

To the Accreditation Council of the
Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and
Quality Assurance in Education and
Healthcare
July 20, 2023

REPORT
OF AN EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF
EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM
“ADULT, PEDIATRIC GASTROENTEROLOGY”
ACCREDITATION OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMS
(RESIDENCE SPECIALTY) OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL
ORGANIZATIONS
JSC "RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF CARDIOLOGY AND INTERNAL
DISEASES"

external expert evaluation period: June 29 - July 1, 2023

Almaty 2023

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children”	4
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	5
2.3	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on self-assessment of the educational program in the specialty - 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for educational programs of PhD doctoral studies in healthcare and conclusions	5
3.	Description of external expert assessment and conclusion	6
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of residency training in the specialty - 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children”	8
5.	Recommendations for improvement in the specialty - 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children”	27
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	28
	Appendix 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment and educational program of residency in the specialty - 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children”	29
	Appendix 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert assessment	30

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
JSC	Joint-Stock Company
SEC	State Examination Commission
State Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan	State compulsory education standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan
State guaranteed volume of medical care	Guaranteed volume of free medical care
JD	Job description
DPAE	Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare
IS	Information Security
FSC	Final state certification
RW	Research work
IEP	Individual education plan
CB	Clinical base
KazNMU	Kazakh National Medical University
CTA	Comprehensive testing of applicants
CIS	Instrumentation assets
CDC	Consultative and diagnostic center
CEP	Committee for Educational Programs
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
KInEH	Kazakhstan information encyclopedic dictionary
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MTE	Material and technical equipment
RI	Research Institute
JSC RIC&ID	Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Disease
RW	Research work
RRW	Resident's research work
STP	Scientific and technical program
NGO	NGO
EP	Educational program
EC	Educational services
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Exam
MSHI	Mandatory social health insurance
TRE	Tolerance Rating Evaluation
RSU	Regulations on the structural unit
PBL	Problem-Based Learning
TS	Teaching staff
Ps	Position
MD	Major disciplines
AT	Advanced training
WC	Working curriculum
RAC	Republican Allergy Center

CBL	Case-based-learning
mass media	Mass media
QMS	Quality Management System
IWR	Independent work of a resident
IWRT	Independent work of a resident under the guidance of a teacher
TTA	Technical training aids
TC	Typical curriculum
TBL	Team-based-learning (team training)
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
HRMLS	Human resource management and legal support
AC	Academic Council

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare (hereinafter referred to as ECAQA) Order No. 16 dated June 15, 2023, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external assessment of the educational program during the period from June 29 to July 1, 2023 residency "Allergology and immunology for adults, children" in the following composition:

№	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	Morenko Marina Alekseevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Children's Diseases with courses in Allergology, Hematology and Endocrinology of NJSC "Astana Medical University", Vice-President of the Association of Immunologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Chief Children's Allergist-Immunologist of the Astana University Hospital
2	Foreign expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of CardioRheumatology of the Institution "National Center for Maternal and Child Health" of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Chief Rheumatologist of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Vice-President of the Association of Rheumatologists of Central Asia and Kazakhstan
3	Academic expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Childhood Diseases with Neonatology of the NAO West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after. M. Ospanova"
4	Academic expert	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Clinical Disciplines of the Higher School of Medicine of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Leading Researcher at JSC Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, Almaty
5	Employers' representative	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	Deputy Director for the Medical Department of the Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital of the State Public Enterprise at the RPV "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"

6	Residents' representative	Ismailov Musa Kenzhegaliuly	Resident 2 years of study in the specialty "General Surgery" NAO "
---	---------------------------	--------------------------------	--

The observer from ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulations of EEC (Order of the ECAQA General Director No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational program 7R09140 “Gastroenterology, adults, children” for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational program and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the residency educational program in specialty 7R09140 “Gastroenterology, adults, children”

Name of organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	JSC "Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases" BIN 990240008700
Government	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the first manager	Pashimov Marat Orumbasarovich
date of creation	
Location and contact details	050000, Almaty, st. Aiteke bi 120 Tel: +7 727-233-00-61
State license for educational activities in PhD doctoral studies (date, number)	unlimited state license for postgraduate professional education No. KZ19LAA00012857 dated September 18, 2018
Year of commencement of the accredited educational program (EP)	<i>It is planned to accept residents from 2023</i>
Duration of training	2 years
Full-time teachers/part-time teachers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % sedate	4/100%
Link to the university website where information about the educational program is posted	ncvb.kz

At this time, the Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine (hereinafter referred to as the Institute or JSC “RIC&ID”) is a multidisciplinary clinic with a capacity of 155 beds, providing highly qualified and specialized medical services in 8 areas, implementing and introducing into practical healthcare the results of scientific achievements in the field of internal diseases, providing outpatient consultations medical services, provides educational services for the training of doctors in residency and additional medical education. In 2021, JSC “RIC&ID” successfully passed the international accreditation of JCI (USA), National accreditation (Highest category). The Institute has a license from the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018, registration KZ19LAA00012857, without a time limit, for the right to carry out educational activities of postgraduate education, according to which it has the right to issue state-issued educational documents; as well as General license for medical activities No. 14000939 dated January 20, 2014, issued by the Almaty Health Department.

In accordance with the Charter, approved by the Decision of the Sole Shareholder No. 719 dated July 20, 2018, one of the main activities of JSC “RIC&ID” is educational. In 2018, the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan re-registered the license for postgraduate education No. KZ19LAA00012857 dated September 18, 2018. Residency programs are implemented in accordance with the Academic Policy of Residency Educational Programs of JSC “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine”, the Rules for organizing the educational process in residency, approved by the Decision of the Academic Council dated September 2, 2022, protocol No. 4.

The total number of teachers involved in the educational process of residency and additional professional training is 66 people, of whom are Doctor of Medical Sciences. - 6, Ph.D. – 11, PhD -3, masters - 1, doctors of the highest category - 49, doctors of the first category -10.

The Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education (hereinafter referred to as DPAAE) is a structural subdivision of JSC “RIC&ID” and operates on the basis of regulations governing educational activities: educational license No. KZ19LAA00012857 dated September 18, 2018; On approval of the Concept of lifelong learning (continuing education); Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 28, 2023 No. 248. DPAAE reports to the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Activities.

Characteristics of the studied educational program 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children”: period of mastery: 2 years; form of study: full-time; graduate qualifications: doctor - gastroenterologist.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

To date, accreditation of the educational program 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” has not been carried out.

2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on self-assessment of the educational program in the specialty 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of educational programs 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” and conclusions:

The report on self-assessment of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01105 “Gastroenterology, adults, children” (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 141 pages of main text, 15-page appendices, copies or electronic versions of documents located at the link ncvb.kz/

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of the educational program provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as internal consistency of information. Attached to the report is a covering letter signed by the head, Chairman of the Board of JSC “RIC&ID”, Marat Orumbasarovich Pashimov, which confirms the reliability of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 5 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting self-assessment of the educational program - Kulzida Mukeevna Koshumbaeva, Ph.D., Associate Professor of the Department of Cardiology of JSC "Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases"

Self-assessment of the educational program in the specialty 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” was carried out on the basis of order No. 92 dated 04/11/2023 “On conducting specialized accreditation for 5 educational programs of JSC “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases” and No. 96 dated 04/11/2023. “On the creation of a working group for organizing and conducting specialized accreditation for 5 educational programs of JSC “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases”, order “On approval of the internal commission on specialized accreditation” No. 134P.

The report was studied and analyzed by accreditation expert Zhumalina A.K. In the process of feedback with a representative of the educational organization and experts, answers to the questions that arose were received and appropriate changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

All standards contain the actual practice of JSC “RIC&ID” in training residents and planning the training of residents in the specialty 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children”, reasoned data, approaches to implementing the objectives of the educational program, planning national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, results of assessment of knowledge and skills, material and technical base of JSC “RIC&ID” and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases) , financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is presented to ECAQA in a completed form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in literate language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, the tables contain links in the text and are continuously numbered.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e. carrying out verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external peer review

External expert work as part of the assessment of the educational program 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external assessment of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA and in accordance with the program approved by ECAQA Order No. 16 dated June 15, 2023 by the General Director of the ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S. and agreed with the head of JSC “RIC&ID” M.O. Pashimov. Dates of visit to the organization: 29.06.-1.06. 2023

External assessment is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the program), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in Appendix 3 to this report. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of external peer review.

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 5 people;
- interviews with residents – 4 people, including foreign ones (if applicable, write from which countries);
- study the website ncvb.kz (write the address);
- interviewing 5 employees, 4 teachers;
- survey of teachers - 10;
- visited the departments of JSC “RIC&ID”, where training will be conducted under the educational program 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” with the participation of 4 full-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 49 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in Appendix 2).

The team of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

№	Job title	Quantity
1	<p>Management</p> <p>1. Marat Orumbasarovich Pashimov – Chairman of the Board, Ph.D.</p> <p>2. Deputy Chairman of the Board for strategic and financial-economic issues Tazhimurat Ermek Atchibaevich</p> <p>3. Head of the department of strategic development and organizational and methodological work Abdikaliev Nurlan Abdikalievich</p> <p>4. Deputy Chairman of the Board for scientific, clinical and innovative work, Ph.D. Kaibullaeva Jamila Akhtanovna</p> <p>5. Head of the Scientific Research Management Department Laura Bakhytzhonovna Danyarova</p> <p>6. Head of the Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education Tashetova Aigul Balabekovna</p>	6
2	<p>Teaching staff</p> <p>1. Tanabaeva Ainash Serikovna - assistant of the department of gastroenterology, head of the clinical research department</p> <p>2. Esetova Gulstan Utegenovna - head of the pulmonology unit, head of the department, doctor</p> <p>3. Batyrbaeva Arai Zhanatovna - head of the allergy unit</p> <p>4. Olga Vasilievna Mashkunova - head of the rheumatology, therapeutic unit</p>	4
3	Human Resources Department – Aizholova Gulnar Kenzhekhanovna	1
4	Residents	10
5	<p>Graduates</p> <p>1. Fedosina Marina Vladimirovna</p> <p>2. Botabekova Aigerim Zhumabekovna</p> <p>3. Bolekhanova Elmira</p>	3
6	<p>Employers</p> <p>– Mayra Nabimuratovna Sharipova - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head. sector of patent-information and evidence-based medicine, pediatric gastroenterologist of JSC “Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery”;</p> <p>– Nugmanova Balzhan Tursunkhanovna – head of the Hepatic Center of Almaty at the State Enterprise at the RPV “City Clinic No. 5”;</p> <p>– Ibekenov Onlasyn Tolegenovich – Head of the strategic block of the National Scientific Center for Surgery named after. A. Syzganova</p>	3

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external assessment. A final discussion was held on the results of the external assessment of the educational program, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, and questionnaires. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external assessment are made. The experts individually completed the “Quality Profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational program 7R01104 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.” No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational program were discussed by the chairman M.A. Morenko. A final open vote was held on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external assessment as part of specialized accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC; during the work, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of JSC “RIC&ID”, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to EEC members.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external assessment as part of specialized accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

When conducting a survey of teachers, 80% completely agreed and 20% of teachers partially agreed that the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

3. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01105 “Adult and pediatric gastroenterology”

Standard 1: MISSION AND RESULTS

Evidence of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement

When implementing program activities, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. The mission of the EP “Gastroenterology for adults, children” is consistent with the mission of the institute, developed in accordance with the health needs of society and the country's medical care system and is aimed at achieving a world level in the main areas of activity based on the development of an innovative approach, expanding the range of educational services through the implementation of continuous multi-level education.

Most participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational program, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, and the mission is brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, and information letters to medical organizations. The organization's strategic plan for a period of 5 years was reviewed, including such areas as educational, research, clinical, which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization, which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents (of other specialties), it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and training bases.

During the visit to the divisions of JSC “RIC&ID”, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational program, including: there is a division directly related to the educational program - the Department of Postgraduate and Continuing Education; there are procedures for the development and adoption of legal acts and their management; conditions have been created for mastering the necessary competencies; EPs are developed on the basis of a competency-oriented model of a residency graduate, in accordance with the needs of the labor market; highly qualified teachers and mentors; sufficient material and technical base. Residents noted that, under the guidance of curators and mentors, they have the opportunity to participate in research work, publications, and make presentations at scientific, practical and clinical conferences.

It should be noted that JSC “RIC&ID” has the conditions for the implementation of the educational process for an accredited EP and there is the opportunity to conduct seminars and scientific research. The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational program 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” and the educational process are built in accordance with the State Standard of Education and the current regulations (NLA) in postgraduate education and healthcare. At the same time, during meetings with management, teachers, residents (of other specialties), experts identified insufficient

work with employers and students in discussing the mission and their participation in advisory bodies. According to the documents submitted by the Committee of Educational Programs (CEP), employers in accredited specialties were not on the list.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

To verify **standard 1**, a meeting was held with the head of the organization, M.O. Pashimov. During the conversation, experts asked questions about the involvement of teachers and students in the work of the methodological commission, the involvement of employers and all interested parties in the formation of proposals for choosing programs, improving the material and technical base, the main directions of strategic planning, as well as approaches to attracting employees of clinical sites for teaching, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, the information security of education and about problems in the management and development of human resources. During the conversation, Pashimov M.O. noted that the personnel potential of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital currently consists of highly professional specialists in the field of therapy, cardiology, and there are currently plans to attract other specialists from other universities and expand international relations with partners. Regarding the improvement of the material and technical base, he noted that the admissions department and the reception and diagnostic department have been renovated and work will continue to improve the departments. During the answers, the head of the organization confirmed and voiced the vision and key activities for the implementation of the development strategy, integration of clinical, scientific and educational activities; the experts also reviewed the strategic plan for 5 years, some financial documents, the annual plan for 2023 and the report for 2022, interviews were conducted with employees of the human resources department and the financial and economic sector, which made it possible to validate **accreditation standards 8**.

The 10 teachers surveyed (23 survey questions) responded that 80% were satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this educational organization, and 20% partially agreed with this statement. Experts determined that JSC “RIC&ID” has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees and responds promptly to requests and requests. In the questionnaire, 60% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 30% are partially satisfied. According to 90% of educational organizations, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. The teaching experience of the respondents: up to 5 years – 50%, up to 10 years – 20%, over 10 years – 30%.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

During the interview and visit, it was revealed that the final learning outcomes are aimed at mastering clinical skills in the specialty, communication with patients and colleagues, developing professionalism, regulatory literacy, scientific research skills, personal and professional growth throughout life. Students can obtain information about the final learning results at www.ncvb.kz/ or in DPAAE. When visiting the clinical base (therapy department) and during interviews with students, confirmation was received that, for example, residents make a diagnosis and carry out treatment, prevention, medical rehabilitation, dynamic observation of adult and pediatric patients with pathology of the digestive system at all levels of medical care. Quite effective mechanisms for observing the principles of academic integrity have been introduced into the educational process of residency - the Board of Directors, the internal audit service, and the quality management department. Special support services have been created (social and psychological service, Atameken party group, etc.) for students - DPAAE, clinical mentors, department doctors, etc.

The surveyed teachers responded that 30% were completely satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, while 50% were partially satisfied, and 20% were partially dissatisfied.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programs. The organization has developed 8 additional education programs, including for graduates of program 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children.” Residents are informed about this.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of mission and final results

Administrative and management personnel and teaching staff take an active part in the formation of the Mission and the final results of the educational program. During conversations with residents and employers, experts asked the questions “Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?”, “What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational program. *Residents responded that they were members of the Council of Young Scientists, and employers responded that they actively participate in master classes, training seminars, and scientific and practical conferences, but are not members of advisory councils.*

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully -13, partially -1, do not comply - 0.

Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Ensure the involvement of a wider range of stakeholders (teachers, students, employers) in the development of the mission, strategic development plan of the organization (1.4.1)

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM

Evidence of compliance:

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program

To implement the educational program 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children”, the organization’s documents contain EMCD, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Experts established compliance with State Standards and standard requirements. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since experts studied the code of ethics (Protocol No. 3 of May 21, 2023) and during the interview, residents responded that they were informed about the contents of this document. Resident evaluations are based on the principles of academic integrity. And in case of violation of the Rules of Academic Integrity, disciplinary sanctions are applied to participants in the educational process, in accordance with the Code of Academic Integrity, approved by the minutes of the Academic Council dated 09/02/2022 No. 4.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The mentoring system was evaluated, which is described in the document “Regulations on Mentoring”, approved by the protocol of the scientific and clinical council No. 4 of 09/02/2022. The number of mentors is planned based on the number of residents enrolled in the EP “Gastroenterology for adults and children.”

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the Job Description of a Resident Doctor DI - VR -40-03-2021 dated 16.02. 21. This demonstrates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of tailoring training to the needs of residents. At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in the document “Student Honor Code” (06/18/2020), JSC “RIC&ID” does not have an anti-plagiarism system. According to the head of DPAE, JSC “RIC&ID” purchased this system, but there was no installation.

2.2 Scientific method

During a meeting with the Deputy Chairman of the Board of Research Institute of Clinical and Innovative Medicine for scientific, clinical and innovative work, D. A. Kaibullaeva, it was established that, along with the development of clinical skills, the EP residency provides for the involvement of students throughout the entire period of study in the implementation of scientific activities. Modern achievements of science and practice are reflected in annually updated CEDs (components of choice), focused on healthcare needs. The catalog of elective disciplines (CED) of the educational program of the specialty “Adult and Pediatric Gastroenterology” includes the discipline “Research Management”, which includes clinical research and clinical epidemiology (number of hours 120). When talking with residents from other specialties, experts learned that they use scientific evidence in their training and

know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach residents methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency program Structure, content and duration of the residency program

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs. The educational process at JSC “RIC&ID” is organized in accordance with the “Rules for organizing the educational process in credit technology of education” (order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152), license for postgraduate education No. KZ19LAA00012857 dated September 18, 2018. (Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan).

Residency programs are implemented in accordance with the Academic Policy of Residency Educational Programs of JSC “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine”, the Rules for organizing the educational process in residency, approved by the Decision of the Academic Council of September 20, 2020, protocol No. 4.

The duration of training for the program 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” is 2 years. Qualification of graduates: doctor - gastroenterologist. The number of hours for two years of study is 4200. Residents master 140 credits, 4 of which are in the elective component (ED) - elective disciplines.

Responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with D. A. Kaibullaeva. A model of graduate professional competence has been developed at JSC “RIC&ID” (Decision of the Academic Council dated November 24, 2021).

The content of the educational program and the catalog of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including the consistent acquisition by residents of clinical skills, clinical decision-making skills, communication skills, patient safety issues, medical ethics, which are considered both during skills development in practical classes and during the joint work of residents with clinical mentors, practicing doctors at clinical sites, as well as the specifics of research work and scientific achievements of teachers. These include the following: to participate in clinical trials based on a modern approach, the co-investigator must have the appropriate experience and competence (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. MoH RK-310/2020, Appendix 1 Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 11, 2020 No. MoH RK-248/2020 in accordance with paragraph 6 of Article 238 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 7, 2020 “On the health of the people and the healthcare system”).

Resident doctors are required to undergo GCP training and receive a certificate of completion. Residents of JSC “RIC&ID” for the period 2018-2023 took part in international observational programs, as well as clinical studies of phases II-IV. All theoretical skills are practiced during “Journal Clubs” (individual and group work, analysis of articles of various levels of evidence).

According to the implementation of the project “Modernization of medical education and science” dated 03.03.2017, as well as the implementation of the national project “Modernization of rural healthcare” (approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 30, 2022, No. 962), it is planned to expand the number of residents in the specialty 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for Adults, children”

JSC “RIC&ID” has its own clinical base with 155 beds and outpatient visits, and has also entered into 4 agreements with medical organizations and, within the framework of a strategic partnership, cooperates with international clinical centers and universities near and far abroad: Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology, Tomsk National Research Medical Center (NRMC), Federal State Budgetary Institution "National Medical Research Center" named after. V.A. Almazov, National Medical Research Center (NMRC) named after. Academician E.N. Meshalkin, Novosibirsk, Russian Federation, JSC "Center for Crisis Research" Kaunas, Republic of Lithuania, Seoul National

University Hospital, Republic of Korea, Beer Sheva Medical Center, Israel, University Hospital of Milan, Italy).

At the same time, to the question “Are representatives of residents and employers involved in the planning, development and approval of educational programs?”, the experts received the following answer that they are not involved enough..

2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (Standard 2) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the organization and conversations with the manager and employees. The interview was conducted with the deputy. Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovative Work Ph.D. Kaybullaeva D.A., head of the department of strategic development and organizational and methodological work Abdikaliev N.A., with the head of DPAE Tashetova A.B. and with the employees responsible for organizing the educational process Tanabaeva A.S., Esetova G.U., Batyrbaeva A.Zh., Mashkunova O.V..

The experts got acquainted with the work of departments, including departments, DPAE, and the centre for simulation technologies. A total of 3 meetings were held and during cross-interviews it was established that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all faculty and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, department regulations, agreements with teachers and residents, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and conversations with the manager and employees. During the visit, the experts saw that JSC “RIC&ID” promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including using simulation equipment.

Training of residents in the specialty 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare. Therefore, this organization is specialized in the field of gastroenterology, and provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in residency. Thus, experts have received information that the training of residents is carried out directly in the clinical departments of the gastroenterological profile - 8 beds, where residents gain knowledge and improve the skills of inpatient treatment, including intensive, as well as outpatient treatment, and get the opportunity to monitor continuity between different stages of therapy and rehabilitation of patients. Residents of this specialty can supervise patients with diseases such as gastritis, peptic ulcers, hepatitis, etc. This is facilitated by the mentoring that is carried out at the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 18 standards comply (including 15 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 16, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Ensure the involvement of a wider range of stakeholders (teachers, employers, students) in the planning, discussion, approval and improvement of the educational program (2.4.4).
- 2) Introduce an anti-plagiarism system into the results of research and independent work of residents (2.2.1).

Standard 3: RESIDENT ASSESSMENT

Evidence of compliance:

3.1 Assessment methods

Policies and methods for assessing residents are reviewed and approved at the DPAE meeting. The study of control and measurement tools in the discipline showed that for conducting current, milestone and final control for residents there are situational tasks of 2 and 3 levels of complexity (MCQ) in a ratio of 50% to 50%, in the amount of 600 per year, 100 tests per 1 resident, which will be

updated annually by the department. Adequate assessment policies have been implemented to provide a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. Current control is carried out by assessment using a checklist (seminar, analysis of a case study, direct observation, checklist for maintaining medical records, reflection of the dynamics of the disease in diaries, quality of maintaining and filling out the appointment sheet, etc.). All types of current control (practical classes, seminars, independent work of a resident (IW), independent work of a resident with a teacher (IWRT) and midterm control are calculated from 100 points. The exam is held at the end of each discipline in 2 stages: a theoretical question, a practical task. Intermediate certification – the average exam score for the past disciplines is displayed.

JSC “RIC&ID” uses additional methods for assessing residents, such as portfolios and assessment of scientific activities. Assessment methods are developed by the department and are reflected in syllabuses approved at a meeting of both the department and the DPAE.

The system for appealing assessment results is reflected in the “Regulations on intermediate and final certification” and during the period of operation of JSC “RIC&ID” there were no applicants for appeal.

When meeting with the head of DPAE Tashetova A.B, the experts asked the following questions: How are residents assessed? What documentation system is used during assessment? During a visit to the organization and during an interview with employee Kaibullaeva D.A., the commission received comprehensive answers and supporting documents that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes documents such as annual plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, agreements with teachers and residents, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and certificates. There are standardized tests and advanced clinical tasks for the written examination, which are compiled by the department and approved at a department meeting. A review of the website showed that its pages contain syllabus documents necessary for residents, samples of tests, tasks, tickets, recommended literature, a schedule of practical classes, thematic plans for seminars, and information about upcoming events in the organization, which is regularly updated.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

The results of students' educational achievements are entered into an electronic educational journal through the educational and methodological office and the AIS "Platonus" program, which automatically generates examination sheets. The electronic educational journal is filled out in accordance with the calendar and thematic plan, in accordance with the schedule and the dates of the current, midterm and final controls reflected in the syllabus.

The methodology for recording learning outcomes is prescribed in standard operating procedures (SOPs) and presented in the University Academic Policy, as well as in documents posted on the website.

The results of the assessment of JSC “RIC&ID” residents are reflected in the minutes and in the reports of the chairmen of the SAC. The methods used to assess the competencies of students at JSC “RIC&ID” are defined in syllabuses for disciplines, which are discussed and approved at department meetings, DPAE meetings, and the Academic Council.

When conducting interviews with 4 teachers regarding assessment methods, the experts received convincing information that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational program, depending on the specific clinical site (admission of residents to equipment, sufficient number of case patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work of residents). When asked about teacher training, experts were presented with training certificates on teaching methods.

During the visit, members of the EEC, along with the clinical base, visited the simulation centre. Taking into account the capabilities of the simulation centre, an integrated format for assessing students' EP knowledge should be provided.

Residents shared their opinions on the timeliness of providing tests, counselling before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. For example, residents said that they were generally satisfied with the training and assessment methods, but at the same time they would like more independent work with patients.

During a visit to the organization, management was asked the question: “Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?” And the answer was received: during the Final State Certification of Residents, leading experts from practical healthcare are involved as chairmen and members of the State Attestation Committee.

JSC “RIC&ID” evaluates the reliability and validity of assessment methods. Criteria for the rule of knowledge assessment: the scale and criteria for assessing knowledge are provided at each level (current, midterm control).

At the same time, experts did not receive evidence of the existence of a mechanism at JSC “RIC&ID” for determining the validity of the methods used to evaluate residents.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria comply with 8 standards (including 5 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully -6, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

Standard 3: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Develop and implement a program for assessing the quality of the assessment methods used for the validity and reliability of the final learning outcomes (3.1.2., 3.1.4).
- 2) Include in the professional development of teaching staff a module on teaching methods and assessment methods (3.2.2).

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

4.1 Admissions policy and selection

The organization has a policy for the admission of residents - “Rules for admission to residency”, protocol No. 3 of the Academic Council of JSC “RIC&ID” dated June 14, 2022, the “Academic Policy” has been updated (approved by the decision of the Academic Council, protocol 2 of May 16, 2023), which reflects all the necessary procedures for the admission and selection of residents. https://ncvb.kz/images/Академическая_политика.pdf

The head of DPAE Tashetova A.B. spoke about the policy for admitting residents. Approaches to the admission of residents are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, it is carried out on the basis of the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 “On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and higher education.” postgraduate education in accordance with the Rules for the organization of postgraduate education. Information about the required list of documents for admission to residency is posted on the JSC “RIC&ID” website, as well as in the admissions committee. Applications for residency programs at higher educational institutions are accepted from July 3 to July 25.

Approaches to the admission of residents are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, according to their applications on a competitive basis based on the results of the entrance exam. During the period of entrance examinations to residency, examination and appeal commissions are created for specialties.

The experts reviewed the documentation for the admission of residents, including the Rules for Admission to Residency. When talking with residents, all interviewed respondents (10 residents of other specialties) confirmed the objectivity and transparency of the procedure for admission to the residency program at JSC “RIC&ID”.

In general, many documents are drawn up correctly, but there are comments regarding the inclusion of resident representatives in the process of developing documents for the admission and selection of residents.

During a conversation with the heads of educational programs, information was received that the program of entrance exams for residency is formed by teachers of departments/courses of the university, approved at a meeting of the department, the Academic Council and posted on a stand/website. The website also contains introductory questions on residency educational programs. Entrance exams for residency are held from August 8 to August 16, enrollment is on August 28. Residency classes begin on September 1st. In order to ensure transparency of the examination procedure, a video recording of the examination is carried out; observers and commission members are present in the hall. In order to ensure compliance with uniform requirements and resolve controversial issues, an appeal commission is being created at JSC “RIC&ID” (Model rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing professional postgraduate training programs, order No. 600 with additions and changes in January 2023).

The chairman and composition of the appeal commission at JSC “RIC&ID” are approved by order of the Chairman of the Board. The resources of the university, the teaching staff of the departments, the number and powerful material and technical equipment of clinical bases, the professionalism of practical healthcare staff (clinical mentors) make it possible to ensure balance and opportunities for training and recruitment of residents.

4.2 Number of residents

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the State Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical and practical training, the maximum permissible load on curators, the provision of educational, educational, methodological and scientific literature, the throughput capacity of clinical bases, as well as the material and technical resources of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital.

According to the regulations on residency, the number of residents in each specialty per teacher is 1:3. If we take this ratio into account, JSC “RIC&ID” can accept up to 12 residents for the specialty “Gastroenterology for adults, children.”

Every year, taking into account the needs for medical personnel, JSC “RIC&ID” sends a request about the needs of scientific and pedagogical personnel and clinical specialties of residency to the Department of Science and Human Resources (DSHR).

In accordance with the submitted request, the Democratic People's Republic of China is allocated a State order for the training of medical personnel in residency.

4.3 Support and counseling for residents

To implement the competency-oriented Model of medical education, JSC “RIC&ID” operates a system of academic counseling for residents at the departments. For this purpose, by order of the Chairman of the Board, a curator is assigned to the resident, who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, manages the educational and scientific activities of the student, and provides assistance in employment. The curator is appointed from among the teaching staff of the department. In addition, the resident is assigned a clinical mentor in the medical organization where the resident is training. Its function is to guide the resident to master the practical skills and competencies necessary for the resident in the process of his training.

In order to optimize employment and monitor the careers of graduates, the Graduates Career Center was organized by order of the Chairman of the Board (order No. 4741 dated August 3, 2020). The Graduate Career Center promotes the employment of Institute graduates together with the Dean’s Office. In order to facilitate the employment of graduates of the Institute, the graduate career center annually conducts Personal Distribution of Graduates with the participation of representatives of health departments, pharmaceutical companies and public health departments of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Academic advisory work at JSC “RIC&ID” consists of advising residents during training and before the examination session. Before the start of each examination session, the department develops and approves a consultation schedule for disciplines.

4.4 Representation of residents

The quality of implementation of the educational program is ensured by the participation of

residents in discussing the mission of the university and the educational program. DPAE, on a par with managers and teachers, but when visiting JSC “RIC&ID” due to the lack of students at the moment, there is no information on the declared EP and the representation of resident students of other specialties is also not confirmed and there is no information in the documents.

4.5 Working conditions

According to the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. MoH RK-16 on the approval of the Rules for the training of medical personnel in internship and the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency, residency students studying under the state educational order are provided with a state scholarship in the prescribed manner. Residents are annually provided with a vacation between academic years of at least 6 weeks, after the final state certification of at least 4 weeks, with the retention of the scholarship.

For residents transferred from other higher educational institutions, reinstated, remaining for a second year of study, returning from academic leave, an individual plan is drawn up based on the working curriculum approved for the corresponding academic year, taking into account the difference in the curriculum or academic debt. Combining training with work (no more than 0.5 rate) in areas of activity close to his future specialty in his free time from study with the consent of the curator, head of the department and the residency sector.

If they have a specialist certificate, residents of the 2nd and 3rd years of study are allowed to conduct independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions, during extracurricular time. Residents, according to the schedule drawn up by the department, are part of the duty team at the clinical bases of the department, and upon completion, report at morning conferences.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): fully -19, partially -1, do not comply - 0

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Include representatives of residents in the process of developing documents for the admission and selection of residents (4.1.6).

Standard 5: TEACHERS

Evidence of compliance:

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

JSC “RIC&ID” has a system of qualification requirements for teachers, on the basis of which recruitment is carried out, with the subsequent holding of a competition according to the schedule approved by the Chairman of the Board. During the visit, the experts were familiarized with the personnel policy. (Hiring, promotion, incentives, dismissals, familiarization of personnel with rights and responsibilities are carried out by the HR Department of JSC “RIC&ID” on the basis of the Order of the Chairman of the Board. Admission to teaching positions in JSC “RIC&ID” is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 17, 2012 No. 230 “On approval of the Rules for competitive filling of positions of professorial teaching staff and researchers of higher educational institutions.”

In accordance with the requirements of the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 13, 2009 No. 338 “On approval of standard qualification characteristics of positions of teaching staff and persons equivalent to them”, when hiring for teaching positions, it is mandatory to take into account the candidates’ compliance with qualification requirements.

There are only 4 full-time teachers in the accredited program, no part-time teachers. Availability of qualified medical category 100%.

Experts are familiar with the Regulations on mentors and the Regulations on resident supervisors.

The opinion of teachers on personnel policy was obtained, which includes approaches to the development of teaching competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring.

During a conversation with the head of the HR department, Aizholova A.K. experts learned that, in accordance with the personnel policy, persons with an academic degree, academic master's degree or professional education in relevant areas are allowed to engage in teaching activities, and it should be noted that in the EP specialty “Gastroenterology for adults, children” there is 100% graduation, as well as All teachers in the residency specialty “Adult and Pediatric Gastroenterology” regularly improve their competencies by studying in advanced training cycles, and have certificates and qualifications. Teacher’s certificates are presented. A 1-year contract is concluded with clinical mentors

When surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (80%) are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace at JSC “RIC&ID”, and 20% of respondents are partially satisfied. At JSC “RIC&ID”, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 70% completely agree, 30% partially agree. Satisfied with the work of the postgraduate education department - 40% completely agree, 60% partially agree. Satisfied with the salary - 30% completely agree, 10% partially agree.

5.2 Faculty Commitment and Development.

The time schedule for each type of activity is established for teaching staff in accordance with the Employment Agreement, which is concluded with each employee individually. JSC “RIC&ID” teachers perform educational, clinical, scientific, organizational and educational work.

The time standard for calculating hours of teaching load is guided by: Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III “On Education”; State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2022 “Education system of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Academic work and teaching load.”

The calculation of the teaching load of teaching staff is carried out in accordance with the Standard Rules for the activities of higher education organizations (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 05/20/2013 No. 499) and the state standard for levels of education (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 08/23/2012 No. 1080).

Planning of the volume of educational work of residency departments is carried out on the basis of the WC and the assignment of academic disciplines to the department for various types of educational work.

The volume of teaching load of teaching staff is approved for the academic year by the Academic Council of JSC “RIC&ID” annually in accordance with the positions held.

The therapeutic load of teaching staff is regulated by orders of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan: “On introducing amendments and additions to the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 238 dated April 7, 2010 “On approval of standard staff and staffing standards for healthcare organizations” dated January 5, 2011 No. 10; No. 628 dated 09.11.12

The work of the residency teaching staff is carried out according to the individual teacher plan (ITP).

Each employee of the department, with a break from their main activities, undergoes full training under the program once every five years, with a total duration of at least 240 hours/credit units (4 modules), 60 hours per week.

Monitoring of the teacher’s work and the achievement of the intermediate and final results of the residency educational program is carried out using external and internal assessment systems.

The internal assessment system is guaranteed and carried out through intra-departmental control, the external assessment system is carried out through the annual certification of teaching staff for all types of activities, including residency work. Encouragement of the Institute's teaching staff is based on the principles of legality, transparency, rewards exclusively for special personal merits and achievements, stimulation of efficiency and quality of work. JSC “RIC&ID” also uses additional types of incentives: declaration of gratitude; rewarding with a valuable gift; awarding a certificate of honor; submission for ranks, medals and badges of the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is held annually, and 4 teachers participating in the implementation of the educational program of the specialty

“Gastroenterology for adults, children” have been trained over the past 5 years. These events are financed by JSC “RIC&ID”. The expert verified teacher certificates on topics such as: Evidence-based medicine technologies in clinical and managerial practice, Teacher of medical organizations and science, Expert facilitator, effective medical lectures.

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization - 70% of surveyed teachers responded, and 30% partially agreed with this. Studied in professional development programs: 30% during a given year, 60% - from 1 to 5 years, and 10% did not answer the question.

JSC “RIC&ID” implements social support programs for teachers - 30% answered that “yes, such programs exist,” 30% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 40% of respondents do not know about it.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard improvement): fully -8, partially -, do not comply - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Evidence of compliance:

6.1 Logistics and equipment

The material and technical base of JSC “RIC&ID” is constantly being improved; modern equipment, reagents, and technical training aids are being purchased. Training rooms have up to 10 seats and are located in the buildings of the clinical base. The training rooms are fully equipped for conducting seminars/practical classes, they have the necessary cabinet furniture, computer equipment: multimedia consoles with monitors. All classrooms are provided with unlimited Internet access. The DPAE includes 3 lecture halls, 11 classrooms for seminars and practical classes, 4 scientific and practical laboratories, 1 computer class, 2 scientific and methodological rooms. To master practical skills, 4 training and simulation centres have been created: - simulation endoscopic centre, simulation centre for cardiopulmonary resuscitation, simulation centre for interventional cardiology and arrhythmology, simulation centre (hybrid laboratory) for providing “Emergency Cardiac Care”, providing “Urgent Resuscitation Care”, “Providing medical care for COVID-19.”.

6.2 Clinical sites

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities. Visited the JSC “RIC&ID’s” own clinical base, intended for the diagnosis and treatment of patients. By order of the director of JSC “RIC&ID” dated January 15, 2021, the clinic's bed capacity was approved to provide a guaranteed volume of free medical care (GVFMC) in the amount of 155 beds, and JSC “RIC&ID” employees ensure collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff and the management of the clinical base to achieve final results for residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients is provided, modern equipment demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his training.

During a visit to the therapy department of the clinical base, where the gastroenterological profile is 10 beds, experts examined the resources to see how modern the equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare. The department provides specialized care to patients with pathologies of the gastrointestinal tract and hepato-biliary system. Practical skills are also developed during work at the outpatient clinic level (1 bed), when residents in the specialty 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” are directly involved in identifying and correcting social determinants of health.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with standard 6, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty "Cardiology" (currently there were no admissions of residents to the gastroenterology program and the experts talked with residents of other specialties to assess general approaches to organization of residency training). The experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, to which the residents responded that they were satisfied with the teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, because they believe that JSC "RIC&ID" has good resources, image and international connections, noted that the library has available resources of international databases of professional literature, when asked about working in Damumed with medical documentation, they answered that they log in through the mentors' login. At the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients. Residents showed their commitment to JSC "RIC&ID", were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research work, and financing. Experts examined documents of residents of other specialties (portfolios, results of resident assessments, checklists, and results of resident surveys).

6.3 Information technology

The library and information service consists of a subscription and a computer room, the total area of the premises is 53.5 sq.m. The information collection of the library contains book and magazine racks and a display rack for the exhibition of new periodicals. The subscription is a point for issuing literature and registering visitors. The computer class consists of 10 workstations with Internet access via a dedicated communication channel; in addition, there is a printer, copier, and scanner. Users work with various Kazakh-language, Russian-language and foreign databases (DBs). Every year, through the Association of University Libraries of the Republic of Kazakhstan, free test access to world-famous databases containing global arrays on medicine is provided: "EbscoHost-Medline", "Springerlink", "Scopus", "Web of Science", "Elsevier", "Thomson Reuters".

6.4 Clinical teams

As a result of the daily clinical activities included in the training process, residents have the opportunity to utilize interdisciplinary collaboration during case discussions, daily rounds, participation in consultations and telemedicine consultations.

The clinical bases of the EP "Gastroenterology for adults and children" have a sufficient number of patients with various diseases of the digestive system in adults and children, the opportunity to master ultrasound diagnostics and endoscopy within the specialty. Students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills - 100% of teachers completely agree with this.

6.5 Medical research and advances

The Educational Program for this specialty states that each resident is required to conduct scientific research during his independent work. Residents have the opportunity to improve their scientific thinking skills through training at seminars or master classes with the involvement of foreign specialists, while participating in republican and international conferences, symposia, etc. During the conversation, it was established that residents of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital are involved as research doctors in the implementation of scientific and technological progress, in particular, 1 resident of another specialty participated in an international, multicentre, non-interventional study to evaluate disease control and treatment regimens for patients with moderate and severe inflammatory bowel diseases in real clinical practice. Confirmation of the relevant competence of a resident doctor is the presence of a certificate of completion of GCP training in accordance with international standards.

Residents are planned to participate in the Journal Club with the goal of learning to read and understand scientific articles and critically evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of experimental design.

In the process of studying the self-report of the accredited person, confirming data on scientific and technical progress and research work were not obtained. It should be noted that within the framework of an integrated approach, the scientific activities of both teaching staff and residents should be intensified.

6.6 Educational expertise

As a result of the ongoing work on expertise in the field of education, JSC “RIC&ID” has introduced relevant innovations in the educational process, which allow the development of broader and more specialized competencies. This is ensured through the following forms of training: Journal club (JC - Journal club), Case analysis (CS - case-study), Assessment of mastery of practical procedures (DOPS - Direct Observation of Procedural Skills), Clinical case discussion (CbD - Casebased Discussion) . A survey of residents and graduates of residency training is used as feedback for carrying out activities and corrective action plans in order to improve the EP. The examination is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education. With the introduction of the AIS “Platonus” program into the educational process in 2023, taking into account the capabilities of this information system, JSC “RIC&ID” has a real opportunity to implement high-quality monitoring of the analysis of key indicators of education performance.

6.7 Training in other institutions

To organize and implement academic mobility, JSC “RIC&ID” has developed a Regulation on the academic mobility of students and teaching staff.

JSC “RIC&ID” cooperates within the framework of a strategic partnership with international clinical centres and universities near and far abroad: Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology of the Tomsk National Research Medical Centre, Federal State Budgetary Institution "National Medical Research Centre" named after. V.A. Almazov, National Medical Research Centre named after. Academician E. N. Meshalkin, Novosibirsk, Russian Federation, JSC "Centre for Crisis Research" Kaunas, Republic of Lithuania, Seoul National University Hospital, Republic of Korea, Beer Sheva Medical Centre, Israel, University Hospital of Milan, Italy. Among the contractual relations of the Institute planned in 2022-2023 are the following International Universities: Sechenov University (RF), Kazan Medical University (RF). Among the contractual relations of JSC “RIC&ID” planned in 2022-2023 are the following International Universities: Sechenov University (Russian Federation), Kazan Medical University (Russian Federation), updating of the memorandum with NJSC Astana Medical University (Kazakhstan), etc. It should be noted that the implementation of academic mobility According to the information from the interviews, no interviews were conducted among teaching staff and residents of other specialties. From 2022-2023, it is planned to expand the list of partners with leading centres such as Sechenov University (Russian Federation), Kazan Medical University (Russian Federation), update the memorandum with NJSC Astana Medical University (Kazakhstan), etc.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 17, partially -1, do not comply - 0

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) As part of an integrated approach, it is necessary to intensify the scientific activities of both teaching staff and residents in the implementation of scientific projects and clinical research of the institute in the field of gastroenterology (6.5.).
- 2) Activate work on academic mobility of teachers and residents (6.7)

Standard 7: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM EVALUATION

Evidence of compliance:

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Evaluation of educational residency programs at JSC “RIC&ID” is carried out at all levels of education, including departments, committee of educational programs, DPAE and AC. External level through accreditation of educational programs by accreditation agencies. Evaluation of the program begins with an analysis of its structure, where the mission, goal and final results of the program are analyzed to assess their compliance with the needs of practical healthcare, modern trends in science and education, the goals and mission of JSC “RIC&ID”, the requirements of the State Educational Standard and other regulatory documents. Program evaluation is carried out on the basis of collective solidarity of all stakeholders. Analysis of the test results is discussed at meetings of the department, DPAE and AC.

7.2 Feedback from faculty and residents

During the visit of experts and the study of DPAE documents, the results of feedback on the quality of the educational program and their satisfaction with the degree of training of graduates from employers were demonstrated, but there was no information about feedback from teachers and residents of other specialties.

7.3 Resident and Graduate Outcomes

DPAE, together with the heads of educational programs, conducts annual monitoring of the employment of residency graduates. The employment rate of graduates in other specialties is 100%; there was no employment of graduates in the specialty “Gastroenterology for adults, children”.

7.4 Stakeholder engagement

The interview with 4 employers was conducted online and included questions such as the mission of JSC “RIC&ID” and the educational program, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training residents through mentoring, employment, and satisfaction with the level of training. During the conversation, complete answers were received, for example, the employer of the specialty “Gastroenterology for adults, children” Nugmanova B. T. voiced the mission of the educational program “Gastroenterology for adults, children”, which demonstrates their good awareness of the educational process carried out at JSC “RIC&ID”, about 100% employment residency graduates are mentors. All employers 100% noted the high level of training and the demand for graduates in the labour market.

7.5 Procedure for approval of educational programs

Evaluation of educational programs is carried out through examination of programs at the planning stage of development, discussion, approval and monitoring of implementation. Responsible for managing the educational program are the DPAE and the advisory body (Academic Council). The distribution of resources to support and improve the educational program is carried out under the leadership of the Chairman of the Board and approved by the Academic Council (AC).

During the visit, it was documented that the EP in the specialty “Gastroenterology, adults, children” was developed by a working group, discussed at a meeting of the educational programs committee, at a meeting of the DPAE and approved at a meeting of the AC JSC “RIC&ID”. It is included in the register of educational programs of EUHEI.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully -8, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Work out a feedback mechanism with teachers and residents to improve the educational program (7.2.1).
- 2) Involve residents and employers in the educational programs committee for planning, developing and monitoring the educational program (7.4.1).

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

Evidence of compliance:

8.1. Management

Management of the educational program is carried out in accordance with the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and is also established by internal regulatory documents “Academic Policy of JSC “RIC&ID””, “Regulations on Residency”, “Regulations on Mentoring”. Academic policy is the main management tool at JSC “RIC&ID”, which guides all structural units implementing residency programs. Coordination of implementation, control, and monitoring of program implementation is carried out by the Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education (DPAE). DPAE supervises residents, maintains relations with the practical healthcare sector and residency graduates. Ensuring the quality of the educational process in residency is determined by fulfilling the mandatory requirements for the level of training (State Educational Standard 2022) of the EP and the creation of a system for monitoring the effectiveness of the teaching staff and the implementation of the resident’s individual plan. Monitoring the quality of the educational process is carried out by DPAE, members of the educational programs committee, and independent experts. Every year, JSC “RIC&ID” conducts a final state certification to evaluate residents. The main results of the implementation of educational programs of the JSC “RIC&ID” residency are the results of the final certification and the employment of residents.

Residency graduates who have successfully completed the EP in accordance with the WC and passed the final certification are issued, by decision of the State Attestation Committee, a Certificate of Completion of Residency of the State standard, with an appendix that reflects the results of mastering all disciplines in WC, GPA, the number of training hours and credits. Responsibility and authority for managing the budgets of the EP residency is assigned to the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Financial and Economic Affairs, the Planning and Economic Analysis Department, and the Accounting and Reporting Department. According to interviews with the managers of JSC “RIC&ID”, it has a stable financial condition, which is aimed at strengthening the material and technical base and increasing income. All JSC “RIC&ID” information on the website www.ncvb.kz is systematically updated in accordance with changes that occur.

8.2 Academic leadership

The educational process is managed in accordance with the organizational structure of JSC “RIC&ID” (approved by the Board of Directors, Minutes No. 40 of October 30, 2022). The governing body is the Board of Directors, the executive body is the Board: Chairman of the Board, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Work, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Strategic Development and Financial and Economic Issues, Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Organizational and Methodological Work.

Direct management of residency educational programs and coordination of residents’ activities is carried out by the Department of Postgraduate and Continuing Education. DPAE supervises residents, maintains relations with the practical healthcare sector and residency graduates. The main educational, scientific and clinical units that provide training to residents are departments. When visiting the department, supporting documents were received for the organization of the educational process at JSC “RIC&ID”: the working curriculum of the educational program, portfolio and IUP of the resident. The educational process is managed in accordance with the organizational structure of JSC “RIC&ID” (approved by the Board of Directors, Minutes No. 40 of October 30, 2022). The governing body is the Board of Directors, the executive body is the Board: Chairman of the Board, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Work, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Strategic Development and Financial and Economic Issues, Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Organizational and Methodological Work.

To the survey question “Do the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, and clinical work,” 70% of teachers answered that systematically, 20% answered “sometimes,” 10% answered no answer.

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

Responsibility and authority for managing the budgets of the EP residency is assigned to the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Financial and Economic Affairs, the Planning and Economic Analysis Department, and the Accounting and Reporting Department.

During the visit, it was noted that the distribution of resources for training residents is regulated by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Budget Program 006). Calculation of training costs is regulated in accordance with Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 474 “On approval of standards for calculating the cost of training for one resident, residency student, master’s student, doctoral student (PhD) in educational organizations and scientific organizations in the field of healthcare within the country under the state educational order (with amendments and additions in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 8, 2011 No. 510 as of August 8, 2011), the Development Plan of JSC “RIC&ID”, the Public Procurement Plan of JSC “RIC&ID” for the current year. Resource support for the educational process, including the target budget for training, is carried out by the planning and economic analysis department, whose employees provide material support for the program by drawing up cost estimates for training residents. The cost estimate for residency is included in the Development Plan of JSC “RIC&ID” and in the Institute's Public Procurement Plan.

8.4. Administration and management

The organizational management of the EP is carried out by the DPAE and heads of departments. During the visit, we became acquainted with: the regulation of the educational process (academic calendar, number of academic groups, volume of academic work, teaching load), calculation of hours, schedules, agreed upon WC, classroom fund, contingent of students, accounting of educational achievements of students (portfolio, statements and etc.).

The operational management of the EP is carried out by: the head of the DPAE, heads of the EP, teachers. The total number of teaching staff is formed based on the average ratio of students and teachers: residency – 1:3. The calculation of the teaching load of teaching staff is carried out in accordance with the Model Rules for the Operation of Higher Education Organizations and the state education standard and in residency is 650 hours per year. JSC “RIC&ID” has created and operates an independent internal audit system and a quality management system (hereinafter referred to as the QMS).

The monitoring system carried out at JSC “RIC&ID” includes the following stages:

- a constant analysis of the implementation of the university’s plans, its goals and formulated success factors is carried out, namely integral characteristics reflecting certain results of work; directly measurable indicators have been identified that make it possible to quantify the degree of achievement of the set goals;
- analysis of the effectiveness and efficiency of processes is carried out;
- an analysis is carried out by the management of the achievement of goals and quality in the field of the management system, processes, and plans of the university;
- functions for collecting and processing information are distributed among employees.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

Self-examination in the direction is carried out on the basis of the order of the Chairman of the Board dated June 18, 2021 No. 218 “On the creation of working groups on accreditation.” Self-examination was carried out from 04/05 until 04/30/2021 in accordance with regulations and methodological recommendations. Work with stakeholders is systematic: areas of activity with partners are laid down in the Strategic and Operational plans of the clinic, in the development plan of the clinic for the current year, in the government procurement plan for the current year, tactical plans by type of activity, in the work plan of the Board of Directors of JSC “RIC&ID”, respectively, in bilateral (multilateral) agreements (memorandums) on the provision of clinical bases; mutual

understanding on academic cooperation, etc. An external independent accreditation body carries out the accreditation procedure for the clinic, which evaluates the content of training, the quality of training of specialists, and the conditions for the implementation of the educational process; Independent quality control of graduates' knowledge is carried out by the National Centre for Independent Examination (NCIE). Information was received and confirmed by documents that the employees of the department are members of professional societies, participate in on-site medical and health-improving republican programs, take part in the work of specialized and permanent commissions of health care organizations and local authorized bodies.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully -11, partially - 0, does not comply -0

Standard 8: completed

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

The management system of JSC “RIC&ID” for the purpose of continuous improvement of the postgraduate educational process in accordance with the best practices of global educational management, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, is ensured by regular review and updating of the process. The department and DPAE are responsible for the process of continuous improvement of the educational program. The Department of Postgraduate and Continuing Education is a structural subdivision of the Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine and operates on the basis of normative legal acts regulating the educational activities of the Republic of Kazakhstan. As part of the continuous improvement of the work of the DPAE, the annual work plan of the Academic Council of the Institute includes the question “Annual report of the Head of the DPAE on the work done and tasks for the new academic year,” which contains a complete analysis of the work of the department.

JSC “RIC&ID” has a stable financial position, operates in the trinity of science, education and practice, which undoubtedly contributes to the educational and clinical process as part of the implementation of EP residency in all specialties, being a modern clinical base, which contributes to adequate training of residents and corresponds to the achievement learning goals. It is planned to create a commission at JSC “RIC&ID” to approve the DPAE budget, which, as a collegial body, would formulate proposals for the implementation of policies in the field of economic and social development.

Recruitment at the university is carried out in accordance with the Standard Qualification Characteristics of the positions of teaching staff and persons equivalent to them, on the basis of the regulations on the Competition Commission for filling vacant positions of teaching staff (approved by order of the rector No. 22a dated 02/01/2018), as well as the Personnel Committee policy approved by Order of the Rector No. 63 of April 11, 2018. Revision of recruitment criteria at the university is carried out in connection with changes in regulatory legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, amendments to internal regulatory documents, as well as the opening of new educational programs.

It should be noted that the educational program in the specialty “Gastroenterology for adults and children” is 100% staffed Sedateness 100%. The residency specialty program “Adult and Pediatric Gastroenterology” is undergoing primary accreditation, prepared by EMCD, and provided with information and library resources. JSC “RIC&ID” is constantly improving the program evaluation procedure at the level of departments involved in the educational process, including all aspects (context, resources, performance indicators, consumer satisfaction, etc.) and a wider range of stakeholders. Thus, at the department/course level, analytical work is carried out in order to evaluate the program in the form of a subsequent annual report of the departments.

In order to improve the organizational structure and management principles, the following are being implemented: the introduction of a risk management system in educational activities, the introduction of an automated process, and the intensification of image policy.

JSC “RIC&ID” plans to create an Academic Council (AC) of the Institute, the main purpose of which will be to determine the list of EP, design, develop and improve EP. The AC will include

representatives of the institute from among the teaching staff; To ensure an interdisciplinary approach, representatives of both specialized academic departments and those providing general education and basic training, representatives of students and representatives of employers will be involved in the AC.

JSC “RIC&ID” plans to implement the policy of academic mobility through further development of international cooperation and partnerships with foreign universities and centres; development of joint educational programs with foreign partner universities. So, during the 2nd quarter of 2023, it is planned to sign a memorandum with the Kazan State Medical University (including the activation of academic mobility), with the Aegean University (Izmir, Turkey).

The management of JSC “RIC&ID” plans to annually improve the qualifications of employees and teachers in areas of activity..

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 2 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully -2, partially - 0, does not correspond -0

Standard 9: completed

CONCLUSION:

When conducting an external assessment of the educational program, it was found that out of **114 standards** (including 82 basic standards and 32 improvement standards, 100 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 72 basic standards and 28 improvement standards. 10 basic standards and 4 improvement standards. No inconsistency of standards has been established. Compliance with improvement standards indicates compliance of the educational organization with international consensus in such areas as educational, scientific, and educational.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational program 7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” JSC “RIC&ID”:

Standard 1

1. Ensure the involvement of a wider range of stakeholders (teachers, students, employers) in the development of the mission, strategic development plan of the organization (1.4.1)

Standard 2

- 2) Ensure the involvement of a wider range of stakeholders (teachers, employers, students) in the planning, discussion, approval and improvement of the educational program (2.4.4).
- 3) Introduce an anti-plagiarism system into the results of research and independent work of residents.

Standard 3

- 4) Develop and implement a program for assessing the quality of the assessment methods used for the validity and reliability of the final learning outcomes (3.1.2., 3.1.4).
- 5) Include in the professional development of teaching staff a module on teaching methods and assessment methods (3.2.2).

Standard 4

- 6) Include representatives of residents in the process of developing documents for the admission and selection of residents (4.1.6).

Standard 6

- 7) As part of an integrated approach, it is necessary to intensify the scientific activities of both teaching staff and residents in the implementation of scientific projects and clinical research of the institute in the field of gastroenterology (clause 6.5.).
- 8) Activate work on academic mobility of teachers and residents

Standard 7

- 9) Work out a feedback mechanism with teachers and residents to improve the educational program (clause 7.2.1).
- 10) Involve residents and employers in the educational programs committee for planning, development and monitoring of the educational program (clause 7.4.1).

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01105 “Adult and Pediatric Gastroenterology” with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairperson of EEC	Morenko Marina Alekseevna	
Foreign Expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	
National Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	
National Academic Expert	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	
Employers' Representative	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	
Residents' Representative	Ismailov Musa Kenzhekaliuly	

**Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational program of specialty
7R01105 “Gastroenterology for adults, children” (generalization) of JSC “RIC&ID”**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	BS*/SI	Grade		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END RESULTS	14	9/5	8/5	1/0	
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM	22	19/3	17/3	2/0	
3.	RESIDENT ASSESSMENT	9	6/3	4/2	2/1	
4.	RESIDENTS	20	14/6	13/5	1/1	
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS	8	7/1	7/1	-	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	18	11/7	9/5	2/2	
7.	EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM	10	7/3	5/3	2/0	
8.	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	11	8/3	8/3	-	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	2	1/1	1/1	-	
		114	82/32	72/28	10/4	
				114		

List of documents studied by members of the EEC as part of an external assessment of the residency educational program

№	Documents name	Quantity
1.	Academic policy	1
2.	Involved residents in science	1
3.	Agreement with city clinic No. 5	1
4.	Agreement with JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy	1
5.	Agreement with NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	1
6.	Job description of a resident doctor (Kazakh, Russian)	2
7.	IMS competency model of graduate resident	1
8.	Personnel policy	1
9.	Process map	1
10.	Code of honor	1
11.	Bed capacity	1
12.	Catalog of elective disciplines	1
13.	Memorandum with NJSC "Astana Medical University"	1
14.	Opinions of employers about JSC RIC&ID graduates 2019	2
15.	On approval of the price for paid services provided during residency training from 08/11/2022	1
16.	Educational program "Allergology and Immunology"	1
17.	Employment report	1
18.	Work plan of the educational programs committee	1
19.	Teacher training plan for 2023-2024	1
20.	Regulations on Clinical Preceptors	1
21.	Regulations on the Council of Young Scientists	1
22.	Regulations on DPAE (departments)	1
23.	Regulations on conducting ongoing monitoring of the progress of intermediate and end-of course assessment of students	1
24.	Regulations on the development and approval of EP	1
25.	Rules for admission to residency for the 2022-2025 academic year	1
26.	CEP Order	1
27.	Order on the creation of an appeal commission	1
28.	Order on employment of a resident	2
29.	Protocol of the Academic Council	1
30.	Protocol of DPAE dated 06/20/23	1
31.	Protocol of DPAE dated 06/27/23	1
32.	Minutes of the Academic Council - approval of the Mission	1
33.	Minutes of the Academic Council - approval of the educational program	1
34.	Review of the educational program	1
35.	Certificate in Pedagogy Nurpeisova T.T.	1
36.	SOP on the development and approval of a system for assessing educational achievements	1
37.	SOP-Rules-for-current-control-of-student-progress	1
38.	Strategic indicators 2022-2026	1
39.	Minutes of the Academic Council No. 3 of 03/28/2023	1
40.	Minutes of the Academic Council No. 5 dated 05/24/2023	1
41.	Agreement with the Eureka Press library	1

ECAQA