

INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF STUDY PROGRAMME GROUPS**ASSESSMENT REPORT****HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTION: Estonian Academy of Arts/ Eesti Kunstiakadeemia**

STUDY PROGRAMME GROUP	Architecture and Building
ACADEMIC CYCLE	Doctoral degree studies (PhD)

STUDY PROGRAMMES	Architecture and Urban Planning
-------------------------	---------------------------------

COMPOSITION OF ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE:

Philippe Bouillard (Chair), Professor, Université Libre de Bruxelles (Belgium)

Toni Kotnik, Professor of Design of Structures, Aalto University (Finland)

Yoko Alender, Architect, member of the Estonian Parliament (Estonia)

Katre Koppel, PhD student, University of Tartu (Estonia)

PERIOD OF EVALUATION: from January to March 2018**DATE ASSESSMENT REPORT SENT TO INSTITUTION UNDER EVALUATION: 12.03.2018****DATE COMMENTS RECEIVED FROM INSTITUTION UNDER EVALUATION: 17.03.2018**

ASSESSMENT BY ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE: THE QUALITY OF INSTRUCTION: - PARTIALLY CONFORMS TO A REQUIRED STANDARD**General Comments:**

The EAA has (since the previous assessment) improved both the pool and scope of the teaching staff. The planned doctoral programme is based on available high-level capacity in-house staff (2/3) and an additional skilled pool of external supervisors (1/3). The teaching staff competencies are relevant to the planned three strands of the programme and the amount of staff is sufficient for the planned size of the doctoral programme. Overall, the programme is well-structured and organised according to international standards and labour market needs.

The financial situation of the EAA is relatively good in the context of Baltic states. Currently the EAA has 8 positions for PhD students every year, two of them are planned for PhD students of architecture. Half of the positions are state funded, half financed by the EAA. During the period of 2014–2017 the Faculty has been involved in 8 research and development projects, representing a total of around 521.000 Euros. Due to the prolonged construction works of the new EAA building, the Faculty of Architecture has faced various logistic and technical problems. Regardless tight conditions, the students and staff have access to studio rooms, lecture halls, laboratories, workshops. The students use their own personal computers for the studies, as the department has acquired a sufficient number of software licences for the students to use in their own computers. For more extensive computing, they have access to the Sun workstations and the computers at the department. The software available for the studies is relevant and sufficient. The library of EAA bears the status of scientific library. The Department of Architecture is updating the library constantly; this is done in accordance with students' needs.

This report contains further recommendations for improvement:

1. doctoral students should increasingly visit international conferences and aim for publications in peer-reviewed journals.
2. the relationship with stakeholders is good but requires a more formal framework for continues exchange and the possibility to widen the corresponding pool.
3. better communicate the required admission profile to foster international attractiveness.
4. clearly articulate in-house/external staff workload/participation in supervising process;
5. additional possibilities (funding) for in-house teaching staff mobility and personal development.
6. since the financing principles are changing and the current funding is running out, the staff members definitely need to apply for PUT and other research grants even more actively they have done so far.
7. to guarantee constant financial income, the EAA needs to find more investments from the private sector. It is crucial to build up the tradition of collaboration between the EAA and private enterprises (and other stakeholders like city municipalities).
8. to attract more investments generally, the EAA should intensively and publicly promote successful cooperation projects (for example "Unfinished City") in different academic and non-academic settings, including international ones.

9. the EAA should be the leading party to evoke discussions with the (prospective) stakeholders, and should establish the image of innovator and initiator who has high level of competency in the fields of architecture and urban planning.

As a conclusion, the Assessment Committee agrees unanimously that the programme partially conforms to the required standard as some aspects can obviously not be currently assessed.

ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE CONSISTING OF THE FOLLOWING MEMBERS:

Philippe Bouillard (Chair), Professor, Université Libre de Bruxelles (Belgium)
Toni Kotnik, Professor of Design of Structures, Aalto University (Finland)
Yoko Alender, Architect, member of the Estonian Parliament (Estonia)
Katre Koppel, PhD student, University of Tartu (Estonia)

APPROVED THE ASSESSMENT, 4 VOTES IN FAVOUR AND 0 VOTES AGAINST

ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE CHAIR

Philippe Bouillard

Date 20/3/2018

Signature



REQUIREMENTS FOR QUALITY OF INSTRUCTION

1. Study Programme and Organisation of Studies

REQUIREMENTS	EVIDENCE GATHERED	COMMENTS
The study programme is based on the needs of the labour market and target groups, and contributes to fulfilling the mission of the educational institution and achieving its objectives.	Study programme; EAA development plan; additional information obtained during the site visit	Discussions with the stakeholders showed that the programme is very much in line with the needs of the labour market and target groups; it was even made clear that the university should not only target current market but be more future-oriented and aim for innovation that is actively shape a new labour market.
Employers and other stakeholders of the study programme group are involved in the study programme development.	Study programme; additional information obtained during the site visit	Stakeholders are not much involved in the development of the programme but it is also not their primary target; in discussion they showed more interest in continuous discourse and exchange; the programme should this take more into consideration in the organisation of events like open lecture series, exhibitions and other public events; the development of a platform of exchange should be the aim also to attract new companies and municipalities. Involvement of the stakeholders should be further formalised.
The title of the study programme is consistent with its content.	Study programme	The programme structure, particularly the research by design strand, and the possible research topics both in architecture and urban planning make the title of the study programme perfectly consistent.

<p>The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme are formulated in such a way that they provide a basis for evaluating the knowledge and skills of graduates of that study programme.</p>	<p>Study programme; the Standard of Higher Education</p>	<p>The objectives and learning outcomes are formulated and should provide a good basis for assessment. Final validation is however not possible yet due to lack of completed doctoral theses.</p>
<p>The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme are equal and comparable to the learning outcomes of the academic cycles of higher education as described in Annex 1 to the Standard of Higher Education.</p>	<p>Study programme; Annex 1 to the Standard of Higher Education; the analysis by the educational institution on the compatibility of learning outcomes with the Standard of Higher Education</p>	<p>The learning outcomes of this PhD programme are in conformity with the general requirements required in the 8th level of the qualification framework.</p>
<p>Forms of study, and student workload for independent work, practical training and, in the case of doctoral studies, for implementation of professional activities, support the achievement of objectives of the study programme.</p>	<p>Study programme; additional information obtained during the site visit</p>	<p>The curriculum follows in its basic setup international standards. On-site visit and discussion with doctoral students confirmed a well-balanced structure. The academic depth and rigour of the research programme especially with respect to the practice-based research programme could not be evaluated due to lack of completed theses. The implementation of an external set of supervisors in addition to the existing staff is a move in the right direction. In addition, the use of external evaluation of completed theses is strongly recommended in order to guarantee the quality and balance between practice and theoretical investigation. To increase the number of publications, it is recommended that doctoral students increasingly visit international conferences and aim for publications in peer-reviewed journals.</p>

<p>The study programme meets the requirements and trends in international legislation that regulates the professional field and, if a professional standard exists, takes into consideration the acquisition and implementation of the knowledge and skills described therein.</p>	<p>International legislation regulating the corresponding professional field;</p>	<p>Not applicable.</p>
<p>The organisation of studies is regulated and takes into consideration the specifics of the study programme group; recognition of prior learning and work experiences is regulated as well.</p>	<p>Additional information obtained during the site visit</p>	<p>At the moment most doctoral students are recruited out of the existing local Master Programmes; the sufficient regulation and recognition of prior learning and work experience, therefore, cannot be judged fully. In terms of admission requirements, the student profile has been clearly and relevantly stated for both creative practice research (master degree, 5 years of practice, strong evidence of completed works) and research by design (master degree, CV, portfolio and research proposal aligned with the possible topics). Based on the discussion with staff, faculty and doctoral students, however, it seems not fully clear that everyone is aware of these requirements which should be better communicated to foster attractiveness.</p>
<p>Students are provided with counselling (study, career, and psychological counselling).</p>	<p>Additional information obtained during the site visit</p>	<p>The PhD students are supported by the doctoral school coordinator, the Faculty study coordinator, research and development coordinator, the Head and assistant of 3D Lab; and also by the research and development department (TAO) consulting the students on wide spectrum of matters like entrepreneurship, grants, international projects etc. Across the EAA students can receive academic, psychological and career counselling, information about studying abroad is also provided as well as IT support. Site-visit and discussions further demonstrate an open atmosphere and flat hierarchies</p>

		within the department that support an informal counselling.
--	--	-------------------------------------------------------------

OVERALL ASSESSMENT BY ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME AND THE ORGANISATION OF STUDIES (AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT):

Overall, the programme is well-structured and organised according to international standards and labour market needs. With the adding of a number of external supervisors the university has reacted to some of the most urgent critic from the previous evaluation and extended the area of expertise of the programme.

Recommendations for further improvement are

1. doctoral students should increasingly visit international conferences and aim for publications in peer-reviewed journals.
2. the relationship with stakeholders is good but requires a more formal framework for continues exchange and the possibility to widen the corresponding pool.
3. better communicate the required admission profile to foster international attractiveness.

2. Teaching Staff

REQUIREMENTS	EVIDENCE GATHERED	COMMENTS
Qualifications of the teaching and research staffs involved meet the requirements established in legislation as well as those arising from the specifics of a study programme group and the academic cycle of higher education. The educational institution has entered into binding contracts with its teaching staff to conduct studies.	“EAA supervisors and key professors”; list of publications; the Estonian Research Information System ETIS https://www.etis.ee/Portal/Persons/Index?lang=ENG	84% of the potential teaching staff of doctoral studies have a PhD and are active in artistic and academic fields at an international level. 21/32 of the Special and General studies tutors/professors and potential supervisors are contracted to the EAA, 11 are visiting from world class universities/research centres, letters of commitment being provided by 5/11 of them.

<p>The level and extent of research and development by the teaching and research staff involved are adequate to teach in the corresponding academic cycle of higher education and to supervise student research.</p>	<p>Information about research and development activities by the teaching staff, ETIS, additional information provided by the educational institution</p>	<p>According to the EAA, they have worked on the shortcomings from previous assessments, this is also demonstrated in the materials presented and in the interviews.</p> <p>The EAA has outlined the doctoral study programme based on the available high-level capacity in-house (architecture and design, art history, conservation etc.) and broadened the curriculum through cooperation with partner universities and staff of high quality (urban studies, architectural design, practice-based research etc.).</p> <p>The Faculty of Architecture involves a number of qualified potential PhD supervisors. Namely Puusepp, Tammiss, Krivy, Ojari, Melioranski, Alver,. The academic staff of Faculty of Architecture is complemented with the potential co-supervisors and teachers from other faculties of EAA. These include for example: Kalm, Kodres, Kurg, Randla, Kermik, Hiiop, Lankots, Laanemets, Ojavee, Sinijärv. The curriculum is broadened through cooperation with partner universities and of high quality staff (urban studies, architectural design, practice-based research etc.). Agreements to contribute to the curriculum are signed with Lehtovuori (Tampere University of Technology), Blythe (Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University), Havik (TU Delft), Carpo The Bartlett School of Architecture, University College London;, Hensel (AHO Oslo School of Architecture and Design), Sevtsuk and Song (both from</p>

		<p>Harvard University).</p> <p>The teaching and research staff are highly valued practitioners in their respective fields adequate to the strands pursued by the EAA doctoral study programme, the majority of staff demonstrate significant international activity, high level competence and good public visibility.</p>
<p>The teaching staff involved have an adequate teaching competency.</p>	<p>Additional information obtained during the site visit</p>	<p>The CVs of the teaching and research staff show good experience of teaching and developing higher education in their respective fields of architecture both in Estonia and abroad. Potential supervisors of PhD candidates demonstrate a record of teaching at the highest academic level.</p> <p>Some of the in-house supervisors have short term experience of teaching since completing their own PhDs but this is acceptable in this period of developing the only PhD programme in Architecture and Urban Planning in the country.</p>
<p>The number of members of ordinary teaching and research staff involved – based on their responsibilities, workload and the number of supervised students – is adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme in a given study programme group.</p>	<p>Information about qualifications as well as research and development activities of the teaching staff involved</p>	<p>Compared to the previous assessment in 2017 the EAA has addressed the shortcomings and worked on acquiring sufficient amount and competence of staff.</p> <p>The recruitment of new Faculty members (Puusepp, Ojari), inclusion of new international tutors (Sevtsuk, Song, Buoli, Havik, Hensel, Blythe) shows that the EAA is since the last evaluation addressing the need for more societal and future-oriented context in research and design, dealing with urban issues in their broadest sense.</p>

		<p>21 inhouse teaching staff are contracted to the school and an additional 11 international potential supervisors (incl 2 already contracted international supervisors) are planned to tutor and supervise courses. Altogether 36 professors are listed for general, special and elective subjects.</p> <p>Additional research staff and supervisors have completed their PhDs (Indrek Rünkla 2017, Tüüne-Kristin Vaikla 2017) and continue with research at EAA (Rünkla, Vaikla, Krivy, Puusepp, Melioranski, Ojavee, Kurg, Lankots, Laanemets, Sinijärv, Kodres, Hansar, Randla, Hiiop) being prepared to take in students.</p> <p>EAA staff from Art History and Heritage and Conservation Departments have been added to the programme for the text based and research by design strands. They have high academic credentials and their inclusion in the programme is in accordance with the EAAs Architecture Departments recent added specialisation on MA level in Landscape and Heritage, the doctoral studies and continued research is a good way to deepen the knowledge in these fields.</p> <p>The international potential supervisors have an ongoing cooperation with the school, they visit the students monthly and understand their role as (co)supervisor.</p> <p>The planned amount of PhD candidates and the amount of research staff and tutors seems appropriate. At the visit the different actors show an understanding of their respective workloads and responsibilities.</p>
--	--	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

<p>The teaching staff involved are aware of the objectives of the study programme and their roles in achieving them.</p>	<p>Additional information obtained during the site visit</p>	<p>The teaching staff demonstrate a good understanding of the aims of the programme, many of them have been involved in developing the programme. Both students and supervisors seem to prefer a “tailored” way of working between student/teacher. Both demonstrate an understanding of the planned joint supervision system, with one in-house and an additional international one. The planned methodology of the programme does give an advantage to very well-organised, self-motivated and pursuant students, which is appropriate for such high-level architecture and design studies.</p> <p>As a recommendation some formalised overview of the possible outlines of the roles and responsibilities and a more detailed work-plan of inhouse/international teaching staff might be helpful for future students and staff.</p>
<p>The ordinary teaching and research staff of the educational institution have undergone the required evaluation. The educational institution provides its teaching staff with opportunities for their professional and individual development.</p>	<p>Additional information obtained during the site visit</p>	<p>The EAA has an internal evaluation system which is outlined based on national laws and requirements. There is a description of the evaluation system available on the EAA official webpage (staff section):</p> <p>https://www.artun.ee/personalitood-reguleerivad-oigusaktid/</p> <p>https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B1IHW3YuvBugWFZkTGtnbkRQa2s/view</p> <p>According to information obtained during the visit all the in-house teaching staff planned for the doctoral programme have undergone the required evaluation.</p>

<p>The teaching staff and supervisors of study programmes of doctoral studies regularly further their skills at foreign institutions of higher education or other research institutions, participate in international research projects, and present papers at high-level conferences.</p>	<p>The Estonian Education Information System ETIS; information about research and development activities by the teaching staff provided by the educational institution; additional information received during the site visit</p>	<p>Teaching staff mobility is sufficient. The mobility of the in-house staff is mainly connected with the partnering universities and most visits are short-term.</p> <p>As a recommendation, the EAA should try to apply for more governmental support and/or financing by private sector to allow for the inhouse teaching staff to regularly and for longer periods further their skills at other institutions to keep up the highest level of competence also thereby attracting international talent to the school and the country.</p>
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

<p>OVERALL ASSESSMENT BY ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE OF THE TEACHING STAFF (AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT):</p>
<p>The EAA has (since the previous assessment) improved both the pool and scope of the teaching staff. The planned doctoral programme is based on available high-level capacity in-house staff (2/3) and an additional skilled pool of external supervisors (1/3). The teaching staff competencies are relevant to the planned three strands of the programme and the amount of staff is sufficient for the planned size of the doctoral programme.</p> <p>Recommendations for further improvement are</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. clearly articulate in-house/external staff workload/participation in supervising process; 2. additional possibilities (funding) for in-house teaching staff mobility and personal development.

3. Resources

REQUIREMENTS	EVIDENCE GATHERED	COMMENTS
--------------	-------------------	----------

<p>The educational institution ensures that financial resources necessary for conducting studies are available and prepares a strategy for acquiring them (prepares risk analyses and financial forecasts that include a calculation of the cost of a student place, takes into account the risks arising from the operational environment, and uses other appropriate measures to ensure the resources).</p>	<p>Tangible resources and financial information of the educational institution, and the information about the infrastructure of the study programme group</p>	<p>Although, incomparable with Scandinavian universities, the financial situation of the EAA is relatively good in the context of Baltic states. Currently the EAA has 8 positions for PhD students every year, two of them for PhD students of architecture. Half of the positions are state funded, half financed by the EAA.</p> <p>To increase their budget the Faculty of Architecture is conducting applied research projects with private companies, Tallinn city municipality and ministries. Collaboration between universities and private enterprises is generally a growing trend in Estonia. Enterprises have become more open towards knowledge and skills the universities can provide – this was also confirmed by stakeholders at the site visit. The involvement of companies is financially a prospective move by the EAA. Currently, the Faculty and EAA are developing strategy to attract more international private companies.</p> <p>In addition, the EAA is one of the partners of the Graduate School of Culture Studies and Arts, the project supported by the EU Structural Funds which will run till 2020. The aim of the GSCSA is to advance the academic level of the PhD programmes of cultural studies and arts in Estonia.</p> <p>The funding from the establishment of ADAPT-r (Architecture, Design and Art Practice Training-Research) network supported by the EU 7th Framework Programme ended in 2016. The year 2017 has proven that the doctoral school of Architecture and Urban Design is able to sustainably continue its activities. Students emphasise that taking part in the network meetings has</p>
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

		had immense positive effect on their research.
The educational institution has the sources for financing research and development related to doctoral studies.	Information about the sources for financing research and development (research projects and their costs, research agreements and their monetary funding, etc.) in ETIS	<p>During the period of 2014–2017 the Faculty has been involved in 8 research and development projects, representing a total of around 521.000 Euros.</p> <p>Some of the staff involved with the Faculty is currently working on one IUT and one PUT projects, both in the area of Art History, and other applied projects financed by different stakeholders.</p> <p>The students' mobility and participation at conferences are either financed by Dora and other EU programmes that are available for PhD students in Estonia, GSCSA, Estonian Cultural Endowment, the Faculty of Architecture or the Estonian Association of Architects.</p> <p>Financial situation for PhD students generally has improved in Estonia as the monthly scholarship has been increased up to 660 Euros from 2018.</p> <p>In cooperation with international organisations and networks, the EAA is organising series of conferences between 2018 and 2021. The expenses are partly covered by the funding of the Creative Cluster (Loovkärg) project of the EAA, the doctoral school and research projects of EAA and the Faculty. The Faculty emphasises that the aim is to link the doctoral research topics with the Faculty's research projects to ensure additional funding for the doctoral students. Interviews with potential students also reflect students' motivation and</p>

		<p>willingness to be more engaged with Faculty’s research projects. At the moment two PhD students of the previous doctoral programme of Architecture and Urban Design are employed as junior researchers by the Faculty. Providing positions for junior researchers is an important mechanism to keep promising young scholars engaged with the EAA.</p> <p>However, since the financing principles are changing (there will not be any IUT grants anymore) and the current funding is running out, the staff members definitely need to apply for PUT and other research grants even more actively they have done so far. Although, wages at the EAA have increased in 2016 and 2017, they are still lower than salaries at the other Estonian universities. To guarantee constant financial income, the EAA needs to find more investments from the private sector.</p> <p>It is crucial to build up the tradition of collaboration between the EAA and private enterprises (and other stakeholders like city municipalities). To attract more investments generally, the EAA should intensively and publicly promote successful cooperation projects (for example “Unfinished City”) in different academic and non-academic settings, including international ones. The EAA should be the leading party to evoke discussions with the (prospective) stakeholders, and should establish the image of innovator and initiator who has high level of competency.</p>
--	--	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

<p>There are facilities (lecture halls, laboratories, seminar rooms, rooms for students' independent work) necessary for educational activities, as well as for research and development related to doctoral studies, which are furnished and equipped adequately and are up to date to achieve the objectives of study programmes; or there are specific existing financial decisions/ projects to finance the additional needs.</p>	<p>Tangible resources and financial information of the educational institution, and the information about the infrastructure of the study programme group</p>	<p>Due to the prolonged construction works of the new EAA building, the Faculty of Architecture has faced various logistic and technical problems. Regardless of the tight conditions, the students and staff have access to studio rooms, lecture halls, laboratories, workshops (see also https://www.artun.ee/oppimine/tookojad/), including the equipment in these rooms.</p> <p>Since the EAA is in the middle of transitional period (the EAA is expecting to move to the new fully equipped and modern house in autumn 2018), the Faculty has decided to acquire only the most essential means for conducting the instruction (wood workshop, software licences, laser cutting machine, 3D printers). They cooperate with the workshops and labs of the nearby universities. Cooperation agreements have been signed with local and international partners and students of EAA are allowed to visit the labs and workshops of the partners.</p>
<p>Means of information technology and communications between national and international communication networks – needed for educational activities as well as for research and development related to doctoral studies – are available.</p>	<p>Tangible resources and financial information of the educational institution, and the information about the infrastructure of the study programme group</p>	<p>The students use their own personal computers for the studies, as the department has acquired a sufficient number of software licences for the students to use in their own computers. For more extensive computing, they have access to the Sun workstations and the computers at the department. The software available for the studies is relevant and sufficient.</p> <p>The 3D Lab is equipped with various modern prototyping software and equipment such as laser cutting machine, 3D printers, robot(s). It also includes the experimental material and construction analyses and simulations (e.g. Karamba, Microsoft Research and other software). In summer 2017 the robotic 3D printing of clay</p>

		<p>was launched.</p> <p>ARV (Centre for Computational Spatial Analysis and Visualisation) for the collection of various large-scale parameters (including 3D digitalisation, computational photogrammetry, thermal imaging) and creation of simulation models (including GIS). It includes AR/VR technologies, generative urban design and pedestrian movement simulations.</p> <p>The 3D Lab and equipment at the Faculty is being upgraded regularly. In addition to EAA's own funding important contributors are private companies/donators demonstrating the EAA's connections with private sector.</p> <p>The Faculty of Architecture has also an agreement with the Estonian Land Board and Tallinn City Government providing access to the geoinformation of the given institutions covering the whole Estonian territory.</p> <p>Internet provided everywhere. The Department of Architecture has its own printing centre through Cloud Print service and A1 format plotter HP DesignJet 500 for printing drawings.</p>
<p>The educational institution ensures that up-to-date information sources (including data bases) needed for teaching, learning and research in the study programme group are available.</p>	<p>Information about existing information sources (including data bases) and those to be acquired</p>	<p>The main library of EAA is located at 7 Estonia Avenue with the complementary library of the Faculty of Architecture at 20 Pikk Street.</p> <p>The library of EAA bears the status of a scientific library. The Department of Architecture is updating the library</p>

		<p>constantly; this is done in accordance with students' needs.</p> <p>The e-library environment provides access to the following databases with restricted access: EBSCO (including Academic Search Complete, MasterFILE Premier, Art & Architecture Complete), Grove Art Online, JSTOR Arts and Sciences, ISI Web of Science, TEA Encyclopaedia. It also provides free access to the Estonian article database, DOAJ Directory of Open Access Journals, European, World Digital Library, Ubuweb and New Left Review. It is common to search books in ESTER database covering all Estonian libraries.</p>
<p>Financial indicators regarding economic sustainability of the educational institution are available to the general public. Annual reports of the educational institution or its organising body are audited, unless otherwise established by law. This requirement does not apply to new educational institutions.</p>	<p>The annual report</p>	<p>Nine annual reports (2008–2016) are provided on EAA's webpage as well as five annual budgets (2013–2017) of the EAA.</p>

OVERALL ASSESSMENT BY ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE OF RESOURCES (AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT):

The financial situation of the EAA is relatively good in the context of Baltic states. Currently the EAA has 8 positions for PhD students every year, two of them for PhD students of architecture. Half of the positions are state funded, half financed by the EAA. During the period of 2014–2017 the Faculty has been involved in 8 research and development projects. Some of the staff involved with the Faculty is

currently working on IUT and PUT projects, and other applied projects financed by different stakeholders. Due to the prolonged construction works of the new EAA building, the Faculty of Architecture has faced various logistic and technical problems. Regardless tight conditions, the students and staff have access to studio rooms, lecture halls, laboratories, workshops. The students use their own personal computers for the studies, as the department has acquired a sufficient number of software licences for the students to use in their own computers. The software available for the studies are relevant and sufficient. The library of EAA bears the status of scientific library. The Department of Architecture is updating the library constantly; this is done in accordance with students' needs.

Recommendations for further improvement are

1. Since the financing principles are changing and the current funding is running out, the staff members definitely need to apply for PUT and other research grants even more actively they have done so far.
2. To guarantee constant financial income, the EAA needs to find more investments from the private sector. It is crucial to build up the tradition of collaboration between the EAA and private enterprises (and other stakeholders like city municipalities).
3. To attract more investments generally, the EAA should intensively and publicly promote successful cooperation projects (for example "Unfinished City") in different academic and non-academic settings, including international ones.
4. The EAA should be the leading party to evoke discussions with the (prospective) stakeholders, and should establish the image of innovator and initiator who has high level of competency in the fields of architecture and urban planning.