



# REPORT

Instrumental Performance

Vocal Art

Conducting

Composition

Traditional Music Art

Art Management

Musicology

**Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory**

**Almaty, Kazakhstan**

**17-19 May 2023**

## Content

List of abbreviations .....	4
Introduction .....	5
Key data on Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory.....	6
A note on the context and scope of the review report .....	7
1. Programme’s goals and context.....	9
2. Educational processes .....	13
2.1 The curriculum and its methods of delivery.....	13
2.2 International perspectives .....	18
2.3 Assessment.....	23
3. Student profiles .....	26
3.1 Admission/Entrance qualifications .....	26
3.2 Student progression, achievement and employability.....	28
4. Teaching staff.....	31
4.1 Staff qualifications and professional activity .....	31
4.2 Size and composition of the teaching staff body .....	33
5. Facilities, resources and support.....	36
5.1 Facilities .....	36
5.2 Financial resources.....	38
5.3 Support staff .....	39
6. Communication, organisation and decision-making.....	41
6.1 Internal communication process.....	41
6.2 Organisational structure and decision-making processes.....	43
7. Internal quality culture .....	46
8. Public interaction .....	49
8.1 Cultural, artistic and educational contexts.....	49
8.2 Interaction with the artistic professions .....	51
8.3 Information provided to the public .....	53
Summary of the compliance with the Standards and recommendations.....	56
Conclusion and perspectives .....	60
Annex 1. Site-visit schedule.....	63
Annex 2. List of documents provided to the review team.....	76
<i>Annexes and supporting documents in English (EN)</i> .....	76
<i>Annexes and supporting documents in Kazakh (KZ)</i> .....	77
<i>Annexes and supporting documents in Russian (RU)</i> .....	78

Annex 3. Definitions of compliance levels..... 80

## List of abbreviations

AEC: Association Européenne des Conservatoires, Écoles de Musique et Musikhochschulen

ECTS: European Credit Transfer System

IAAR: Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating

IARA: International Accreditation and Ranking Agency

KNC: Kazakh National Conservatory named after 'Kurmangazy'

Republican Educational and Methodological Council (REMC),

SEADOM: Southeast Asian Directors of Music



## Introduction

Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory (KNC) was established in 1944 and has the status of a national university. All programmes offered today, except the Art Management programme, were part of the programme portfolio from the start. The Art Management programme was established in 1991 and received its current name in 2007 (*SER*, p. 8). In 2009 KNC joined the Bologna system and offers 4-year bachelor programmes, 2-year master programmes and 3-year doctoral programmes since then (*SER*, p. 8). Only the bachelor programmes are the focus of this accreditation review.

For many years, KNC was the only higher music education institution in Kazakhstan. Consequently, a large proportion of professionals active in the Kazakh music industry and music education institutions are KNC graduates (*SER*, p. 4). KNC was founded on the traditions of Tchaikovsky Moscow State University because many of the first generations of teachers at KNC were members of the Russian musical elite who fled Russia during the Second World War (*SER*, p. 8). In later years KNC has been influenced by the Bologna process and a competency-based educational system represented by the AEC Learning Outcomes, which KNC has implemented. KNC has now established its educational model blending the European and Russian educational traditions with the Kazakh national system of training musicians (*SER*, p. 5). KNC had consistently been at the top of the rankings of art universities, as well as in general university rankings in Kazakhstan (*SER*, p. 5). In 2019 it passed international accreditation by the International Independents Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), valid until 2026, and also received a “Gold Star of Quality” in the IAAR Eurasian Ranking 2022 among the art universities (*SER*, p. 6).

Music education in the Republic of Kazakhstan is built on the Soviet model of primary music education, secondary specialised music education and higher, professional music education. Admission to higher music education is contingent on applicants having completed primary and secondary music education. The only exception is applicants to the Art Management programme, who can apply with a diploma from a music school (*SER*, p. 8).

The national creative universities, including KNC, are under the Ministry of Culture and Sports, which also provides funding. The educational processes, however, are governed by rather detailed regulations from the Ministry of Science and Higher Education, which are identical for all higher education institutions. Consequently, some of the regulations are experienced as less relevant for a creative university such as KNC. There is an ongoing dialogue with both ministries to resolve these issues (*SER*, p. 9).



## Key data on Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory

<b>Name of the institution</b>	Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory
<b>Legal status</b>	National University
<b>Date of creation</b>	May 24, 1944
<b>Website address</b>	<a href="http://www.conservatoire.edu.kz">www.conservatoire.edu.kz</a>
<b>Departments</b>	String instruments, wind and percussion instruments, special piano, compulsory piano, ensemble art, conducting, vocal art, music education and psychology, dombyra, oobyz and button accordion, traditional singing, social and humanitarian disciplines, musicology and composition, art management.
<b>List of reviewed programmes</b>	Instrumental Performance, Conducting, Vocal Art, Musicology, Composition, Art Management, Traditional Musical Art
<b>Number of students enrolled in the programmes reviewed</b>	1052 (2022)
<b>Number of teachers serving the programmes reviewed [permanent and part-time staff]</b>	353 (year 2022), 253 full time, 100 part time

## A note on the context and scope of the review report

Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory (KNC) has commissioned MusiQuE to organise an accreditation procedure for seven programmes at bachelor level.

The object of the review procedure is the accreditation of seven programmes, namely: Vocal Art, Instrumental Performance, Conducting, Composition, Traditional Musical Art, Musicology and Art Management, as well as supporting its further enhancement. The review report will cover these seven programmes as a whole, highlighting the programmes' strong points and including specific recommendations for each of the programmes, when appropriate, for their further enhancement.

The MusiQuE review team will assess the above-mentioned programmes' compliance with the *MusiQuE Standards for Programme Review* in the report. The MusiQuE Board will take a decision on the accreditation of the programmes based on the proposal for accreditation as expressed by the review team in the report. The decision on the accreditation and the report will be made publicly available on the MusiQuE website.

The procedure for the review of the seven bachelor programmes followed a four-stage process:

- Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory prepared a Self-evaluation report (*SER*) and supporting documents, based on the *MusiQuE Standards for Programme Review*.
- An international review team composed by MusiQuE studied the SER and documentation provided in preparation for the site-visit.
- A site-visit was carried out on 16-19 May 2023. The review team met the KNC leadership, representatives of teachers, students and support staff, alumni and employers (see the programme in *Annex 1* to this report). The review team also conducted a guided tour of the buildings, visited exams, the library, a masterclass, and three concerts. The review team used the *MusiQuE Standards for Programme Review* as the basis of its investigations.
- The review team produced the review report that follows, structured along the *Standards* mentioned above.

The review team consisted of:

Henk van der Meulen (chair), Royal Conservatoire The Hague



Hannu Apajalahti (peer), Sibelius Academy, University of the Arts, Helsinki

Daulet Tapenov (peer), Kazakh National University of Arts

Richard Wigley (peer), Ulster Orchestra/BBC Philharmonic/Dunhard Centre, Edinburgh

Bekzada Samigolla, (student peer), Kazakh National University of Arts

Ingrid Maria Hanken (peer and secretary), Norwegian Academy of Music

The review team would like to express its sincere gratitude to the staff of Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory for the production and timely delivery of the self-evaluation report and all supporting documents, and for the excellent organisation of the site-visit. The review team had the opportunity to meet various external and internal stakeholders, all of whom were open and collegial. The review team hopes that the present report will be helpful for the future development of KNC and that the content of the report will be made available to those who participated in the review process.





## 1. Programme's goals and context

**Standard 1. The programme goals are clearly stated and reflect the institutional mission.**

The mission, vision and aims of KNC are stated in “Program (strategy) for the development of the Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory for 2019-2025” (*Annex 1.1 EN*). The mission is “Training highly professional and competitive specialists in the field of professional music education and musical art, capable to realise their creative potential both domestically and internationally” (*Annex 1.1 EN*). The vision is expressed as follows: “The Conservatory in 2025 is a modern university of professional music education, science and enlightenment, performing the functions of a key partner of cultural and educational organisations in professional training” (*Annex 1.1 EN*).

The programme portfolio of KNC reflects the need for professional specialists in areas of cultural and educational importance: Instrumental and Vocal Music Performance (traditional and classical), Composition, Conducting, Musicology, Music Education and Art Management. Each programme has several specialisations. The Instrumental Performance programme, for example, offers specialisation in many different instruments, and the Conducting programme offers specialisation in orchestra conducting and choir conducting. In addition, several of the programmes offer students the possibility to choose additional minors such as conductor of a folk orchestra in the Traditional Musical Art programme or music criticism and journalism in the Musicology programme (*SER*, p. 10-12). The programme Music Education, which provides training for teaching music as a subject in schools, is being discontinued at KNC due to a decision by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education that such programmes will only be offered in specialised pedagogical universities (*meeting with Heads of Department*). The need for new programmes or specialisations was also discussed during meetings and the following suggestions were offered: Music theatre, Classical guitar, Three string dombyra (*meeting with Vice-Rectors*), and Ballet piano accompaniment (*meeting with alumni and employers*).

The goals of the programmes are focused on training highly qualified professional music specialists in relevant areas, thus reflecting the mission of KNC (*SER*, p. 10). One example is the goal for the Traditional Musical Art programme: “...to train professional specialists in the field of traditional musical art, to educate and develop the creative potential of students, to form competitiveness that meets national and international standards” (*Annex 1.22 EN*). Another example from the Composition programme: “... to train a highly qualified composer who works on the creation, arrangement, arrangement of musical works, pedagogical work

at a high professional level, possessing the primary skills of research, engaged in cultural and educational activities” (*Annex 1.24 EN*).

KNC was for many years the only provider of higher music education in Kazakhstan. In 1998 the National University of Arts was opened in Astana, offering similar undergraduate programmes as KNC. This has to some extent resulted in a regional division of applicants, where KNC now mainly recruits from the southern, southeastern, western and southwestern regions of the country (*SER*, p. 10). According to the *SER* (*SER*, p. 10), the existence of two similar institutions provides both opportunities for cooperation and healthy competition. A distinguishing characteristic of the KNC programmes is the opportunity to choose a minor (*SER*, p. 11). Art Management is offered as a bachelor programme in three other creative universities in Kazakhstan. The practice-oriented and multidisciplinary profile is what distinguishes the programme at KNC from the others (*SER*, p. 10). There are several internship agreements offering students professional practice (*Annex 1.25 EN*). Employers met by the review team did not seem fully aware of the potential that this programme represents in providing both managers and leaders for the industry. The professional practice orientation of other study programmes is currently being explored through "dual education" agreements between KNC and other institutions or organisations, such as an opera house, a music college or a concert organisation to provide professional training in collaboration between KNC and the other institution or organisation. So far, an agreement is made with the National Theatre “Astana Opera” for vocal students (*SER*, p. 10).

There are specific standards within the quality assurance system for monitoring and developing the quality of the programmes. This includes systematic assessments of the quality by external stakeholders, evaluation of how students perform in relation to learning outcomes, arranging feedback seminars and round table discussions with different stakeholders and more (*Link*: “Internal Quality Assurance Policy” *SER*, p. 59). Student surveys also play an important role in adjusting the programmes according to the needs of students (*meeting with Deans*). There are specific change sheets attached to each programme description where changes to the programme can be traced (*SER*, p. 15).

The admission capacity is largely determined by regulations issued by the Ministry of Education and Sports. These define the number of students under state order, who will then receive a scholarship. Applicants to the programmes Instrumental Performance, Traditional Musical Art and Vocal Art all have to compete in the same contest, "Performing Arts" to be accepted under state order. With a large number of qualified applicants to Traditional Musical Art and Vocal Art, it is difficult for classical instrument performers to

qualify for studying under state order (*SER*, p. 14). This issue is now in the process of being solved in cooperation with the Ministry of Culture and Sports (*SER*, pp.14-15).

Information is collected in several areas to support the development of the programmes. This includes analysis of the predicted number of applicants and the labour market, proposals by employers, annual plans and reports from departments, educational achievements and more (*SER*, p. 16).

Each programme is developed, planned and approved by the Academic Committee responsible for the programme. Students, teachers and employers are involved as members of the Academic Committees. The programme is then officially approved and legally recognised by the Academic Council. Furthermore, all programmes have to go through an official review by independent experts of the Center for the Bologna Process and Academic Mobility under the Ministry of Science and Higher Education (*SER*, p. 15).

Equal opportunities are not specifically mentioned in the mission and vision of the institution or the programmes. According to the *SER* (*SER*, p. 16), inclusiveness regardless of gender, ethnicity, religion etc. is assumed "a priori" for admission and study. The Student Relations Department keeps a record of students in need of financial support and issues scholarships etc. (*SER*, p. 16).

The goals of the programmes are clearly formulated and aligned with the mission of KNC. The rationale behind the programme goals is to meet the needs of specialised professionals in Kazakh society. The same rationale lies behind the choice of which programmes to offer, reflecting the different specialities needed in society. The high employment rate indicates that the choice of programmes and their goals are relevant. The programmes are well connected to the society they serve. They are being updated and developed as needed, involving stakeholders in these processes and establishing partnerships with institutions and organisations. The review team finds this involvement in society and working life exceptional. In order for the programmes to stay relevant, the review team suggests that contemporary music should be better represented in the programmes.

