

Accreditation of Study Programmes
Assessment Report

Institution: The State University of Moldova

Study programme: Professional Master Programme in International Law

Assessment committee:

Urmas Volens (chair), Head of SORAINEN Real Estate & Construction Team, Estonia

Mihai Floroiu, Professor, “Dunarea de Jos” University of Galati, Romania

Ingeborg Mottl, Associate professor, University of Salzburg, Austria

Rene Värk, Associate professor, Estonian National Defence College; University of Tartu, Estonia

Joosep Raudsepp, Student, Tallinn University, Estonia

Coordinator: Hillar Bauman

Dates of the assessment visit: 20/05/15

Assessment committee sent the preliminary report to EKKA: 10.07.2015

Assessment committee received the comments of the institution under accreditation: 20.07.2015

Assessment committee approved the final version of component assessment with 5 votes in favour and 0 votes against.

Date: 07.09.2015

Template for Assessment Report

I Summary of the assessment (mark with 'X'):

	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
Study programme and its development	X		
Teaching and learning		X	
Teaching staff	X		
Students		X	
Resources		X	

General Introduction:

The State University of Moldova (hereinafter referred to as SUM) is a state higher education institution established in 1946 with a mission of educating qualified specialists able to adapt to the changing social and economic conditions, as well as conducting fundamental and applied scientific research and offering various continuous education training programmes. Since 2001, SUM holds the status of an autonomous National University granted by the Government of Moldova and constitutes a unitary, integral and indivisible academic, educational, scientific and cultural center.

As the largest University in Moldova, SUM is providing both full and part-time studies on a wide range of specialties at the Bachelor's level (1st cycle) and the Doctoral level (3rd cycle), and on 125 Master of Research and Professional Master study programmes (2nd cycle) with the corresponding duration of 2 and 1.5 years.

The Law Faculty of SUM was founded in 1959 and continues to be the leading provider of specialists in law in Moldova. The Faculty consists of nine departments: Theory and History of Law, Constitutional Law and Administrative Law, International Law and Law of Foreign Economic Relations, Civil Procedure Law, Civil Law, Business Law, Criminal Law and Criminology, Labour Law and Criminal Procedure and Forensics, and is governed by the

Template for Assessment Report

Council of the Faculty elected for a term of five years. In academic year 2014/15, SUM conducts studies on 12 Professional Master programmes in the field of law: “Business Law”, “Criminal Law”, “Criminal Procedure Law and Forensics”, Civil Law”, “Civil Judicial Procedures”, “National and European Enforcement Law”, “Labour Law”, “International Law”, “Human Rights”, “Informational Law”, “Customs Law” and “Public Law”.

The Professional Master programme “International Law”, which is being evaluated, is a programme with the duration of 1.5 years of studies, three semesters and 90 credits. The study programme was initiated in year 2000 and is managed by the Department of International Law and Law of Foreign Economic Relations operating within the Faculty of Law.

Comments:

The study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force. The title of the programme is consistent with its content. The department regularly plans the development of the study programme. The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme presented in the SER are in correspondence with the European Qualifications Framework. The master’s programme has a logical structure.

The title of the study programme is consistent with its content. However, it is recommended considering the focus of the programme and despite of having specialization on all legal issues with international aspects, making a clear choice whether the field of specialization should be public international law or private international law. In general it would be advisable to cover all international aspects of typical legal disciplines within the courses specializing to those disciplines (e.g. European Contract Law as part of Contract Law or European Business Law as part of Business Law etc) and within this master’s programme have a clear focus on public international law.

It is also highly recommended to increase the cooperation between the master of law programmes in MSU regarding both the content and conduct of studies. For example, the subjects relating to international commercial/business law currently taught on the “International Law” study programme should also be included in the “Business Law” curriculum.

It should be ensured by the Faculty and the Department that no overlaps occur between the content of bachelor’s and master’s study programmes.

The development of the study programme takes into consideration the major trends of the labour market. The employers are very satisfied with the skills and qualifications of the graduates.

There is a certain lack of systematic approach in collecting and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders. The academic staff has a strong sense of mission and is well aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.

Template for Assessment Report

The Faculty and Department regularly conduct surveys to evaluate learning process and outcomes. However, the Committee received mixed information on whether and how students, alumni and employers are actually involved in the development process: The Department should have a clearer procedure to engage the students, alumni and employers in the development process.

The meeting with teaching staff indicated that a variety of teaching methods are used, and they prefer to use active teaching methods. It is commendable that teaching staff publishes practical journal articles and teaching materials for their courses. Teaching staff is well aware of the need to keep up with the changes in legal regulations and recent court practice. Still, in order to provide a wider, comparative perspective, it is essential to include non-Moldovan, non-Romanian and non-Russian literature in the syllabi. Syllabi should include foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) in addition to literature in Romanian and Russian and library should acquire more and recent textbooks on public international law, human rights and other main branches of public international law in English.

Taking into consideration of the nature of the study programme and international reality, the Department should emphasise the importance of and encourage the actual use of English language.

The University has agreements or good cooperation with many public and private institutions, where the students can perform their internship. Students in general expressed satisfaction with organisation of internship. In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the internships should be conducted in the field of international law.

It remains unclear how exactly the assessment methods are chosen and matched to learning outcomes and whether the students receive personal feedback regarding their performance at different assessments in order to support student development.

The necessary regulation appears to be in place for the recognition of prior learning, but there is no actual experience. The University should consider the possibility of increasing the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It provides more choices to students, but also increases the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility and therefore again makes academic mobility more attractive.

Although the students are already being encouraged to participate in scientific conferences and publish articles, the Department should find more ways to involve master students in current or future research projects (also in development activities).

The total number and qualification of teaching staff is sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programmes at master's level. All of the staff members have a PhD degree. Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age indicates sustainability of the programme.

Template for Assessment Report

Members of the teaching staff have attended various scientific events, at national and international levels, thus allowing them to improve their research and teaching methods.

The members of the teaching staff have participated in several self-improvement activities both in Moldova and abroad. The assessment committee welcomes this approach. The Faculty in general should be more actively participating in the academic mobility programs. The International Law and Law of Foreign Economic Relations Department could serve as a good example in this respect.

However, regarding other staff development activities besides some continuing education possibilities, the committee did not receive any evidence concerning the broader staff development plan, including conducting systematic appraisal interviews with the staff and other methods of staff development. At the Faculty management level, it is recommended to establish a comprehensive staff development system that includes also other important elements of staff development, like the implementation of regular appraisal interviews with the teachers.

There have been lessons and topics taught by foreign professors from HEIs from Europe, South Africa and Canada in the Department, which give this programme enough weight in relation to the other ones delivered by SUM in which there are no such initiatives. The committee recommends that the department should even more actively seek possibilities for involving more visiting professors in the teaching of the study programme.

Some of the members of the academic staff of this programme have given lectures in foreign universities or participated in mobilities for teaching staff improvements overseas. The committee recommends that at the Faculty management level a system will be created that supports and encourages the members of the full-time teaching staff to regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks. Regular goals for the international cooperation should be set and the achievement of those goals should be measured regularly e.g. during quarterly performance reviews of the members of the academic staff.

Research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.

The students' satisfaction with the study programme is high and they have good informal relationship with the teaching staff.

At the moment, mobility options on the study programme are very limited. It is recommended to encourage master students to participate in academic mobility and focus on informing them about the mobility opportunities (for example, hold classes or seminars to introduce the opportunities for academic mobility).

However, the percentage of master students participating in international mobility programs is increasing. During 2010-2014, nine master students have been involved in academic mobility. This was a genuinely positive finding which needs to be highlighted and the committee hopes that this positive trend shall also continue in the future.

In order to help the University in its internationalization (and academic mobility) processes at the University and also at the Faculty level, it is advisable to consider updating and revising the webpage's content in English in order to attract foreign students.

Template for Assessment Report

To further support the students, MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g. consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.

The committee welcomes the use of modern software by MSU in order to discover plagiarism, yet this approach is only one aspect of plagiarism detection. Therefore, the committee urges the Faculty to adapt a unified and more systematic approach towards preventing plagiarism and actively seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g. course for academic writing, master's seminars etc).

