

Accreditation Report

**Zhetysu University named after I. Zhansugurov
Taldykorgan, Republic of Kazakhstan**

„Jurisprudence“ (Bachelor of Law/ Master of Law/ Master of Legal Sciences), „Economics“ (Bachelor of Economics and Business/Master of Business and Management/Master of Economic Sciences), „Accounting and Audit“ (Bachelor of Business and Management/ Master of Business and Management/Master of Economic Sciences), „Finance“ (Bachelor of Business and Management/ Master of Business and Management/Master of Economic Sciences), „State and Local Governance“ (Bachelor of Business and Management/ Master of Business Management/Master of Economic Sciences)

I Procedure

Initial accreditation of the study programmes: on 31 March 2015 by ACQUIN until 30.09.2020: temporary accreditation until 30.09.2021

Date of contract: 22 May 2019

Date of the submission of self-assessment report: 14 December 2020

Date of online visit: 21-23 April 2021

Attendance by ACQUIN office: Dr. Lyazzat Nugumanova

Accreditation decision: 28 June 2021

Peer review experts:

- **Prof. Dr. Alisher Aldashev**, Satbayev University, Professor of Economics
- **Professor Zhanat Z. Alimanov**, KIMEP University, School of Law, Professor of Law
- **Prof. Dr. rer. pol. Dr. h.c. mult. H.-Christian Brauweiler**, WHZ Westsächsische Hochschule Zwickau, Business Administration, Management Accounting & Internal Auditing
- **Prof. Dr. Stefan Handke**, HTW Dresden - University of Applied Sciences, Professor of Public Management

- **Prof. Dr. Dr. h.c. Andreas Knorr**, German University of Administrative Sciences Speyer, Professor of Economics
- **Prof. Dr. Mathias Moersch**, Hochschule Heilbronn, Professor of Financial Economics
- **Prof. Dr. Thomas Schomerus**, University of Lueneburg, Professor of Public Law, in particular Energy and Environmental Law
- **Prof. Dr. Carola Spiecker-Lampe**, Hochschule Bremen, City University of Applied Sciences, Professor of Business Administration, Financial Economics and International Management
- **Aizhan Nasibullina**, Business Trainer, Director TOO NSB Technology
- **Lina Irscheid**, Law Student (Bachelor of Law), University of Potsdam

The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of study programmes, lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the “Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area” (ESG) in the current official version. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of study programmes, are taken into account.

Content

I	Procedure	1
II	Introduction	6
1	Short profile of HEI.....	6
2	General information on the study programmes.....	7
3	Results of the previous accreditation.....	7
III	Implementation and assessment of the criteria	9
1	ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance	9
1.1	Implementation	9
1.2	Assessment	11
1.3	Conclusion	12
2	ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes.....	12
2.1	Implementation	12
2.2	Assessment	17
2.3	Conclusion	29
3	ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment	29
3.1	Implementation	30
3.2	Assessment	31
3.3	Conclusion	32
4	ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification	33
4.1	Implementation	33
4.2	Assessment	34
4.3	Conclusion	35
5	ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff.....	35
5.1	Implementation	35
5.2	Assessment	37
5.3	Conclusion	37
6	ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support.....	37
6.1	Implementation	37
6.2	Assessment	39
6.3	Conclusion	40
7	ESG Standard 1.7: Information management.....	40
7.1	Implementation	41
7.2	Assessment	41
7.3	Conclusion	42
8	ESG Standard 1.8: Public information	42
8.1	Implementation	42
8.2	Assessment	43
8.3	Conclusion	43
9	ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes	43
9.1	Implementation	43

9.2	Assessment	44
9.3	Conclusion	45
10	ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance	45
10.1	Implementation	45
10.2	Assessment	45
10.3	Conclusion	46
IV	Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN.....	47
1	Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version	47
2	Accreditation Recommendation	49
V	Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN.....	51
1	Accreditation Decision.....	51
2	Fulfilment of conditions	56

II Introduction

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of the study programmes, study programmes coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure. In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are taken into account.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programmes.

1 Short profile of HEI

Zhetysu University named after Ilyas Zhansugurov (ZhSU) is a large regional university that combines classical principles with modern educational programmes. The university is developing as a multidisciplinary innovation-oriented Smart-university in the areas of education, science and upbringing.

The structure of the university includes a research institute for issues of biotechnology, 7 faculties (Faculty of Natural Sciences, Faculty of Physical Culture and Art, Faculty of Law and Economics, Faculty of Pedagogy and Psychology, Faculty of Humanities and Technical Faculty), 22 departments, a college, a scientific and educational center "Rukhani zhagyru", StartUp Academy ZhGU, a scientific and practical center "Iliyastanu", an office for the commercialization of research results and an IT center.

Currently, the university has 60 cooperation agreements with foreign universities and organizations in the field of joint scientific research, academic exchanges of students and teachers and joint implementation of educational programs and scientific projects.

Educational and educational and research processes at ZhSU are provided by highly qualified scientific and pedagogical personnel, the total number of teaching staff is 281 people, incl. 22 doctors of sciences, 103 candidates of sciences, 21 doctors of PhD, 144 masters, 18 professors, 48 associate professors.

2 General information on the study programmes

The educational programmes in this cluster are offered by the faculty of Law and Economics. The faculty includes 6 departments: civil law disciplines, public law disciplines, economics and service, accounting and finance, criminal law disciplines and state and local management.

The faculty comprises of 81 teachers, including 10 doctors of science, 23 candidates of science, 11 PhDs and 37 master's graduates.

The standard study duration of bachelor's programmes are 8 semesters (4 years). Students must complete 240 ECTS credits to graduate.

Master study programmes are offered in two directions: profile and scientific and pedagogical. The standard duration of the profile direction is one year or two semesters and encompasses 60 ECTS credits. The scientific and pedagogical profile encompasses 120 ECTS credits, which is equivalent of a study period of 2 years or 4 semesters.

In both bachelor's and master's programmes students can study on a competitive state grant or on a tuition basis.

3 Results of the previous accreditation

The study programmes „Jurisprudence“ (Bachelor/ Master), „Economics“ (Bachelor/Master), „Accounting and Audit“ (Bachelor/ Master), „Finance“ (Bachelor/ Master), „State and Local Governance“ (Bachelor/ Master) were examined and accredited by the accreditation agency ACQUIN for the first time in 2015 without any conditions:

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated (translated from German):

General recommendations:

- The recognition of study and examination achievements obtained abroad should be implemented as a rule in the sense of the Lisbon Convention in the equivalence of acquired competences.
- The university should work towards expanding the range of courses offered by foreign guest lecturers. These efforts can be supported particularly through the expansion of university cooperation.
- More foreign-language, especially English-language scientific literature should be made available for the study programs.
- In order to improve the international compatibility of the degree programs and to increase student mobility, more suitable courses should be offered in English.

„State and Local Governance“ (Master)

- The concept of the study program should be revised in the elective area in such a way that modules can be assigned more strongly to overarching topic complexes and professionalization areas. Accordingly, the module titles should be less specific and more general.
- Organizational and decision-making theories with clear reference to the public sector should be taken into account in the courses of study in order to meet the special requirements of work in the public administration.

„Finance“ (Master)

- It is recommended that the area of financial consulting / financial advising and the area of consideration of specific customer groups (corporate customer business, private customer consulting and business) as well as international aspects, if applicable, be given greater consideration in the elective course.

A temporary accreditation was issued for the proper implementation of the ACQUIN reaccreditation procedure. The application was approved and the temporary accreditation of the study programmes was issued until 30.09.2021.

III Implementation and assessment of the criteria

1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance

Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.

1.1 Implementation

ZhSU has a quality policy developed for the academic years 2018-2021. The policy is publicly available on the website of the university.

The main priorities of the quality policy are among others training of highly sought-after graduates with innovative qualifications and competencies that satisfy the needs of employers; modernization of the content of study programmes on the basis of professional standards that have a practice-oriented character and inculcate students with managerial, entrepreneurial skills; development of education digitalization in accordance with the state program «Digital Kazakhstan» on 3 key areas: development of information, automation of education management process, training of IT professionals; increasing efficiency of scientific research and integration into international scientific community; increased autonomy for management and academics and transformation of the university from state ownership to national joint-stock company, development of collegial systems of management and quality management to the requirements of international standards ISO 9001:2015; conducting educational work with students on the basis of the values of Kazakhstan's identity and unity, spiritual and moral values of the program of modernization of public consciousness «Ruhany Zhangyru», formation of healthy lifestyle culture and «zero tolerance» towards corruption and ensuring academic integrity; ensuring a favorable moral and psychological climate at the university and developing infrastructure and providing sustainable financial and economic conditions of the university and regional use of resources.

The basis of the ZhSU quality assurance system is the internal quality management system (QMS), which guarantees the achievement of educational objectives and expected learning outcomes for each implemented study programme. The QMS is part of the university management system, which provides coordinated activities regarding the content, technology, methods and means of work of managers, employees, faculty, and students to further improve the quality of the educational process and the professional competence of university graduates.

University staff, including managers at all levels, build their activities based on the existing legal framework. The functions, tasks and responsibilities of departments, faculties, and other

structural units are aimed at the successful implementation of a quality assurance strategy. The quality assurance strategy for educational activities and the quality policy are implemented at all levels of management and if necessary are reviewed and revised.

The QMS was developed, implemented and maintained in accordance with the requirements of the international standard ISO 9001: 2015 Quality Management Systems. The QMS of the university is based on a process approach. For each process of the quality management system, a process manager and its owner are established. The head of the process ensures its implementation, monitors its effectiveness and efficiency. The owner of the process draws up the process in the form of a document, sets control assessments, manages the process, is responsible for its status, and carries out checks.

The responsibilities of departments, faculties and other units, management, employees, and students for quality assurance are governed by the relevant provisions and job descriptions, approved in the prescribed manner.

The university management carries out quality assurance activities in the following areas: organization and planning of educational process, quality of training session, providing students with educational and methodological complexes of disciplines in accordance with the state educational standard.

Educational and methodical work of the faculties includes among others modular development study programmes, according to which the training and graduation of specialists is carried out based on the state compulsory standard of higher education (further SCSE) and model rules; educational and methodological support of educational disciplines of the department (the development of textbooks, teaching aids, guidelines, etc.) etc.