### **Compliance with Standard 1**

On the basis of the information in the *SER*, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 1 as follows:

<b>Programmes</b>	<b>Compliance level</b>
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

## 2. Educational processes

### 2.1 The curriculum and its methods of delivery

**Standard 2.1. The goals of the programme are achieved through the content and structure of the curriculum and its methods of delivery.**

As described under Standard 1, the institutional mission is to train “highly professional and competitive specialists in the field of professional music education and music art, capable to realise their creative potential both domestically and internationally” (*Link*: “Development strategy” *SER*, p. 9). Each of the programmes aims to train specialists in one or two specific areas of specialisation (major and minor). The learning outcomes are based on the professional competencies for each specialisation which are outlined in the curriculum. The modules constituting the curriculum support different aspects of the student’s professional development (*SER*, p. 18; *annexes* 1.21 EN - 1.27 EN).

Students are represented in the academic committees which deal with the development and updates of their respective study programmes. Through their representatives, students can influence the curriculum and the teaching and learning strategies that are used (*SER*, p. 29).

As a follow-up of a previous MusiQuE review, the Polifonia Dublin Descriptors and the AEC Learning Outcomes are now taken into consideration in all programmes. They are explicitly recognised as recommendations when developing new programmes (*SER*, p. 19; *link*: “Regulations of educational, methodological work and practice” *SER*, p. 19). Heads of Department met by the review team expressed the view that the Dublin Descriptors and AEC Learning Outcomes had been of great help in developing the programmes. The curriculum is now also perceived as clearer and more structured (*meeting with alumni and employers*). In each curriculum, there is a matrix mapping the learning outcomes to each module in the study programme. It was mentioned, however, that the transition into a more learning outcomes-based approach had its challenges since the teachers themselves are products of the Soviet system of teaching (*meeting with teachers*).

Students have some opportunities to develop their own study profiles, mainly through their choice of elective subjects. The teachers offering elective subjects present these, and the students make their choices with the help of their advisors (*SER*, p. 21). Students and teachers met also underlined how the possibility to choose a minor, allowed students to widen their qualifications. Heads of Department met by the review team indicated that the introduction of a minor was one of the most important changes since 2018, and teachers

met by the review team proposed that this possibility should be extended to all programmes. The choice of repertoire is another way to develop an individual study profile. Heads of Department met suggested that students should decide more of their repertoire themselves in the future. An opinion was also offered that students should be more versatile, i.e. playing more than one instrument.

There are state regulations concerning the ratio of compulsory and elective subjects. KNC is aware of the limitation this imposes on the students' choices (*SER*, p. 21). There are also state regulations concerning compulsory subjects in the curriculum. 56 out of 240 ECTS credits in the bachelor programmes must be assigned to compulsory general education subjects, such as the history of Kazakhstan (*SER*, p. 18). Both students and teachers met were critical of the large number of ECTS credits devoted to general education subjects in music programmes since this leaves less time for music studies. They also commented that the general education subjects overlap with previous education.

According to the *SER*, there are connections between the different departments, programmes and disciplines. Teachers teach across faculties and programmes. Programmes such as Conducting and Vocal Art cooperate closely, and their modules are partly correlated. Also, the Composition programme works with other programmes to create student works and develop creative skills. (*SER*, p. 22). However, students met expressed concerns about the lack of status and integration of the composition programme into the activities of the KNC and called for more possibilities to have student works performed. Heads of Department met by the review team commented that the pandemic had caused some disruption in this respect, the discontinuation of a composition contest being one example.

A wide range of teaching and learning strategies are utilised in the programmes, and they are outlined with varying degrees of detail in the descriptions of each of the programmes (*SER*, p. 22; *annexes* 1.21 EN - 1.27 EN). KNC aims to enhance the use of digital tools in the educational process (*Link*: "Regulations of educational, methodological work and practice" *SER*, p. 19). During the pandemic, all classes were in an online format. Auditoriums are equipped with computers and midi keyboards, and one room has been dedicated for use by musicologists and composers, where modern software for musical notation and composition is available (*SER*, p. 22).

Students can present their creative work in different ways inside and outside KNC. The *SER* offers many examples of how students in the different programmes are given such opportunities. Students in performance programmes hold class concerts in the concert halls of KNC (*SER*, p. 22). According to Heads of Department met by the review team

refurbished facilities in the three concert halls have improved the students' concert experiences. There are also regular outdoor concerts, and students contribute to concerts in schools, hospitals etc. and when various national holidays are celebrated, thereby contributing to the local community (*SER*, p. 22). The Concert service office offers support for concert events (*meeting with senior administrative staff*). Students met suggested that students could perform in student clubs and receive credits for that. Students from all programmes take part in masterclasses, and some take part in national and international competitions. Students who take part in competitions are supported financially and in other ways by KNC (*SER*, p. 22). This is a new development which is considered very positive (*meeting with Heads of Department*). Students can also present their creative work at various international festivals, and through projects they organise themselves (*SER*, pp. 23-24). The need for performance experiences to grow as an artist was strongly underlined by alumni and employers met, and the Vice-Rectors met said they intended to strengthen the students' stage performance competencies. Internships and professional practice can also be means for students to present their work and receive guidance in "real life" situations. Students met found these opportunities very useful and suggested that students in the Art Management programme in particular should have more possibilities to work in professional organisations on professional productions. It was also suggested that these students should further develop their skills in using modern technologies (*meeting with Heads of Department*). The ambition to strengthen the practice-orientation of programmes through internships is expressed in internal regulations concerning curriculum development (*Link: "Regulations of educational and methodological work and practice" SER*, p. 19).

The SER states that: "One of the tasks of undergraduate academic programmes is the development of students' critical thinking" (*SER*, p. 24). This is to some extent reflected in the learning outcomes in the curricula (*Annexes 1.21 EN - 1.27 EN*). According to the SER, students can express their opinions and have the opportunity to hold seminars, prepare abstracts, and give presentations. They are also invited to express their view in different surveys, which encourage them to reflect on their learning process (*SER*, pp. 24-25).

Teachers are active as researchers and provide a wide variety of research outcomes such as compositions, scientific articles, collections and educational and methodological texts (*SER*, pp. 25-26). These are actively used in the educational processes and in developing the curricula (*SER*, p. 27). Of special importance are all textbooks, teaching aids and other resources which significantly contribute to the students' learning processes (*SER*, pp. 27-28). Educational resources authored and compiled by teachers are published by KNC after a review process (*SER*, p. 28). The implementation of research into the programmes is

regulated, and different methods for doing this are described in a specific document (*SER*, p. 26; *link*: “Regulations on the implementation of research results in the educational process” *SER*, p. 26). Students carry out research activities within the framework of the annual contest of student research work (SRW) which is held at KNC with the participation of students from all creative universities nationally (*SER*, p. 26). The participation of students in the performance programmes is, however, not as frequent, because of their heavy workload, including work opportunities in professional ensembles (*SER*, p. 27). Students also conduct research as part of their graduation thesis, and there are guidelines concerning the design and format of the thesis (*SER*, p. 27; *link*: “Guidelines for the implementation and design of a thesis/graduation project” *SER*, p. 27).

Each student is assigned an advisor who helps the student find his/her individual educational path and provides academic, career and personal advice to students (*SER*, p. 28; *link*: “Regulations on the advisor-curator” *SER*, p. 28). In addition, each student except for students on the Art Management programme works individually with a teacher in their specialty, whom they can consult. There is a scheduled consultation hour when students can consult their advisors and the Vice-Rector for Academic Work. In addition, they are also free to contact their Head of Department, the Dean, as well as the Rector, who holds a weekly, open reception (*SER*, p. 29). Students met by the review team said that they found it easy to get advice and that they were well provided with educational services, including the resources provided via the electronic information system Platonus.

The content of the curricula and the aims of the programmes reflect the institutional mission of training specialists in different areas. Students can influence the curriculum through their representatives in the academic committees. The review team has not seen clear evidence of students being members of working groups on curriculum development. If this is not the case, the review team would encourage KNC to utilise the resources students represent in these processes.

KNC has made a formidable effort to align its curricula to the Polifonia Dublin Descriptors and the AEC Learning Outcomes. The review team is impressed with how far the implementation process has come in such a short time, considering that the Polifonia Dublin Descriptors and AEC Learning Outcomes represent a very different approach to learning and teaching as well as curriculum design compared to Soviet pedagogical practice. The review team would encourage KNC to explore how values underlying the Polifonia Dublin Descriptors and AEC Learning Outcomes, such as student ownership of learning, independence and critical reflection can be implemented even more in the curricula.



Students can create their study profiles to some extent, mainly through opportunities for minor studies and electives. The review team would encourage KNC to explore the possibilities for minor studies in study programmes where this opportunity does not exist today. The view that students need to become more versatile is supported by the review team since there is a clear trend in the international labour market towards portfolio careers for music professionals. The review team also supports greater freedom for students in choosing their repertoire. This would encourage the students' ownership of learning and promote independence, helping them find their own pathways into their chosen profession.

Almost 25% of the curriculum is devoted to compulsory general subjects. The review team is aware that this decision is outside the control of KNC but will nevertheless point out that this puts KNC students at a certain disadvantage compared to students in other countries who can devote all their time and energy during their bachelor studies to their music specialisation.

There are relevant connections between programmes, but the review team would suggest that KNC explores how the Composition programme and its students could become more integrated.

A wide range of teaching and learning strategies are described in the curricula, relevant to the programmes. Students have many opportunities to present their creative work. The strong position of KNC in Kazakh cultural life enables students to present their work also outside of KNC. The review team supports initiatives to further strengthen the students' possibilities for presenting their work and engaging in professional practice.

The development of students' critical reflection and self-reflection is to some extent part of the curricula and students are also invited to reflect through surveys. In light of the importance placed on these competencies in the AEC Learning Outcomes, the review team would suggest that KNC continues to explore ways to support the students' development in these areas, not only formally but also as a living practice.

Teachers at KNC are active researchers and the review team wishes to commend in particular the large output of textbooks and other material that supports student learning. Commendable is also the effort to implement research into the programmes. This also includes engaging students in research activities.

Each student is assigned an advisor who has a defined mandate, and there are scheduled consultation hours. In addition, there are also other opportunities for students

to consult members of staff and receive advice. The review team formed the impression that students are well supported in this respect.

### Compliance with Standard 2.1

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 2.1 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

## 2.2 International perspectives

**Standard 2.2. The programme offers a range of opportunities for students to gain an international perspective.**

According to the SER (*SER*, p. 29), the activities of the bachelor programmes are based on the KNC internationalisation strategy (*Link: "2022-2025 Internationalisation strategy" SER*, p. 29). This strategy outlines several goals that are relevant at programme level: 1) Development of international programmes and doctoral schools. This includes activities such as participation in international conferences and events and creating conditions for teachers and students to take part in international events. 2) Attracting foreign students and staff. 3) Development of academic programmes in English, also at bachelor level, including developing an action plan to expand foreign language training. 4) Organisation of international events such as international summer schools and international scientific conferences.

According to the SER, students are offered international perspectives in different ways. Large international conferences are held at the KNC at least twice a year where both students and teachers can participate (*SER*, p. 29). There are regular masterclasses and workshops with renowned international artists, and there was an international chamber music festival in 2022 at the KNC. Students and teachers were also involved in the international UNESCO Festival "The Planet of Art" in 2022 and 2023 held at KNC. Teachers met by the review team considered such international events located at KNC as a way of compensating for the small number of international exchange visits (see below). Students and teachers furthermore take part in the international project "Eurasian research community in the field of music and performance 2017-2023" involving institutions from Azerbaijan, Georgia, and Norway. In addition to KNC activities, this project includes students exchanges (*SER*, p. 29).

Internationalisation is mainly reflected in the learning outcomes of the programmes in terms of the "ability to communicate in a foreign language for solving professional activities" or similar formulations (*Annexes* 1.21 EN – 1.27 EN). The Composition and Musicology programmes, in addition, have learning outcomes concerning knowledge of "foreign, Russian, Soviet, traditional, domestic and Kazakh musical art as a type of creative activity" (*Annexes* 1.23 EN and 1.24 EN). Foreign language is a compulsory discipline in all programmes with 10 ECTS credits. In addition, students in the Vocal Art programme have Italian and French or German related to repertoire in those languages. Teaching methods and materials are being developed to improve teaching and learning in foreign languages (*SER*, p. 30). Four subjects are currently taught in English (*Link*: "2022-2025 Internationalization strategy" *SER*, p. 29).

All programmes engage in different forms of international partnerships. There are agreements in the field of music science with Russian institutions and the Kyrgyz Republic, involving conferences, seminars and creative events in which teachers and students participate. This has also resulted in a publication with contributions from a teacher active in the Traditional Musical Art programme (*SER*, p. 31). Teachers and students in this programme also take an active part in different activities within the International Council for Traditional Music, and teachers are represented in the leadership of this organisation (*SER*, pp. 31-32). A considerable amount of the KNC teachers have studied as well as performed abroad and thereby have direct contact with international institutions and organisations. Teachers of KNC are regularly appointed as jury members/chairs of international contests and are active members of international organisations, such as the International chamber orchestra "Turksoy", and the International Association of Guitar Art. Furthermore, teachers are regularly invited to give masterclasses abroad (*SER*, p. 32).

