Namely, out of 100 points, the interim results are allocated 70 points, while the final exam results are 30 points. In interim evaluations the minimum competency barrier to be reached is 59%. The interim evaluation includes assessment components, the total of which is 70 points. For each assessment component, the evaluation is based on the pre-determined learning goals, task-oriented clear criteria and the learning rubrics drawn on their basis. In the interim results the student has to accumulate at least 59% of the 70 points to be allowed to take the final exam. The student's final examination is passed, if he/she gets at least 60% of the total 30 points.

In case the student fails to overcome the minimum competency barrier of the final exam, he/she is allowed to retake the final examination. The student shall retake the final exam within the period prescribed by the academic calendar no later than 5 days after announcement of the results of the final exam.

In case the student totally scores 0-50 points or fails to overcome the minimum competency barrier set for any form of the evaluation (Interim/Final exam), he/she shall be given a grade of "F-0".

During interviews students confirmed that their assessment is based on objectivity and transparency. And in case of questions or misunderstandings, they have opportunity to look through their quiz or exam papers get answers from professors/academic staff and appeal evaluation if needed. Additionally, the university operates an assessment appeal mechanism, which gives the student the opportunity to appeal to the school for the purpose of creating a complaint commission and initiating appropriate procedures in the case of reasonable doubt. This procedure is written in university regulation on conducting exams. Students are able to have consultation hour with professors/academic staff upon prior agreement or via phone call/E-mail.

The assessment of the Master's thesis is a one-time matter and multi-component. The paper is assessed through a collegiate assessment, in a commission manner. Assessment is based on 4 criteria:

The requirements related to Master's theses preparation, assessment procedures and criteria are clearly

established into Regulations on the Preparation and Defense of the Master's Thesis. University uses mechanisms of academic and research ethics, academic integrity, plagiarism prevention, detection and response in evaluating students. Every Thesis must be checked in the plagiarism detection and prevention program "Turnitin".

#### Evidences/Indicators

- Program and Syllabi
- Regulation on conducting exams<sup>[1]</sup>/<sub>SEP</sub>
- Regulations on the Preparation and Defense of the Master's Thesis
- Interview results

# **Recommendations:**

o None

# Suggestions for the programme development

o None

#### Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
2.4. Student evaluation						

#### Compliance with the programme standards

2. Methodology and Organisation o	Complies with requirements	$\mathbf{\nabla}$
	Substantially complies with requirements	
Programme Mastering	Partly complies with requirements	
	Does not comply with requirements	

# 3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them

The programme ensures the creation of a student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; promotes maximum student awareness, implements a variety of activities and facilitates student

involvement in local and/or international projects; proper quality of scientific guidance is provided for master's and doctoral students.

# 3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services

Students receive consultation and support regarding the planning of learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the programme and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the programme.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Caucasus University has various students' services implemented focused on students development and support activities. Students are involved in HEI everyday life and are represented in decision making units. From selfevaluation report and site visit we have got information that student and graduate were program development and self-evaluation group members. During interview students from related educational programs noted that they were involved in program evaluation process in different ways, like: evaluation of academic/ invited staff, program structure, administration etc. Evaluation team was able to check the electronic platform (LMS) where students are getting these questionaries to assess their professors/ academic staff and once process is finished Quality Assurance Service and academic staff are getting feedback. LMS is equipped with other possibilities. Students are registering on the classes, getting schedule for the semester, checking their study progress and using it as a communication tool with administration or teaching staff.

To help with integration process at the university at the beginning of their student life at CU students have orientation meeting where they are getting acquaint with university regulations and program. For easy communication every student has his/her personal corporate e-mail, where they are receiving information about different events related with learning process and extracurricular activities. During interview students expressed general satisfaction about university administration especially about academic managers who are specially appointed staff to help students with their learning process and help them to cope with different challenges during their study period.

Beside the academic processes students have opportunity to participate in different projects, sport activities (on the day of accreditation site visit university President opened CU football cup championship), excursions offered by CU or other institutions. Students remembered their experience about excursions in program related locations to get expression about their future practical jobs. We need to mention that employers expressed their willingness to get students on internship. With fact is formalized in memorandums between HEI and companies and from Career Development and Employment Promotion Service students are receiving information about vacancies.

Students have opportunity to participate in different exchange programs with partner universities not only within the Erasmus+ exchange program but based on the agreements between CU and other HEI. Exchange programs considers learning or/and research component.

## **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-evaluation report;
- Statute of the Department of International Relations and Projects;
- Regulations of the Career Development and Employment Promotion Service;
- Regulations of the Educational Process Management and Student Registration Service;

- Regulations of the Department of Educational Monitoring and Student Services;
- Learning Management System;
- Memorandums;
- Interview results;

# Recommendations:

o None

# Suggestions for Programme Development

o None

# Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially with requ	complies irements	Does with re	
3.1StudentConsultingandSupport Services								

## 3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision

- A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctoral students to perform the scientific-research component successfully.
- Within master's and doctoral programmes, ration of students and supervisors enables to perform scientific supervision properly.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Caucasus University has developed Regulations on the Preparation and Defense of the Master's Thesis, regulation that regulates all the details of the preparation and defense of the master thesis. The rule also describes the functions and duties of the thesis supervisor. Each postgraduate student is assigned qualified supervisor who has scientific-research experience relevant to the study topic. To approve the master's thesis, the student applies to the dean of the school within 2 weeks after registration for the master's thesis in writing or electronically using a special application form after that supervisor has regular consultations with the student total of 20 hours, the frequency of consultations depends on students needs. During this process student gets advises about research topics, methodology, requirements and specifics of writing a paper and presentation preparation.

The supervisor of the master's thesis (co-supervisor, if necessary) can be an academic staff member of the Caucasus University - a professor or an associate professor from the School of Tourism, as well as from other schools of the University. The thesis supervisor can also be a guest lecturer from another university or other institution with relevant competence and expertise.

With the help of special software, before defending the thesis, the school checks the coincidence of the text of the submitted master's thesis and checks for plagiarism. The plagiarism is prohibited, and if the coincidence of

the text exceeds 10% (including appendices), the student must eliminate the mentioned defect within three days.

# Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation report;
- Regulations on the Preparation and Defense of the Master's Thesis;
- Education Program;
- Syllabus;
- Interview results.

## **Recommendations:**

 $\circ$  None

# Suggestions for the programme development

o None

# Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially with requi	complies rements	Does with re	
3.2. Master's and Doctoral Students Supervision			•					

# Compliance with the programme standards

		Complies with requirements	$\mathbf{\nabla}$
3.	Students Achievements, Individual Work with them	Substantially complies with requirements	
	with them	Partly complies with requirements	
		Does not comply with requirements	

# 4. Providing Teaching Resources

Human, material, information and financial resources of educational programme ensure sustainable, stable, efficient and effective functioning of the programme and the achievement of the defined objectives.

# 4.1 Human Resources

➤ Programme staff consists of qualified persons, who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes.

➤ The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability.

➤ The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programme. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation.

 $\succ$  Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff of appropriate competence.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The profile of the program staff looks like a good combination of theoretical and practical knowledge, with a high potential. The teaching staff meets the legal requirements, holds the Doctor's of Master's degree in the relevant field, sufficient part of the team can be described as well-known tourism practitioners. The strong practical orientation can be treated as the strength of the program. The lectures from partner University of Central Florida enrich the teaching staff with both practical and theoretical experience, as well the international approach.

The Head of the Master Program demonstrates the knowledge, experience and dedication to field, with the strong international approach. As well it can be declared, that students of the Master Program will be provided with an appropriate number of administrative and support staff.

The Panel members would find it helpful to strengthen the research and publications in the field of Travel, Tourism and recreation, actively participate in the research activities with the research colleagues inside and outside the organization, publish the articles in the highly rated scientific journals. The revised data regarding publications of the potential staff members gives the right to say, that the level is good, however more consistency and annual research results are needed, avoiding the long time gaps in research, in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation.

Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Programme	Including the staff with sectoral expertise <sup>6</sup>	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction <sup>7</sup>	
Total number of academic staff	6	9	5	1
- Professor	4	2	2	1
- Associate Professor	1			

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

- Assistant-Professor	1	1		
- Assistant				
Visiting Staff	13	6	3	
Scientific Staff				

The table indicates that the programs is executed with the participation of 19 academic and visiting staff members. Among them 6 individuals are academic staff, comprising 4 professors, 1 associate professor, and 1 assistant professor. The remaining 13 staff members are invited staff. Upon examining the personal profiles of the academic staff, is evident that 3 of them possess specialized expertise in the sector. Similarly, among the invited staff, 6 individuals have academic backgrounds relevant to the sector, with 3 of them holding PhD degrees. Additionally, the program is supported by 1 affiliated personnel.

# Evidences/Indicators

- Personal files of academic and invited staff;
- Rules for loading academic and invited staff;
- Order of the approval of the program manager;
- University regulations.

## **Recommendations:**

• Seeking the sustainable implementation of the program it is recommended to increase the number of affiliated staff members.

## Suggestions for Programme Development

- To strengthen the research and publications in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation.
- Actively participate in the research activities with the research colleagues inside and outside the organization, publish the articles in the highly rated scientific journals.

## Evaluation

Componen	ıt	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially with requi	-		comply ements
4.1 Resources	Human								

# 4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students

The Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of research.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Master students will have the unique opportunity to select American as well as Georgian professors, having a 5-year experience in research. The procedure of the preparation and submission of the final thesis can be described as clear and appropriate. Provided scheme of the structure of the Master's Thesis looks appropriate for the Master level program: probable thesis, topic and the expected structure of the master's thesis, research design (research question, hypothesis/hypotheses, tentative theoretical framework, outline of research methodology); if there is one, the outline of the original research (what type of research where and when will be conducted, who will be the target group, etc.); outline of the review of scientific literature related to the research topic; bibliography.The final thesis is to be reviewed by the supervisor, with all the recommendations and support needed. Scientific supervisors of Master students equipped with the latest knowledge, have participated in the scientific research and projects.

Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	Thesis supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral thesis	5	5	1
- Professor	4	2	
- Associate Professor	1		
- Assistant-Professor			
Visiting personnel			
Scientific Staff			

## **Evidences/Indicators**

- The personal documents of the Academic staff;
- Regulations on the Preparation and Defense of the Master's Thesis;
- Syllabus of the Master Thesis.

# **Recommendations:**

o None

Suggestions for the programme development

 Seeking to develop the study programme it can be suggested create the scheme enabling to involve more master students into the research activities, together with the teaching staff of the University, what would create the conditions for the development of the research competence, attracting new talents to the research activities of the University.

#### Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially with requ	complies irements	Does not with requi	
4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students								

#### 4.3 Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff

The HEI conducts the evaluation of programme staff and analyses evaluation results on a regular basis.
The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Research Facilitation Department established by the Caucasus University, which implements and coordinates activities aimed at facilitating research, helps internationalizations and promotes involvement of academic staff can be treated as supportive in these terms. The University carry out the evaluation of the academic and invited staff, on the basis which relevant directions of professional development are determined. The training and professional activities to promote internationalization are planned and implemented in accordance with the needs of the staff. The implemented scientific projects demonstrate the high scientific potential of the Team of the Caucasus University School of Tourism. It is suggested to plan and motivate staff to actively work on researches in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation, aiming to create the relevant scientific production, perform the research based international cooperation. It would be recommended to have the annual results related with the scientific production of the staff of the University in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation.

#### Evidences/Indicators

- Questionnaire for academic staff;
- International mobility statistics;
- Memoranda, agreements;
- Reports on the work done by the Research Promotion Department;
- Participation in the international research based projects;

• Rules and procedures for internal university funding of research activities, approved by the Governing Board of Caucasus University (2018)

# Recommendations:

• None

# Suggestions for the programme development

• It is suggested to plan and motivate staff to actively work on researches in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation, aiming to create the relevant scientific production, perform the research based international cooperation.

# Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially with requi	-	Does not with requi	- •
4.3 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff								

## 4.4. Material Resources

Programme is provided by necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The investment into the renovation of the building and equipping it with new inventory are evident. The effective management of the educational and administrative process are ensured by 63 lecture halls, conference hall, recreational spaces, administrative spaces, space to work group work, sanitary facilities, library (265 sq. m.), laboratories, archive, 2 cafeterias etc. Caucasus Business School has four rooms for startup accelerators, which are equipped with modern equipment, for instance VR technology, Smart board etc. The university has an efficient system of power supply, sanitary-hygienic norms are observed, constant lighting and ventilation, firefighting, safety and medical assistance detection mechanisms have been implemented.

Caucasus University library has and maintains the sufficient amount at the print and electronic book-fund appropriate to the Master's program, which is available for students, invited and academic staff. Students as well have the access to various international electronic resources: EBSCO HOST, ScienceDirect, Scopus, Sci-val Funding (Funding Insitutional), HeinOnline, Taylor and Francis, Math Scientific Publishing (MSP)-Journals. Auditoriums and computer classes are provided with a local area network and internet. At the University used electronic system for assessing students' knowledge and organizing the educational process. Work space for academic staff can be definitely evaluated positively.

During the meetings both social partners and the students of the related study programme mentioned the need in the practically gained tourism and hospitality reservation system usage skills, what can be implemented with the help of tourism and hospitality oriented software at the computer class.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- Material and technical resources of the University;
- Access to international library and academic databases;
- Library Book Fund;

## Recommendations:

o None.

## Suggestions for the programme development

- Seeking to develop the study programme in the future in would be suggested to analyze the option of creation of the Tourism and Hospitality laboratory, which could be helpful in accelerating the tourism and hospitality startups, tourism research, usage of the technologies in the sector.
- To enrich the study programme with the tourism and hospitality reservation system(s) training software.

#### Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
4.4 Material Resources						

## 4.5 Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in the programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the programme needs.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The budget of Master's Programme of Hospitality and Tourism Management of Caucasus Tourism School at Caucasus University was approved on 2022-10-25 (Order No. 03/01-05). According to mentioned budget implementation of the study programme looks realizable and practicable. The financial calculations are based on: Contact hours; Number of training courses; Reimbursement of class hours; Material support of the student in the teaching process; Expenses of the University administration; Program development / accreditation / internationalization costs; Unforeseen expenses during the implementation of the Programme. The panel members would find it helpful to develop the motivational system for the academic staff seeking to increase the scientific productivity. The aspect of scientific productivity in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation was mentioned in the sub-chapters 4.1. and 4.3.

## **Evidences/Indicators**

• Educational program budget.

## **Recommendations:**

o None;

# Suggestions for the programme development

• Take into consideration motivational system for the academic staff seeking to increase the scientific productivity in the field of Travel, Tourism and Recreation.

# Evaluation

Component	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	· -	Does not comply with requirements
4.5. Programme/ Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability				

## Compliance with the programme standard

	Complies with requirements	$\mathbf{\nabla}$
4. Providing Teaching Resources	Substantially complies with requirements	
	Partly complies with requirements	
	Does not comply with requirements	

# 5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilises internal and external quality assurance services and also, periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development.

#### 5.1 Internal Quality Evaluation

Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance department(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of programme quality assurance, developing assessment instruments, and implementing assessment process. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

Internal Quality Assurance mechanisms at CU are defined by the regulation of the Quality Assurance Office. Internal quality assurance includes the systemic surveys and evaluations of curricula, services, and resources. QA Office focuses on semester and annual surveys, involving all stakeholders to analyze assessment results to maintain effective monitoring and identify development tendencies. In accordance with the evaluation of the submitted documents and accreditation site visit findings, programme evaluation is consistent and assessment results are utilized for programme improvement.

Programme quality assurance is based on the PDCA - "plan –do – check - act" principle. Programme evaluation ensures inclusiveness of programme staff that collaborate with the internal QA and share the principles and mechanisms to ensure proper internal quality evaluation of the programme.

Students, graduates, employers, academic and invited staff are involved in the internal quality assessment process. The QA office cooperates and encourages the involvement of all stakeholders to ensure the constructive evaluation process, therefore, a self-evaluation report of the programme is jointly prepared especially with the active involvement of academic and administrative staff.

The Quality Assurance Office coordinates identifying the weaknesses and challenges while working on the self-evaluation report with the staff involved in the programme. Necessity-based and need assessment surveys are used by internal quality evaluation processes for purposively identifying the problems and ensuring quality improvement interventions. These surveys are targeted to identify the necessities, needs, and wants of the students, as well as annual students and staff satisfaction surveys, are conducted for assessing the general administration of the programme and availability of services.

The submitted documentation as well as interviews with programme director also gave the expert panel confidence that quality assurance is taken thoughtfully at the University. Quality assurance policy is flexible to

the new realities and tendencies, ensuring fast and effective adaptation of the evaluation and monitoring tools for distance learning process.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Quality Assurance Department Regulation
- o Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms
- Rules for implementation of educational programs
- Survey reports and analysis
- Interview results

# **Recommendations:**

o None

# Suggestions for the programme development

o None

# Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially with requir	complies rements		comply ements
5.1 Internal quality evaluation								

#### **5.2 External Quality Evaluation**

Programme utilises the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

External quality assurance at CU is carried out through Accreditation and Authorization Processes, maintained by the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement. The University review the recommendations and suggestions and the findings are introduced to the schools. The QA office ensures compliance of the developments with the received recommendations; the results of the formative evaluation are taken into account. Since the programme is new, senior management express willingness to consider all finding and effectively use them for the further developments.

The educational programs of the university are periodically evaluated by external experts, including international experts. Tourism and Hospitality Management Programme was prepared with the active

consideration of the local experts' experiences and positions, therefore ensured compliance with the sectoral benchmark requirements. Professors from the Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University and the George Washington University School of Business evaluated the programme positively despite minor recommendations, as well as underlined its perspectives and importance for preparing qualified professionals in the fiels, the right balance between theoretical knowledge accumulation and attainment of practical skills, programme staff and teaching methods.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Quality Assurance Department Regulation
- Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms
- Evaluation Reports of External Experts
- Benchmarking Document
- Interview results

#### **Recommendations:**

o None

#### Suggestions for the programme development

o None

#### Evaluation

Component	Complies requirements	with	Substantially complies requirements	with	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
5.2. External Quality Evaluation						

#### 5.3 Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review

Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematic data collection, study and analysis. Evaluation results are applied for the programme improvement.

# Summary and Analysis of the Education Programme's Compliance with the Requirements of the Component of the Standard

The programme development and service improvement, the QA Office at CU ensures constant monitoring and periodic assessment. The assessment and evaluation process involves internal and external stakeholders. Surveys with academic and administrative staff, students, graduates, and employers are central tools for implementing strategic visions of the university. The monitoring process is based on the principles of transparency and sharing, participation, continuity, academic integrity and freedom, and accountability. At the

end of every compulsory course, students evaluate the course by completing a course evaluation form, if the student response is too low to get representative results, focus groups are used for ensuring validity. Necessity-based and need assessment surveys are used to identify improvements and priorities, to ensure an effective monitoring process. Results of the evaluation process are distributed among the stakeholders and are used for the programme improvements.

At the end of each semester, the Quality Assurance Department monitors the students' academic performance, and segregated data according to schools are reviewed by the school councils. Master students evaluate the services offered by the University, the implementation of the research components, as well as overall implementation of the program. The evaluation results are used to assess the programme efficiency is and if necessary, to modify and improve it.

Conducted interviews with academic and invited staff of both institutions showed that there is an expectation to be more actively engaged in sharing experiences. Organizing formal and/or informal meetings for the academic and invited staff provides a platform to share experiences, skills and knowledge that would help the Proogramme to develop further.

The University ensures bendchmarking for the best available practices to develop a competitive programme. The Programme shares the experiences of 24 leading universities. Many common courses and features have been observed that affected the elaboration process of the programme and incorporates both, international and local practices and requirements.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Quality Assurance Department Regulation
- o Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms
- Evaluation Reports of External Experts
- Benchmarking Document
- Interview results

# **Recommendations:**

o None

#### Suggestions for the programme development

o None

#### Evaluation

Component	Complies	with	Substantially		Partially	complies	Does no	ot comply
	requirements		complies	with	with requi	irements	with requ	uirements

5.3. Programme monitoring and periodic review

# Compliance with the programme standards

		Complies with requirements	$\mathbf{\nabla}$
0	Enhancement	Substantially complies with requirements	
Opportunities		Partially complies with requirements	
		Does not comply with requirements	

Attached documentation (if applicable): -

Name of the Higher Education Institution: LLC Caucasus University

Name of Higher Education Programme, Level: Tourism and Hospitality Management Master's Programme

Compliance with the Programme Standards

Evaluation Standards	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
1. Education Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	V			
2. Teaching Methodology and Organisation, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering	V			
3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them				
4. Providing Teaching Resources	V			
5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	V			

Signatures:

Sleeg

**Chair of Accreditation Expert Panel** 

Alina Katunian, signature

Accreditation Expert Panel Members

Davit Sikharulidze, signature

Tamta Tskhovrebadze, signature

Co. labor 07. flee

Davit Tepnadze, signature

0.075635