Report of Accreditation Expert Group Report on Cluster of Higher Education Programmes

Cluster of Educational Programmes
Bachelor's Program
0214.1.1 Glass Arts
0214.1.2 Ceramic Arts
0214.1.3 Jewellery and Metal processing Art
0214.1.4 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood

Master's Program
0214.1.1 Glass Arts
0214.1.2 Ceramic Arts
0214.1.3 Jewellery and Metal processing Art
0214.1.4 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood

LEPL - Apollon Kutateladze State Academy of Arts

Evaluation date: 13.-15.09.2023.

Report Submission Date: 19.12.2023.

Tbilisi

Contents

Information on the Higher educational Institution

Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form	LEPL - Apollon Kutateladze State Academy of Arts
Identification Code of Institution	203851545
Type of the Institution	University

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Arvids Endzins, Art Academy of Latvia, Latvia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Leila Grigolia (field expert) Ilia State University
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Ana Japaridze (employer expert) Ilia State University
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Tsotne Ghughunishvili (student expert) Tbilisi State University
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Tinatin Gabrichidze, New Vision University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	

I. Information on the Cluster of Educational Programmes

	Programme 1	Programme 2	Programme 3	Programme 4	Programme 5	Programme 6	Programme 7	Programme 8
Name of the educational programme	Glass Arts, BA	Glass Arts, MA	Ceramic Arts, BA	Ceramic Arts, MA	Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA	Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA
Level of higher education	Bachelor's Degree	Master's Degree	Bachelor's Degree	Bachelor's Degree	Bachelor's Degree	Bachelor's Degree	Bachelor's Degree	Bachelor's Degree
Qualification to be awarded	Bachelor of Fine Arts in Glass Arts	Master of Fine Arts in Glass Arts	Bachelor of Fine Arts in Ceramic Arts	Master of Fine Arts in Ceramic Arts	Bachelor of Fine Arts in Jewellery Arts	Master of Fine Arts in Jewellery Arts	Bachelor of Fine Arts in Artistic Woodworking	Master of Fine Arts in Artistic Woodworking
Name and code of the detailed field	0214.1.1 Glass Arts	0214.1.1 Glass Arts	0214.1.2 Ceramic Arts	0214.1.2 Ceramic Arts	0214.1.3 Jewellery Arts	0214.1.3 Jewellery Arts	0214.1.4 Artistic Woodworking	0214.1.4 Artistic Woodworking
Indication of the right to provide teaching of subject/subjects/group of subjects of the relevant level of general education[1]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Language of instruction	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian
Number of ECTS credits	240	125	240	125	240	125	240	125
Programme Status (Accredited/Non-accredited/Conditionally Accredited/New/International Accreditation) Indicating Relevant Decision (number, date)	Accredited 21.10. 2011 N 154	Accredited 09.08.2012 N 321	Accredited 21.10. 2011 N 154	Accredited 09.08.2012 N 318	Accredited 21.10. 2011 N 157	Accredited 09.08.2012 N 318	Accredited 21.10. 2011 N 155	Accredited 09.08.2012 N 314

---

[1] In case of Integrated Bachelor's-Master's Teacher Training Educational Programme and Teacher Training Educational Programme

II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary

- **General Information on the Cluster of Education Programmes[2]**

The cluster of 8 programmes (BA and MA programmes in Glass Arts, Ceramic Arts, Jewellery and Metal Processing Art, Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood). The accreditation team was familiarized with the self-evaluation report and the attached documentation. Based on this, the accreditation team conducted an online meeting on September 8. Some additional documentation was requested and received from HEI. The team was familiarized with the general conclusions of previous accreditation, which was held in 2011 for BA programmes and in 2012 for MA.

- **Overview of the Accreditation Site Visit**

The accreditation site visit took place from September 13 until September 15 at Apollon Kutetladze State Academy of Arts. Before the site visit, expert group met two times using the electronic distance communcation tools to discuss the preliminary findings based on the review of the self-evaluation report and relevant annexes, as well as discuss the process of the visit.
During this time meetings and interviews with representatives from the administration, self–evaluation team, the heads of all evaluated programmes, academic staff and invited lecturers were conducted. The accreditation team got acquainted with visual materials of BA and MA diploma works. Interviews were held with representatives of employers, graduates, students and the quality assurance office. The accreditation team visited workshops of all programmes and the library of the academy. All the interviews were conducted independently with each group. The visit was conducted in a constructive environment, the representatives of the academy were cooperative and open to discussions and suggestions. The requested additional documentation was provided by the institution in a timely manner.

- **Brief Overview of Education Programme Compliance with the Standards**

The assessment of the state of the eight education programmes was overall positive. All programmes are substantially compliant with: 1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme; 2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering; 3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them. 4. Providing Teaching Resources. 5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

- **Recommendations**

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme;

---

[2] When providing general information related to the programme, it is appropriate to also present the quantitative data analysis of the educational programme.

1.1. Recommendations:

The General recommendations of the cluster: to pursue an interdisciplinary approach that fosters students' ability to work collaboratively and makes rational use of teaching resources. To achieve the overall objectives, it is necessary to expand international student exchanges as well as faculty staff mobility.

Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)

As glass design is integrated into the Faculty of Design, interdisciplinarity could be more integrated into the study content. Glass in interior, architecture, the practical use and function of glass as a material.

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

We recommend increasing the focus on research-led design, so that those who have not studied at undergraduate level can direct their studies towards materials research. To include participation in international competitions, fairs and other activities in the curriculum.

Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)

Despite a strong tradition at technological level, there is a clear need to increase the share of new technologies in the early stages of project development and throughout.

Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)

To increase the emphasis on research and work on presentation techniques

Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)

Place more emphasis on design principles such as sustainability, functionality and addressing global issues faced in the furniture industry

Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)

Place more emphasis on design principles such as sustainability, functionality and addressing global issues faced in the furniture industry. To increase the emphasis on research

1.2. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster: To improve foreign language skills and develop the technical base by incorporating latest technology used in the field.

Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)

Improve foreign language skills and develop the technical base by incorporating latest technology used in the field.

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

Improve foreign language skills and develop the technical base by incorporating latest technology used in the field.

Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)

To continue improving the technical base

Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)

To continue improving the technical base

Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)

To develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field. Expand the facilities to enable relevant study process

Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)

To develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field. Expand the facilities to enable relevant study process

Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)

To develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field.

Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)

To develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field.

1.3. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster: Develop individual plans for programme learning outcomes assessment, identify concrete direct and indirect methods of assessing programme learning outcomes, with respective benchmarks and finalize assessment.

Review the curriculum maps of the programmes grouped in a cluster to ensure that all of the programme learning outcomes are developed on three levels and the level of attainment of the learning outcomes increases logically.

1.4. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster: The total number of credits is distributed according to the priorities of the sector and the objectives of the programme, but the content should be adapted in response to the need to include more modern technologies, presentation methods and specialised foreign language skills.

1.5. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster:
1. To add syllabi for new foreign publication books of the main field subject.
2. The practical side should be strengthened and specified in the educational programmes.
3. Workshops of educational programmes that are grouped in a cluster need to be equipped with more modern materials.

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering;

2.2. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster: Students should receive information about workshops, creative projects, and intra-University creative activities through faculty email.

Sign detailed memorandums of mutual commitment for students to do internships with internship sites and employers.

Conduct alumni surveys regularly to analyze results to improve the program.

2.3. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster: to support and find financial opportunities to promote mobility among teachers and more opportunities to invite guest lecturers to complement the range of methods used. It would be advisable to provide digital screens in the studios / workshops so that teachers could present lecture content in a modern and easily comprehensible form for the students

2.4. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster:

1.   In the part of the final assessment, the student's development should be analyze in parallel with the assessment of the students work, which will positively affect the results.
2.   During the interview with the students, we found out that after the evaluations, they are not given a detailed explanation of what they failed in.
    3.   Also, during the interview with the students, we found out that the appeal process related to the score is unclear.

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them

3.1. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster:

1. Since cluster programs are primarily practical courses, students need to have
access to the appropriate quality and quantity of tools and inventory that should be provided by
the academy.

2. The Academy should cover the costs of the computer programs that are necessary for students. Students have bare possibility to diversify their learning process because they have limited resources to experiment. For this reason, these resources are used only for the projects of great importance, such as bachelor's or master's final project, etc.

3. Due to the fact that only a minimal number of students participate in international (exchange programs) and local projects (Shota Rustaveli National Science Foundation of Georgia and others), it is necessary for the Academy to further encourage students and raise their level of awareness in order to increase the participation rate in such competitions.

4. The academy should ensure the development and implementation of a policy to support the rapid integration of foreign students. For example, it is possible to introduce "school of tutors" in the academy, the purpose of which is to promote the integration of students representing ethnic minorities and to strengthen a tolerant environment among young people. Both Georgian and international students are involved in this process, yet the academic staff should also be in charge.

3.2. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster:

1. It is important to actively involve professors of leading foreign universities in the learning process as a result of which new perspectives will be opened for the students of the Academy. In addition, proper attention should be paid to strengthening of the internationalization process and deepening of bilateral relations with international (partner) universities.

2. During the last 5 years, the involvement of students in conferences and grant competitions, which provide funding for their projects, is not recorded. The amount of interested students in exchange programs is also minimal. Therefore, it is necessary for the academy to encourage

students even more and raise the level of awareness in order to increase their participation in such Competitions.

4. Providing Teaching Resources
4.1. Recommendations
General recommendations of the cluster:

1. The educational programmes1,2,5,6,7 and 8 require renewal of both academic staff and invited teachers.
2. More involvement of students and invited teachers in international projects.
3. The workshops of programs grouped in a cluster should be provided with materials and tools in such a way that the student's educational process of the practical is not interrupted.

4.2. Recommendations
General recommendations of the cluster:

Supervisors of the master's program should be actively involved in international projects (exhibitions, biennials, workshops and ect.).

Supervisors of the master's program should ensure conducting the educational process with modern trends in teaching methods.

Supervisors of the master's program should select the appropriate research teaching method in the process of working on the master's thesis based on the specifics of the subject.

4.3. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster:
Conduct academic/innovative learning trainings for visiting/academic staff to facilitate program development.
Conduct regular staff surveys and analysis to assist in program development.
Send written information to visiting/academic staff about internal university news, activities and opportunities via the Academy email.

4.4. Recommendations
General recommendations of the cluster:
The books specified in the syllabi become available in the electronic database.
Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes:

Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA)

As a result of the site visit and interview, a malfunction of the main furnace was observed, which prevents the learning process from working properly. Students also expressed dissatisfaction with tools. Basic equipment and tools for practical work should be brought into the arrangement.

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

As a result of the site visit and interview, a malfunction of the main furnace was observed, which prevents the learning process from working properly. Students also expressed dissatisfaction with tools. Basic equipment and tools for practical work should be brought into the arrangement.

Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA)

During the visit to the workshop, we saw samples of the work done during the study period, which shows a long tradition and craftsmanship. Recommendation is to increase access to modern manuals/books needed for the program.

Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA)

During the visit to the workshop, we saw samples of the work done during the study period, which shows a long tradition and craftsmanship. Recommendation is to increase access to modern manuals/books needed for the program.

4.5. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster:

Detailed budgets should include a list of expenses separately for each program: how much was spent on licensed software, more detailed training expenses etc.