KNC takes part in the Erasmus+ academic mobility programme and has partnerships with many institutions abroad, about half of them in neighbouring countries (*Link: “2022-2025 Internationalization strategy” SER, p. 29*). An information session focusing on international mobility is held for first-year students every year (*SER, p. 30*). Increased mobility for students as well as teachers is a priority for the KNC (*meeting with Vice-Rectors*), and alumni and employers met by the review team also underlined the importance of more international exchange. According to the SER, there is a need to strengthen the motivation of students for going on exchange (*SER, p. 31*). However, Vice-Rectors met by the review team noted a positive development in the students’ motivation for going on exchange, and one of the students met by the review team cited the possibility of international exchange as one of the main reasons for choosing KNC. Statistics from 2019-2022 show that eight students have been on exchange under the Erasmus+ programme. In addition, 12 student exchange visits have taken place under other programmes (*Link: “2022-2025 Internationalisation strategy” SER, p. 29*). The lack of language skills among students constitutes a large obstacle (*SER, p. 35; meeting with students; meeting with teachers; meeting with Vice-Rectors*) According to the internationalisation strategy less than 10% of students can speak English (*Link: “2022-2025 Internationalisation strategy” SER, p. 29*). Students met by the review team expressed a strong need for more training in English for both students and teachers. Students in the Traditional Musical Art programme cannot take part in the Erasmus+ exchange due to a lack of similar programmes in foreign institutions (*meeting with students; meeting with teachers*). Heads of Department met by the review team expressed that also these students need to go abroad, representing Kazakh music. Students met thought it most useful for students in the Traditional Musical Art programme to go on exchange to neighbouring countries but explained that there is a lack of funding since these countries are not part of the Erasmus+ programme. The possibility of developing joint academic programmes with foreign institutions is hampered by a large amount of credits for compulsory general subjects (*SER, p. 35*) as well as by the lack of language skills.

There are relatively few international students in the bachelor programmes, currently only ten. Most of them are ethnic Kazakhs or Kazakh-speaking from neighbouring countries (*SER, p. 32*). A dedicated action programme is developed to integrate foreign students into KNC and Kazakh culture. It includes both academic, practical and psychosocial support for students, such as accommodation, an advisor and student clubs (*Link: “Programme for foreign students adaption 2021-2025” SER, p.33*). The programme outlines deadlines and the person and office who is responsible for each action, thus assuring the quality.

The KNC is interested in having international teachers over longer periods to enhance the quality of teaching. According to the SER, however, engaging foreign teachers is difficult, since national legislation prevents KNC from paying salaries to foreign teachers. Also, teachers have to have their diplomas officially approved by the Ministry of Education and Science (*SER*, p. 34). A few international guest teachers have nevertheless been invited, and there are regular masterclasses with international artists (*SER*, p. 34).

Teachers can gain and expand their international experience through participation in international activities such as masterclasses, concerts, conferences, festivals etc. (*SER*, p. 32) and through the work in the dissertation council which has an international composition of members (*SER*, p. 34). They can also get international experiences through their professional development activities (See standard 4.1). Teachers have only recently started to take part in the Erasmus+ mobility programme. So far, five teachers have been on exchange visits (*SER*, p. 34). Heads of Department met by the review team underlined how important it is for teachers to engage in international exchange to get new impulses on teaching and curriculum development. Teachers met by the review team were grateful for the support they received for their international activities but underlined that it was not enough. The lack of sufficient support for international activities was also noted by the Heads of Department in the meeting with the review team.

Internationalisation is not specifically targeted in the quality assurance system (*Link*: “Internal Quality Assurance Policy” *SER*, p. 59) but the progress in the area “Internationalisation of educational, scientific and creative activities” is described in the yearly progress reports of the KNC (*Annex 1.2 EN*).

KNC has an ambitious strategy for internationalisation. Some of the aims, such as organising international events including conferences, masterclasses and festivals at KNC are fully met, thereby providing international perspectives to students and teachers. However, there is still a long way to go towards the aims to attract foreign teachers and students, developing programmes in English and strengthening foreign language training.

Internationalisation is primarily expressed in terms of language skills in the curricula except for the Musicology and Composition programmes where knowledge of foreign music is a learning objective. The review team suggests that similar learning outcomes be included in the performance programmes as well.

All programmes participate in different kinds of partnerships, some also offering possibilities for teacher and student exchange. The number of exchanges under the

Erasmus+ programme is still very limited. The main reason seems to be a lack of foreign language skills, inhibiting both incoming and outgoing student and teacher exchange. The review team recommends that the acquisition of language skills, particularly in English should be given high priority. English is the most widespread foreign language used also in non-English speaking higher education institutions. Some of the language training could take place through extra-curricular activities such as student clubs. Students in the Traditional Musical Art programme would also benefit from going on international exchange, particularly to other countries in the region, but these are not part of the Erasmus+ programme. The review team recommends that funds are allocated for student and teacher exchange in the region. This would provide valuable international experience but also be a means to promote Kazakh music and culture abroad.

There are few international students at KNC, and most of them are of Kazakh ethnic origin. There is a comprehensive programme for the inclusion of these students. The number of international teachers is very small, limiting the international ambitions of KNC. The low number is due to restrictions at national level, and the review team recommends that this issue is raised with the relevant authorities in light of its negative consequences.

A considerable number of the teachers have international experiences through their studies abroad and different international professional activities such as concerts, conferences, juries, master classes etc. The review team has noted that there is a lack of funding for such activities and recommends that more funds are allocated to such activities. The international activities of teachers are important means for attracting foreign students to KNC and benchmarking the quality of the programmes against international standards.

As indicated above, there are several obstacles on the pathway to internationalisation, some of them outside the control of KNC. The review team wishes to commend the institution for working hard to compensate by providing opportunities for internationalisation “at home” through multiple international events hosted by KNC. If physical exchange is difficult, online opportunities could be explored.

## **Compliance with Standard 2.2**

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 2.2 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Substantially compliant

## 2.3 Assessment

**Standard 2.3. Assessment methods are clearly defined and demonstrate achievement of learning outcomes.**

Assessment of students in all programmes is based on how well they perform concerning learning outcomes as defined in the curricula and syllabi (*SER*, p. 35). The use of learning outcomes in this context was considered a positive consequence of the Bologna implementation process by Heads of Department met by the review team. The policy for all assessments is based on the principles of validity, reliability, and transparency (*Link: "Policy for assessing learning outcomes at Kurmangazy KNC" SER, p. 35; annex 3.2.2 RU*). In this policy, it is stated that "[...] the scope and range of assessment task should correspond to the learning outcomes" ("Policy for assessing learning outcomes at Kurmangazy KNC", p. 8) and that "Methods of evaluation include a full range of written, verbal and practical (creative) exams, tests, projects and portfolios that are used to assess the progress of students" (*Ibid*, p. 9). Furthermore, the policy states that "The assessment methods chosen for the educational component should be related to the learning outcomes and learning activities associated with it" (*Ibid*, p. 9). These formulations indicate that the intention is for assessment methods to be aligned with learning outcomes as well as with teaching and learning methods. The descriptions of assessment methods in the curricula

seem less detailed in this respect (*Annexes 1.21 EN – 1.27 EN*). It is therefore difficult to conclude that there is, in fact, alignment between assessment methods on the one side and teaching and learning methods and learning outcomes on the other. Assessment methods are discussed in collegiate bodies, where representatives of external stakeholders participate when syllabi are approved (*SER*, p. 35).

Assessment criteria are clearly defined in the curricula, as exemplified in *SER* (*SER*, p. 36-39). First-year students are introduced to the assessment system during an orientation week at the beginning of their studies (*SER*, p. 39). A grading system from 1-100 is used for all examinations and assessments. Descriptions are given for performances characterising each score interval. These scores are then converted to the international grade system A-F (*Link: “Regulations of educational, methodological work and practice” SER*, p. 19). Alumni and employers met by the review team commented that the assessment criteria now are much clearer after the last revisions of the programmes.

The assessment procedures are described in detail in the curricula (see example *Link: “Educational program Instrumental Performance” SER*, p. 18) and are available in the Platonus system (*demonstration of the Platonus system*). Teachers met by the review team expressed satisfaction with how formalised the assessment procedures now are.

Assessment of performance exams is conducted by members of the relevant department through collegiate discussions. This enables the student to receive feedback from different teachers. Assessment of theoretical exams is conducted by the teacher in the subject and an assistant (*SER*, p. 35; *visit to exams*).

Students receive feedback on their progress and performance in the course of regular class assignments, and after midterm assessments and final exams (*SER*, p. 35). This includes recommendations for further development. Grade points from each assessment are registered in Platonus, giving students the possibility to track their progress continuously (*SER*, p. 39). Students can submit an appeal to the Appeal Commission if they disagree with the examination assessment (*SER*, p. 39).

The specific methods used for assessment in each subject are not described in detail in the curricula, but the ambition seems to be to use varied assessment methods and to align them with the learning outcomes of the programmes. The review team would suggest that KNC ensures that this ambition is more reflected in the curricula.



Detailed assessment criteria are formulated and easily available to students. Descriptions of performances characterising each score interval can also easily be accessed. The assessment procedures are rigorous, including having more than one assessor at exams. There are also appeals procedures. These measures contribute to a fair and consistent assessment of students.

There are several assessments throughout each semester where students get feedback on their progression and performance thus enabling them to track their progress.

### Compliance with Standard 2.3

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 2.3 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

## 3. Student profiles

### 3.1 Admission/Entrance qualifications

**Standard 3.1. There are clear criteria for student admission, based on an assessment of their artistic/academic suitability for the programme.**

Entry qualifications to the bachelor programmes are determined by national regulations as well as internal regulations (*SER*, p. 41; *Link*: “Admission rules” *SER*, p. 41; *annex* 1.3 RU). Amendments have been made recently to the national regulations, which have harmed the possibility for applicants to the Instrumental Performance programme to qualify for studying under the state order. There are currently joint efforts by the KNC and the Ministry of Culture and Sports to solve these issues (*SER*, p. 14).

The website provides clear descriptions of the entry requirements, the types of exams and assessment criteria (*Link*: “Baccalaureate” *SER*, p. 41) including links to the specific requirements for each programme. The requirement for admission to the Art Management programme has recently been updated as a consequence of the changes made to the programme (*SER*, p. 14). The level of independent and critical thinking is now part of the admission assessment for this programme (*SER*, p. 14). Students met by the review team found the website informative.

Applicants can attend consultations before taking part in entry exams to clarify the criteria and help them prepare for the exams. The lecturers conducting the consultations are not members of the examination boards (*SER*, p. 42). Furthermore, teachers from all programmes carry out career guidance for applicants throughout the Republic of Kazakhstan, and also during the Republican Small Olympiad, which takes place at KNC annually (*SER*, p. 42).

Entry requirements to all programmes except the Art Management programme are based on a completed secondary education in music. In recent years there has been a decrease in the level of proficiency among applicants from regional music colleges. KNC, therefore, provides support in different ways (*SER*, p. 15).

Applicants who have not completed a specialist secondary music education are offered foundation courses (*meeting with Heads of Department*). Alumni and employers met by the review team suggested that KNC should also look for talents outside the music colleges, for example in music schools, regular schools, amateur ensembles etc.

According to the SER, graduates from specialised music schools and music colleges normally pass the entrance examinations (*SER*, p. 42). However, as noted above, some concerns were expressed that not all music colleges are preparing their students well enough to be admitted to KNC. Music colleges are not governed by the same Ministry as the KNC. Therefore, the recent changes in the framework at KNC, such as implementing the AEC Learning Outcomes are not followed up at the college level (*meeting with teachers; meeting with Vice-Rectors*). KNC provides educational and methodological assistance to music colleges to remedy the situation (*SER*, p. 15).

The admission criteria are specified for each programme. The criteria are relevant to the programmes and the admission processes are transparent. Applicants can receive guidance in advance and there are also foundation courses to prepare applicants. Music colleges play an important role in the recruitment of applicants. The review team, therefore, suggests a closer dialogue between the colleges and KNC, and an even stronger support for enhancing the quality of teaching at the colleges.

**Compliance with Standard 3.1**

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 3.1 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

### 3.2 Student progression, achievement and employability

Student progression and achievement is monitored through midterm examinations and exams. The data is recorded in the Platonus system, analysed and reported to the Deans and presented in the annual report to the Vice-Rector for academic and educational-methodical work. The individual student's mean score is calculated in the Platonus system and forms the basis for decisions on transfer to the next academic year (*SER*, p. 42). Student advisors play an important role in supporting student progression (See standard 2.1.) .

Students can obtain recognition for learning outcomes acquired at other educational institutions through a specified procedure carried out by the Dean's office. The differences in disciplines between the institutions are calculated, and the student pays for taking disciplines that are not part of their previous education (*SER*, p. 43).

Studies abroad as part of mobility programmes are subject to recognition. The Dean's office reviews and transfers disciplines, grades and credits (*SER*, p. 43; *annex 3.2.2.*).

Graduate employment is monitored by the Student and Alumni Department. There must be a minimum of 50% employment rate among graduates for the institution to apply for a state order for the programme (*SER*, p. 43). There are statistics on the employment rate at programme level. The employment rate is high among graduates from most programmes except for graduates from the Conducting, Musicology and Composition programmes where about half of the graduates were employed in 2022 (*SER*, p. 43). Last year the employment rate was 97% across all programmes (*meeting with Vice-Rectors*). The review team understands this to be employment relevant to the respective study programmes. There is a growing need for teachers in different disciplines in music colleges. Graduates seem well prepared for teaching in music colleges, but some concern was expressed about the level of pedagogical and methodological skills in graduates from the Vocal Art department (*meeting with alumni and employers*). There is also an increasing demand for performers (*SER*, p. 44).

Graduates are employed in the public sector in different music education institutions, in the Abay National Opera and Ballet Theatre and in different professional orchestras (*SER*, p. 44). Graduates from the Art Management programme are mainly employed as production managers, in administration or in marketing departments (*meeting with alumni and employers*). Some graduates also find employment in the private sector, such as in production companies, private music schools and studios (*SER*, p. 44).

Until recently, dual education and internships have mostly been reserved for music colleges, but in 2021 an agreement was signed with the National Theater "Astana Opera", which allows vocal students to carry out their final year of studies at the opera. Participation in an opera performance is then acknowledged as a state exam. There are plans to extend the concept of dual education to other areas of study as well (*SER*, p. 10; *meeting with Vice-Rectors*). Students met by the review team were very positive about internships and practica as part of their studies, stating that it gives them opportunities to meet and work with professionals in their field. The experience of practicing their chosen profession also gives them valuable insight into their strengths and weaknesses.

Information about vacancies is provided by the Student and Alumni Department, and an annual job fair is held at KNC. Employers met by the review team underlined the importance of the job fair in recruiting employees. Students can also get in contact with potential employers during practice periods (*SER*, p. 44). Many students work during their studies, accommodating their working hours to scheduled classes. Heads of Department met by the review team saw this type of practice as positive but indicated at the same time that scholarships should be increased so that students would not have to work so much.

Employers are represented in the different Academic Committees and have thus the opportunity to give their input to the curriculum and other issues concerning the programmes (See also Standard 6.2).

KNC has effective mechanisms in place for monitoring the progression, achievement and employability of its graduates. The Platonus platform is a useful tool in this respect. Students with prior studies and/or studies abroad can have these recognised through specific procedures.

The employability rate is routinely monitored at programme level. Most graduates find relevant jobs, mainly within the large public cultural sector. There is little evidence as to how KNC prepares graduates for a freelance market or if such a market yet exists nationally. Trends in other countries indicate the increased importance of the freelance market in providing job opportunities. The review team, therefore, supports the view that performers should become more versatile to be prepared for portfolio careers when also entrepreneurship skills are vital.

The review team commends the initiative to organise job fairs, which seem highly effective in helping graduates and employers connect. The representation of employers at governing bodies at the programme level ensures the relevance of the programmes.

The intention to expand dual education and other forms of internships is supported by the review team.

Alumni from the Art Management programme seem to mainly enter jobs on an administrative and practical level and not in leadership positions. The review team believes that the Art Management programme could play a greater role in providing Kazakh cultural life with competent leaders and that the curriculum should be adjusted to prepare for such responsibilities.

### Compliance with Standard 3.2

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 3.2 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

## 4. Teaching staff

### 4.1 Staff qualifications and professional activity

**Standard 4.1. Members of the teaching staff are qualified for their role and are active as artists/pedagogues/researchers.**

National regulations govern the teaching staff's pedagogical qualifications, and KNC complies with these. There are job descriptions for teaching staff, specific for each level as well as requirements concerning professional competencies, experience and achievements in teaching and research in the area of specialisation (*SER*, p. 45). Teachers do not have permanent contracts but take part in a competition every five years for filling positions. Part-time teachers who have been working at KNC for at least ten years can also participate and compete for positions. The competitions provide an opportunity to ensure that teachers continue to possess the required competencies. There are regulations in place concerning this process (*SER*, p. 45). Vacant positions are advertised once a year and there is an elaborate procedure in place for the recruitment of new teachers (*meeting with senior managers*).

As defined by national legislation, teachers are required to complete 72 hours of advanced training courses in leading institutions in Kazakhstan or abroad every five years (*SER*, pp. 45-47). In recent years, teachers have also taken advanced courses online (*SER*, p. 47) The courses completed are listed on each teacher's profile page on the KNC website (<http://www.conservatoire.edu.kz/en/structure/faculties/>).

KNC has developed a rating system, launched in January 2022 to stimulate the pedagogical, scientific and creative work of its teaching staff. The rating system details what type of activities qualify for incentive payments, such as publications, concerts, grants received, student achievements, innovative teaching, jury membership etc. (*SER*, p. 45-46; *Lnk*. "Teaching staff ranking regulations", *SER*, p. 46). Teachers also can be promoted to higher-level positions via competitions for positions (*SER*, p. 46). The Ministry of Education and Science also offers other incentives such as grants for "Best Teacher of the Year" (*meeting with teachers*). According to the *SER* (*SER*, p. 13), the status of KNC, as well as the level of salaries, attracts highly qualified musicians to seek positions at the institution. Students met by the review team expressed great satisfaction with their teachers and cited the quality of the teachers as one of the reasons for choosing to study at KNC.

KNC has a staff apprenticeship tradition where more experienced teachers provide mentoring for less experienced. The doctoral programmes also play an important part in

professional development as ten teachers have completed their PhD since 2017 (*SER*, p. 47). In 2022, 44 of 253 full-time teachers were professors or associate professors, 22 had a doctoral degree and 134 had a master's degree (*SER*, p.47-48).

Teachers are engaged in a variety of activities inside and outside of KNC, such as juries, masterclasses, concerts and lectures, examinations, media presentations, and creative projects (*SER*, p. 48-49). Many textbooks have been published by teachers (*meeting with teachers; visit to the library*). KNC ensures flexibility for teachers so that they can combine their scientific and creative activities, and professional development with teaching (*SER*, p. 48). Teachers met expressed gratitude for the support provided both by KNC and the Ministry for Education and Science for carrying out their scientific and creative activities.

KNC has a practice for having open classes, for teachers to attend each others' classes, collegial discussions of students' reports, and scientific and pedagogical issues, thus encouraging critical reflection. Collective discussions of students' academic work contribute to developing students' critical reflection (*SER*, p. 49). Since 2021, student surveys have been conducted to provide feedback on the implementation of the programmes, thereby allowing students to critically reflect on their education (*SER*, p. 50).

The review team met a group of teachers, where the vast majority were graduates from KNC, who were proud of their achievements, and rightly so since their graduates find employment and they play an important role in Kazakh music life.

There are requirements and procedures in place to ensure that teachers have the necessary qualifications and that they continue their professional development. The qualifications of each teacher are transparent through the website, which gives prospective applicants as well as other interested parties valuable information about each specific teacher.

Teachers are supported and stimulated through several measures to further develop their teaching and to carry out academic and creative activities. The criteria in the recently developed ranking system are diverse and therefore relevant to rewarding any activity teachers typically engage in. It is, however, too early to assess the effect of the ranking system.

Teachers are involved in many activities inside as well as outside KNC. The review team wishes to commend the large output of textbooks by the teachers and their active involvement in Kazakh cultural life.

There are arenas for collegiate discussions, facilitating critical reflection among teachers. As indicated in standard 2.1 there is less evidence as to how critical reflection



is developed among students apart from taking part in surveys. The review team would encourage teachers to explore different opportunities for them to engage students in critical reflection and in learning to express their opinions respectfully.

### Compliance with Standard 4.1

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 4.1 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

### 4.2 Size and composition of the teaching staff body

**Standard 4.2. There are sufficient qualified teaching staff to effectively deliver the programme.**

The Ministry of Culture and Sports has issued regulations concerning the size of the teaching staff body which KNC complies with: 3,5 students per 1 teacher. According to the SER, this is considered sufficient to ensure a student-centred education, enabling one-to-one and small-group teaching (*SER*, p. 50).

The SER describes how representatives responsible for the programme ensure that there is consistency between the content of the curriculum and the composition of teaching staff. Teachers are initially hired for one year and then compete for their positions at regular intervals (*SER*, p. 51). Part-time teachers can be hired for specific teaching areas (*SER*, p.

51), and experienced professionals from other higher education institutions can be hired on an hourly basis if needed (*SER*, p. 50).

Teachers can develop new competencies as needed when new professional requirements or other changes to the programmes are introduced, by engaging in advanced training in different forms (*Link: "Human Resource Management" SER*, p. 51). One example of successful professional development was the digitalisation of teaching which was rapidly introduced during the Covid-19 pandemic (*SER*, p. 51). New developments in the programmes can thus be accommodated by the core teaching staff.

KNC has developed a human resource policy (*Link: "Policy: Human Resources Management" SER*, p. 51) which describes the principles and values which underpin it. Among these is the principle of proactivity, defined as the ability to diagnose, predict and plan the need for personnel for the medium and long term.

KNC has a very generous teacher per student ratio compared to many other institutions. This is an asset as it enables a substantial amount of one-to-one teaching and many contact hours for students. On the other hand, the high number of contact hours can slow down the process of making the student independent and responsible for their learning.

Representatives responsible for the programme have a defined role in ensuring that the number and experience of the teaching staff is adequate for delivering the programmes.

The flexibility of teaching staff to meet new requirements or developments within the programmes is ensured by the 5-year term hiring policy, by opportunities for professional development, and by hiring part-time teachers. The principle of proactivity in the "Human Resource Policy" indicates that there is an awareness of the need to plan ahead to ensure a sufficient number of qualified teaching staff under changing circumstances.

#### Compliance with Standard 4.2

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 4.2 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant

Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

## 5. Facilities, resources and support

### 5.1 Facilities

**Standard 5.1. The institution has appropriate resources to support student learning and delivery of the programme.**

KNC has two buildings specifically built for learning and teaching purposes. Building A was built in 1950, it has 7'064 square meters and 58 classrooms. 43 of the rooms are equipped with musical instruments. Building B, constituting 5'067 square meters, was built in 1960 and transferred to KNC in 1999. It has 37 classrooms of which 29 are equipped with instruments. The buildings have a mixture of rooms appropriate for group lectures and individual lectures and for practicing (*SER*, p. 52). There is a chamber music hall with 170 seats, a small concert hall with 236 seats and a big organ hall, built in 2021 with 500 seats. The buildings were overhauled during the pandemic (*SER*, p. 52). Heads of Department met by the review team commented that the improvement of the concert halls had vastly enhanced the students' performance opportunities. The classrooms are open from 6.30 am until 10.00 pm. In addition, there is a dormitory and rooms for physical education (*SER*, p. 52). It is stated in the SER that there is sufficient space for teaching, but that there is a lack of practice rooms for the students' self-study. KNC is in discussions with the Ministry of Culture and Sports to solve this problem (*SER*, p. 52). Students met confirmed that they experienced problems finding practice rooms, especially during exam periods, and it was suggested that the opening hours of the buildings should be extended. There is also a need for more and newer instruments (*meeting with Vice-Rectors*).

According to the SER, there was previously a serious lack of funding for technical equipment. In the last three years, however, there has been a significant improvement, and KNC has been able to buy a large server and different types of software including modules from the Platonus system, one of which supports online learning (*SER*, p. 53). There is, however still a need to upgrade existing technical equipment and to acquire new equipment (*meeting with Vice-Rectors*).

The library is the largest in its field in Kazakhstan. In addition to the rooms housing its collection, there is also a reading room with 160 seats, and a hall of electronic resources (*SER*, p. 53). All material in the library is now in a digital catalogue (*meeting with senior administrative staff*). There are 38 computers where students can work, and there is internet access, including access to electronic information resources such as the databases Web of Science, Scopus, Science Direct, and Open Music Library (*SER*, p. 53). The library has a large collection of material, both printed versions (220'146 titles) and a

substantial amount of electronic full-text copies (17'400 titles). The library has a commercial-sized scanner used for digitalising material (*SER*, p. 53; *visit to the library*).

During the visit to the library, the review team was informed that there are many textbooks in the collection written by teachers at KNC as well as textbooks that were translated into Kazakh by teachers. Students get an introduction to the library, and students met by the review team stated that the reading room and the computers were frequently used. They confirmed that they found the number and types of databases sufficient and pointed out that they also could use the National Library.

The buildings are built for purpose and of an excellent standard. The three concert halls are a great asset and they are in daily use for public concerts. The review team supports the efforts to find a solution for the lack of practice rooms and efforts to update computers and technical solutions. The library, its services and its equipment are appropriate for the current situation. However, there might be a need for supplementing collections and subscriptions when KNC's plans for internationalisation are fully implemented.

**Compliance with Standard 5.1**

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 5.1 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

## 5.2 Financial resources

**Standard 5.2. The institution's financial resources enable successful delivery of the programme.**

The study programmes are funded by the state. According to national legislation, higher state institutions receive 100% funding for their activities, which ensures long-term operations. Each year the KNC submits a financial plan which the Ministry of Culture and Sports then approves (*SER*, p. 53). Many of the costs run across programmes, making it difficult to isolate the allocation of resources to each programme (*SER*, p. 54).

There are norms regulating the financial support to Kazakh higher education institutions, and according to these norms, funding is considered sufficient for implementation of the programmes (*SER*, pp. 53-54). KNC does not have the autonomy to make money or allocate funds without approval from the authorities (*SER*, p. 54). Some extra funds can be acquired through offering courses, renting out instruments as well as fees from students who do not receive state grants (*meeting with senior administrative staff*). Students' stipends and teachers' salaries have increased lately, but salaries for support staff such as accompanists have not, causing a problem for recruitment and retainment of key staff (*meeting with senior administrative staff*). Teachers met also expressed concern about the lack of funding for research activities, and there are concerns about the lack of funding for internationalisation (See standard 2.2).

KNC has a stable financial situation. State funding provides financial support for regular activities, and it is positive that students' stipends and teachers' salaries have increased. However, there is evidently a strong need for better funding for both key support staff such as accompanists, (although accompanists could also be considered as teaching staff) instruments, research, and international activities. The review team recommends that these concerns are raised with the relevant authorities.

### Compliance with Standard 5.2

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 5.2 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Substantially compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Substantially compliant

### 5.3 Support staff

#### Standard 5.3. The programme has sufficient qualified support staff.

KNC adheres to state regulations concerning the number and composition of support staff, such as a defined ratio of nine students per one educational support staff. In addition, there is administrative staff and service staff such as housekeeping etc. bringing the total number of support staff to 224. The support staff is evenly distributed across the study programmes (*SER*, p. 54). There is a shortage of accompanists due to low salaries. (*SER*, p. 54). This has also resulted in a large turnover (*SER*, p. 55). According to senior administrative staff met this problem is now in the process of being solved in collaboration with the Ministry of Culture and Sports.