One of the main components of the education quality system is students' involvement in university management i.e., student self-government. Students are involved in the work of the Academic Council, the Anti-Corruption Council and other university committees.

Student deans are elected at each faculty. The main duties of student deans are to attract all students of the faculty to a conscious and systematic participation in the management affairs of the faculty, involve student youth in the decision-making process, development of creative potential and professional growth, on a moral orientation, self-realization in all spheres of life.

For the effective organization of the educational process, the university develops mechanisms for interacting with key stakeholders, analyses the composition of stakeholders and the relationship between them and the university, systems of interests and mutual expectations. The university defines a group of stakeholders, that is those interested in the process of interaction with the university in the framework of achieving mutually beneficial objectives.

1.2 Assessment

Compared to the previous accreditation, the university now has a greater autonomy regarding the development and implementation of study programmes. This greater academic freedom increases the need for stringent internal policies for quality assurance. As discussed above, a wide range of formal policies for quality assurance has been developed and the policies are publicly available. These policies span a wide range of subjects and appear to be comprehensive. However, during the online discussions with the representatives of the university, peer review experts determined that the degree of implementation appears to vary across different areas.

A strong point is the cooperation with the world of practice. Each faculty has an advisory board which includes employers as well as representatives from the national Chamber of Commerce. Practitioners are actively involved in the teaching of courses. Both activities assure the high practical relevance of the study programmes and the incorporation of current trends. The close interaction assures that the needs of the local labour markets are addressed. In addition, regular surveys are conducted with the aim of assessing labour market trends and anticipating future demand from the world of practice.

A weakness was discovered with regard to research integrity. The peer review experts were presented with a paper that was supposedly published in one of the highest-ranking international economic journal. However, a quick data base search revealed that no such publication existed. It was determined by the peer review experts that the article “Economic and legal aspects of entrepreneurship development in the Republic of Kazakhstan” was never published in that journal. Based on the evidence provided, it appears that the title was simply copied into the front matter of the journal. A cursory reading of the article also made clear that the quality in no way warranted publication in a such top-level journal. How this incident happened could not be clarified by the experts, possible is that the teaching staff became victims of the fraud. Nevertheless, this does not justify such cases at the university. To avoid this in the future, the existing and further structures concerning academic and research integrity must be established and strengthened in the university on all levels. One way to address this issue would be the formation of a board, which has the responsibility to validate and assess the quality of academic articles.

All relevant stakeholders are involved in quality management processes. The involvement of students is appropriate as indicated by their participation in the work of the Academic Council, the Anti-Corruption Council or the youth committee. Student deans are also elected at each faculty. Lectures are regularly evaluated, and the results are discussed in various committees, such as the quality assurance board.

Regarding gender equality and diversity, the university follows national regulations. No additional measures at ZhSU to promote gender equality and diversity could be identified by the expert group. Peer review experts recommend considering measures to improve gender equality and to integrate gender and diversity objectives in the curriculum.

1.3 Conclusion

The criterion is partially **fulfilled**, because relevant structures must be established to ensure academic and research integrity of the staff and students.

Peer review experts suggest the following recommendation:

- Measures to improve gender equality and diversity should be implemented. In addition, aspects of gender equality and diversity could be considered in the curriculum.

2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

2.1 Implementation

General overview

All study programmes at ZhSU are developed in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework, SES, professional standards and agreed with the Dublin Descriptors and the European Qualifications Framework.

The main regulatory documents for the development of the study programme of the university are: classifier of areas of training with higher and postgraduate education in the Republic of Kazakhstan; SES of higher and postgraduate education (order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 604), Model rules for the activities of organizations of higher and postgraduate education; Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of education.

The procedure for the development of existing study programmes and the methodology for their compilation is determined by the Regulation on the development of modular study programme. Study programme is developed for each specialty of higher and postgraduate education by specially created working groups and agreed with the Council of Employers of the faculties. The working group includes the head of the department and two to three leading

teachers of the department. Each study programme goes through the procedures of discussion and consideration at the meetings of departments (protocols), faculty council (protocols), expert group (verification act) and is approved by the rector on the basis of the decision of the Academic Board.

Responsibility for the implementation of the requirements specified in this provision lies with the head of the EMC (Educational and Methodical Council). Responsibility for organizing and monitoring compliance with established standards in accordance with the requirements of this provision lies with the head of the EMC and deans of faculties. Heads of departments are responsible for the content of the study programmes. Study programmes are developed in three languages: Kazakh, Russian and English.

Students participate in the development of study programme by taking part in a survey of students' satisfaction with the educational process. Students participate in the discussion of the study programme at the meetings of the Faculty Council and the Academic Board of ZhSU, where the programme is reviewed and approved. Students can recommend elective courses for inclusion in the catalogue of elective disciplines.

The faculty pays special attention to attracting employers to the development of programme. The faculty created the Council of Employers. Before approval, the programme is assessed by the employers. A survey on satisfaction with the graduates is conducted among employers of Taldykorgan town and Almaty region. In addition, employers can send their feedback about the graduates including any problems and wishes for improving the training of future graduates.

Structure of the programmes

The academic year consists of periods (semester – 15 weeks, trimester – 10 weeks, quarter – 7-8 weeks). The volume of classroom work is at least 30% of the volume of each discipline. One credit is equal to 15 academic hours of the following types of academic work; classroom work of the student during the academic period in the form of a semester, evenly distributed for 1 hour per week, student's work with the teacher according to the schedule, student's work on writing and defending a thesis (project), master's or doctoral dissertation. The number of hours allowed for independent work of a student is within the established norm (1:2). Independent work under the guidance of a teacher is a type of work performed by students in contact with the teacher.

The curriculum of the bachelor's programmes consists of theoretical learning (cycles of general education (GED), basic and main disciplines (BD and MD)) and final certification. GED cycle disciplines are studied in first two semesters, BD and MD cycle disciplines are studied in the second through eight semesters. GED cycle includes following disciplines: Modern history of

Kazakhstan, Foreign Language, Philosophy, Kazakh (Russian) language, Philosophy, Information and communication technologies (in English), module of socio-political knowledge (sociology, political science, cultural studies, psychology), Physical training. GED cycle is the same for all study programmes. The cycle of general disciplines comprises 56 ECTS, BD 112 ECTS, MD make up total of 70-72 ECTS. The disciplines of MD and BD consist of mandatory university component and the elective component.

The content of the master's programmes consists of: theoretical learning (basic and main disciplines), practical preparation of postgraduate (various types of practices, scientific or professional internships), research work that includes the implementation of a master's thesis – for a scientific and pedagogical master degree or experimental research work that includes the implementation of a master's project – for a specialized master's degree and a final certification. One ECTS corresponds to 30 academic hours. The basic disciplines and main disciplines include the disciplines of the university component (UC) and the elective component (EC).

In the scientific and pedagogical focus of the programme, the BD cycle amounts to 31-32 ECTS and MD 36-37 ECTS. The profile focus of the programme includes 10 ECTS BD cycle and 20 ECTS MD cycle. The final examination (12 ECTS) is master's thesis and defense.

The basic discipline cycle in the scientific and pedagogical direction includes compulsory disciplines "History and philosophy of science", "Foreign language (professional)", "Pedagogy of the higher school", "Management psychology" and in the profile direction - the discipline "Management psychology" and "Foreign language (professional)".

Professional practice is an integral part of the BD and MD cycles of higher education. Industrial practice is one of the types of educational activities in real production conditions. It is conducted in organizations that are bases of practice – state bodies for professional activities.

In the bachelor's programmes students take an educational and manufacturing (pedagogical) practice/internship. In the master's degree programme students of scientific pedagogical direction take pedagogical and research practice, while students of profile direction take an internship or a manufacturing practice.

„Jurisprudence“ (Bachelor of law)

The purpose of the study programme “Jurisprudence” is to prepare highly qualified and competitive graduates of Bachelor of Law, getting knowledge in the field of the legal system, the special features and functioning of Kazakhstan's legislation, getting an idea about the most important directions of jurisprudence sector's development, status and prospects for the development of the State legal system of RK.

The study programme “Jurisprudence” includes the following modules “Historical and theoretical foundations of state and law”, “Legal regulation of civil, administrative and criminal law relations”, “Multilingual module”, “Application of civil, criminal and administrative procedural law”.

„Jurisprudence“ (Master of law/Master of legal sciences)

The purpose of the master's programme is to provide quality training of highly qualified specialists with a high level of legal culture and legal awareness, fundamental knowledge and professional competence in the field of development and implementation of legal norms, ensuring law and order, legal training and education.

Students of the profile direction study following two modules” Skills for effective management and research” and “Theoretical and practical problems of law enforcement”.

Students of the scientific-pedagogical direction study modules “Actual issues of science and education”, “Historical and theoretical foundations of state and law”, “Theoretical and practical problems in teaching state-legal disciplines” and “Problems of application of civil and criminal legislation”.

„Economics“ (Bachelor of economics and business)

The goal of the programme is to train educated, intellectually developed specialists in the field of economics, ensuring rational management of the economy, production and social development of enterprises of all organizational and legal forms, taking into account industry specifics. Graduates of this programme will have professional knowledge of industry economy and enterprise and are ready to successfully implement their knowledge, skills and abilities in the public sphere, private business, and public organizations.

The bachelor’s degree programme includes the following modules: “Informational and communicative”, “Basic economics”, “Economics and mathematics”, “Regional and foreign economic aspects of the economy”, “Economics of firm and entrepreneurship”, “Economy industries”, “Business analytics” and “Methods of planning and forecasting in economics”.

„Economics“ (Master of business and management/Master of economic sciences)

The profile direction of the master’s study programme consists of the modules “Scientific and communicative theory” and “Analysis of the national economy”.

The scientific-pedagogical direction of the programme includes the following modules “Scientific and communicative theory”, “Micro- and macroeconomic analysis”, “System development of the national economy” and “Analysis and modelling of economic processes”.

„Accounting and Audit“ (Bachelor of business and management)

The purpose of the study programme is to train qualified specialists who have the necessary knowledge and skills to perform such functions of professional activity as: organizing and maintaining records of the fund and entities movement, maintaining all forms of reporting of organizations, conducting audits, monitoring and managing the movement of tangible and intangible assets of enterprises of all organizational and legal forms of activity and ownership.