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities
5.1. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster:

Ensure establishment of the quality culture and involvement of the programme staff in the QA processes.

5.3. Recommendations

General recommendations of the cluster:

Increase involvement of internal and external stakeholders in the evaluation of the programmes and ensure the analysis of results on individual programme level.

1. Information about admittion statistics for the last period could be added. This could help to analyse tendencies, like how popular are the programmes among applicants. If competition is low for a certain programme, there are possibilities to react with planned public activities to rise the number of applicants and the artistic quality of the admitted students.
2. At SER there is missing information about analysis of students that have dropout from studies and the reasons for that. Conducting a survey could help to analyse and prevent some of the reasons in the future.
3. At SER there is information about elected teaching stuff (CV). To better understand the situation, there is missing information about activities, necessary for re-election for the next period. For instance, international mobility, seminars, courses, creative projects, participance at residencies, symposiums. Language of the studies is Georgian, but for international mobility and conducting courses and classes for incoming students (if any), there is a need to use foreign languages. Is there a mechanism of evaluation of those skills? Previous accreditation team had highlighted problems with the level of foreign language skills.
4. Mobility of students and teaching staff is very low. Administration has to find ways to establish sustainable financial base for supporting students and staff for creating international contacts and acquisition of knowledge.

5. Technical base at all programmes has to be updated and improved. At Glass and Metal programmes, current tools and equipment cannot satisfy full study process. Metal programme workshop has a very compact space, larger room would be beneficial for a safer and more productive work. Despite the fact that Academy is putting massive effort on restoration of main building, library etc., there is also a need to find financial resources to improve technical support, like up-to-date tools and machinery.
6. The academy, as a state institution, should provide all the necessary computer software for student's educational needs.

- **Suggestions for the Programme Development**

1.1. Suggestions

General suggestions of the cluster: to strengthen the design component across the programmes that are brought together in the cluster.

Suggestions according to the programmes:

Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)

Could strengthen interdisciplinarity with combinations of different materials and a focus on building strong international brands

1.2.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes:

Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)

To incorporate CNC machine work into study process

Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)

To incorporate CNC machine work into study process

1.3.

General suggestions of the cluster: Increase the level of awareness about the programme learning outcomes assessment in the programme staff.

2.4.

General suggestions of the cluster:

1. It would be relevant if the evaluation process would be more transparent for students.
2. It would be   relevant if students got timely feedback from their supervisors regarding the assessment.

4.2.

General suggestions of the cluster:

It would be relevant if supervisors discuss modern teaching methods with students and with their involvement, modern teaching methods will be introduc in the master's program.

5.2.

General suggestions of the cluster: Encourage more detailed and thorough external peer reviews for the programme development. The specially developed form for peer evaluations and communication of the expectations might be helpful.

5.3.

General suggestions of the cluster: In order to gain valuable insight into the programmes, further encourage and enhance focus groups, dialogues, discussions and round tables with and among stakeholders.

1. Regular updates of information and quality of visual materials for the website (English version) are required to attract more interest about the study opportunities.
2. Commision was acquainted with a visual presentation of BA and MA diploma works. The quality of presentations could be significantly improved, which could be helped with interdisciplinary

cooperation projects between different programs and other departments across the whole academy. (for example, photos, new media etc.)
3. Encourage students to set more ambitious goals on an international level.
4. Continue to develop the content of programs in collaboration with representatives of the market.

- **Information on Sharing or Not Sharing the Argumentative Position of the HEI**

Response of Accreditation Experts on Argumentative Position of Tbilisi State Academy of Art.

The panel of Accreditation Experts got acquainted with the argumentative position of the academy. We would like to express gratitude for preparation of Self Assesment Report, all additional documentation, organization of site visits, interviews and meetings with all involved groups of representatives from the administration, self–evaluation team, the heads of all programmes, academic staff and invited lecturers. The accreditation team got acquainted with visual materials of BA and MA diploma works. Interviews were held with representatives of employers, graduates, students and the quality assurance office. The accreditation team visited workshops of all programmes and the library of the academy. All of the interviews were conducted independently with each group. The visit was conducted in a constructive environment, the representatives of the academy were cooperative and open to discussions and suggestions.

During accreditation we felt responsive and productive cooperation between panel of experts and representatives of the academy.

The panel of experts appreciates argumentative position on the final draft of accreditation of programs. The greatest part of our assessment is based on the documents, that are included in SAR, but an important part of the final evaluation is formed during several interviews and meetings with participants of the involved groups and site visit and exploring workshops and technical equipment.

Some of our observations were based on the fact that all eight programs are included in the Design faculty at the same time those disciplines are categorized under applied art (handicraft) since 2022. Our suggestions were made taking in to account the tendencies in art and design education internationally where borders between applied art and design are disappearing. The panel of experts appreciates the effort to share our opinion to integrate more focus into several design aspects in all eight programs. The aim is to encourage to move focus from creating decorative artworks to creating items using mindset of design thinking, such as sustainability, customer orientation, social responsibility and working in cooperation with design industry etc.

Standard 3.1. (recommendation)
After more detailed familiarization with the provided documentation, we made corrections at the recommendation 5.

Standard 5.1. (recommendation)

The expert panel shares the position of the university that the working groups were participatory and would also like to stress and command the efforts of the QA service. The work carried out by the QA department, including the efforts in relation to involvement of the staff in the process and increasing of the quality culture at the institution is acknowledged and commended. However, the process is continuous and needs further improvement and the recommendation was issued based on the interview results. Therefore, the recommendation remains in place.

Standard 5.3. (recommendation)

The recommendation remains in place, as even though the individual learning programs' quality is evaluated based on the provided documents, the discussion and analysis of the results are on the faculty level, therefore, the expert panel believes that the analysis on the program level would be more helpful.

Experts are united in common vision, that accreditation process will help to improve quality of execution of all programs.

Evaluation approaches for the accreditation experts:

The components of the accreditation standards are evaluated using the following two approaches:

1. Cluster and individual evaluation[3]

---

[3] **Evaluation Approaches:** Describe, analyse, and evaluate the compliance of each educational programme grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the corresponding component of the standard. Also, you can specify information about an educational programme that is different from the common and basic characteristics of educational programmes grouped in the cluster.

2. Cluster evaluation[4]

Standard/Component	Assessment approaches:
1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	
1.1. Programme Objectives	Cluster and individual
1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster and individual
1.3. Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster
1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	Cluster and individual
1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Cluster and individual
2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering	
2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions	Cluster and individual
2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills	Cluster
2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods	Cluster
2.4. Student Evaluation	Cluster
3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	
3.1. Student Consulting and Support Services	Cluster
3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Cluster
4. Providing Teaching Resources	
4.1. Human Resources	Cluster and individual
4.2. Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students	Cluster and individual
4.3. Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff	Cluster
4.4. Material Resources	Cluster and individual
4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability	Cluster and individual

---

[4] **Assessment approaches: In case of necessity**, describe, analyse and evaluate compliance of each education programme in the cluster with the requirements of this component of the standard. Also, you can indicate the information on the education programme, distinguished from the general and major characteristics of the education programmes in a cluster.

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	
5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.2. External Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review	Cluster

III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the programme. The content and consistent structure of the programme ensure the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

Educational programmes grouped in a cluster are logically interrelated to each other in line with the study fields and evolve according to the respective levels of higher education.

1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level and an educational programme, and define the set of knowledge, skills and competences a programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the programme to the development of the field and society.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Apollon Kutateladze State Academy of Arts can be proud of having a long tradition of a diverse field of arts, crafts and design programmes. Among them are the eight programs from the Faculty of Design grouped in this cluster.

In the self assessment document, the programme objectives are stated clearly but could be further elaborated.

The overarching objective is to provide students with theoretical and practical

knowledge in applied art, equipping them with competencies aligned with the level of the educational program. This includes fostering creative thinking, professional, technical, technological, and artistic skills. Traditional art technologies and techniques are taught on a high level, taking into account the specificities of each field. The programs allow and encourage interdisciplinary approaches and are linked to the consumer market dictated by the labor market.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 / Glass Arts, BA

The aim of the programme is well defined. The programme is developing, and students are encouraged to take creative risks. The students would benefit from more clearly defined employability and professional practice skills and greater exposure to international practice.

The objectives are clear and correspond to the requirements of the field of study and the level of

education, the mission of the university, are based on the requirements of the field of study and

are logically related to its content and results; it corresponds to the requirements of the level of qualification descriptor of the qualifications framework and the content of the detailed field.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview results.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 / Glass Arts, MA

The objectives are generally clearly defined and accessible. The goals of the program clearly state what knowledge, skills and competencies the graduate should have. However, it might be advisable to include more international approaches and mobility in the curriculum to achieve the objectives. Accessible workshop equipment does not allow the level of knowledge and technical expertise required by the industry.

Evidences/Indicators

Evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview results.

Description and Analysis - Programme 3 / Ceramic Arts, BA

The programme aims are well defined, clear, and publicly available. The students would benefit from more clearly defined employability and professional practice skills and greater exposure to international practice. As Ceramics Arts is integrated into the Faculty of Design, interdisciplinarity could be more integrated into the study content as well as implementation of design research methodology.

Evidences/Indicators

Evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview results.

Description and Analysis - Programme 4 / Ceramic Arts, MA

The objectives are generally clearly defined and accessible. The goals of the program clearly state what knowledge, skills and competencies the graduate should have. However, it might be advisable to include more international approaches and mobility in the curriculum to achieve the objectives.

Evidences/Indicators

Evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview results.

Description and Analysis - Programme 5 / Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA

The objectives are generally clearly defined and accessible. The goals of the program clearly state what knowledge, skills and competencies the graduate should have. Despite a very strong emphasis on learning traditional techniques, it is necessary to incorporate current trends and developments in jewellery field to help achieve the set objectives.
The working environment and the range of instruments do not allow the objectives to be fully achieved.

Evidences/Indicators

Evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview results.

Description and Analysis - Programme 6 / Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA

The objectives are generally clearly defined and accessible. The goals of the program clearly state what knowledge, skills and competencies the graduate should have. Despite a very strong emphasis on learning traditional techniques, it is necessary to incorporate current trends and developments in jewellery field to help achieve the set objectives.
In recent years, there has been an increase in practical lectures, but research is a very important component of the Master's programme and it would be advisable to expand it much further.
The working environment and the range of instruments do not allow the objectives to be fully achieved.

Evidences/Indicators

Evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview results.

Description and Analysis - Programme 7 / Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA

The objectives are generally clearly defined and accessible. The goals of the program clearly state what knowledge, skills and competencies the graduate should have. Despite a very strong emphasis on learning traditional techniques, it is necessary to incorporate current trends and developments in furniture design field to help achieve the set objectives.

Evidences/Indicators

Evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview results.

Description and Analysis - Programme 8 / Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA

The objectives are generally clearly defined and accessible. The goals of the program clearly state what knowledge, skills and competencies the graduate should have. Despite a very strong emphasis on learning traditional techniques, it is necessary to incorporate current trends and developments in furniture design field to help achieve the set objectives.

In order to fully achieve the set objectives, it would be advisable to include the participation of students and faculty members in current developments in the field. Such as exhibitions, fairs.

To include more international examples of good practice in design.

To improve knowledge in the use of digital tools to ensure a complete design development cycle.

Evidences/Indicators

Evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview results.