The performance of educational support staff and service staff is assessed once a year when contracts are renewed. Accompanists undergo an assessment every three years to review their qualifications (*SER*, p. 54).

There is a personnel management policy in place which ensures professional development opportunities for all categories of support staff (*SER*, p. 55). One example is training in quality assurance (*meeting with senior administrative staff*).

State regulations ensure that there is a sufficient number of support staff. Regular assessments as well as professional development opportunities ensure the quality of the support staff. Lack of funding has however caused some problems concerning recruiting and retaining qualified accompanists. The review team commends KNC to find a solution to this issue.

### Compliance with Standard 5.3

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 5.3 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant



## 6. Communication, organisation and decision-making

### 6.1 Internal communication process

**Standard 6.1. Effective mechanisms are in place for internal communication within the programme.**

The SER underlines that KNC is a small institution which makes internal communication within the programmes relatively uncomplicated. Each teacher has scheduled office hours for consultations and meetings with students and other teachers. Administrative staff is available during office hours (*SER*, p. 55). There are regular meetings within the departments and collegiate bodies where information is exchanged, also between programmes. Information is also shared via the Platonus platform, and announcements on the KNC stands. In addition, more informal channels are used for communication such as e-mail and instant messaging groups (*SER*, p. 56).

The Platonus platform plays an important role in providing necessary information about the programmes to the students and teachers. It contains information such as the curriculum, syllabi, academic calendar, timetables, student progress and results, teacher contact details and profiles etc. (*demonstration of Platonus during the meeting with senior administrative staff*). Students met confirmed that Platonus is a valuable resource for them and that it was particularly useful during lockdown.

Students have the opportunity to communicate with their advisors, Head of Departments, the Dean, Vice-Rectors and Rector by appointment (*SER*, p. 56). Students met confirmed that they have easy access to information and communication with their teachers and advisors, and also with the leadership through scheduled meetings. There are also student meetings where students are encouraged to ask questions. One such meeting is with the compliance officer where students are informed about academic integrity, and there are meetings when teachers present elective subjects (*meeting with Vice-Rectors; meeting with students*). First-year students take part in an orientation week and there is a guidebook developed for them (*Link: "Guide for a first-year student" SER*, p.39) The advisors play an important role and were described as "the golden bridge" between the students on the one hand and the teachers and leadership on the other. The internal communication is described as very close (*meeting with Heads of Department*). The programme managers have the responsibility for communication with part-time staff and external collaborators (*SER*, p. 56).

The process of communication within KNC must comply with ethical standards as described in the “Code of Corporate Ethics” (*Link: “Code of Corporate Ethics” SER, p. 56*). If necessary, conflicts among staff are resolved by the Disciplinary Commission (*Link: “Regulations for the Disciplinary Commission” SER, p. 56*). Conflicts among students are solved by The Youth Committee which is a student self-governing body, and by the Student Council of the KNC dormitory (*SER, p. 56*).

There are effective measures in place to ensure internal communication within the programmes. These include the Platonus system, the website, the defined role of the advisors, as well as scheduled meetings between students, teachers and the leadership as well as in collegiate bodies. In addition to these more formalised measures of communication, the review team has the impression that there is a friendly and informal atmosphere where students have easy access to teachers and other staff members. The review team wishes to underline the importance of maintaining these more informal arenas for communication even when more structured approaches have been implemented.

**Compliance with Standard 6.1**

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 6.1 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional musical art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

## 6.2 Organisational structure and decision-making processes

**Standard 6.2 The programme is supported by an appropriate organisational structure and decision-making processes.**

KNC is managed by a Rector and three Vice-Rectors. It is divided into four faculties each led by a Dean. Each faculty is divided into departments with a Head of Department (*Link: "Organization chart" SER, p. 57*). Each department offers a set of academic programmes and there is an academic committee for each programme. There are regulations governing the activities of the faculties and the departments (*SER, p. 57*). The Dean, the Heads of Department and the leading teachers are members of the Educational and Methodological Council of the faculty (*SER, p. 57*).

Decisions concerning the programmes are carried out on three levels; department, faculty, and institution, depending on the issue under consideration. Issues concerning the educational process, the content of the programmes and the curriculum are agreed upon by the academic committee, then approved by the Educational and Methodological Council of the faculty and lastly by the Educational and Methodological Council of the institution. Employers participate when educational programmes are developed and are also represented in the academic committees (*SER, p. 57*).

The SER indicates that students take part in the decision-making processes in all areas of activity and are represented in the academic committees at programme level and the Academic Council as well as the Educational and Methodological Council at institutional level (*SER, p. 58*). The descriptions of the composition of the Academic Council and the Educational and Methodological Council on the KNC website confirm that students are represented in these bodies. Student candidates for these councils are proposed by the Deans "from among socially active students who have proven themselves in their studies and social life" (*e-mail correspondence with Ms Zhaniya Warren 23.6.2023*). Student members in the academic committees are "activists, advanced students (...), interested in the educational process, distinguished by good and excellent grades" (*Annex 1.19 EN*). Students have a "Committee for Youth Affairs" comprising only students (*SER, p. 33*). This committee does not have a formal place in the organisational structure. Students met stated that they can influence decisions through their representatives in the academic committees and that head students can raise issues with the management.

There are job descriptions for staff, outlining their responsibilities (*SER, pp. 57-58, Link: "Internal documents" SER, p. 58*). The opinions of different stakeholders are collected through various surveys and are considered in the decision-making process (*SER, p. 58*).

According to the SER, there are several indications of the effectiveness of the organisational structure and decision-making process: The national accreditation agency (IAAR) conducted an audit in 2022 and concluded that KNC is an effective institution in all areas of activity. In 2019 the International Accreditation and Ranking Agency IARA conducted an institutional accreditation of KNC and concluded that the organisational structure and decision-making processes are effective. Furthermore, the inspection by the National Quality Assurance Committee in 2021 did not result in any remarks as to the effectiveness (*SER*, p. 58).

Each programme has an academic committee where decisions are made on matters concerning the programme. These are then approved by institution-wide bodies. All relevant stakeholders including students, teachers and employers are represented on all levels of the decision-making process. The review team is aware of the fact that there are cultural differences as to how the role of students is perceived within the organisational structure of an institution but wishes to point out that many institutions have an independent student body representing the students as stakeholders as part of the organisational structure. Furthermore, student representatives to governing bodies are often elected by the students themselves, not appointed by the leadership.

There are detailed job descriptions for staff and they submit regular reports on their work (see Standard 7). The rapid changes that KNC has implemented in its programmes since the last MusiQuE review, is a testimony to the effectiveness of the organisational structure and decision-making processes.

**Compliance with Standard 6.2**

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 6.2 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant

Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

## 7. Internal quality culture

**Standard 7. The programme has in place effective quality assurance and enhancement procedures.**

A comprehensive quality assurance policy is in place as of November 2022 (*Link*: “Internal Quality Assurance Policy of Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory” *SER*, p. 59). The quality assurance system includes the following aspects relevant to the programmes: Programme development and approval, student-centred learning and assessment, student admission, access, recognition and certification, teaching staff, learning resources and student support systems. The programmes are developed by the relevant academic committee and approved by the Academic Council of KNC. They are monitored and periodically evaluated at least twice a year by specially trained intra-university auditors (*Link*: “Internal Quality Assurance Policy of Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory” *SER*, p. 59). There is a quality management sector within the organisational structure (*Link*: “Organization chart” *SER*, p. 57)

Proposals to change the quality assurance policy are discussed at the Academic Council and accepted or rejected by majority vote (*Link*: “Internal Quality Assurance Policy of Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory” *SER*, p. 59).

The *SER* states that quality assurance is a shared responsibility among all teaching and administrative staff, divisions and departments in KNC. Their respective responsibilities are outlined in the policy document (*Link*: “Internal Quality Assurance Policy of Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory” *SER*, p. 59). Surveys are conducted each year, some twice a year, among students, graduates and employers (*Links*: “Student satisfaction survey” *SER*, p. 58; “Regulations on questionnaires in Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory” *SER*, p. 60; *annex* 1.28 RU). Students met confirmed that they are asked to fill out questionnaires three to four times a semester on average and that they can read the results of the surveys on the KNC website. An example of the results of a survey among bachelor students in June 2022 is given on *SER* pages 24-25 with a detailed overview of the types of issues raised by how many students. Students met expressed a positive view of the usefulness of the surveys because they noticed changes being made as a result of their input.

All information gathered from different sources through quality assurance activities, such as reviews of experts, results from surveys, and minutes from meetings of collegiate bodies, provide the basis for proposals which are then discussed. The *SER* states that any necessary changes are implemented as soon as possible (*SER*, p. 61). Students and

teachers are informed about changes in programmes or procedures through different information channels (*SER*, p. 61).

The *SER* outlines how the quality culture is based on certain principles described in the quality assurance policy document, such as the involvement of all employees, considering the needs and expectations of internal and external stakeholders and ensuring their active involvement, ensuring equal opportunities for students, maintaining academic honesty and freedom, creating conditions for continuous improvement of quality assurance systems and the development of a quality culture, ensuring transparency and accessibility of information (*SER*, p. 61). Teachers and students met by the review team seemed informed about the existence of the quality assurance system despite its recent introduction.

The review team commends KNC for developing a comprehensive quality assurance system which ensures a systematic approach to quality assurance where responsibilities are clearly defined. At the time of the review, the system as a whole had only been in operation for about 6 months. Therefore, it is too early to draw definite conclusions as to how well it has been implemented or the effectiveness of the system. However, there is reason to believe that the quality assurance system will be of great use to KNC.

The review team has noted, that one aspect of the system is to “create conditions for (...) the development of a quality culture” (*SER*, p. 61) and would encourage KNC to explore such conditions. Examples could include creating arenas for open discussions about quality issues involving leadership, teachers and students, arenas for exchanging "best practice" across subjects and programmes, arranging professional development seminars for groups of teachers as a supplement to individual professional development, creating incentives for exploring innovative teaching or assessment methods etc. Such initiatives focus on quality enhancement rather than on quality assurance and are therefore more effective in building a quality culture. If there is a one-sided emphasis on quality assurance with many formalised checkpoints, one might risk a defensive attitude among staff rather than a willingness to acknowledge weaknesses and embrace necessary change. With a large number of surveys to fill out for students at short intervals, one might also risk that students get tired of filling them out, resulting in a low response rate or “automated” responses. Formalised surveys are important elements, but they must not replace ongoing discussions and informal feedback between stakeholders in building a quality culture.

**Compliance with Standard 7**

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 7 as follows:

<b>Programmes</b>	<b>Compliance level</b>
Bachelor in Art management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant



## 8. Public interaction

### 8.1 Cultural, artistic and educational contexts

**Standard 8.1. The programme engages within wider cultural, artistic and educational contexts.**

SER describes how KNC plays an active role as a resource for expertise on a national level. Teachers from all bachelor programmes are currently involved in developing professional standards, an initiative supervised by the Ministry of Culture and Sports on behalf of the Ministry of Higher Education and Science. When approved, the academic programmes will be adjusted to these professional standards (*SER*, p. 62).

Currently, a cultural policy with national projects and programmes is being developed by the Ministry of Culture and Sports. Teachers from the Department of Musicology are involved in this process (*SER*, p. 62).

Through its membership in the Association of Higher Educational Institutions of Kazakhstan, KNC is actively working to improve the legislation for higher education (*SER*, p. 62). Representatives from all programmes are involved in the Republican Educational and Methodological Council (REMC), concerning the improvement of the national legislation for creative education and continuous music education (*SER*, p. 63). Teachers are members of several national and international organisations and communities, and act as jury members of competitions, festivals, and projects (*SER*, p. 64).

Teachers from the Traditional Musical Art programme regularly contribute to educational TV and radio programmes. Teachers from the Musicology programme contribute to the television project “Music of the Great Steppe” regularly and take part in numerous conferences and forums concerning culture and education. There is a course in the Musicology programme, “Music Criticism and Journalism” where students are introduced to practical activities such as posting on the platform “New Musical Newspaper” (*SER*, pp. 62-63).

Teachers and students contribute to cultural and educational events at local, national and international levels. The study programmes also initiate and carry out various creative projects such as festivals, conferences, concerts etc. (*meeting with senior administrative staff*). Students met suggested that KNC should contribute even more to society in the future.

Free concerts are held daily in the three concert halls at KNC where teachers and students as well as visiting musicians perform. All concerts are being advertised on the official Almaty city website as well as on KNC’s website (*SER*, p. 63) The concerts seem very well attended (*visit to concerts*).

Students are prepared for work in the wider society through different forms of curricular practice outside the institution, such as performances in hospitals, orphanages, and subways. Students in the Musicology programme practice different oral and written forms of communication about cultural issues as well as exploring different genres of lecture practice. Students of the Art Management programme are regularly involved in various cultural projects (*SER*, p. 64; *annex 8.1.4. RU*) and act as interns in the service department for concert and artistic activities (*meeting with senior administrative staff*).

KNC engages actively with the wider cultural, artistic and educational contexts in different ways. Teachers contribute with their expertise in media, in juries etc. and both teachers and students contribute to different cultural and educational events, including a large number of concerts inside and outside of KNC. Students are thereby prepared for their future roles in society.

Given the important role music colleges play in the recruitment to KNC the review team suggests that the programmes explore ways in which they could play a bigger role as centres of expertise for the music colleges. The discontinuation of the Music Education programme, unfortunately, prevents KNC from playing a similar role in music education in general schools.

The review team wishes to commend KNC for the central role its leadership and teachers play concerning the development of national policies, legislation etc. This is an indication of the strong position KNC has acquired in Kazakh society.

**Compliance with Standard 8.1**

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 8.1 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant



Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

## 8.2 Interaction with the artistic professions

**Standard 8.2. The programme actively promotes links with various sectors of the music and other artistic professions.**

The programmes have good connections to the music profession, partly because a large percentage of the members of the profession are alumni from KNC (*meeting with employers*). Members of the profession are invited as teachers in the programmes (*meeting with Heads of Department*). The review team also observed students performing in concerts together with professional musicians already in their first year of study (*visit to a concert*).

Students are encouraged to interact with students from other specialties in ensembles and different projects as well as at KNC conferences and seminars. On occasion, students also work with performers from other art forms such as when pianists work with ballet dancers and choreographers (*SER*, p. 64). KNC is actively engaged with other creative areas through projects within the Republican Educational and Methodological Association in the Art (*SER*, p. 64). KNC also cooperates with Qazaq Ballett's scientific and creative laboratory on public lectures. According to the *SER*, there is a great potential for developing a closer interaction between KNC and different sectors within arts and culture and, therefore, a need to develop a programme in this area and to provide resources (*SER*, p. 66).

20-50% of students in all programmes combine their studies with work in their respective fields, such as different State ensembles (*SER*, p. 65). There is an internship programme with the Astana Opera and Ballet Company which is considered successful, and there are plans for more internships (*meeting with employers; meeting with Heads of Department*). Employers met by the review team were open to more partnerships.

The performance-oriented programmes assess and monitor the needs of their specialties through surveys among employers. They also invite employers to exams, concert performances etc. to provide a basis for discussions about the professional competencies of the students (*SER*, p. 66). The departments for the programmes Musicology and Art Management hold discussions of student thesis and scientific work of teachers and use this to update the content of different theory courses (*SER*, p. 66). Employers are also represented in the different organisational bodies. Employers met underlined the importance of maintaining close contact between the profession and KNC. The response they gave to the question of what advice they would give to the new Rector is indicative in this respect: "Listen, listen, listen".

In the *SER*, KNC states that it offers lifelong education opportunities to its students by offering all three cycles of education. The teachers are offered lifelong education through regular professional development opportunities as part of their contracts (*SER*, p. 66). In addition, KNC offers courses for teachers in other higher music education institutions, such as open master classes (*meeting with Vice-Rectors*; <http://conservatoire.edu.kz>).

Teachers may participate in various external creative and educational projects on their initiative (*SER*, p. 66) and students regularly engage in external creative and educational projects as part of their studies (*meeting with senior administrative staff*).

The programmes are well integrated into the cultural life of Kazakhstan and have strong links with the music profession where alumni are valued members. These links provide the programmes with valuable information and feedback as to the content and quality of the curriculum and it appears to be a well-functioning ecosystem.

Initiatives have been taken to provide internships for students. The review team suggests that such internships as well as dual education programmes could be further explored. It could be useful to develop a specific strategy for more formalised collaborations with professional organisations and institutions.

The vast majority of alumni find employment within public organisations or institutions, as there hardly seems to be a national freelance market. This situation might change as is evident in many other countries where a majority of candidates from higher music education institutions must create their jobs. Consequently, the review team would suggest that KNC considers how to prepare for a potential change in the labour market and to prepare its students for an international freelance career (See also standard 3.2.).

The review team would also suggest that KNC with its unique expertise might consider expanding its provision of lifelong education to active members of the profession,

including teachers at music colleges. Furthermore, the need for lifelong learning will be substantial if there is an increase in the freelance market, and subsequently, an increase in portfolio careers in the future.

### Compliance with Standard 8.2

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 8.2 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

### 8.3 Information provided to the public

**Standard 8.3 Information provided to the public about the programme is clear, consistent and accurate.**

The principal delivery system for information about the institution and its programmes is the KNC website <http://conservatoire.edu.kz>. It is available in Kazakh, Russian and partly in English. Students met remarked that they found the website informative when considering applying to the KNC. In addition to the website, KNC uses social media such as Facebook, Instagram and YouTube to post news about educational, scientific and creative activities. There are also information stands on the premises (*SER*, p. 67).

The information is provided by the participants in the activity themselves to ensure that it is consistent with the programmes. It is submitted for review and approval by the relevant

management such as Head of Department or Vice-Rector for the area of activity. The Public Relations department then publishes the information on the website or the relevant social media platform (*SER*, p. 67). To ensure reliability, key information is supported by scanned officially registered documents and documentary evidence such as videos (*SER*, p. 67).

The accuracy and reliability of the information is ensured by the requirement to comply with internal regulations concerning information (*Link*: “Information Policy Regulations” *SER*, p. 67) The regulations emphasise the key principles of information; transparency and openness, (*SER*, p. 67). Ethical considerations are ensured through the requirement to comply with the internal ethical standards (*Link*: “Code of Academic Integrity” *SER*, p. 67).

The website contains information about many relevant aspects of quality assurance such as concert activities, teachers’ qualifications and achievements, results of external evaluation procedures and accreditations, international mobility and results of surveys.

There are robust procedures in place to ensure that information to the public is accurate and transparent. This includes a dedicated information policy department and specified regulations concerning information policy.

The website provides easily accessible information about important aspects concerning the programmes including curriculum, teacher qualifications, results of surveys and other aspects of quality assurance. In addition, KNC also uses social media to communicate with the public. Parts of the website are in English, but to gain more international visibility and promote international exchange a larger proportion should ideally be accessible in English.

**Compliance with Standard 8.3**

On the basis of the information in the SER, further documentation including annexes and the meetings during the site-visit, the review team finds the programmes compliant with MusiQuE Standard 8.3 as follows:

Programmes	Compliance level
Bachelor in Art Management	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Composition	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Conducting	Fully compliant

Bachelor in Instrumental Performance	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Musicology	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Traditional Musical Art	Fully compliant
Bachelor in Vocal Art	Fully compliant

# Summary of the compliance with the Standards and recommendations

The review team concludes that the KNC programmes comply with the *Standards for Programme Review* as follows:

1. Programme’s goals and context	
<b>Standard 1.</b> The programme goals are clearly stated and reflect the institutional mission.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestion:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Include more contemporary music in the programmes.</li> </ul>	
2. Educational processes	
<b>Standard 2.1.</b> The goals of the programme are achieved through the content and structure of the curriculum and its methods of delivery.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestions:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Involve students in curriculum development.</li> <li>- Explore ways to encourage students’ independence and critical thinking.</li> <li>- Extend students’ choice of study profile.</li> <li>- Enhance integration between the composition programme and other programmes.</li> <li>- Strengthen students’ opportunities for presenting their work and engaging in professional practice.</li> </ul>	
<b>Standard 2.2.</b> The programme offers a range of opportunities for students to gain an international perspective.	<b>Substantially compliant</b>
<b>Recommendations:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Focus on foreign language acquisition, in particular English.</li> <li>- Provide more funding for international exchange in the region for students and teachers in the Traditional Musical Art programme.</li> <li>- Provide more funding for teachers’ international activities.</li> <li>- Alert the relevant authorities to the negative impact of national regulations hindering the employment of international teachers.</li> </ul>	
<b>Suggestion:</b>	



<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Include as a learning outcome the knowledge of foreign music in all programmes.</li> </ul>	
<b>Standard 2.3.</b> Assessment methods are clearly defined and demonstrate achievement of learning outcomes.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>3. Student profiles</b>	
<b>Standard 3.1.</b> There are clear criteria for student admission, based on an assessment of their artistic/academic suitability for the programme.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestion:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Strengthen the dialogue with music colleges and offer more support.</li> </ul>	
<b>Standard 3.2.</b> The programme has mechanisms to formally monitor and review the progression, achievement and subsequent employability of its students.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestions:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Consider how to prepare students for portfolio careers including developing entrepreneurial skills.</li> <li>- Consider a greater emphasis on leadership skills in the Art Management programme.</li> </ul>	
<b>4. Teaching staff</b>	
<b>Standard 4.1.</b> Members of the teaching staff are qualified for their role and are active as artists/pedagogues/ researchers.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestion:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Explore ways to enhance the development of students' critical and independent thinking as part of the learning and teaching process.</li> </ul>	
<b>Standard 4.2.</b> There are sufficient qualified teaching staff to effectively deliver the programme.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>5. Facilities, resources and support</b>	

<b>Standard 5.1.</b> The institution has appropriate resources to support student learning and delivery of the programme.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Standard 5.2.</b> The institution's financial resources enable successful delivery of the programme.	
<b>Substantially compliant</b>	
<b>Recommendations:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Secure more funding for key support staff, instruments, research, and international activities.</li> </ul>	
<b>Standard 5.3.</b> The programme has sufficient qualified support staff.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestion:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Provide financially attractive positions for accompanists.</li> </ul>	
<b>6. Communication, organisation and decision-making</b>	
<b>Standard 6.1.</b> Effective mechanisms are in place for internal communication within the programme.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Standard 6.2</b> The programme is supported by an appropriate organisational structure and decision-making processes.	
<b>Fully compliant</b>	
<b>Suggestion:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Consider strengthening student democracy by including an independent student body as part of the organisational structure and letting students elect their own representatives.</li> </ul>	
<b>7. Internal quality culture</b>	
<b>Standard 7.</b> The programme has in place effective quality assurance and enhancement procedures.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestion:</b>	

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Explore different quality enhancement measures in order to develop a quality culture.</li> </ul>	
<b>8. Public interaction</b>	
<b>Standard 8.1.</b> The programme engages within wider cultural, artistic and educational contexts.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestion:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Explore how the programmes could serve as centres of expertise for music colleges.</li> </ul>	
<b>Standard 8.2.</b> The programme actively promotes links with various sectors of the music and other artistic professions.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestions:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Further develop the use of internships and dual education.</li> <li>- Consider possible consequences for the study programmes of a more portfolio-based labour market.</li> <li>- Consider providing more lifelong learning opportunities for members of the profession.</li> </ul>	
<b>Standard 8.3.</b> Information provided to the public about the programme is clear, consistent and accurate.	<b>Fully compliant</b>
<b>Suggestion:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Further develop the KNC English website.</li> </ul>	

## Conclusion and perspectives

Since the MusiQuE review of 2016 and after becoming a full AEC member in 2019, KNC has conducted a major operation in implementing the AEC Learning Outcomes across all Bachelor programmes. Through our study of the SER and our site-visit, which included sessions with management, teachers, students and representatives of the profession, we have been able to verify the comprehensive nature of this operation. We are impressed with the great amount of work that has been done, and equally impressed with the awareness across the organisation about the process that has brought KNC to this point. We have concluded that KNC is an excellent institution offering excellent education resulting in excellent alumni. Furthermore, KNC is an institution with comprehensive connections to the professional field and society as a whole. Our observations, analyses and qualification of the standards speak for themselves.

The recent developments that have been so successfully implemented can be seen as an exciting path towards a sustainable and inspiring future. We have allowed ourselves some thoughts and suggestions that might be considered for the longer term. Some of these suggestions would not only involve policy choices and commitment, but also considerable financial resources. We hope that the relationship between the KNC and the relevant ministries will be characterised by the notion that KNC has a unique position as a valuable asset and promotor of Kazakh culture. Consequently, KNC deserves the appropriate support to fulfil its potential, educationally, artistically and internationally. It is of course up to KNC and the relevant state institutions to determine the choices that will shape its future.

### **Educational Culture**

The KNC leadership has made a clear decision to adopt the AEC Learning Outcomes and develop the international orientation of the KNC. This is a sign of visionary leadership under which this operation has been initiated and conducted right from the top down into the other layers of the organisation. However, if we look at the spirit of the Dublin Descriptors and the AEC Learning Outcomes, they also speak of the personal and individual ownership of the students and teachers within the frame of admission requirements, subject descriptions, the curriculum, tests, exams and learning outcomes. This implies responsibility and ownership by students and teachers who shape the teaching and learning on a day-to-day basis. Developments initiated and shaped by them could be seen as 'bottom up'. We anticipate that the top down implementation as well as bottom up initiatives and contributions to KNC's exciting developments will result in an ongoing process of enhancement and of a trustful culture with ownership by all that continues to

grow. Such a culture has, of course, a formal, administrative framework, but also an indispensable informal and personal nature in which feedback and growth are as natural as the air we breathe, not just the tasks we commit ourselves to.

### **General Music Education**

The importance of KNC within Kazakhstan musical life and musical cultural is pivotal. KNC is not just a conservatory but also a centre of expertise which influences and shapes musical practice across Kazakhstan. Part of a musical ecology is general music education in which all children learn the understanding and practice of music as a language. Professional music practice depends on the appreciation and the understanding of an audience. We have come to appreciate the audience as a co-creator and co-partner in the practice of professional music making. Therefore, we hope KNC can keep playing an important role in the practice of general music education, even though the academic programme of music education will be placed elsewhere.

### **Strategic positioning and possible consequences**

The active membership of the AEC and the adoption of the AEC Learning Outcomes can be seen as a forceful choice towards internationalisation. This brings about questions on strategic positioning of the KNC, with national and international dimensions. Historically, KNC was founded by Russian musicians escaping the Second World War, resulting in a high level and flourishing practice of European Classical Music in Kazakhstan today. The other, and unique, pillar of KNC is its traditional musical art department which constitutes a unique asset, not only to KNC as an institution but to Kazakhstan as a nation. Then there is the geographical position in Central Asia, between major powers such as Russia and China. In the recognition and understanding of this geographical (and cultural as well as political) position of Kazakhstan lies its potential greater success. The process described above could be seen as a choice to become an active part within the realm of European Higher Music Education. This positive development should not overshadow the national importance, and the important connections within the region as well as eastward towards Southeast Asia. Perhaps the membership of AEC could be complemented with one of SEADOM. Kazakhstan and KNC in particular have the potential to play a unique and leading role in connecting Central Asian culture and music practices with those in Europe, the Americas as well as with those in Asia. In building bridges between these practices and the traditional music of Kazakhstan will serve as a unique asset. Exchanges and bridge building will only succeed if they take place in a reciprocal way. For a true international practice of KNC, it might consider developing from a bilingual practice (Kazakh and Russian) into a trilingual one (Kazakh, Russian and English). If all management, students

and teachers and all administration communication would be trilingual, KNC can become a key player in global development in music and music education. At the same time, KNC can safeguard and develop the nation's own distinctive musical heritage and make its national music treasure a source of inspiration to others. We realise it would take a great deal of effort to develop and implement English language fluency across the KNC, but its reward would be massive.

A sustainable music practice requires a knowledge and flourishing practice of our musical heritage, be it classical or traditional music. However, its future depends on the development and the renewal of those practices and the making of new music in which the existing practices feed into. Current compositional practice in Kazakhstan and those within the KNC seem relatively unconnected to musical developments in Europe, the Americas and Asia that have taken place over the past decades. Kazakh music might benefit from further knowledge of these compositional developments and from entering into the international discourse of contemporary music. Kazakhstan's own traditional music would be a contributing and inspiring force in such an international exchange and discourse. The same goes for the ongoing cross fertilisation between pop(ular) music and art music currently happening globally. In short, KNC would benefit from international reciprocal exchanges on a much larger scale than it has been able to realise up to now. We hope the means can be found to make this happen.

**Based on the compliance with MusiQuE standards, it is proposed that the programmes be accredited.**

## Annex 1. Site-visit schedule

Meeting
Review Team meeting
Break/Lunch/Dinner or Social activities/free time

**Institution address:** Kazakh National Conservatoire Abylai Khan Ave 90 Abylai Khan Avenue., corner Karasai Batyr St., Almaty 050000, Kazakhstan

Day 1 – (16/05/2023)			
Time	Meeting (working session)	Participants of the meeting (names and positions of the participants from the visited institution)	Location
13:00-14:00	Lunch as proposed by the institution	Review Team alone	KKNC facilities
14:00-18:00	<i>Preparatory meeting of the Review Team</i>		Conference hall (No. 103) building B
18:00-19:00	Traditional music concert with students and undergraduates in the "Traditional Music Art" programme		Small Hall named after A. Zhubanov
19:30 -	Dinner	Review Team alone	

Day 2 – (17/05/2023)

Time	Meeting (working session)	Participants of the meeting (names and positions of the participants from the visited institution)	Location
09:00-09:30	<b>Review Team meeting</b>		Conference hall (No. 103)  building B
09:30–11:00	<b>Meeting 1</b>  <i>Meeting with representatives responsible of the programme(s)/management of the institution (Rector, Vice Rectors, Deans)</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Arman Zhudebayev</b> - Rector, Honored Worker of Kazakhstan, Master;</li> <li>2. <b>Galiya Begembetova</b> - Vice-Rector for Scientific and Creative Activities and International Cooperation, Candidate of Art History (PhD), Associate Professor;</li> <li>3. <b>Gulnar Abdrakhman</b> - Vice-Rector for Academic and Methodical Work, Candidate of Art History (PhD);</li> <li>4. <b>Mukhambet Eshmukhanov</b> - Vice-Rector for educational and social work;</li> <li>5. <b>Aizhan Bekenova</b> - Dean of “Instrumental Performance”, Associate Professor (Academic), Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Master;</li> <li>6. <b>Tulepbergen Tokzhanov</b> - Dean of the Faculty of “Folk Music”, Professor (Academic), Associate Professor, Honored Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, cultural figure;</li> <li>7. <b>Gulmira Musagulova</b> - Dean of the Faculty of “Musicology, Art Management and Social and Humanitarian Disciplines”, Professor (Academic), Associate Professor, Candidate</li> </ol>	Conference hall (No. 103)  building B



		of Art History; 8. <b>Aizada Nusupova</b> - Dean of the Faculty of “Vocal, Conducting and Music Education”, Associate Professor, Candidate of Art History	
11:00-11:15	<b>Review Team meeting</b> <i>Review Team members share conclusions with Secretary</i>		Conference hall (No. 103) building B
11:15-12:45	<b>Meeting 2</b> <i>Meeting with department heads responsible for curriculum development, syllabi and examination assessment - group 1</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Marlena Koilybayeva</b> – Head of the Department of “Musicology and Composition”, Associate Professor (Academic), Doctor of Philosophy (PhD);</li> <li>2. <b>Aigerim Karsakpayeva</b> - Head of the department "Kobyz and Bayan", Senior Lecturer, Master of Arts;</li> <li>3. <b>Tanagul Beknazarova</b> - Head of the department "Vocal Art", Senior Lecturer, Master of Arts, excellent student in the field of culture;</li> <li>4. <b>Sagatbek Kaliev</b> - Head of the department "Art Management", Senior Lecturer, Candidate of Art History;</li> <li>5. <b>Alima Kairbekova</b> - Head of the Social and Humanitarian Disciplines department, Professor (Academician), Associate Professor, Doctor of Philosophical Sciences;</li> <li>6. <b>Dinara Nurbayeva</b> - Head of the department "Dombra", Senior Lecturer, Master of Arts, excellent student in the field of culture;</li> <li>7. <b>Kamila Esdauletova</b> - Head of the Department of “Music Education and Psychology”</li> </ol>	Conference hall (No. 103) building B
12:45-13:00	<b>Review Team meeting</b>		Conference hall (No. 103)

	<i>Review Team members share conclusions with Secretary</i>		building B
13:00-14:00	Lunch as proposed by the institution	Review Team alone	
14:00-15:15	<b>Meeting 3</b> <i>Senior administrative staff</i> <i>Presentation of the Platonus programme</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Nesibeli Yertaeva</b> - Head of Planning and Organization of Educational Process;</li> <li>2. <b>Gulnara Kasymova</b> - Head of Financial Department;</li> <li>3. <b>Yermek Skakov</b> - Head of Rector's Office;</li> <li>4. <b>Galiya Baygunusova</b> - Head of Scientific and Information Library Service;</li> <li>5. <b>Ainur Ayazbayeva</b> - Head of Concert Service</li> </ol> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Damir Urazymbetov</b> - Head of Quality Management Sector;</li> <li>2. <b>Shyryn Amanzholova</b> - Scientific Secretary;</li> <li>3. <b>Zhaniya Warren</b> - Head of International Department;</li> <li>4. <b>Asem Sadykova</b> - Head of HR Department;</li> <li>5. <b>Orynbasar Tlegenova</b> - Head of the legal sector</li> </ol>	Conference hall (No. 103) building B  Room No. 102 building B
15:15-15:30	<b>Review Team meeting</b> <i>Review Team members share conclusions with Secretary (debriefing)</i>		
15:30-15:45	Break		
15:45-17:00	<b>Visiting the library -</b> Meeting with the member of staff in charge of the library	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Galiya Baigunusova</b> - Head of Scientific and Information Library Service;</li> <li>2. <b>Miragul Zhamiyeva</b> - Head of the department of maintenance and storage of the library fund;</li> <li>3. <b>Firuza Akylbek</b> - Head of the department of electronic resources of the library.</li> </ol>	Library building A, B.

17:00-18:00	<b>Review Team meeting</b> <i>Reflection on the first day and preparations for day 2</i>	
18:00-19:00	Master class People's Artist of the Republic of Kazakhstan, State Prize Laureate, Professor, Head of Conducting Department, holder of "Parasat" and "Kurmet" Order B.A. Zhamanbaev	Chamber hall building A
19:15	Dinner	

Day 3 – (18/05/2023)			
Time	Meeting (working session)	Participants of the meeting (names and positions of the participants from the visited institution)	Location
9:00–09:15	<b>Review Team meeting</b>		Conference hall (No. 103) building B
9:15–10:30	<b>Meeting 4</b> <i>Meeting with students</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Taisia Zhanuzakova</b> - 4th year, Program "Musicology and Composition", Specialty "Musicology";</li> <li>2. <b>Aubakirova Anel</b> - 2nd year student, Program/Specialty "Art Management»</li> <li>3. <b>Shin Daniel</b> – 3rd year, Program "Musicology and composition", Specialty "Composition";</li> <li>4. <b>Gani Makar</b> - 3rd year, Program "Vocal art", Specialty "Opera singing";</li> <li>5. <b>Adlet Malika</b> - 1st year, Program "Conducting", Specialty "Orchestral Conducting";</li> </ol>	Conference hall (No. 103) building B

		<p>6. <b>Imangalieva Aktolkyn</b> - 3rd year, Program "Conducting", Specialty "Choral conducting"</p> <p>1. <b>Baikozha Kamila</b> - 4th year, Program "Wind and percussion instruments", Specialty "Oboe";</p> <p>2. <b>Kydimurat Asel</b> - 4th year, Program "Traditional Music Art", Specialty "Kyl kobyz";</p> <p>3. <b>Uzakbay Nurbolat</b> - 4th year, Program "Traditional Music Art", Specialty "Folk singing";</p> <p>4. <b>Dastan Kazkenov</b> - 4th year, Program "Traditional Music Art", Specialty "Dombyra";</p> <p>5. <b>Berdnik Kristina</b> - 4th year, Program "Instrumental Performance", Specialty "Voltorna";</p> <p>6. <b>Ainel Tulepova</b> - 4th year, Program "Instrumental Performance", Specialty "Piano"</p>	<p>Room No. 102 building B</p>
10:30-10:45	<p><b>Review Team meeting</b></p> <p><i>Review Team members share conclusions with Secretary (debriefing)</i></p>		<p>Conference hall (No. 103) building B</p>
10:45-11:00	Break		
11:00-12:30	Exam Attendance	<p>1. "Conducting", (discipline "Choral class") at 10:00, 1st year - teacher. Rudkovsky Ya.S., Associate Professor (Academician), Master of Arts, Honored Worker of Kazakhstan;</p> <p>2. "Traditional Musical Art" (Dombyra), (discipline "Ensemble") at 10:00, 2nd year, - teacher. Alina A.K., Senior Lecturer, Master of Arts;</p> <p>3. "Traditional Musical Art" (Folk Singing), (discipline</p>	<p>308 room</p> <p>317 room</p>

		<p>"Specialty") at 10:00, 2nd year, -Department of "Folk Singing";</p> <p>4. "Vocal art", (discipline "Chamber class") at 10:00, 3.4 course - Department of "Vocal art";</p> <p>5. "Ethnomusicology", (discipline "History of modern Kazakh music") at 10:00, 3rd year - teacher. Nusupova A.S., Dean of the Faculty of Vocal, Conducting and Musical Education, Associate Professor, Candidate of Art History;</p> <p>6. "Musicology", (discipline "Methodology and practice of writing a research paper") at 10:00, 3rd year - teacher Berdibay A.R., Associate Professor (Academic), Doctor of Philosophy (PhD).</p>	<p>100 B room</p> <p>Chamber hall</p> <p>221 room</p> <p>225 room</p>
12:30-12:45	<p><b>Review Team meeting</b></p> <p><i>Review Team members share conclusions with Secretary (debriefing)</i></p>		<p>Conference hall (No. 103)</p> <p>building B</p>
12:45-13:45	Lunch as proposed by the institution	Review Team alone	
13:45-15:15	<p><b>Meeting 5</b></p> <p><i>Meeting with representatives of the teaching staff</i></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Adalat Yusupova</b> - Senior Lecturer of the Department of "Vocal Art", Master;</li> <li><b>Akmaral Emreeva</b> - Lecturer at the Department of "String Instruments", Master of Arts;</li> <li><b>Tamara Satybaldina</b> - Professor of the Faculty of "Social Sciences and Humanities" (Academician), Associate Professor, Candidate of Philosophical Sciences;</li> </ol>	<p>Conference hall (No. 103)</p> <p>building B</p>

		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. <b>Marina Ivanova</b> - Senior Lecturer of the Department of “Ensemble Art”;</li> <li>5. <b>Zhanat Ermanov</b> - Professor of the Department of “Wind and Percussion Instruments”, Honored Worker of Kazakhstan</li> </ol> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Aizhan Berdybai</b> - Associate Professor of the Department of “Musicology and Composition” (Academic), Doctor of Philosophy (PhD);</li> <li>2. <b>Karima Sakharbayeva</b> - Professor of the “Dombra” Department, Honored Worker of Kazakhstan, Excellence in Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan;</li> <li>3. <b>Valeria Nedlina</b> - Senior Lecturer of the “Musicology and Composition” Department, Associate Professor (Academic), Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) ;</li> <li>4. <b>Dinara Keshubaeva</b> - Senior Lecturer of the “Art Management” Department, Master</li> </ol>	Room No. 102 building B
15:15-15:30	<b>Review Team meeting:</b> <i>Review Team members share conclusions with Secretary (debriefing)</i>		Conference hall (No. 103) building B
15:30-15:45	Break		
15:45-17:00	<b>Meeting 6</b> Meeting with alumni and employers	<b>Employers:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Gulsara Balpanova</b> - Deputy Director for teaching and methodological work at the Tchaikovsky Music College;</li> <li>2. <b>Medet Kuanyshev</b> - Director of the Kurmangazy orchestra;</li> <li>3. <b>Saniya Ospankulova</b> - Deputy Director of</li> </ol>	Conference hall (No. 103) building B

