განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

Report on LEPL – Davit Aghmashenebeli National Defense Academy Authorization

Expert Panel Members

Chair: Jean, Jacques, J. Marsia, President at Société européenne de défense (S€D) AISBL, Belgium

Members:

Ia Mosashvili - Kutaisi International University, Associate Professor at the school of Computer Science, Georgia

Natia Tchigvaria - Head of PhD programs; Georgian Institute of Public Affairs (GIPA), Georgia

Kristina Rzgoeva - Employer Expert, Head of Legal Division of Maritime Transport Agency of Georgia

Mariam Gorgodze - Student Expert, Tbilisi State University, Georgia.

Tbilisi
2022

Authorization Report Resume

General information on the educational institution

Education and training provided at the NDA are in line with Georgia's needs in general, cope with the geopolitical context, as with the specific needs of the Georgian armed forces. Excellent training of armed forces officers is essential for Georgia's security and defence in the current geopolitical context, aggravated by Russia's war with Ukraine. Although the level of bachelor's degree officers is considered very satisfactory by the employer, the Defence Staff, it was considered very appropriate that the NDA should also be responsible for providing master's degree training and developing a Research Centre, to provide more scientific training. Based on what the Royal Military School in Brussels realized from 2004, this could pave the way for doctoral training if the NDA follows a well-thought-out development plan and develops the necessary national and international partnerships. We suggest indeed dual doctorates. They promote inter-university, civil-military and / or international cooperation.

Brief overview of the authorization site visit

The visit consisted in several meetings with the NDA Rector, Deputy Rectors, Deans, Chaplain and Sergeant of Academy, the representatives of the Academic Council, of G1-G6, including Planning Division, Security Service, MDTD and CTDT, of Quality Assurance Service, of Chancellery, Internal Audit and PR departments, of Junker Training Battalion, TSDC, SPTC and Language Training department, of Library, Examination and Distance Learning Centers, and of the Scientific Research Center, with the Heads of the Programs, the Academic Staff (including MA supervisors), the Invited Teaching Staff, the Self-Evaluation Team, the so-cold "Assurance Services" or Supply, the Student-Speakers, with one student per study-field, and, by Visio conference, with the employer, and in tour of the whole facilities/infrastructure.

Overview of the HEI's compliance with standards

Summary of Recommendations

Standard 1 Mission and strategic development:
1. NDA should adjust its mission statement, make it more precise and compatible with strategic plan;
2. NDA should define its role and place in the mission statement by better reflecting the context, trends, and challenges of the higher education landscape at national, regional, and international levels;
3. NDA should define precise measurable targets and Key Performance Indicators in the action plan;

Standard 2 Organizational structure and management:
4. The position of Dean and head of educational program should be occupied by different people with relevant job descriptions: the Deans should be responsible to produce teaching and research; the heads of programmes should manage the educational processes.
5. Representatives of NDA should have full understanding of the importance of Quality culture for the institution and everybody's engagement in the processes organized by QA service is required;

Standard 3 Educational Programmes:

6. For BA programs (Civil courses) more practical work should be implemented;
7. For MA programs the strengthening of research components is necessary;

Standard 4 Personnel:

Standard 5 Students and their support services

8. It is recommended to adjust the mobility rules for the master's level in accordance with the current regulations;
9. Both BA and MA (especially – MA) students should be involved in the scientific research projects;
10. A career development center / unit should be established to diversify and strengthen career support measures and employment opportunities, especially in the civil sector;
11. International exchange programs should be intensified and improved, particularly for MA students.

Standard 6 Research, development and/or other creative work

12. NDA needs to have a strong policy for development of the research capacity of the institution.
13. NDA should reinforce coherent implementation of the research strategy;
14. NDA should develop measurable criteria for evaluation of scientific productivity of academic personnel.

Standard 7 Material, information and financial resources:

15. It is necessary to place evacuation signs in all buildings.
16. Emergency exits should be placed in all buildings.
17. The Archive should be renewed timely for ensuring normal placement of documents and operation of databases.
18. Fire Safety Plan should be approved by Emergency Management Service of Georgia.
19. All buildings as well as parking space should be adapted to the persons with disabilities.
20. Academy should either stop video monitoring of lectures or in case of proving of exceptional situation should inform all students and personnel about that and request the signature of acknowledgment of this and should place special signs everywhere where the video monitoring is conducted.
21. Librarian and all responsible person should receive up–to-date legislation or be granted the access to the database for ensuring the provision of students with updated versions of legislation.

Summary of Suggestions

Standard 1 Mission and strategic development:

NDA should:
- Extend teaching of leadership beyond military context.
- Use the research-based approach and QA service results for identify weak and strong points of the institution
- Increase the involvement and engagement of Junkers, alumni and employers in the strategic planning process;
- elaborate targeted short-term training courses systematically based on employees' needs/requests.

Standard 2 Organizational structure and management:

- Panel suggest NDA find more stakeholders as they combine military and civic education components;
- The Code of Ethics of NDA needs some improvements by adding more information about research ethics (as it is not only about plagiarism) and develop an article about discrimination aspects for different target groups.

Standard 3 Educational Programmes:

- To increase the engagement of the stakeholders in the process of program development, students, Alumni and labor market representatives included.

Standard 4 Personnel:

Standard 5 Students and their support services

- It is preferable for the academy to maintain a better connection with the graduates and involve them more in the self-evaluation processes.

Standard 6 Research, development and/or other creative work

- The Research Center should attract more partners and implement joint research projects.
- Research ethics should be developed and documented.
- NDA should make the process of internationalization systematic.
- NDA should announce internal grant contest at least twice a year and develop transparent and fair indicators for assessment of the research proposals;
- In SWOT analysis NDA should place "scarce funding for research" in the weakness instead of an opportunity.

Standard 7 Material, information and financial resources:

- Evacuation plan should be in Georgian and in English.

Summary of the Best Practices

Standard 1 Mission and strategic development:

- Having a successful combination of educational and military components enhances providing relevant cadres for military service.
- The panel was impressed with the transformative capacity of the Academy – NDA has a long tradition, and it is firmly focused on future development and building of a new quality culture.

Standard 2 Organizational structure and management:

- QA service has formalized internal quality assurance mechanisms.

Standard 3 Educational Programmes:

Standard 4 Personnel:

Standard 5 Students and their support services:

- NDA has developed a lot of activities to increase the attractivity of the teaching and the level of students: summer schools, exchange programs, scholarships, free-of-charge tuition, campus accommodation, excellent infrastructure.

Standard 6 Research, development and/or other creative work:

Standard 7 Material, information and financial resources:

- NDA has very well-developed accommodation, hospital, recreational and sport facilities.

Summary Table

	Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1.	**Mission and strategic development of HEI**	☐	☒	☐	☐
1.1	Mission of HEI	☐	☒	☐	☐
1.2	Strategic development	☐	☒	☐	☐
2.	**Organizational structure and management of HEI**	☐	☒	☐	☐
2.1	Organizational structure and management	☐	☒	☐	☐
2.2	Internal quality assurance mechanisms	☐	☒	☐	☐
2.3	Observing principles of ethics and integrity	☒	☐	☐	☐
3.	**Educational Programmes**	☒	☐	☐	☐
3.1	Design and development of educational programmes	☒	☐	☐	☐
3.2	Structure and content of educational programmes	☐	☒	☐	☐
3.3	Assessment of learning outcomes	☒	☐	☐	☐
4	**Staff of the HEI**	☒	☐	☐	☐
4.1	Staff management	☒	☐	☐	☐
4.2	Academic/Scientific and invited Staff workload	☒	☐	☐	☐
5	**Students and their support services**	☐	☒	☐	☐
5.1	The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights	☐	☒	☐	☐
5.2	Student support services	☐	☒	☐	☐
6	**Research, development and/or other creative work**	☐	☐	☒	☐
6.1	Research activities	☐	☐	☒	☐
6.2	Research support and internationalization	☐	☐	☒	☐
6.3	Evaluation of research activities	☐	☐	☒	☐
7	**Material, information and financial resources**	☐	☒	☐	☐
7.1	Material resources	☐	☒	☐	☐
7.2	Library resources	☐	☒	☐	☐
7.3	Information resources	☒	☐	☐	☐
7.4	Financial resources	☒	☐	☐	☐

Signature of expert panel members

1. Marsia, Jean, Jacques, J. (Chair)

2. Mosashvili, Ia (Member)

3. Natia Tchigvaria (Member)

Type text here

4. Rzgoeva, Kristina (Member)

5. Gorgodze, Mariam (Member)

Compliance of the Authorization Applicant HEI with the Authorization Standard Components

1. **Mission and strategic development of HEI**

Mission statement of a HEI defines its role and place within higher education area and broader society. Strategic development plan of HEI corresponds with the mission of an institution, is based on the goals of the institution and describe means for achieving these goals.

1.1 Mission of HEI
Mission Statement of the HEI corresponds to Georgia's and European higher education goals, defines its role and place within higher education area and society, both locally and internationally.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

LEPL - David Agmashenebeli National Defence Academy is a legal entity of public law of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia. It is the only higher military education institution in Georgia that implements academic, first and second level educational programs in accordance with the status of higher military education institution. In addition to higher education programs, it implements the Junior Officer Candidate Training Course. Education and training provided at the NDA are in line with Georgia's needs in general, cope with the geopolitical context, as with the specific needs of the Georgian armed forces. The idea of combining higher education and military components enhances providing relevant cadres for military service.

The mission statement of NDA is as follows: "The mission of the academy is to produce a corps of officers having high ethics, strong morale and leadership skills, with higher military and academic education, for the country and the Ministry."

In the Mission statement, NDA defines its institutional role locally, but the panel has clarified during the site visit and from other formal documents, that the institution sees its role regionally and internationally, which is declared in the vision too. In SER it is indicated that NDA has an ambition to become a leading competitive military institution in the region, besides, "The academy has responsible role and place locally, regionally and internationally". In NDA bylaws, article 5, the panel finds that one of the goals of the institution is developing and supporting scientific research locally and implementing local and international joint scientific research projects and programs.

The mission statement of HEI corresponds to Georgia's and European higher education goals, prepares officers based on European higher education requirements. Representatives of NATO, from DEEP (Defense Education Enhancement Program) actively support NDA to improve education programs and trainings. According to SER, the mission statement, vision and values are developed in accordance with representatives of NDA and Ministry of Defense of Georgia. However, during the site visit, some representatives of NDA mentioned that the vision and strategic plan are developed by the Rector annually, if all personnel is not involved in this process, the institution has to aware them about the strategic plan.

NDA developed leadership program separately to respond to the mission statement, however leadership for NDA deals with pure military aspects. The panel considers that if the institution strives to combine military and civil education, it will be more relevant to perceive leadership with full context. While the mission statement defines appropriate outcomes, it remains weak on characterizing a general academic profile. It includes the main concept of a higher education institution as well as the military aspect, the current format and wording of the mission are not fully in line with what the general theory and practice offers.

It is of crucial importance that NDA realizes the strategic potential that a concise, specific, forward-looking mission entails both for strategic planning and for promotion of its uniqueness. NDA should better define its role and place within the higher education landscape at both national, regional, or international level taking into consideration the context, trends and challenges these levels imply. When revising the mission statement, the institution should conduct a complex consultation process involving both external and internal stakeholders. The site visit showed that the mission statement is shared by the community of NDA. The middle management, students and the administration are aware of the mission.

Evidences/indicators

- Mission statement of NDA; Annex 1.1;
- NDA bylaws; Annex 2.1.9;
- Self – evaluation report of NDA;
- Site visit interview results;
- Strategic plan of NDA 2021-2027 (7 years); Annex 1.1

Recommendations:

- NDA should adjust its mission statement, make it more precise and compatible with strategic plan;
- NDA should define its role and place in the mission statement by better reflecting the context, trends, and challenges of the higher education landscape at national, regional, and international levels.