Recommendations - should be considered by the HEI in order to comply the programme with the requirements of the standard

Suggestions - non-binding advice for the programme development

General recommendations of the cluster: to pursue an interdisciplinary approach that fosters students' ability to work collaboratively and makes rational use of teaching resources. To achieve the overall objectives, it is necessary to expand international student exchanges as well as faculty staff mobility.

General suggestions of the cluster: to strengthen the design component across the programmes that are brought together in the cluster.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)

Recommendation(s): As glass design is integrated into the Faculty of Design, interdisciplinarity could be more integrated into the study content. Glass in interior, architecture, the practical use and function of glass as a material.

Suggestion(s): None

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

Recommendation(s): we recommend increasing the focus on research-led design, so that those who have not studied at undergraduate level can direct their studies towards materials research. To include participation in international competitions, fairs and other activities in the curriculum.

   Suggestion(s): None

Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)

   Recommendation(s): None

   Suggestion(s): None

Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)

   Recommendation(s): None

   Suggestion(s): could strengthen interdisciplinarity with combinations of different materials and a focus on building strong international brands

Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)

   Recommendation(s): despite a strong tradition at the technological level, there is a clear need to increase the share of new technologies in the early stages of project development and throughout.

   Suggestion(s): None

Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)

   Recommendation(s): to increase the emphasis on research and work on presentation techniques

   Suggestion(s): None

Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)

   Recommendation(s): place more emphasis on design principles such as sustainability, functionality and addressing global issues faced in the furniture industry

   Suggestion(s): None

Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)

> **Recommendation(s): place** more emphasis on design principles such as sustainability, functionality and addressing global issues faced in the furniture industry. To increase the emphasis on research
>
> **Suggestion(s):** None

Evaluation [5]

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.1 - Programme Objectives	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies the requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes

---

[5] Evaluation is performed for each programme separately.

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

➢ The learning outcomes of the programme are logically related to the programme objectives and the specificity of the field of study.

➢ Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or sense of responsibility and autonomy which students gain upon completion of the programme.

The learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the programme. The content and consistent structure of the programme ensures the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

Educational programmes grouped in a cluster are logically interrelated to each other in line with the named fields of study and evolve according to the respective levels of higher education.

The stated outcomes are clearly defined, but a review of student and alumni work, as well as interviews with students and alumni, has shown that they are not fully in line with the stated objectives.

With reference to the recommendations of the previous accreditation commission on the level of practical use of English, there are still shortcomings. Improvement is needed in the teaching and application of presentation techniques both visually and conceptually.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 / Glass Arts, BA

The results are based on the principle of logical development according to the complexity and

content of the field of study. It provides an opportunity to continue studying at the Masters' level

of higher education.

The relationship between learning objectives and learning outcomes is well represented in the Self-Assessment Report. However, during the visit and interviews the lack of "Participation in international congresses and symposia to promote the field of artistic glass, with the ability to organize public presentations using new technologies, including in a foreign language." (mentioned in SER) came to attention. Existing technical solutions are outdated, and new technologies would be recommended to be incorporated in the study process to increase the quality of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

- o   Evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 / Glass Arts, MA

The results are based on the principle of logical development according to the complexity and

content of the field of study.

The relationship between learning objectives and learning outcomes is well represented in the Self-Assessment Report. However, during the visit and interviews the lack of "Participation in international congresses and symposia to promote the field of artistic glass, with the ability to organize public presentations using new technologies, including in a foreign language." (mentioned in SER) came to attention. Existing technical solutions are outdated, and new technologies would be recommended to be incorporated in the study process to increase the quality of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

o   The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme.

Description and Analysis - Programme 3 / Ceramic Arts, BA

The results are based on the principle of logical development according to the complexity and
content of the field of study. It provides an opportunity to continue studying at the Masters' level
of higher education.
The relationship between learning objectives and learning outcomes is well represented in the Self-Assessment Report. Existing technical solutions are outdated, and new technologies would be recommended to be incorporated in the study process to increase the quality of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme as well as site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 4 / Ceramic Arts, MA

The results are based on the principle of logical development according to the complexity and
content of the field of study.
The relationship between learning objectives and learning outcomes is well represented in the Self-Assessment Report. Existing technical solutions are outdated, and new technologies would be recommended to be incorporated in the study process to increase the quality of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme George Iashvili as well as site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 5 / Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA

The results are based on the principle of logical development according to the complexity and content of the field of study. It provides an opportunity to continue studying at the Masters' level of higher education.

The relationship between learning objectives and learning outcomes is well represented in the Self-Assessment Report.

The technical equipment and tools available for the programme only partially allow us to achieve the learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme as well as site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 6 / Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA

The results are based on the principle of logical development according to the complexity and content of the field of study.

The relationship between learning objectives and learning outcomes is well represented in the Self-Assessment Report.

The technical equipment and tools available for the programme only partially allow us to achieve the learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme as well as site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 7 / Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA

The results are based on the principle of logical development according to the complexity and content of the field of study. It provides an opportunity to continue studying at the Masters' level of higher education.

The relationship between learning objectives and learning outcomes is well represented in the Self-Assessment Report. Existing technical solutions are outdated, and new technologies would be recommended to incorporate in the study process to increase the quality of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme as well as site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 8 / Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA

The results are based on the principle of logical development according to the complexity and content of the field of study.

The relationship between learning objectives and learning outcomes is well represented in the Self-Assessment Report. Existing technical solutions are outdated, and new technologies would be recommended to incorporate in the study process to increase the quality of learning outcomes.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme as well as site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed suggestions that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)

    Recommendation(s): Improve foreign language skills and develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field.

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

Recommendation(s): Improve foreign language skills and develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field.

Suggestion(s): None

Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)

Recommendation(s): To continue improving the technical base

Suggestion(s): None

Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)

Recommendation(s): To continue improving the technical base

Suggestion(s): None

Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)

Recommendation(s): to develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field. Expand the facilities to enable relevant study process

Suggestion(s): None

Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)

Recommendation(s): to develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field. Expand the facilities to enable relevant study process

Suggestion(s): None

Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)

Recommendation(s): to develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field.

Suggestion(s): To incorporate CNC machine work into study process

Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)

Recommendation(s): to develop the technical base by incorporating the latest technology used in the field.

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes

➢ Evaluation mechanisms of the programme learning outcomes are defined. The programme learning outcomes assessment process consists of defining, collecting and analyzing data necessary to measure learning outcomes.
➢ Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Tbilisi State Academy of Arts has developed a programme learning outcomes assessment methodology, the programme learning outcomes assessment process is regulated by "Learning Outcomes Assessment, Mechanisms for Evaluating Academic Performance and Analysis of Results", approved by the academic council, minutes N43, 17.03.2022. According to the regulation, the direct methods of assessment include evaluation of the learning courses, as defined by the syllabus – midterm and final evaluation. The methodology also defines indirect methods of assessment such as, e.g., graduates' employment and/or self-employment rate, evaluation of graduates by the employers, the career development of the graduates, etc.

As for the benchmarks for the programme learning outcomes assessment, methodology also points to the necessity of developing the benchmarks for the evaluation. According to the methodology and interview results, the normal distribution of the student assessment is used for benchmarking.

For the programmes grouped in a cluster, curriculum maps are also developed and are an integral part of the programmes. The curriculum maps ensure the links between the programme learning outcomes and the components of the programmes, as well as identify the level of attainment of the programme learning outcomes, e.g. 1,2,3. However, the curriculum maps needs to be revised to make sure that every learning outcome is strengthened on all three levels and that the level of attainment of the learning outcomes increases logically from year to year:

Glass Arts BA programme – there are programme learning outcomes without courses intended for the introductory level of attainment (level 1) – learning outcome 8 and 9;
Glass Arts MA programme - learning outcome without courses for the introductory level (level 1) – learning outcome 4, 9; Without 1 and 2 level – learning outcomes 6 and 10;
Jewlery and Metal Processing Art BA programme – there are learning outcomes that have only third level of attainment linked to the programme components (learning outcome 7; learning outcome 8; learning outcome 9; learning outcome 10; learning outcome 11) and there are also learning outcomes without courses for the introductory level (level 1) – learning outcomes 3 and 6;
Jewlery and Metal Processing Art MA programme – there are learning outcomes that have only third level of attainment linked to the programme components (learning outcome 6; learning outcome 10) and there are also learning outcomes without courses for the introductory level (level 1) – learning outcomes 4; learning outcome 9; learning outcome 12.
The abovementioned applies for the **BA and MA programmes Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood**.

Also, as based on the methodology and interview results, it is evident that the concrete methods of direct evaluation are not defined for the programme learning outcomes and it is a continuous process of observing the student achievements. Even though it is good practice to evaluate the student achievements continuously, and the continuous effort of the institution is commended, some improvements to the programme learning outcomes assessment methodology can be identified.

Firstly, as mentioned, even though the student academic performance monitoring is carried out, it should be distinguished from evaluation of programme learning outcomes. As based on the standards' requirements and recommended methodology of the NCEQE, the programme learning outcomes evaluation should be carried out when a student finalizes achievement of the programme learning outcomes, the evaluation of the programme learning outcomes should happen when the student achieves learning outcomes based on the curriculum map, and the evaluation method should be chosen from that concrete course(s). Based on the specificities of the programmes grouped in a cluster, it is logical to evaluate programme learning outcomes within the creative project, practice, etc. The topic was addressed during the interview with the QA office and based on interviews, the programme learning

outcomes assessment with the projects and student work is carried out systematically, however, it should be further formalized and reflected in the methodology.

The accreditation package of the programmes grouped in a cluster did not include the programme learning outcomes assessment plan for the programmes with the inclusion of the benchmarks for evaluation and the abovementioned was requested additionally. The evaluation of the programme learning outcomes of the cluster's programmes has not been carried out yet and therefore, the results have not been used for the development of the programmes. Based on the current methodology of programme learning outcomes, the institution does not have indication of the concrete methods of assessment of programme learning outcomes, the periodicity of evaluation is early. Therefore, it can be said that the methods of assessment and periodicity of the process should be once again reevaluated, after updating the approaches and developing the programme learning outcomes' assessment map.

The interview results also revealed the low level of knowledge of the programme learning outcomes assessment within the academic staff of the programme. For establishing a methodology and practice that works for the continuous development of the programmes, it is vital to increase involvement of the programme staff in the process of defining programme learning outcomes assessment methods and their overall level of knowledge of the topic of programme learning outcomes assessment. This issue is closely related to the quality culture at the academy and will be addressed later in the report.

Evidences/Indicators

- o "Learning Outcomes Assessment, Mechanisms for Evaluating Academic Performance and Analysis of Results";
- o Self-evaluation report;
- o Interview results;
- o Indicators for programme learning outcomes' assessment;
- o Curriculum maps of the programmes grouped in a cluster;
- o Additionally requested and provided documents.

General recommendations of the cluster: Develop individual plans for programme learning outcomes assessment, identify concrete direct and indirect methods of assessing programme learning outcomes, with respective benchmarks and finalize assessment.

Review the curriculum maps of the programmes grouped in a cluster to ensure that all of the programme learning outcomes are developed on three levels and the level of attainment of the learning outcomes increases logically.

General suggestions of the cluster: Increase the level of awareness about the programme learning outcomes assessment in the programme staff.

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

1.4. Structure and Content of Educational Programme

➢ The programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes.