		<p>A.Zhubanov Music School;</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. <b>Togzhan Karmenova</b> - Deputy Director of Almaty Seleznev Choreographic School;</li> <li>5. <b>Svetlana Surapbergenova</b> - Deputy Director of Music Department of K.Baiseitova Musical School;</li> <li>6. <b>Fatima Dzhumagulova</b> - Director of the Kamerata of Kazakhstan orchestra;</li> <li>7. <b>Nurbakyt Bokybayev</b> – Director of Kazakh National Opera and Ballet Theatre</li> </ol> <p><b>The alumni:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Tair Karataev</b> - Head of the State Academic Dance Theater of the Republic of Kazakhstan;</li> <li>2. <b>Arthur Orenburgsky</b> - Professor of the Department "Variety Orchestra Instruments" KazNAA named after T. Zhurgenov;</li> <li>3. <b>Gaziza Gabdrakhimova</b> - Head of the group "The Magic of Nomads";</li> <li>4. <b>Tokmurzieva Dinara</b> - Teacher of the music school named after K. Baiseitova</li> <li>5. <b>Abylserik Araylym</b> - Teacher of the Music College named after P. Tchaikovsky;</li> <li>6. <b>Shnarov Azamat</b> - Artist of the Kurmangazy Orchestra</li> <li>7. <b>Alisher Damira</b> - is a teacher at the Tchaikovsky Music College;</li> <li>8. <b>Shakhnoza Rozbakieva</b> - Tchaikovsky Music College teacher;</li> <li>9. <b>Sadvakasov Darhan</b> - artist of "Camerata Kazakhstan" orchestra;</li> <li>10. <b>Turlanova Bakhyt</b> - head of vocal department of the Republican Variety and Circus College;</li> <li>11. <b>Zhibek Moldakarimova</b> - Head of Choral</li> </ol>	<p>All participants have already been invited</p> <p>Room No. 102 building B</p>
--	--	--	--

		<p>Conducting Department of K.Baisaitova Musical School;</p> <p>12. <b>Alla Zubkova</b> - Head of Music Theory, History and Composition Department of K.Baiseitova Musical School;</p> <p>13. <b>Kadisha Onalbayeva</b> - is a composer and professor at the University of Mobile, Alabama, Stenway Artist (USA).</p>	
17:00-17:30	<p><b>Review Team meeting:</b></p> <p><i>Review Team members share conclusions with Secretary (debriefing)</i></p>		<p>Conference hall (No. 103)</p> <p>building B</p>
18:00	Instrumental music concert with undergraduate and graduate students		<p>Big Hall named after</p> <p>E. Rakhmadiyev</p>
19:00	Dinner	Review Team alone	

Day 4 – (19/05/2023)			
Time	Meeting (working session)	Participants of the meeting (names and positions of the participants from the visited institution)	Location
09:00-09:15	<p><b>Review Team meeting</b></p> <p><i>Preparation for the feedback meeting</i></p>		<p>Conference hall (No. 103)</p> <p>building B</p>



9:15–10:45	<b>Meeting 7</b> Meeting with heads of departments responsible for curriculum development, syllabi and examination assessment - group 2	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Amangeldy Kuzeubay</b> - Head of the "Folk Singing" Department, Associate Professor (academician), Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), excellent student in the field of culture;</li> <li>2. <b>Bazargali Zhamanbaev</b> - Head of the "Conducting" Department, Associate Professor of the "Conducting" Department, Professor, People's Artist of the Kazakh USSR;</li> <li>3. <b>Saule Medeubaeva</b> - Head of the "Chamber Ensemble" Department, Professor (academician);</li> <li>4. <b>Dinara Aidarkhanova</b> - Head of the "General Piano" Department;</li> <li>5. <b>Olesya Nesterova</b> – Head of the "Wind and Percussion Instruments" Department, Senior Lecturer, Doctor of Philosophy (PhD);</li> <li>6. <b>Irina Gavrilenko</b> - Head of the "Piano" Department, Master of Arts;</li> <li>7. <b>Gaukhar Murzabekova</b> - Head of the "String Instruments" Department, Professor, People's Artist of Kazakhstan.</li> </ol>	Conference hall (No. 103) building B
10:45-11:00	Break		
11:00-13:00	<b>Review Team meeting</b> <i>Preparation for the feedback meeting</i>		Conference hall (No. 103) building B
13:00-14:00	Lunch as proposed by the institution	Review Team alone	
14:00-15:30	<b>Meeting 8</b> Feedback to the institution	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Arman Zhudebayev</b> - Rector, Honored Worker of Kazakhstan, Master;</li> <li>2. <b>Galiya Begembetova</b> - Vice-Rector for Scientific and Creative Activities and International Cooperation, Candidate of Art History (PhD), Associate Professor;</li> </ol>	Conference hall (No. 103) building B

		<p>3. <b>Gulnar Abdrakhman</b> - Vice-Rector for Academic and Methodical Work, Candidate of Art History (PhD);</p> <p>4. <b>Mukhambet Eshmukhanov</b> - Vice-Rector for educational and social work;</p> <p>5. <b>Aizhan Bekenova</b> - Dean of “Instrumental Performance”, Associate Professor (Academic), Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Master;</p> <p>6. <b>Tulepbergen Tokzhanov</b> - Dean of the Faculty of “Folk Music”, Professor (Academic), Associate Professor, Honored Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, cultural figure;</p> <p>7. <b>Gulmira Musagulova</b> - Dean of the Faculty of “Musicology, Art Management and Social and Humanitarian Disciplines”, Professor (Academic), Associate Professor, Candidate of Art History;</p> <p>8. <b>Aizada Nusupova</b> - Dean of the Faculty of “Vocal, Conducting and Music Education”, Associate Professor, Candidate of Art History;</p>	
15:30	End of the site-visit		
15:30-16:00	Break		
16:00-17:00	<p><b>Meeting 9</b></p> <p><i>Private meeting with the Chairman and Secretary of the Review Team</i></p>	<p><b>Arman Zhudebayev</b> - Rector, Honored Worker of Kazakhstan, Master;</p> <p>Conservatory employee responsible for writing the self-evaluation report</p>	<p>Conference hall (No. 103)</p> <p>building B</p>
18:30	Concert of students and teachers of the AP Vocal Art		Big Hall named after

		E. Rakhmadiyev
--	--	----------------

## Annex 2. List of documents provided to the review team

### *Annexes and supporting documents in English (EN)*

- The structure of the Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory
- [2022-2025 Internationalization strategy](#)
- [First-year students' guide](#)
- [Educational program “Instrumental performance”](#)
- [Educational program “Traditional musical art”](#)
- [Educational program “Art management”](#)
- [Educational program “Conducting”](#)
- [List of students participating in external academic mobility program](#)
- [Program for foreign students adaptation to the conditions of study at Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory](#)
- [Regulation for implementing research and development results in the academic process](#)
- [Methodological instructions for the implementation and registration of the graduation thesis/project \(for all academic programs\)](#)[Learning outcomes evaluation policy](#)
- [Human resources management policy](#)
- [Appeal Board regulations](#)
- [Regulations on alumni association](#)
- [Questionnaire student satisfaction assessment](#)
- [Regulations of educational, methodological work and practice](#)

0.4 IAAR accreditation certificate for 2019:

0.6 "Gold Star of Quality" diploma according to the results of the IAAR Eurasian Rating – 2022

1.1 [Program \(strategy\) for the development of the Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory for 2019-2025](#)

1.2 [Report on the progress of the 2022 development strategy](#)

1.3 [List of faculties and departments](#)

1.4 [Entry requirements educational program “Musicology”](#)

1.5 [Entry requirements educational program “Composition”](#)

1.6 [Entry requirements educational program “Art management”](#)

1.7 [Entry requirements educational program “Piano”](#)



- 1.8 [Entry requirements educational program “Stringed instruments, classical guitar”](#)
- 1.9 [Entry requirements educational program “Wind and percussion instruments”](#)
- 1.10 [Entry requirements educational program “Accordion”](#)
- 1.13 [Entry requirements educational program “Kyk-kobyz”](#)
- 1.16 [Entry requirements educational program “Traditional singing”](#)
- 1.17 [Entry requirements educational program “Vocal art”](#)
- 1.18 [Entry requirements educational program “Conducting”](#)
- 1.19 [Regulations on Academic Committee](#)
- 1.20 [Academic Council structure](#)
- 1.28 [Regulations on questionnaires at Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory](#)
- 2.1.1 [Catalog of elective disciplines of accredited educational programs](#)
- 2.1.2 [Educational program "Vocal Art"](#)
- 2.1.20 [Educational program "Composition](#)
- 2.2.1 [Educational program "Musicology"](#)
- 2.2.5 [Academic mobility on the Erasmus+ program](#)
- 2.2.10 Master classes and concert program of the performing arts educational program teaching staff at the Higher Conservatory of Music (Vigo, Spain)
- 4.1.1 Academic teaching staff rating regulations
- 4.1.3 Qualitative structure of the teaching staff
- 8.1.1 Brochures from scientific conferences and forums on culture and education

### ***Annexes and supporting documents in Kazakh (KZ)***

- [Curriculum of Bachelor programmes](#)
- 0.1 Order "On the structure of working groups for drafting a self-evaluation report" for academic programs
- 0.2. Minutes of the Meeting of the Academic Council No. 5 dated December 28, on the educational programs self-evaluation report
- 0.5 Certificate of accreditation of the Conservatory for scientific activities in 2022
- 1.1 Extract from the minutes on the approval of the updated Program (strategy) of the university development
- 1.4 Order of the Rector on the structure of academic committees for the 2022-2023 academic year
- 1.6 Minutes of the meeting of the Academic Committee No. 07 dated February 24, 2022 on the approval of undergraduate academic programs
- 2.1.3 Poster of the students - composers gala concert
- 4.1.5 Documents from joint creative projects of teaching staff

4.1.6 Methodological assistance to colleges

4.2.2 Certificates of advanced training of teaching staff in the field of digital technologies

8.1.5 Brochures showing participation of students in city and republican events

### *Annexes and supporting documents in Russian (RU)*

- [Regulation on recognition of non-formal education results](#)
- [Information on the vacancies of the teaching staff and researchers at Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory](#)
- [Academic integrity code](#)
- Document on the recognition of learning outcomes
- [Attestation of the auxiliary academic staff](#)
- [Internal labor discipline](#)
- Certificates of achievements of teaching staff
- [On Republican contest of students scientific and research works](#)
- [Information policy regulations](#)

0.3 Licenses for educational activities of the university

1.2 Regulations on dual-diploma education at Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory

1.3 [Rules for admission to study at the Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory](#)

1.5 Extract from the minutes of the meeting of the MAMF EMC and the SHS on the approval of the Musicology academic program

1.7 The structure of the Academic Council for the 2022-2023 academic year

2.1.4 Poster of the lecture: "Pipe Organ and Modern Music", aimed at eliminating the existing gaps among students in creating music for the pipe organ

2.1.5 Master classes and meetings with prominent representatives of the industry

2.1.6 Online lectures, classes in the form of webinars using software

2.1.7 Teaching staff class concerts with the participation of students

2.1.9 Documentation on participation of teaching staff and students in various international projects

2.1.15 [Certificates of research work results implementation in the educational process of the "Musicology" educational program](#)

2.1.16 I.S. Khodzhabekov's book: "Symphonic picture in the work of Kazakhstani composers"

2.1.17 [Certificates for implementing the research results into the educational process of the "Instrumental Performance" educational program](#)

2.1.18 [Certificates for introducing the research results into the educational process of the "Art Management" educational program](#)



2.1.19 [Certificates for introducing the research results into the educational process of the "Traditional Musical Art" educational program](#)

2.2.4 Cooperation agreements with research institutes

2.2.6 Documents informing about performing arts educational programme teaching staff acting as chairmen and jury members of international contests

2.2.7 Performing arts educational program teaching staff - members of international organizations

2.2.8 Master classes of the performing arts educational program teaching staff

2.2.9 Individual Study Plan (Piano)

2.2.21 S. Nurgaliyeva Academic and Educational Manual

3.2.2 [Policy of evaluation of learning outcomes](#)

4.1.2 [Information on teaching staff advanced training](#)

4.1.7 Students survey results

5.1.1 Library resources: contracts

8.1.3 Lecture practice of the "Musicology" educational programme students

8.1.4 Brochures showing participation of students in projects outside the Conservatory

### Annex 3. Definitions of compliance levels

- **Fully compliant.** *A standard is fully compliant when the approaches, structures or mechanisms relevant to that standard are fully implemented in a coherent and consistent way.*
- **Substantially compliant.** *A standard is substantially compliant when the standard is in place, while minor gaps have been observed but the manner of implementation is mostly effective. In such cases Review Teams are asked to include a recommendation as to how full compliance can be achieved.*
- **Partially compliant.** *A standard is partially compliant when the standard is in place, while significant gaps have been observed or the manner of implementation is not sufficiently effective. In such cases Review Teams are asked to include a recommendation as to how full compliance can be achieved or a condition\*.*
- **Not compliant.** *A standard is not compliant when the approaches, structures or mechanisms relevant to that standard are lacking or implemented inadequately. In such cases Review Teams are asked to include a strong recommendation or a condition\*.*

*(\*Please note that conditions can only be formulated in accreditation reports and not in quality enhancement review reports.)*