

# Accreditation Expert Group Report on Cluster of Higher Education Programmes

Bachelor's programme Interior Design Master's programme Interior Design

LEPL - Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art Faculty of Architecture

> Evaluation Date(s) 4-5 October 2023 Report Submission Date 08/12/2023

> > Tbilisi

# Contents

I. Infor	mation on the Cluster of Educational Programmes	4
II. Accı	reditation Report Executive Summary	5
III. Cor	npliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards	12
	Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance v	
	Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Program	
3.	Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them	38
4.	Providing Teaching Resources	44
5.	Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	57

# Information on the Higher educational Institution

Name of Institution Indicating its	Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy	
Organizational Legal Form	of Art	
	Legal entity of public law	
Identification Code of Institution	203851545	
Type of the Institution	University	
· -	·	

# **Expert Panel Members**

Chair (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization,	Wenger, Andreas - Basel Academy of Art	
Country)	and Design FHNW /ICDP Interior	
	Architecture and Scenography, Switzerland	
Member (Name, Surname,	Kiknavelidze, Lela – LEPL - Akaki Tsereteli	
HEI/Organization, Country)	State University, Georgia	
Member (Name, Surname,	Nikuradze, Giorgi – LTD Business and	
HEI/Organization, Country)	Technology University, Georgia	
Member (Name, Surname,	Khositashvili, Giga – LEPL - Ilia State	
HEI/Organization, Country)	University, Georgia	
Member (Name, Surname,	Gazrdeliani, Soso – LTD Caucasus's	
HEI/Organization, Country)	International University, Georgia	

# I. Information on the Cluster of Educational Programmes

	Programme 1	Programme 2
Name of the educational programme	Interior Design	Interior Design
Level of higher education	Bachelor	Master
Qualification to be awarded	ინტერიერის დიზაინის ბაკალავრი Bachelor of Interior Design	ინტერიერის დიზაინის მაგისტრი Master of Interior Design
Name and code of the detailed field	0212 Fashion interior and industrial/manufa cturing design	0212 Fashion interior and industrial/manufa cturing design
Indication of the right to provide teaching of subject/subjects/group of subjects of the relevant level of general education <sup>1</sup>	_	_
Language of instruction	Georgian	Georgian
Number of ECTS credits	240 ECTS	123 ECTS
Programme Status (Accredited/Non-accredited/Conditionally Accredited/New/International Accreditation) Indicating Relevant Decision (number, date)	Accredited 10. 21.2011 N141	Accredited 08.09.2012 N317

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> In case of Integrated Bachelor's-Master's Teacher Training Educational Programme and Teacher Training Educational Programme

# II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary

# General Information on the Cluster of Education Programmes<sup>2</sup>

The Bachelor's and Master's degree programmes in Interior Design at the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art, Faculty of Architecture, are of high quality overall, despite sometimes difficult conditions. In principle, nothing stands in the way of further accreditation. The efforts made with the 2023 self-evaluations were fortunately used to make adjustments and changes to the existing programme in the Bachelor's and Master's programmes and have already been implemented. The teaching contents of the individual modules are clearly described, the syllabi in the already changed form are coherent and conclusive overall. The classification of the complex field of interior design between private and public space design, which includes interiors and exteriors and serves the broad field between architecture and furnishing/decoration, is well positioned.

With a view to a PhD programme possibly building on the Master's degree and in order to remain compatible in the international discourse and to increase academic exchange, the foreign language skills, especially in English, must be improved overall. This applies not only to students, but especially to lecturers and professors.

# • Overview of the Accreditation Site Visit

The on-site meetings could all be held, as well as the detailed tour of the premises and the infrastructures available to students at the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art.

Particularly noteworthy is the fact that the buildings of Campus 22, Griboedovi street, are home to the Faculty of Architecture, to which the Interior Design degree programmes belong, as well as other design and art degree programmes, a fact that cannot be deduced from the self-evaluation report. Interior Design students benefit from the close proximity and exchange with students from other design and art disciplines.

The adaptations in the syllabus of the degree programmes (Art of Conducting Communication, Psychological Basis for Showcase Decoration, Construction Physics, Energy efficiency in Interior Design etc.) could be explained vividly during the on-site visit.

# • Brief Overview of Education Programme Compliance with the Standards

The Bachelor's and Master's programmes in Interior Design at the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art meet the specified standards, as far as the experts were able to determine

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> When providing general information related to the programme, it is appropriate to also present the quantitative data analysis of the educational programme.

on the basis of the documents and the on-site visit. The infrastructures and services of the university are available to the students.

However, in order to be able to continue the programme in the long term and sustainably, it is necessary to expand the teaching staff, especially the professorships in the department. The efforts to improve the spatial, infrastructural and technical equipment of the study programmes are welcome and should be continued in order to meet the requirements of the professional field. This applies in particular to the digital equipment of the programmes with hardware and software.

# Standard 1

- Interior Design (Bachelor's program) Complies with requirements
- Interior Design (Master's program) Complies with requirements

# Standard 2

- Interior Design (Bachelor's program) Complies with requirements
- Interior Design (Master's program) Complies with requirements

#### Standard 3

- Interior Design (Bachelor's program) Substantially complies with requirements
- Interior Design (Master's program) Substantially complies with requirements

## Standard 4

- Interior Design (Bachelor's program) Substantially complies with requirements
- Interior Design (Master's program) Substantially complies with requirements

## Standard 5

- Interior Design (Bachelor's program) Complies with requirements
- Interior Design (Master's program) Complies with requirements

# Recommendations

The accreditation experts give six recommendations to the Bachelor and Master programme in Interior Design of the Faculty of Architecture and the University Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art:

- 1. It is recommended to increase international mobility and add exchange programs.
- **2.** It is recommended to pay more attention to the preparation of master's theses, especially in terms of improving the scientific apparatus and academic writing standards, so that the qualifying thesis acquires a relevant form.
- 3. It is recommended to teach academic writing skills and, along with it, research methods relevant to the field at the master's level, in order to eliminate the shortcomings in the mentioned direction in the papers.

- 4. It is recommended that the expansion of the Faculty's digital equipment with hardware and software be increased in proportion to the number of students at the Faculty. Students should be provided with the most modern working environment possible for CAAD (Computer Aided Architectural Design) and visualisation programs, particularly with regard to the development possibilities in augmented and virtual reality applications.
- 5. It is recommended that the academy prioritize the library renovation/reconstruction and create space for students to work in the library reading-halls, this is crucially important for quality teaching and learning.
- 6. It is recommended to increase the budget for specific teaching staff (academic staff of the degree programme) for the Bachelor's and Master's degree programme in Interior Design; this applies to professorships in the field of Interior Design, especially for the Master's degree programme (cf. 4.1).

# • Suggestions for the Programme Development

Based on the documents and records studied and following the visit and discussions with the representatives of the Bachelor's and Master's programmes in Interior Design at the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art, the accreditation experts give indications for the further development of the programme:

- 1. It is suggested that the Bachelor's and Master's degree programmes in interior design at the Faculty of Architecture at the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art and Design be more strongly oriented towards sustainability criteria. The United Nations' Agenda 2030 with its 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which include social, economic and ecological aspects, can provide valuable guidance here. Interior design in particular characterises, enables and shapes social exchange processes in societies. The circularity of material, energetic and social processes that are influenced or shaped by interior design should be taken into account in the teaching of design practice;
- 2. It is advisable to develop interdisciplinary projects in the process of practice courses together with other programmes of the cluster;
- 3. It is advisable to increase creativity by taking into account construction and technologies, combining tools of other and other materials in interior design using complex approaches;
- 4. It is advisable to further expand professional relations with companies in the field of interior design;
- 5. It is advisable to increase the involvement of students in research projects in general; Increasing student involvement in research projects based on individual or academic collaboration;
- 6. It is advisable to increase student involvement in theoretical research projects; to ensure that current projects are based on real practice, to promote student initiatives in project activities;
- 7. The teaching methods provided by the curriculum of the programme, of course, contribute to the acquisition of specific material. In addition, it is desirable to actively use

- heuristic methods in the educational process, since the description of work in the syllabi reflects only design approaches and neither the technological process, nor new forms of education;
- 8. During the self-evaluation of the cluster programmes, it is advisable to specifically indicate the content of the training related to the training/education methods completed by the personnel implementing the programme;
- 9. It is desirable to frequently plan events supporting the career development of students;
- 10. It is desirable to increase and rejuvenate the specific teaching staff for the Bachelor's and Master's degree programmes in Interior Design, especially for professorships in the field of Interior Design;
- 11. It is suggested that staff responsible for supervising Master's theses keep abreast of evolving trends in AI-related plagiarism issues;
- 12. It is suggested to improve professional development opportunities for teachers. They should feel supported and empowered by the university to excel in their role as teachers;
- 13. The Faculty's financial resources for the current Bachelor's and Master's teaching programmes should be improved, in particular for learning materials, consumables or tools, excursions, external lectures and the purchase of books.

# Brief Overview of the Best Practices (if applicable)<sup>3</sup>

The accreditation experts gained the impression during their on-site visit and from the discussions held with students, alumnae and the teaching staff that the aspect of informal and formal communication between teaching staff and students and former students is high and well developed. In the self-evaluation report for accreditation, no rubric is provided for this «soft factor». This practice of formal and informal communication between teachers and students cannot be valued enough for the advancement of students; it should definitely be cultivated further.