Suggestions:

- Extend teaching of leadership beyond military context.

Best Practices (if applicable):

- Having a successful combination of educational and military components enhances providing relevant cadres for military service.

Evaluation

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

1.2 Strategic Development

- o HEI has a strategic development (7-year) and an action plan (3-year) in place.
- o HEI contributes to the development of society, shares with the society the knowledge gathered in the institution, and facilitates lifelong learning
- o HEI evaluates implementation of strategic and action plans, and duly acts on evaluation results.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

NDA has developed a Strategic Plan for the timeframe 2021-2027 prepared by the University Strategy Planning Working Group which has been specifically established for this purpose by academic council of NDA. Consequently, the plan was approved by the academic council and then sent to the Ministry of Defence for final approval. The group has in its composition 23 people, included Heads and specialists of G-5, G-1 G-4 and G-3, Heads of Baccalaureate and

MA programs. Head of the library, Head and deputy of QA department, Head and a specialist of legal department of administration, teachers of English and French languages, specialist from scientific research center, Chief of procurement department, etc. The group created the strategic plan based on SWOT analysis. The Strategic Framework includes the following strategic aims:

1) preparing officers with leadership skills;

2) Developing educational component (military/academic);

3) Effective Research/scientific activities;

4) Internationalization;

5) Development of Junker/listeners services;

6) Raising awareness about the academy;

7) Development of organizational management and control.

The same group prepared an action plan for the timeframe 2021-2023. Both plans are adopted in 2021. In the provided documents the panel have strategic development document with timeframe 2021-2027 with seven strategic goals, while on the website we found 2018-2024 strategic development plan with 8 goals and action plan for 7 years.

According to the document "The rule of monitoring strategic and action plans", monitoring and evaluation of objectives and activities are performed quarterly and the last report is produced at the end of the third and fourth quarter. Final reports of Monitoring are presented to the academic council twice a year which revises the results and prepares the final annual reports to the rector. Unscheduled monitoring is possible to be implemented if it is commissioned by the Ministry of Defense or academic council or if there are significant amendments in the strategic plan or action plan.

NDA plans to evaluate the implementation of the strategic and actions plan every year; The presented report reveals that NDA has made a lot in the part of developing civil education for the last two years. Pandemic-related situation became a serious obstacle in fulfilment of some objectives too.

While the action plan is aiming at supporting the short-term implementation of the strategic plan, the panel observes that the objectives are general and not all targets in the action plan are measurable. For example, leadership does not include only military aspect, in this case it will be reasonable to specify and say that it is military leadership. In the strategic goal N 1, objective N 1, refers to the development of mechanisms of evaluation and stimulation of self-preparation program, "approved instructions" could not be the only indicator to measure performing this objective. The same issue is about the result of the objective that "a Junker is able to use military knowledge and skills", in the action plan should be presented how it is measured. In strategic goal N 2, objective N 1 and objective N 4 are the same, about constant development of the programs, performance is ensured with evaluation by alumni, affiliated personnel and analyzing the documents issued by Ministry of Defence and reflect the results in the programs. Activities in this regard should be very precise. The panel believes that the follow-up of the strategic development will be challenging unless measurable Key Performance Indicators are accompanying the action plan. Besides, connection between SWOT, strategic Plan, QA service activities, mission and action plan should be very tight.

NDA presents the high quality of internationalization and joint international projects with western universities in "Strength" point of the organization, in this light NDA does not have international students or professors at the institution for this period, except of one invited lecturer of English language. The component of internationalization is quite weak and needs improvement.

In "Weaknesses" point NDA presents decreasing number of admission candidates, but the research to reveal the real reasons has not been conducted yet. The policy of career development for personnel should be developed based on their needs, during site visit the panel had impression that the institution offers trainings based on top management decision. Accordingly, SWOT and action plan should be revised and improved.

The first report of the action plan reveals thatthe results are not encouraging. Recommendations left by the Monitoring group indicate that there are some delays in the performance of set objectives, this is understandable, because of the pandemic period. In SER panel finds that nearly the whole institution was engaged in the process of developing strategic plan and action plan, however site visit revealed that few people are aware of these documents and understand their importance

NDA formalized all relevant documents regarding strategic plan, with relevant procedures and monitoring group, however it has to develop more precise objectives with Key Performance Indicators, analyze risks and make an action plan more measurable and reach interested parties to be involved in this process.

NDA is aware of the need to participate in contributing to society through knowledge dissemination and to cooperate in developing of the region. In SER and during interviews NDA mentioned public lectures, visits to the schools, organizing conferences, doing cleaning works in nature. The status of the unique military institution and long tradition in providing officers to the Ministry of Defense give NDA a positive input for further engagement, but its overall impact currently is still low and the number of activities for satisfying lifelong learning aspects is limited.

In response to the NDA's argumentative position on Standard 1:

In SER it is clearly stated that NDA has an ambition to function on local, regional and international level, what is not indicated in the mission.

NDA considers that the component of raising leaders is ensured by the extra curricula activities, implemented according the „leadership system" program. In this document we read that the components of raising leaders are:
1) Junker's way of life;
2) Procedures for selection, appointment and evaluation of Junkers on temporary Staff command positions;
3) Duties and responsibilities of Junkers assigned to temporary Staff;
4) Military leadership;
5) Program developing military leadership;
6) Program of implementation of military marches;
7) Physical training program for Junkers etc.

It is clear that this is purely military field related program and is not related to civil understanding of leadership which involves making proper decisions, creating and articulating a clear vision, establishing achievable goals and providing followers with the knowledge and tools necessary to achieve those goals. Leaders are found and required in most aspects of society, from business to politics to region to community-based organizations.

In the curriculum of two MA programs the panel finds two courses: Military leadership and Strategic leadership. Only BA program in Management includes the course Organizational Behavior and Leadership. Hence, if the mission of NDA states that the institute raises leaders, who have military as well as civil education, all programs have to ensure teaching leadership according international standards.

In argumentative position of the institute is stated that it is possible to make some changes in the strategic plan, to avoid this kind of changes is needed to develop risk analysis in the action plan.

When the panel mentioned that the objectives in the action plans should be more precise, it means that the objective is not improvement of the programs, but inviting new academic personnel, revise curriculum, add new courses etc.

The panel understand that NDA works under umbrella of Ministry of Defense of Georgia, however it is independent Higher Education Institution and has to meet QA standards.

Evidences/indicators

- Order on the Formation of a Working Group on Establishing Strategic Development Plan and a 3-Year Action Plan, Annex N 1.1.
- Rule of monitoring strategic plan and action plan, Annex N 1.2;
- Site visit interview results;
- Strategic Planning Methodology, Annex N 1.1;
- Strategic Development Plan, (7-years) Annex N 1.1;
- Action Plan (3-years), Annex N 1.1;
- Monitoring Results, Annex N 1.2;
- Activities Planned and Implemented by NDA in Order to Contribute to Social Development, Annex N 1.3;
- Website of NDA, www.eta.edu.ge;
- Annual Reports on the Activities of NDA, Annex N 1.4;
- Self-evaluation report.

Recommendations:

- NDA should define precise measurable targets and Key Performance Indicators in the action plan

Suggestions:

NDA should:

- Use the research-based approach and QA service results for identify weak and strong points of the institution
- Increase the involvement and engagement of Junkers, alumni and employers in the strategic planning process;
- Elaborate targeted short-term training courses systematically based on employees' needs/requests.

Best Practices (if applicable):

- The panel was impressed with the transformative capacity of the Academy – NDA has a long tradition, and it is firmly focused on future development and building of a new quality culture;

Evaluation

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

2. Organizational Structure and Management of HEI

Organizational structure and management of the HEI is based on best practices of the educational sector, meaning effective use of management and quality assurance mechanisms

in the management process. This approach ensures implementation of strategic plan, integration of quality assurance function into management process, and promotes principles of integrity and ethics

2.1 Organizational Structure and Management
o Organizational structure of HEI ensures implementation of goals and activities described in its strategic plan o Procedures for election/appointment of the management bodies of HEI are transparent, equitable, and in line with legislation o HEI's Leadership/Management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution o Considering the mission and goals of HEI, leadership of the HEI supports international cooperation of the institution and the process of internationalization.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Since NDA made some changes in its structure, at present, it consists of the following units:

- Quality Assurance Service

- Headquarters

- Baccalaureate

- MA programs

- Junker Training Battalion

- Junior Officer Training School

- Learning Process Support Center

- Sports and Physical Training Service

- Distance Learning Center

- Library

- Scientific-Research Center

- Internal Audit Service

- Public Relations Department

- Examination Center.

The Rector runs and represents NDA with third parties. The following organizational units are directly subordinated to the Rector: Quality Assurance Service, Internal Audit Service, Scientific-Research Center, Public Relations Department and Deputy Rectors, namely:

- First Deputy Rector
- Deputy Rector
- Deputy Rector - Chief of the Staff

The following units are under the direct supervision of the First Deputy Rector: Junker Training Battalion, Junior Officer Training School, Sports and Physical Training Service, and Learning Process Support Center. The following units are under the direct supervision of the Deputy Rector:

- Baccalaureate,
- MA Programs,
- Examination Center,
- Distance Learning Center,
- Library.

The following units are under the direct supervision of the Deputy Rector – Chief of the Staff: G-1 Service that is responsible for the human resource planning and management process; G3-G2 Service, whose task is to facilitate the process of management and control of the Academy, security,

combat training, conducting the educational process in accordance with international standards and obtaining future-oriented academic education, and planning and implementation of necessary measures; G-4 Service, which provides planning, organizing, coordinating and monitoring the delivery of military technical, material and technical and medical facilities of the Academy. The service also monitors the process of obtaining property transferred to the Academy and operations for disposing of existing material and technical (non-core) assets; The G-5 Service organizes the design of the Academy development plans and programs, is responsible for promoting bilateral military cooperation and civil-military relations with NATO and Partner countries, and coordinates and directs the international activities of the Academy; G-6 Service that is responsible for providing the Academy communications, information systems, network planning, organization and monitoring. It also organizes and ensures the security of information exchange and provides and monitors working and learning processes at the Academy with computer and other information technologies using the appropriate equipment. Also, the Logistic Service, Legal Division, Financial Management Division, Procurement Division, Chancellery, Exhibition Hall and Recreation Center are under the supervision of the Deputy Rector-Chief of Staff.

The functions of the structural units are separated from each other that is confirmed by the provisions and the functional duties of the structural units. The scope of responsibilities and regular activities are clearly and precisely defined in these documents. Employees of the structural units are familiar with the provisions and their own functions and duties as well as evaluation rules and criteria. Given this fact, their individual evaluation takes place.

The governing bodies / governing authorities of the Academy are:
- Academic Council
- The Rector
- Head of the Quality Assurance Service.

The governing bodies / governing authorities of the basic educational units and educational units of the Academy are:
- Head of Baccalaureate
- Baccalaureate Council
- Head of MA Programs
- MA Programs Council.

The governing bodies / governing authorities of the educational units are:
- Commander of the Junker Training Battalion
- Head of Junior Officer Training School
- Head of Learning Process Support Center
- Head of Sports and Physical Training Service
- Head of Distance Learning Center.

Acting rules and procedures at NDA are in line with current legislation. The Minister of Defence of Georgia has approved the instructions on E-flow, electronic document management system, which is used by the academy too.

The panel considers that organizational structure of NDA is able to ensure the effective implementation of the activities outlined in the Strategic Development Plan and the achievement of the Academy goals.