➢ The programme structure is consistent and logical. The content and structure ensure the achievement of the programme learning outcomes. The qualification to be awarded corresponds to the programme content and learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The programs on both levels (BA and MA) are drawn up using the methodology of planning, designing and development of educational programs operating at HEI. The structure of the programs is consistent and logical. Their content and structure ensure that the learning outcomes of the programme is achieved. The qualifications to be awarded are in accordance with the content of the programs and the learning outcomes.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 / Glass Arts, BA

Bachelor program is based on the ECTS system; It is student-centered and based on the student's academic workload required to achieve the goals of the educational program.

Qualification to be awarded: Bachelor of Fine Art in Glass

Requirements for awarding a bachelor's degree: In order to successfully complete the full bachelor's course and

receive a diploma confirming the completion of the educational program, the bachelor must meet the requirements stipulated by the educational program.

Teaching language: Georgian

Study duration: 4 years (8 semesters)

Program volume - 240 credits (ECTS), including:

● Specialty disciplines - 140 credits

● Basic disciplines - 18 credits

● University disciplines - 36 credits

● Optional disciplines - 46 credits

Volume of 1 credit - 25 hours.

One academic year - 2 semesters, credit volume - 60 (ECTS)

Depending on the student's individual workload, the number of credits per year may be less or more than 60

credits, but not more than 75 credits.

1 semester includes - a combination of academic weeks and a session period, of which classroom classes - 15

academic weeks

During 1 semester - one midterm exam.

After the end of the academic semester - final exam (for final exams - 2 weeks and for additional exams - 1 week)

On the basis of the SER and the programme stucture provided it is concluded that the amount of work in the speciality disciplines is sufficient in relation to Basic disciplines, University disciplines and Optional disciplines.

Evidences/Indicators

- o   The evaluation is based on SER, content and stucture of programmes and interview with the head of the programme.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 / Glass Arts, MA

The Master's Program is built on the basis of the ECTS system, is student-

centered, and is based on the student's academic workload, which is required to achieve the goals of the

educational program.

Qualification to be awarded: Master of Fine Art in Glass

Requirement for the award of a master's degree: upon successful completion of the master's course

In order to receive a diploma confirming the completion of the educational program, the master must meet the

requirements stipulated by the educational program.

Teaching language: Georgian

Study duration: 2 years (4 semesters)

Program size: - 125 credits (ECTS), including:

● Cycle of professional disciplines - 80 credits

● Cycle of visual arts disciplines - 10 credits

● University disciplines - 12

● Optional disciplines - 13 credits

● Cycle of digital technology disciplines - 10 credits

Volume of 1 credit - 25 hours.

One academic year - 2 semesters

Amount of credit - 60 (ECTS)

Depending on the student's individual workload, the number of credits per year may be less or more than 60 credits, but not more than 75 credits.

1 semester includes - a combination of study weeks and the session period, including 20 weeks, of which classroom studies - 15 study weeks

During 1 semester - one midterm exam.

After the end of the academic semester - final exam (for final exams - 2 weeks and for additional exams - 1 week)

On the basis of the SER and the programme stucture provided it is concluded that the amount of work in the speciality disciplines is sufficient in relation to Basic disciplines, University disciplines and Optional disciplines.

Evidences/Indicators

Evaluation is based on SER, content and structure of programmes and interview with the head of the programme.

Description and Analysis - Programme 3 / Ceramic Arts, BA

The bachelor's program is built on the basis of the ECTS system, is student-centered, and is based on the student's academic load, which is necessary to achieve the goals of the educational program.

Qualification to be awarded: Bachelor of Fine Arts in Ceramics

In order to receive a diploma confirming the completion of the educational program, the bachelor must meet the requirements stipulated by the educational program.

Teaching language: Georgian

Study duration: 4 years (8 semesters)

Program volume - 240 credits (ECTS), including:

● Specialty disciplines - 140 credits

● Basic disciplines - 18 credits

● University disciplines - 36 credits

● Optional disciplines - 46 credits

Volume of 1 credit - 25 hours.

One academic year - 2 semesters, credit volume - 60 (ECTS)

Depending on the student's individual workload, the number of credits per year may be less or more than 60

credits, but not more than 75 credits.

1 semester includes - a combination of academic weeks and a session period, of which classroom classes - 15

academic weeks

During 1 semester - one midterm exam.

After the end of the academic semester - final exam (for final exams - 2 weeks and for additional exams - 1 week)

On the basis of the SER and the programme stucture provided it is concluded that the amount of work in the speciality disciplines is sufficient in relation to Basic disciplines, University disciplines and Optional disciplines.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content and structure of programmes and interview with the head of the programme George Iashvili as well as site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 4 / Ceramic Arts, MA

The master's program is built on the basis of the ECTS system, is student-centered, and is

based on the student's academic load, which is necessary to achieve the goals of the educational program.

Qualification to be awarded: Master of Fine Arts in Ceramics

Requirement for awarding the master's degree: To successfully complete the full master's course and receive a

diploma confirming the completion of the educational program, the master must meet the requirements stipulated by the educational program.

Teaching language: Georgian

Study duration: 2 years (4 semesters)

Program size: - 125 credits (ECTS), including:

● Cycle of professional disciplines - 80 credits

● Cycle of visual arts disciplines - 10 credits

● University disciplines - 12

● Optional disciplines - 13 credits

● Cycle of digital technology disciplines - 10 credits

Volume of 1 credit - 25 hours.

One academic year - 2 semesters

Amount of credit - 60 (ECTS)

Depending on the student's individual workload, the number of credits per year may be less or more than 60 credits, but not more than 75 credits.

1 semester includes - a combination of study weeks and a session period, including 15 study weeks, session weeks - 16th, 17th, 18th

During 1 semester - one midterm exam.

After the end of the study semester - final exam.

2 weeks for final exams and 1 week for additional exams

On the basis of the SER and the programme stucture provided it is concluded that the amount of work in the speciality disciplines is sufficient in relation to Basic disciplines, University disciplines and Optional disciplines.

The evaluation is based on SER, content and structure of programmes and an interview with the head of the programme George Iashvili as well as a site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 5 / Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA

The bachelor's program is built on the basis of the ECTS system, is student-centered, and is based on the student's

academic load, which is necessary to achieve the goals of the educational program.

Qualification to be awarded: Bachelor of Fine Art in Glass

Requirements for awarding a bachelor's degree: In order to successfully complete the full bachelor's course and

receive a diploma confirming the completion of the educational program, the bachelor must meet the

requirements stipulated by the educational program.

Teaching language: Georgian

Study duration: 4 years (8 semesters)

Program volume - 240 credits (ECTS), including:

● Specialty disciplines - 140 credits

● Basic disciplines - 18 credits

● University disciplines - 36 credits

● Optional disciplines - 46 credits

Volume of 1 credit - 25 hours.

One academic year - 2 semesters, credit volume - 60 (ECTS)

Depending on the student's individual workload, the number of credits per year may be less or more than 60

credits, but not more than 75 credits.

1 semester includes - a combination of academic weeks and a session period, of which classroom classes - 15

academic weeks

During 1 semester - one midterm exam.

After the end of the academic semester - final exam (for final exams - 2 weeks and for additional exams - 1 week)

On the basis of the SER and the programme stucture provided it is concluded that the amount of work in the speciality disciplines is sufficient in relation to Basic disciplines, University disciplines and Optional disciplines.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme as well as site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 6 / Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA

The master's program is built on the basis of the ECTS system, is

student-centered, and is based on the student's academic load, which is necessary to achieve the goals of the

educational program.

Qualification to be awarded: Master of Fine Art in Jewelry and metalworking

Requirement for awarding the master's degree: To successfully complete the full master's course and receive a

diploma confirming the completion of the educational program, the master must meet the requirements stipulated

by the educational program.

Teaching language: Georgian

Study duration: 2 years (4 semesters)

Program size: - 125 credits (ECTS), including:

● Cycle of professional disciplines - 80 credits

● Cycle of visual arts disciplines - 10 credits

● University disciplines - 12

● Optional disciplines - 13 credits

● Cycle of digital technology disciplines - 10 credits

Volume of 1 credit - 25 hours.

One academic year - 2 semesters

Amount of credit - 60 (ECTS)

Depending on the student's individual workload, the number of credits per year may be less or more than 60

credits, but not more than 75 credits.

1 semester includes - a combination of study weeks and a session period, including 15 study weeks, session weeks -

16th, 17th, 18th

During 1 semester - one midterm exam.

After the end of the study semester - final exam.

2 weeks for final exams and 1 week for additional exams

On the basis of the SER and the programme stucture provided it is concluded that the amount of work in the speciality disciplines is sufficient in relation to Basic disciplines, University disciplines and Optional disciplines.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme as well as site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 7 / Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA

The bachelor's program is built on the basis of the ECTS system, is student-centered, and is based on the

student's academic load, which is necessary to achieve the goals of the educational program.

Qualification to be awarded: Bachelor of Fine Arts in Woodworking

Requirements for awarding a bachelor's degree: In order to successfully complete the full bachelor's course and

receive a diploma confirming the completion of the educational program, the bachelor must meet the

requirements stipulated by the educational program.

Teaching language: Georgian

Study duration: 4 years (8 semesters)

Program volume - 240 credits (ECTS), including:

● Specialty disciplines - 140 credits

● Basic disciplines - 18 credits

● University disciplines - 36 credits

● Optional disciplines - 46 credits

Volume of 1 credit - 25 hours.

One academic year - 2 semesters, credit volume - 60 (ECTS)

Depending on the student's individual workload, the number of credits per year may be less or more than 60

credits, but not more than 75 credits.

1 semester includes - a combination of study weeks and the session period, including 20 weeks, of which

classroom studies - 15 study weeks

During 1 semester - one midterm exam.

After the end of the academic semester - final exam (for final exams - 2 weeks and for additional exams - 1 week)

On the basis of the SER and the programme stucture provided it is concluded that the amount of work in the speciality disciplines is sufficient in relation to Basic disciplines, University disciplines and Optional disciplines.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme as well as site visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 8 / Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA

The master's program is built on the basis of the ECTS system, is student-centered, and is based on the student's academic load, which is necessary to achieve the goals of the educational program.

Qualification to be awarded: Master of Fine Arts in Woodworking

Requirement for awarding the master's degree: To successfully complete the full course of the master's degree and receive a diploma confirming the completion of the educational program, the master must meet the requirements stipulated by the educational program.

Teaching language: Georgian

Study duration: 2 years (4 semesters)

Program size: - 125 credits (ECTS), including:

● Specialty disciplines - 80 credits

● Visual arts disciplines - 15 credits

● University disciplines - 12

● Optional disciplines - 13 credits

● Cycle of digital technology disciplines - 5 credits

Volume of 1 credit - 25 hours.

One academic year - 2 semesters, credit volume - 60 (ECTS)

Depending on the student's individual workload, the number of credits per year may be less or more than 60 credits, but not more than 75 credits.

1 semester includes - a combination of study weeks and a session period, from which classroom studies - 15 study weeks (16, 17, 18 weeks)

During 1 semester - one midterm exam.

After the end of the study semester - final exam.

2 weeks for final exams and 1 week for additional exams

On the basis of the SER and the programme stucture provided it is concluded that the amount of work in the speciality disciplines is sufficient in relation to Basic disciplines, University disciplines and Optional disciplines.