# Information on Sharing or Not Sharing the Argumentative Position of the HEI

The accreditation experts have taken note of the written feedback on the «argumentative position of the Faculty of Architecture of the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art on the Draft Report on Bacahelor's and Master's Programmes in Interior Design». The six main recommondations of the accreditation experts were accepted by the Faculty of Architecture. According to the feedback, some recommendations are already in the process of being implemented, albeit with unknown completion dates (3.1, 3.2, 3.3, 4.4). The recommondations on the digital infrastructure (4.4) and on the staffing of the degree programmes (4.5), which are very important for the sustainable development of the degree programme and from the point of view of the accreditation experts, accepted Architecture. The Faculty only partially responded to the long list of suggestions, probably due to the short feedback deadlines. The accreditation experts fully understand this. The suggestions were formulated on the basis of very benevolent expertise and are aimed at the two degree programmes in Interior Design, the Faculty and the Academy as a whole. The Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art and the Bachelor's and Master's degree programmes in Interior Design are free to consider these suggestions or to exclude them from their considerations for the further development of the HEI and the two degree programmes in Interior Design.

The accreditation experts see no reason to withdraw their recommendations and suggestions from the final report or to weaken them, as they largely agree with the feedback from the Academy. They see their recommendations as support for the further development of the Interior Architecture degree programmes and the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> A practice that is exceptionally effective and that can serve as a benchmark or example for other educational programme/programmes.

# • In case of re-accreditation, it is important to provide a brief overview of the achievements and/or the progress (if applicable)

Those responsible for the self-evaluation of the Bachelor's and Master's degree programmes in Interior Design at the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art, Faculty of Architecture, have used the preparation of the report to document the syllabi well and have also used the opportunity of the self-evaluation to make thematic and content-related adjustments to the curricula and have already implemented them. The Accreditation Commission has noted and praised this very favourably.

The adjustments and changes in the fields «basic subjects», «credit courses in speciality» and «optional subjects» are fundamentally sensible. The objectives and content of the degree programmes can thus be sharpened and better tailored to the requirements (see standard 1.1).

The changes that have already been implemented and the planned projects to improve the general conditions for studying within the faculty are generally pleasing. It is to be hoped that they can be realised in a timely manner and that the improvements can be consolidated.

It is pleasing to note that after the last accreditation it was decided to increase the number of credit courses in foreign languages to 12 credits in all Bachelor's programmes at the Tbilisi State Academy of Arts. This change has been implemented and appears to be proving successful. The fact that this change was partly based on student surveys is very remarkable.

The renovation and maintenance of the campus' building infrastructure has already been completed in some places and is still in progress in others. It is to be hoped and desired that this work can be completed in a timely manner.

The urgently needed increase in the salaries of teaching staff appears to be gratifying. It is to be hoped that the general conditions of academic staff will continue to improve.

Those responsible at the faculty and the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art have recognised that the technical equipment of the Interior Design courses is in urgent need of renewal of the digital equipment of their infrastructure with hardware and software in order to be able to offer the course content under contemporary conditions with a view to the future working world of the students.

# Evaluation approaches for the accreditation experts:

The components of the accreditation standards are evaluated using the following two approaches:

- 1. Cluster and individual evaluation<sup>4</sup>
- 2. Cluster evaluation<sup>5</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> **Evaluation Approaches:** Describe, analyse, and evaluate the compliance of each educational programme grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the corresponding component of the standard. Also, you can specify information about an educational programme that is different from the common and basic characteristics of educational programmes grouped in the cluster.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> **Assessment approaches:** <u>In case of necessity</u>, describe, analyse and evaluate compliance of each education programme in the cluster with the requirements of this component of the standard. Also, you can indicate the information on the education programme, distinguished from the general and major characteristics of the education programmes in a cluster.

Standard/Component	Assessment approaches:				
1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme					
1.1. Programme Objectives	Cluster and individual				
1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster and individual				
1.3. Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster				
1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	Cluster and individual				
1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Cluster and individual				
2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Ad Mastering	lequacy of Evaluation of Programme				
2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions	Cluster and individual				
2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills	Cluster				
2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods	Cluster				
2.4. Student Evaluation	Cluster				
3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them					
3.1. Student Consulting and Support Services	Cluster				
3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Cluster				
4. Providing Teaching Resources					
4.1. Human Resources	Cluster and individual				
4.2. Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students	Cluster and individual				
4.3. Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff	Cluster				
4.4. Material Resources	Cluster and individual				

4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and	Cluster and individual
Programme Financial Sustainability	
5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	
5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.2. External Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review	Cluster

# III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

# 1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the programme. The content and consistent structure of the programme ensure the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

Educational programmes grouped in a cluster are logically interrelated to each other in line with the study fields and evolve according to the respective levels of higher education.

# 1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level and an educational programme, and define the set of knowledge, skills and competences a programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the programme to the development of the field and society.

## Cluster and individual evaluation

# Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The purpose of combining the Bachelor's and Master's programmes in the cluster is connected with the intention of preparing students of interior design for an interdisciplinary field, which represents both a central part of architecture and at the same time the professional field of interior design overlaps with artistic, applied and decorative fields, as well as with the engineering-technical disciplines and humanities university directions. In this respect, the intentions of the two programmes coincide with the concern of the Apollon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art to unite the training of professionals from different fields under the umbrella of liberal and applied arts.

In this respect, the students of the Bachelor's and Master's programmes in Interior Design benefit greatly from this proximity to the liberal and applied arts. The artistic and creative freedom of the Interior Design students would suffer considerably if they were linked to an engineering-oriented department, for example.

While the aim of the Bachelor's programme Interior Design is to introduce students to the essence of interior design as an interdisciplinary field and to introduce the basic principles, approaches, modern theories, professional standards of ethics and occupational safety, the focus of the Master's programme is to bring together the practical directions of interior design with the latest

architectural theories, engineering disciplines, applied art requirements and economic issues: To unite and express the functional, volumetric-spatial, engineering, artistic-aesthetic, colour, lighting and acoustic requirements atmospherically.

The fact that the Bachelor's and Master's programmes in Interior Design are close to other design and art programmes at the same location in terms of space and content only became apparent to the accreditation experts during the on-site visit. The Interior Design students benefit from the spatial proximity and the exchange with students from other design and artistic disciplines.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)<sup>6</sup>

The Bachelor's programme Interior Design focuses on teaching students the methods of designing interiors as the result of a logical creative process. Designing contemporary interiors means responding to a range of requirements that organically encompass the whole set of demands: Functional, volumetric-spatial, technical, sustainable and artistic-aesthetic. The solution of each design-spatial task is carried out taking into account the relationships between all these requirements in the interior and exterior spaces.

The teaching of design fundamentals in the Bachelor's degree programme Interior Design is clearly and comprehensibly formulated in nine points in the self-evaluation under «the purpose of the programme». The distribution of the course credits into the areas of basic subjects (18 ECTS), credit courses in specialty (140 ECTS), university credit courses (36 ECTS) and optional subjects (46 ECTS) seems reasonable.

The division of the «credit courses in specialty» into subjects in Interior Design (101 ECTS), theoretical subjects in specialty (18 ECTS) and subjects in engineering specialty (21 ECTS) makes sense for the Bachelor's degree programme.

The digital equipment for the Interior Design degree programme with hardware and software in appropriate relation to the number of students is currently insufficient to be able to prepare students adequately for their later professional life. Students must have access to a digital working environment for CAAD (computer aided architectural design) and visualisation software that is as up-to-date as possible. Augmented and virtual reality applications in the professional environment are developing rapidly and require hardware environments with large computing capacities (see standard 4.4).

Please repeat the description and analysis field according to the number of programmes, for example, programme 2 (name, cycle), programme 3 (name, cycle) and so on. (Please consider this reference format when evaluating each subsequent component).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Describe, analyze and evaluate the compliance of each educational programme grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the specified component of the standard. Also, you can specify information about the educational programme that is different from the common and basic characteristics of the educational programmes grouped in the cluster.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's program)

In the Master's degree programme in Interior Design, the research component is introduced into the design processes and the degree of complexity of the topics and tasks is increased in contrast to the Bachelor's programme. Contemporary architectural theory, engineering disciplines, the requirements of applied art and economic issues are addressed to a greater extent.

Essentially, the Master's programme is designed to deepen and link the basic knowledge acquired in the Bachelor's programme. Attention is focussed on the use of ecological materials, building constructions and energy-saving systems for interior design tasks.

The goal of providing Master's students with knowledge of modern information and communication technologies, including professional computer programs, can only be achieved to a limited extent due to the limited digital equipment with hardware and software for CAAD (Computer Aided Architectural Design) and visualisation software. Augmented and virtual reality applications, which are developing rapidly in the professional environment, require hardware environments with large computing capacities (see standard 4.4).

The programme objectives are clearly defined, realistic and achievable and take appropriate account of the special features of Interior Design at both Bachelor's and Master's levels. The level of the two educational programmes is good and reflects the knowledge, skills and competences that the programme aims to develop in its graduates. The current accessibility and equipment of the digital infrastructure partially hinders the achievement of the intended course objectives in the Bachelor's and Master's programmes in Interior Design. Both programmes are likely to be increasingly oriented towards the sustainability criteria of the UN Agenda 2023.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- Weighting of credits: «Interior Design- Bachelor's programme»
- Digital equipment for the interior design bachelor's degree programme: On-site visit
- Description of the study contents: «Self-evaluation report of accreditation for educational programmes grouped in a cluster of educational programmes».

# General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

# General suggestions of the cluster:

It is suggested that the Bachelor's and Master's degree programmes in interior design at the Faculty of Architecture at the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art and Design be more strongly oriented towards sustainability criteria. The United Nations' Agenda 2030

with its 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which include social, economic and ecological aspects, can provide valuable guidance here. Interior design in particular characterises, enables and shapes social exchange processes in societies. The circularity of material, energetic and social processes that are influenced or shaped by interior design should be taken into account in the teaching of design practice.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes:				
Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)				
Recommendation(s): See: General recommendations on the cluster.				
Suggestion(s): See: General suggestions on the cluster.				
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)				
Recommendation(s): See: General recommendations on the cluster.				
Suggestion(s): See: General suggestions on the cluster.				

# Evaluation 7

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.1 -	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
Programme Objectives	requirements	complies the	complies with	comply with
		requirements	requirements	requirements
Programme 1 Interior				
Design (Bachelor's				
program)				
Programme 2 Interior				
Design (Master's				
Program)				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Evaluation is performed for each programme separately.

# 1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes

- The learning outcomes of the programme are logically related to the programme objectives and the specificity of the field of study.
- ➤ Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or sense of responsibility and autonomy which students gain upon completion of the programme.

# Cluster and individual evaluation

# Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The programme learning outcomes are in line with the objectives of the Interior Design degree programmes and include the key knowledge, skills and responsibility and autonomy appropriate to the content.

The learning outcomes are measurable, achievable and realistic and are consistent with the appropriate level of qualification, the detailed descriptor and the qualification to be awarded.

The Bachelor and Master in Interior Design cluster learning outcomes are consistent in terms of content, complexity and difficulty. They are broadly consistent with the employment requirements of programme graduates and enable graduates to continue their education at the next level of training.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1: Interior Design (Bachelor's program)

The Bachelor's programme Interior Design is designed in a building-up manner, which means that students are introduced to the compexity of the field step by step. The historical theoretical foundations of art and architecture, the mechanisms of applying the basic principles of the fine arts, the importance of knowledge in the humanities are taught in the same way as the contemporary methods of zoning, colouring and lighting of buildings with different functions. With the updating of the syllabus, important adjustments have been made, such as in the «foreign language», «the art of conducting communication», or «psychological basis for showcase decoration». Special mention should be made of the strengthening of the engineering-technical subjects in the degree programme, for example «energy efficiency of buildings».

With the renewal within the framework of the self-evaluation report, essential steps have been taken to renew and update the study programme. It is to be hoped that the process of updating the programme will be sustained.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2: Interior Design (Master's program)

The Master's programme in Interior Design focuses on the ability to think creatively, to use the power of imagination and to recognise in depth the aspects of the overall psychological and aesthetic effect (materiality, colour, lighting, planting, acoustics, etc.) on people.

The Master's programme also pays more attention to collecting complex information and analysing problems based on the latest data on interior design. The aim is to develop the ability to think critically, carry out analyses and develop strategies for action with social and ethical responsibility.

This ensures that the learning objectives match the employment requirements for graduates of the Master's programme and enable graduates to continue their education at the next level or successfully enter the labour market.

The learning outcomes of the Bachelor's and Master's in Interior Design programmes are measurable, achievable and realistic and are consistent with the relevant qualification level, detailed descriptors and qualifications to be awarded. They are bundled into Bachelor's and Master's programmes in Interior Design and are consistent in terms of content, complexity and level of difficulty. They are broadly consistent with the employment requirements of graduates of the programme.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- Description of Learning Outcomes: «Self-evaluation Report of Accreditation for Educational Programs Grouped in a Cluster of Educational Programs».
- Bachelor's degree programme;
- Master's programme;
- o Curricula of degree programmes at the corresponding level;
- o Map with the objectives and learning outcomes of the degree programme;
- o Study Outcomes: On-site visit.
- Renewal of the Syllabus: Explanatory talks during the on-site visit.

## General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

# General suggestions of the cluster:

No suggestions on this item

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:
No recommendations or suggestions on this item
Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s):—

# **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.2	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
Programme Learning	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with
Outcomes		requirements	requirements	requirements
Programme 1 Interior				
Design (Bachelor's				
program)				
Programme 2 Interior				
Design (Master's				
Program)				

# 1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes

- ➤ Evaluation mechanisms of the programme learning outcomes are defined. The programme learning outcomes assessment process consists of defining, collecting and analyzing data necessary to measure learning outcomes.
- ➤ Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.

The learning outcomes are, as far as the accreditation experts could ascertain on the basis of the documents submitted and during the on-site visit, assessed in the teaching and research

component in a coherent and transparent way with a periodicity corresponding to the characteristics of the subject Interior Design.

The learning outcomes assessment system and periodicity take into account the specificities of the Interior Design field of study and the level of education. It uses relevant forms and methods of assessment that make it possible to determine the extent to which students have achieved the learning outcomes of the programme.

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The mechanisms for assessing programme learning outcomes are accessible to stakeholders. The assessment plan for learning outcomes of the Interior Design clustered programmes are appropriate to the programmes offered.

Those responsible share the results of surveys among graduates and employers and maintain an active exchange with former students and employer companies.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- o Description of Learning Outcomes: «Self-evaluation Report of Accreditation for Educational Programs Grouped in a Cluster of Educational Programs».
- o Learning Outcomes: Interviews On-site visit
- o Renewal of the Syllabus: Explanatory talks during the on-site visit

# General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

# General suggestions of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

# Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes:

No recommendations or suggestions on this item

**Programme 1** Interior Design (Bachelor's program)

Recommendation(s): —

Suggestion(s): —
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —

## **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.3	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
<b>Evaluation Mechanism</b>	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with
of the Programme		requirements	requirements	requirements
Learning Outcomes				
Programme 1 Interior				
Design (Bachelor's				
program)				
Programme 2 Interior				
Design (Master's				
Program)				

# 1.4. Structure and Content of Educational Programme

- ➤ The programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes.
- ➤ The programme structure is consistent and logical. The content and structure ensure the achievement of the programme learning outcomes. The qualification to be awarded is corresponding to the programme content and learning outcomes.

# Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The programmes in Interior Design are designed according to the methodology of Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art, Faculty of Architecture, for planning, designing and

developing educational programmes. The content, scope and complexity of the programme correspond to the learning cycle.

The programme complies with ECTS recommendations - European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System. The content and structure of the study programmes ensure their individuality.

The structure of the study programme is coherent; the teaching and scientific-research components of the Interior Design degree programmes (including the individual modules) are logically structured and a comprehensible development of the content is guaranteed. The admission requirements for the next level are appropriate.

# Description and Analysis - Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)

The Bachelor's degree programme comprises 240 ECTS and is structured as follows: Basic subjects (18 ECTS), credit subjects defining the specialisation (140 ECTS), general education subjects in the desired field (36 ECTS) and electives amounting to 46 ECTS. The programme structure appears consistent and logical. The content and structure of the Bachelor's programme ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes. The qualification to be acquired corresponds to the study contents and learning outcomes.

# **Description and Analysis - Programme 2** Interior Design (Master's program)

The programme is based on the ECTS system, it is student-centred and based on the student workload required to achieve the objectives of the educational programme.

The areas «Speciality/major», «University credit courses», «Optional subjects» and «Master's thesis» with 20 ECTS are clearly structured and the weighting of the areas appears appropriate.

The structure of the Bachelor's and Master's degree programmes is coherent and well developed; the didactic and scientific-research components of the Interior Design degree programmes (including the individual modules) are comprehensible and logically structured. A comprehensible development of the content is guaranteed.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

 Description of programme structure: «Self-evaluation Report of Accreditation for Educational Programs Grouped in a Cluster of Educational Programs».

o ECTS Allocation: Interviews On-site visit.
o Renewal of the Syllabus: Explanatory talks during the on-site visit.
General recommendations of the cluster:
No recommendation on this item
General suggestion of the cluster:
No suggestions on this item
Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:
No recommendations or suggestions on this item

# Recommendation(s): — Suggestion(s): — Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)

Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)

Recommendation (s): --

Suggestion(s): —

# **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)				

Programme 2 Interior		
Design (Master's		
Program)		

# 1.5. Academic Course/Subject

- ➤ The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject.
- ➤ The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.
- ➤ The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.

# Cluster and individual evaluation

# Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The learning outcomes of the academic subject of the degree programmes are consistent with the learning outcomes of the degree programmes. The content of each academic course or module corresponds to its learning outcomes. The number of credits allocated to each module corresponds to the course content and learning outcomes. The ratio between contact and self-study seems appropriate and takes into account the specificities of interior design. The learning outcomes of each module are assessed as far as the accreditation aexperts could determine on the basis of the documents submitted and during the on-site visit.

# **Description and Analysis - Programme 1** Interior Design (Bachelor's program)

The content of the curriculum follows the outcomes of their own subject, which provide the overall outcomes of the programme. The number of credits allocated to each educational curriculum of the Bachelor's programme corresponds to the content and learning outcomes of the Bachelor's in Interior Design. The correlation between contact and self-study is appropriate and takes into account the specificities of Interior Design. The special features include, for example, the 8 hours per week reserved for studio work. This time is divided equally between the student and the lecturer to discuss the intermediate results.

# Description and Analysis - Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's program)

Like the Bachelor's degree programme, the Master's is also characterised as a results-oriented programme. Outcome-orientation takes into account the requirements of the various interest

groups (academic and visiting staff, students, graduates and employers). The structure of the degree programme includes a logical structure and a sensible balance: in the case of the Master's programme with the components subject area, special area, special electives and Master's thesis. In contrast to the Bachelor's programme, the Master's programme aims for an in-depth understanding of technical design processes in the planning of the spatial environment; this in the combination of constructions, furniture, building materials and service systems and their connection to a functional and efficient unit.

Compulsory literature and other teaching and learning materials are listed in the curricula. They correspond to the learning outcomes of the subject and ensure that the learning outcomes of the programme are achieved.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- Description of Bachelor programme structure: «Self-evaluation Report of Accreditation for Educational Programs Grouped in a Cluster of Educational Programs».
- ECTS Allocation and between contact and self-study hours: «Self-evaluation Report of Accreditation for Educational Programs Grouped in a Cluster of Educational Programs» and Interviews On-site visit.
- Renewal of the Syllabus: «Self-evaluation Report of Accreditation for Educational Programs Grouped in a Cluster of Educational Programs» and explanatory talks during the on-site visit.

## General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

# General suggestions of the cluster:

No suggestions on this item

# Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

No recommendations or suggestions on this item

**Programme 1** Interior Design (Bachelor's program)

Recommendation(s): —

Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)						
Recommendation(s):	_					
Suggestion(s): —						
Evaluation  Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component						
Please, evaluate the comp	liance of the prog	ramme with the	component			
Component 1.5	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not		
Component 1.5 Academic		Substantially complies with	Partially complies with	comply with		
Component 1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Complies with	Substantially	Partially			
Component 1.5 Academic	Complies with	Substantially complies with	Partially complies with	comply with		
Component 1.5 Academic Course/Subject Programme 1 Interior	Complies with	Substantially complies with	Partially complies with	comply with		

# Compliance of the programmes with the standards

1. Educational	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes	requirements	complies with requirements	complies with requirements	comply with requirements
and their Compliance		requirements	requirements	requirements
with the Programme				
Programme 1 Interior				
Design (Bachelor's				
program)				
Programme 2 Interior				
Design (Master's				
Program)				

# 2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering

Prerequisites for admission to the programme, teaching-learning methods and student assessment consider the specificity of the study field, level requirements, student needs, and ensure the engagement achievement of the objectives and expected learning outcomes of the programme.

# 2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions

The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programme to achieve learning outcomes.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

# Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Admission requirements to the educational programmes take into account the specifics of the programmes, ensure the involvement of persons with the necessary knowledge, skills and competence to acquire the programme; prerequisites and procedures for admission to the programme comply with applicable legislation; the HEI determines the methodology of planning the number of students in the educational programme, which takes into account the specifics of the programme, the resources of the institution and ensures the smooth implementation of the educational process;

# Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Interior Design, BA)

The prerequisites and procedures for admission to the Bachelor's programme in "Interior Design" are in line with the applicable legislation, is public, transparent and accessible, and ensure the involvement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills to achieve the learning outcomes of the programme. In particular, admission to the Bachelor's programme is as follows:

A person with Full General Education is admitted to the educational programme, based on the results of unified national exams (mathematics, Georgian language and literature, foreign language);

- The person who has passed the creative test at TSAA is admitted to the educational programme. Information about the creative test is available to the entrants at least two months before the test.
- On the basis of external or internal mobility, in accordance with legislative and university rules and regulations.

Enrollment in the programme without Unified National Exams takes place within the fixed term according to the established procedure. In particular, I. for foreign citizens or for stateless persons who have acquired a Full General Education or its equivalent education in a foreign country; for Georgian citizens who have acquired the Full general Education or its equivalent education in a foreign country and have studied abroad for the last two years of their general education; II I. for persons who are studying/ have studied and received credits in a foreign country at the higher educational institution recognized in accordance with the legislation of the country concerned;

The mobility of students from other higher educational institutions is carried out in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia dated February 4, 2010 N 10/N and on the basis of the normative acts established by the University (see TSAA Regulations for Educational Process)

# Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Interior Design, MA)

The prerequisites for admission to the MA programme "Interior Design" are in line with applicable legislation, programme content and learning outcomes and ensure the admission of persons with appropriate qualifications and skills to the programme. Admission requirements for the MA programme of Interior Design are also fair, transparent and affordable. Admission requirements for the MA programme "Interrior Design" as as follows:

- Applicants who have an academic degree (qualification) in architecture or Bachelor of Arts will be admitted to the programme;
- have passed the Unified National Master's Exam, and the exam of the Faculty of Architecture of TSAA in foreign languages: (BII level);
- The skills of the applicant in the specialty are evaluated with the presented portfolio and attached documentation (CV, cover letter, reference).

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- BA programme;
- MA programme;
- MA entrance exam procedure;
- o MA entrance exam criteria;
- Students contingent planning methodology;
- TSAA webpage http://www.art.edu.ge.

# General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

General suggestions of t	he cluster:			
No suggestions on this i	item			
Recommendations and s	suggestions accord	ling to the progra	mmes:	
No recommendations o	-			
Programme 1 Interior I	Design (Bachelor's	program)		
J		18		
Recommendation(s): —				
Suggestion(s): —				
Programme 2 Interior I	Design (Master's P	rogram)		
Recommendation(s): —				
Suggestion(s): —				
Suggestion(s). —				
Evaluation				
m	1			
Please, evaluate the comp	pliance of the prog	gramme with the	component	
Component 2.1	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
-				comply with
Programme admission	requirements	complies with	_	- ·
Programme admission preconditions	requirements	complies with requirements	requirements	requirements
Programme admission preconditions  Programme 1	requirements	_	_	- ·
Programme admission preconditions	requirements	_	_	- ·
Programme admission preconditions Programme 1 (Interior Design BA)	requirements	_	_	- ·
Programme admission preconditions Programme 1 (Interior Design BA) Programme 2	requirements	_	_	- ·
Programme admission preconditions  Programme 1 (Interior Design BA)  Programme 2 (Interior Design MA)		requirements	requirements	requirements
Programme admission preconditions Programme 1 (Interior Design BA) Programme 2	Practical, Scientifies the	requirements  Corrections and the correction of	requirements	requirements   nd Transferable Ski ents' practica

# Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Based on the self-evaluation report of the educational programmes, the documentation attached to it, and the information obtained as a result of the accreditation visit, the practical/creative/performance component of the programme is organized and planned in accordance with the learning outcomes of the programme and corresponds to the level of education. In accordance with the learning outcomes, the programmes are oriented towards the involvement of students in practical, scientific/research/creative activities, the main goal of which is the development of practical, creative skills of the students according to the learning outcomes and educational level. This corresponds to the standard in theory, and it is advisable that in practice are considered according to both parts. The high aesthetic values and creative potential of the presented student works are noteworthy which was clearly visible during the site visit; however, in terms of developing practical skills, it is recommended to update the content of practical courses within the curriculum with modern issues and topics, and more work and involvement in scientific research projects is needed. For example, for practical and scientific research skills, it is very appropriate to teach old traditional techniques, however, these skills and knowledge acquired at the university level, should be updated at the next level. Involvement in scientific research should be increased at the undergraduate level and mainly, at the stage of mastering the final work.

# If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

# Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Interior Design, BA)

The practical, creative and performing component of the programme is organized in compliance with the learning outcome and cycle. However, it is advisable to strengthen the practice session. In the self-evaluation report, there is information about the practice but there is still space to attract more companies. It is recommended that you further support students to gain practical knowledge in local companies. The self-evaluation report shows the list of students participating in university, international events, exhibitions, which significantly contribute to the development of the student's creative skills, but this should be ensured regularly.

# Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Interior Design, MA)

The site visit, as well as the syllabi of the MA programme Interior Design show that both the practical and the research components are developed more; In contrast to the Bachelor's degree, the Master's degree student faces difficult tasks to solve. They devote more time to the mastery of specialty, due to the fact that a large part of the credits are allocated to specific subjects. Advanced scientific-research training at the Master's degree is provided by such courses as functional analysis - which deals directly with research issues; the cycle of professional technical disciplines is also being enriched;

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- BA "Interior Design";
- MA "Interior Design";
- o self-evaluation report of the programmes grouped in the cluster;
- Results of the interview.
- Site visit;
- o relevant agreements/memorandums with practice facilities and partner organizations;
- materials of TSAA conferences;
- magazine ACADEMIA
- TSAA webpage www.art.edu.ge

# General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

# General suggestions of the cluster:

It is advisable to develop interdisciplinary projects in the process of practice courses together with other programmes of the cluster;

It is advisable to increase creativity by taking into account construction and technologies, combining tools of other and other materials in interior design using complex approaches;

It is advisable to further expand professional relations with companies in the field of interior design;

It is advisable to increase the involvement of students in research projects in general; Increasing student involvement in research projects based on individual or academic collaboration;

It is advisable to increase student involvement in theoretical research projects; to ensure that current projects are based on real practice, to promote student initiatives in project activities.

# Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:

See general suggestions

**Programme 1** Interior Design (Bachelor's program)

Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —

# **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.2. The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/perform ing and transferable Skills	Complies with requirement s	Substantiall y complies with requirement	Partially complies with requirement	Does not comply with requirement
		S	S	S
Programme 1 (Interior Design BA)				
Programme 2 (Interior Design MA)				

# 2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods

The programme is implemented by using student-centered teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

# Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The syllabi of each course provided by the educational programmes of both levels of the cluster are implemented using student-oriented teaching-learning methods. Each syllabus envisages ways (methods) of achieving the goal of the academic course, which are based on the principles of student-centered teaching. The teaching and learning methods envisaged by the syllabus of each academic course are focused not only on acquiring knowledge, but also on developing the skills. The academic courses include teaching-teaching methods of the relevant specifics. The teaching-learning methods reflected in the syllabus of each academic course of the educational programme correspond to the education level and the goals and content of each academic course.

The teaching-learning methods, based on the specifics of the academic course, ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes provided by the syllabus of the academic course, and the combination of existing teaching methods ensure the achievement of learning outcomes provided by the programme. While selecting the teaching methods, the objective and expected outcome of the study course have been taken into account - what a student should know and be able to do. The teaching-learning methods envisaged by the syllabi of the academic courses support mastering a specific material and develop transferable skills of the student.

# If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

# Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Interior Design, BA)

The teaching methods of each study course/subject of the programme correspond to the level of study, the content of the course/subject, the learning outcomes, the requirements of sectoral benchmarks (if any) and ensures their achievement, active involvement of students and staff in the learning process, as well as interaction between students and takes into account the student's participation in the learning process with proper autonomy and responsibility.

In the learning process, the following teaching methods are used based on the specifics of the study course of the programme Interior Design: Studio teaching, exhibition, verbal or oral method, method of working on a book, method of written work, demonstration method, explanatory method, action-oriented teaching method, induction, deduction, methods of analysis and synthesis, as well as practical methods: Case study, problem-based learning (PBL), brainstorming. Students prepare a group and individual research project, its presentation, discussion/debate during group work, etc.

In the teaching-learning process, methods complement each other, or combine several methods, or any other method, depending on a specific educational task. The methods of teaching and learning of a specific training course are provided in the syllabus of respective training course.

# Description and Analysis - programme 2 (Interior Design, MA)

The structure of the MA programme "Interior Design" defines the possibility of acquiring theoretical knowledge and practical skills and developing general and industrial competencies; In particular, the training courses include teaching methods such as homework, individual work and portfolios, preparation of reports for presentations and conferences. In order to achieve the goals set by the programme, various methods are used in the educational process, including certain "diversity of theoretical knowledge and research work", in which it is desirable to develop research methods using not only traditional technologies, but also the entire set of methods specified in the program, In particular, in the results of students' work, the importance of heuristic methods should be emphasized, which allows the student to expand the range of creativity. Considering the specifics of a certain training course, the following teaching methods are used in

the learning process: Verbal method, written work, demonstration method, discussion, debate method, exhibition, demonstration, presentation method, induction, deduction, analysis and synthesis, case study, problem-based learning (PBL), brainstorming, individual and group projects, consultations and others. Methods complete and complement each other in the teaching and learning process. A professor may use one or several of the above methods or any other method, based on the objective of a specific educational objective. The methods of teaching and learning of a specific training course are provided in the syllabus of the respective training course.

## **Evidences/Indicators**

- o BA programme "Interior Design" and the syllabi;
- o MA programme "Interior Design" and the syllabi;
- Self-Evaluation Report of Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster
- The Web page of the University:
- Students' work;
- Students' portfolio
- Component evidence/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results

## General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

# General suggestions of the cluster:

The teaching methods provided by the curriculum of the programme, of course, contribute to the acquisition of specific material. In addition, it is desirable to actively use heuristic methods in the educational process, since the description of work in the syllabi reflects only design approaches and neither the technological process, nor new forms of education;

During the self-evaluation of the cluster programmes, it is advisable to specifically indicate the content of the training related to the training/education methods completed by the personnel implementing the programme;

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: See general suggestions

**Programme 1** Interior Design (Bachelor's program)

Recommendation(s): —

Suggestion(s): —
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —

## **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.3.	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
Teaching and learning	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with
methods		requirements	requirements	requirements
Programme 1				
(Interior Design BA)				
Programme 2				
(Interior Design MA)				

# 2.4. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.

## Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

At the Apollon Kutateladze State Art Academy of Tbilisi, the assessment of students is carried out according to the established procedures, it is transparent, reliable and in accordance with the legislation. During the implementation of the program and the teaching of study disciplines, the student's performance in each discipline is evaluated by the European Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS) and the evaluation system according to the "Rules for calculating credits for higher education programs" approved by the Order #3 of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia on January 5, 2007.

The academy has a 100-point student evaluation system. The maximum positive score is 100, and the minimum is 51 points. In addition, the following are considered positive grades: A (91-100), B (81-90), C (71-80), D (61-70), E (51-60). A negative grade is considered: FX (41-50), F (40 or less).

Mastering the educational component provided by the educational programs assumes the active participation of students in the teaching process. The evaluation of the work done by the student during the semester takes into account: evaluation of independent work; mid-semester assessment; final exam evaluation.

The assessment criteria are detailed in the syllabus of the particular subject. For the successful completion of training courses, the active involvement of the student in the process is required. The evaluation scheme in TSSA is simple and consists of several components, namely: evaluation of independent work, evaluation of midterm exam, evaluation of final exam.

According to the regulation of the educational process of TSSA, - a student will not be admitted to the final exam, if the number of missed contact hours in a specific subject is 50% or more; At each stage of study, the student is allowed to retake the final exam only if he/she has a total score of at least 41, including the final exam; In each form of intermediate assessment, the minimum competence threshold represents 30% of the maximum score determined for this assessment, and 50% of the maximum score in the final assessment; If plagiarism is found in a TSSA student's work, it will not be graded. The student is given the opportunity to pass the intermediate or final exam (take an additional exam).

The grading system and grading criteria for each component are given in the subject syllabus. Also, the syllabi of all level programs describe the midterm or final exam format and evaluation criteria for any course. The presented programs are accompanied by information about the evaluation criteria of the qualification thesis (bachelor's, master's).

As for the evaluation system of diploma theses, it is as follows: the thesis is evaluated with a maximum of 100 points. Work on theses, both at the bachelor's and master's levels, consists of three stages: 1. Selection and approval of the topic of the thesis, which is determined as a result of consultations with the supervisor during the first three weeks of the last semester; 2. Intermediate defense, which is not assessed, although it is a kind of prerequisite for the defense of the work; 3. Defense of the thesis, during which the diploma holder presents the completed thesis before the commission.

The following criteria and percentage distribution for the undergraduate thesis evaluation for the Bachelor of Interior Design program are:

The supervisor evaluates the graduate with 30%, in which he takes into account: 1. Finding, processing and analyzing materials for the given topic (15%); 2. The ability to gather information, foresee the problem, analyze and develop a strategy. Creative search for composition and cost of proposed options (15%).

And for a large share of the assessment, 70%, the commission writes: 1. functional-planning solution of the object and compliance with the construction scheme (15%); 2. Proper use and placement of interior components (furniture, decorative elements and other components) in a

specific space according to their function, color, texture and other characteristics (15%); 3. Decision of spatial composition of the interior using architectural details and elements (15%) 4. Compliance of the presented material with the basic requirements of the diploma project and quality of graphic execution (10%); 5. Verbal presentation (15%).

As for the interior design master's program, it is evaluated according to the following criteria, here is the percentage distribution of the evaluation according to the criteria: The evaluation criteria of the master's thesis include the following points: 1. Finding, processing, and analyzing research materials for the given topic (15%); 2. The ability to gather information, foresee the problem, analyze and develop a strategy. creative search for the composition and the value of the proposed options (15%); 3. Interior spatial solution (15%); 4. Functional-planning solution and structural-engineering scheme of the facility (15%); 5. Proper use of interior components, furniture, decorative elements and other components in a specific space according to their function, color, texture and other characteristics (15%); 6. Compliance of the presented material with the basic requirements of the diploma project and graphic design (10%); 7. Verbal presentation (15%).

As mentioned during the interview, the students' attitude towards the existing assessment system and components is positive. The mentioned scheme is understandable and acceptable to them and they would not like to change anything in this direction.

As for the mechanism of appeal, as it became clear during the interview, the Academy provides students with this mechanism as well. In case they are not satisfied with the result of the exams/defence, they have the possibility to appeal the score. Students are also informed about the appeal mechanism.

# **Evidences/Indicators**

- The regulatory document of the assessment system;
- Evaluation methods and criteria outlined in the attached syllabuses of the educational program;
- Electronic student evaluation system/portal;
- o Procedure for appeal of assessment results;
- o The procedure for completing bachelor's and master's theses;
- Academy website;
- Interview results.

# General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

General suggestions of t	he cluster:				
No suggestions on this item					
		-			
Recommendations and s			nmes:		
See general recommend	ations and suggest	TIONS			
<b>Programme 1</b> Interior D	esign (Bachelor's <sub>l</sub>	program)			
Recommendation(s): —					
• •					
Suggestion(s): —					
Programme 2 Interior D	esign (Master's Pr	ogram)			
Recommendation(s): —					
`,					
Suggestion(s): —					
- 1 .					
Evaluation					
Please, evaluate the comp	oliance of the progr	rammes with the	component		
Component 2.4 -	Complies with		Partially	Does not	
Student evaluation	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with	
Programme 1		requirements	requirements	requirements	
(Interior design, BA)					
Programme 2					
(Interior design, MA)					
Constitution Cal	545.41	. 1 1.			
Compliance of the progra	mmes with the sta	ndards			
2. Methodology and	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not	
Organisation of	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with	
Teaching, Adequacy	1	requirements	requirements	requirements	
Evaluation of		_		_	
Programme Mastering					

Programme (Interior Design BA)		
Programme 2 (Interior Design MA)		

#### 3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them

The programme ensures the creation of a student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; promotes maximum student awareness, implements a variety of activities and facilitates student engagement in local and / or international projects; proper quality of scientific guidance and supervision is provided for master's and doctoral students.

### 3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services

Students receive consultation and support regarding planning of the learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the programme and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the programme.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

# Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Students of the Tbilisi Apollon Kutateladze State Academy of Arts receive consultation and support on planning the educational process, improving academic achievements and career development by the persons involved in the program and/or the structural units of the institution, namely: the dean, the head of the quality assurance service of the faculty, the coordinators of bachelors, masters and doctoral students, IT department, library, program supervisor and academic staff implementing the program.

In order to improve teaching results and individual work with students, the schedule of academic staff includes consulting hours, information about which is written in the syllabus itself and the student has access to it. Students of both levels have the opportunity to familiarize themselves with the syllabi of the study courses of the program in advance.

Students are informed about various local and international projects and events. As mentioned during the interview, students receive information through various means, including: e-mail, educational database, social media of the academy, telephone communication, etc. In addition, it was also noted that the relations between the representatives of the administration and the students are often established on an interpersonal level, with direct feedback.

Within the framework of the program, students have the opportunity to participate in local and international projects, events, performing and creative activities. As for exchange programs, in this direction, as mentioned, there was some resistance, although they intend to actively cooperate with foreign higher education institutions. The mentioned note can also be found in the areas for improvement of the self-assessment document.

Regarding student services, it is worth noting their feedback forms, which primarily include surveys. Student survey is conducted every semester. The survey is periodic, anonymous and mandatory. The questionnaire was drawn up to determine how the lectures were conducted in the last semester, how satisfied the student was with the work of the professor. In this direction, the student states his position, after which the results of the survey are delivered to the quality assurance service of the faculty. The latter involves the academic staff and the person responsible for the educational process from the administration in the process of analyzing the results and developing relevant recommendations. After processing the results of the survey, as necessary, advice or recommendations are developed to improve the training course or the work of the professor. As mentioned by students and teachers during the interview, the recommendations given as a result of the results obtained on the basis of the survey are largely taken into account.

In addition to students, it was mentioned during the interview that they also have a questionnaire for graduates, which is sent to them every year. The graduates confirmed the information and noted that they often fill out the questionnaire.

In addition to the evaluation of study courses, students are sent a questionnaire about the study process and material base once a semester. In addition, it is significant that the academy often uses the focus group method, in which students of different academic backgrounds are randomly selected. The results are being actively analyzed. Also, on an interpersonal level, they are often interested in students' opinions on what can be improved/what needs to be corrected.

The Academy has a career development service that provides counseling to students and graduates regarding employment.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Planned and implemented consulting services;
- Workload, functions and duties of persons involved in consulting services (academic/scientific/guest/administrative/support staff involved in the program, faculty/school coordinator or others), their job descriptions;
- o documents/information on student involvement in local and international activities;
- Academy website;
- Results of the interview.

General recommendation	ns of the cluster:						
It is recommended to increase international mobility and add exchange programs.							
General suggestions of the	ne cluster:						
It is desirable to frequently plan events supporting the career development of students.							
Recommendations and st	aggestions accord	ling to the progra	mmes:				
See general recommenda	ations and sugges	tions					
Programme 1 Interior De	esign (Bachelor's	program)					
Recommendation(s): —							
Suggestion(s): —							
Programme 2 Interior De	esign (Master's P	rogram)					
Recommendation(s): —							
Suggestion(s): —							
Evaluation							
Please, evaluate the comp	liance of the prog	grammes with the	component				
Component 3.1	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not			
Student consulting and	requirements	complies with requirements	complies with	comply with			
support services  Programme 1		requirements	requirements	requirements			
(Interior design, BA)							
Programme 2 (Interir design, MA)							

# 3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision

A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctorate students to perform the scientific-research component successfully.

➤ Within master's and doctoral programmes, ratio of students and supervisors enables to perform scientific supervision properly.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

# Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Bachelor's and master's programs of interior design of Tbilisi State Academy of Arts are provided with the regulatory documents necessary for the completion of the thesis: regarding the appointment of the supervisor and co-supervisor, the completion of the thesis, and others.

The head is appointed by the decision of the faculty council. Masters level students are provided with supervisors. The supervisor is selected depending on the topic of the master's thesis, according to his experience and competence. The faculty provides the master's student with a scientific supervisor with at least a master's academic degree, creates conditions for conducting scientific research; The supervisor of the qualifying thesis can be an academic staff member of the faculty or a visiting teacher.

The supervisor controls the process of work on the qualification paper; His leaving the academic position held at TSSA does not lead to his refusal to lead the master's student. In this case, a new contract will be signed between the academy, the head of the master's student and the master's student, which, in addition to the obligations of the parties, will determine the terms of the supervisor's remuneration.

The supervisor is obliged to consult the graduate regularly. The frequency of consultations based on the specifics of the scientific topic is determined by the agreement of the supervisor and the master's student.

As it was repeatedly stated during the interview, graduates are free to choose their thesis topic and scientific supervisor. On the other hand, the supervisors express their willingness to be available to all students within a certain limit. As for the co-leader, during the interview, the Academy mentioned that they mostly turn to consultants for some advice and recommendations, and the need for a co-leader has not yet been observed in the programs.

Completion of the master's thesis consists of three stages: 1. Selection and approval of the topic of the thesis, which is determined as a result of consultations with the supervisor during the first three weeks of the last semester; 2. Intermediate defense, which is not evaluated, although it is a kind of prerequisite for the defense of the work; 3. Defense of the thesis, during which the diploma holder presents the completed thesis before the commission.

As for the evaluation criteria of the master's thesis and its percentage distribution, it is as follows: 1. Searching, processing, and analysis of research materials for the given topic (15%); 2. The ability to gather information, foresee the problem, analyze and develop a strategy. creative search for the composition and the value of the proposed options (15%); 3. Interior spatial solution (15%); 4. Functional-planning solution and structural-engineering scheme of the facility (15%); 5. Proper use of interior components, furniture, decorative elements and other components in a specific space according to their function, color, texture and other characteristics (15%); 6. Compliance of the presented material with the basic requirements of the diploma project and graphic design (10%); 7. Verbal presentation (15%).

As mentioned during the interview, graduate students do not take courses in academic writing and research methods. The absence of the mentioned training courses, in turn, finds a negative reflection on the master's thesis.

As a result of looking at master's theses, it can be said that it is almost no different from the work done at the undergraduate level. To a large extent, it has the appearance of a presentation and, to a greater extent, is made with visual decoration.

As mentioned during the interview, theses involve a little research, although the scientific apparatus is to be strengthened as well as academic writing skills. The architectonics of the presented works, as I mentioned, was more like the format of the presentation. It would be clear, the relevant structure for the master's thesis - with its introduction, main part and conclusion.

During the interview, the students expressed that it would be good if they were also taught research methods and academic writing at the graduate level. This, on the one hand, will help the supervisor not to make additional efforts in this direction during the process of working on the thesis, and on the other hand, the students to maintain scientific and academic standards in their papers to the extent that it is required for the Master of Interior Design program.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- The form of the agreement of the supervisor/co-supervisor of master's and doctoral students and/or the document defining the appointment, replacement and powers of the supervisor;
- Mechanisms for evaluating the quality of the supervisor's/co-supervisor's activities and evaluation results;
- o MA provision;
- o rights and duties of the MA head;
- Academy website;
- Results of the interview.

#### General recommendations of the cluster:

It is recommended to pay more attention to the preparation of master's theses, especially

in terms of improving the scientific apparatus and academic writing standards, so that the qualifying thesis acquires a relevant form.

It is recommended to teach academic writing skills and, along with it, research methods relevant to the field at the master's level, in order to eliminate the shortcomings in the mentioned direction in the papers.

General suggestions of the cluster:

No suggestions on this item

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:
See general recommendations and suggestions
Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —

#### **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 3.2.	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
Master's and Doctoral	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with
Student Supervision		requirements	requirements	requirements
Programme 1				
(Interior design, BA)				
Programme 2				
(Interior design, MA)				

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Interior design, BA)				
Programme 2 (Interior design, MA)				

#### 4. Providing Teaching Resources

Human, material, information and financial resources of educational programme/educational programmes grouped in a cluster ensure the sustainable, stable, efficient and effective functioning of the programme and the achievement of the defined objectives.

#### 4.1 Human Resources

- ➤ Programme staff consists of qualified persons who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes.
- ➤ The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability.
- ➤ The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programme. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation.
- ➤ Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff with relevant competence.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The academic staff of the BA program is well selected and balanced.

The actual capacity of MA supervisions within the team is questionable.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Interior Design BA)

Programme staff consists of qualified persons who have necessary competences. Their number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff may be said to ensure the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability. Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff with relevant competence.

The Head of the program is characterized by a profound academic background and extensive experience, as manifested by the exceptional quality of his contributions and performance.

Programme 1 (Interior Design BA) <sup>8</sup>							
Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Programme	Including the staff with sectoral expertise <sup>9</sup>	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction <sup>10</sup>	the affiliated			
Total number of academic staff	20		19	7			
- Professor	1		1	1			
- Associate Professor	5		5	5			
- Assistant-Professor	1		1	1			
- Assistant							
Invited Staff	12		11	_			
Scientific Staff	1		1	_			

# Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Interior Design MA)

The academic staff involved in the cluster, in addition to the documentary qualifications in the field, have high awareness in the society and it should be considered that their contribution to the creation and development of successful products of the country is significant and frequent. Thus, their real work is very noteworthy and their experience should be taken into account. On the other hand, it is worth noting that there is an insufficient number of thesis advisors for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

Master's thesis. There is a need to augment the roster of affiliated professors specializing in interior design who can supervise these theses.

Programme 2 (Interior Design MA) <sup>11</sup>						
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction <sup>12</sup>	Among them, the affiliated academic staff			
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	2					
- Professor	1	1	1			
- Associate Professor	3	2	3			
- Assistant-Professor						
Invited Staff	18	4	_			
Scientific Staff			_			

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Site visit and the observation of the facilities
- o List of staff implementing the educational bachelor's program in Interior Design

#### General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

### General suggestions of the cluster:

It is desirable to increase and rejuvenate the specific teaching staff for the Bachelor's and Master's degree programmes in Interior Design, especially for professorships in the field of Interior Design (see Standard 4.5).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Theses supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

Recommendations and			mmes:	
See general recommend	lations and sugges	tions		
Programme 1 Interior I	Design (Bachelor's	program)		
Recommendation(s): —				
Suggestion(s): —				
Programme 2 Interior I	Design (Master's P	rogram)		
Recommendation(s): —				
Suggestion(s): —				
	pliance of the prog	grammes with the	e component	
	pliance of the prog	•	component Partially	Does not
lease, evaluate the comp		Substantially complies with	Partially complies with	comply with
Please, evaluate the comp Component 4.1 Human resources	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	
Component 4.1 Human resources  Programme 1 (Interior design, BA)	Complies with	Substantially complies with	Partially complies with	comply with
Human resources  Programme 1 (Interior design, BA) Programme 2	Complies with	Substantially complies with	Partially complies with	comply with
Component 4.1 Human resources  Programme 1 (Interior design, BA)	Complies with	Substantially complies with	Partially complies with	comply with

#### 4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students

Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of research.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Faculty are qualified to deliver cluster programs to produce learning outcomes. The head of the program and the implementing academic staff are selected according to their knowledge, experience and qualifications, in a competitive manner. They have the necessary competence to produce the results envisaged by the program, an academic degree relevant to the program profile,

teaching and research experience, which is confirmed in the CV they present. The head of the programs grouped in the cluster have recognition in professional circles, on the basis of which he is actively involved in providing the graduates of the programs with professional employment.

The number and workload of academic/scientific and visiting staff implementing the programmes ensures the implementation of the educational process defined by the educational programme, as well as the regular performance of scientific research, creative and performing activities and other functions assigned to them. The implementation of the programme can only be ensured with substantial support from visiting staff.

The staff responsible for supervising Master's theses should take into account the evolving trends in AI-related plagiarism issues. Further development and support for AI-driven anti-plagiarism methodologies are warranted.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Site visit and the observation of the facilities
- List of staff implementing the educational master's program Interior Design

#### General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

#### General suggestions of the cluster:

It is suggested that staff responsible for supervising Master's theses keep abreast of evolving trends in AI-related plagiarism issues.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:
See general recommendations and suggestions
Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)
Recommendation(s): —

Suggestion(s): —		

#### **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.2	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
Qualification of	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with
supervisors of master's		requirements	requirements	requirements
and doctoral students				
Programme 1				
(Interior design, BA)				
Programme 2				
(Interior design, MA)				

#### 4.3 Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff

- ➤ The HEI conducts the evaluation of programme staff and analyses evaluation results on a regular basis.
- ➤ The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The empirical findings from the conducted interviews have demonstrated a prevailing deficiency in the allocation of resources towards continuous professional development among educators. Such a commitment to perpetual learning empowers teachers to refine and expand their pedagogical methodologies, thus enhancing their efficacy within the classroom setting. The domain of education, particularly in this context, remains inherently dynamic, characterized by the consistent emergence of new research findings and instructional practices. Sustained engagement in professional development serves as a mechanism by which educators can remain abreast of the evolving educational landscape and adapt to the ever-changing pedagogical trends. Informed and proficient teachers typically exert a positive influence on student performance, thereby cultivating a more conducive and productive learning environment. Furthermore, it is essential to recognize the need for financial support to facilitate the publication of articles in high-impact factor journals, which can significantly contribute to the dissemination of cutting-edge research and best practices in the field. The provision of opportunities for professional

development not only elevates teacher morale but also augments job satisfaction, as educators perceive themselves as supported and empowered to excel in their instructional roles.

Greater involvement of academic staff in international scientific conferences will enhance scientific research activities, leading to the enrichment of contemporary topics in educational programs.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- o Results of the interview.
- Site visit and the observation of the facilities

#### General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

#### General suggestions of the cluster:

It is suggested to improve professional development opportunities for teachers. They should feel supported and empowered by the university to excel in their role as teachers.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): See general recommendations and suggestions
Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —

#### **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.3 Professional	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with	Partially complies with	Does not comply with
development of		requirements	requirements	requirements
academic, scientific				
and invited staff				
Programme 1				
(Interior Design,				
Bachelors)				
Programme 2				
(Interior Design,				
Master)				

#### 4.4. Material Resources

Programme is provided with necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

During the visit, it was determined that the computer equipment was outdated and needed to be updated. hardware capacities are largely below the software minimum requirements (e.g. 2 GB RAM for a 16GB-RAM demanding Adobe package), there are not enough screens (100% adobe RGB) or projectors for working in the mentioned programmes. According to the students, the computer pool should also be better differentiated to cover both PC and Apple demands and specifics. It is imperative to consider upgrading the video cards, with a preference for those possessing a minimum of 3000 CUDA cores.

In order to optimize collaborative efforts, students necessitate a communal workspace, the establishment of which is poised to significantly enhance their scholarly pursuits and academic achievements.

It should be noted that students and academic staff have access to the electronic resource of the TSSA library, where the academy currently has access to the following databases: 1. Elsevier - Scopus (https://www.scopus.com/home.uri) 2. Elsevier - ScienceDirect (https://www.sciencedirect.com/) 3. Education Resources Information Center (https://eric.ed.gov/) 4. Social Science Research Network (https://www.ssrn.com/index.cfm/en/) 5. Bielefeld Academic

Search Engine (https://www.base-search.net/) 6. Jstor (https://www.jstor.org/) 7. EIFL (https://eifl.remotexs.xyz/ user/login) (Note: We do not have a separate contract with this database, unlimited access is provided by the contract between us and the consortium of the integrated network of libraries, within the framework of which the consortium gives us access to everything that is provided for higher education, within the scope of the consortium's capabilities). 8. JURN (http://www.jurn.org) 9. Academic Research Sharing Platform ACADEMIA (https://www.academia.edu/) 10. Perlego (www.perlego.com) An agreement has been signed with all these organizations for all employees of TSS Academy, as well as for students of all levels, ELSEVIER databases can be accessed both from the organization and from any place outside the organization. Academy representatives can access the databases remotely through their institutional e-mail, for this each user specifies the institutional e-mail with which the Elsevier account was created and a link to access the databases is sent to the e-mail.

During the site visit experts visited the facilities at the Academy. Some of the classrooms are recently renovated. The academy owns different studios that are accessible for both students and faculty members of this program.

Due to the renovation in the building the library is being operated in a small room, the majority of the resources are in the boxes ready to be shelved. At the given moment there is no space for students neither for individual nor for group working at the library. Students can use the library for only borrowing the books and getting some consultation from the staff members. The expert team recommends that the academy prioritize the library renovation/reconstruction and create space for students to work in the library reading-halls; this is crucially important for quality teaching and learning.

The library has access to academic databases. There is a remote access to the databases, as per library staff highlighted. The library staff is actively engaged with providing sufficient service to staff and students, the user guides and manuals are accessible via the university web-page. The expert panel double checked the student's awareness about the databases and library services. During the interviews students mention that they have information and some of them even attended an information session about the usage of databases, but the majority mentioned that they use it rarely, as there is no such need for their research projects.

The expert panel tried to identify what was the procedure of purchasing library resources and to what extent students were engaged in this. According to the procedures academic staff are the people who initiate the process and after getting confirmation from the faculty administration the library is purchasing resources.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Site visit and the observation of the facilities
- Web-page of the Academy

#### General recommendations of the cluster:

It is recommended that the expansion of the Faculty's digital equipment with hardware and software be increased in proportion to the number of students at the Faculty. Students should be provided with the most modern working environment possible for CAAD (Computer Aided Architectural Design) and visualisation programs, particularly with regard to the development possibilities in augmented and virtual reality applications.

It is recommended that the academy prioritize the library renovation/reconstruction and create space for students to work in the library reading-halls, this is crucially important for quality teaching and learning.

## General suggestions of the cluster:

No suggestions on this item

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: See general recommendations and suggestions
Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —

#### **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.4	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
Material resources	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with
		requirements	requirements	requirements
Programme 1				
(Interior Design,				<u>—</u>
Bachelors)				
Programme 2				
(Interior Design,				
Master)				

#### 4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the programme needs.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The budget of the Interior Design Cluster for BA and MA is determined by the higher education institution or faculty. The allocation of funds for the programme from the budget is financially feasible but very tight. In order to be able to continue the programmes in the long term and sustainably, the financial resources need to be increased. These should be invested in the general increase and rejuvenation of teaching staff, but also in the continuation of the maintenance of the digital hardware and software infrastructure and analogue workshops.

It should be noted that the Master's programme is currently not budgeted to cover costs and is therefore supported by the Bachelor's programme (-12067 MA to + 35128.5 BA).

The budgets contain information on the permanent sources of funding in the budgets of the study programmes; any one-off sources of funding that benefit the educational programmes are not listed.

The amounts budgeted under learning materials are very modest, as are the budgeted funds for field practice, external lectures are low or non-existent. Costs for the purchase of books and accompanying literature are not budgeted. During the visit and tour of the buildings of the Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art, Faculty of Architecture, there are no workshops with technical equipment for wood or metalworking for model or prototype construction for the Interior Design programmes.

The allocation of financial resources, which are provided for in the budget of the degree programmes, is feasible with restrictions and can only just cover the needs of the degree programme.

#### **Description and Analysis - Programme 1** (Interior Design BA)

The faculty's expenditure, in particular the indirect expenditure for the Bachelor's programme (specialists/technicians, office, cleaning, security and other expenditure) is covered by the Academy of Art's budget, but is not included in the programme's budget. Expenditure on learning materials, consumables and tools is very tightly budgeted. The costs for excursions, external lectures etc. are available to a certain extent. Purchases of books and programme-specific literature are budgeted at zero.

It should also be mentioned that teaching in the degree programme is carried out to a greater extent by visiting teachers/staff (58%) than by the academic staff of the programme (42%).

### Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Interior Design MA)

In contrast to the BA programme, no expenditure is budgeted for learning materials, consumables or tools in the Interior Design MA programme. There is no budget for excursions, external lectures, etc. Purchases of books and programme-specific literature are budgeted at zero.

As in the BA programme, teaching in the Master's in Interior Design is provided to a greater extent by visiting teachers/staff (67%) than by the academic staff of the programme (33%).

The Master's programme is currently not budgeted to cover costs and is therefore supported by the Bachelor's programme (-12067 MA to + 35128.5 BA).

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Site visit and the observation of the facilities
- Budget 2022 Interior Design (Bachelor`s Program)
- Budget 2022 Interior Design (Master's Program)
- List of staff implementing the educational master's program Interior Design
- List of staff implementing the educational bachelor's program in Interior Design

#### General recommendations of the cluster:

It is recommended to increase the budget for specific teaching staff (academic staff of the degree programme) for the Bachelor's and Master's degree programme in Interior Design;

this applies to professorship degree programme (cf. 4.1).		Interior Design,	especially for the	e Master's
General suggestions of the c	luster:			
The Faculty's financial reprogrammes should be impresented as excursions, external lecture	roved, in particı	ılar for learning ı		•
Recommendations and Sugg See general recommendation			mes:	
Programme 1 Interior Design	gn (Bachelor's p	rogram)		
Recommendation(s): —				
Suggestion(s): —				
Programme 2 Interior Desig	gn (Master's pro	gram)		
Recommendation(s): —				
Suggestion(s): —				
Evaluation				
Please, evaluate the complian	ace of the progra	ammes with this s	standard compone	ent
Component 4.5 Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Interior Design, Bachelors)				

Programme 2

(Interior Design, Master)

#### Compliance of the programmes with the standards

4. Providing Teaching Resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Interior Design, Bachelors)				
Programme 2 (Interior Design, Master)				

#### 5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development.

#### 5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation

Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance department(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of programme quality assurance, developing assessment instruments, and implementing assessment process. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

During the site visit it was determined that there is a central Quality Assurance Office as well as one on the level of faculty. The major decisions regarding the QA mechanism are done with close collaboration of both units. On the faculty level the QA representative is responsible for the communication and data collections, while the analyses are done on the central level.

According to the submitted document, the Quality Assurance Office has responsibility for conducting assessments for academic staff and University administrative services. This Office also arranges for questionnaires to be sent to employers and alumni. During the interviews with students, employers and academic staff, it was confirmed that they are actively involved in this

process by filling out the survey forms and providing feedback to the Academy. The collected data are analyzed by the Quality Assurance Office and further steps are then planned. The expert team was therefore satisfied that all staff participate in self-assessments and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.

The Academy gives priority for the quality issues and the program undertakes to develop the culture and practices applicable for efficient quality assurance and management. This area of assessment focuses on policies, organization and quality assurance of teaching, learning, assessment and research. The mission is to achieve on each program level the goals of excellence, transparency and efficiency. Quality assurance is based on internal and external quality assurance as explanatory self-assessment processes. The standard approaches of internal quality assurance are used in case of the educational programs given in this cluster. In particular, the mentioned process works like - 'Plan, Do, Check, Act' cycle. This process includes both staff evaluations and analysis of student survey forms.

The programs' Self-Evaluation teams include both academic and administrative staff at the faculty level and from different structural units providing university services. The expert team had the opportunity to meet the staff involved in the self-evaluation process, as a result of which it was identified that they actively participate in the process of program implementation and development, the roles are distributed according to their competencies.

During the interviews with the QA representatives, it was determined that, besides managing the evaluation processes, they are responsible for program design and for providing support in course syllabus development, design of the assessment methods within the courses, and monitoring the academic achievements of the students within the course. The academic staff confirmed that the support they get from the QA team is oriented on their professional development. The expert team was satisfied that the quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.

The institution has developed recommendations for the Emergency Remote Teaching/Online Learning and it was communicated to academic staff as well as to students.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report
- Questionnaires/surveys of students, graduates, teachers, employers developed by the Quality Service;
- Analysis of the results of the survey and responses
- Statistical data related to the educational programs grouped in the cluster (student profiles, student progress, status suspension and termination rate, student satisfaction with their program, information on the career development of graduates, etc.)
- Analysis of the results of internal and external evaluation of quality assurance according to the data of the 2022-2023 academic year.

- o Interviews with the students, alumni, employers, university administrative and academic staff and QA
- o Website of the Tbilisi State Academy of Art http://www.art.edu.ge

General recommendations of the cluster:
No recommendation on this item
General suggestions of the cluster:
No suggestions on this item
Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):
See general recommendations and suggestions

Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)

Recommendation(s): —

Suggestion(s): —

Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)

Recommendation(s): —

Suggestion(s): —

#### **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.1	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
Internal Quality	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with
Evaluation		requirements	requirements	requirements

Programme 1 (Interior Design,			
Bachelors)			
Programme 2 (Interior Design, Masters)			
5.2 Fyternal Ouality Fyalua	ution		

Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

As it was identified during the interviews with the QA staff as well as with university senior management, the university is working in two major dimensions when it comes to external quality evaluation of the programs given in the cluster. The first is the recommendations the programs are given during the program and institutional accreditation process and second is the external reviewers included in the assessment process.

The programs given in the cluster were previously accredited in 2011-2012. Since then due to the change in the National Qualification Framework and the Study Field Classifier all of the programs were modified, with their goals and learning outcomes in order to meet the requirements of the current legislation. It is worth mentioning that the academic staff of those two programs are involved in the working group that are working on sectoral benchmarks. As stated during the interviews, it allows them to share current tendencies with local staff from different institutions and at the same time get some information regarding the international practices.

As for the external collegial evaluation, the programs given in the cluster were sent for assessment to the International Design School under the Georgian State Technical University. As seen from the evaluation reports, the assessment is mostly positive and does not highlight any recommendations or suggestions. In addition to this, due to the legal status of the academy, it goes through an audit by the Ministry of Culture of Georgia each year. The Audit covers both financial and content wise aspects.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report of the Arts Program Cluster
- External Evaluation Report by Georgian State University of Technology
- Interviews with academic and administrative staff
- Academy's Web-page

F				
General recommendati				
No recommendation on this item				
General suggestions of	the cluster:			
No suggestions on this				
F				
Recommendations and			immes (if any):	
See general recommen	dations and sugges	stions		
Programme 1 Interior	Docian (Bacholor's	program)		
r rogramme r interior	Design (Bacheloi s	program)		
Recommendation(s): —	_			
Suggestion(s): —				
buggestion(s).				
Programme 2 Interior	Design (Master's P	rogram)		
Recommendation(s): —	_			
Suggestion(s): —				
Evaluation				
Please, evaluate the com	pliance of the prog	grammes with thi	s standard compo	nent
Component 5.2	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
External Quality	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with
Evaluation	104411011101110	requirements	requirements	requirements
Programme 1		• 🗆	· 🗆	· 🗆
(Interior Design,				
Bachelors)				
Programme 2				
(Interior Design,				
Master)				

#### 5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review

Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematic data collection, study and analysis. Evaluation results are applied for the programme improvement.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

# Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

During the site visit the expert team met with the different stakeholders (Academic and invited staff, and employers and graduates) and confirmed that they are involved in program monitoring and that periodic review is conducted through systematically collecting and analyzing information. The document 'Procedure for applying quality assessment results and Report on use of quality results' sets out clearly, the methods and mechanisms for gathering and collating data and trend analysis, and the role and responsibilities of the Faculty Quality Assurance Service and Faculty Council in the QA process. The document provides a number of examples of issues arising from surveys that have been addressed.

The expert team was able to read the outcome of the Master student's evaluation of the implementation of the scientific-research component, as well as scientific supervision. The expert team were reassured to see evidence of a sample recommendation being identified, followed through, and resolved, as a result of this survey, regarding the practical component enhancement in the given program. This was discussed in the meeting with the Head of the program, QA office representatives and students.

In the two meetings with students the expert team were able to discuss the evaluation process that takes place at the end of each academic year through questionnaires and surveys, and it was clear that the students are engaged in this compulsory process. The BA and MA students were able to give an example of modifications made to their training as a direct consequence of their answers, and they were confident to use the process to comment on the performance of a professor, in order for the professor to moderate their teaching in some way. The students also spoke about the role of round table discussions in informally sharing experience of the study program, and students are represented on the Faculty Council. The expert team are therefore content that the complex indicators of results of monitoring and program evaluation, the program efficiency is assessed and if necessary, the program is modified and improved.

During the interviews it was identified that the head of the program as well as the academic staff are actively trying to find similar programs outside of the country and compare the content as well as the aims and objectives. As it was explained, although there are some HEIs in Georgia offering similar programs, they focus mostly on architecture rather than design. While the programs given in the cluster are oriented on interior design mostly.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

Self-Evaluation Report

General recommendations of the cluster:

No recommendation on this item

General suggestions of the cluster:

No suggestions on this item

- Questionnaires/surveys of students, graduates, teachers, employers developed by the Quality Service;
- Analysis of the results of the survey and responses
- Statistical data related to the educational programs grouped in the cluster (student profiles, student progress, status suspension and termination rate, student satisfaction with their program, information on the career development of graduates, etc.)
- Analysis of the results of internal and external evaluation of quality assurance according to the data of the 2022-2023 academic year.
- Interviews with the students, alumni, employers, university administrative and academic staff and QA
- o Website of the Tbilisi State Academy of Art http://www.art.edu.ge

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):
See general recommendations and suggestions
Programme 1 Interior Design (Bachelor's program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —
Programme 2 Interior Design (Master's Program)
Recommendation(s): —
Suggestion(s): —

#### **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.3.	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not
Programme	requirements	complies with	complies with	comply with
Monitoring and		requirements	requirements	requirements
Periodic Review				
Programme 1				
(Interior Design,				
Bachelors)				
Programme 2				
(Interior Design,				
Master)				

# Compliance of the programmes with the standards

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Interior Design, Bachelors)				
Programme 2 (Interior Design, Master)				

Attached documentation (if applicable): — Name of the higher education institution:

LEPL Apolon Kutateladze Tbilisi State Academy of Art

Name of Higher Educational Programmes, Levels: Bachelor's programme Interior Design Master's programme Interior Design

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

	1. Educational	2.	3. Student	4. Providing	5. Teaching
Contents	Programme	Methodology	Achievements,	Teaching	Quality
	Objectives,	and	Individual	Resources	Enhancement
	Learning	Organisation	Work with		Opportunities
	Outcomes and	of Teaching,	them		
	their	Adequacy			
Standard	Compliance	Evaluation of			
	with the	Programme			
	Programme	Mastering			
Programme 1			Substantially	Substantially	
(Interior Design	Complies with	Complies with	complies with	complies with	Complies with
BA)	requirements	requirements	requirements	requirements	requirements
Programme 2			Substantially	Substantially	
(Interior Design	Complies with	Complies with	complies with	complies with	Complies with
MA)	requirements	requirements	requirements	requirements	requirements

# **Signatures**

Chair of Accreditation Experts Panel

Wenger/Andreas

Basel Academy of Art and Design FHNW, ICDP Interior Architecture and Scenography,

Switzerland

Of the member(s) of the Accreditation Experts Panel

Kiknavelidze, Lela

Akaki Tsereteli State University, GeorgiaFull name, signature

# Nikuradze, Giorgi

Business and Technology University, GeorgiaFull name, signature

Khositashvili, Giga

Ilia State University, Georgia

Gazrdeliani, Soso

Caucasus's International University, Georgia