In SER panel found that "*election and appointment of members in the governing bodies meet pre-determined requirements. The elections of the elective governing bodies of the Academy, in accordance with the rules approved by the Academic Council in agreement with the Ministry, are conducted by the Election Commission of NDA, with the rules and authorities defined by the Academic Council.*" During the site visit it was discovered that contest for middle management

positions are led by Ministry of Defence, however people who work based on contract found the openings at hr.gov.ge and were invited to the job interview.

Panel could not identify who is responsible for the academic part of the programs, as job descriptions of program Heads for BA and MA programs are purely administrative.

Panel sees problematic when the position of Deans and program heads are occupied by the same individuals. The Deans should be responsible to produce teaching and research; the heads of programmes should manage the educational processes.

Due to its specific nature, the Academy pays special attention to the continuity of its activities. NDA is guided by the Risk Management Policy of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia approved by the Minister of Defence of Georgia. It is a departmental level document of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia, which defines the risk management framework, principles etc. Based on this document, and in order to apply it in practice, the Academy has developed and approved a register for business continuity risks, which records all the potential risks and risk levels that may threaten the continuity of the Academy activity. The present document identifies the structural units responsible for the risks.

Besides the fact, that NDA has developed an internationalization policy and it is the one of the 7 strategic goals, in this direction institution's activities are not so systematic or intense. In the presented documents there is evaluation of junkers and personnel's satisfaction who participated in international exchange programs, that are typically of 2 week long visits to similar institutions in western countries. Most of them appreciate this opportunity, still there are a few people who mentioned that because of language barrier they did not get relevant benefit.

The G-5 Service of the Academy Headquarters informs the Junkers about the international cooperation, as well as about the permanent events that take place regularly throughout the year in the international direction.

As for personnel exchange programs / professional development activities, the information about them is disseminated by the G1 Service of the Academy Headquarters through Emod case management system.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report;
- Site visit interviews' results;
- Structure of the Academy - Annex N 2.1.1.
- Functions of the Academy Structural Units - Annex N 2.1.2.
- Selection/Appointment Rule and Procedures for the Governing Bodies - Annex N 2.1.3.
- System of the Maintenance of the Register of Educational Institutions - Annex N 2.1.4.
- Clerical work Regulations - Annex N 2.1.5.
- Management Effectiveness Monitoring Mechanisms and Evaluation System - Annex N 2.1.6.
- Risk Management Policy of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia and Business Continuity Risk Register of the Academy - Annex N 2.1.7.
- Internationalization Policy - Annex N 2.1.8.
- Relevant Internationalization Statistical Data - Annex N 2.1.8.
- Survey Results of the Junkers and Staff conducted by the Academy - Annex N 2.1.8.
- Internal Regulation - Annex N 2.1.10.
- Provisions - Annex N 2.1.11

Recommendations:
-    The position of Dean and head of educational program should be occupied by different people with relevant job descriptions: the Deans should be responsible to produce teaching and research; the heads of programmes should manage the educational processes.

Suggestions:
Non-binding suggestions for further development

Best Practices (if applicable):
Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard
☐ Complies with requirements
☒ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
o   ☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.2 Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms
o   Institution effectively implements internal quality assurance mechanisms. Leadership of the institution constantly works to strengthen quality assurance function and promotes establishment of quality culture in the institution.
o   HEI has a mechanism for planning student body, which will give each student an opportunity to get a high quality education.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements
The main internal Quality Assurance responsibility across the organisation lies with the Quality Assurance Service, which is established in 2021 and reports to the Rector. In SER we read that "The Quality Assurance Service shares the doctrines, other normative documents and standards for quality assurance of US Defence Force training programs; shares the quality assurance standards and recommendations of the European Higher Education Area (ESG-2015) and the principles and approaches to quality assurance developed by the European Higher Education Area. In addition, the Quality Assurance Service is aware of the publications published by ENQA regarding quality assurance and, if necessary, uses the best practices."
The main functions of QA service are as follows:
a) evaluation of learning and scientific research processes and development of recommendations for further improvement.
b) To manage the process of preparation NDA for authorization and accreditation, organize the process of supplementary documents for authorization self-evaluation questionnaire and report.
c) To support embedding modern teaching and learning methods. How can QA service ensure this duty?
d) based on evaluations constant monitoring of lectures seminars group work presentations and other activities and preparation of relevant recommendations or conclusions.
e) Cooperation with relevant services of military as well as civil higher education institutions for ensuring transparent quality criteria and methodology for its fulfilment.
f) Developing criteria and indicators for technical monitoring and academic expertise for main educational programs at NDA, if needed preparation of relevant recommendations on future measures.

g) To determine the compliance of the educational programs of NDA with the standards of authorization and accreditation in cooperation with the relevant structures of the Academy, responsible persons and stakeholders;

h) Participate in the development of questionnaires for academic / invited / scientific staff, teachers, military instructors and Junkers / trainees and, based on the analysis of the questionnaire, develop recommendations for further improvement of the Academy and submit them to the Rector of the Academy.

i) Participation in the monitoring of diploma supplements;

j) Organizing conferences, training, seminars, consulting and information meetings for the academic and administrative staff of the Academy on topical issues related to the Bologna process, curriculum development, authorization and accreditation.

The Academic Council has approved the Quality Assurance Guide, which combines the basic principles, standards, and procedures that define and ensure the quality of academic / military education programs implemented at NDA.

Quality assurance has the following goals at the Academy:

- Continuously improve the quality of teaching, learning, research and management;
- Realize the potential of the Junkers, learners, academic and visiting personnel, academic faculty, teachers, and instructors;
- Facilitate the process of creating an optimal learning environment;
- Contribute to the establishment of an education-based society.

Baccalaureate and MA programs have their own quality assurance experts, who, in coordination with the Quality Assurance Service, support quality assurance processes at the institution.

The quality assurance system of the Academy is structured on the PDCA cycle. Quality Assurance Service of NDA has developed relevant internal mechanisms which is documented in the guide of quality assurance approved by the rector in 2017. In the presented documents are included different questionnaires for Junkers, graduates, instructors, administrative and academic personnel, and other interested parties. To conduct quantitative surveys, QA Service uses Google form platform. However during the panel visit it was clear that only few people understand the importance of quality for the institution.

The panel recognizes that NDA has formalized all relevant documents for achieving quality assurance and included improvements of these mechanisms in an action plan.

Interviews have shown an active and eager administration from QA service side but less awareness of quality culture from some representatives of administration and academic personnel. Some of them consider quality as just attending classes, the main mechanism of quality assurance mentioned during the interviews is the evaluation policy of peer classroom attendance and classroom work and the practice of peer review. Site visit also revealed that the process of evaluation is quite formal for most of the people at NDA, some of them mentioned that frequency of evaluation is once a month, for some of them the semester or even a year. In addition, some individuals do not have proper understanding who is responsible for the quality assurance at the institution. It is of concern that evaluation results and recommendations are sometimes not even shared among personnel. Part of the staff is focused on providing feedback about their satisfaction and about possible individual improvement initiatives or ideas.

The performance of the Quality Assurance Service is evaluated by the Rector of the Academy. the Quality Assurance Service submits an annual report to the Academic Council of NDA. The performance of the Rector is evaluated by General Staff and Ministry of Defence.

NDA operates an electronic system for monitoring the academic performance of the Junkers that basically aims at formulating a weekly assessment of the Junkers. During the site visit they mentioned that it is user friendly and comfortable system,

In SWOT it is mentioned that the dynamic of candidates who want to be a student at NDA is decreasing. The panel listened to different assumptions from the site, however the research to investigate the real reasons was not conducted, considering the fact that NDA has very good infrastructure, Junkers can get degree for free of charge, in addition there are scholarship opportunities for five top Junkers per program.

In the process of program planning, development, and further improvement, Ministry of Defence is actively involved (for example, the Deputy Commander of the Defence Forces, the Training and Military Education Command, J7 Military Education and Combat Training Department are involved in the process). Once the final versions of the program are developed, the document will be sent to the Ministry of Defence of Georgia as well as to local and international allied organizations and higher education institutions for evaluation. Evaluation of the program by employers / experts plays an important role in the program development process.

The site visit revealed that while developing the programs, for external evaluation were used experts from NATO DEEP program, but none of these consultations are documented.

When planning the Junker contingent, NDA is primarily guided by the needs of the Defence Forces of Georgia. Given the fact that Bachelor's degree programs are the main source for staffing the Defence Forces with officers, NDA takes into account the requirements of the Defence Forces (training of 150 officers per year, training of 35-40 Junkers for each program), but the interview with an employer proved that there are deficit of cadres and their need is not fulfilled

In addition, NDA has developed the Junker contingency planning methodology that considers the resources and relevant indicators and benchmarks identified. NDA, as a specific HEI is purely dependent on the demand of Ministry of Defense, that's why they do not address other employers.

At the moment, the level of development of the quality culture across the institution does not fully support the development of the operations. NDA should increase its efforts to promote the development of quality culture as a common understanding of quality values, for which every individual of the organisation is responsible, right now this process is formal this should be.

Evidences/indicators
- Quality Assurance Guide – Annex N 2.2.1;
- Interviews during the site visit;
- System for Evaluating the Effectiveness of Quality Assurance Mechanisms - Annex N 2.2;
- Results of Internal Quality Assessment and Changes Made - Annex N 2.2.2; Annex N 2.2.3;
- Procedure and Practice for Using Evaluation Results - Annex N 2.2.2; Annex N 2.2.3;
- Results of a Survey of the Junkers and Other Individuals Conducted by the Academy - Annex N 2.2.3;
- Junker Contingent Planning Mechanism, Methodology and Benchmarks - Annex N 2.2.4;
- Evaluation Policy for Peer Classroom Attendance and Classroom Work - Annex N 2.2.2;

Recommendations:
- Representatives of NDA should have full understanding of the importance of Quality culture for the institution and everybody's engagement in the processes organized by QA service is required.

Suggestions:
-Panel suggest NDA find more stakeholders as they combine military and civic education components;

Best Practices (if applicable):
QA service has formalized internal quality assurance mechanisms.

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard
☐ Complies with requirements ☒ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.3. Observing Principles of Ethics and Integrity

- o HEI has developed regulations and mechanisms that follow principles of ethics and integrity. Such regulations are publicly accessible.
- o Institution has implemented mechanisms for detecting plagiarism and its prevention.
- o HEI follows the principles of academic freedom.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The institution has two Code of ethics, both are presented on the website; one is a military code of ethics, another one is for civilians. During interviews it was mentioned that students can find it on ILIAS or Moodle platforms.

The Code of Ethics has developed procedures to respond to the violations of different regulations; it equally focuses on all the members of the academic community. In the document is provided the description of the ethics committee, its duties and responsibilities. However, panel found during site visit that NDA representatives have different information about procedures while breaching the ethic code, some of them think that these cases are sent to legal department, some of them think it should be discussed with the head of the faculty etc. In difference with personnel students have information about code of ethic and know where they can find it and they are aware of the procedure with ethic committee. In SER we read that "The academy bases its teaching and research activities on the principles of research ethics and academic integrity", hence the panel considers that the Code of Ethics should include more information about research ethics and an article about discrimination.

Committee of ethics consists of 8 people. In case of breaching the regulations, the head of the program is the first person who is informed, then a lawyer is invited to discuss the case during faculty meeting and then the case is sent to the committee. The panel considers that this procedure could be simpler to be more effective.

There are no student members in the ethics committee. The legal department provided an explanation that NDA regulations based on military contract, limits Junkers presence in the different committees.