The programme includes following modules: “Fundamentals of economic disciplines”, “Professional language”, “Business and finance”, “Standards and information technologies”, “Audit and analysis”, “Financial accounting” and “Accounting and reporting”.

„Accounting and Audit“ (Master of business and management/Master of economic sciences)

The purpose of the study programme is to train specialists with in-depth knowledge in the field of financial and management accounting, as well as training personnel with in-depth knowledge in the field of special sciences and pedagogy for the higher education system and research structures.

Students of the profile direction study the modules “Actual issues of science and education” and “Fundamental and applied questions of accounting and audit”.

Students of the scientific-pedagogical direction complete the following modules “Actual issues of science and education”, “Fundamental and applied questions of accounting and audit” and “Accounting and audit in industries”.

„Finance“ (Bachelor of business and management)

The main objective of the study programme is to prepare qualified specialists for the country's financial system who objectively assess the economic processes in society, understand the essence and trends in the development of financial relations and their features in the field of public finance, international finance and finance of economic units, who have skills in developing and resolving issues of the financial system.

The study programme consists of the following modules “Informatively-communicative”, “Fundamentals of economic sciences”, “Calculations and modelling”, “Business module”, “Sector of the financial market”, “Corporate finance” and “Financial activities in the direction”.

„Finance“ (Master of business and management/Master of economic sciences)

The profile direction of the study programme includes following modules “Effective management of the educational process” and “Management of financial resources”.

Scientific-pedagogical direction includes the modules “Topical issues of science and direction”, “Modern financial system of the state” and “Financial analysis, control and forecasting”.

„State and Local Governance“ (Bachelor of business and management)

The main objective of the study programme is the preparation of specialists of a new formation, having broad fundamental knowledge, initiative, adaptive to the changing requirements of the labour market and technologies, able to work in a team with the necessary knowledge in the field of public service, economics, management, finance, law, psychology, statistics able to analyse source material and to make conclusions.

The programme includes the following modules “Introduction to specialty”, “Informatively communicative”, “Statistics and analysis”, “Informatively communicative”, “Management by directions”, “Public administration and business” and “Public service and administration”.

„State and Local Governance“ (Master of business and management/Master of economic sciences)

The goal of the master’s programme is to provide high-quality preparation for masters of economic sciences in the field of state and local government based on national priorities and international experience.

Students of the profile direction of the study programme study the following modules “Educational process management”, “Public administration” and “State regulation and economic policy”.

Students of the scientific-pedagogical direction cover the modules “Current issues of science and education”, “Communication and management activities”, “Public administration” and “State regulation and economic policy”.

2.2 Assessment

General assessment

The study programmes are developed on the initiative and under the ministerial guidelines. The development is based on the professional standards of the national chamber of commerce and the international professional standards. From these, objectives and learning outcomes are defined. Finally, a project group consisting of teachers, employers and one or two students is formed to further develop the programme. Other stakeholders involved in the development of study programmes are the Academic Council and the Scientific Council. Finally, the study programme undergoes an internal and external evaluation and is finally approved by the Academic Council. Students are represented in this council and, according to the university administration, can ask questions and propose topics for discussion.

Due to the state requirements and the system of licensing study programmes, Kazakh universities do not necessarily have as much freedom of choice and flexibility as European universities. The university takes into consideration the GOS requirements and licensing conditions. This explains some very general subjects in the curriculum. In particular, subjects that in other educational systems are more likely to be taught in the Gymnasium (with 12 - 13 school years) are taught here in the first year of undergraduate studies. This is explained by the 11 year school system and therefore, bachelor programmes are of 8 semester duration.

The curriculum of the "General Disciplines", which is obligatory for all bachelor's programmes, is intended to form and develop general competencies that are not necessarily related to specialization, including socio-ethical as well as cultural, general economic and organizational competencies.

The qualification objectives of the individual study programmes are clearly defined and correspond to the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework and to the Framework for Qualification of the European Higher Education Area.

The descriptions of the modules are available in the supplement. They contain all relevant information, in particular information on the module coordinator, the language in which the module is offered (Russian and/or Kazakh), the workload, the course frequency, the course type (compulsory or optional), the prerequisites for participation, the content and the learning objectives. In addition, all module descriptions contain sufficient and mostly very up-to-date literature references. However, some of the information is usually in the form of lecture notes (textbooks published by the lecturers themselves or by the university). The module descriptions are systematic, comprehensive and generally understandable. Particularly positive is the detailed information on the learning objectives. Throughout, the targeted competencies such as subject knowledge, interdisciplinary knowledge, subject-specific, methodological and generic competencies as well as key qualifications are made clear. Also noteworthy is the consistent language regarding the competency taxonomy.

The expected student workload is defined in a transparent manner as regards its two components in-class hours and consultancy hours. By contrast, the calculation methods with respect to the self-study workload of students is not documented and hence lacks transparency so that it was impossible for the expert team to verify the documented self-study workload. The self-study workload of students is not based on representative surveys among students, but rather appears to be a rough estimate by the programme coordinators without any empirical basis. The question of how the students' workload would be recorded during the pandemic remained largely unanswered. According to the lecturers, the workload was measured by the quality of the work - more workload went into good work than into less good work. To use this as the sole criterion is not comprehensible. The experts learned that student workload is calculated

in a very schematic way and essentially includes in-class hours and consultation hours only while no procedure exists to estimate the students' self-study workload. Hence, ECTS credits are unlikely to be properly calculated. This shortcoming ought to be remedied by including this item to the students' evaluation questionnaires or by means of student logbooks. This practice is not in line with the ECTS requirement and therefore needs to be reformed. However, it should be noted, that Kazakh universities only recently switched to the European ECTS-System, therefore some time is needed for staff and structures to adapt and adjust to the new requirements.

In addition, another key dimension of the ECTS system – ECTS grades – is currently not correctly applied by the university. Instead of relative ECTS grades in line with the ECTS grading guidelines (i.e. that each reference group needs to be split into five segments to distinguish the top 10% of the students, followed by the next 25%, the next 30%, the next 25%, and eventually the lowest 10%), the ECTS grades awarded by the university do not properly reflect the grades which are actually obtained by the students. Given that most students obtain the grades “excellent” and “very good”, a massive and systemic distortion of the real performance of students is the result.

Peer review experts recommend optimizing the currently improper application of the ECTS system. Neither are students' self-study workloads adequately recorded, nor are ECTS grades properly rolled out. Here further improvements need to be undertaken by the university.

Peer review experts would recommend establishing cooperation between different departments to create new interdisciplinary study programmes. This could attract more students also from other regions of Kazakhstan to ZhSU.

The recommendations from the previous accreditation were addressed. Especially in the field of Jurisprudence, a substantial number of courses is now offered in English language. The number of international partners and international visitors was also increased. However, the number of modules offered in English language should still be increased in the other disciplines, especially in study programmes Economy, Accounting and Audit, Finance, and State and Local Management.

Peer review experts suggest the following general recommendations:

- The ECTS system especially measurement of the student workload and ECTS grades should be properly implemented.
- The number of modules in English language should be increased.
- Different faculties should seek interdisciplinary cooperation with regards to the development of study programmes.

„Jurisprudence“ (Bachelor of law)

The study programme comprises eight semesters and is equivalent to 240 ECTS credits. The LL.B. is a regular local law programme fully compliant with state standards on faculty and curriculum. The Ministry of Education and Science of the RK highly regulates all local universities (public and private) and rigorously supervises such compliance.

The curriculum of the programme is well structured and suitable to achieve the defined objectives. The study programme meets state requirements and the requirements of the local labour market. Students have expressed their overall satisfaction with the study programme.

The LL.B. programme aims to produce highly qualified professionals able to compete in a demanding and oversaturated local market for legal professionals in Kazakhstan.

The university is already conducting several surveys on study programmes, however peer review experts would encourage the university to do even more and include more comprehensive anonymous student evaluations of the law faculty and relevant administration. Students should be able to assess their law professors after academic semesters but before examinations to avoid bias. They should have an opportunity to evaluate the administration. This can be done on an annual basis. Evaluations could include sections on academic and professional integrity, including corruption assessments.

The Ministry of Education and Science RK requires academic and professional internships for an LL.B. programme. Peer review experts as well as the ZhSU consider internships as excellent opportunities to develop students' practical skills. The expert group encourages the university to establish a legal clinic at the university. In other words, a mandatory academic internship can be delivered in the form of clinical education at the university. This would be a good option for students to acquire practical skills. There are manifold benefits of such a legal clinic in the LL.B. curriculum. A legal clinic offers free legal aid to vulnerable people and excellent legal-practice opportunities to students under faculty supervision. While the clinic allows law students to develop practical skills, it also helps the faculty to remain up to date with regulatory developments. Top international law schools also provide legal clinics.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

„Jurisprudence“ (Master of law/Master of legal sciences)

The master's programme in both directions is suitable to meet the defined learning outcomes. The concept of the study programme is well implemented and seems to be successful. The disciplines offered in the programme correspond to the needs of the local labour market.

Students can acquire in-depth knowledge and skills in the field of law. The level of the courses is appropriate for the master's degree. The programme allows students to acquire important competencies, including methodological, personal, social and language competencies (Kazakh, Russian, English). The requirements of professional practice are properly reflected in the programme.

Students expressed their satisfaction with the study programme and process. Graduates of the programme said that they do not have any difficulties finding an appropriate job position.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

„Economics“ (Bachelor of economics and business)

The curriculum is well-structured. The choice of mandatory and elective subjects is substantiated. The sequencing of courses is natural with a possible exception of „Economic Statistics“ which precedes „Mathematical Economics“, where usually in economics programmes students take calculus before starting the statistics.

Some courses are labelled differently but in terms of content are quite similar. For example, „International Business“ is similar in its content „International Economics“. It is not very clear in what way „Planning and forecasting of Enterprise Activity“ is different from „Data Analysis and Economic Forecasting“.

Having a separate discipline „Prices and Pricing“ is unusual. Prices are usually covered in microeconomics and macroeconomic extensively. Pricing strategies are covered in industrial economics. Pricing should be also covered in the economics of the enterprise. So, the separate course on „Prices and Pricing“ seems to be redundant and usually does not appear in curricula of major economics programmes in universities.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

„Economics“ (Master of business and management/Master of economic sciences)

The university pursues the strategy to provide private-sector and state-owned companies of the region with qualified specialists in business studies and economics with high levels of employability. In addition, students are also trained to start up their own businesses to contribute to the regional economy. Planned in the near future eventually, teacher training and the preparation of select graduates to become junior researchers/PhD candidates will be valuable ad-

ditional outcomes. The master's study programme with its two directions "profile" and "scientific-pedagogical" is hence an integral and important part of the mission and overall strategy of the university.

Due to the explicit focus on the graduates' employability, representatives of external stakeholders and students are fully involved in the process the design of the curriculum and its annual review; for details, see the discussion of ESG standard 1.9 "On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes" later in this report.

After successful completion of the programme, graduates are expected to have acquired "a full, high-quality profile and scientific-pedagogical education, professional competence in the field of Economics, management and organization of production", "a high general intellectual level of development, mastering competent and developed speech, culture, high moral, ethical and legal standards, culture of thinking and skills of organizing human resources", and to have developed their "creative potential, initiative and innovation". Hence, these expected learning outcomes are formally in line with level 6 study programmes in economics according to the NGF of Kazakhstan and the EQF in terms of the knowledge, skills and the desirable degree of responsibility and autonomy which must have been gained by the successful graduate.

Expected learning outcomes are essentially reflected throughout the curriculum in terms of course contents, teaching, learning and examination methods. Overall, the programme offers a good mix of essential business studies, management and economics contents, methods and tools.

Due to the close cooperation with employers, a high degree of employability at the appropriate qualification level is ensured. In addition, the programme prepares outstanding graduates to pursue their academic education and training at the PhD level.

The objectives of mandatory internships are clearly defined, and academic and practical supervision as well as student support are comprehensive and conducive to assist students in obtaining internship goals. Students in the scientific-pedagogical direction are adequately trained in economic research methods for their Master theses.

Overall, the Master programme is a sound academic offering which boasts a clear and strong focus on graduates' employability, both in the non-academic and the academic and pedagogical labour markets. The lecturers, including practitioners, are well equipped to assist students in attaining the program's expected learning outcomes at the Master level.

Study programme could be further enhanced by increasing international mobility of students and lecturers.

All previous recommendations of the first accreditation in 2014 were implemented.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

„Accounting and Audit“ (Bachelor of business and management)

The eight-semester bachelor's degree programme "Accounting and Auditing" is designed as a face-to-face or as a distance learning programme, though the latter, as a "second bachelor's degree" lasts only 2 years (as opposed to 3 years). The program is divided into three educational cycles: "General disciplines", "Basic disciplines" and "Main disciplines".

In the training cycle "Basic Disciplines" a distinction is made between compulsory subjects (compulsory elements) and elective subjects (elective elements). For the bachelor's degree programme "Accounting and Auditing", 47% or 112 ECTS are reserved in the "Basic Disciplines" training cycle, of which 51-71 ECTS are allocated to the compulsory subjects and 41-61 ECTS to the elective subjects.

The main discipline comprises 30 % or 72 ECTS of the study programme, of which 29 - 39 ECTS belong to the compulsory program, the rest are again elective modules.

In total, the programme contains 40% - 96 ECTS of compulsory modules and 34% - 81 ECTS of elective modules. Thus, there is sufficient scope for the students' free development and interest-related selection of modules, while at the same time providing a meaningful bound, i.e. predefined, programme.

Overall, the curriculum is to be judged positively in its composition. On the one hand, within the framework of the compulsory subjects of the training cycles "basic disciplines" and "profile disciplines", it includes the common courses that are to be attributed to a business studies in the field of accounting and auditing. On the other hand, it offers students good opportunities for specialization through the extensive range of electives. In addition to these technical aspects, the curriculum also emphasizes the teaching of methodological and generic competencies, which are practiced in "educational practices" modules. In conclusion, the composition of the curriculum is undoubtedly suitable to fulfil the objectives of the study programme.

The study programme is modular throughout. The module sizes comprise 5 ECTS credits, in exceptional cases they deviate slightly from this. An internship in the bachelor semester as well as the writing and defense of the bachelor thesis are appropriately allocated with ECTS credits.

The examination load in semesters 1 to 7 is 6 to 8 examinations per semester. There is a final exam in the 8th semester. In terms of workload, the study programme is assessed as studyable.

The teaching and learning methods used cover the usual spectrum, though lectures dominate. Most lectures are accompanied by exercises. (Inter)active forms of teaching and learning, such as business games, are rarely used. Examinations are usually written or, to a lesser extent, oral examinations or a mixture of written and oral examinations. Although a module on scientific work/writing has been included in all curricula since the first accreditation, this is unfortunately not used as an assessment of performance. It should be examined whether and to what extent it is advisable, at least in higher semesters (5th - 7th semesters), to occasionally include term papers, scientific papers, and oral examinations. The course is designed to prepare students for the bachelor's thesis.

The methods of teaching and learning as well as the forms of examinations on the whole meet the objectives of the study programme. It would be desirable, however, if interactive methods of teaching and learning could be given greater consideration in the further development of the program.

The study programme has a clearly defined objective derived from the overall strategy of the university, from which operational qualification goals are derived in a transparent form and logically consistent.

The concept of the bachelor's programme can only be influenced by the university in the elective area. The Faculty of Finance and Economics has used the freedom granted to it in a meaningful way. The structure and content of the programme are suitable for achieving the intended qualification goals.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

„Accounting and Audit“ (Master of business and management/Master of economic sciences)

The profile master's programme comprises two semesters in which 60 ECTS credits can be earned. The scientific-pedagogical master's programme is designed for four semesters with 120 ECTS credits. Both master's programmes are offered as full-time only. The programme has 4 main components which are supposed to lead to a higher professional qualification:

1. theoretical learning part, which includes basic disciplines and main disciplines.
2. preparation of postgraduates for practice, subdivided into scientific or practical trainee programs
3. research work, culminating in the master's thesis; and
4. final examinations.

They are divided into the two training cycles "basic disciplines" and "main disciplines", which run partly in parallel, and which each comprise in total half of the curriculum with a share of about 1/3 for the basic and 2/3 for the main discipline. The other half of the curriculum is provided by the final examinations.

The concept of offering two types of master's degrees in the subject "Accounting and Auditing" is unusual, but understandable and typical for the country. The field of application of the profile master is business and administrative practice, the scientific-pedagogical master's degree qualifies for the teaching profession at schools and universities. In some cases, different qualifications are required for working as a scientist or as a teacher than for working in business and administrative practice. The present concept is based on the insight that different requirements in the field of accounting and auditing require differentiated master's degrees.

The curriculum of the two master's programmes can certainly be described as successful. This assessment is based above all on the thematic in-depth content of the compulsory or optional courses, all of which are of master's level and are directly related to the qualification objectives pursued. In addition, the extensive elective area enables students to develop their own individual focus.

Both Master's programmes are fully modularized. The module sizes generally comprise 5 ECTS, in exceptional cases they deviate from this, whereby the master's degree shows a greater deviation than the bachelor's. Here, too, the final internship and the thesis are rightly rated higher with 13 and 12 ECTS credits, respectively.

The teaching and learning methods used cover the usual spectrum, though lectures dominate. Most lectures are accompanied by exercises. (Inter)active forms of teaching and learning, such as business games, are rarely used. Examinations are usually written or, to a lesser extent, oral examinations or a mixture of written and oral examinations. Although a module on scientific work/writing has been included in all curricula since the initial accreditation, this is unfortunately not used as assessment. In the case of the master's degree, it is urgently recommended that homework and scientific papers be included in the examinations. Papers should be introduced as an examination in preparation for the master's thesis.

The forms of teaching and learning as well as the forms of examination meet the objectives of the course. However, it would be desirable if interactive methods of teaching and learning could be given greater consideration in the further development of the course.

For both the profile and the scientific-pedagogical master's programme "Accounting and Auditing", there are sufficiently precise and operational qualification goals that are comprehensible and logically consistent with the overall objective of the programme.

The structure and content of both the profile and the scientific-pedagogical master's programme are suitable for achieving the qualification objectives. In terms of workload, both master's degree programmes can be studied.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

„Finance“ (Bachelor of business and management)

A formal institutional approval process of the study programme is in place. It involves all relevant stakeholders and is well documented. The programme reflects well the four purposes of higher education of the Council of Europe.

In line with the strategy of the university, the bachelor's in finance trains specialists for a number of finance functions with a specific focus on the local labour market. Employment opportunities mentioned by students include the banking sector or tax services. These employment opportunities are appropriate and in line with the qualifications of the graduates. Demand for the graduates is regularly assessed via surveys and an intensive and ongoing dialogue with the local industry.

External stakeholders and students are involved in the development of the programme as members of various committees. Peer review experts got an impression that the programme is adjusted regularly in line with demands from the local industry. Recent additions of courses based on stakeholder feedback include cost management, financial analysis, and analysis of financial reporting.

Appropriate for a bachelor programme, the curriculum consists of three cycles, namely general education, basic discipline and main discipline. The weights (approximately 60 / 110 / 70 ECTS) appear adequate.

While ECTS credits are introduced in the programme, the assessment of the appropriateness of the students' workload should be improved.

Given the relatively low student numbers, it is recommended to consider ways of cooperation with other study programmes, specifically with the programme in "accounting and audit" or the programme in "economics".

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

„Finance“ (Master of business and management/Master of economic sciences)

Both Finance master programmes are mainly in line with the strategy of the university: The Finance Master programme (“Master of economic sciences”) provides preparation for tutors of financial disciplines for the higher education system as well as for the research sector. The Finance Master programme (“Master of business and management”) trains professionals capable of performing managerial functions at various levels for the financial system.

The Finance Master of economic sciences consists of four terms with 23 modules which is appropriate for a Master programme with a focus on training researchers.

The Finance Master of business and management consists of two terms with ten modules. Considering the feedback of the students, the duration of internship could be extended.

Employment opportunities mentioned by the students are mainly the banking and tax sector.

Considering the sectors where graduates can be employed, it would be beneficial to incorporate optional modules of financial advising of target groups, e.g. retail, private, commercial and corporate customers and to offer modules of international banking or tax management.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

„State and Local Governance“ (Bachelor of business and management)

The study programme has an applied nature, focusing on management duties in public authorities and collaborating with politicians, civil society, and the (local) economy. Thus, students are acquainted with business competences, analytical methods and (public) management skills. Based on the mission of the university to prepare students for the regional and national labour markets, the programme meets the requirements of employers in Kazakhstan. The objective to broaden the scope of students and to prepare them for jobs in the business sector as well, is the reason for explicit entrepreneurial competences, such as “Marketing”, “Finance” and “Start-up management”. This emphasis on job opportunities inevitably narrows the scope of State and Local Government studied as an academic discipline.

To understand the general trends in State and Local Government at ZhSU, the group of experts tried to find out whether the university should follow the concepts of "public management" or "public administration". Based on the responses of teachers and students, it was possible to determine that the applied nature in terms of business management and the interaction between state and economy is crucial for the programme at ZhSU.

Considering the current focus of the study programme, the group of experts, nevertheless, recommends making changes in the future. To develop the discipline and to improve the education of civil servants in Kazakhstan, the university should provide students with more administrative competencies and a broader view of state structure, legal frameworks, and bureaucratic endeavours. Modules with a strong microeconomic focus should be reduced and might be replaced by application-based modules in public and administrative digitisation or (international) regulatory affairs.

In addition to the medium-term recommendations, there is also a special feature of the study programme that requires immediate action. The study programme contains virtually no legal competences, which are needed for the work in public administration. However, a sound knowledge of public law is vital for employees in public administration. Therefore, basic knowledge and legal practical skills must be a mandatory part of a degree programme.

Despite of some recommendations and one requirement for the further development, the current implementation of the programme corresponds to the national requirements determined by the Ministry of Science and Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and applicable mandatory disciplines. The rest of the programme is built based on the university's own ideas, which is positively assessed by the group of experts. Additionally, a positive impression is created by the connection between theory and practice, since students have enough time to gain some insights in public management during their studies.

All in all, the degree programme appears to be well designed, good to study and appropriately tailored for the labor market in Kazakhstan. The lack of qualification for legal processing is the only obvious shortcoming in the degree programme, so that a requirement is made in this context.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially **fulfilled**, because the study programme “State and Local Government” requires an adjustment of the curriculum. The curriculum must be supplemented with competences in the field of public law.

Peer review experts suggest the following recommendation:

- The university should reconsider whether modules with microeconomic/business focus could be replaced by modules with content on administrative competencies and a broader view of state structure, legal frameworks, and bureaucratic endeavours.

„State and Local Governance“ (Master of business and management/Master of economic sciences)

The objectives of the master’s programme in the field of State and Local Government are justified and convincing against the background of the data of national labour market requirements. Given the fact that civil servants for ministries, regional and local authorities should, first of all, receive the appropriate level of training, conducting academic research is not a priority. Therefore, the profile direction of the programme shows an explicit orientation towards managerial competences in public organizations. The graduate programme is aimed at certain groups and provides the enrolled students with the necessary competencies in the field of applied work in the public sectors, such as government affairs, (public) business companies and related fields. In addition, graduates of the programme – in particular in the scientific-pedagogical direction – can independently conduct research, although the programme is not designed to prepare students for employment in the field of academic research because it is of an applied nature.

From the point of view of the group of experts, the general objectives and purpose of the educational programme on the specialty "State and Local Government" could be outlined a bit more explicitly and with reference to the work in the public sector.

In conclusion, the study programmes “State and Local Government” (Bachelor and Master) correspond to the overall strategy of the university, and the expert group highly appreciates the creation and continuous development of programmes at ZhSU. Further, it should be emphasized that the group of experts found that ZhSU managed to improve the programmes within the last years from the time of the previous accreditation. Recommendations on the use of foreign literature, a more transparent presentation of the curriculum (module titles) and giving students more opportunities for independent work were considered.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

2.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled for all study programmes, except for the study programme “State and Local Governance” (Bachelor)**.

3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach

3.1 Implementation

Student-centered learning is implemented at the university through numerous ways: involvement of the students in the development of the study programmes, option of choosing multilingual education, system for evaluating students' knowledge, possibility of appeals by students, supporting students' sense of autonomy, guidance of the students in determining educational trajectory under the guidance of the experienced mentor and use of new educational technologies.

Since 2017-2018 academic year, multilingual education in Kazakh, Russian and English in the Bachelor programmes "Jurisprudence" is conducted.

The university tries to attract foreign specialists who can teach in a foreign language. Language training is provided not only in classes, but also through participation in additional English courses and summer schools. Students of multilingual groups and teachers take free language courses organized by the Center for Continuing Education and Continuing Education.

Distance learning technologies are used in the educational process of the University. For the organization of the educational process on remote educational technologies, the ZhSU has created an information and educational portal providing students with educational and methodological, organizational and administrative information which allows them to receive and transmit information in accessible forms, including on-line consultations and off-line interaction.

The educational process at the university is constantly focused on the introduction of new educational technologies, the widespread computerization, the use of new technical training and monitoring tools, the implementation of the principles of independent knowledge audit. The educational process uses electronic textbooks, computer training programs, multimedia technologies, and video lectures.

The following innovative technologies and interactive teaching methods are most effectively implemented: problem-developing education; the development of critical thinking through reading and writing; academic reading and writing; modular training technology; information computer technology; pedagogy of cooperation; multimedia programs for teaching foreign languages, etc. In the classes on basic and major disciplines of accredited EP, the project method, elements of imitation, reflection, relaxation during individual practical exercises, problem and role situations are used. Teachers use business games, role-playing situations and case studies. Project preparation and debate have also established themselves as effective forms of conducting classes. Problematic lecture, lecture-visualization, lecture-conference, round table, field classes with thematic discussion, practical group and individual exercises are used in some of the classes.

Since 2017-2018 the university is creating video lectures.

The University takes into account situations such as absence from classes and/or failure to appear for the exam for one of these reasons because of health, participation in national and (or) events of cultural or sports direction etc. In this case, the student's justification documents are registered and access is opened in the electronic journal for issuing points for missed classes. In this case, the teacher's journal reflects the reason why mitigating circumstances were taken into account.

The procedure for appealing exam results is developed and described in the University's Academic policy.

3.2 Assessment

Student assessment is based on fair and transparent standards, and a procedure exists for students to appeal. Methods of assessment in all study programmes are clearly defined.

The university lecturers use a variety of teaching methods such as thematic talks, video lectures, case studies, problem lecture, visualisation lecture, conference lecture, round table, field studies with thematic discussion, practical group and individual exercises. The teaching and learning methods are appropriate to reach the defined learning outcomes.

Outside the curriculum, there is the so-called "StartUp Academy", where student projects can be presented. Students can learn how projects are implemented there. Competitions are organized in which the winning project receives financial support from the university and is commercialized.

However, further improvements are possible specifically in both study programmes "Economy". Peer review experts were provided with several exam examples in the bachelor study programme "Economy". The impression is that in several disciplines questions mainly test student's memory and conceptual understanding rather than applying what they learned in problem setting. For example, Data Analysis and Economic Forecasting – this is a very applied course where students should become familiar with data analytics techniques/econometric methods and apply them to real data. However, the exam questions are not structured to assess this knowledge. For example, questions such as "In which year W. Leontieff received the Nobel Prize in economics?" seem to be unrelated to the subject. In the opinion of the experts, many questions are dedicated to the Walrasian general equilibrium which should be covered in microeconomics. Expert group would recommend in the study programme "Economy" (Bachelor) to structure where appropriate final exams or other assessments that test students applied and problem-solving skills. The questions should be less theoretical and focus less on testing student's memorization of concepts and definitions.

The primary focus on written examinations in the master's "Economy" as the principal form of examinations is not sufficiently adequate for a master level education. This does not ensure

the students' development of necessary critical thinking skills and thus students are not properly trained to apply their theoretical knowledge in own research. Accordingly, it should be replaced by more project-based and seminar style teaching and examination. Teaching, learning and, most of all, examination methods ought to become better aligned with, and reflect the research, self-study and qualifications which must be acquired by the successful graduate of any Master level degree.

The procedure of appeal of examination results is developed and described in the Academic Policy of the university and includes the following stages: reception of students' applications; collection and analysis of information; meeting of the appeal committee and consideration of materials; deciding on the appeal; drawing up the minutes of the appeal committee meeting; making changes in the history of students' learning achievements; informing students about the results of the appeal.

The activities to consider the appeal applications of students is organized by the Appeals Commission, established by the order of the Rector for a period of one academic year. The results of the appeal are brought to the attention of students within one week after the end of the examination session by the head of the testing department (in case of appeal application on the fact of computer-based testing), or the director of the office in case of a student taking oral, written or combined examinations. Minutes of appeal application review are kept in the registrar's office and upon completion of the student's studies are transferred to the university archive for storage in accordance with the established procedure.

The university works closely with students and employers and is striving to improve programmes so that students are in demand on the labour market.

Students and graduates are actively involved in the development of the study programmes. They have the possibility to give feedback on the quality of teaching, to evaluate a particular subject and to express their opinion regarding the study programmes. In addition, the university management actively communicates with future employers, which shows the care and continued support of the students, even after graduation.

3.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Peer review experts suggest the following recommendation for the study programme "Economy" (Bachelor):

- Final exams or other assessment should focus more on testing students applied and problem-solving skills.

Peer review experts suggest the following recommendation for the study programme “Economy” (Master):

- Teaching, learning and examination methods should be further aligned to the Master level.

4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.

4.1 Implementation

The university regulations on admission rules were developed on the basis of Standard rules for admission to education organizations that implement educational programs of higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with sub-paragraph 11) of article 5 of The law "On education", have been approved.

The formation of the student contingent of ZhSU is carried out through budget financing, placement of the state educational order for training specialists (educational grants), as well as payment for training at the expense of individuals ' own funds and other sources.

Admission of applicants to the bachelor’s degree is carried out on their applications on a competitive basis in accordance with the points of the certificate issued by the results of the unified national testing or comprehensive testing. Citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan, foreign citizens with secondary General, primary professional (technical and professional), secondary professional (post-secondary) and higher education are admitted to ZhSU for bachelor's degree programs.

Persons who have received a certificate of award of an educational grant, submit an application for admission and are enrolled to the university by order of the rector of the University.

Applicants who pay the tuition fee must pass comprehensive testing. Admission to the university for tuition on a fee basis is carried out by the selection committee.

Admission of persons to master's studies is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of comprehensive testing or entrance exams. Acceptance of applications for master's degree is carried out by the admission Committee of ZhSU through the information system. Applicants need to pass a comprehensive test consisting of a foreign language test (English, German, French), a test for the profile of the study program group, and a test to determine readiness for training in Kazakh or Russian.

An internal online portal includes information about the current monitoring of students' knowledge, students' attendance, the distribution of grants, and the distribution of places in hostels.

Registration Office monitors the current student performance in all disciplines and sends it to the departments, where further work is carried out to analyse student performance and provide academic assistance to underperforming students.

The university has a portal of distance education and an electronic journal of quality control of students' knowledge. The university publishes schedule of classroom lessons for students and teachers.

The procedures for accepting students from other universities, transferring the credits they have mastered are described in detail in the academic policy of the university and the Regulation "On transfers, deductions and restorations, the provision of academic leave" of the QMS of ZhSU, as well as posted on the university website under the heading "Translation, restoration, expulsion: what is important for the student to know."

The organization of final certification of students is carried out in accordance with the "Standard rules for conducting current monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of students in higher education institutions". In 2014, ZhSU developed the Regulation "On the procedure for completing the diploma Supplement" dated September 11, 2014, which was reissued in the 2018-2019 academic year. The diploma Supplement does not replace the main document on higher education and does not give any rights to formal recognition of the original diploma by the authorized bodies of other countries.

4.2 Assessment

Students must take a uniform countrywide test to be admitted to the bachelor's degree. To get admitted to the master's degree students take an entrance examination as well as a foreign language test. The admission requirements are largely determined by the Ministry of Education and Science and are published. University accepts students on a tuition fee and grant basis. Generally, the university responds to the needs of the labour market. Analyses are regularly conducted in the region to determine which specialists are needed on the labour market. The university trains students accordingly. This also corresponds to the number of state scholarships and thus to the capacity of the study programmes.

Admissions are thus partially based on employment trends. Among others, business representatives are involved. This is reflected in the structure of the study programmes and teaching. Each faculty has a committee consisting of employers, faculty members and representatives of the Chamber of Commerce.

Depending on the student's English language skills, they can be admitted to the multilingual study programmes. It is possible to change from the multilingual programme to the regular programme within the first year of study without any further problems. However, a change is rather the exception. Since basic subjects are studied in the first semesters, the courses can be credited, and the state scholarship is not lost through the change. Before students are accepted for the multilingual program, they must pass a test. The requirements for the test are rather low, which is due to the secondary school education. Filling the study programmes would be difficult otherwise. However, there is a deficit in the language level of the English language courses. This should be compensated. In addition to the study programmes, the university has further offers to students which should help them to improve their language skills during their studies (e.g. clubs with native speakers and the language center).

The university stated that ECTS credits from other universities are always recognized, which is conducive to mobility. How the process is actually implemented cannot be conclusively assessed. Within Kazakhstan, students can spend a semester studying at another university. Every year, between five and twenty students from the university use this opportunity.

In order to distribute the workload appropriately during the examination phase, the students are involved in various committees (e.g. during the examination period in the organization of the examinations and their progression).

The students themselves stated that high demands were placed on them. The low dropout rate does not seem to support this statement.

Students' progress is regularly monitored, relevant data is gathered and communicated to the departments. Departments analyse the data and take necessary measures.

Upon graduation, students are issued graduation certificates and a diploma supplement.

4.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff

5.1 Implementation

Teaching staff is formed in accordance with national laws and regulations. The university has a commission that considers candidates for vacant faculty and researcher positions. The formation of the teaching staff is based on the analysis of the needs of the study programme. The

qualification of teachers and their quantitative composition correspond to the areas of training of bachelor, master, PhD and meet the licensing requirements.

Announcements about the competition for vacant positions of teaching staff are published in the national media and on the university's website. Appointment of the teaching staff is carried out based on the decision of the departments, as well as by a secret ballot of the competition Commission. Ballots and minutes of the counting Commission are sealed and stored in the personnel service safe. The Department of personnel management of the university deals with the selection of personnel, registration of their admission, relocation and dismissal, and preparation of documents for approval in the positions of employees.

At the beginning of the academic year, the Academic Council annually reviews and approves intra-University criteria that apply to the competitive replacement of positions of full-time teachers.

Regulations on structural divisions and job descriptions for all employees have been developed and approved. Description of tasks, requirements, and guidelines of the positions are available.

The professional development of the faculty is coordinated by the Vice-rector for academic Affairs. Professional development plans are developed for the teaching staff for each year. ZhSU provides advanced training of scientific and pedagogical staff in several areas. It includes multi-level-long-term professional development program and international programs, training in structural divisions of other universities, state-accredited academic institutions or organizations that have a license to conduct educational activities in the field of education, internships in the framework of multilateral cooperation of ZhSU with leading enterprises and research institutes and training in internal training courses and seminars etc.

Research work of the faculty is carried out in accordance with the developed thematic research plans. The faculty participates in the implementation of funded research projects. The university and the faculty participate in the implementation of budget-based basic research funded by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The results of research work of the faculty of Law and Economics are communicated to the general public through publications in various scientific publications of the university itself (Bulletin of ZhSU, collections of scientific papers and conference materials) and in scientific journals of the leading universities in Kazakhstan, foreign countries, academic publications, and international scientific publications. The faculty pays special attention to modern requirements for scientific results in the form of publications in rating publications with a non-zero impact factor and in publications included in the databases of international publishing centers.

5.2 Assessment

In general, all study programmes have adequate number of teaching staff that have appropriate qualifications. Many teachers have PhD degree or equivalent. Theoretically, the relatively high number of teachers should create a critical mass of academics for a thriving research environment at the university. However, considering the publication output of the teachers it seems like the research environment at the university is not yet well established. The faculty publishes, also in English, their work in foreign journals, but the quality of these journals as well as of publications raises questions among the expert group. The expert group got an impression that not all faculty is properly trained on requirements of publishing scientific paper and choosing proper journals. As was already mentioned in Chapter 1.1., the university management needs to take further actions to ensure that the research activities of the university are conducted in ethical and proper way. Experts would suggest making further investments in order to provide all faculty members to proper training, for example organizations like Thomson Reuters or Elsevier offer from time-to-time seminars on how to publish a scientific paper. This should help staff first to distinguish decent journals from indecent and to improve their scientific writing to target better journals.

Teaching staff emphasized that measures for the development and qualification of the staff are available and used. For example, many lecturers could take part in mobility abroad and improve their language and/or professional skills.

5.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.

6.1 Implementation

The university has three educational buildings, training and a laboratory complex, a library, a military department, two dormitories, a training camp, sports and educational training ground and a stadium. There are four medical centers at the university. The educational process is implemented in 173 seminar rooms, including 25 educational and scientific laboratories, 26 computer classes, 2 multimedia classes, 4 language laboratories, 6 reading rooms, etc., where 44 interactive whiteboards are installed.

The university has 26 computer classes, 9 of which are equipped with the latest computers, 20 eight-core computers in a set, 11 Macintosh monoblocks, 1 high-resolution interactive wall,

a tutorial class equipped with computers and other information and communication tools designed to implement distance learning technologies.

The university is equipped with modern hardware and software. The university has created a developed information infrastructure, including structured regulatory, educational, scientific, reference and other information. The department of development and implementation of information systems created the digital university SmartZhetysu. The unified information system includes the Information and Program Complex (IPC) "Administrator", IPC "Admission Commission", IPC "Chair", IPC "Computer Testing", IPC "Student's Study", IPC "Employee's Office", software (software) "Curator", identification cards of students and employees.

The university library provides access to scientific electronic publications of Thomson Reuters, to full-text articles of journals of Springer, Elsevier, Scopus, and Polpred.com databases. In addition to electronic databases, a library of educational and scientific literature on electronic media is available in the library. The library provides access to domestic databases. As of November 29, 2019, the general fund of the library amounted to 564,243 copies, including 20,083 in the Kazakh language, 344,829 in Russian and 19,331 in foreign languages, the AIA - 4,017 copies.

The library has two reading rooms with 176 seats capacity, two computer classes, electronic information rooms that are equipped with new furniture, television equipment, office equipment, so students can receive services, such as "Internet", "Electronic textbooks", television training.

The financial strategy of the university is based on the legislative and regulatory requirements of the RK. The university has an independent balance and carries out financial and economic activities according to the University Development Plan, approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the RK.

The university has a student service center, a youth affairs committee, a youth center, a department for the formation of contingent and employment of graduates, a department for educational and social work, a sports club, interest clubs and a single Anti-Corruption Council operate. University has several dining rooms. The university currently has 2 student dormitories with 524 beds.

The goal of academic mobility of students and teachers is to integrate the university into the international educational space through the use of innovative, global educational resources and borrowing the best teaching methods and practices. Study programmes intensified work on the implementation of students' academic mobility. Agreements were concluded and mobility of students and undergraduates with foreign universities was established: University of

Genoa (Genoa, Italy); Corvinus University (Budapest, Hungary); Lodz University of Technology (Lodz, Poland); Tallinn Technical University (Tallinn, Estonia).

Within the framework of internal academic mobility, students and undergraduates of the faculty can study at 26 universities of Kazakhstan.

The University has a recreation area on the shores of Lake Balkhash with a total area of 15,000 square meters, including the area of residential buildings 275.6 square meters; sports camp "Karlygash" with a total area of 6100 square meters with residential summer houses, where practical and field classes in biology, geography, tourism, initial military training and cultural events are held.

The university has a department which supports employment of graduates. One of the main tasks of the department is to promote the effective employment of ZhSU graduates through vocational guidance, providing information on the labour market and job prospects, establishing long-term partnerships with enterprises, organizations and other employers.

6.2 Assessment

Students evaluate various professional support facilities and learning resources positively. In addition to a language centre, there are continuing education opportunities through courses in students' majors. Groups of students work both in the language center and in the continuing education courses for the respective disciplines. Exactly what this work looks like did not become entirely clear in conversation with students. However, with regard to the students' language skills in English, further expansion of supervision in this area or alternative testing of language skills is desirable.

Students do not have to look for internships themselves. Chairs of the university can arrange internship places for the students. However, students can also search for the internship place on their own. After the internship or after graduation, students are typically offered a job by the internship site. Here it is clear that there is close cooperation between the practice and the university. This is particularly evident in the admission requirements and in the admission process.

Students do not see a need for an improvement of the support services or resources at the university. Through the student parliament and the so-called "complain box", students can express wishes to the university management and administration regarding the support offered. The student deaneries at the faculties forward questions of the students to the university management and lecturers. The "Youth Center", where twelve students work part-time, mainly deals with student satisfaction levels. When students have problems, the students pass it on. Who is now responsible for which concerns and how efficient this system is could not be fully determined. However, the students seem to be clear about this structure.

In addition, there are support services in the form of a "Committee for Young People". According to the university, twenty groups consisting of volunteer students work there. It is divided into different units according to study subjects and study interests. The committee's task is to act as a bridge between students and the university administration. Among other things, they help students from low-income families prepare for the entrance exam. As further support for orphans, dining hall meals are free. For students with top grades, there is a 15% discount on tuition fees. For all students, the bus ticket is free of charge. In addition, commissions of students are formed to visit the dormitories and check how students feel there.

There are various measures to balance studies and family life and for students with disabilities: For students with children there is a possibility of so-called distance-learning (30% of the events take place online and 70% offline). Some of the university premises are accessible for people with disabilities. The possibility of flexible distance-learning exists in parallel. In the accommodation and dormitories there are special spaces for young families and students with disabilities. There are six students with limited opportunities so far at the entire university.

Students rate the professional support positively. Students seem to understand the system and are satisfied with it, though for peer review experts it was challenging to understand the structure and functioning of the various support services. Due to the limited insight into the implementation, however, any conclusive evaluation is prohibited.

Teaching staff and students have access to international databases and digital textbooks. The extent to which these are used could not be conclusively determined. The university had already introduced digital distance learning as an implementation of "part-time study", which was extended to all students during the pandemic. The students have access to the timetables and teaching materials via an online platform and a user account.

The study materials are based on so-called syllabi. In addition, students have access to teaching platforms, free access to e-textbooks, methodological handouts and digital textbooks.

Overall, peer review experts consider that the learning resources and support provided is sufficient to successfully offer and implement study programmes.

6.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.
--

7.1 Implementation

Study programmes at ZhSU are developed in accordance with the needs of the Almaty region and the Republic of Kazakhstan as a whole. Both levels look for qualified personnel and are degree programmes aimed at meeting the needs of society with human and scientific resources that have a high professional level of and a moral qualities of a person in the context of integration into the world of the educational, scientific and information community.

According to the SER, the university has implemented a system for collecting, analysing, and evaluating information, which include key performance indicators (KPI) of the departments and faculties. The data is used to rank the best performing departments and faculties. The university analyses the structure of the student body in the context of specialties and training courses, students' academic performance, their success and the proportion of expelled students. This information is discussed at the meetings of departments, councils of faculties, Educational and methodical council and Academic Board of the university. Periodic assessment of students' satisfaction with study programmes and disciplines is regularly carried out by means of sociological research, meetings of students with university managerial personnel, meetings of the youth affairs committee, and the council of curators. Periodic assessment of satisfaction of teaching staff, employees with working conditions, management system, available resources, assessment of the availability of resources for training and student support is carried out by questioning teaching staff and students. Questionnaire results are discussed at the meetings of the Academic Board and if necessary, improvements are implemented. The university stays in contact with the graduates and monitors their careers. A survey of graduates is conducted to collect and summarize information about their employment. This information is used for improving study programmes.

Information about the results of the current control, intermediate certification and final evaluation is displayed on the University's website, which ensures transparency of the process of monitoring and evaluating students' knowledge.

The university systematically collects data on the employment of the graduates.

An annual survey "Satisfaction of employers with the quality of graduate training" is conducted among employers.

7.2 Assessment

The management of the degree programmes at ZhSU is carried out based on collection, analysis and use of relevant information. The university provides this process based on modern information and communication technologies and software, determines the scope and structure of periodically updated information and responsible persons for the reliability and timeliness, completeness of information. The collection and analysis of information on the activities

of the teaching staff ensure a high level of students' satisfaction with the implementation of the degree programmes, and with the work of the internal quality assurance system.

The expert group is convinced that central procedures are in place and continuously improved at ZhSU. Since the last accreditation, the university still collects and analyses data to assess the effectiveness of the activity, determine the degree of implementation of the mission, goals and objectives, and opportunities for continuous improvement of the service provided, which is the implementation of the degree programmes at Bachelor and Master level.

7.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.

8.1 Implementation

The university has online resources for providing information to all interested stakeholders. The official website of the university includes information on the structure and activities of the entire university, the mission of the university and objectives in the field of education and research.

The university website provides all necessary information to applications, students, teachers, employees, external stakeholders etc.

The main sources of information about the implementation of the mission, goals and objectives of the University are published materials about activities in the media and news feeds (e.g. "Khabar", "Kazakhstan", "ZHETYSU"), the Internet (the University's website: zhgu.edu.kz, social networks), in printed publications such as "Kazakhstanskaya Pravda", "Egemen Kazakhstan", "Modern education", "Higher education in Kazakhstan. Accreditation and nostrification", "Zhetysu" and "Alatau Lights".

The University has a media center, whose main task is to form a positive public opinion about the University and improve the image of the University through the media.

More than 50 information about the University is available on the electronic sites "Taldykorgan online", "Egemen KZ", "Law KZ", "Bnews", "Tengri news", "Kazakparat", "Kazinform", "Nur KZ" and social networks Facebook, Instagram

The university publishes once a month the Almaty regional socio-political youth newspaper "ZHETISU Universiteti".

8.2 Assessment

The information about the university and the study programmes is publicly available. The main source of information is the official website of the university which is available in three languages Kazakh, Russian and English. Moreover, the university publishes news and other updates in national and local newspapers, social media etc. The information is up-to-date and clearly understandable.

8.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.

9.1 Implementation

Updating of the content of the study programmes is carried out annually on the basis of proposals from employers, students and teaching staff. Changing the structure of the study programme is carried out as amendments to legislative and regulatory acts.

The department of testing and monitoring annually conducts questionnaires of the employers. Employers' Councils have been established at the faculties.

The modular educational programmes are updated when the requirements for a specialist change, changes in technologies and labour organization.

ZhSU conducts various kinds of surveys of students, graduates, teaching staff and other employees. Questionnaire of students and faculty covers following areas: anti-corruption, survey of first year students, student satisfaction with the quality of the educational process, survey of the employees, satisfaction with the organization of practice and on inclusive education.

Sociological survey are conducted on a voluntary basis and anonymously. Students' questions and suggestions received after the surveys are considered by the management, discussed and analysed at various levels (advisors-department-dean's office – vice-rector-rector), and then appropriate decisions are made. The results of the survey are brought to the structural divisions of the university and are considered by departments when developing working curriculum, modules, and professional competencies.

ZhSU annually holds meetings of the rector with the active student community, including members of the Committee for youth Affairs, heads of academic groups.

Graduates and employers take an active part in the educational process: they recommend elective courses, curriculum and programs are agreed with them.

9.2 Assessment

The process of continuous monitoring and readjustment of the study programmes is well documented, transparent and conducted as described in the self-documentation. Its cornerstone is an annual review of the curriculums of all study programmes under the leadership of the Chair which is responsible for the respective study programme. The focus clearly is to ensure high level of employability of graduates which is reflected by the fact that every faculty is advised by an Employer Council. Moreover, all study programmes contain courses which are taught by practitioners (equivalent to twenty per cent of all teaching).

The peer review team during the online site visit was able to verify that all relevant stakeholder groups (employer representatives, lecturers, graduates/alumni and current students) are closely involved in the process.

All recommendations of the first accreditation were implemented. Accordingly, peer review experts were presented with examples of recent curriculum adjustments. These include the addition of two English language courses in the Accounting and Audit programme, the implementation of courses on banking services, corporate finance, corporate management and academic writing in the Finance programme, the addition of courses on juvenile delinquency and criminal procedural law in the Jurisprudence programme and the addition of agrobusiness and economic standardization courses in the Economy programme.

A similar and equally well-structured procedure exists for the design and introduction of new study programmes. Here, the initiative may be taken by any Chair which then forms and leads a project group which must include lecturers, employer representatives and students. The conceptual work must be based on the legal framework set by the Ministry of Education. Moreover, employer representatives ensure that labour market requirements as well as national and international professional standards are adequately considered when programme contents and expected learning outcomes are elaborated. The draft programme will then be subjected to internal (university) and external expertise. If the study programme is evaluated well at this stage, it will be proposed to the university's Scientific Council for final internal approval before it will be forwarded to the Ministry of Education for the final external approval.

Further development of the degree programs is additionally done through evaluation. There are several student surveys. Course evaluations are conducted regularly on user accounts. Various survey tools are used on the teaching platforms for this purpose. It is not clear whether the evaluation is voluntary or mandatory. After the students have answered the questionnaires, the results are evaluated. To what extent these are then communicated to the students is not

completely clear. The results are sent to different committees (the Scientific Council or the Academic Council) depending on what was the subject of the evaluation. At each faculty there is a committee for quality assurance, in which students are represented. When there is a question about updating the program content, students are invited to join a working group. According to the students, the program directors are interested in working closely with them.

Overall, the assessment of the existing instruments for the further development of the study programmes is positive, and the experts were able to discern a trend towards continuous improvement since the first accreditation in almost all areas. In particular, the systemic involvement of all relevant stakeholder groups in curriculum design and curriculum review is laudable. Furthermore, continuous efforts are made to include recent research findings and labour market requirements with respect to skill, knowledge and competence into the study programmes which are well reflected by the expected learning outcomes. Student support - academic and social - is very comprehensive and thus ensures a learning environment which is conducive to the successful completion of the study programmes by the vast majority of students, equally for full-time and distance learning students.