According to the SER, MSU has a mechanism to monitor the evolution of graduates' employment. Also, the Department monitors the employment of the graduates. However, monitoring the faculty's graduates' employment could be more systematic. Much of this communications and monitoring of graduates career is done informally and is based on individual connections and relationships between the alumni and the (teaching) staff. There is a need for a systematic and institutionalized approach towards tracking the employment of faculty's graduates.

Taking into account the national context, the competitiveness of the graduates is high, regarding their employment rates. However, it is recommended that the data regarding the employment of graduates should be collected more regularly and systematically. Although the graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements, it would be in the Faculty's best interests that the causes for dropping out would also be formally collected and analysed.

The budget planning in general is sustainable. However, the Faculty is underfinanced, which according to the understanding of the committee is the reason for many shortcomings described above, e.g. the general salary level of the academic staff, the state of library and the general infrastructure of the Faculty, the low level of academic mobility etc. It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.

According to the trends presented to the committee, the number of students and graduates in shows lasting stability which indicates sustainability of the study programme.

As the Faculty in general was at least partially under renovation, it was not possible for the committee to assess the conformity to the requirements of the teaching and learning environment as a whole. There was dissatisfaction among the students with the learning environment.

Template for Assessment Report

ICT devices are available for both Faculty members and students. The computer rooms look modern and meet the basic contemporary standards. The staff and the students are relatively motivated to use ICT techniques. The positive trend is the using of *Moodle* platform providing the students with information regarding the courses online. Still, the existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable.

There is almost no foreign literature in the field of law and the books available are rather out-dated. **The situation related to foreign law books is somewhat better with regard to the International Law and Foreign Economic Relations Law Department, because there seems to be a minimal satisfactory library within the department. This also is a proof that with the right mindset and enthusiasm there are possibilities to obtain minimally needed foreign books and start using them.**

Still, the University should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in international academic databases (that provide actual access to legal texts, not just directories), training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources. The library needs major investment, especially regarding field specific legal literature in English, French or German. It is recommended to increase the awareness of students and academic staff of international databases and motivate them to use the few available.

Commendations:

- The academic staff has a strong sense of mission and is well aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.
- Good employment rate of the graduates;
- Teaching staff is balanced by age and there is a sign of academic continuity;
- Teaching staff finds time to publish teaching materials for their courses;
- Internship is well organised and the University helps the students with a place of internship due to specific agreements or good cooperation with many employers;
- The ratio between master students and supervisors is favourable and due to this, the workload of academic staff is well-balanced.
- Open lectures given by foreign professors;
- Participation of members of teaching staff as lecturers or visiting professors abroad or in mobility programmes
- Existence of a dedicated library at Department level, in course of completion with recent publications
- Budget planning has sustainable character;
- The usage of Moodle platform providing the students information regarding the courses online;
- Teaching staff is well experienced;

Template for Assessment Report

- Students' satisfaction with the study programme is high.

Recommendations:

- It is recommended considering the focus of the programme and despite of having specialization on all legal issues with international aspects, making a clear choice whether the field of specialization should be public international law or private international law. In general it would be advisable to cover all international aspects of typical legal disciplines within the courses specializing to those disciplines (e.g. European Contract Law as part of Contract Law or European Business Law as part of Business Law etc) and within this master's programme have a clear focus on public international law.
- **It is highly recommended to increase the cooperation between the master of law programmes in MSU regarding both the content and conduct of studies.** For example, the subjects relating to international commercial/business law currently taught on the "International Law" study programme should also be included in the "Business Law" curriculum.
- It should be ensured by the Faculty and the Department that no overlaps occur between the content of bachelor's and master's study programmes.
- It is advisable to pay more attention to developing the students' English language skills (e.g, include in the curriculum more foreign language materials) and also offer the students some special course(s) on the methodology of legal research.
- It is recommended that all members of the academic staff involved in the study programme finalize their PhD studies as soon as possible.
- It is advisable to implement a clear system of gathering and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders.
- Syllabi should include foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) in addition to literature in Romanian and Russian and library should acquire more and recent textbooks on public international law, human rights and other main branches of public international law in English.
- Taking into consideration of the nature of the study programme and international reality, the Department should emphasise the importance of and encourage the actual use of English language.
- When replenishing the library, attention should be paid to the modern sources of information, especially investing in international academic databases (that provide actual access to legal texts, not just directories)and training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources. At the University, access should be enabled to legal literature databases (e.g. WestLaw, LexisNexis, HeinOnline, BeckOnline etc). In the study processes, the use of such databases should be promoted, as there are numerous journals which are openly accessible and provide high quality articles.
- It is recommended to consider the possibility to increase the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It would provide more choices to students, but also increase the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility, and therefore again make academic mobility more attractive to the students.
- In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the internships should be conducted in the field of international law.

Template for Assessment Report

- It would be advisable to provide students with personal feedback regarding their performance in order to support student development.
- Master students should be involved in broader research and development activities.
- At the Faculty management level, it is recommended to establish a comprehensive staff development system that includes also other important elements of staff development, like the implementation of regular appraisal interviews with the teachers.
- It is recommended to increase the number of scientific activities;
- It is recommended to Increase the activity of the research center for international law;
- It is advisable to find methods in order to encourage and support the teaching staff to participate in the international research projects and other international scientific activities.
- At the Faculty management level a system should be created that supports and encourages the members of the full-time teaching staff to regularly develop their knowledge and skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks. Regular goals for the international cooperation should be set and the achievement of those goals should be measured regularly e.g. during quarterly performance reviews of the members of the academic staff.
- The Department should actively seek possibilities for involving visiting professors in the teaching in the study programme.
- It is recommended to encourage master students to participate in academic mobility and focus on informing them about the mobility opportunities (for example, hold classes or seminars to introduce the opportunities for academic mobility).
- In order to help the University in its internationalization (and academic mobility) processes at the University and also at the Faculty level, it is advisable to consider updating and revising the webpage's content in English in order to attract foreign students.
- MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists and also provide some sort of psychological counselling services for the students. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.
- It is recommended to adapt unified and systematic approach towards detecting plagiarism and seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g course for academic writing, seminars etc).
- The University should seek ways how to formally strengthen their ties with graduates (alumni club, events for graduates, satisfaction surveys for alumni etc).
- It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.
- It is recommended to increase the awareness of students and academic staff of international databases and motivate them to use the few available.
- The existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable.

Template for Assessment Report

Recommendation to the Ministry of Education

- According to the Framework Plan for higher education (Order of the Ministry of Education no 455 of 2011 § 62) for the master studies, a course shall have 5/10/15 credits and subsequently one semester shall plan 6-2 courses/modules. This means that all courses on master's level must have the same amount of ECTS (5 ECTS) with the same number of contact hours and hours for individual work. Some courses also are "combined courses" and they offer 10 ECTS. The assessment committee recommends considering changing this rule in order to enable the universities offering master's level programmes some additional flexibility and to support the academic mobility.

II Assessment areas and requirements

1. STUDY PROGRAMME AND ITS DEVELOPMENT	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	X		
<p>Collected evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Self-evaluation report (SER); Annexes of SER; Internal regulations; Additional documents received during the site visit; Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers. 			
<p>Based on available documents and on the discussions during the assessment visit the assessment committee is convinced that the professional master programme in International Law substantially conforms to requirements.</p> <p>The study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force. Considering the majority of the study disciplines within the programme as well as the learning outcomes of the curriculum the title of a study programme is consistent with its content.</p> <p>The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme are in correspondence with the European Qualifications Framework. The courses and study disciplines taught within the master's programme are distinguishable from those offered on the bachelor's study programme. The main objective of the master programme is to supplement the theory acquired by the students during the first cycle of studies with judiciary cases and practical aspects provide a more in-depth and focused object of study. The study disciplines are presented in a logical succession. It should be ensured by the Faculty and the Department that no overlaps occur between the content of bachelor's and master's study programmes.</p> <p>The development of the study programme takes into consideration the trends of the labour market.</p>			

Template for Assessment Report

There is a certain lack of systematic approach in collecting and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders. The academic staff has a strong sense of mission and is well aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.

Commendations:

- Development structure ensures sustainability and continuous development.
- The academic staff has a strong sense of mission and is well aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.
- Graduates acquire skills necessary to succeed in the labour market

Recommendations:

- It is recommended considering the focus of the programme and despite of having specialization on all legal issues with international aspects, making a clear choice whether the field of specialization should be public international law or private international law. In general it would be advisable to cover all international aspects of typical legal disciplines within the courses specializing to those disciplines (e.g. European Contract Law as part of Contract Law or European Business Law as part of Business Law etc) and within this master programme have a clear focus on public international law.
- **It is highly recommended to increase the cooperation between the master of law programmes in MSU regarding both the content and conduct of studies.** For example, the subjects relating to international commercial/business law currently taught on the “International Law” study programme should also be included in the “Business Law” curriculum.
- It should be ensured by the Faculty and the Department that no overlaps occur between the content of bachelor’s and master’s study programmes.
- It is advisable to implement a clear system of gathering and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders.
- It is recommended to consider the possibility to increase the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It would provide more choices to students, but also increase the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility, and therefore again make academic mobility more attractive to the students.
- It is advisable to pay more attention to developing the students’ English language skills (e.g. include in the curriculum more foreign language materials) and also offer the students some special course(s) on the methodology of legal research.

1.1.REQUIREMENT: A higher education institution regularly plans its development: the higher education institution has a development plan accompanied by an action plan to ensure sustainability both in the institution and in a given study programme. The implementation of the action plan is analysed and forms the basis for planning of the next development period.

Comments:

According to the information obtained during the assessment visit, the new strategic plan of SUM for years 2015 – 2020 shall be established

Template for Assessment Report

after the election of the new Rector which takes place in October, 2015. In terms of development, the Rector informed the committee that the priority issues for SUM are quality assurance, scientific research and also, modernizing the infrastructure of the University.

Concerning the level of the law programmes, the management found it important to have more impact on local level and create a competitive framework for new talents. Fighting counterfeit and corruption was underlined as a key issue regarding the development of the law programmes.

According to the management (the Rector and Vice-Rector), in the interests of more profound studies, the master programs in law should be consolidated, as there is currently a surplus of the programmes. The committee was informed that starting from June 1st 2015, there shall only be 5 law departments at SUM.

There is a Strategic Development Plan in place for the Faculty of Law for years 2012 – 2017.

The Strategic Plan of the International Law and Foreign Economic Relations Law Department for the years 2011-2016 (adopted every 5 years) ([Annex B.I.1.1](#)) is elaborated in accordance with the development plan of the faculty for the years 2012-2017 ([Annex B.I.1.2](#)). Based on the submitted documents and the interviews during the assessment visit the assessment committee is convinced that the department regularly plans the development of the programme.

1.2. REQUIREMENT: A study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force.

Comments:

The master program “International Law” was authorized by Order of the Ministry of Education and Youth (Nr 385 of May 30, 2008; curriculum of study program see Annex D.1).

The Order no. 455 of the Ministry of Education issued on June 3, 2011, establishes requirements for the study plans at Master’s level. It is the requirement for the professional Master’s programmes (90 credits) to be structured in the following way: Master thesis (30 ECTS), Internship (10 ECTS), Fundamental disciplines (15-25 ECTS), and Specialized disciplines (25-35 ECTS) among which there should be up to 20% alternative disciplines.

The structure of the Master’s programme “International Law” is as follows: Master’s thesis (30 ECTS), Fundamental disciplines (15 ECTS), Specialized disciplines (35 ECTS) including two optional/alternative disciplines (10 ECTS), Internship (10 ECTS) and Disciplines to free choice (10 ECTS)

Template for Assessment Report

<p>The Assessment committee finds that the master's programme substantially functions in accordance with the normative acts in force. The curriculum also respects the impact of the Bologna Higher Education System and is based on the ECTS transfer system.</p>	
<p>1.3. REQUIREMENT: The title of a study programme is consistent with its content.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the information presented in the SER and the curriculum and considering the majority of the subjects/ study disciplines within the programme as well as the learning outcomes of the curriculum the title of the study programme "International Law" is consistent with its content.</p> <p>During the site visit it was mentioned that there is a plan to change the name of the curriculum so that it would include both European and International Law.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recommendation: The committee recommends considering the focus of the programme and despite of having specialization on all legal issues with international aspects, making a clear choice whether the field of specialization should be public international law or private international law. At the moment, the programme is focused on all of the legal aspects of international law. In general it would be advisable to cover all international aspects of typical legal disciplines within the courses specializing to those disciplines (e.g. European Contract Law as part of Contract Law or European Business Law as part of Business Law etc.) and within this master's programme have a clear focus on public international law. 	
<p>1.4. REQUIREMENT: The conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship, support achievement of the objectives of the study programme.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the information presented in the SER and obtained during the site visit the conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship support the achievement of the objectives of this study programme.</p> <p>However, the discussions during the site visit revealed that a lot of the students studying on the programme are already employed and attend the courses in addition to their everyday work. Taking into account that for 90 ECTS, students also have an additional independent workload of 25-30 hours per credit point, it is questionable whether the students actually have enough time to spend on their studies during the semester to meet these requirements.</p> <p>The available study plan and the detailed curriculum support the objectives of the study programme. Contact hours with academic teaching</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

<p>staff and individual work are integrated and compulsory and mandatory subjects are offered.</p> <p>The internship is organized in a professional manner and students gain support from the University as well as from the Department. The internship is conducted according to the Framework Regulations on practical training in higher education and based on curriculum of the internship and an internship portfolio.</p>	
<p>1.5. REQUIREMENT: The objectives and learning outcomes of a study programme are in coherence with the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The structure and content of the study programme is internationally comparable.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the SER the objectives and learning outcomes of the programme take in consideration the regulations of the Ministry of Education and the requirements of the Bologna Process (ECTS credit-transfer-system). The objectives of the curriculum (content and learning outcomes) are in accordance with the requirements of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The learning outcomes are comparable with other programmes of HEIs in Moldova.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <p>Recommendation to the Ministry of Education: The system of distributing the amount of ECTS is only partially internationally comparable because according to the Framework Plan for higher education (Order of the Ministry of Education no 455 of 2011 § 62) for the master studies, a course shall have 5/10/15 credits and subsequently one semester shall plan 6-2 courses/modules. This means that all courses on master's level must have the same amount of ECTS (5 ECTS) with the same number of contact hours and hours for individual work. Some courses also are "combined courses" and they offer 10 ECTS. The assessment committee recommends considering changing this rule in order to enable the universities offering Masters level programs some additional flexibility and to support the academic mobility.</p> 	
<p>1.6. REQUIREMENT The objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master's study programme are clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The SER and the discussions during the Assessment Visit that the objectives, the content and the learning outcomes are in general distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme. However, although the curriculum of the master program is focused on advanced education of graduates from bachelor program there is a lack of clearly distinguishable subjects.</p> <p>The curriculum includes disciplines belonging both to public and private area, with an international approach, of course, as well as disciplines from European Law area. From discussions with teaching staff members the assessment committee learned that the programme was designed this way in order to give the MA students a general approach on international aspects. Sometimes, there appear to be some minor overlapping</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

<p>between the bachelor's and master's programmes in terms of general designation of courses, although in terms of content there are differences.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: It should be ensured by the Faculty and the Department that no overlaps occur between the content of bachelor's and master's study programmes. 	
<p>1.7. REQUIREMENT: Study disciplines of the study programme are presented in a logical succession.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The curriculum as well as the additional documents clearly show a logical structure of the master programme. According to the SER, the subjects in the curriculum are presented in a logical sequence so as to ensure to the student the continuity of the legal materials, development of the general and specific skills and targets.</p>	
<p>1.8. REQUIREMENT: Development of a study programme takes into consideration the needs of the labour market.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The SER and the discussions with the alumni and the employers during the assessment visit confirmed that the development of the study programme takes into consideration the major trends of the labour market. The employers were extremely satisfied with the skills and qualifications of the graduates of the programme and underlined the importance of English language proficiency. The content of the study program is continuously improved to assure that the graduates are educated according to current labour market requirements.</p> <p>The SER emphasizes that the development of the study program takes into account the needs of the labour market through constant monitoring the employment of the International Law master program graduates. (Annex B.I.8.1.).</p>	
<p>1.9. REQUIREMENT: Study programme development is a continuous process which, among others, involves feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the information made available to the committee, the study programme renewal procedure is determined by the legal provisions of normative documents in force. The Regulation on initiation, approval, monitoring and periodical evaluation of the study programmes approved by the MSU Senate on 25.02.2014 acts at the institutional level. Any change in the curriculum starts at the initiative of the specialized chairs, taking into account the provisions from the Framework Plan. After that, the curriculum is discussed at the office of the Faculty and</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

subsequently at the meeting of the Commission for Quality Assurance including in its structure also a representative of the employers. After this, the curriculum is approved by the Faculty Teaching Council and, by the last instance the Senate of MSU.

Employers were satisfied with the development process and the quality of graduates, as the Department took their suggestions into account.

Also, the students recalled giving their opinion about some aspects of the curriculum. However, this feedback appeared to have been given in rather an informal and unstructured manner and concerning rather the conduct of studies than its content. The committee received no evidence about the involvement of the alumni in the study programme development.

Although according to the documents everything related to the feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders seem to function well, the assessment committee could not find evidences that there is a system in place for collecting the feedback. Therefore the committee recommends to take more systematic and formalized approach e.g. creating a formal consultative council of the department etc.

- **Recommendation:** Although the feedback of students, employers and other stakeholders is to some extent taken into account when developing the study programme, it is advisable to implement a clear system of gathering and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders.

1.10. REQUIREMENT: The members of the teaching staff are aware of the objectives of a study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.	
---	--

Comments:

The interview with the academic employees conducted during the site visit proved the strong awareness of the teaching staff of the study programme and of their role and strong sense of mission in achieving these objectives. The teaching staff makes considerable efforts for the assimilation of master students' knowledge, by using various modern methods of teaching (group assessments, modelling of situations, solving test cases etc.). The teaching staff elaborates the course learning outcomes in accordance with the general objectives of the study programme.

1.11. REQUIREMENT: Study programme provides opportunities for further education at doctoral level.	
---	--

Comments:

In general, the study programme provides the students with opportunities for further education at doctoral level. The students gain some experience in academic writing while preparing their master's theses and preparing for participation in scientific conferences, and therefore obtain necessary skills to continue their research activity within the doctoral studies in Law. According to the academic staff, some of the students' work shall be published in a volume.

Template for Assessment Report

Still, there is some room for improvement regarding both the foreign language skills of the students (inevitably required for advanced scientific research) and their overall experience in academic writing.

Recommendation: It is advisable to pay more attention to developing the students' English language skills (e.g, include in the curriculum more foreign language materials) and also offer the students some special course(s) on the methodology of legal research.

2. TEACHING AND LEARNING	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	
<p>Collected evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-evaluation report (SER); • Annexes of SER; • Internal regulations; • Additional documents received during the site visit; • Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers. 			
<p>General comments:</p> <p>The Faculty and Department regularly conduct surveys to evaluate learning process and outcomes. However, the Committee received mixed information on whether and how students, alumni and employers are actually involved in the development process: The Department should have a clearer procedure to engage the students, alumni and employers in the development process.</p> <p>The meeting with teaching staff indicated that a variety of teaching methods are used, and they prefer to use active teaching methods. It is commendable that teaching staff publishes practical journal articles and teaching materials for their courses. Teaching staff is well aware of the need to keep up with the changes in legal regulations and recent court practice. Still, in order to provide a wider, comparative perspective, it is essential to include non-Moldovan, non-Romanian and non-Russian literature in the syllabi. Syllabi should include foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) in addition to literature in Romanian and Russian and library should acquire more and recent textbooks on public international law, human rights and other main branches of public international law in English.</p> <p>Taking into consideration of the nature of the study programme and international reality, the Department should emphasise the importance of and encourage the actual use of English language.</p> <p>The University has agreements or good cooperation with many public and private institutions, where the students can perform their internship. Students in general expressed satisfaction with organisation of internship. In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the</p>			

Template for Assessment Report

internships should be conducted in the field of international law.

It remains unclear how exactly the assessment methods are chosen and matched to learning outcomes and whether the students receive personal feedback regarding their performance at different assessments in order to support student development.

The necessary regulation appears to be in place for the recognition of prior learning, but there is no actual experience. The Department should consider the possibility of increasing the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It provides more choices to students, but also increases the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility and therefore again makes academic mobility more attractive.

Although the students are already being encouraged to participate in scientific conferences and publish articles, the Department should find more ways to involve master students in current or future research projects (also in development activities).

As described above, the study programme has both strengths and areas of improvement in this assessment area. Some problems are significant and require substantial effort to improve the situation (e.g. availability and use of foreign legal literature, involving master students in broader research and development activities, increasing comparative perspective). As a result, the study programme fulfils the following requirements partially. The Committee understands that some areas of improvement are on Faculty or University level, and thus demand action on Faculty or University level, but still inevitably affect the specific study programmes and their quality.

Commendations:

- Teaching staff finds time to publish teaching materials for their courses.
- Internship is well organised and the University guarantees the students a place of internship due to specific agreements or good cooperation with many companies.
- The ratio between the students and teaching staff is favourable

Recommendations:

- Syllabi should include foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) in addition to literature in Romanian and Russian and library should acquire more and recent textbooks on public international law, human rights and other main branches of public international law in English.
- Taking into consideration of the nature of the study programme and international reality, the Department should emphasise the importance of and encourage the actual use of English language.
- In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the internships should be conducted in the field of international law.
- It would be advisable to provide students with personal feedback regarding their performance in order to support student development.
- In connection with the recognition of prior learning, it should be considered to increase the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum in order to (1) provide more choices to students and (2) make academic mobility more attractive.
- If the alumni and the employers do not participate in the evaluation of study process, the Department should involve them as they can

Template for Assessment Report

<p>provide useful feedback.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> It is recommended to involve master students in broader research and development activities (beyond their individual research). 	<p>2.1. REQUIREMENT: Study management is regulated, publicly available, and supports the achievement of learning outcomes. In course of study management development, the results of feedback surveys and the analysis of learning activities are taken into account.</p>
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The main text of the SER is rather short and does not describe how study management is regulated and whether the regulation supports the achievement of learning outcomes. However, the annexes of the SER, and additional information and materials received during the meetings (including those from other programmes) proved that the study management is regulated by national and internal normative documents, which are publicly available (although mostly in Romanian).</p> <p>The SER and the meetings with the Dean, the Head of the Department, teaching staff and students (including those from other programmes) showed that the Faculty and Department conduct regularly surveys to evaluate learning process and outcomes. In the context of courses, students give their feedback on how course was delivered, what were their expectations, whether they achieved their objectives, etc. The results are taken into account when planning and implementing improvements. The proposals for changes to the study programme are first approved by the Department, then sent to the Faculty and finally to the senate. The Committee received mixed information on whether and how students, alumni and employers are actually involved in the development processed: some said that they are involved, some regretted that they are not. Students and alumni mentioned that would like to make proposals for changing the study programme (they had some concrete proposals). The Department should have a clear procedure to engage the mentioned groups in the development process.</p>	
<p>2.2. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, efficient teaching strategies are applied (modern, interactive, teamwork-based, etc.) and oriented towards active learning of the students.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The SER includes a long list of teaching methods, which include both traditional (e.g. lectures) and modern (e.g. seminars, problem solving, group work) teaching methods. The meeting with teaching staff indicated that a variety of teaching methods are used, and they prefer to use active teaching methods. Lectures are meant to provide introduction to the course and to explain basic concepts of the subject matter.</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

Seminars are for practical teaching and learning, to develop teamwork, to solve cases, to conduct debates, etc. Seminars demand active participations from students and prior preparation at home. As a good starting point for independent learning, some courses have a textbook written by the instructor (member of the teaching staff). Teaching staff decides which teaching methods they wish to use and adjust the choice of teaching methods as needed. The SER claims that instructors use “the methods of teaching-learning, that are purely specific for “International Law” study program”, but almost all mentioned methods are used/usable in all fields of law. The meeting with students confirmed that students are generally happy with the choice of teaching methods (although they thought that there could be less traditional lectures and more interactive studying) and that students are active in seminars (although sometimes tired as the lessons take place in the evening after work). Students complained that most auditoriums do not have a stationary projector and valuable time is lost at the beginning of lectures/seminars for setting up the projector. The Committee was informed that the Faculty will move to renovated premises in autumn and the teaching/learning conditions will improve.

Students wished that one or two courses were taught in English. Also, some students expressed concern that their command of English was not good and the Department should help to improve their command of English as it is important in their chosen area of study and future employment.

2.3. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, up-to-date teaching materials are used.

Comments:

Instead of teaching materials, the SER speaks about Moodle and other technical means to facilitate teaching. However, the meetings with teaching staff and students gave more information regarding the teaching materials. The use of up-to-date teaching materials is inevitable for providing high quality education. It is commendable that the teaching staff publishes practical journal articles and teaching materials for their courses. Some courses have specially prepared textbooks. Teaching staff is well aware of the need to keep up with the changes in legal regulations and recent court practice (including of the International Court of Justice and the European Court of Human Rights).

Syllabi and meetings with teaching staff painted a mixed picture about the selection and use of foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) during the studies. The Committee notes that syllabi contain literature published in Romania or in Russia, but the situation is troubling when it comes to literature in English, French, German, etc. As it is international law programme, it is inevitable that that foreign legal literature has a significant weight. Some syllabi include a fair number of foreign legal literature (e.g. European Contract Law). Students who study international law should work with foreign legal literature as well as authentic texts of treaties or judgments (Romanian versions are usually translations) to improve their foreign legal language skills. Furthermore, international institutions and courts apply authentic texts. Taking into consideration the fact that developments are fast in some areas of international law, it is also necessary to track that the teaching materials are up-to-date. Some syllabi contain outdated or most likely ideologically biased literature (e.g. Theory of International Organizations includes a

Template for Assessment Report

textbook from 1970 and Soviet time textbooks). The Committee saw that legal literature databases (e.g. WestLaw, LexisNexis, HeinOnline) are not available at the university, but there are numerous journals which are openly accessible and provide high quality articles.

The Committee was told that the Department has received some funding to acquire foreign legal literature and was shown a list of books which have already being ordered by the Department. These books, when they arrive, should lay a good foundation for foreign legal literature selection. The efforts the Department has made to include some foreign literature in the library in the future, are commendable.

- **Recommendation:** Syllabi should include more up-to-date foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) in addition to literature in Romanian and Russian and library should acquire more and recent textbooks on public international law, human rights and other main branches of public international law in English.

2.4. REQUIREMENT: Organisation of internship is clearly regulated, the requirements for the completion of internship are determined, the instructions for conducting the internship are available and the supervision of students in work environment is ensured.

Comments:

The internship is regulated by national and internal normative documents. The curriculum contains a compulsory five week internship (10 credits). The objectives of internship are defined in the regulation of internship and also available in the blank portfolio of internship which is given to each student performing internship. Each student is officially assigned to a place of internship, and is appointed a supervisor from the university and a tutor from the place of internship. At the end of internship, students complete a portfolio of internship.

2.5. REQUIREMENT: The higher education institution has a network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for students and supporting the achievement of learning outcomes of study programmes.

Comments:

The university has agreements or good cooperation with many public and private institutions, where the students can perform their internship. Students can themselves find a place of internship. At the meeting with employers, the latter assured that they are satisfied with the students who have performed their internship with them and they are happy to receive the students also in future. Students expressed satisfaction that the university guarantees them a place of internship. However, they wished there was an opportunity to go for a short internship abroad, taking into consideration the nature of the study programme. The Committee learnt that the students who already work can perform their internship at their current workplaces. This opportunity involves a risk. If the current workplace is not related to International Law, the internship may not achieve its learning outcomes.

Template for Assessment Report

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the internships should be conducted in the field of international law.
<p>2.6. REQUIREMENT: Assessment of learning outcomes of students is performed in accordance with the existing requirements. Assessment methodology is consistent with learning outcomes and includes feedback supporting student development.</p>
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The assessment of learning outcomes is regulated by national and internal normative documents. The assessment as a whole is comprised of the initial assessment at the beginning of study process, the current assessments during the semester (60%) and the final assessment at the end of semester (40%). The SER lists different assessment methods which are used. Students are informed at the beginning of the semester how the course will be assessed (methods) and what are the criteria. The Committee understands that the instructor of the course may choose the assessment methods. It remains unclear how exactly the assessment methods are chosen and matched to learning outcomes, especially when considering the fact that all courses are of 5 credits and contact hours are quite similar per 1 credit. The content of assessment methods (e.g. exam questions) are regularly updated. The SER states that although the assessment questions are prepared by the teaching staff, the final quality of applied assessment method (e.g. whether specific questions, tests, exams respect the levels of knowledge of the students) is assured by the head of the Chair, of the Department and of Quality Management. If they are not subject matter experts, how do they assess and ensure the substantial quality questions, tests, exams, etc. in question?</p> <p>Although the students are examined on a regular basis and the teachers officially provide reception hours for the students, the Committee is not convinced that students receive substantive personal feedback regarding their performance at different assessments in order to support student development.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: It would be advisable to provide students with personal feedback regarding their performance in order to support student development.
<p>2.7. REQUIREMENT: The higher education institution recognizes prior learning and work experiences.</p>
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The SER is very brief on this topic.</p> <p>The recognition of prior learning and work experience is mainly regulated by national normative documents. The meetings showed that there is confusion as to what the recognition of prior learning and work experience actually means. The Committee was interested if students can transfer the credits earned, individual courses taken in other Moldovan or foreign higher education institutions at master's or higher level to the MSU as part of their studies at the MSU. The Committee understands that according to national regulation, work experience is recognised</p>

Template for Assessment Report

only in the framework on vocational higher education. After the meetings, the Committee believes that a necessary regulation is in place for the recognition of prior learning, but there is little actual experience. The inflexibility of the current credits system in Moldova and the quite formalistic requirements appear to make it difficult to actually implement this system. The Committee did not receive any evidence regarding the awareness of the students of such a system, nor its application.

Recognising of prior learning is closely connected to academic mobility, i.e. if the credits earned during academic mobility are recognised without unduly difficulties, students have one more incentive to take advantage of academic mobility.

- **Recommendation:** The State University of Moldova should consider the possibility of increasing the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It provides more choices to students, but also increases the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility and therefore again makes academic mobility more attractive.

2.8. REQUIREMENT: Systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is performed and improvement measures are undertaken.

Comments:

The evaluation of study process has clearly defined purposes and its results are used to improve curriculum, courses, teaching methods etc. and to select teaching staff. There are several organs or officials who are involved in the analysis of the achievement of learning outcomes, e.g. Dean, Quality Assurance Commission, Quality Management Department, and the Pro-rector responsible for didactic activity. The SER and meetings showed that teaching staff and students are asked for feedback and their feedback is considered by appropriate organs and officials. However, the Committee received mixed information on whether and how alumni and employers also participate in the evaluation of study process. If they are not involved, the Department should involve them as they can provide useful feedback.

- **Recommendation:** If the alumni and the employers do not participate in the evaluation of study process, the Department should involve them as they can provide useful feedback.

2.9. REQUIREMENT: Students are involved in research and development activities, the supervision of student research papers (seminar papers, applied projects, final thesis) is well organised and the satisfaction rate with the quality of supervision is high.

Comments:

Each student has a supervisor appointed by the Department. The study programme involves 9 instructors and has 16 master students (enrolled

Template for Assessment Report

in 2014). When considering the number of teaching staff and students, the ratio is very favourable and students should receive very good supervision. Students have the freedom to choose the topics for their master's theses. The meetings with students and alumni showed that they were satisfied with supervision. Master's students are encouraged to participate in scientific conferences and to publish scientific articles. The meetings with students and alumni showed that students actually participate in conferences and publish articles (sometimes with their supervisors). **Employers emphasised that master's theses should include more international and European court and state practice.**

However, the Committee found no evidence that students are involved in broader research and development activities (beyond their individual research), e.g. participating in a research project led by a member of teaching staff. True, there are examples where professors and students/alumni have co-authored a publication. The SER shows that teaching staff participates in research projects. However, the Committee has not received enough evidence regarding the involvement of students in such activities.

- **Recommendation:** The Department should find ways to involve master's students in current or future research projects (also in development activities).

3. TEACHING STAFF	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	X		
<p>Collected evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-evaluation report (SER); • Annexes of SER; • Internal regulations; • Additional documents received during the site visit; • Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers. 			
<p>General comments:</p> <p>The total number and qualification of teaching staff is sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programmes at master's level. All of the staff members have a PhD degree. Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age indicates sustainability of the programme.</p> <p>Members of the teaching staff have attended various scientific events, at national and international levels, thus allowing them to improve their research and teaching methods.</p>			

Template for Assessment Report

The members of the teaching staff have participated in several self-improvement activities both in Moldova and abroad. The assessment committee welcomes this approach. The Faculty in general should be more actively participating in the academic mobility programs. The International Law and Law of Foreign Economic Relations Department could serve as a good example in this respect.

However, regarding other staff development activities besides some continuing education possibilities, the committee did not receive any evidence concerning the broader staff development plan, including conducting systematic appraisal interviews with the staff and other methods of staff development. At the Faculty management level, it is recommended to establish a comprehensive staff development system that includes also other important elements of staff development, like the implementation of regular appraisal interviews with the teachers.

There have been lessons and topics taught by foreign professors from HEIs from Europe, South Africa and Canada in the Department, which give this programme enough weight in relation to the other ones delivered by SUM in which there are no such initiatives. The committee recommends that the department should even more actively seek possibilities for involving more visiting professors in the teaching of the study programme.

Some of the members of the academic staff of this programme have given lectures in foreign universities or participated in mobilities for teaching staff improvements overseas. The committee recommends that at the Faculty management level a system will be created that supports and encourages the members of the full-time teaching staff to regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks. Regular goals for the international cooperation should be set and the achievement of those goals should be measured regularly e.g. during quarterly performance reviews of the members of the academic staff.

Research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.

Analysed in comparison with the other programmes, the programme “International Law” substantially conforms to requirements, despite some clear areas of improvement.

Commendations:

- Open lectures given by foreign professors;
- Participation of members of teaching staff as lecturers or visiting professors abroad or in mobility programmes
- Existence of a dedicated library at Department level, in course of completion with recent publications

Recommendations:

- At the Faculty management level, it is recommended to establish a comprehensive staff development system that includes also other important elements of staff development, like the implementation of regular appraisal interviews with the teachers.
- It is recommended to increase the number of scientific activities;
- It is recommended to increase the activity of the research center for international law;
- It is advisable to find methods in order to encourage and support the teaching staff to participate in the international research projects and other international scientific activities.

Template for Assessment Report

- At the Faculty management level a system should be created that supports and encourages the members of the full-time teaching staff to regularly develop their knowledge and skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks. Regular goals for the international cooperation should be set and the achievement of those goals should be measured regularly e.g. during quarterly performance reviews of the members of the academic staff.
- The Department should actively seek possibilities for involving visiting professors in the teaching in the study programme.

3.1. REQUIREMENT: The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the requirements established by legislation. At least 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme have PhD degree or equal.

Comments:

The study programme is taught by 9 teaching staff members, out of which 7 are full-time staff (78%). All of teaching members have a PhD degree.

This means that the number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the requirements established by legislation.

3.2. REQUIREMENT: Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age, and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensures the sustainability of studies in a higher education institution and a study programme.

Comments:

The age average of full-time staff is around 41 years. The oldest staff member is 58 years old and the youngest is 34. Given the fact that all of academic staff have a PhD degree and the ratio of younger researchers is bigger than the one of older ones, it is possible to say that the programme's sustainability can be ensured.

3.3. REQUIREMENT: The total number and qualification of teaching staff is – based on their responsibilities, workload and the number of supervised students – sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programmes at MA level.

Comments:

The qualification of the teaching staff is adequate to disciplines taught. In terms of workload and supervised students, it appears from annexes provided that the supervision workload is around 2-3 students per member of teaching staff, which is sufficient for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the programme.

Template for Assessment Report

<p>3.4. REQUIREMENT: The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and improve their teaching methods.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The CV's state that the members of the teaching staff have adequate teaching competences. Also, from Annexes B III.4.1 and B III.5.1 it appears that members of the teaching staff attended various scientific events, at national and international levels, thus allowing them to improve their research and teaching methods.</p>	
<p>3.5. REQUIREMENT: The staff development system is effective: the members of the teaching staff have opportunities for self-improvement, staff development methods are applied by the higher education institution.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Annex B III.5.1 presents a list of special events destined for the members of teaching staff, organized both in Moldova and abroad.</p> <p>The assessment committee welcomes this approach. Moreover, it should be contributed at the University and Faculty management level to the creation and development of the opportunities for the members of the academic staff of other departments to develop their knowledge and skill within the foreign academic institutions. The Faculty in general should be more actively participating in the academic mobility programs. The International Law and Law of Foreign Economic Relations Department could serve as a good example in this respect.</p> <p>However, regarding other staff development activities besides some continuing education possibilities, the committee did not receive any evidence concerning the broader staff development plan, including conducting systematic appraisal interviews with the staff and other methods of staff development.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: At the Faculty management level, it is recommended to establish a comprehensive staff development system that includes also other important elements of staff development, like the implementation of regular appraisal interviews with the teachers. 	
<p>3.6. REQUIREMENT: Visiting members of the teaching staff (including from foreign higher education institutions) are involved in teaching in a study programme.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Although one cannot really speak about visiting professors involved in teaching activities, there are nevertheless lessons and topics taught by foreign professors from HEIs from Europe, South Africa and Canada (Annex B III.6.1), which give this programme enough weight in relation to the other ones delivered by SUM in which there are no such initiatives.</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

- **Recommendation:** The committee recommends that the department should even more actively seek possibilities for involving more visiting professors in the teaching of the study programme.

3.7. REQUIREMENT: The members of the full-time teaching staff of a higher education institution regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks.

Comments:

From Annex B III.7.1 it can be deduced that some of the members of the academic staff of this programme gave lectures in foreign universities or participated in a mobility programme for teaching staff improvements overseas.

With this approach the department can serve as a good example for the whole Law Faculty.

- **Recommendation:** The committee recommends that at the Faculty management level a system will be created that supports and encourages the members of the full-time teaching staff to regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks. Regular goals for the international cooperation should be set and the achievement of those goals should be measured regularly e.g. during quarterly performance reviews of the members of the academic staff.

3.8. REQUIREMENT: Teaching staff are involved in national and international research projects and participate in forums, national and international scientific conferences.

Comments:

From Annex B III.8.1 it appears that two of teaching staff members were involved in some research projects. Also, from Annex B III.8.2 it can be deduced that there were attendance or participations in international conferences organized both in Chisinau and abroad (most of them in Romania), which led, in most cases, to the publication of scientific papers.

3.9. REQUIREMENT: Research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.

Comments:

The SER stipulates that the research activity of each member of the academic staff is planned and monitored, as each of the academics has to fill in every year an individual work plan, with research tangible result, which becomes part of the Department's yearly plan, the real achievement of such results being monitored by the head of the Department, based on reports and evidences provided by each member of the teaching staff.

Template for Assessment Report

At the same time, the Development strategy presented in Annex D7 stipulates for the period 2012-2017 the creation of two research centers: Centre for Public Law and Private Law Center, that will organize scientific activities (sessions and conferences, debates, round tables, practical workshops, case studies, experimental processes, methodological seminars, international schools, summer schools and essay contests), with emphasis in organizing international scientific conferences every two years.

Also, annex B III.9.1 states the fact that a center for research in international law is created within the SUM and annex B. III.9.2 presents the list of scientific activities targeted for the 2014-2015 period for some of the members of teaching staff involved in this programme.

At the visit, were provided proofs of annual individual plans of teachers, as well as reports by head of Department.

4. STUDENTS	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	
<p>Collected evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-evaluation report (SER); • Annexes of SER; • Internal regulations; • Additional documents received during the site visit; • Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers. 			
<p>General comments:</p> <p>Although the committee was pleased to meet many satisfied students who all assured the positive image of the International Law study programme, there is also plenty of room for improvements. Main reasons for regarding the decision to assess the area as partially conforming to requirements were insufficient academic mobility (internal and external) and also the lack of systematic approach towards anti-plagiarism and academic fraud issues.</p> <p>The students' satisfaction with the study programme is high and they have good informal relationship with the teaching staff. At the moment, mobility options on the study programme are very limited. It is recommended to encourage master students to participate in academic mobility and focus on informing them about the mobility opportunities (for example, hold classes or seminars to introduce the opportunities for academic mobility).</p>			

Template for Assessment Report

However, the percentage of master students participating in international mobility programs is increasing. During 2010-2014, nine master students have been involved in academic mobility. This was a genuinely positive finding which needs to be highlighted and the committee hopes that this positive trend shall also continue in the future.

In order to help the University in its internationalization (and academic mobility) processes at the University and also at the Faculty level, it is advisable to consider updating and revising the webpage's content in English in order to attract foreign students.

To further support the students, MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.

The committee welcomes the use of modern software by MSU in order to discover plagiarism, yet this approach is only one aspect of plagiarism detection. Therefore, the committee urges the Faculty to adapt a unified and more systematic approach towards preventing plagiarism and actively seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g course for academic writing, master's seminars etc).

According to the SER, MSU has a mechanism to monitor the evolution of graduates' employment. Also, the Department monitors the employment of the graduates. However, monitoring the faculty's graduates' employment could be more systematic. Much of this communications and monitoring of graduates career is done informally and is based on individual connections and relationships between the alumni and the (teaching) staff. There is a need for a systematic and institutionalized approach towards tracking the employment of faculty's graduates.

Taking into account the national context, the competitiveness of the graduates is high, regarding their employment rates. However, it is recommended that the data regarding the employment of graduates should be collected be more regularly and systematically.

Although the graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements, it would be in the Faculty's best interests that the causes for dropping out would also be formally collected and analysed.

Commendations:

- Students' suggestions and feedback is considered a valuable input to the University and Faculty.
- Students' satisfaction with the study programme is high.
- Graduates of the study programme are competitive in the labour market

Recommendations:

- MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.
- The faculty should encourage master students to participate in academic mobility and focus on informing them about the mobility

Template for Assessment Report

<p>opportunities (for example classes or seminars to introduce the opportunities for academic mobility).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In order to help the University in its internationalization (and academic mobility) processes at the University and also at the Faculty level, updating and revising the webpage's content in English in order to attract foreign students should be considered. • It is recommended to adapt a unified and systematic approach towards preventing plagiarism and seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g course for academic writing, master's seminars etc). Implementing anti-plagiarism software is a positive improvement but there is room for further improvements. • It is recommended to seek ways how to formally strengthen the ties with graduates (alumni club, events for graduates, satisfaction surveys for alumni etc). • It is recommended to formally collect and analyse the causes for dropping out. • It is recommended that the data regarding the employment of graduates should be collected be more regularly and systematically. 	
<p>4.1. REQUIREMENT: The admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. The admission of students is performed by procedures stipulated in the normative acts.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>In general, the admission requirements for students in the study programme International Law are in accordance with the normative acts and are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme.</p> <p>According to the SER, admission to the master's programme is governed by the rules of organization and development of admission to higher education master cycle II, adopted and approved annually (http://usm.md/admitere/) under the Rules for Admission to higher education master cycle II, approved by Government Decision nr.1455 of 24.12.2007. The Dean informed the committee that annually, the criteria for enrolment of students is approved annually by the Senate.</p> <p>Admission to master's degree studies is in accordance with the rules of the institution and is organized in two sessions. The admission examination for master's degree studies consists in a written or oral test for the profile subjects, also test for one foreign language and test for IT skills. According to the Dean, starting with year 2015, there shall be an online test as an entrance exam to the master's level studies.</p> <p>The national admission criteria include a specialty exam and evaluation of the IT and foreign language skills (English/French). Regarding the general lack of foreign language skills among the master students encountered by the committee, a question can be raised whether the language test serves its purpose adequately or is there some room for improvement.</p>	
<p>4.2. REQUIREMENT: The counselling system of students (including study, career and psychological counselling) is planned/targeted and effective.</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Although the SER claimed that study and career counselling is available to students, as well as the Center of Psychological Assistance for the students, the committee was not able to witness the awareness of the students or the alumni of other formal counselling services than career counselling.</p> <p>It is recommended for the Faculty to consider delegating the responsibility of study counselling from professors to a trained specialist. All of the professors are not prepared to provide effective study counselling. A separate study advisor can provide more professional counselling and could also ease the professors' workload.</p> <p>There seems to be a lack of information regarding other counselling services besides career counselling.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.
<p>4.3. REQUIREMENT: Students are provided with internal and external mobility opportunities.</p>
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Mobility options available to the students (especially external mobility options) are very limited. Although there are very few options, the students are still not aware about the opportunities they might have. The committee encourages the faculty to seek more academic mobility opportunities and to raise the awareness amongst students.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: It is recommended to provide master students with internal and external mobility possibilities and focus on informing them about such opportunities (for example, hold classes or seminars to introduce the opportunities for academic mobility).
<p>4.4. REQUIREMENT: Students participate in international mobility programmes. The percentage of students participating in student mobility is stable or growing.</p>
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The percentage of master students participating in international mobility programs is increasing. During 2010-2014, nine master students have been involved in academic mobility. This was a genuinely positive finding which needs to be highlighted and the committee hopes that this</p>

Template for Assessment Report

<p>positive trend shall also continue in the future.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: The committee recommends the faculty members further actively seek possibilities to support and encourage students to participate in international mobility programmes. 	
<p>4.5. REQUIREMENT: Students are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the higher education institution.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> As stated in the SER and also confirmed during the interviews, students are involved in the decision-making processes at various levels of the university. Furthermore they are not only formally involved but they also assured us that the management of the faculty and the university considers their feedback and also implements their suggestions. Master’s degree student representatives are included in the Council of the Faculty of Law, in the University Senate but also in the Quality Committee of the Faculty</p>	
<p>4.6. REQUIREMENT: A system has been established for the detection and prevention of academic fraud.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> To prevent and exclude plagiarism in master thesis, MSU is testing a special program that determines whether the master thesis overlap with other existing works and to what extent overlaps. In this order the master thesis is presented with a CD copy which, after inspection, shall be kept in the archives of MSU. The committee welcomes this approach and recommends also to the Department to participate in this initiation, although this approach is only one aspect of plagiarism detection.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: All of the study programmes under evaluation lack a systematic approach towards academic fraud. In many cases the discovery of academic fraud lies upon academic staff (for example thesis supervisors). Therefore, the committee urges the Faculty to adapt a unified and more systematic approach towards preventing plagiarism and actively seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g course for academic writing, master’s seminars etc). 	
<p>4.7. REQUIREMENT: Higher education institution has a tracking mechanism of graduates’ employment and is monitoring the evolution of graduates’ career.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> According to the SER, MSU has a mechanism to monitor the evolution of graduates’ employment. Also, the Department monitors the</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

employment of the graduates. Regarding the obtained qualification, from 78 master graduates, 61 are employed according to their specialty, 9 of them continue cycle studies II and III, and 12 are employed in other spheres of activity.

However, monitoring the faculty's graduates' employment could be more systematic. Much of this communications and monitoring of graduates career is done informally and is based on individual connections and relationships between the alumni and the (teaching) staff. There is a need for a systematic and institutionalized approach towards tracking the employment of faculty's graduates.

- **Recommendation:** The committee recommends to consider organising annual events e.g. conferences, seminars or other types of networking meetings with the alumni of the faculty. Also the collecting feedback from graduates could be more regular and systematic.

4.8. REQUIREMENT: The competitiveness of the graduates of a study programme is demonstrated by employment rate according to obtained qualification; unemployment rate; employment rate in other fields than the one studied within the programme.

Comments:

The committee was able to confirm that the students in the programme are prepared with the necessary skills and qualifications and also needed in the labour market. The chair is responsible for the implementation of the master's degree program, monitors by its own means the employment of graduates and their career development. Usually, this is materialized in writing recommendations to soliciting employers, as well as in maintaining collaboration links depending on requirements. According to the SER, about 80% of the total number of graduates are employed according to their qualifications, 14% are employed in other fields and only 8% are unemployed, this figure also includes those, about whom the Department has no information for objective reasons, characterized by high migration flow from Moldova. Taking into account the national context, these rates indicate clear competitiveness of the graduates.

However, the SER nor the additional documents provided more detailed data on the employment rate of the graduates. It is recommended that the collecting of the data regarding the employment of graduates should be more regular and systematic.

4.9. REQUIREMENT: There is a system in place for monitoring academic progress. Graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements. Effective measures are implemented to reduce the drop-out rates.

Comments:

According to the SER, there exists a database in SUM where all the academic results of the master students are included. The professors notify of the study results methodic worker from Dean's office who adds all necessary information to the register that reflects all final evaluations of the students.

Template for Assessment Report

Graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements. The dropout rate for the 2008-2014 period is around 18%. Monitoring of students' academic process is satisfactory and complies with the regulations and procedures in place.

However, it would be in the interests of the Department to formally collect and analyse the causes for dropping out.

5. RESOURCES	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	
<p>Collected evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-evaluation report (SER); • Annexes of SER; • Internal regulations; • Additional documents received during the site visit; • Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers. 			
<p>General comments:</p> <p>The budget planning in general is sustainable. However, the Faculty is underfinanced, which according to the understanding of the committee is the reason for many shortcomings described above, e.g. the general salary level of the academic staff, the state of library and the general infrastructure of the Faculty, the low level of academic mobility etc. It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.</p> <p>According to the trends presented to the committee, the number of students and graduates in shows lasting stability which indicates sustainability of the study programme.</p> <p>As the Faculty in general was at least partially under renovation, it was not possible for the committee to assess the conformity to the requirements of the teaching and learning environment as a whole. There was dissatisfaction among the students with the learning environment.</p> <p>ICT devices are available for both Faculty members and students. The computer rooms look modern and meet the basic contemporary standards. The staff and the students are relatively motivated to use ICT techniques. The positive trend is the using of <i>Moodle</i> platform</p>			

Template for Assessment Report

providing the students with information regarding the courses online. Still, the existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable.

There is almost no foreign literature in the field of law and the books available are rather out-dated. The situation related to foreign law books is somewhat better with regard to the International Law and Foreign Economic Relations Law Department, because there seems to be a minimal satisfactory library within the department. This also is a proof that with the right mindset and enthusiasm there are possibilities to obtain minimally needed foreign books and start using them.

Still, the University should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in international academic databases (that provide actual access to legal texts, not just directories), training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources. The library needs major investment, especially regarding field specific legal literature in English, French or German. It is recommended to increase the awareness of students and academic staff of international databases and motivate them to use the few available.

Commendations:

- The classrooms are equipped sufficiently, the equipment is being renewed.
- The use of *Moodle* platform providing the students information regarding the courses online.

Recommendations:

- It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.
- The University should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in international academic databases (that provide actual access to legal texts, not just directories), training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources. The library needs major investment, especially regarding field specific legal literature in English, French or German.
- It is recommended to increase the awareness of students and academic staff of international databases and motivate them to use the few available.
- The existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable.

5.1. REQUIREMENT: The financial resources of a higher education institution are adequate for conducting studies, development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff.

Comments:

Template for Assessment Report

According to the SER, the financial resources of Moldova State University are practically sufficient for conducting studies, activities for the development of studies and for supporting the development of teaching staff, which is confirmed by (Annex B.V.1.1).

The committee still feels that in general the faculty seems underfinanced, which according to the understanding of the committee is the reason for many shortcomings described above, e.g. the general salary level of the academic staff, the state of library and the general infrastructure of the faculty, the low level of academic mobility etc. It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.

5.2. REQUIREMENT: Trends in the number of students and graduates, and the budget of a higher education institution in the last three to five years indicate sustainability.

Comments:

The trends of admission and graduation of students per each year are presented below:

No.	Registration year	Number of students registered	Number of students graduated
1.	2008	25	19
2.	2009	22	18
3.	2010	16	11
4.	2011	16	14
5.	2012	16	16

According to the trends presented to the committee, the number of students and graduates in shows lasting stability which indicates sustainability.

From year 2010 to 2014, the revenues have increased by approximately 10% and so have the expenditures - by approximately 16%. The committee finds that these numbers also clearly show the sustainable character of budget planning.

5.3. REQUIREMENT: Teaching and learning environments have been developed according to the teaching and learning objectives, include all facilities necessary for conducting studies in a given study programme and are of adequate capacity

Template for Assessment Report

<p>considering the number of students (auditoriums, seminar rooms, laboratories, rooms for students independent work and recreation, video projectors, internet etc.).</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Teaching environment includes all the facilities necessary to carry out our Study program (the study classrooms, seminar rooms, laboratories, offices for individual work of the students, spaces for recreation, etc.). For the International Law Study Program, Room no. 3, with a capacity of 42 seats, area 32.4 square meters, was attributed. Each master incumbent 16 square meters (Annex B.V.3.1).</p> <p>The committee witnessed that the faculty in general was at least partially under renovation, therefore it is currently not possible to assess whether the outcome of the works will meet all the requirements.</p> <p>During the interviews with the students, some dissatisfaction was expressed with the learning environment.</p>	
<p>5.4. REQUIREMENT: Both the conduct of studies and other activities of a higher education institution are supported by up-to-date information technology solutions, including the study information system, e-learning opportunities, and communication portals for students and teaching staff.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>In general, the number of computers is sufficient. ICT devices are available for faculty members and students. The computer rooms look in general modern and meet the basic contemporary standards. The staff and the students are relatively motivated to use ICT techniques.</p> <p>However, the availability and the knowledge of Faculty members regarding electronic legal databases should be increased. The committee found no evidence during the assessment visit that the basic legal databases are available for use from Faculty computers. The positive trend is the using of <i>Moodle</i> platform providing the students with information regarding the courses online.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: The existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable. 	
<p>5.5. REQUIREMENT: The students are provided with dormitories and medical service.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p>	

Template for Assessment Report

SUM has dormitories for students (Annex B. 5.5.). Master law students stay in the dormitory no.19 on Flower Street 4/2, Chisinau. Law Faculty students receive medical services at University Medical Center located on Pan Halippa str. 6/5 Chişinău.	
5.6. REQUIREMENT: A library supports the conduct of studies ensuring that up-to-date information sources are available, and provides students with the opportunities for independent work.	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According the SER, the general library of SUM is equipped with 1,809,725 of books, 1445 PhD thesis; 4074 rare books, 523 places for reading rooms (capacity that can simultaneously serve more than 20% of the students of the Faculty of Law of USM) and 4359 square metres functional place.</p> <p>However, in the light of this data, the most significant problem related to library is that there is almost no foreign literature in the field of law. The books available are rather out-dated. The visit to the library proved that the literature in the field is inadequate and needs fundamental strategic re-planning. The students and academic staff are not aware of international databases and therefore not motivated to use the few available. Also the librarians need training to give advice to the students on how to access electronic academic materials.</p> <p>The situation related to foreign law books is somewhat better with regard to the International Law and Foreign Economic Relations Law Department, because there seems to be a minimal satisfactory library within the department. This also is a proof that with the right mindset and enthusiasm there are possibilities to obtain minimally needed foreign books and start using them.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation: However, in general the library of SUM needs major investment, especially regarding field specific legal literature in English, French or German. The university should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in international academic databases (that provide actual access to legal texts, not just directories), training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources. 	