From 2017 to 2020, the National Defence Academy of Georgia was one of the parties involved in winning the Erasmus+ project - CBHE Institutional Development Grant Competition 2017 - Academic Integrity for Quality Teaching and Learning in Higher Education Institutions in Georgia (INTEGRITY). The project aimed to develop policies and mechanisms that would facilitate the detection, elimination and prevention of the plagiarism cases in the higher education institutions of Georgia. This partnership was helpful for NDA to develop rules of regulating plagiarism issues. The institution developed two documents, one is about plagiarism and its

levels, another document deals with plagiarism cases and relevant measures that are taken in case of detecting it. NDA purchased anti-plagiarism program "Turnitin" and has the right to create 1000 accounts and check the papers. The program is administered by the Distance Learning Center. In case of necessity, the program is used by the Baccalaureate, Master's program and the Scientific-Research Center to check for the plagiarism of papers.

In response to the NDA's argumentative position on Standard 2:

As deputy rectors take the position of the Dean, and program heads are responsible for the academic part of the program, the panel accepts NDA's position regarding Deans and Program heads.

In the argumentative position NDA states that it is ambiguous what does the panel mean under research ethics. Besides the plagiarism, research ethics includes the following international principles and standards: academic honesty, responsibility, confidentiality etc. Research should be conducted according research ethics standards, which means informing research participants on research purposes, methods, using research results, or probable risks about confidentiality, anonymity, this also includes respondents' rights , citation rules, archiving audio video or other materials that are used for research purposes or in the results, it is about the rights of individuals who participate in the research, rules of affiliation, juveniles under 18, taking into consideration the age, gender, religion, culture, sex, nationality and other differences, it is interesting does research results reflect the position of the academy, how the institute monitors this process etc. The answer in the argumentative position is not documented in the Code of Ethics, "people are informed about copyright" is not sufficient answer.

Evidences/indicators

- Code of ethics Annex N 2.3.2;
- Code of ethics of Ministry of Defence of Georgia for military personnel, website www.eta.edu.ge
- Self-evaluation report;
- Interview results during site visit;
- The rule of plagiarism - Annex N 2.3.1;
- Internal Regulations - Annex N 2.1.10;
- Ethics Commission - Annex N 2.3.3;
- Contract with Turnitin- Annex N 2.3.5;
- Erasmus + project Academic Integrity for Quality Teaching and Learning in Higher Education Institutions in Georgia (INTEGRITY) -results - Annex N 2.3.6;
- List of regulations- Annex N 2.3.7;
- Regulatory Policy for Learning Process- Annex N 2.4;
- Website - www.eta.edu.ge

Recommendations:

Proposal(s), which should be considered by the institution to comply with requirements of the standard component

Suggestions:

- The Code of Ethics of NDA needs some improvements by adding more information about research ethics (as it is not only about plagiarism) and develop an article about discrimination aspects for different target groups.

Best Practices (if applicable):
Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation
☒ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

3. Educational Programmes

HEI has procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling educational programmes. Programme learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in line with the National Qualifications Framework. A programme ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes

3.1 Design and Development of Educational Programmes

HEI has a policy for planning, designing, implementing and developing educational programmes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

National Defense Academy has the rule of programs planning, development and implementation. They follow the law of High education of Georgia as well as the rules of the ministry of defense. The programs comply with National Qualification Frameworks as well as the requirements of Military program standards. They have the BA and MA programs. For BA programs there are 2 directions: BA and Military. All the programs are accredited. BA program's duration is 4 years. 3 years are fully loaded by Bachelor courses but the last year of the study is for military program. The needs and requirements of the bachelor's programs are determined by the Ministry of Defense. Due to highest level of physical activity, BA programs require that only healthy individuals be admitted, which is described in programs. Admission to MA programs isn't required the healthy conditions. 4 years earlier before the programs will be initiated the needs will be listed and the number of the potential Junkers will be defined. The Junkers are involved in the process of programs evaluation, they fill out the surveys and fix their needs, for instance, they wanted to increase and/or decrease the number of English lessons hours. Program learning outcomes are defined according to Georgian qualification framework, as well as according to Georgian defense requirements. The program goals and learning outcomes are clearly defined, the assessment system is familiar for Junkers and they have the possibility to appeal their results. The learning methods are according to the subjects.

In the process of elaboration of programs in the academy, the academic and invited staff of the academy are involved, as well as the quality assurance service. More involvement of Junkers and alumni would be beneficial in the program development process. This was revealed during the interview with them. It seemed that some them knew the programs well, while others were less aware of the processes of program development. In the program development process, the academy considers the requirements of the Ministry of Defense, but also prepares them for the labor market, which means that except of the Ministry of Defense, the alumni will be able to find employment in the private sector as well. In addition to surveys, the Quality Assurance Service also creates focus groups in the process of programs development. DEEP members were involved in the external evaluation of the programs. There is a rule in the academy according to which the Junkers can't pass the subject again, if they failed. Because of this, those who are

failed, should leave the academy or continue to serve in the military. They don't pay the fine. The process is described in the rules for learning process regulation.

The results of monitoring the Junkers academic performance are periodically checked. Should be noted, that in the last years their academic performance is of high level.

During the program development, mutual attendance and auditory performance evaluation policies and collegial attendance practices are used, it was evidenced by the staff interviews. Academy has the procedures for approving, modifying, and revoking a program.

Evidences/indicators
- Rules for Analysis, Planning, Development, Implementation, Evaluation and Approval of Academic Educational Programs;
- Employer requirements;
- Surveys of Junkers, alumni, employers and analysis of their results;
- Alumni research related to career and academic development;
- Results of monitoring Junkers academic performance;
- Procedures for approving, modifying, and revoking a program;
- Interview results.

Recommendations:
Proposal(s), which should be considered by the institution to comply with requirements of the standard component

Suggestions:

To increase the engagement of the stakeholders in the process of program development, students, alumni and labor market representatives included.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☒ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

3.2 Structure and Content of Educational Programmes
- Programme learning outcomes are clearly stated and are in line with higher education level and qualification to be granted
- With the help of individualized education programmes, HEI takes into consideration various requirements, needs and academic readiness of students, and ensures their unhindered involvement into the educational process.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

National Defense Academy has 8 accredited programs, 4 of them are BA programs and 3 are MA programs. Alumni have only one master's program. They also implement the Georgian language 60-credit program.

The program components are determined by its content, learning outcomes and field specifics. The teaching-learning methods used in the educational programs consider the specifics of the field and ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the program. The learning methods are according to the Junkers skills.

Academy is represented by the courses of the main field of study (compulsory bachelor's thesis in the specialty, elective courses of the main field). The program provides a free component of the program. All BA programs offer a total of 75 credits in General Military Management Training Courses. Civic subjects are taught at the BA level for 3 years, and military subjects are taught in the 4th year. In the 6th semester is a BA thesis. English is taught intensively. In total they have more then 240 credits for each program, but they accumulate 240 credits before entering the 4th year. The curricula of the program at MA level are devoted to the compulsory courses of the main field of study, the elective courses of the basic field of study and also provide a research component - MA thesis, to which 30 credits are devoted.

The academy has approved the rule of developing an individual curriculum, which ensures that the Junkers different requirements, needs and academic training are considered and their involvement in the educational process. In addition, in accordance with this rule, if a Junker has a grade D or lower, an individual curriculum is developed in an upcoming semester.

Interviews with Junkers and alumni showed that they are satisfied with the courses, although they mentioned the need of more practical components in relation to civic subjects. The system for evaluating military subjects is different. Both theoretical and practical parts are evaluated by the special checklists. If the Junker misses the practical exercises, they will have possibility to remake them. For MA programs there is the need to be strengthened the research component, which is due to the fact that they started implementing 2 MA programs only last year.

The catalog of educational programs is posted on the website of the Academy.

Evidences/indicators
- Educational programs and syllabi;
- Rule of planning, implementation and evaluation of the scientific-research component;
- Academic Calendar;
- Catalog of educational programs;
- Satisfaction survey of Junkers, alumni, employers and analysis of their results;
- Alumni research related to career and academic development;
- Results of monitoring Junkers academic performance;
- Individual curriculum and methodology of its development;
- Instructions for BA and MA theses;
- Ilias- and Moodle- platforms;
- Web site;
- Interview results.

Recommendations:
- For BA programs (Civil courses) more practical work should be implemented.
- For MA programs the strengthening of research components is necessary.

Suggestions:
Non-binding suggestions for further development

Best Practices (if applicable):
Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

o ☐ Does not comply with requirements

3.3 Assessment of Learning Outcomes
HEI has law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment, which promotes the improvement of students' academic performance.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The academy has established methods and tools for evaluating the learning outcomes of the educational program. Both direct and indirect assessment methods are used to assess learning outcomes. Academy has developed the documents, which include the academy's "Educational Program Implementation Evaluation Indicators and Assessment Rules, Educational Program Planning and Development Methodology", Learning Outcomes Map for each program, Learning Outcome Evaluation Plan / Curriculum Map of compliance of learning methods with learning outcomes. In addition, there are the mechanisms, which are described in the quality manual book. Staff involved in the programs participate in comparing the learning outcome evaluation system for the programs. The Academy met with representatives of the DEEP (Defense education enhancement program), where one of the priorities was the introduction of modern teaching-assessment and assessment methods in the process of distance learning.

There is an effective appeal system at the academy. In case of dissatisfaction with the test results, the Junker can write the official letter to head of the bachelor / master within 3 (three) working days after the announcement of the results. The complaint will be reviewed by the Academy's Claims Commission. The details of the appeal system were clearly described by the Junkers as well as the staff.

One of the indicators of program learning outcomes is Junkers' assessment. The assessment system is reflected in the syllabus of all courses of the educational programs. Information meetings are held for Junkers, where one of the topics is devoted to the current assessment system and regulations related to assessment. In addition, Junkers are informed about the criteria, the results achieved and the ways to improve the results by the course supervisors. Information about the grading system is available to Junkers on the Ilias and Moodle platforms, where all the necessary regulations are uploaded, including instructions for organizing, conducting and grading exams. In the process of evaluating learning outcomes, the academy uses the Gaussian distribution principle.

The information about the assessment of learning outcomes is also posted on the Website.

Evidences/indicators
- Learning Outcome Evaluation System and their availability to stakeholders;
- Quality Assurance Guide;
- Educational programs;
- Survey results;
- Evaluation indicators for the implementation of educational programs and the evaluation rule;
- Methodology of planning and developing educational programs;
- Programs maps;
- Order of approval of the claim commission;
- Web site;
- Interview results.

Recommendations:
Proposal(s), which should be considered by the institution to comply with requirements of the standard component

Suggestions:
Non-binding suggestions for further development

Best Practices (if applicable):
Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard
 	
    ☒ Complies with requirements
    ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
    ☐ Partially complies with requirements
o ☐ Does not comply with requirements

4. Staff of the HEI

HEI ensures that the staff employed in the institution (academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support) are highly qualified, so that they are able to effectively manage educational, scientific and administrative processes and achieve the goals defined by the strategic plan of the institution. On its hand, the institution constantly provides its staff with professional development opportunities and improved work conditions.

4.1. Staff Management
o HEI has staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of educational process and other activities defined in its strategic plan. o HEI ensures the employment of qualified academic/scientific/invited/administrative/ support staff.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The Academy has developed and operates a personnel management policy, which defines the principles and rules of personnel management. The document provides directions and mechanisms for attracting, selecting, managing, retaining staff of the Academy. The document contains information on staff selection and recruitment, staff development and evaluation, staff motivation and encouragement, staff retention. More work needs to be done for the new staff to be familiar with his/her working area and the internal rules. This was revealed during the interviews. The academy tries to attract young staff, administrative, academic, scientific or invited staff. In the process of cooperation, the Academy provides support for their professional development through training / workshops, publication / funding of research, participation in conferences. All persons employed in the academy have free health insurance, they freely use the material and technical base of the academy.

The rules for the selection of military personnel shall be determined by an order of the Minister of Defense. Appointment to the position is made on the request of the Rector of the Academy by the order of the Commander of the Defense Forces. Recruitment of support staff is carried out by appointment of the Rector and on the basis of contracts, with or without open competition. Academic, invited and administration staff are highly qualified. Academic / Invited Staff (Supervisor Professor, Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor) Recruitment of Academic / Invited Staff (Department Supervisor, Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor).

The academy has a unique opportunity to engage in international professional development activities.

There are incentive mechanisms in place at the academy. A staff award ceremony is held every month. These awards are: medals, certificates, various prizes. The Civic Personnel Assessment Guide is approved by the Academy and aims to define the Academy Civic Personnel Assessment Method / System and the regulatory processes. To effectively manage the activities of the

academy, in connection with the activities performed by the staff, it sets targets and takes care of their improvement.

The NDA fosters intensive professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff as their scientific and research work. The purpose of the academic / invited / scientific staff is to evaluate the academic activity and self-assessment, to evaluate the scientific / research activity, to take care of their development. Targets for administrative / support staff Assessing their work and self-assessment, taking care of their development.

Evidences/indicators

- Charter of Academy;
- Unified rules for hiring academic staff and holding competitions;
- Rules for hiring support staff;
- The rule of determining the number of academic, scientific and invited staff;
- Human resource management policy, relevant regulations and implementation results;
- The approval of the rules of affiliation of the academic staff of the National Defense Academy;
- Results of staff performance appraisal and satisfaction survey and their use in personnel management and development;
- Survey results;
- Staff functions and job descriptions;
- Qualification requirements;
- Personal files of staff;
- Samples of staff contracts;
- Statistics of staffs;
- Interview results.

Recommendations:

Suggestions:

Non-binding suggestions for further development

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☒ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

4.2. Academic/Scientific and Invited Staff Workload

Number and workload of academic/scientific and invited staff is adequate to HEI's educational programmes and scientific-research activities, and also other functions assigned to them

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The academy has a "scientific staff-research and academic workload rule, which is accompanied by a semester-upload workload scheme. The full workload for the academic staff includes the obligatory lecture / seminar workload, individual work / consultation with the Junkers, development of examination materials, development of a new course, supervising / reviewing and reviewing of bachelor / master thesis / other. The minimum weekly lecture load of the staff is 6 academic hours. The maximum weekly lecture staff workload does not exceed 14 academic hours. The work load of the academic staff includes their scientific activities, which is defined in their

contract. See Standard 6 for details of scientific activities. For all the staff the max. working hours per week are 40 hours. This was checked during interviews with academic and visiting staff. Full-time academic staff workload is defined as a minimum of 800 hours per year.

The number of academic, scientific and personnel invited in relation to the number of adequate recruiting Junkers, which is determined by the methodology of determining the number of academic, scientific and scientific staff.

BA and MA offices of the Academy, in coordination with the Civic-Educational Department of the G3-G2 Service of the Academy, monitor the workload of the academic staff in various higher education institutions.

The academy has developed a methodology for determining the number of academic, scientific and invited staff, according to which in the BA program there is 1 academic staff per 40 Junkers; in the MA program - 1 academic staff per 10 Junkers.

The rules and conditions of academic staff affiliation are established in the academy and the rights and responsibilities of academic staff are defined in connection with affiliation. There is the Monitoring Regular system at Academy G3-G2 Civil Service Training Department.

Evidences/indicators
- Rules for academic-research and academic workload;
- Academic / Scientific / Invited Staffing Scheme;
- Functions Descriptions of staff;
- Personnel cases;
- Methodology for determining the number of academic staff invited to the program;
 - Staff ratios;
- Results of a Junkers and staff survey;
- Documentation confirming the load in other Universities;
- Interview results.

Recommendations:
Proposal(s), which should be considered by the institution to comply with requirements of the standard component

Suggestions:
Non-binding suggestions for further development.

Best Practices (if applicable):
Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions.

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

    ☒ Complies with requirements

    ☐ Substantially complies with requirements

    ☐ Partially complies with requirements

    ☐ Does not comply with requirements

5. Students and Their Support Services
HEI ensures the development of student-centred environment, offers appropriate services, including career support mechanisms; it also ensures maximum awareness of students, implements diverse activities and promotes student involvement in these activities. HEI utilizes student survey results to improve student support services

5.1. The Rule for Obtaining and Changing Student Status, the Recognition of Education, and Student Rights
o For each of the educational levels, HEI has developed regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting, issuing educational documents as well as recognition of education received during the learning period.
o HEI ensures the protection of student rights and lawful interests.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

NDA has developed relevant regulations for student enrolment, suspension/termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting, as well as recognition of education, which are in accordance with the Law of Georgia on Higher Education, the Law of Georgia on Military Obligation and Military Service and other normative acts. These regulations are transparent, fair, and publicly available on the academy's website. The procedure of obtaining student status, mobility, qualification granting and the grounds of suspension and termination of student status are provided through the "Rules for learning process regulation". The abovementioned document also contains information about Junker's contract.

The contract between a Junker and the institution includes the rights and obligations of the Junker. It should be mentioned that the terms of the contract restrict some of the student's rights guaranteed by the Law of Georgia on Higher Education (such as being elected as a member of the students' self-government body, as well as of the management bodies of the higher education institution and its main educational units), however, the Law of Georgia on Military Obligation and Military Service, which applies to NDA, regulates this issue and suggests that "the rights established for students under the Law of Georgia on Higher Education may be limited under a contract concluded with a Junker of a military institution of higher education."

Considering that Junkers are restricted to be selected as a member of self-government, hence they can't form student self-government, the academy has established an alternate institute - Student-Speakers for direct communication with the leadership of the institution. Academy selects Speakers from the Junker training battalion - two Junkers per course for 1 month. During their studies at the academy, most of the Junkers are involved in this activity.

The speakers have pre-arranged meetings with the Rector of the Academy, Deputy Rectors and the Commander of the Junker Training Battalion. Student speakers have the role of mediator between the Junkers and the management of the institution – speakers discuss specific issues, opinions, requests and suggestions expressed by all Junkers. Besides the pre-scheduled formal meetings, every week (on Tuesdays) student speakers have an informal meeting in the format of dinner with the leadership, as well as the personnel of the academy. Having both formal and informal meetings intensifies communication between the speakers and the personnel and helps speakers to fulfill their roles more productively.

Suspension and termination of student status, as well as mobility, are regulated by the "Rules for learning process regulation." According to this document, at the first level of academic higher education in the academy (bachelor), depending on the specifics of the academy, only the mobility of the autumn semester is carried out. As for internal mobility, the right to participate in internal mobility arises for a cadet after one semester of studying at the corresponding level of higher academic education (except for cadets of the Mechanical Engineering educational program), only at the end of the first and third semesters (after the fourth semester, all cadets are restricted from using internal mobility). This document also considers the cases of mobility restrictions, which derive from the specifics of the academy.

The right to mobility (both – internal and external) is also provided for master's degree students. However, according to the "Rules for learning process regulation", "the student/Junker has the right to mobility and internal mobility at the second level of academic higher education (master's degree) only in the educational program direction that corresponds to the type of test of the unified

master's exam they passed." It must be mentioned that starting from 2020, test types were removed from the unified master's exams, and all candidates write the same test, which was aimed at simplifying the mobility process. Hence, the abovementioned rule is not in accordance with the current regulations. (According to the NDA this issue has been resolved, however, no relevant documentation was presented to the panel.)

"Rules for learning process regulation" regulates the issue of suspension of student status, in particular, the grounds for suspension of status, restoration of status, and the procedure for restoration. Termination of student status is also regulated by the mentioned document, "the grounds for termination of Junker status may be related to the impossibility of achieving the learning outcomes provided for by the educational program/programs of the academy, or the performance of actions incompatible with Junker status, or the violation of the terms specified in the contract signed with the cadet." NDA's regulations for both suspension and termination of student status comply with current legislation.

According to the Junkers interviewed by the panel, they were provided an explanation about the terms of the contracts by the academy before signing it. Informational meetings with Junkers are held at the beginning of the learning process with the involvement of various structural units. The panel was informed that in case of under-aged candidates, a parent or a guardian also attends the aforesaid meeting. The interviewing process made it apparent that the students are aware of the terms of the contract – rights guaranteed by it, as well as obligations and the consequences of its breach.

The institution has also developed two codes of ethics (one for the civilians and another – for the military) which suggests a relevant procedure in case of violation of the regulations. The code of ethics is available on the website of NDA. Junkers can also find it on ILIAS and Moodle platforms. Students are informed about the Code of ethics and where to find it, they are also aware of the procedure carried out by the ethics committee.

To protect students' rights the institution has formulated further documents, such as the Statute of the Academy, the rules for issuing scholarships and the disciplinary provisions.

To make the knowledge assessment process transparent and fair, an Examination Center has been set up at the institution. Information about the activities of the Examination Center is written in the regulations of the Examination Center. Through this document, all Junkers are aware of the examination procedure and specific rules that must be followed.

All the regulatory documents are available on the website of NDA – www.eta.edu.ge, additionally, they are uploaded to the Ilias and Moodle platforms.

Evidences/indicators
- Rules for learning process regulation- Annex N 2.4;
- The law of Georgia on Higher Education (Available on the website of NDA – www.eta.edu.ge);
- The Law of Georgia on Military Obligation and Military Service (Available on the website of NDA – www.eta.edu.ge);
- Code of Ethics- Annex N 2.3.2;
- Provisions of Examination Center- Annex N 2.1.11;
- Statute of the Academy- Annex N 2.1.9;
- Samples of the contract between the Academy and the Junker – Annex N 5.1;
- Self-evaluation report of NDA;
- Site visit interview results;
- Website – www.eta.edu.ge.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to adjust the mobility rules for the master's level in accordance with the current regulations.

Suggestions:
Non-binding suggestions for further development

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard
□ Complies with requirements ☒ Substantially complies with requirements □ Partially complies with requirements □ Does not comply with requirements

5.2 Student Support Services
o HEI has student consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance o HEI has career support service, which provides students with appropriate counselling and support regarding employment and career development o HEI ensures students awareness and involvement in various university-level, local and international projects and events, and supports student initiatives o HEI has mechanisms, including financial mechanisms to support low SES students

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

NDA has developed relevant student consulting services to plan the educational process and improve academic performance. Junkers receive proper counseling from the management of the institution, as well as from academic/invited personnel.

Consultation schedules for Junkers are provided at the beginning of the semester, besides pre-arranged schedules, students can also receive a consultation by an individual agreement. The individual workload document of the academic/invited staff includes the volume of the consulting workload.

According to the interviewees, in the distance learning period, despite certain technical issues, students were still receiving sufficient consultations with the involvement of various online platforms (Zoom, Teams, Outlook, WhatsApp, etc.). It is noteworthy that the Distance Learning Center also operates in the institution to support students during the distance learning period.

As a result of the interviews with students and academic/invited personnel, it was revealed to the panel that to improve academic performance, students who have grades D (according to the regulations of NDA - 61-70 points of maximum evaluation) or lower are receiving individual consultations.