9.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

10 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis

10.1 Implementation

At the present time 62 study programmes at ZhSU were successfully accredited by national and international accreditation agencies. In the academic year 2018-2019, the university successfully passed institutional accreditation and reaccreditation of 22 study programmes.

ZhSU regularly takes part in national and international university and study programmes rankings.

10.2 Assessment

The study programmes at the university go through regular external quality assurance in accordance with the ESG-Standards.

Furthermore, the quality of education is also ensured by regular external evaluations of the bachelor's degree programs. For this purpose, the university uses the EEEA (External evaluation of educational achievements). These tests are carried out by the Ministry of Education

and Teaching of the Republic of Kazakhstan with the involvement of ministerial and other experts, especially from other universities in Kazakhstan. This instrument of external control of the graduating classes is the most suitable for checking the content of studies and assessing the level of knowledge of students. It is worth mentioning that all students of the final years achieved the required number of points. High results were achieved in the elective subjects (special subjects).

Another instrument of quality assurance is the FSA (final state attestation). This is an internal evaluation instrument. For this purpose, an independent commission verifies the students' level of knowledge by means of comprehensive (exam) examinations and a defense of the final thesis. It represents a state control of student performance and is intended to check the conformity between the knowledge acquired and the knowledge required, which means that the results of the FSA should provide information about the quality of education students are receiving.

In a broader sense, the involvement and discussion rounds with external experts from (regional) business and administration can also be seen as a quality assurance component. Through the critical examination of the learning objectives and learning outcomes by the external experts, the study program objectives are reviewed and adjusted, this includes content as well as general concepts, coherence of modules as well as teaching methods.

10.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

IV Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

1 **Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version**

The study programmes “Jurisprudence” (Bachelor/ Master), “Economics” (Bachelor/Master), “Accounting and Audit” (Bachelor/ Master), “Finance” (Bachelor/ Master), “State and Local Governance” (Bachelor/ Master) were assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG) and the national or other relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standard 1.1** (Policy for quality assurance) is partially fulfilled.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standard 1.2** (Design and approval of programmes is partially fulfilled for the study programme “State and Local Governance” (Bachelor).

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards 1.2** (Design and approval of programmes), 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled for the study programmes “Jurisprudence” (Bachelor/ Master), “Economics” (Bachelor/Master), “Accounting and Audit” (Bachelor/ Master), “Finance” (Bachelor/ Master), “State and Local Governance” (Master).

The assessment criteria are as follows:

Standard 1.1 Policy for quality assurance: Universities have a publicly accessible quality assurance strategy, which is part of their strategic management. This strategy is developed and implemented by internal stakeholder representatives through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.

The criterion is **partially fulfilled** because relevant structures must be established at the university to ensure academic and research integrity of the teaching staff and students.

Standard 1.2 Design and approval of programmes: Universities have procedures for the design and approval of their courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved. The qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The criterion is **fulfilled** for the study programmes “Jurisprudence“ (Bachelor/ Master), “Economics“ (Bachelor/Master), “Accounting and Audit“ (Bachelor/ Master), “Finance“ (Bachelor/ Master), “State and Local Management“ (Master).

The criterion is **partially fulfilled** for the study programme “State and Local Management“ (Bachelor) because the study programme requires an adjustment of the curriculum. The curriculum must be supplemented with competences in the field of public law.

Standard 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment: Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification: Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.5 Teaching staff: Universities ensure the competence of their teachers. They use fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment and further training of their employees.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.6 Learning resources and student support: The university has adequate funding to finance study and teaching and ensure that there is always a sufficient and readily available range of learning and support available for their studies.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.7 Information management: Universities ensure that they collect, analyze and use the relevant data relevant to the successful conduct of studies and other activities.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.8 Public information: Universities publish easily understandable, correct, objective, up-to-date and well-accessible information about their activities and courses of study.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes: Universities are constantly monitoring their courses and regularly reviewing them to ensure that they achieve the goals set and meet the needs of students and society. The tests lead to a continuous improvement of the courses. All affected parties will be informed about any measures planned or resulting from this.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance: Universities regularly undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the ESG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

National criteria: if applicable, national criteria are integrated in the ESG standards or listed separately.

The peer-review experts note that the recommendations from the previous accreditation procedure have been adequately taken into account.

2 Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review experts recommend accreditation of the study programmes “Jurisprudence” (Bachelor/ Master), “Economics” (Bachelor/Master), “Accounting and Audit” (Bachelor/ Master), “Finance” (Bachelor/ Master), “State and Local Governance” (Bachelor/ Master) with conditions.

The peer-review experts recommend the following **conditions and recommendations**:

General condition

1. Relevant structures must be established at the university to ensure academic and research integrity of the teaching staff and students.

Condition for study programme “State and Local Governance” (Bachelor)

1. The curriculum must be supplemented with competences in the field of public law.

General recommendations

1. Measures to improve gender equality and diversity should be implemented. In addition, aspects of gender equality and diversity could be considered in the curriculum.
2. ECTS system especially measurement of the student workload and ECTS grades should be properly implemented.
3. Number of modules in English language should be increased.
4. Different faculties should seek interdisciplinary cooperation with regards to the development of study programmes.

Recommendation for the study programme “Economics” (Bachelor)

1. Final exams or other assessment should focus more on testing students applied and problem-solving skills.

Recommendation for the study programme “Economics” (Master)

1. Teaching, learning and examination methods should be further aligned to the Master level.

Recommendation for the study programme “State and Local Governance“ (Bachelor)

1. The university should reconsider whether modules with microeconomic/business focus could be replaced by modules with content on administrative competencies and a broader view of state structure, legal frameworks, and bureaucratic endeavours.

V Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

1 Accreditation Decision

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statement of the Higher Education Institution, the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN made on the 28 June 2021 the following decision unanimously:

The study programmes are accredited with the following general and specific conditions and recommendations:

General condition

- **Relevant structures must be established at the university to ensure academic and research integrity of the teaching staff and students.**

General recommendations

- Measures to improve gender equality and diversity should be implemented. In addition, aspects of gender equality and diversity could be considered in the curriculum.
- ECTS system especially measurement of the student workload and ECTS grades should be properly implemented.
- Number of modules in English language should be increased.
- Different faculties should seek interdisciplinary cooperation with regards to the development of study programmes.

Jurisprudence (Bachelor of Law)

The study programme „Jurisprudence“ (Bachelor of Law) is accredited without any specific conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclusion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

Jurisprudence (Master of Law)

The study programme „Jurisprudence“ (Master of Law) is accredited without any specific conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclusion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

Economics (Bachelor of Business and Management)

The study programme „Economics“ (Bachelor of Business and Management) is accredited without any specific conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclusion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

Economics (Master of Business and Management)

The study programme „Economics“ (Master of Business and Management) is accredited without any specific conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclu-

sion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

The following recommendation is given for the further development of the study programme:

- Teaching, learning and examination methods should be further aligned to the Master level.

Accounting and Audit (Bachelor of Business and Management)

The study programme „Accounting and Audit“ (Bachelor of Business and Management) is accredited without any specific conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclusion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

Accounting and Audit (Master of Business and Management)

The study programme „Accounting and Audit“ (Master of Business and Management) is accredited without any specific conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclusion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

Finance (Bachelor of Business and Management)

The study programme „Finance“ (Bachelor of Business and Management) is accredited without any specific conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclusion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

Finance (Master of Business and Management)

The study programme „Finance“ (Master of Business and Management) is accredited without any specific conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclusion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

State and Local Governance (Bachelor of Business and Management)

The study programme „State and Local Governance“ (Bachelor of Business and Management) is accredited with a following specific condition:

- The curriculum must be supplemented with competences in the field of public law.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclusion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

The following recommendation is given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should reconsider whether modules with microeconomic/business focus could be replaced by modules with content on administrative competencies and a broader view of state structure, legal frameworks, and bureaucratic endeavours.

State and Local Governance (Master of Business and Management)

The study programme „State and Local Governance“ (Master of Business and Management) is accredited without any specific conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 January 2023.

The Higher Education Institution must submit documents that prove the fulfilment of the conditions by 14 July 2022. If the Accreditation Commission comes to the conclusion that the conditions are fulfilled, the accreditation will be extended until 30 September 2028. If the Higher Education Institution fails to prove the fulfilment of the conditions in due time, the accreditation will not be extended.

The accreditation procedure may be suspended for up to 18 months after response from the Higher Education Institution, with the expectation that the Higher Education Institution will remedy the deficiencies within the given time frame. This statement must be submitted until 14 August 2021.

2 Fulfilment of conditions

Based on the evaluation of the submitted documents and statement of the Higher Educational Institution, the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN decided on its meeting on 12 September 2022:

Jurisprudence (Bachelor of Law)

The conditions of the study programme “Jurisprudence“ (Bachelor of Law) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.

Jurisprudence (Master of Law/Law Sciences)

The conditions of the study programme “Jurisprudence“ (Master of Law/Law Sciences) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.

Economics (Bachelor of Business and Management)

The conditions of the study programme “Economics“ (Bachelor of Business and Management) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.

Economics (Master of Business and Management/Economic Sciences)

The conditions of the study programme “Economics” (Master of Business and Management/Economic Sciences) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.

Accounting and Audit (Bachelor of Business and Management)

The conditions of the study programme “Accounting and Audit” (Bachelor of Business and Management) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.

Accounting and Audit (Master of Business and Management/Economic Sciences)

The conditions of the study programme “Accounting and Audit” (Master of Business and Management/Economic Sciences) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.

Finance (Bachelor of Business and Management)

The conditions of the study programme “Finance” (Bachelor of Business and Management) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.

Finance (Master of Business and Management/Economic Sciences)

The conditions of the study programme “Finance” (Master of Business and Management/Economic Sciences) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.

State and Local Governance (Bachelor of Business and Management)

The conditions of the study programme “State and Local Governance” (Bachelor of Business and Management) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.

State and Local Governance (Master of Business Management/Economic Sciences)

The conditions of the study programme “State and Local Governance” (Master of Business Management/Economic Sciences) are fulfilled. The accreditation period is extended until 30 September 2028.