Evidences/Indicators

The evaluation is based on SER, content of programmes and interview with the head of the programme as well as site visit.

General recommendations of the cluster: The total number of credits is distributed according to the priorities of the sector and the objectives of the programme, but the content should be adapted in response to the need to include more modern technologies, presentation methods and specialised foreign language skills.

General suggestion of the cluster: None

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

    Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

1.5. Academic Course/Subject

➢ The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject.

➢ The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.

➢ The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.

Cluster and individual evaluation

There are eight educational programmes grouped in the cluster: Glass Arts bachelor, Ceramic Arts bachelor, Jewellery and Metal processing Art bachelor, Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of wood bachelor, Glass Arts master, Ceramic Arts master, Jewellery and Metal processing Art master, Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of wood master.

The Goal of the programmes BA and AM is that the students have the opportunity to work in each other's workshop and create combined artworks.

For each BA educattional programmes full credits number are 240, and in this case, credits are divided as follows:

● Specialty disciplines - 140 credits

● Basic disciplines - 18 credits

● University disciplines - 36 credits

● Optional disciplines - 46 credits

1 credit - 25 hours.

One academic year - 2 semesters

Number of credits - 60 (ECTS)

And inside of MA programmes credits it looks so;

Ceramic Arts MA full credits include 120 ECTS, among them specialization disciplines – 80 credits, optional disciplines-28 credits, university disciplines – 12 credits, volume of 1credit – 25 hours, amount of credit – 60 (ECTS).

Glass Arts and Jewlery and Metal processing Art MA programmes program includes - 125 credits (ECTS), including: specialization disciplines – 80, optional disciplines-13, university disciplines – 12, disciplines of visual Arts – 10, Cycle of Digital technologies – 10. volume of 1credit – 25 hours, amount of credit – 60 (ECTS).

The documents that were sent to us did not include (unable) many syllabi from BA and MA programmes of Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of wood.

Subjects and the number of credits is somehow quat Insaf and achievable to reach the learning outcomes of the program. After interviews with the program director, academic staff, and students, it was determined that there was consideration of requirements/needs Optional subjects have been added to the program. The main study areas of the program are the study courses, whose outcomes are designed in accordance with the program's learning outcomes and reflected in the program in the competency map.

The educational programmes are written considering the requirements of the standard, however, during the on-site visit and personal interviews, some shortcomings were revealed. In the description of the educational programmes, it is clearly emphasized that considering the studying modern technologies and materials, they have competitive students with contemporary skills. But, after the visit to the workshops and interview with students we saw that some of the workshops have no materials and modern technologies. In the subsequent interview, they explained to us that they have ordered some new working machines and materials.

During the interview, the heads of the programmes that grouped in the cluster mentioned that, based on the students request, the credits of the main field's subject in the programs were increased to 140 credits.

In the syllabi, they have old publications books and no foreign languages contemporary publishing for the main field of study.

There Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programmes grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 Glass Arts BA

The techniques they describe in the syllabus are fine as one component of this educational program, but it does not include contemporary trends of study. After the visit to the Glass Arts workshop, I would say they need more modern material resources and techniques for the outcomes, that they have written in description of the educational program and SER.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 Glass Arts MA

The master's educational program is slightly different from the bachelor's. The research part is not highlighted, and the stages of development are not clearly defined.

Description and Analysis – Programme 3 Ceramic Arts BA

The ceramic arts educational program is one of the most complete and well-organized from the grouped in the cluster. They have clearly defined stages of development. The research phase is also important at the bachelor level. Contemporary trends in teaching are outlined in the program. As they said during the interview, they have already ordered some more materials and are waiting for them.

Description and Analysis – Programme 4 Ceramic Arts MA

Master of ceramic arts syllabi is logical and proper part of the bachelor's study process. However, the research methodology is unclear in the program and needs to be specified.

Description and Analysis – Programme 5 Jewlery and Metal processing Art BA

The bachelor's educational program as it is written meets the requirements of the standard. However, the site visit gave us a little different information. Modern trends and requirements are not considered in the program. After visiting the workshops, we found that the space was too small and the tools.

During interviews with students, it was found that they do not have enough material resources and they often are waiting for some tools to do their artworks.

Description and Analysis – Programme 6 Jewlery and Metal processing Art MA

The master's educational program is slightly different from the bachelor's. The master's educational program covers almost nothing new. There are no stages of development.

Description and Analysis – Programme 7 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of wood BA

The BA's educational program covers several traditional methods of woodworking. Also, within the program, students learn three computer programs: Adobe photoshop, Corel draw, and 3DS Max and the basics of interior design.

During the interview, the academic staff and students mentioned that they like the fact that they learn the basics of interior design along with woodworking.

Note that the educational program's foreign analogue is more experimental, aimed at developing research and critical thinking skills. Analoogy fully includes working on modern materials with contemporary teaching methodology. However, during the visit to the workshop, we found that the workshop is equipped with some equipment and materials, but the modern materials are not exhausted.

Description and Analysis – Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of wood MA

The MA's educational program is a logical continuation of a BA's degree. The program includes more practical work. But the syllabi and over documents I cannot check them, because downloading files were empty. That is why this short description is based only on a Program description.

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programme with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit.

Evidences/Indicators

- o   Self-Evalution report
- o   Interview results
- o   Workshop visit
- o   Description of the programmes grouped in a cluster
- o   Syllabi of the programmes grouped in a cluster

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	

47

	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of wood, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of wood, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of wood, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of wood, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering

Prerequisites for admission to the programme, teaching-learning methods and student assessment consider the specificity of the study field, level requirements, student needs, and ensure the engagement achievement of the objectives and expected learning outcomes of the programme.

2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions

The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programme to achieve learning outcomes.

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The Tbilisi State Academy of Arts has defined relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programmes grouped in a cluster to achieve learning outcomes.

For the **BA programmes** grouped in a cluster, a person with a secondary school diploma or equivalent can be admitted, based on the results of the unified national exams and the internal creative tour of the academy. The subjects to be passed by the prospective students on the national examinations are: Georgian language and literature, foreign language, mathematics and history. Information regarding the creative tour is available for the applicants 2 months prior to the exam. TSAA has developed the provision of the creative tour, which is available through the webpage of the institution. The applicants can also be admitted without passing national unified exams, as in accordance with the law. The information provided is transparent and easily accessible. The students can also be admitted through mobility, internal, as well as external. Based on the interview results and analysis of the quantitative data of the programmes, there have been cases of mobility to the programmes. However, the students admitted through mobility did not have any problems in achieving the programme learning outcomes.

As for the **MA programmes** grouped in a cluster, a person holding a bachelor's degree can be enrolled in the master's programme, if one has passed the exams determined by the TSA, namely: Specialty (composition) and foreign language. As in the case of the BA programmes, the applicants can be addmiitted through or without the unified master's examination and through mobility.

The programme admission preconditions are in line with the current legislation, are detailed and available publicly. The admission requiremenets of the programmes grouped in a cluster also take into account the specificities of the field and corresponding requirements for BA and MA levels of study.

As the admission preconditions for the BA and MA programmes grouped in a cluster are the same, the report for the BA and MA programmes is grouped according to the level of studies and does not provide differentiation among the programmes.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)

Description and Analysis - Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)

Description and Analysis - Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)

Description and Analysis - Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)

People who have completed their general education can be admitted to the BA programmes. A person can be admitted through unified national exams, without passing unified national exams and through mobility.

Enrollment based on the results of unified national exams: In order to be admitted to the BA programmes of the cluster based on the unified national exams, the applicant must pass Georgian language and literature, foreign language, Mathematics and History exams, and also TSAA creative tour. Information on the regulations is detailed, fair, transparent and corresponds to the specificities of the field and level of the studies, ensuring enrollment of the persons with relevant skills on the programmes.

Enrollment without taking **the unified national exams** is possible in accordance and in line with the regulations established by the legislation of Georgia and existing procedure. Namely, for the citizens of foreign countries and stateless persons, who have received a full general education or its equivalent in a foreign country; for the citizens of foreign countries who have received a full general education or its equivalent in a foreign country and have studied in a foreign country for the last two years; Individuals who have studied in a foreign country and received credits from a higher educational institution recognized in accordance with the legislation of that country.

The mobility of students is possible from other HEIs, as well as from the other educational programmes of TSAA, in accordance with the normative acts of the academy and current legislation of Georgia.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

Description and Analysis - Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)

Description and Analysis - Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)

Description and Analysis - Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)

For the master's programmes grouped in a cluster, an applicant must successfully undergo an exam in a foreign language and an exam in a specialty. The applicants can be admitted through or without unified master's examination and also through mobility.

Evidences/Indicators

- o **Programme 1** (Glass Arts, BA)
- o **Programme 2** (Glass Arts, MA)
- o **Programme 3** (Ceramic Arts, BA)
- o **Programme 4** (Ceramic Arts, MA)
- o **Programme 5** (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)
- o **Programme 6** (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)
- o **Programme 7** (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)
- o **Programme 8** (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)
- o Self-Evaluation Report;
- o Webpage of the institution;

- o Interview Results.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: N/A

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 2.1 Programme admission preconditions	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)	✓	☐	☐	☐

2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills

Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programmes grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit.

The development of students' practical, research and transfer skills on both levels of the programs included in this cluster takes place according to the principle of gradual growth. The syllabi clearly describe the activities planned to develop practical skills, however, the methods used to develop creative/performance skills, students' aesthetic-artistic side and ways of avoiding plagiarism while working on an idea are unclear.

In order to develop transferable skills, the self-assessment report mentions and the meeting with the quality service also mentioned the market relations component in the block of optional disciplines, however, during the interview, the students noted that the availability of optional subjects is not correct, other students had no information about these possibilities.
In our interviews, students/graduates of programs grouped in this cluster confirmed active participation in workshops/exhibitions with their lecturers and academic staff, but the bulk of creative activities are sought and carried out by invited/academic staff based on personal relationships.
Students receive information about workshops, exchange programs and other opportunities through various means: personally, from a lecturer, a fellow student, through TSAA's official website and social media platforms, but students are not informed about workshops, creative/performance projects and intra-university creative activities through faculty e-mail.

The results of the survey conducted with practice facilities/employers indicate a growing demand for clustered programs. Employers express their willingness to engage in the process and offer internships to students, although only 2 MOUs have been signed for Ceramic Arts and 2 Jewelry and metalwork Arts programs.
The memorandum submitted by TSAA represents the main agreement of the parties, which provides for the goal/result, but the information about the number of students and the duration of the practice are missing, as well as the purpose and result of the practice are general. It is mentioned in the existing document (Article 2.2.) that the conditions and obligations related to specific activities of mutual cooperation may be determined by a separate additional agreement.
The requested documentation includes a questionnaire of graduates, which is a good precedent for improving the program in the future.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Name and Level)

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programme with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit;

Evidences/Indicators

o   Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results

General recommendations of the cluster: Students should receive information about workshops, creative projects, and intra-University creative activities through faculty email.

Sign detailed memorandums of mutual commitment for students to do internships with internship sites and employers.

Conduct alumni surveys regularly to analyze results to improve the program.