It should be positively evaluated that almost all the NDA graduates are guaranteed to be employed by the Ministry of Defence of Georgia. However, from the submitted documentation and the site visit it was revealed to the panel that the institution doesn't have a separate career development center or unit, which is crucial in the process of providing students with the appropriate support regarding employment and career development. Although the academy provides career support for students in different ways, for the career development process to be more organized, well-structured and convenient for the Junkers, it is necessary to have a separate career development center or body

within the academy itself, in this case, such center/unit is especially necessary for the civil sector. Even though the Ministry of Defence of Georgia is the main employer for the NDA graduates, the goals of the programs implemented by the institution provide include employment for graduates in the civil sector as well (according to the program curriculum). Nevertheless, the interview with the Junkers made it clear that they aren't receiving sufficient career support in the aforementioned area.

Junkers have meetings with invited guests to discuss important topics related to their field and future career. Moreover, in the second term of the 4th year, students will undergo a military internship in the relevant units of the Defence Forces, which helps them to develop practical skills for their future careers. Students are also taking practical courses, however, the surveys taken by the Junkers and the graduates, as well as the results of the interview made it obvious that the component of practical courses, especially in the civil field, needs to be improved (see standard 3.2).

The institution is conducting research/surveys with graduates and employers to modify programs in accordance with the feedback from the abovementioned parties. The panel considers that more connection between the graduates and the institution is preferable, as well as more involvement of the graduates in the self-evaluation process.

NDA collaborates with Western military institutions, which provides Junkers with an opportunity to participate in short-term/long-term exchange programs and obtain new experiences from the military schools of leading NATO countries. Junkers are mostly receiving information about exchange programs from Ilias and Moodle platforms. During the interview, the panel was informed that currently, the institution has 5 incoming students from the University of North Georgia. In the surveys taken by the graduates, both – BA and MA graduates (especially – MA) recommend that exchange programs should be intensified.

Each year, the institution hosts an international week in which military academies from several countries (Canada, the United States, Norway, Sweden, France, Federal Republic of Germany, Lithuania, Latvia, Estonia, Romania, Turkey, Azerbaijan, and Armenia) regularly participate.

Junkers confirmed at the interview conducted by the panel that they are involved in the various conferences. To ensure students' motivation and their further involvement in the conferences the institution awards students for successful participation in the conference.

As for the scientific research projects, in the first place, it should be mentioned that the institution has a Scientific Research Center which is staffed with professionals and conducts a variety of research. Nonetheless, students are barely involved in the research projects. It should be noted that the members of the Scientific Research Center express their desire and readiness to involve both – BA and MA – students in research. The panel's evaluation of the low involvement of students in research is based not only on the results of interviews with the Junkers but also on interviews with academic personnel, and personnel of the Scientific Research Center. Although the document about "implemented, ongoing and/or planned scientific research projects" suggested the involvement of the Junkers in several research projects (in general and not by specifying the name and surname of the involved student), this fact was not confirmed in the above-mentioned interviews.

NDA supports students' initiatives regarding additional activities, such as art, sports, etc. For example, the academy has a dramatic circle, a music band (which is provided with a space for rehearsal and necessary equipment), in addition to the mandatory sports component, Junkers can choose to engage in other sports activities: basketball, football, volleyball, rugby, mini-football, wrestling, boxing. The institution has developed infrastructure and proper equipment for these activities. Moreover, NDA frequently hosts indoor championships in different kinds of sports. The

institution also organizes local and international summer schools, public lectures and seminars, and other relevant activities to provide Junkers with various experiences and possibilities to develop.

The institution addresses the necessities of the low SES students and has relevant mechanisms to support them. First and foremost, at NDA Junkers have a unique possibility to be fully funded by the Ministry of Defence of Georgia, which means that studying at the academy is tuition-free for all students (Both – BA and MA students). Moreover, the institution provides scholarships to all Junkers as well as to the successful Junkers. All Junkers are awarded a fixed scholarship – monthly 200 GEL. Additional scholarships are awarded to the students with high grades (high academic performance, leadership, and PT standards).

Based on the order of the Minister of Defence of Georgia, the Criteria and scope of the scholarship award are as follows:

- A+ (95-100 point + PT 100 point) – 300 GEL + 200 GEL fixed
- A (91-94 point+ PT 90 point) – 200 GEL+ 200 GEL fixed
- B (81-90 point + PT 80 point) – 100 GEL+ 200 GEL fixed

The academy has set an additional 200 GEL for students in the long-term exchange program. Junkers enrolled in the Georgian Language Training program are also awarded a monthly scholarship of GEL 200 during a full calendar year until the end of the program.

In addition to the aforementioned scholarship, the Junkers are also awarded scholarships sponsored by another institution, the same institution, or other nominal scholarships. For example, the Academy has approved the rules for obtaining a scholarship named after Donald Rumsfeld. In accordance with the defined criteria, the Junker will be awarded an additional scholarship (in the amount of 100; 200 or 300 GEL).

According to the interviews with Junkers and the personnel of the academy, during the distance learning period, the institution provided computers to all students. For the students who didn't have access to the internet, NDA also provided packages of internet to ensure the continuity of the distance learning process. Academy also funds the other necessities of low SES students (such as providing family members with medicines or food, funds for parents' surgery, etc.)

The institution also uses the following forms of encouragement for cadets of the academy (which is implemented by the Resolution 124 of the Government of Georgia of March 17, 2016, on the "Military Disciplinary Charter of the Military Servicemen of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia"):

- Expressing gratitude
- Certificate of honor
- Valuable gift
- Cash reward
- Short-term leave

The institution has also implemented various forms of incentives for the encouragement of the MA Junker (civilian person), for high academic achievement, graduation with honors, cultural and scientific activities, etc.

Evidences/indicators
- Loading of academic/invited personnel – Annex N 4.2.1;
- Topics of consultation meetings with Junkers- Annex N 5.3;
- Consulting schedules – Annex N 5.6;
- Memoranda - Annex N 7.1.1;
- List of conferences - Annex N 6.1.6;

- Results of a Junker survey conducted by the Academy – Annex N 2.2.3;
- Graduates research about career and academic development – Annex N 2.2.3;
- Implemented activities, projects and Junker initiatives – Annex N 5.5;
- Implemented internship and practical working projects – Annex N 5.7;
- Tools to support socially vulnerable Junkers – Annex N 5.2;
- Scholarship for the Junkers of the Georgian Language Training educational program – Annex N 5.8;
- Self-evaluation report of NDA;
- Site visit interview results;
- Website – www.eta.edu.ge.

Recommendations:
- Both BA and MA (especially – MA) students should be involved in the scientific research projects;
- A career development center / unit should be established to diversify and strengthen career support measures and employment opportunities, especially in the civil sector;
- International exchange programs should be intensified and improved, particularly for MA students.

Suggestions:
- It is preferable for the academy to maintain a better connection with the graduates and involve them more in the self-evaluation processes.

Best Practices (if applicable):

> NDA has developed a lot of activities to increase the attractivity of the teaching and the level of students: summer schools, exchange programs, scholarships, free-of-charge tuition, campus accommodation, excellent infrastructure.

Evaluation

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

6. Research, development and/or other creative work

Higher Education Institution, considering its type and specifics of field(s), works on the strengthening of its research function, ensures proper conditions to support research activities and improve the quality of research activities

6.1 Research Activities
o HEI, based on its type and specifics of its fields, carries out research/creative activities.
o Ensuring the effectiveness of doctoral research supervision
o HEI has public, transparent and fair procedures for the assessment and defense of dissertations which are relevant to the specifics of the field

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Currently NDA has the status of a teaching university and therefore does not implement third-level higher education programs. Therefore, there are not presented regulations for doctoral programs.

NDA implements BA and MA programs, what requires from the institution to support research at place, and strengthening Scientific research is set as a goal in the strategic plan (7 years) and in the action plan (3 years).

To support scientific-research activities NDA established Scientific Research Center in 2018, which is a structural unit of the National Defence Academy. In SER is given that "The reason for the establishment of the Scientific Research Center was the creation of a structure in the Defence Forces that would study in a scientific context and analyze the existing threats and political and military challenges at the strategic level" In the action plan, which is developed separately by the Center, there are several objectives:

- To support scientific research activities and young scientists;
- to organize conferences;
- to implement joint research with local and international institutions;
- to support academic personnel participation in conferences;
- to find research grant competitions for academic personnel;
- to organize consultations and training for the staff of the Academy on issues related to scientific activities.

The center has full-time positions for three chief scientists. Since 2018 main activities organized by the Center are local, military and international conferences. In the presented documents the panel saw a list of research activities implemented by the academic personnel or chief scientists, thirteen ongoing researches, seven completed and several planned. In this document is indicated that Junkers were involved in several researches, however during the interviews it was clear that Junkers have not participated in these activities so far, but they actively participate in conferences organized by the Research Center. NDA implements MA programs in defense Analysis, State resources management, Security Studies, it is very important to support Junkers to participate in the research activities more actively.

Educational programs curriculums include research methods with relevant academic hours and teaching material. Instructions for completing MA thesis, which includes duties and responsibilities of MA paper supervisor are available. During the site visit students mentioned that they are provided systematic consultations from their supervisors in the process of writing MA research.

Based on meetings with students and academic staff, the Center defines which directions are priorities for the institution. The main research priorities are field specific: national security, defence analysis, more topics form political science and international affairs.

In SER we read that NDA intends to encourage academic personnel to be more active towards research projects. All implemented research work at the academy contributes to the development of educational programs. The evidence is a long list of conferences held in NDA where the majority of participants are Junkers.

NDA has the rule of workload of the academic personnel, based on which the staff is required to carry out scientific/research work, which may be expressed in the following activities:

- Development/translation of a scientific paper, monograph or textbook on behalf of the Academy;
- Preparation of a Junker for a scientific conference;
- organization of a scientific conference on behalf of the Academy;

- publication of a scientific paper on behalf of the academy;
- implementation of a research project, participation in a research project;
- review of an article for the scientific journal of the Academy.

Academic personnel are affiliated with NDA, therefore all the scientific activities carried out by them are carried out on behalf of the Academy. As for the scientific personnel, they are the staff of the Scientific Research Center, who carry out/facilitate the conduct of scientific research on behalf of the Academy. In addition, the scientific staff is involved in the educational process in terms of conducting lectures-seminars. The scientific activity of the academic and scientific personnel of the Academy is reflected in the appendices of the self-assessment. However, the works of those personnel who are affiliated in different institutions could not be presented in this list.

The Scientific Research Centre should consider that translation, preparing textbooks or organizing a conference is not considered as a research activity. Academic personnel should be more oriented on publishing academic articles and participate in research projects.

As an action plan of the scientific Research Center covers the period of 2021-2023, it is understandable that pandemic in reality delayed many processes in the country, however the Center should become a more active unit regarding meeting strategic goals of NDA.

Evidences/indicators
- Self-evaluation report;
- MA paper instructions, Annex N 3.2.7
- Site visit interviews;
- Rule for planning, implementation and evaluation of the research component - Annex N 6.1.8.
- 7-year strategic and 3-year action plans of NDA - Annex N 1.1.
- 2022-2023 action plan developed by the Scientific-Research Center - Annex N 6.1.2
- Memorandums Annex N 7.1.1.
- Regulations of the Scientific Research Center- Annex N 2.1.11
- Scientific activity of the academic and scientific personnel of the Academy- Annex N 6.1.4.
- Rules for workload of academic personnel - Annex N 4.2.1.
- Implemented, ongoing and/or planned scientific research projects - Annex N 6.1.1.
- Collection of conferences and scientific papers - Annex N 6.1.5

Recommendations:
- NDA needs to have a strong policy for development of the research capacity of the institution.

Suggestions:
- The Research Center should attract more partners and implement joint research projects;
- Research ethics should be developed and documented.

Best Practices (if applicable):
Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard ☐ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☒ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

6.2. Research Support and Internationalization

- o HEI has an effective system in place for supporting research, development and creative activities
- o Attracting new staff and their involvement in research/arts-creative activities.
- o University works on internationalization of research, development and creative activities.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

As noted, to support research activities, a Scientific Research Center has been established at the Academy, whose main function is to support research activities. According to the Regulations the key responsibility of the Center is "to encourage the growth of the research potential of the Academic Staff and the Invited Personnel as well as Junkers and enhance the prestige of their scientific career". The Center signed memorandums with 25 institutions for establishing new scientific contacts. The Research Center organized information about donor organizations, that provide research grants and promotes the dissemination of this information among personnel, organizes conferences at local and international level etc. In addition, NDA owns the necessary facilities for research, that are laboratories of physics, chemistry, aero hydraulics, mechanical engineering, and electrical conductivity.

Research Center developed a separate action plan where we found two strategic goals:

1. Supporting scientific activities, with three objectives:

a) Supporting research activities;

b) Supporting young scientists;

c) Conducting joint research with international partner universities and centres.

2. Raising awareness about NDA among scientific circles - objectives are:

a) Increase the number of partner organizations;

b) Organize conferences;

c) Support academic staff participating in international conferences.

During the site visit the head of the Center mentioned that they have become more active this year 2022, as pandemic postponed planned projects.

The main priorities of the Center were defined together with academic personnel and with the help of NATO DEEP representatives. In SER is given research priorities for BA, MA programs.

The Center developed regulations of providing internal grants for research activities of academic personnel. The panel's advice will be to develop precise indicators for evaluating research projects in case there is a contest of proposals. During the site visit it was revealed that some research projects got internal funding, however it was more of the top management's will than the procedure implemented by the research Center. In SWOT analysis NDA placed "scarce funding for research" as an opportunity. It is definitely a weakness and it should be corrected.

Obligation of academic personnel for being involved in Scientific research is documented with workload regulations.

During the site visit interviews researchers presented the idea of a comprehensive research about "Total Defence", which will greatly benefit the analysis of the current situation of Georgia and developing better security strategy of the country.

In SER NDA indicates that regarding research activities the institution is falling behind, hence it is planning to be more active in this direction. Besides, the institution should realize that in the research activities, there could not be presented researches of those personnel who are affiliated in different institutions.

There is no methodology given how NDA defines its research priorities. There are no ethical regulations for research activities. The NDA should draft and adopt formal procedures regarding the ethics in research and ensure that all its internal stakeholders conduct their activities in line with these (such as signed consent forms for all human subjects, ensuring confidentiality of research data, etc.), scientific Research Center could be a unit which will bear responsibility for following these procedures. In addition, NDA has its own printing facilities and provides an opportunity for academic staff to publish their work.

Evidences/indicators

- Regulations of the Scientific-Research Center - Annex N 2.1.11.
- Rule for planning, implementation and evaluation of the research component - Annex N 6.1.8.
- List of grant projects - Annex N 6.1.7.
- Information on implemented and planned conferences - Annex N 6.1.6.
- Compendium of conferences and scientific papers - Annex N 6.1.5.
- List of books published on behalf of the Academy - Annex N 6.1.5
- Regulation for providing grants for scientific research projects - Annex N 6.1.9.
- Support to the planning, acquisition and implementation of grant projects by the staff - Annex N 6.1.9.
- Scientific-Research Center Action Plan (2022-2023) - Annex N 6.1.2.
- Memorandums - Annex N 7.1.1.
- Report on the research conducted (taking into account the affiliation of the academic staff) – Annex N 6.1.4.

Recommendations:

- NDA should reinforce coherent implementation of the research strategy;

Suggestions:

- NDA should make the process of internationalization systematic;
- NDA should announce internal grant contest at least twice a year and develop transparent and fair indicators for assessment of the research proposals
- In SWOT analysis NDA should place "scarce funding for research" in the weakness instead of an opportunity.

Best Practices (if applicable):
Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☐ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☒ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

6.3. Evaluation of Research Activities

HEI has a system for evaluating and analysing the quality of research/creative-arts activities, and the productivity of scientific-research units and academic/scientific staff.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

NDA developed the document "Rules for planning, implementation and evaluation of the scientific-research component", which describes the indicators for the evaluation of the scientific-research productivity of the academic and scientific staff:

- Scientific publications in Georgia and abroad;
- Scientific publications in publications with impact factor;
- Research grants;
- Participation in scientific conferences;
- Published textbooks and monographs;
- Number of citations.

In addition, the Academic Staff of NDA, based on the Civilian Staff Evaluation Manual, completes a self-assessment document, which is submitted to the head of the relevant educational unit, who in turn evaluates the academic staff together with the Deputy Rector. At the end of each semester, the academic staff submits a written self-assessment of the individual workload to the Civil Education Department of the G3-G2 Service of the Academy Headquarters, which contains information on the scientific-research activities too. This information is processed by the Civic Training Department of the G3-G2 Service of the Academy Headquarters and the Quality Assurance Service.

NDA has an attestation procedure for professors, supplemented with a form of self-assessment of individual's educational and research activities. According to this rule, the professor submits an annual self-assessment report at the end of the year, which provides information on his / her professional, academic and scientific activities and achievements in the current year, participation in conferences, publishing articles, obtained local or international grants, the Junker supervision and other activities. Through the self-assessment report, the professor should describe and evaluate the educational activities he / she has carried out during the year and provide specific information about the research activities he / she has carried out during the reporting period. The above-mentioned self-assessment is submitted by the academic staff of the Academy to the attestation commission, which evaluates them on the basis of pre-defined criteria. This data is used by NDA for further development of academic personnel and research through the institution.

Scientific Research Center reports to the Rector of NDA and regularly submits information on the implemented and planned scientific activities to him. The staff of the Scientific Research Center, in accordance with the rules established in NDA, on the basis of the Academy's Civilian Staff Assessment Manual, conduct self-assessment and are also evaluated by their Head and the Rector of the Academy.

The panel recognizes that NDA has set and formalized evaluation for scientific research performance and academic staff follow these instructions, but this approach is quite general, as research activities should be evaluated with measurable criteria and coefficients assigned to each activity.

Scientific productivity of the personal could be determined by the number of academic papers, with the impact of papers on science development, and the impact of scientific activeness on the development of the society etc.

In response to the NDA's argumentative position on Standard 6:

The panel mentioned that organizing conferences, translation and textbook development is not sufficient for developing research activities. Academic personnel should be more oriented on conducting research, publishing academic articles and participate in research projects.

NDA must develop regulations for providing internal research grants, which will include indicators for evaluating research proposals.

The panel appreciates motivation of the institution to be developed however potential and motivation could not serve as a background for the evaluation process of authorization.

Evidences/indicators
- Regulations for planning, implementation and evaluation of the scientific-research component - Annex N 6.1.8
- Rules for evaluation of educational and scientific research work - Annex N 2.2.2.
- Evaluation Results - Annex 4.1.7
- www.eta.edu.ge
- Professor attestation rule - Annex N 4.1.7.
- Self-evaluation report of NDA;
- Site visit interview results.

Recommendations:
- NDA should develop measurable criteria for evaluation of scientific productivity of academic personnel.

Suggestions:
Non-binding suggestions for further development

Best Practices (if applicable):
Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☐ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☒ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

7. Material, Information and Financial Resources
Material, information and financial resources of HEI ensure sustainable, stable, effective and efficient functioning of the institution, and the achievement of goals defined through strategic development plan.

7.1 Material Resources
- The NDA possesses or owns material resources (fixed and current assets) that are used for achieving goals stated in the mission statement, adequately responds to the requirements of educational programmes or research activities, and corresponds to the existing number of students and planned enrolment.
- NDA offers environment necessary for implementing educational activities: sanitary units, natural light possibilities, and central heating system.
- Health and safety of students and staff is protected within the institution.

o   NDA has adapted environment for people with special needs

The Academy is located in Gori and has modern infrastructure and equipment.

Based on the Law of Georgia on „Defence of Georgia", the Academy performs specific military duties and tasks on the territory of Academy, therefore, besides the training and other areas, there are facilities and infrastructure for the performance of military tasks and they are exploited for the performance of tasks assigned to the Academy by the Ministry of Defence. Thus, they were taken out from the authorization process.

The Academy consist of the following buildings: the undergraduate and graduate buildings, the battalion headquarters, dormitories, library, examination center, gym, conference hall and training hall. As per self –evaluation report it is noted that the educational area of the institution is 6.596 sq. m and the supporting area is 10.818.1 sq. m. though it was impossible to check the documentation from Public Registry due to the lack of special permission from the Ministry of Defence (Certificate N2).

The following areas are located in the training buildings: foyer, theoretical training classrooms, administrative storerooms, space for group work, sanitary facilities, laboratories relevant to the specifics of the field, work rooms for academic/invited staff. The layout of the storerooms in the educational buildings ensures the effective management of the educational and administrative process.

All buildings are equipped with fire-fighting equipment which is valid and were updated in September 2021. Next check is due in September 2022.

Also, all buildings have an evacuation plan which is well noted but they are only in Georgian language. As the NDA is cooperating with foreign Institutions and hosts lot of foreign guest as well as foreign students involved in exchange programmes it is suggested to have an evacuation plan also in English in case of emergency to facilitate evacuation of foreigners.

Most buildings have emergency exit and evacuation signs though some buildings still lack it. It is necessary to place evacuation signs in all buildings. Also, almost all buildings have emergency exit except examination Center , hospital and gym. It is recommended to have evacuation doors in all buildings.

Fire Safety Plan is approved by the Rector of the Academy (18.06.2021) and Safety Rules and Actions in case of fire is also approved by the Rector of Academy (21.01.2021). Based on the Ordinance of the Government of Georgia N519 dated 20 August 2020 on Approval the Charter of Internal Military Forces of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia, art.113, par.3 all units shall have fire safety plan which shall be approved by the Head of the Unit.

All buildings have an entrance for persons with disabilities though there is no adapted space for them. There are no lifts or any other equipment ensuring that Junker has the opportunity to attend lectures. Only gym with swimming pool is equipped with lift and is well arranged.

The representatives of the Academy insist that they don't have persons with disabilities and they don't accept students with disabilities due to the specific nature of the institution but there is a possibility to have a lecture or even Junker with temporary disability where their study process should not be interrupted by lack of the facility.

There is a good parking space outside the territory of the Academy also on the territory but there is no parking place for the persons with disabilities.

It should be noted that all classrooms are equipped with necessary resources for conducting lectures (tables, chairs, projector, board, heating, air conditioning etc.), some auditoriums have smart boards and TV. There is one auditorium for innovations where they are planning to teach the usage of drones and innovative equipment.

However, in all classrooms there are placed video cameras and video monitoring is conducted during the lectures that is in contradiction with Law of Georgia on Protection of Personal Information where the Article 12 states that video monitoring should be conducted for the purpose of testing/examination. Paragraph 3 of this article states that video monitoring can be conducted in exceptional cases where there is a risk for person's safety, property or for examination reasons. In this case all involved persons should be informed by written notice and everywhere where video monitoring is conducted should be placed special signs.

In the Hospital of the Academy there are rooms for patients where 2 patients could be placed, and the room is well equipped with all necessary facilities. Besides that, there are separate isolated rooms for

patients with infection to avoid infecting the others. For the time of the visit there was one patient in the isolated room. The hospital also has own surgery room for conducting light manipulations, emergency room and dental treatment room. All rooms are well equipped with necessary equipment and all medicaments in the special box are listed and valid. Surgery and dental room have their own sterilization room which ensures the sterilization of the instruments. Emergency room has special emergency kits for providing immediate help. There is always at least one doctor on duty who can provide the needed help.

The Archive is temporarily located in one of the spaces apart from the main buildings because of the repairment works in the Archive. There is one person responsible for keeping the documents in a good order. The store is not fit for archiving documents as there is not enough space for that. There are kept documents since 1991 in physical form. The documents since 1993 documents proving acceptance, graduation and change of the position are in electronic format though there is no list of documents or any database facilitating the search procedure of information of any of the Cadets/Junkers.

As during the interview was mentioned the Archive will be moved to the renewed building till September.

Evidences/indicators

- Documents proving the ownership of movable property
- Receipts confirming the payment of natural gas
- Document certifying compliance with sanitary norms
- Fire safety, medical assistance and order protection mechanisms
- Sanitary inspection plan (sanitary monitoring, disinfection, laboratory inspection of drinking water and swimming water are carried out according to the approved plan)
- Practice /Contract concluded with a research-scientific object
- Results of the survey of the Junkers and staff conducted by the Academy
- Document certifying the proper operation of the heating and ventilation system and term of operation -Document confirming the approval of evacuation plans
- Statute of the Security Division of the G3 / G2Headquarters / Function of the Head of the Division Duties Function and responsibilities of the head of the hospital
- Documentation of fire and medical equipment, security cameras (inventory protocol)
- Conclusions: On the safety of the building, on fire safety Adapted environment - https://eta.edu.ge/360/

Recommendations:

1. It is necessary to place evacuation signs in all buildings.

2. Emergency exits should be placed in all buildings

3. The Archive should be renewed timely for ensuring normal placement of documents and operation of databases.

4. Fire Safety Plan should be approved by Emergency Management Service of Georgia.

5. All buildings as well as parking space should be adapted to the persons with disabilities.

6. Academy should either stop video monitoring of lectures or in case of provement of exceptional situation should inform all students and personnel about that and request the signature of acknowledgment of this and should place special signs everywhere where the video monitoring is conducted.

Suggestions:

Evacuation plan should be in Georgian and in English

Best Practices (if applicable):

NDA has very well-developed accommodation, hospital, recreational and sport facilities.

Evaluation

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.2. Library Resources

Library environment, resources and service support effective implementation of educational and research activities, and HEI constantly works for its improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The Library of the Academy is in conformity with the needs of the students. All literature mentioned in syllabi was in place. There were lot of material resources which are in compliance with teaching process. Besides the learning material there is a good literature (fiction) which can help Junkers to broaden their knowledge. Apart of that, during the interview, it appeared that all Junkers are given a personal portative computer where is downloaded all programs to access the different libraries.

The library of the Academy includes a printing house, which is also actively involved in the continuous process of learning. It issues educational materials, prints textbooks, lecture materials, readers or other educational materials, etc. The library of the Academy also includes translation services, which is responsible for translating documents, textbooks, readers, diplomas and other resources required for the educational process from Georgian to English and vice versa.

NDA has access to the following electronic resources:

- Cambridge Journals Online
- e-Duke Journals Scholarly Collection
- Edward Elgar Publishing Journals and Development Studies e-books
- Edward Elgar Publishing Journals
- European Respiratory Journal
- IMechE Journals
- Mathematical Sciences Publishers Journals
- Openedition Journals
- Royal Society Journals Collection
- SAGE Journals

Library resources are provided by the Ministry of Defence and also some resources are purchased by Academy itself. Some books are outdated and it would be nice to update them.

The personnel of the Library have relevant competencies. They are constantly involved in professional development activities such as digital cataloging, electronic circulation, Elsevier database usage, etc.

The librarian has access to the electronic resources and all legislative acts are downloaded in her computer. In case of request she can provide Junker/Cadet with the relevant information. But for the time of audit on request to show the legislative act the librarian showed an outdated act regulating the work of the Military Forces. As librarian has no access to the legislative Herald of Georgia and during the interview it appeared that only legal department has the access, it is necessary that legal department has the procedure to control the validity of legal acts related to the activity of NDA and supply the Library with updated information systematically.

Library has no space adapted to the persons with special needs/disabilities as they refer that they don't have this kind of personnel though it should be provided the space for that.

Library has no evacuation exits and signs. It is recommended to ensure library with emergency exits and special relevant signs should be placed.

Evidences/indicators

1. Library's regulation
2. Documents confirming the fact of possessing books' funds
3. An electronic catalogue - www.eta.edu.ge
4. The documents confirming an involvement in the international electronic library
5. Document confirming the possession of technology available in the library
6. Statistics related to the usage of library's electronic data
7. Tools to renovate and develop resources and services in the library
8. Instructions and regulations concerned with the usage of the library
9. Results of inquiries and interviews held by the Academy
10. Dynamics of library's resources development within the period of 5 years-Annex N 7.2.3.

Recommendations:

1. Librarian and all responsible person should receive up–to-date legislation or be granted the access to the database for ensuring the provision of students with updated versions of legislation.

Suggestions:

Non-binding suggestions for further development

Best Practices (if applicable):

Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.3 Information Resources

- o HEI has created infrastructure for information technologies and its administration and accessibility are ensured
- o Electronic services and electronic management systems are implemented and mechanisms for their constant improvement are in place
- o HEI ensures business continuity
- o HEI has a functional web-page in Georgian and English languages.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The Academy has an information technology infrastructure which is administered by G-6 service unit. Headquarters' services are responsible for the support and supervision of computer technology, programs and functioning of the Internet. The Academy council establishes the policy of controlling information technology innovations which helps to regulate all the procedures with information systems and electronic services and ensures their development.

The Academy has permanent and uninterruptible Internet access. In all classrooms is available Internet network, programming assistance. There is also an examination center, which ensures transparent and effective examination process. The system has the ability, in case of appeal to log whole examination process in order to issue objective decision. Academy has a computer-based library, Cisco programming and networks laboratories, physics, chemistry and electronic laboratories, projectors and smartboards that are installed in the classrooms. G-6 service takes into account the requirement of modern, educational programs and renovated computer classes, laboratories and other spaces. The Academy provides every Junker with a personal computer, where G-6 is responsible for computer service and updates. Laptops are granted to the Junker's to their personal possession. Also, all technical assistance including uploading relevant programs and databases is ensured by the Academy.

The Academy has internet access, both Wi-Fi and wired to provide all kinds of Internet, in the Academy area. The Academy's inner network is managed by the Ministry of Defence servers from the static range, on the other hand, in wireless network with IP addresses are written in routers, which produces the address automatically. Correspondents who use a global network have access to the restricted number of websites categories. Consumers are included into the Defence Ministry domain. A G-6 service chief specialist supervises the full functioning of the network and backup of servers takes place as in G-6 where there is a special server's room in compliance with the standards, also the backup of servers is made on the Ministry of Defence's servers.

The Academy has a website where is placed the whole information about the Academy's administration and personnel, organization structure, vacancies, education programs, library, strategic and regulatory documents, normative and legislative acts, etc. The website is in Georgian and in English. The information placed on the website provides the full picture of the activity of the Academy. The technical assistance of the website is supported by the Ministry of Defence.

Academy has well-developed learning process. The ILIAS programme is used for managing the study process. The system provides Junkers with necessary resources including course syllabus, information about exchange programs, law documents and regulations, examination schedules, education programs, a school year plan, a scholarship criteria, electronic literature, and other important information. Student who study on baccalaureate has access to the ILIAS program and they get the whole information through this platform. Student who are on Master's programme have access to the MOODLE programme and get all necessary information through this platform.

Also, besides the ILIAS system, where lectures upload all necessary information for students, personnel has it's own internal network (e-flow) which is linked to the Ministry of Defence where all notices and necessary information is sent to them through this platform and also is backed up on their private emails.

Evidences/indicators

1. Information Technology Management Policies and Procedures, Information Technology Infrastructure
2. Regulation of the Distance Learning Center
3. Concept of distance learning center
4. The statute of the G-6 Service of the Academy staff
5. Agreement with the internet providers
6. Domain, documentation of hosting ownership
7. Contract /acceptance of delivery contract with all purchased services (turnitin, etc)
8. Functions and responsibilities of the person responsible for the administration of the HEI website
9. Emod administration rule
10. Management rule of the computer security incident
11. Mechanisms for the development of electronic services and electronic management systems
12. Website www.eta.edu.ge
13. Interview with personnel and students
14. Checking on place.

Recommendations:

Recommendation/or proposal, which should be considered by the institution to comply with requirements of the standards

Suggestions:

Non-binding suggestions for further development

Best Practices (if applicable):

Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation
Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard
☒ Fully complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.4 Financial Resources

- o Allocation of financial resources described in the budget of HEI is economically achievable
- o Financial standing of HEI ensures performance of activities described in strategic and mid-term action plans
- o HEI financial resources are focused on effective implementation of core activities of the institution
- o HEI budget provides funding for scientific research and library functioning and development
- o HEI has an effective system of accountability, financial management and control

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The Academy represents a legal entity of public law of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia. According to the Law of Georgia on the State Budget of the country, the Academy is a sub -program of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia (29 02 02 –Military Education) the main source of funding of it is the state budget allocations.

The source of funding of the Academy can be the following:

a) Target funds allocated from the relevant budget.

b) Revenues received from grants

c) Income received from the work performed on the bases of the agreement.

d) Donations.

e) Other revenues permitted by the law.

The Deputy Rector – Chief of staff of the Academy is responsible for the financial-economic relations of the Academy and the activities carried out by them, he is also responsible for the legality and efficiency of the financial and economic activities. The allocation of financial resources provided by the budget of the Academy is achievable for continuing learning process. The resources available for the program meet the program requirements.

The budget of the Academy is compiled in accordance with the needs of the Academy and considers goals and objectives of the strategic development plan and the action plan. The heads of the structural units of the Academy participate in compiling the budget. They submit the information about the requirements to the G-4 Service of the Academy Headquarters and the Finance Management Division, which, based on the information received and will define the project of the budget in accordance with the priorities.

The budget includes remuneration of existing academic, administrative and support stuff, funding of staff qualification development activities, funding of research projects, funding of short-term and long-term exchange programs, purchase of literature and all necessary equipment for laboratories as well as for medical care. It also includes the funding for participation in conferences and workshops. The Academy has set up a commission to review incoming correspondence on social, medical and financial assistance to the Academy staff, which will consider among other subjects, the assistance of socially vulnerable Junkers. From January 1, 2019 to December 15, 2021, one-time financial assistance total amount of GEL 8584 was issued to socially vulnerable Junkers.

The Academy monthly pays for the consumed natural gas on the basis of receipts and invoices. The cost of electricity consumed by the Academy on a monthly basis is paid by the Ministry of Defence, while the water for the Academy is supplied from the artesian well.

The Academy submits an annual financial report to the Ministry of Defence of Georgia. Also, the Ministry of Defence receives information quarterly about the number of employees and some administrative expenses.

The budget of the Academy provides funding for scientific research in particular: organizing scientific conferences, printing textbooks for the academic staff, as well as the expenses for enhancing the qualification of the staff and financing business trips, etc.

The Ministry of Defence of Georgia ensures the examination of financial reports submitted by the Academy by authorized (certified or accredited) auditors and the preparation of a relevant report. The conclusions drawn up by authorized (certified or accredited) auditors on the annual financial statements are kept (in material form) in the Finance Management Division.

Evidences/indicators

1.Academy Budget 2021

2.Budget 2022

3.Charter of the Academy

4.Dynamics of planned finances of previous years

5. Conclusions of auditing companies

5. Financial Management and Control System implementation document

Recommendations:

Proposal(s), which should be considered by the institution to comply with requirements of the standard component

Suggestions:

Non-binding suggestions for further development

Best Practices (if applicable):

Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation

Please mark the checkbox, which best describes the HEI's compliance with this specific component of the standard

☒ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements