

**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**

**ASSESSMENT REPORT**

**HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTION: Tallinn University**

<b>STUDY PROGRAMME GROUP</b>	<b>Arts</b>
<b>ACADEMIC CYCLE</b>	<b>Doctoral studies (PhD)</b>

<b>STUDY PROGRAMMES</b>	<b>Audiovisual Arts and Media Studies</b>
-------------------------	---

**COMPOSITION OF ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE:** Prof Lily Diaz-Kommonen, Chairman, Aalto University, Finland  
Prof Andrew Spicer University of the West of England, UK  
Amy Genders PhD student representative, University of South Wales, UK  
Helle Tiikmaa Estonian Association of Journalists, Estonia

**PERIOD OF EVALUATION: February-March 2018**

**DATE ASSESSMENT REPORT SENT TO INSTITUTION UNDER EVALUATION: 28 March 2018**

**DATE COMMENTS RECEIVED FROM INSTITUTION UNDER EVALUATION: 2 April 2018**

**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**

**ASSESSMENT BY ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE: THE QUALITY OF INSTRUCTION - CONFORMS TO A REQUIRED STANDARD PARTIALLY**

**General Comments:**

The panel notes there is a clear need for such a programme. Estonian society would benefit from highly educated specialists/researchers in forming cultural/media policy. There is the pronounced enthusiasm amongst the Baltic Film, Media and Communication School staff and from the University's executive as well as in the industry and societal institutions. The programme would be unique in Estonia and would open up possibilities for a new type of research – practice-based/artistic/creative – and which is timely. It would give the country more visibility, attract international students and is in line with developments in other countries.

As the programme is being established there is lack of clarity in some areas: how to combine academic and creative research in particular; how the programme will be sustained financially; its ability to attract and maintain high quality students. These were the three issues that gave the assessment committee some concerns. Below we list the strengths of the programme and areas for improvement noted by the panel:

**Strengths:**

1. There is evident enthusiasm and synergy among the tutors, the staff, and the stakeholders that met with the panel. TU has assembled a group of high quality potential supervisors for the programme.
2. There is a clear commitment to the project evidenced from the statement by Indrek Ibrus that “they have been working on this for more than two years”. The documentation showed evidence of careful and imaginative planning.
3. The staff are realistic about the demands of a doctoral programme and understand the challenges.
4. Though they would hope to get two (2) students, Ibrus mentioned that University of Tallinn has promised at least one (1) additional study place per year.
5. They also hope to get two (2) more places from some of the tutors' research project grant money.
6. Thus it is anticipated that although the programme will start small, it will build to a steady group of five (5) to seven (7) participants after five (5) years.
7. Initially the programme will use already existing university wide courses; more bespoke courses will be developed as the programme matures. Staff will also try to tap into doctoral courses already existing in other countries, such as summer and winter doctoral schools in exchange programmes.

### INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS

Areas for improvement:

1. A key challenge for the programme creators and organisers is the need to develop clearer criteria for the evaluation of creative research.
2. No physical facilities (at the University of Tallinn) belonging to a stakeholder group that could adequately accommodate the needs for the programme from a new media and new/media arts perspective was shown to the panel. Such a space, which also requires careful planning, design, implementation and money, will be needed in the event that the programme decides to develop in this way. A new building to take care of these needs has been planned and construction will commence soon. Note that the panel was not shown plans or given more information about this structure and its capabilities.
3. Prof. Ibrus mentioned in his interview that the university is developing a tenure track system. This is important given that an evident, transparent and long-term strategy for recruiting and retaining the programme's staff is needed. After the assessment interview, the panel received additional information about the new career model for academic staff that TU is implementing.
4. Though there is a very good group of potential tutors assembled, not all of them have experience supervising a thesis from the beginning to its completion. Therefore, the panel also recommends mentoring for less experienced supervisors.
5. The programme need to develop a clear strategy for how the candidates will be selected. At present it seems to be a rather ad hoc arrangement in which some students will transfer from another programme; some might apply after completing an already existing MA programme at TU; and some might apply from abroad).
6. There are promises of considerable support both financial as well as 'in kind'. However, we would hope to see clear evidence of this support being manifested as the programme develops.
7. It might be good practice that, as the unit expands, the workload of the Head of Programme is reviewed.
8. BFM needs to ensure adequate teaching of technical skills as required by students on this programme.

It is because of these challenges that the assessment panel decided on issuing a partial recommendation (suggesting a renewed evaluation in to be carried out in a period of three (3) years.

**ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE CONSISTING OF THE FOLLOWING MEMBERS: Lily Diaz-Kommonen, Andrew Spicer, Amy Genders and Helle Tiikmaa**

**APPROVED THE ASSESSMENT, 4 VOTES IN FAVOUR AND 0 VOTES AGAINST: 3.04.2018**

**ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE CHAIR Lily Diaz-Kommonen**

## INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS

**REQUIREMENTS FOR QUALITY OF INSTRUCTION****1. Study Programme and Organisation of Studies**

REQUIREMENTS	EVIDENCE GATHERED	COMMENTS
<p>The study programme is based on the needs of the labour market and target groups and contributes to fulfilling the mission of the educational institution and achieving its objectives.</p>	<p>Study programme; Tallinn University/BFM development plan; Interviews with the TU and BFM management, the head of the programme, potential supervisors, employers and cooperation partners</p>	<p>The study programme is unique in offering a creative-oriented and academic doctoral programme in the field of audio-visual arts in Estonia. Opening the doctoral programme is part of Baltic Film, Media and Communication School (from here on, BFM) Development Plan 2015-2020. Indeed, it seems to be, in essence, necessary to fulfil the goals set for BFM to combine academic and artistic research. There is no doctoral programme at the present for media and audio-visual arts students in Tallinn University (from here on, TU). According to the cover letter presented, the Media and Communications programme in University of Tartu (from here on, UT) has a different focus hence it is not a competitor to this new programme. Additionally, BFM has a goal of improving its visibility through co-operation with creative industry enterprises, which the doctoral programme can assist in fulfilling.</p> <p>Film Arts belong solely to the fields of study offered by TU, hence it has an obligation to Estonian society to cover the field from every angle.</p> <p>The objectives of the programme (as discerned by these evaluators) are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. to train a new generation of teachers that satisfy the needs of the growing (digital) audio-visual field in the country</li> <li>2. to train researchers to fulfil the need of the country's media market sector</li> <li>3. to train innovative and creative content producers and</li> </ol>

**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**

		<p>practitioners.</p> <p>The programme offers also new model for an innovation to the doctoral programme system in Estonia. In its inclusion of creative practices, the programme is bound to raise discussion and debate regarding third cycle education in Estonia. Within the Baltic region there are already other programmes of doctoral study but they are quite different from the one proposed by the University of Tallinn with its simultaneous emphasis on cultural studies and the inclusion of artistic practices. And though the primary audience is Estonia, it offers additional opportunities to students from the whole Baltic region.</p> <p>The study programme recognises the evolving needs of contemporary society and the increasing centrality of audio-visual competencies. It therefore aims to equip graduates with the necessary skills for the current labour market, centrally those seeking employment in the audio-visual sector. It aims to develop high level skills and knowledges leading to a standard of professional competence that would help to secure high quality employment in the sector.</p> <p>Tallinn University identifies ‘Digital and Media Culture’ as the second of its five key strategic goals (2015-20) and identifies Media Innovation and Digital Culture (from here on, MEDIT) as a research centre of excellence that will ‘improve capacity’ through the creation of digital media and communication culture, interdisciplinary research and the building of an international research community.</p> <p>BFM wishes to develop the theoretical and practical skills that will</p>
--	--	--

**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**

		<p>enable it to become a “leading force in cultural and media change in the digital era” and has committed to support the MEDIT research centre in improving the research capacity, volume and international profile through the launch of a PhD programme.</p> <p>MEDIT fulfils BFM’s desire to combine and connect practical and academic training and to develop both researchers and future professionals. The BFM’s plan contains an explicit commitment to sustaining MEDIT and to support its staff’s ambitions, which include the launch of a doctoral programme.</p>
<p>Employers and other stakeholders of the study programme group are involved in the study programme development.</p>	<p>Study programme; Support letters; Interviews with the employers and cooperation partners, potential student candidates</p>	<p>Materials presented includes three letters of support – from Public Broadcaster ERR (from the previous CEO), which states the need for academic tutors and lecturers; from the Estonia Film Institute (a foundation established by the Ministry of Culture that is also a major contributor in the Estonian film market) and the Ministry of Culture.</p> <p>There seems to be financial rewards forthcoming from the state and positive societal impact from the programme graduates as well as from the innovative research projects that could result from the activities in the study programme. The interviews with the employers and cooperation partners showed their readiness to be more involved with the programme: They declared their desire to be not only financiers but also partners with the programme.</p> <p>The student candidate interviews did not include any artistically-oriented representative nor potential candidates from BFM’s Master of Arts programmes Hence there is lack of evidence around the expectations and needs of such students.</p>

## INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS

The title of the study programme is consistent with its content.	Study programme	Audio-visual Arts and Media Studies clearly identifies the two core strands of media and creative research and the content presented to the panel is consistent with this title.
The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme are formulated in such a way that they provide a basis for evaluating the knowledge and skills of graduates of that study programme.	Study programme; the Standard of Higher Education	<p>The study programme objectives provide a basis for evaluating the following knowledge and skills:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. the ability to undertake independent doctoral research in the field of media and communication studies</li> <li>2. the ability to undertake practical doctoral research in the form of media and film projects</li> <li>3. the development of pedagogical and research organisation skills.</li> </ol> <p>These objectives are supported by specific learning outcomes, which provide a basis for evaluation that is consistent with doctoral study.</p> <p>The overall selection of the courses is comprehensive and well fitted to what the panel perceives to be the identity of the programme and to the expectations of the students interviewed. However, the panel wishes to call the attention to two important omissions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. the inclusion of quantitative methods in the curriculum</li> <li>2. human-centred design research methods, if these are not included in the qualitative methodologies seminars.</li> </ol>
The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme are equal and comparable to the learning outcomes of the academic cycles of higher education as described in Annex 1 to the Standard of Higher Education.	Study programme; Annex 1 to the Standard of Higher Education; the analysis by the educational institution on the compatibility of learning outcomes with the Standard of Higher Education	<p>The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme are equal and comparable to the expectations of the learning outcomes of doctoral studies.</p> <p>The general compulsory courses provide the ‘broad and systematic overview’ of the fields; and the range of speciality seminars and electives give depth in the more specific areas of research and provide training in research methods.</p> <p>Overall training and research methods are substantial except in the case of the already above mentioned quantitative and design</p>

**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**

		<p>methods.</p> <p>The programme document submitted provides clear evidence of the ways in which the elements of this programme map the general requirements of study at this level.</p> <p>The teaching option is a good practice as long as it does not exceed a certain proportion so that it would interfere with the participant’s work on their research and thesis. It might be beneficial to set a maximum number of hours for this. Also, it can be beneficial to set parameters to the student-supervisor relationship. Examples of the parameters to be included are: 1. The overall level of academic supervising to be provided (number of hours) throughout the four (4) years of study. 2. Ensuring that this supervision relates specifically the subject matter of the dissertation.3. The number of hours allocated for each of these tasks to each tutor per semester. These figures should be one of the first things to be determined by the Committee or Studies Board that will be in charge of the study programme.</p>
<p>Forms of study, and student workload for independent work, practical training and, in the case of doctoral studies, for implementation of professional activities, support the achievement of objectives of the study programme.</p>	<p>Study programme; additional information obtained during the site visit</p>	<p>General courses appear to support academic and professional development appropriate to this level of study and are in line with the objectives of the study programme. However, the 60 ECTS workload is in the upper register bearing in mind the amount of coursework generated by doctoral work that may also include a practice-based component, which is often very time-consuming. The Studies Board should monitor the amount of credits required and see how the workload affects the first cohort’s ability to graduate within the designated time period and, if required, ask the University to reconsider this requirement. The panel calls for more flexibility from the University in tailoring the programme to suit the needs and experience of individual students and for BFM to have the option of exempting them from some of the compulsory elective courses.</p>



## INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS

<p>The study programme meets the requirements and trends in international legislation that regulates the professional field and, if a professional standard exists, takes into consideration the acquisition and implementation of the knowledge and skills described therein. In professional higher education, study programmes of a study programme group are related to a specific vocation.</p>	<p>international legislation regulating the corresponding professional field;</p>	<p>The study programme appears to meet the requirements and trends in international frameworks of doctoral study. Some doctoral study programmes (such as for example in the United Kingdom) give less emphasis to contextual courses. Rather, the trend increasingly is to implement a wide-ranging programme that develops doctoral researchers in a more holistic way, including student development funding that allows them to pursue a bespoke study and training plan, including field trips, archival work, study abroad, placements and even short internships. Most UK universities implement the Vitae Researcher Development Framework (<a href="https://www.vitae.ac.uk/">https://www.vitae.ac.uk/</a>) with its four ‘domains’: a) knowledge and intellectual abilities; b) personal effectiveness; c) research governance and organisation; and d) engagement and impact.</p>
<p>The organisation of studies is regulated and takes into consideration the specifics of the study programme group; recognition of prior learning and work experiences is regulated as well.</p>	<p>Interviews with potential supervisors and head of the programme</p>	<p>The interviewed personnel are invested in the specific audiovisual programme, creating the academic/creative community of this specific programme and bringing in the national networks to encourage integration and on the other hand, international networks to support the programme, which also encourages student mobility and timely graduation. There is an awareness and understanding of the nature of creative practice-based research in the group, as well as recognition for a rigorous academic ‘umbrella’ within which to frame that research. The supervisors recognized the need for ongoing work in the regulation and structure of the programme.</p>
<p>The organisation of practical training is clearly regulated, the requirements for implementing practical training are determined, and preliminary agreements with practical training facilities are in place.</p>	<p>additional information obtained during the site visit</p>	<p>BFM’s excellence and focus on audio visual and film production contributes to the programme’s unique identity.</p>

**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**

<p>Students are provided with counselling (study, career, and psychological counselling).</p>	<p>additional information obtained during the site visit</p>	<p>TU has one (1) full time and one (1) psychological counsellor with 0.1 workload; one (1) career counsellor for doctoral students and seven (7) study counsellors for students in general. With the stress involved in doctoral studies, the University should monitor the need for additional psychological support.</p>
---	--	---

**OVERALL ASSESSMENT BY ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME AND THE ORGANISATION OF STUDIES (AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT):**

Overall this study programme has been thought out and planned carefully and the panel was presented with evidence as to the availability of staff (both academic and technical) to undertake the teaching and mentoring work load. However, as was noted several times throughout the report, the panel has not been presented with enough evidence regarding teaching and mentoring for the *creative* aspects of the programme. In the opinion of the panel, a key challenge for the programme creators and organisers is the need to develop clearer criteria for the evaluation of creative research. We would like to have seen how the programme would accommodate the specific demands of practice-based students though we recognise that this is very difficult to evidence before the programme begins and therefore what kinds of practice-based students it might attract. Another item for review is the workload of the Head of the Programme and what provisions are being made to support and reward his leadership.

## INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS

**2. Teaching Staff**

<b>REQUIREMENTS</b>	<b>EVIDENCE GATHERED</b>	<b>COMMENTS</b>
Qualifications of the teaching and research staffs involved meet the requirements established in legislation as well as those arising from the specifics of a study programme group and the academic cycle of higher education. The educational institution has entered into binding contracts with its teaching staff to conduct studies.	“TLU supervisors and key professors”; list of publications; ETIS	There seems to be a good pool of talent available to the programme—seventeen (17) of the teaching staff have PhDs. The teaching staff have all published work or produced practical creative work in relevant fields. However, on the creative practitioners’ side there are fewer PhDs (the panel recognises that there has been no suitable PhD programme in Estonia until now). The courses assigned appear to correspond with the individual’s experience and expertise. Most of the teaching staff have binding contracts with TU (through BFM and MEDIT).
The level and extent of research and development by the teaching and research staffs involved are adequate to teach in the corresponding academic cycle of higher education and to supervise student research.	Information about research and development activities by the teaching staff (the Estonian Research Information System ETIS, additional information provided by the educational institution)	While there is limited experience in supervising PhDs, there is sufficient critical mass and synergy among the teaching staff to tackle the challenges that might arise. This includes co-supervision. The panel also recommends mentoring for less experienced supervisors.
The teaching staff involved have an adequate teaching competency.	additional information obtained during the site visit	There is a good balance of theoretical and practice-based expertise across the teaching and research staff to support a programme of this type.
The number of members of ordinary teaching and research staffs involved – based on their responsibilities, workload and the number of supervised students – is adequate for	Information about qualifications as well as research and development activities of the teaching staff involved	The number of teaching and research staff appears adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme. Nevertheless, there is a need to monitor the workload of the staff who are engaged in the programme as teachers and as researchers writing grant applications, through MEDIT and BFM.

## INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS

achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme(s) in a given study programme group.		
The teaching staff involved are aware of the objectives of the study programme and their roles in achieving them.	Interviews with the potential supervisors and head of the programme	The teaching staff seems to be enthusiastically engaged with the programme development and are aware of their obligations as future supervisors.
The ordinary teaching and research staffs of the educational institution have undergone the required evaluation. The educational institution provides its teaching staff with opportunities for their professional and individual development.	Interviews with the potential supervisors and head of the programme	According to the designated head of the programme, Professor Indrek Ibrus, a tenure track system is being developed at TU. There is also feedback system in place for students to evaluate teachers and courses on a regular basis. There are pedagogical courses available and accessible in the University. The future supervisors expressed the need for developing a more formal structure for discussing amongst themselves best practices and learning from mistakes. Such a forum might be accomplished partially through the Studies Board.
The teaching staff and supervisors of study programmes of doctoral studies regularly further their skills at foreign institutions of higher education or other research institutions, participate in international research projects, and present papers at high-level conferences.	The Estonian Education Information System ETIS; information about research and development activities by the teaching staff provided by the educational institution; additional information received during the site visit	The majority of the teaching staff are actively involved in on-going projects and/or present papers at high-level, international conferences. The staff is well connected with the international networks of their fields. Via MEDIT they host international conferences, invite visiting professors and researchers to further the professional development. They also publish an open-access, blind-peer reviewed international academic journal, the <i>Baltic Screen Media Review</i> . The panel suggests that the programme would benefit from broadening the scope of the journal to accept practice-based research submissions and from joining already existing publications and networks (e.g. <i>Journal for Artistic Research</i> or <i>Screen Media</i> ). BFM has a custom of bringing in international practitioners-teachers

**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**

		as visiting staff and that should be encouraged and broadened.
--	--	--

**OVERALL ASSESSMENT BY ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE OF THE TEACHING STAFF (AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT):**

The teaching staff (or potential supervisors interviewed) comprise a good cadre of skilled professionals who seem dedicated to achieving excellence in their work. As is the case with a new programme featuring artistic activities, not all have achieved a PhD degree, although not many of them have proven experience of having supervised PhDs to completion. Nevertheless, they were all very enthusiastic and seemed committed to being involved with the programme.

There were no clear indicators regarding the teaching of technical skills related to digital media production, such as programming and electronics. The Committee (or Studies Board) should consider how to address this need if teaching in these subjects is not already a part of MEDIT.

**3. Resources**

<b>REQUIREMENTS</b>	<b>EVIDENCE GATHERED</b>	<b>COMMENTS</b>
The educational institution ensures that financial resources necessary for conducting studies are available and prepares a strategy for acquiring them (prepares risk analyses and financial forecasts that include a calculation of the cost of a student place, takes into account the risks arising from the operational	Tangible resources and financial information of the educational institution, and the information about the infrastructure of the study programme group	The University’s management assured the panel of its commitment and readiness to support the starting of the programme and allocating funds for it. MEDIT and BFM have been successful in getting grants for their research. However, the panel suggests that the University must allocate sufficient staff to ensure the sustainability of the programme and also develop a strategy for its financial sustainability. The programme should strive to achieve visibility and social impact, as well as foster industry co-operation.

## INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS

environment, and uses other appropriate measures to ensure the resources).		
The educational institution has the sources for financing research and development related to doctoral studies.	Information about the sources for financing research and development (research projects and their costs, research agreements and their monetary funding, etc.) in ETIS; interviews with the management and head of the programme	Existing sectors that could provide possible funding: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- State financing</li> <li>- University commitment</li> <li>- European funding (Interreg, HERA, H2020, Creative Europe)</li> <li>- National foundations</li> <li>- Industry projects</li> <li>- Commissioned projects.</li> </ul>
There are facilities (lecture halls, laboratories, seminar rooms, rooms for students' independent work) necessary for educational activities, as well as for research and development related to doctoral studies, which are furnished and equipped adequately and are up to date to achieve the objectives of study programmes; or there are specific existing financial decisions/projects to finance the additional needs.	Tangible resources and financial information of the educational institution, and the information about the infrastructure of the study programme group	BFM has basic facilities that could accommodate the programme. The panel recommends that there should be willingness to renew the technological base as it develops and as the specific needs from the PhD projects arise. Particular care should be placed when designing the new spaces to accommodate the different media. The design process should include all the communities that will be using it, particularly the different professors of the programme. <p>There is currently:</p> 75 lecture/seminar rooms across 6 buildings. 23 study laboratories across 2 buildings. 3,436 study places across 6 buildings. 51 work places for teaching staff. Fewer stationary/portable projectors than study rooms and study

**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**

		<p>laboratories, although the TU Infrastructure document notes that rooms used for teaching practical skills (TV studio, film studio, editing room, etc.) use specialist equipment instead.</p> <p>Cinema Hall, Film Studio, Television Studio, Post Production Centre and MEDIT Creative Lab adequately equipped for students to undertake practical learning.</p> <p>Cinema Hall holds 105 seats and is equipped with Estonia’s first 4K digital cinema projector.</p>
<p>Means of information technology and communications between national and international communication networks – needed for educational activities as well as for research and development related to doctoral studies – are available.</p>	<p>Tangible resources and financial information of the educational institution, and the information about the infrastructure of the study programme group</p>	<p>The Post Production Centre is equipped with 25 iMacs with various video and sound editing software. Access to 40TB media server from room N507.</p> <p>8 separate video editing rooms, which provide access to Final Cut Pro, Adobe Premiere Pro or Avid Media Composer on Mac Pro workstations.</p> <p>2 sound studios and 2 sound editing rooms. Multi-track recording and audio editing - Avid ProTools HD.</p> <p>Other software available in the BFM computer network: Adobe Creative Cloud 2015.3; Davinci Resole 12.5; Frameforge Previz Studio Pro 3; Celtx; Open Office; Apple Pages; Apple Numbers; Apple Keynote; Safari; Firefox; Google Chrome; Skype; Cyberduck; SimplyBurns; Blackmagic Disk Speed Test; DigiDoc3; ID-Card Utility; Quicktime 7; VLC Player; Flip4Mac; REDCINE X; MPEG Streamclip; Handbrake; Gimp; Audacity; CCleaner; UnRarX; The Unarchiver; Paragon NTFS.</p> <p>Public places for computer usage in the library/study centre: 113</p>

**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**

		1 GB/S internet connection.
The educational institution ensures that up-to-date information sources (including data bases) needed for teaching, learning and research in the study programme group are available.	Information about existing information sources (including data bases) and those to be acquired	Databases available: Ebook Central (approx. 150,000 e-books); JSTOR Arts & Sciences I, II, III, IV; Sage Research Methods; EBSCO databases; SpringerLINK multidisciplinary database; Oxford Art Online and Oxford Music Online.  Students also have access to the following support systems: homepage detailing the websites of all academic units; study information system (OIS), course schedule programme (ASIO); e-study environments such as Moodle.
Financial indicators regarding economic sustainability of the educational institution are available to the general public. Annual reports of the educational institution or its organising body are audited, unless otherwise established by law. This requirement does not apply to new educational institutions.	The annual report	TU has proven financial sustainability.

**OVERALL ASSESSMENT BY ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE OF RESOURCES (AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT):**

The assessment panel was impressed by the proposed programme of study presented to them in the documentation provided, and in the interviews conducted with the staff. However, we do see the need for some improvement and recommend the following areas for attention:



### INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS

- 1) As has been noted throughout the evaluation, a key area of concern is the handling of the creative work as part of doctoral studies. This is central because this element is also what will primarily differentiate this programme from other doctoral programmes, not only in Estonia but also throughout the region. To a large degree, the innovation that is being sought by the different stakeholders interviewed emerges from this creative component.
- 2) Care must be taken not over burden the BFM staff with additional workloads in teaching and research.
- 3) We see the need to raise awareness and commitment for the programme from stakeholders that goes beyond letters of support and results in stable financing, perhaps by the Ministry of Education.
- 4) There is a need to take great care in the design of the new spaces that will accommodate the programme activities.
- 5) The current BFM facilities would seem to be able to support the programme if the main focus is on film. However, there is a need for further expansion *if the programme decides to focus on more experimental (new) digital media*. For instance, the panel was not shown a laboratory space dedicated to working with electronic components such as Arduino or Raspberry microprocessor boards. These items are a staple in the current interactive installation technical environment. Very little was mentioned about the whole area of sound design, except with regards to sound editing for film. In the area of virtual reality and augmented reality, the panel was only shown the studio of one researcher.