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (name, level)

   Recommendation(s):

   Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (name, level)

   Recommendation(s):

   Suggestion(s):

....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.2. The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable Skills	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	☐	✔	☐	☐

53

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and metal processing Art, BA)	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA)	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artisting processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artisting processing of Wood, MA)	☐	✔	☐	☐

2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods

The programme is implemented by using student-centered teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The small size of student groups in the programmes ensures close, direct contact between the teacher and the students. It gives the opportunity to learn individual skills from teachers who are professionals in their field and who are also artists or designers.

A wide range of teaching methods are used, suitable for smaller groups of students. Innovative forms of teaching and learning are used (design-thinking process, project-based learning, inquiry-basedlearning, etc.)

The support provided by university for staff mobility is insufficient to gain new experience and knowledge in diversifying teaching methods.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis – Programme 1 (Name and Level)

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programme with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit;

Evidences/Indicators

- o   Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results

General recommendations of the cluster: to support and find financial opportunities to promote mobility among teachers and more opportunities to invite guest lecturers to complement the range

of methods used. It would be advisable to provide digital screens in the studios / workshops so that teachers could present lecture content in a modern and easily comprehensible form for the students.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

    Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)

    Recommendation(s): None

    Suggestion(s): None

Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)

    Recommendation(s): None

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.3. Teaching and learning methods	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

2.4. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The programmes are grouped in this cluster have a same system of the student's evaluation and each syllabus describes the evaluation method and forms very detailly; The evaluation of learning outcomes is made easier for

teachers and students alike as teaching methods are adapted to each course's objective. The evaluation system is approved by Order N3 of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia. The educational programs include one – intermediate and final assessment, the sum of which represents the final assessment (100 points). For intermediate all programmes have - 40 points and final assessment- 60 point, which in turn includes 30-point in theory and 30 – point in practicul part.

The grading system is based on a 100-point scale with assessments according to:

Positive grades:

(A) - Excellent - the rating of 91-100 points;

(B) – Very good - - the rating of 81-90 points

(C) - Good - the rating of 71-80 points

(D) - Satisfactory - the rating of 61-70 points

(E) - Enough - the rating of 51-60 points

 Negative grades:

(FX) - Did not pass - 41-50 points of rating, student needs more work to pass and is given the right to take the exam once more;

(F) – Failed - 40 points and less, which means that the work carried out by the student is not enough and he /she has to learn the subject from the beginning

Each professor decides how to distribute the points according to the components, depending on the different activities and the specifics of the subject.

The supervisor of the MA program is involved in the evaluation process of the master's artwork a commission created for protection evaluation, composed of specialists in the field.

During the interview, students raised that academic staff are open to any kind of question, but in stand of this close relationship between students and academic staff after the intermediate and final assessments feedback and some explanations are not given in time. During the interview, students mentioned that the university has a mechanism for appealing the results of midterm and final exams, but they do not use it often.

Evidences/Indicators

- o   BA and MA Program and Curriculum
- o   Mechanisms for evaluating program learning outcomes
- o   Interview with students
- o   Interview with Program supervisors

General recommendations of the cluster:

1. In the part of the final assessment, the students development should be analyze in parallel with the

   assessment of the students work, which will positively affect the results.

2. During the interview with the students, we found out that after the evaluations, they are not given a detailed explanation of what they failed in.

3. Also, during the interview with the students, we found out that the appeal process related to the score is unclear.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (name, level)

    Recommendation(s):

    Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (name, level)

    Recommendation(s):

    Suggestion(s):

....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.4 - Student evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐

Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them

The programme ensures the creation of a student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; promotes maximum student awareness, implements a variety of activities and facilitates student engagement in local and / or international projects; proper quality of scientific guidance and supervision is provided for master's and doctoral students.

3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services

Students receive consultation and support regarding planning of the learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the programme and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the programme.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Tbilisi State Academy of Arts provides a variety of support services for undergraduate and graduate students. Usually, students have access to both learning resources and professors who are ready to provide them with relevant information promptly.

There is a career development center in the academy, which actively offers appropriate counseling to students and helps them develop practical skills, as a result of which students will be able to become self-employed or be employed in the desired company. In addition, the positive attitude of students towards the academic staff were revealed during the interview. Professors are always ready to share all kinds of information and advice with students to improve the educational program and learning process. As evidence, there is a change in the Ceramic Arts program, were material resources have become available to freshmen as a result of student requests.

Students confirmed that they regularly receive information about announced competitions (local, international) and exchange programs both officially from the university's website and unofficially - through lecturers or other students. The Academy sees the need to further actively promote the process of internationalization of students. On the website- art.edu.ge- students have the opportunity to get acquainted with the news, events, workshops and information about organizing public lectures and exhibitions.

Students are able to contact the lecturers and the administration of the academy at any time through the electronic student portal- emis.art.edu.ge. In addition, it is also possible for students to request their documentation online. Besides, students have the opportunity to protest their assessment, which is monitored by the relevant committee of professors, although appeals rarely happen in these directions.

Currently, the Academy has a limited amount of literature in the Georgian language, although it is planned to enrich the educational resources. Students mainly use online resources in the English Language.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Name and Level)

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programme with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit;

Evidences/Indicators

- o ● Interview with students and alumni
- o ● Electronic portal: art.edu.ge
- o ● Electronic portal: emis.art.edu.ge
- o ● Interview with Program supervisors

General recommendations of the cluster:

1. Since cluster programs are primarily practical courses, students need to have

access to the appropriate quality and quantity of tools and inventory that should be provided by

the academy.

2. The Academy should cover the costs of the computer programs that are necessary for students.

Students have bare possibility to diversify their learning process because they have limited

resources to experiment. For this reason, these resources are used only for the projects of great

importance, such as bachelor's or master's final project, etc.

3. Due to the fact that only a minimal number of students participate in international (exchange

programs) and local projects (Shota Rustaveli National Science Foundation of Georgia and others),

it is necessary for the Academy to further encourage students and raise their level of awareness in

order to increase the participation rate in such competitions.

4. The academy should ensure the development and implementation of a policy to support the rapid integration

of foreign students. For example, it is possible to introduce "school of tutors" in the academy, the purpose of

which is to promote the integration of students representing ethnic minorities and to strengthen a tolerant

environment among young people. Both Georgian and international students are involved in this process, yet

the academic staff should also be in charge.

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to
the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 3.1 Student consulting and support services	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐

3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision

➢ A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctorate students to perform the scientific-research component successfully.
➢ Within master's and doctoral programmes, the ratio of students and supervisors enables to perform scientific supervision properly.

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The Academy provides students of both levels of the educational programs in the cluster with appropriate supervisors. A supervisor helps a student in creating a qualification project and conducts consultations. The frequency of consultations depends on the specificity of the program. From the interviews, it became clear that the quality and quantity of supervisors' involvement was sufficient for the students.

The HEI offers students adequate workspace and basic equipment (although more equipment is needed) to enable them to successfully complete their MA or BA projects. Practical work can be carried out both in the internal space of the Academy, as well as with partner companies and potential employers.

The students mentioned an opportunity to participate in exchange programs and highlighted the fact that they receive information about it regularly. Also, the Academy takes care of the career development of students and graduates.

The rate of employment of graduates in the case of Glass arts is 2; In the case of Ceramic arts, it is 11, in the case of Jewelry and Metal processing Art it is 5, and in the case of Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood it is 3. In addition, there is some involvement in the presentations, exhibitions and conferences of the students of the three programs mentioned above (except for Glass arts). However, it is necessary to further increase the level of activity, healthy and open competition in this regard.

The head of the program, faculty administration, and support staff are constantly involved in the learning process and provide all kinds of assistance to students in order to identify and eliminate problems in time and help students to properly finalize their projects.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Name and Level)

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programme with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit;

Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students **Programme 1** (Glass Arts, MA)[6]	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	1

---

[6] In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	
Number of master's students	0
//Number of doctoral students	
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	N/A
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	

Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 1 (Ceramic Arts, MA)[7]	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	4
//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	
Number of master's students	4
//Number of doctoral students	
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	1
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	

Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 1 (Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA)[8]	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	1
//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	
Number of master's students	2

---

[7] In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

[8] In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

//Number of doctoral students	
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	0.5
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	

Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 1 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)[9]	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	2
//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	
Number of master's students	2
//Number of doctoral students	
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	1
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	

Evidences/Indicators

- o ● Interview with students and alumni
- o ● Electronic portal: art.edu.ge
- o ● Electronic portal: emis.art.edu.ge
- o ● Interview with Program supervisors

General recommendations of the cluster:

1. It is important to actively involve professors of leading foreign universities in the learning

process as a result of which new perspectives will be opened for the students of the Academy. In

addition, proper attention should be paid to strengthening of the internationalization process and

deepening of bilateral relations with international (partner) universities.

---

[9] In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

2. During the last 5 years, the involvement of students in conferences and grant competitions,

which provide funding for their projects, is not recorded. The amount of interested students in

exchange programs is also minimal. Therefore, it is necessary for the academy to encourage

students even more and raise the level of awareness in order to increase their participation in such

competitions.

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally
to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed
recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes

Programme 1 (name, level)

   Recommendation(s):

   Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (name, level)

   Recommendation(s):

   Suggestion(s):

....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐

	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐

4. Providing Teaching Resources

Human, material, information and financial resources of educational programme/educational programmes grouped in a cluster ensure the sustainable, stable, efficient and effective functioning of the programme and the achievement of the defined objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

➢ Programme staff consists of qualified persons who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes.
➢ The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of

the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability.
➢ The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programme. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation.
➢ Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff with relevant competence.

Cluster and individual evaluation

After analyzing and studying the documents of personal qualification, personal files of staff (CV), BA staff list and MA staff list it can be said that all eight programs in the cluster have sufficient teaching academic and invitid staff to enable proper specialized studies at the Bachelor's and Master's level. At the same time, intensive and personal supervision is possible due to the high supervision rate and small student groups. During the interviews students and staff noted that between them there are remarkably close relationships. From the analysis of documents, we saw that many of them have been working at the State Art Academy for many years.

The study of international activity documents showed that in the last 5 years the staff and students of the Academy were involved in 36 projects within the framework of the program grouped in the cluster. It should be noted that the number of invited teachers participating in the projects is small.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA

Educational program 1 has a small number of students. The ratio of students to academic staff is 0.54. and with invited teachers 1.33. Fluctuation percentage of academic staff: fluctuation 25.0%, keeping 75.0%. In the case of invited teachers: fluctuation 66.7%, keeping 33.3%

Despite the small number of students, it should be said that the glass workshop does not have a satisfactory amount of material resources, because during the interview with the students, one of the students mentioned that he himself bought the glass cutters that he needed to work in the glass workshop during his studies.

The program 1 have same several exhibitions

They had several exhibitions within the framework of international activities where mainly the academic staff participated.

Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA				
Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise[10]	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[11]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	7	7	0	4
- Professor	1	1	0	1

[10] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study
[11] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

- Associate Professor	1	1	0	1
- Assistant-Professor	2	2		2
- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	3	3	0	0
Scientific Staff	0	0	0	0

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA

The ratio of students to academic staff is N/A. Glass Arts MA program has not had any students for the past five years. Fluctuation percentage of academic staff: fluctuation 25.0%, keeping 75.0%. In the case of invited teachers: fluctuation 66.7%, keeping 50.0%.

Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA				
Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise[12]	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[13]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	6	6	0	4
- Professor	1	1	0	1
- Associate Professor	1	1	0	1

---

[12] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

[13] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
- Assistant-Professor	2	2		2
- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	2	2	0	0
Scientific Staff	0	0	0	0

Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA

Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise[14]	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[15]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	**7**	**7**	**0**	**4**
- Professor	1	1	0	1
- Associate Professor	3	3	0	3
- Assistant-Professor	0	0		0
- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	3	3	0	0
Scientific Staff	0	0	0	0

Description and Analysis - Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA

Educational program 3 has a substantial number of students. The ratio of students to academic staff is 0.17. and with invited teachers 0.29. Fluctuation percentage of academic staff: fluctuation 25.0%, keeping 75.0%. In the case of invited teachers: fluctuation 66.7%, keeping 33.3%.

In this cluster only Ceramic Arts BA and MA programmes have one invited professor.

Within the BA program, both students and academic staff are actively involved in international exhibitions and workshops.

---

[14] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

[15] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

Description and Analysis - Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA

The ratio of MA students to academic staff is 1.0. and with invited teachers 1.75. Fluctuation percentage of academic staff: fluctuation 25.0%, keeping 75.0%. In the case of invited teachers: fluctuation 25.0%, keeping 75.0%.

 The documents show that the number of students on the program is increasing.

Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA				
Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise[16]	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[17]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	7	7	0	4
- Professor	1	1	0	1
- Associate Professor	3	3	0	3
- Assistant-Professor	0	0		0
- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	3	3	0	0
Scientific Staff	0	0	0	0

Description and Analysis – Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA

Educational program 5 has a small number of students. The ratio of students to academic staff is 0.15. and with invited teachers 0.33. Fluctuation percentage of academic staff: fluctuation 0%, keeping 100%. In the case of invited teachers: fluctuation 22.2%, keeping 75.0%

---

[16] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

[17] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

Despite the very small number of students, it should be said that the programmes 5 and 6 workshop does not have a satisfactory amount of material resources, because during the interview with the students, the students mentioned that they spend a week or two trying to figure out when it will be free so they can work on their own artwork.

The program 5 and 6 have same several exhibitions three exhibitions within the framework of international activities where mainly the academic staff participated.

Programme 5 Jewlery and Metal processing Art, BA				
Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise[18]	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[19]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	9	9	0	4
- Professor	0	0	0	0
- Associate Professor	1	1	0	1
- Assistant-Professor	3	3	0	3
- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	4	4	0	0
Scientific Staff	1	0	0	0

Description and Analysis – Programme 6 Jewlery and Metal processing Art, MA

The ratio of students to academic staff is 2.0. and with invited teachers 5.0. Fluctuation percentage of academic staff: fluctuation 0%, keeping 100%. In the case of invited teachers: fluctuation 22.2%, keeping 75.0%

Programme 6 Jewlery and Metal processing Art, MA				
Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with	Including the staff holding PhD degree in	Among them, the affiliated academic staff

---

[18] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

[19] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

		sectoral expertise[20]	the sectoral direction[21]	
Total number of academic staff	10	10	0	4
- Professor	0	0	0	0
- Associate Professor	1	1	0	1
- Assistant-Professor	3	3	0	3
- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	5	5	0	0
Scientific Staff	1	0	0	0

Description and Analysis – Programme 7 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood BA

The ratio of students to academic staff is 0.13. and with invited teachers 0.22. Fluctuation percentage of academic staff: fluctuation 0.0%, keeping 100%. In the case of invited teachers: fluctuation 100%, keeping 20%.

They had several workshops within the framework of international activities where mainly the students participated.

Programme 7 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood BA				
Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise[22]	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[23]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	7	7	0	4
- Professor	0	0	0	0
- Associate Professor	2	2	0	2
- Assistant-Professor	2	2	0	2

---

[20] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

[21] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

[22] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

[23] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	3	3	0	0
Scientific Staff	0	0	0	0

Description and Analysis – Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood MA

The ratio of students to academic staff is 2.0. and with invited teachers 1.0. Fluctuation percentage of academic staff: fluctuation 0.0.%, keeping 100%. In the case of invited teachers: fluctuation 85.7.%, keeping 25.0%

Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood MA

Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise[24]	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[25]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	7	7	0	4
- Professor	0	0	0	0
- Associate Professor	2	2	0	2
- Assistant-Professor	2	2	0	2
- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	3	3	0	0
Scientific Staff	0	0	0	0

Evidences/Indicators

- o   Self-evolution report
- o   Personnel qualification requirements
- o   Personnel files of staff (CV)

---

[24] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

[25] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

- ○ BA staff list
- ○ MA staff list
- ○ Interview with the student
- ○ Interview with the academic and invited Persoonnel
- ○ Discription of Programmes

General recommendations of the cluster:

1. The educational programmes1,2,5,6,7 and 8 require renewal of both academic staff and invited teachers.
2. More involvement of students and invited teachers in international projects.
3. The workshops of programs grouped in a cluster should be provided with materials and tools in such a way that the student's educational process of the practical is not interrupted.

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (name, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (name, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 4.1 Human resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Art, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Matel processing Art BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐

4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students

Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of research.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The cluster's MA programmes have a small number of Ma students. The professional experience and qualifications of the supervisors fully correspond to the requirements of the standart. The MA students are supervised by professors affiliated with TSAA, as well as lecturers invited or otherwise involved in the implementation of the respective study program. It should also be noted that working on a master's project in art is a certain creative process, and supervisors must work with each MA student individually. The result of the MA program is an Artwork or a series of artworks, which subsequently becomes the property of the Academy, in case the administration of the TSAA bought material for the MA project for the MA students.

Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[26]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	1	0	1
- Professor	1	0	1
- Associate Professor	1	0	1
- Assistant-Professor	2	0	2
Invited Staff	2	0	0

[26] Theses supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

Scientific Staff	0	0	0

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA

In this cluster Glass Arts MA programme have no MA student during last five year. We have saw only BA Artworks.

Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA			
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[27]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	4	0	4
- Professor	1	0	1
- Associate Professor	3	0	3
- Assistant-Professor	0	0	0
Invited Staff	3	0	0
Scientific Staff	0	0	0

Description and Analysis - Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA

Programme 4 has 4 supervisers, with high qualifications. The ratio of MA students to MA programme supervisers is 1.0. They actively participate in both international and local industry exhibitions, workshops, and seminars. The book "Ceramics - Glass technology for creative education" was developed with the involvement of the head of the program of the Faculty of Ceramic Arts and the supervisors of BA and MA together with a foreign invited professor.

Programme 6 Jewlery and Metal processing Art, MA			
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[28]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	1	0	1
- Professor	0	0	0
- Associate Professor	1	0	1

[27] Theses supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.
[28] Theses supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

- Assistant-Professor		0	0
Invited Staff	5	0	0
Scientific Staff	1	0	1

Description and Analysis - Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA

Programme 6 has 1 supervisor, with high qualifications. The ratio of MA students to MA programme supervisors is 0.50. Programme 6 has a minimal number of MA students.

Supervisors are specialists in the field with many years of experience and meet the requirements of the programme. Hoever, it must be said that the creative international activities of supervisors and students are small.

Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood, MA			
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[29]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	2	0	2
- Professor	0	0	0
- Associate Professor	2	0	2
- Assistant-Professor	2	0	2
Invited Staff	3	0	0
Scientific Staff	0	0	0

Description and Analysis - Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood, MA

Programme 8 has 2 supervisors, the ratio of MA students and Ma programme supervisors is 1.0%. Programme

6 has aminimal number of MA students.

Supervisors are actively involved in the work process at all stages of the MA project. They approach students with individual advice, proper planning of practical work, etc. MA programme's 6 supervisors had some activities in the field with BA and MA students.

---

[29] Theses supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

Evidences/Indicators

- o Self-evolution Report
- o Interview with Supervisors of the Proogrammes
- o Interview with Students
- o Personnel files of staff (CV)
- o Personal Qualification requirements

General recommendations of the cluster:

Supervisors of the master's program should be actively involved in international projects (exhibitions, biennials, workshops and ect.).

Supervisors of the master's program should ensure conducting the educational process with modern trends in teaching methods.

Supervisors of the master's program should select the appropriate research teaching method in the process of working on the master's thesis based on the specifics of the subject.

General suggestions of the cluster:

It would be relevant if supervisors discuss modern teaching methods with students and with their involvement, modern teaching methods will be introduc in the master's program.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (name, level)

    Recommendation(s):

    Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (name, level)

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.2 Qualification of supervisors of master's and doctoral students	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 7 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 8 Furniture Design and Artistic processing of Wood, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐

4.3 Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff

➢ The HEI conducts the evaluation of programme staff and analyses evaluation results on a regular basis.
➢ The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programmes grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit.

For the purpose of professional development of TSAA staff, a questionnaire of training needs of academic staff has been drawn up, which includes the components of academic teaching, including innovative methods, however,

during the site visit, in the interview with academic/visiting staff, we learned that they did not have information about this.

The results of the pilot survey of employee satisfaction include the results of a survey of academic staff involved in all TSAA programs, making the survey more generalizable. There is no research and outcome analysis of academic or visiting staff specifically involved in clustered programs.

During the TSAA site visit, during the survey, the academic staff mentioned participation in an anonymous survey conducted in the past, but according to them, the survey was conducted 5-7 years ago and most of the academic/visiting staff did not participate due to lack of information.

As a result of the request for documents, we received (Teacher survey report 2023) the raw information, results of the survey of staff involved in other programs, which does not represent the necessary information for the programs grouped in the cluster.

TSAA is a document of scientific mobility of personnel, which includes field activities carried out, mainly in the direction of restoration, which does not represent information intended for educational programs grouped in this cluster, which will help to develop the programs.

The list of training and informational meetings for academic staff by the Scientific/Research and Creative Development Department of TSAA indicates the information, date, but in some cases the topic of the training, the number of participants, the position, is it invited, academic or administrative staff is not indicated.
Part of the training list does not address the needs of staff involved in the programs grouped in this cluster and for its improvement.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Name and Level)

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programme with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit;

Evidences/Indicators

Self evaluation report

Scientific mobility of personnel

Staff trainings scientific meetings

Employee Satisfaction Pilot Survey Report

Teacher survey report 2023.

General recommendations of the cluster:

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.3 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐

Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA	✓	☐	☐	☐

4.4. Material Resources

Programme is provided with necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programmes grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit.

University learning environment - workshops, auditoriums and library are equipped with appropriate equipment. As a result of ongoing restoration works in the TSAA building, the library is changing its location, expanding, and a reading room has been arranged. There are few modern publications in the Georgian language in the library, but there are some textbooks of technology translated by TSAA into Georgian (0214.1.2., 0214.1.4.). At our request, the literature included in the program could not be found in the electronic database (0214.1.2., Making & Installing Handmade Tiles, Angelica Pozo, Sterling Publishing Company, Inc., 2008)

Bachelor's and master's programs of the cluster are provided with appropriate library, material and technical resources, library and electronic databases are available for academic staff and students, but during the visit, students noted that the electronic database needs improvement, it does not function properly.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programme with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit;

As a result of the site visit and interview, a malfunction of the main furnace was observed, which prevents the learning process from working properly. Students also expressed dissatisfaction with tools

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

83

As a result of the site visit and interview, a malfunction of the main furnace was observed, which prevents the learning process from working properly. Students also expressed dissatisfaction with tools

Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA)

During the visit to the workshop, we saw samples of the work done during the study period, which shows a long tradition and craftsmanship, but it is important that modern works are created with the ancient tradition in mind and that students have access to modern facilities and publications.

Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA)

During the visit to the workshop, we saw samples of the work done during the study period, which shows a long tradition and craftsmanship, but it is important that modern works are created with the ancient tradition in mind and that students have access to modern facilities and publications.

Evidences/Indicators

- o   Self-Evalution report
- o   Interview results
- o   Workshop visit

General recommendations of the cluster:
The books specified in the syllabi become available in the electronic database.

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA)

Recommendation(s): Basic equipment and tools for practical work should be brought into the arrangement.

Suggestion(s): None

Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)

Recommendation(s): **Basic** equipment and tools for practical work should be brought into the arrangement.

Suggestion(s): None

Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA)

Recommendation(s): **Recommendation** is to increase access to modern manuals/books needed for the program.

Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA)

Recommendation(s):   Recommendation is to increase access to modern manuals/books needed for the program.

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.4 Material resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	☐	✓	☐	☐

| Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA | ☐ | ✓ | ☐ | ☐ |

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the programme needs.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programmes grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit.

It was noted during the interviews and in the requested documentation (August 2023 purchases for authorization) the allocated funds (0214.1.4.) for the purchase of necessary equipment and tools, amounting to 46,270 GEL, are shown.
The budget of the educational program grouped in a cluster reflects the program's income, remuneration, expenses and staff development costs.
Despite our request for a detailed budget of the programmes, it does not include expenses of the licensed software and other...

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Name and Level)

Describe, analyse and evaluate the compliance of the educational programme with the requirements of the component of the standard, based on the information collected through the self-evaluation report (SER), the enclosed documents and site-visit;

Evidences/Indicators

- o Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results
- o Self-evaluation report
- o Budget breakdown by programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Detailed budgets should include a list of expenses separately for each program: how much was spent on licensed software, more detailed training expenses etc.

Programme 1 (name, level)

    Recommendation(s):

    Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (name, level)

    Recommendation(s):

    Suggestion(s):

....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.5 Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	☐	☐	✓	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	☐	✓	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	☐	✓	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	☐	✓	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	☐	☐	✓	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	☐	☐	✓	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	☐	☐	✓	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA	☐	☐	✓	☐

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

4. Providing Teaching Resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	☐	✔	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA	☐	✔	☐	☐

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development.

5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation

Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance department(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of programme quality assurance, developing assessment instruments, and implementing assessment process. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Elaboration of a self-evaluation report of educational programmes grouped in a cluster was a collaborative process involving academic staff, faculty, students, alumni, employers and administrative staff. The self-evaluation group for the programmes grouped in a cluster was approved by the faculty council on the 23rd of December 2022 (Minutes N20). The group was composed of 39 members, and as mentioned, was representative of the different stakeholders, toghether with the staff of the faculty and academy, involving industry representatives, covering all BA and MA programmes grouped in a cluster, as well as students of both levels of higher education. The minutes of the meetings

of the self-evaluation group are also recorded and provided in the accreditation package. The QA office and SER group have worked on the improvement of the quality of programmes grouped in a cluster, as well as planned further actions on the elimination of weaknesses identified during the elaboration of self-evaluation report.

It should be mentioned that the minutes of the faculty council, as well as minutes of the self-evaluation group demonstrate the ongoing process of development and work on the quality of the programmes. However, the overall involvement and engagement of the programme staff in the QA processes and the level of their knowledge of the QA processes should be improved.

Namely, the interview results did not support the existence of the shared quality culture and the programme staff demonstrated a low level of information on the QA mechanisms and processes, or their roles in it.

The QA process of the educational programmes grouped in a cluster is based on the "Plan-Do-Check-Act" cycle, the evaluations are carried out, analyzed and followed up. The evidence shows closing the QA cycle with the developed recommendations and their fulfillment. Even though some recommendations from QA need more time and resources, the application of the continuous cycle is evident. The recommendations and results from the evaluation, as well as main findings and recommendations of the QA office is discussed on the faculty council. The recommendations might need to be agreed on at the council meeting and supported. Based on the abovementioned, programme staff takes into consideration quality assurance results when making programme related decisions. The collaboration of the programme staff with the QA office is ongoing, however, as mentioned, the shared quality culture must be further supported.

The electronic/distance learning process is not active now at the TSA, however, as mentioned during interviews, the experience gained during the electronic/distance learning process has provided programme staff and students tools for ongoing communication and consultations. TSAA has developed internal quality assurance mechanisms and tools for evaluating electronic/distance learning. The distance learning process was evaluated by TSA, through student surveys and relevant recommendations were provided to improve the quality of the process. The details on the programme monitoring and review are provided further in the description of standard component 5.3.

Evidences/Indicators

o   Minutes of the council of the design faculty;

- o   Minutes of the work of the Self-evaluation group;
- o   Self-evaluation report;
- o   Interview results;
- o   Results of internal QA mechanisms' implementation and information on their usage for the programme development;
- o   QA office statute;
- o   QA mechanisms;
- o   Mechanisms of evaluating electronic/distance learning and teaching process.

General recommendations of the cluster: Ensure establishment of the quality culture and involvement of the programme staff in the QA processes.

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): N/A

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.1 Internal Quality Evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The programmes grouped in a cluster utilize the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis. Higher education programme's accreditation process is used as the tool for external quality assurance; however, peer evaluation process is also utilized for the development of the quality of the programmes – TSAA reaches out to the representatives of the creative sphere, professional unions for the evaluation and modification of the educational programmes.

For the external peer evaluation of the programmes grouped in a cluster, the TSAA reached out to "Georgian Artists Union", who evaluated the BA and MA programmes in Glass Arts. Ceramic Arts BA and MA programmes were evaluated by professionals in the field, through the surveys (e.g., "White Studio", "Crater Ceramic Design"). The Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood BA and MA programmes were also supported by the LLC Lazieri (the provided document is more a recommendation, rather than evaluation of the programmes).

Some of the evaluations had resulted in suggestions and/or recommendations for the TSAA, the suggestions of the industry representatives are taken into account by the academy and have resulted in relevant changes, however, the evaluations were more general and for the future peer evaluations, it is suggested for the institution to foster as thorough and detailed review, as possible. A special form for peer evaluation and a meeting to discuss the needs of the institution, the communication for the expectations of the institution might be helpful.

Evidences/Indicators

- o SER;
- o Interview results;
- o External evaluation results and recommendations.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): N/A

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.2 External Quality Evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	✓	☐	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)	✓	☐	☐	☐

5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review

Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematic data collection, study and analysis. Evaluation results are applied for the programme improvement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

TSAA has defined necessary tools and for monitoring and periodic evaluation of the programmes grouped in a cluster with the involvement of relevant stakeholders, including programme staff, administrative and support staff, graduates, employers and representatives of the industry. The tools are implemented, the evidence shows that the cycle of the quality assurance is continuous, being closed after implementing of the recommendations and re-

evaluating the processes, however, some improvements can be made to the implementation process of the tools, in order to further enhance quality at the academy.

The classroom observation is not implemented at TSAA, based on the interview results. However, as it is not a mandatory requirement of the standard, TSAA is not recommended, but suggested to revisit implementation of the classroom observations. The academy can also explore the option of having it not as a mandatory tool, but the tool used in case of need.

The survey of students is carried out every semester, electronically. The results are analyzed and used for the development of the quality of the programmes of the faculty. The provided document on the analysis of the surveys is generalized on the faculty level. Even though the application of the QA mechanisms and analysis of results is evident, and the cycle of the quality assurance is closed (recommendations issued, monitored, fulffilled) analysis and implementation of the results of the QA mechanisms on the individual programme level is not clear. There are questionnaire forms developed for evaluating the learning courses at TSA, and it is sent out to every student, however, as noted, the analysis document is prepared on the faculty level and even though the results of the analysis on the programme and leanring course level were requested, the report provided still covered faculty level.

TSAA has also developed a separate form for evaluation of the MA supervision process, and the process of quality assurance of the MA supervision is implemented – the survey results are analyzed and used for the improvement of the process, the results of the surveys are discussed on the faculty council, recommendations issued and fullfilled. However, once again, the analysis/report is prepared at the faculty level and does not distinguish between programmes.

The last survey of the graduates of the programmes grouped in a cluster was carried out in the summer 2023, the response rate was 50%. The survey, as indicated in the document, serves as an indication of the attainment of the programme learning outcomes by graduates. The surveys are administered electronically. Even though the employment of the graduates serves as the valuable source of information on the results of the programmes, it should be noted that graduates can provide more valuable information for the development of the programmes, I.e. how satisfied they are with the programme learning outcomes attainment, was the knowledge and skills gained in the process of learning sufficient in different areas or they wished to have obtained different skills/knowledge. The graduates who were present at the interviews were also asked about their involvement in the programme development, or their feedback to the institution after graduation. The interview results reviled different findings, namely, most of the graduates were not involved in the process of renewal of the programmes grouped in a cluster and they did not evaluate the programmes they studied, after graduation, or provide recommendations for improvement. The graduates that stated that they were involved in the development of the programmes in some ways, said that it was a more informal exchange of ideas. Therefore, the involvement of graduates in the development of the programmes should be strengthened.

As for the employers and representatives of the industry, they are highly informed and involved in the process of development of the programmes. However, once again, informal communication and exchange of information is most common.

It should be further noted that the experts fully understand the specificities of the programmes, and the challenges of involvement of stakeholders in the surveys and other formal QA procedures, also, taken into account the small number of students, and graduates per year, the analysis of the surveys on the programme level might not be sufficient. TSAA has a good practice of discussions with the PhD students, as mentioned, they have implemented it with the MA students as well. To support continuous development of the programmes and gain sufficient information on the programme level for the cluster, the focus-groups/roundtables/discussions of the stakeholders might be more relevant, and the practice can be further developed by the academy.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation report;
- Interview results;
- Results of the graduate survey on employment;
- Report of student survey of the TSAA faculty of design;
- Forms for surveys of different stakeholders;
- Mechanism for evaluating MA supervisor (approved on 27.03.2020);
- Results of evaluation of the MA supervisors;
- Questionnaire for MA students on the process of supervision;
- QA tools.

General recommendations of the cluster: Increase involvement of internal and external stakeholders in the evaluation of the programmes and ensure the analysis of results on individual programme level.

General suggestions of the cluster: In order to gain valuable insight into the programmes, further encourage and enhance focus groups, dialogues, discussions and round tables with and among stakeholders.

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Glass Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 2 (Glass Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 3 (Ceramic Arts, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 4 (Ceramic Arts, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 5 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 6 (Jewelry and Metal Processing Art, MA)	☐	✓	☐	☐
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA)	☐	✓	☐	☐

Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA)	☐	✔	☐	☐

Attached documentation (if applicable):

Name of the higher education institution:

Name of Higher Educational Programmes, Levels:

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

Contents / Standard	1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering	3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	4. Providing Teaching Resources	5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities
Programme 1 Glass Arts, BA	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements
Programme 2 Glass Arts, MA	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements
Programme 3 Ceramic Arts, BA	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements
Programme 4 Ceramic Arts, MA	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements
Programme 5 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, BA	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements
Programme 6 Jewelry and Metal processing Art, MA	Substantially complie with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements
Programme 7 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, BA	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements
Programme 8 (Furniture Design and Artistic Processing of Wood, MA	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements