

Evaluation Report for the Accreditation of Study Programmes offered by

the School of International Business and Business Administration, the School of Applied Economics and Commerce, the International Institute of Administration, the School of Business and International Proficiency, the International Institute of Energy Policy and Diplomacy (MIEP), and the Master's Programme Department of
MGIMO University, Moscow

Name of Programme	Degree Awarded	ECTS credit points	Programme duration	Type of programme	Annual admission capacity	Taught in
Management	Bachelor of Management	240	4 years	Full-time	60	Russian
Public and Municipal Administration	Bachelor of Public and Municipal Administration	240	4 years	Full-time	40	Russian
Commerce	Bachelor in Commerce	240	4 years	Full-time	25	Russian
International Environmental Policy and Management	Bachelor of Environmental Policy and Management	240	4 years	Full-time	25	Russian
International Business	Master of Management	120	2 years	Full-time	25	Russian
International R&D Management	Master of Management	120	2 years	Full-time	15	Russian
Management and Marketing of Foreign Economic Activities	Master of Management	120	2 years	Full-time	15	Russian

Name of Programme	Degree Awarded	ECTS credit points	Programme duration	Type of programme	Annual admission capacity	Taught in
Management of Military and Technical Cooperation in Hi-Tech (w/ Russian Technologies State Corp.)	Master of Management	120	2 years	Full-time	15	Russian
Public and Municipal Administration	Master of Management	120	2 years	Full-time	25	Russian
International Management (w/ ICN Nancy)	Master of Management	120	2 years	Full-time	30	French, English, Russian
MIEX Master in International Management (w/ ICN Nancy, Bologna Univ., et al.)	Master of Management	120	2 years	Full-time	15	Russian, Italian, French
International Business in the Oil and Gas Sector (w/ Univ. of Nordland, Norway)	M.Sc. in Management	120	2 years	Full-time	15	English
Sustainable Development and Strategic Management in Energy (w/ Univ. of St. Andrews, UK)	M.Sc. in Economics	120	2 years	Full-time	20	English
International Business in the Oil and Gas Sector (w/ ROSNEFT)	MBA	120	2 years	Part-time	25	Russian
Master of Business Administration	MBA	120	2 years	Part-time	15	Russian

Date of on-site talks at MGIMO University: 3-6 December 2012

Contact person (MGIMO University): Alexandra Khudaykulova, Ph.D., Vice-Rector for Educational Program Development, MGIMO University, 76, Prospect Vernadskogo, Moscow, 119454, Tel. (495) 434 92 93, email khudaykulova@mgimo.ru

Responsible project officer (ZEvA): Dr. Jürgen Petersen

Expert Panel:

- **Prof. Dr Nicola Fohrer**, Professor for Hydrology and Water Resources Management, Head of the Department of Hydrology and Water Resources Management, Kiel University, Germany
- **Prof. Dr Ulli Arnold**, Professor for Business Administration, University of Stuttgart, Germany
- **Prof. Dr Manfred Röber**, Professor for Administration Management and New Public Management, University of Leipzig, Germany
- **Prof. Dr Andreas Fürst**, Professor for Business Administration and Marketing, University Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany
- **Mr Elchin Guliev**, Publisher & Chief Editor, Journal “Energy Fresh”, Russian Federation
- **Mr Ivan Potemkin**, Deputy Executive Director, Russian Managers Association, Moscow, Russian Federation
- **Mr Stepan Ushanov**, BA student at Peoples’ Friendship University of Russia, Department of Economics, Moscow, Russian Federation

Date of report: Hannover, Germany, May 07, 2013 (amended December 04, 2013)

Table of contents

Evaluation Report.....	2
1.1 Introduction: Purpose, Design and Context of the Accreditation Procedure	2
1.2 Outline of the Institutional Profile, Organizational Structures and Management of MGIMO University	3
1.3 Evaluation of the Study Programmes, the General Infrastructure and Related Managerial Aspects	4
1.3.1 Qualification Objectives of the Study Programmes	4
1.3.2 Compliance of the Study Programmes with the ECTS Users' Guide.....	10
1.3.3 Structure, Teaching Contents and General Concept of the Study Programmes.....	12
1.3.4 Students and Study Conditions.....	17
1.3.5 Examination System.....	19
1.3.6 Cooperative Relationships.....	20
1.3.7 Resources and Infrastructure.....	21
1.3.8 Transparency and Public Information	22
1.3.9 Quality Assurance and Development.....	23
1.4 Summary	23
Final vote of the expert panel	24
1. General Recommendations	24
2. Specific Recommendations	25
3. Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission	26

Evaluation Report

1.1 Introduction: Purpose, Design and Context of the Accreditation Procedure

By contract dated June 1st, 2012 the Moscow State Institute of International Relations (MGIMO University) has entrusted the Central Evaluation and Accreditation Agency (ZEvA) with the accreditation of its entire portfolio of study programmes. For this purpose, the programmes were grouped according to academic disciplines. All in all, five different clusters were formed, each of which was evaluated separately by a review panel consisting of experts from the respective scientific and/or professional background.

This is one of five evaluation reports following a series of on-site talks at MGIMO University between October and December 2012. As indicated in the survey table above, this report focuses on the study programmes in the field of Management, Public Administration and Environmental Management.

The evaluation of the study programmes is based on the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ESG, 2009), the Framework of Qualifications for the European Higher Education Area and the ECTS Users' Guide. Among other things, the ESG require "established processes, criteria and procedures that are used by [quality assurance] agencies which should be also pre-defined and publicly available" (ESG 2005, p. 25). Hence, ZEvA has largely applied its established procedures and evaluation criteria for the accreditation of study programmes, which are all fundamentally rooted in the European-wide standards and guidelines mentioned above. Among others, one central procedural rule is the representation of all institutional stakeholders in the expert panel. Thus, ZEvA decided to include representatives of the Russian labour market and a Russian student representative in each of the five review panels.

Russia signed the Bologna declaration in 2003 and since then has continuously implemented its basic objectives both at national and at institutional level. In the year 2004, MGIMO introduced the ECTS system with its central focus on the learners, the learning process and learning outcomes.

However, slight modifications of the accreditation framework were necessary, especially when it came to aspects that do not lie within the power of the institution alone: for example, the reviewers took a less narrow approach to issues of curricular structure and modularization, as the design and content of the curricula depend to a relatively large extent on nationwide standards defined at ministerial level, not at institutional level. In case of a positive accreditation decision, the study programmes will receive the ZEvA quality seal (instead of the seal of the German Accreditation Council). As a recognized actor in quality assurance at European level, ZEvA also awards the quality seals of the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA) and the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR).

This evaluation report is based on the self-report and documentation submitted by the responsible schools and institutes of MGIMO University, additional documents provided on request during the on-site visit or shortly thereafter and the on-site talks with deans, teaching faculty, students and members of the rectorate on December 4th and December 5th, 2012.

Both in the self-report and during the talks English language was used as a medium of communication, with the addition of simultaneous translation in some talks.

The procedural rules and the criteria for the accreditation of the study programmes were made transparent to MGIMO at the time of contracting. Also, a template including all central evaluation criteria was created to assist the university in generating the self-report.

The experts would like to thank the leadership board, faculty, staff and students of MGIMO University for the friendly and open atmosphere during the on-site talks and the careful organization and planning of the site visit.

1.2 Outline of the Institutional Profile, Organizational Structures and Management of MGIMO University

The Moscow State Institute of International Relations (MGIMO University) was founded in 1944 and quickly became Russia's leading diplomatic training institution. Still today, MGIMO is closely linked to the Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, although operating as an independent higher education institution. Until the present day, MGIMO has retained its humanistic, decidedly non-technical profile with a focus on International Relations and Diplomacy, Economics, Law and Social Sciences.

In the course of the large-scale social, political and economic changes that Russia saw in the 1990s, MGIMO also underwent a process of restructuring and modernization. In 1994, it officially gained the status of a university. In recent years, the institution's educational scope has been continuously widened through the foundation of several new schools and institutes. During the past decade, MGIMO has also gradually got in line with the European-wide educational standards developed in the course of the Bologna Process, for example by introducing two-tier study programmes (Bachelor/Master programmes) and the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS) at all educational levels. What has remained, however, is the strong emphasis on internationality which is reflected, for instance, in the special importance attached to foreign language acquisition and a significant percentage of graduates entering diplomatic service for the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. A relatively large number of international students and numerous joint programs offered in cooperation with other European universities are also evidence of MGIMO's overall strategy of internationalization.

At present, MGIMO University comprises eight different schools and five associated institutes which cooperate with the schools in matters of teaching and learning, but are independent of them in terms of organization. All schools and institutes consist of several departments (most of which equal what would be called a 'chair' in English-speaking countries or a 'Lehrstuhl' in German). Also, there are independent departments responsible for the general coordination of, Master and PhD programmes and academic supervisors in charge of the individual Master programmes.

This report evaluates four Bachelor's programmes, nine Master's programmes, including several Joint Programmes, and two MBA programmes. It can be characterized as a cluster of 'Management, Public Administration and Environment' (to name just the most significant dis-

ciplinary sub-fields).

The Bachelor's programmes discussed in this report are offered and administered by three separate schools. The School of International Business and Business Administration, founded in 1992, offers a Bachelor's programme in "Management". The International Institute of Administration offers full-time programmes since 1999, which are mostly aimed at education in the field of state and public administration, municipal administration and corresponding legal aspects. The School of Applied Economics and Commerce, which offers two of the Bachelor's programmes included in this cluster (BA in Commerce, BA in International Environmental Policy and Management) is the youngest of the MGIMO Schools, founded in 2011. Besides education in the areas of applied business and trade, it started to include a BA in "International Environmental Policy and Management"¹ with an emphasis on geosciences and ecology.

The Master's programmes are generally administered by the Master's Programmes Office of MGIMO, but are also supervised each by an Academic Director. Thus most Master's programmes are academically attached to a specific Department (and thus implicitly also to a School or Institute), but import courses from different Schools and Institutes. Two of the present Master's programmes are in the sole responsibility of the International Institute of Energy Policy and Diplomacy (MIEP): the Master in Sustainable Development and Strategic Management in Energy (a Joint Programme with the University of St. Andrews, UK) and the MBA programme "International Business in the Oil and Gas Sector", organized in cooperation with ROSNEFT. A second, general MBA programme is offered by the School of Business and International Proficiency (former: School of Vocational Training) as a part-time programme for further education of professionals.

The Master's programmes also include four Joint Programmes with a shared curricular structure between MGIMO and foreign institutions of higher education (see details below, chapter 1.3.1).

For the members of the expert panel this organizational structure became largely transparent during the site-visit. But due to the large number of programmes and their partly similar structures the panel opted for a partly generalist evaluation of programmes for each cycle, especially in relation to aspects like admission, examination or general study conditions.

1.3 Evaluation of the Study Programmes, the General Infrastructure and Related Managerial Aspects

1.3.1 Qualification Objectives of the Study Programmes

The overall qualification goals of all Bachelor's and Master's programmes offered by MGIMO are based on nation-wide governmental standards which are defined by the Ministry of Education for each academic discipline. As the Framework of Qualifications for the European

¹ In the course of the accreditation procedure the name of this programme was changed from "Environmental Science" into "International Environmental Policy and Management" to reflect the panels recommendations.

Higher Education Area, these standards describe the level of knowledge and the analytical, generic and communicative skills and competences that graduates should have acquired at completing a programme.

This chapter provides a brief introductory outline of the general aims and purposes of the study programmes referred to in this report. Additional information on goals and learning outcomes is provided in the chapters 1.3.2 and 1.3.3.

Bachelor Level

The qualification objectives (or learning outcomes) of the Bachelor programmes in this cluster have been made transparent in the self-reports and the course descriptions submitted by MGIMO. Some of them are also mentioned in the Diploma Supplements and have been discussed during the site-visit.

All four Bachelor's programmes include the acquirement of a broad basis of knowledge in History, Philosophy and Politics (through courses like Philosophy or World Economy), as well as in subject-related IT and Mathematics (through courses like e.g. Statistics or Econometrics). In regard to their specific core areas, the programmes and their qualification objectives differ:

- The Bachelor's programme "Management" (School of International Business and Business Administration) is aimed toward competencies "in the field of business administration with a profound knowledge of all the aspects of management" (cf. self-report). Graduates will be able to use technical tools and technologies to analyse problems, handle and interpret economic data and statistics, and have profound knowledge of the current economic situation in Russia and worldwide. A special emphasis is on practical competencies for professional activities in business administration, including the assessment of management decision and the development of proposals for improving such decisions – all set before a background of theoretical and ethical knowledge. Thus, this BA is mostly oriented towards practice-related task, but with a sound basis of theoretical and methodological knowledge.
- The Bachelor's programme "Commerce" (School of Applied Economics and Commerce) is somewhat similar to the previous programme, including its orientation towards professional practice, but has a stronger emphasis on aspects of organizing and managing processes of marketing, advertising or logistics. Graduates will have the competences, among others, to identify, create and meet the requirements of consumers, to hold business negotiations and to conduct market research. These activities will be placed before a sound background of "basic principles and methods of social, humanitarian and economic sciences" as well as "methods of mathematical analysis and modelling" (cf. self-report).
- "Environmental Science" (now renamed into: International Environmental Policy and Management") is a Bachelor's programme that is on offer by the School of Applied Economics and Commerce, too. Its qualification goals aim to link three different fields: firstly, knowledge and competencies in the field of natural and earth sciences like Physics, Chemistry, Soil Science or Geology; secondly, aspects of Environmental Science like ecological monitoring, ecological risk assessment or Geography; and

thirdly, economic and legal aspects of environmental protection, sustainable development or environmental management. Graduates also will have more general competences and skills like working with computer networks, with Geographical Information Systems (GIS) or using mathematical applications. As in all Bachelor's programmes at MGIMO, a special emphasis is on professional behaviour in job-related contexts.

- The Bachelor's programme "Public and Municipal Administration" (International Institute of Administration) is aimed at competencies in "doing research, conducting analysis and planning in the area of public and municipal administration" (cf. self-report). Graduates will have acquired a profound background in regard to the public administration system and its legal basis and will be able to design research in this field. That includes setting research objectives, choosing methods and having the skills to collect, analyse and interpret data. Further skills should be in staff management, organizational management and presentation of research results. A special emphasis is on "serving and promoting civil society", including the involvement of citizens, institutions and organizations.

In line with MGIMO's international orientation, foreign language acquisition plays a central role especially at undergraduate level, i.e. the knowledge of foreign languages is an essential part of the graduates' special educational profile. Whereas courses in English are compulsory for everyone, students must also choose at least one out of up to 50 other European and non-European languages on offer. Hence, foreign language classes take up a large part of the curriculum, making for about one third of the total workload (around 90 out of 240 ECTS-points).

Furthermore, the Bachelor students are meant to develop general personal and social competences as e.g. the ability to cooperate with others within a team, the capability of self-development and self-improvement as well as analytical skills. Intercultural competence is also imparted in the context of the language classes.

Democratic citizenship is an explicitly formulated educational goal of the Bachelor programmes in this cluster, including the ability to analyse social processes, to respect and preserve historical and cultural traditions, and encourage the development of civil society via the inclusion of citizens and institutions in public affairs. In addition, extracurricular activities as e.g. involvement in the student union or other clubs and societies support this goal.

Master level

There are five Master's programmes located solely at MGIMO and four Joint Programmes evaluated in this cluster (for MBAs see below). Four of the local programmes are in the field of mostly economic Management and one in the field of Public Administration.

- The three Master's programmes in Management share their qualification objectives to a certain degree: "International business", "Research and Development Management in International Business" and "Management and Marketing of Foreign Economic Activities". Graduates will be able to identify and formulate scientific issues and to implement scientific research by using quantitative and qualitative methods, including methods of strategic analysis. A strong emphasis is on the applicability of competen-

cies and knowledge, including “the ability to develop corporate strategy”, “managing corporate finance” and “the ability to make and evaluate management decisions” (cf. self-report). The self-report also state differences between the three programmes. The Master’s programme in International Business has a rather strong emphasis on the scientific aspects of Management, while at the same time preparing students for positions in international or internationally active Russian companies. The programme “International R&D Management” is carried out in cooperation with the Committee on Science and High Technology of the State Duma and more adjusted towards applied aspects of management in the area of commercialization of innovation: one main objective is “to prepare professionals and managers who can develop and implement advanced business trends designed to achieve market success in terms of participation in international trade” (cf. self-report). The third Master’s programme, “Management and Marketing of Foreign Economic Activities”, is aimed towards employment in companies engaged in international trade. Graduates will have knowledge of international trade relations, risk management, international economic law or international marketing.

- The Master’s programme “Management of Military and Technical Cooperation in Hi-Tech” shares a considerable amount of the qualifications objectives with the former programmes, but is focused on the field of military-technological cooperation and advanced technologies (“high tech”) and its special challenges and requirements. The programme is set up in cooperation with the Russian Technologies State Corporation (known as “Rostec”), a state-founded business entity that embraces (partly via stock holdings) different military and civil companies and holdings like “AVTOVAZ” (producer of Lada cars) or IZMASH, a holding for manufacturers of military arms systems.² The curricular structure is partly adapted to the needs of Rostec and the admission of students takes place in cooperation between the State Corporation and MGIMO.
- The Master’s programme in Public and Municipal Administration is – like the corresponding Bachelor’s programme – offered by the International Institute of Administration. It aims at equipping graduates with the necessary knowledge and competences to conduct analysis and planning in the area of public and municipal administration, including skills in staff management and organizational management. This entails a link of competences in international management with profound knowledge of the (Russian) public administration systems and its legal basis.

These Russian-based programmes are thus mostly oriented towards training and further employment in the economic or public sector. Scientific training is one of the qualification goals of all programmes, but not the primary one. Thus, most of the programmes in this cluster use practice-oriented forms and contents in teaching and learning, including external lecturers, from e.g. Rostec in the Master “Management of Military and Technical Cooperation in Hi-Tech”, the Foreign Ministry or the banking sector.

This cluster also includes four Joint Programmes with Double Degrees, which have distin-

² <http://www.rostec.ru/> (accessed February 27, 2013)

guishable qualification objectives.

- Two of the programmes have a focus on Management and Business Administration and are under supervision of the Department of Management and Marketing. The first programme – “International Management” – is set up in cooperation with the ICN School of Business in Nancy, France, where MGIMO-students spend their second year. The teaching language is French and English (but at MGIMO students can also choose Russian-taught courses) during the entire programme. The second programme – formerly “Management of Small and Medium Enterprises”, now “MIEX Master in International Management”³ – is in cooperation again with the ICN School in Nancy, where students spend their first months. Then they move on the University of Bologna, Italy, where they spend another three months, and then return to MGIMO to finish their studies. The degree is awarded by all three higher education institutions. Both Joint Programmes share similar qualification goals, mostly aimed towards applied knowledge and competences. Graduates will have the abilities e.g. to manage organizations, develop corporate strategies or apply methods of corporate finance. In addition, students will gain the skills to use methods of economic analysis, to conduct research and to develop intellectual and cultural skills. The latter two aspects are especially important in the context of a Joint Programme, including language skills and intercultural abilities.
- The Master’s programme “International Business in the Oil and Gas Sector” is organized by MGIMO’s International Institute of Energy Policy and Diplomacy (MIEP) in cooperation with the University of Nordland, Norway. According to its own qualification objectives, graduates will be prepared for “employment in major oil and gas development and production projects in the off-shore areas in the North and Barents Sea and in the High North in general” (cf. self-report). The focus is thus on applied knowledge in the fields e.g. of energy resources, energy development and management, risk analysis, but also in related areas like international marketing, corporate governance or international financial markets. The first semester is spent at MGIMO (or Nordland University for Norwegian students), the second at Nordland University, the third at MGIMO and the fourth again at the respective home university. The degree is awarded by both universities.
- The Joint Programme “Sustainable Development and Strategic Management in Energy” is a new programme established in 2012 and again organized by MIEP in cooperation with the University of St. Andrews, Scotland, UK. MGIMO-students spend their first year at St. Andrews and their second at MIEP. The aim is twofold: firstly, students shall be enabled to “critically interrogate the principles, practice and plurality of sustainable development as well as the evolution of innovative, interdisciplinary thinking and action in this area” (cf. self-report). Secondly, students should gain “advanced grounding in theoretical and applied energy economics and management” and acquire the necessary skills to act professionally in this sector.

³ In the course of the accreditation procedure the programme was renamed along the recommendations of the expert panel.

MBA

The expert panel also evaluated two part-time MBA programmes: a general “Master of Business Administration”, offered by the School of Business and International Proficiency, and an MBA in “International Business in the Oil and Gas Sector”, which is run by MIEP. The latter was set up in cooperation with ROSNEFT, the leading, state-owned Russian oil company, and is explicitly designed for its CEOs. The objectives are to “educate entrepreneurial leaders” (cf. self-report) for the Russian energy sector. This includes the competences for entrepreneurial thinking, managing in a global context, but also “social, environmental and economic responsibility”. Admission requires at least five-year experience in managing positions at ROSNEFT and the programme includes excursions to Norway.

The general MBA offered by the School of Business and International Proficiency, a partly independent entity of MGIMO, requires at least an undergraduate degree and two years of full-time work experience. Based on these prerequisites graduates will be able to plan and implement research on economic and managerial processes and have the competencies to use skills and methods for analysing modern management processes and practices. This includes e.g. the development of business plans and the application of quantitative methods for management and decision-making in companies.

The experts assess the programmes on Bachelor and Master level as being generally oriented towards scientific and employment-related qualification objectives in a plausible and positive way. This holds true also for the Joint Programmes, which are based on stable cooperation with the respective foreign institutions and for the MBA programmes. Also considered are the goals of developing personal skills and competencies and of enhancing the involvement in civil society.

Yet, the experts put forward a few programme-specific recommendations in regard to the qualification goals:

- The naming of the Joint Programme “Management of Small and Medium Enterprises”, set up in cooperation with ICN Nancy and the University of Bologna, should become more specific in regard to the qualification goals (and the respective curricular content), as the subject of SMEs only plays a limited role and is mostly restricted to the Italian component of the programme.⁴
- While the Joint Programme “Sustainable Development and Strategic Management in Energy” is assessed very positively by the panel, the overall qualification goals appear obviously divided between the two partners, with the University of St. Andrews being responsible for the Sustainable Development part and MGIMO/MIEP for the Strategic Management part. A stronger integration already on the level of the qualification objectives between the two partners is recommended.

⁴ Recommendation was followed and programme renamed: MIEX Master in International Management

1.3.2 Compliance of the Study Programmes with the ECTS Users' Guide

In 2004 MGIMO was the first Russian university to introduce the European Credit Transfer System based on the awarding of credit points for achieved learning outcomes. Courses are worth between 1 and 10 ECTS credit points.

Bachelor programmes at MGIMO comprise 240 ECTS credits to be acquired within a span of four years (60 credits per academic year). As a general rule, the courses are not grouped into larger educational components (modules) but are instead allocated to one of the three following “cycles” or pillars:

- Humanities, social and economic cycle (ca. 50 ECTS points)
- Mathematic cycle (ca. 15 ECTS points)
- Professional cycle (ca. 160 ECTS points)

The three cycles are not studied successively, but simultaneously, i.e. each semester students take courses from more than one cycle. Each cycle includes both compulsory courses (as prescribed by ministerial directive) and a range of varying elective courses that lie in the responsibility of the institution itself.

Additional ECTS points are awarded for preparation and taking the final state examinations (cf. Chapter 1.3.5) and the final paper. The content and didactic purpose of the individual cycles will be described in more detail in Chapter 1.3.3.

Graduates of the Bachelor's programmes are awarded either the degrees “Bachelor of Management”, “Bachelor of Public and Municipal Administration”, “Bachelor in Commerce” or “Bachelor of Science”.

At Master level, a total of 120 ECTS points is awarded (60 credits per year). Most Master programmes in this cluster consist of the following cycles/pillars:

- General scientific cycle: overviews (Public Sector Economics, World Economy etc.), current debates, language etc. (ca. 20-30 ECTS points; around one third compulsory, two-thirds electives)
- Professional cycle: subject-specific courses (ca. 30-45 ECTS points, around one third compulsory, two-thirds electives)
- Internship, Scientific Research and thesis (ca. 40-55 ECTS points)
- Examination, State Certification (ca. 12 ECTS points)

The arrangements differ for Joint Programmes, where semesters abroad are structured according to the host-institution's curricular concept and for both MBA programmes where courses are structured in regard to content.

The experts regard the credit system as generally reasonable and structured according to the average students' workload. However, the programme-specific awarding of credits to specific cycles, courses and other achievements (internship, thesis etc.) remains ambiguous in the presented reports. For example, for the “Preparation and Defense of the Master's The-

sis” the number of credits awarded range from 3 (“Management of Military and Technical Cooperation”, Diploma Supplement) to 15 (“International Management”, Diploma Supplement). The panel members therefore highly recommend including transparent crediting provisions in the programme handbooks (see below).

By ministerial directive, one ECTS credit point equals a total workload of ca. 36 hours at all levels of qualification (both contact hours and self-study time are included in this estimation). This amounts to a workload of about 2,160 hours per academic year, which clearly exceeds the average workload recommended in the ECTS Users’ Guide (25-30 hours per ECTS point, 1,500-1,800 hours per year). Although the average annual student workload is high by international comparison (in most Bologna countries it does not go beyond the limit of 1,800 hours), the experts still regard it – especially after the talks with the students at the site visit – as manageable, especially as students appear highly motivated. In spite of that, the experts recommend a closer monitoring of workload estimates at course and programme level (cf. Chapter 1.3.4).

Graduates of the Master’s programmes in this cluster are awarded different types of the degrees: “Master of Management”, “M.Sc. in Management” and “M.Sc. in Economics”.

In accordance with the ECTS Users’ Guide, ECTS points are awarded based on the assessment of these desired learning outcomes by means of different forms of examination.

A Diploma Supplement including an ECTS grading scheme has been submitted for the Bachelor’s and most Master’s programmes. Examples of other ECTS key documents like Learning Agreements were not included in the documentation. However, during the on-site talks, MGIMO submitted a draft version of an ECTS handbook (in English), in which Learning Agreements and Transcripts of Records are mentioned as standard documents. The procedures in connection with the issuance of the documents are described in detail in the draft handbook.

The experts welcome the draft of the general part of an ECTS handbook by MGIMO. However, to allow for compliance of all reviewed study programmes in Management, Public Administration and Environment with the provisions of the ECTS User’s Guide the experts strongly recommend to compile specific ECTS-handbooks for each of the study programmes in English. Besides a general part they must include the workload and awarded credits for each course as well as for each cycle/part of the programme, including internships, exams or thesis preparation. It should be made publicly available.

General remarks regarding the practical components of the curricula

As already indicated in Chapter 1.3.2, all of MGIMO’s study programmes at Bachelor’s and Master’s level consist of both general education and subject-specific parts. The members of the panel welcome that MGIMO students receive practical training, including national and international internships. The experts consider these practical elements as being overall professionally organized. Yet, it remains somewhat unclear to which extent and in what forms internships are (compulsorily) included in the specific Bachelor’s and Master’s programmes and how they are possibly related to the preparation of the thesis. For example, the three

general Master of Management programmes (“Internat. Business”, “International R&D Management”, “Management and Marketing of Foreign Economic Activities”) include each a compulsory 11 week-internship credited with 20 ECTS points, while the Master in “Public and Municipal Administration” states a unit of 22 ECTS points named “Research Work”. For Bachelor’s programmes it remained unclear, if internships are obligatory or optional. The experts generally recommend to include obligatory internships in the Bachelor’s and Master’s programmes and to provide information on the exact nature, duration and quality assurance of these parts in the programme-specific ECTS handbooks.

General remarks on credit transfer, mobility and admission

Student exchange and mobility are part of MGIMO’s overall strategy of internationalization and participation in the Bologna process. Each year, MGIMO takes in an increasing number of international students and in return sends a considerable number of its own students to universities abroad. Currently, a new website for international and Double Degree programmes at MGIMO has been set up and provides concise descriptions.

The members of the panel appreciate these efforts to increase the bi-directional mobility of students (and faculty members). Yet, the rules and procedures applied by MGIMO for the recognition of credits earned abroad (outside the Joint Programmes) remained somewhat unclear in the documentation. As mentioned above, there were no examples of Learning and Training Agreements included in the documentation. As the draft ECTS handbook submitted during the on-site talks transparently describes a process of recognition based on comparable learning outcomes as recommended in the ECTS Users’ Guide, the experts strongly support and recommend the inclusion of these procedures and provisions in the respective ECTS handbooks, including a binding policy on the recognition of credits. The criteria and procedures for the recognition of credits should also be published online. In addition, the experts recommend further improvement of support for incoming students by providing more information (regulations, documents, handbooks etc.) and advisory service in English. This might also include forms of student tutoring like ‘buddy programmes’, which are especially suited for non-Russian students. Overall, a ‘climate of acceptance’ should be established, as student mobility is only attainable within a context of flexible recognition.

1.3.3 Structure, Teaching Contents and General Concept of the Study Programmes

Bachelor’s programmes

Like all Bachelor’s programmes offered by MGIMO, the Bachelor’s programmes in Management, Public Administration and Environment consists of several “cycles”, each of which has its own didactic purpose and desired learning outcomes defined in nation-wide standards. By and large, these standards are closely aligned with the desired learning outcomes described in the Qualifications Framework for the European Higher Education Area. Students are to learn to apply methods of analysing managerial processes in private corporations and public institutions in the Russian and international context and its specific structures, norms and

regulations (world market, taxation laws, international trade law etc.). Students also become able to integrate knowledge from neighbouring fields like history, law, philosophy or the natural sciences to better understand, analyse and eventually help to resolve economic, civic and environmental problems. Also, graduates will be able to communicate the results of their work in written and oral forms directed at different types of audiences.

During the four-year program, students receive a broad general education in the Arts and Humanities (Philosophy, History, and Sociology; often attuned towards the core subject of the programme) and take courses in the field of Mathematics and Information Science, like Statistics or “Natural Science Concepts”. At the same time they acquire specialized knowledge in the respective study field and receive in-depth training in at least two languages (cf. the qualification outcomes described in more detail above, 1.3.1). The Professional Cycle makes up the largest share of the curricula. It includes training in a second foreign language and then the core academic courses, including some theoretical and methodological components. All Bachelor’s programmes conclude with a Bachelor’s thesis that is defended in the last semester. Beyond that common structure, the programmes differ considerably:

- The Bachelor’s programme “Management” (School of International Business and Business Administration) with its broad approach towards management in the Russian and international context and its practice-oriented concept is evaluated positively. It offers a full range of curricular content within the specific approach of MGIMO, especially the international perspective and the intense language instruction. The so-called ‘Humanitarian, Social and Economic Cycle’ provides not only general education in fields like world history or philosophy, but also in more subject-related courses like World Economy or Economic Theory. The second cycle, ‘Mathematic and Natural Science’ is again mostly subject-adapted with courses like Statistics or Information Technologies in Management. The third and central ‘Professional Cycle’ covers the important aspects of the discipline in compulsory and elective courses which range from Theory of Management or Human Resources Management to Commercial Law or Advertising and Banking Operations.
- The Bachelor’s programme “Commerce” (School of Applied Economics and Commerce) with its focus on organizing and managing processes of marketing, advertising or logistics shares most curricula aspects with the former programme in the first two cycles, while its third cycle contain corresponding courses like Accounting, Basics of Logistics or International Security Market.
- The Bachelor’s programme in “Environmental Science” (now: International Environmental Policy and Management), that has been started by now, is designed according to its qualification objectives as an integrated programme including skills and knowledge in regard to managerial tasks as well as in regard to environmental studies and their natural sciences’ background. The natural science courses are located in the ‘second cycle’ (courses on Mathematics, Physics, Geography, Soil Science or Statistics of Wildlife Management) as well as in the third, ‘professional’ cycle, e.g. Ecological Monitoring, Sustainable Development or Environmental Economics. The

second, 'Humanitarian' cycle adds the economy-related subjects in courses like Theory of Management, Comparative Economics or Marketing.

The experts strongly support that MGIMO is taking steps towards integrating environmental science and ecological aspects in this newly developed programme that will be rather unique in the context of Russian higher education. However, MGIMO should take steps to ensure that the necessary facilities for teaching the natural sciences' part of the curriculum are adequately provided. In the short term MGIMO should establish cooperation with other adequately equipped higher education institutions to provide adequate laboratories, fieldwork opportunities etc. In the long term such infrastructure should be located at MGIMO itself. The panel also recommends reconsidering the name of the programme as it does not entirely reflect the significant curricular segments on economics and commerce. Alternative names might be Environmental Economics or Environmental Management.⁵

- The Bachelor's programme "Public and Municipal Administration" (International Institute of Administration) is clearly conceptualized toward the intended qualification goals in regard to scientific qualification as well as post-graduate employment. While the first and second 'cycles' are mostly similar to the other programmes – with the remarkable exception of courses like Prolegomena to Profession – the Professional Cycle is distinctly designed for imparting knowledge and competences for public administration on different levels of the Russian administrative system. It includes courses on the legal and economic context (Administrative Law, Civil Service, International Economic Affairs etc.) as well as on managerial and administrative aspects: Regional Administration and Territory Planning, Innovation Management or History of Public Management in Russia. It became obvious during the on-site visit that students are remarkably satisfied with the programme (and its consecutive Master). Yet, the expert panel would like to recommend including or strengthening the subject of Accounting in the curriculum, as it is an indispensable part of current Public Management.

Based on the self-reports and the on-site talks, the members of the expert panel overall evaluate the programme concepts on the Bachelor's level as being built up coherently and with a view towards the set qualification objectives. They have no doubt that the programmes succeed in imparting the level of knowledge and skills as described by the Framework of Qualifications for the European Higher Education Area. The programmes build on the students' level of knowledge from secondary education and combine a broad curricular structure with a largely reasonable selection of study fields. The programmes show a high quality on the conceptual level, but also appear well implemented. The latter is supported, among other things, by diverse forms of teaching, the use of Russian and non-Russian literature and a good relationship between teaching faculty and students. Already at Bachelor's level, students learn to apply their knowledge in diverse contexts and to solve practical problems within their field of study (as e.g. by means of discussion, case-work, seminars). Furthermore,

⁵ The name has now been changed in line with these recommendations.

they acquire the necessary theoretical and methodological basis for undertaking further study autonomously. Also, students learn to communicate information, ideas, problems and solutions.

Yet, even while the extent of practice-related components has not become entirely clear (see above), the experts appreciate that significant parts of the curricular structure would be devoted to practical experience. In addition, they recommend a closer cooperation in teaching between the different Schools and programmes, especially in regard to the Bachelor's programmes in Management and Commerce. In addition, the qualification profiles and curricular structures of the Bachelor's programmes in the area of Management and Commerce should become more distinct and then be made more transparent in their specific descriptions. Likewise, the panel members recommend enlarging the number of elective courses vis-à-vis compulsory ones to give students an early opportunity to build up individual profiles during their study progression.

Considering all aspects the experts have come to the conclusion that the Bachelor programmes are in line with the Bologna framework in terms of educational goals and learning outcomes.

Master's programmes (including MBAs)

Master's programmes at MGIMO usually comprise 2 years and 120 ECTS credit points. The taught courses are allocated either to the "general scientific" (philosophy, languages) cycle or to the professional cycle, the latter consisting of both compulsory and elective courses.

The desired learning outcomes of Master's programmes are generally closely in line with the Framework of Qualifications for the European Higher Education Area: for example, graduates will be able "for comprehensive analysis of contemporary international management trends" (Management Masters) or have "the ability to find and implement organizational management solutions" (Master Public Administration). Based on the written descriptions of the curricula and the information provided during the on-site talks in Moscow, the experts have come to the conclusion that the graduates of the Master's programmes reach the desired learning outcomes for the second cycle as described by the Framework of Qualifications for the European Higher Education Area.

The Master's programmes generally build on the broad knowledge base laid at Bachelor's level – plus work experience for the MBA programmes. Compared to the Bachelor's programmes, the general cycle lays a stronger focus on the core disciplines of the separate programmes – i.e. in all parts of the Master's programmes the emphasis is on specialized rather than general knowledge. While professional training can be the main objective for some of the programmes, rather than scientific education in the narrow sense of the word, one central goal of all Master's programmes is to enable students to conduct scientific research independently and autonomously. The experts thus come to the conclusion that the students of the Masters' programmes in the cluster 'Management, Public Administration and Environment' reach this goal. Yet, the generally recommend to focus the Master's thesis in most of the programmes (less in the two MBA programmes) more distinctly on theory-based research and also allow for more creativity in choosing research topics for the thesis.

Still, the experts are certain that students acquire the necessary soft skills they need to take up leading positions in their field of professional and academic specialization. Through further intense language training, students' communicative skills reach an advanced level. All in all, the panel members welcome the frequent use of modern forms of teaching, including interactive forms of learning, case studies, practical trainings (role plays etc.), excursions (in the case of the Institute for Ecology) and an often broad range of literature. The MBA programmes are especially responsive to vocational needs of the student clientele.

The experts also support efforts to increasingly use web-based teaching and other forms of online-supported learning. In this regard, they recommend to provide an e-learning platform for all programmes and levels to support self-directed learning by students (including part-time students in the MBA programmes).

In addition to this general evaluation the experts would like to comment on selected Master's programmes:

- For the Master's programme "Management of Military and Technical Cooperation in Hi-Tech" it did not become entirely clear who can be admitted to this programme (the admission regulations in the self-report are not specific for most of the Master's programmes) and what previous qualifications are expected. Hence, the experts recommend clarifying the admission procedure in the respective ECTS handbook. In addition, they see a large part of the curriculum devoted to the field of general management and thus recommend tuning the concept more explicitly towards the requirements of military-technical innovations.

Double Degree Master's Programmes

Four Master's programmes are offered in cooperation with other European universities (Joint Programmes). Graduates of these programmes receive one degree from each of the participating institutions (Double Degree). In addition, there is one English-taught programme aimed primarily at students from Russia and Norway. Each programme is based on a contractual agreement between the participating institutions which regulates the overall design of the curricula, the organization of the programmes and the selection and supervision of students.

All four joint study programmes aim at preparing students further for working in an international context, either academically or vocational. As mobility is a basic underlying principle of the programmes, the above remarks regarding the crediting of courses and student mobility do not apply to them.

The experts regard all programmes as being well-organized and continuously reviewed and improved by all partners involved. The selection of students and the evaluation of their work are for the most part also joint responsibilities of all partners. The panel members strongly appreciate the double degree programmes as a strong enhancement of MGIMO's international profile and a significant contribution to the further internationalization of European higher education. In the following the experts would like to point out aspects of specific programmes:

- The Joint Programme “Sustainable Development and Strategic Management in Energy”, established in 2012, and organized by MIEP in cooperation with the University of St. Andrews, Scotland, UK, is overall evaluated by the experts as an extraordinary programme. It aims to integrate applied economics and management in the field of energy and energy production and consumption on the one hand with the environmental dimension. The latter both covers aspects of natural and earth sciences as well as social aspects in relation to the concept of sustainable development. While the experts assess both parts of the programme in themselves as excellent, they see a lack of curricular integration: the first year at St. Andrews and the second year at MGIMO appear as almost separate study programmes. Thus, the experts recommend to further integrate both parts by closer curricular cooperation as well as by using more cooperative forms of teaching and learning, e.g. through a common supervision of the Master’s thesis by MIEP and the Sustainability Institute at St. Andrews.
- The two Joint Programmes with a focus on Management and Business Administration and in cooperation with the ICN School in Nancy plus other partners are evaluated generally positive. Yet, concerning the programme “International Management” the experts would like to recommend a stronger curricular emphasis on the international aspect of management, as most of the courses are focused on general management rather than on aspects of management in international contexts like intercultural awareness or legal, economic or customer-related differences between regions and countries (for the recommendation of renaming the programme “Management of Small and Medium Enterprises” see chapter 1.3.1 above).

1.3.4 Students and Study Conditions

Admission Procedure

To be admitted to MGIMO, applicants must complete their secondary school education (Unified State Exam) with excellent grades. High performance in Russian, Mathematics and foreign languages is held especially important in the selection of students. Furthermore, MGIMO is one of only a few higher education institutions in Russia conducting their own additional entrance examinations – in case of the Bachelor’s programmes in Management, Public Administration and Environment, applicants must take a written foreign language exam. Considering the central importance of foreign language training for MGIMO’s educational concept, this selection procedure is regarded as adequate by the panel of experts.

As mentioned above, a majority of MGIMO’s Bachelor graduates go on studying at Master’s level. Also, Bachelor graduates from other Russian universities are enrolled in postgraduate programmes at MGIMO. So far, there seem to be very few non-nationals absolving a complete Bachelor’s or Master’s programme at MGIMO (apart from those Master’s programmes especially designed for foreign students).

Formally, foreigners have the opportunity to apply, but it seems that until now it is quite difficult to get foreign degrees and diplomas recognized. To further MGIMO’s own aim of interna-

tionalization, the experts recommend that MGIMO should set up regulations and procedures for the admission of foreign students, especially to their (Russian-taught) Master's programmes. It must be made clear, if and how foreign graduates with a 3 year-Bachelor's degree (180 ECTS credits) can enter MGIMO's Master's programmes. Furthermore, the 'nostrification' of foreign degrees, i.e. the legalization prior to continuing higher education, as practised by the Russian government, might hinder the vertical mobility of incoming students. Since Russia has signed and ratified the Lisbon Recognition Convention in 1999/2000, each party shall recognise higher education qualifications conferred in another party unless a substantial difference can be shown.⁶ While the current practice of recognition by the Russian government might be in line with the Convention, the criteria and procedures for the nostrification and, if applicable, for further admission procedures by MGIMO should be made transparent (e.g. online).

Apart from excellent academic performance in a similar or related Bachelor's or "Specialist" programme, admission requirements for the Master's programmes evaluated in this cluster include proficiency in the English language and a solid base of knowledge in the relevant disciplines, which must be demonstrated in two entrance examinations.

Exceptions are the Joint Master's programmes in Management as the selection of incoming students is generally made by the partner institutions (ICN Nancy, Bologna University etc.). For the Double Degree Programmes "International Business in the Oil and Gas Sector" and "Sustainable Development" the selection is made by MIEP at MGIMO and Nordland University/St. Andrews on the basis of commonly agreed rules and a joint committee. The MBA programme in cooperation with Rosneft postulates at least five years of high-ranking experience in the company while the admission to the general MBA offered by the School of Business and International Proficiency requires a minimum of two years of work experience – which is in both cases in line with the European MBA Guidelines.⁷

General study requirements and workload

MGIMO students spend the largest part of the day in class (teaching hours are usually from 9 am until 4 pm on six days a week); the rest of the time is dedicated to independent self-studying and extracurricular activities. As stipulated in the Russian Law on Education, the weekly study time cannot exceed a total 54 academic hours, which includes both contact time and self-study time. The maximum number of contact hours per week does not exceed 27, excluding physical training. From the third academic year onwards, one day per week is dedicated to research and thus kept free of taught classes.

As described in Chapter 1.3.3, practical placements might also consume a certain amount of time which must be brought in line with the theoretical part of education, both in organiza-

⁶ Cf. Lisbon Recognition Convention, Section VI; <http://conventions.coe.int/Treaty/en/Treaties/Html/165.htm> (access February 4, 2013).

⁷ http://www.efmd.org/images/stories/efmd/downloadables/EQUAL/equal_mba_guideline.pdf (accessed March 05, 2013)

tional terms and in terms of content. Also, the frequent tests and examinations cause a considerable amount of work on the students' side (cf. Chapter 1.3.5).

The students present during the on-site talks described their workload as manageable and comparable to other European and American universities. While the experts basically follow their self-assessment and experienced the students during the talks as highly motivated, open-minded and outspoken, they recommend a closer monitoring of the student workload and – in the long-term perspective – a reduction of it. Thus, the university should check on a regular basis whether there is a discrepancy between the anticipated workload and the time actually taken by the majority of students to reach the expected learning outcomes. This could be achieved, for example, in the context of course evaluations or general surveys on study condition. If necessary, adequate measures should be taken to revise the estimated workload, the teaching and learning methods applied or the desired learning outcomes, as recommended by the ECTS Users' Guide.

Counselling and advisory services

The members of the expert panel were satisfied with the presented counselling and advisory services at MGIMO. The faculty appears to be accessible, responsive to the students and the excellent ratio between students and teaching faculty clearly supports these efforts.

General organizational and social aspects

As far as the members of the expert panel can see, students profit from relatively small group sizes, often modern teaching forms and an impressive teacher-student ratio. In addition, MGIMO offers a number of social and extra-curricular activities that students can get involved in. On the MGIMO campus, students also have a variety of sporting grounds and facilities, a well-equipped canteen and several cafeterias at their disposal.

Generally, the students participating in the on-site talks displayed a high level of identification with the institution while at the same time being outspoken and critical. Hence, the further integration of students into institutional decision-making as well as in internal quality assurance would help to improve curricula as well as overall study structures. The experts thus recommend to strengthen the role of students and other stakeholders in these procedures as recommended in the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the EHEA" (ESG).

1.3.5 Examination System

Examination regulations and the evaluation criteria for student assessment at MGIMO are based on several internal acts, guidelines and directives, most of which are publicly available on the university's Russian website. As English translations of these documents are not at hand, they were listed in the institutional self-report, but not included in the documentation.

Final course examinations are held twice a year, i.e. at the end of each semester. The number and scope of examinations within that span of time does not exceed a manageable

measure (a maximum of five exams per semester). However, in each course there are usually three additional tests or assignments like 'response papers' for readings that serve to monitor students' progress throughout the term. Even though students excelling in these tests may be exempt from the end-of-semester exam, the peers consider the overall workload caused by tests and examinations to be relatively high (up to 30 tests/exams per semester are possible). Thus, the peers recommend a closer monitoring of student workload (cf. Section 1.3.4).

Depending on the subject, there are either written examinations (with a maximum duration of 2 hours) or oral examinations that last about 15 minutes. Oral exams may also be taken in groups of up to five students. As a general rule, there are at least two examiners for each exam, and each paper is corrected by two lecturers to ensure objectivity. The evaluation criteria seem to be made transparent to the students both orally and as part of the course syllabi.

Furthermore, both Bachelor's and Master's students must undergo final 'state examinations' in order to be awarded their degrees. At MGIMO, these usually consist of a final thesis (including oral defence) and two examinations: one foreign language exam and one interdisciplinary exam in the core scientific discipline of the programme. The Bachelor's thesis comprises between 40 and 70 pages, a Master's thesis around 130 pages.

All in all, the experts regard tests and examinations as being well distributed over the academic year and thus remain feasible for students at all times. The applied forms of examination are fit to measure the desired learning outcomes of the courses, including different types of written and oral exams. In the final theses, students can show that they have learned to apply methods of scientific research and to apply their knowledge to a concrete topic or problem.

Based on the on-site talks and the self-report the experts have thus come to the conclusion that the procedures for the assessment of students applied at MGIMO comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area. However, as the relevant institutional regulations and legal acts could not be provided in English, some details have remained unclear. Hence, the experts recommend making the information regarding student assessment and examination available in English. The experts are fully aware that translated versions and/or summaries of such official documents cannot be legally binding, but would still like to make this recommendation for the sake of transparency and student-friendliness, especially with a view to the needs of foreign students (cf. Chapter 1.3.8).

1.3.6 Cooperative Relationships

MGIMO has forged cooperative relationships regarding its study programmes in the cluster Management, Public Administration and Environment with, on the one hand, institutions of state government or (partly) state-owned corporations, especially the Ministry of Foreign Af-

fairs, but also the State Duma (“International R&D Management”), Rosneft (“International Business in the Oil and Gas Sector”) or Rostec (“Management in Military and Technical Cooperation”), and, on the other hand, with a several foreign higher education institutions. These co-operations are used for internship placements and practical training for students, but also for offering practice-related courses, workshops and guest lectures. The Double Degree programmes also developed from such intense cooperative efforts.

The panel members welcome the efforts of MGIMO and its respective Schools and Departments to establish strong relationships with national institutions and internationally renowned universities. They recommend using them further for increasing student and – not less important – faculty mobility in both directions (cf. Chapters 1.3.7).

1.3.7 Resources and Infrastructure

Teaching staff

In total, MGIMO has a faculty of about 1.200, including 160 full professors, 430 associate professors as well as assistant professors and other supporting lecturers of various qualifications. Students are usually taught by lecturers from several MGIMO schools and departments.

After the site-visit, the panel members came to the conclusion that the faculty members exhibit a high level of knowledge, professional experience, empathy for students’ concerns and commitment that are necessary for effective and successful teaching. The experts especially welcome the efforts of faculty members to increasingly use a broad and didactically modern range of forms of teaching and examination – which was also honoured by the students.

Teaching staff is generally given the opportunities to develop and extend their teaching capacity by participating in professional training programmes. Also, students can provide feedback on the quality of teaching in the context of regular surveys (cf. Chapter 1.3.9). Yet, the experts recommend, firstly, reducing the often high teaching load for faculty members, especially in the language departments. Secondly, to further improve the amount and quality of research activities – which, in turn, strengthens the quality especially of the Master’s programme – they recommend introducing recurrent sabbaticals.

Infrastructure and Equipment

MGIMO provides its students with an excellent and modern infrastructure and learning resources far above the Russian standard. There are five different buildings on the premises which primarily serve academic purposes and comprise more than 200 lecture rooms, computing facilities, multimedia labs and language laboratories as well as a high-standard research library which also provides access to online literature databases like EBSCO host, LEXIS-NEXIS and Wolters Kluwer.

Yet, as indicated above, the Bachelor’s and Master’s programmes related to aspects of envi-

Environmental science are lacking adequate infrastructure for practical exercises at the moment. Students should have access to laboratories, GIS-labs etc. MGIMO should establish cooperation for the short-term and aim at setting up its own facilities to sustain the development of this new and promising track of programmes.

In addition to providing an e-learning platform, the experts also recommend to set up an intranet to ease the storage and exchange of learning materials, syllabi etc.

Beyond the academic realm, the university also caters for other needs of students and staff: apart from the sports facilities already mentioned above, there are several dormitories on the premises, another one with an intake capacity of up to 1.800 students is currently in the process of construction. Furthermore, MGIMO has its own medical centre, pharmacy and shops.

1.3.8 Transparency and Public Information

According to the ESG, higher education institutions “have a responsibility to provide information about the programmes they are offering, the intended learning outcomes of these, the qualifications they award, the teaching, learning and assessment procedures used, and the learning opportunities available to their students”. As has already been outlined above, the most important regulations regarding student assessment, internships, final theses etc. seem to be published on the Russian website of MGIMO, but are not yet available in English. The English version of the website provides information on the institution as a whole, but only few facts regarding the (Russian-taught) study programmes.

The programme and course descriptions in English that were submitted as part of the documentation do not yet include all information that the ECTS Users’ Guide recommends for the description of study programmes and course units (MGIMO should, according to its own curricular structure, label them “courses” instead of “modules”). Based on these observations, the members of the expert panel would like to recommend the following measures for improvement:

First of all, the English version of the MGIMO website should be extended to include more detailed information regarding the study programmes, the central regulations and evaluation criteria for student assessment and the institutional quality assurance policy.

Secondly, a course catalogue in English should be generated for each study programme within the cluster. The design and content of the course catalogues should follow the recommendations of the ECTS Users’ Guide as closely as possible: each document should comprise a general introductory part providing general information on the institution and especially on the programme (including provisions for mobility, recognition, internships etc.), as well as course descriptions including at least a brief outline of the contents and the desired learning outcomes of each course. The handbooks including course catalogues should be made available on the MGIMO website.

1.3.9 Quality Assurance and Development

For the last few years, MGIMO has been developing an internal quality management system which is applied throughout the institution. The implementation and further development of this system are the responsibility of the Department for Quality Assurance and Academic Development which was established in the year 2007. An official quality assurance policy does exist, but is not yet available in English. The experts recommend generating and publishing a translated version of this document.

Apart from assuring compliance with the educational standards issued by the Ministry of Education and Science, quality assurance at MGIMO aims at further improving study programmes and educational processes on the basis of collected data. To this end, a new information system based on performance indicators has recently been introduced. The university gathers the necessary management information by continuously monitoring the students' academic progress and achievements and through regular surveys among students and alumni. At the end of each term, students get a chance to provide feedback on the quality of courses and teaching. Based on the survey results, analytical reports are generated which are passed on to the rectorate and the heads of the schools and institutes as a decision base for further action.

The members of the panel thus conclude that the internal quality assurance mechanisms of MGIMO are in place and in accordance with the recommendations of the ESG. Nevertheless, they would like to make a few suggestions for further improvement:

Lecturers should be encouraged to discuss the results of course evaluations with their students, as some teachers appear to do it already. In case this is not possible for organizational reasons, it should at least be made sure that students receive feedback on the results of the surveys. Generally, students should get a chance to participate actively in all phases of the quality assurance cycle: for example, student representatives should be entitled to suggest measures for improvement, contribute to working groups etc.

1.4 Summary

The members of the expert panel were impressed by the modern infrastructure and the strong commitment of faculty, students and staff and the efficient organizational structures they found at MGIMO. The peers have no doubt that the students of the programmes evaluated in this report get well prepared for the challenges of the international economy, of public administration and environmental management. They especially support the MGIMO in installing an environmental programme as including sustainability in economy and management is certainly forward looking in this sector. We encourage MGIMO in the near future to search for cooperation possibilities in order to allow also a hands-on and field training of the students and in the long run to establish the necessary laboratory facilities at MGIMO. We suggest that the high share of economy and management courses is somehow also reflected

in the name of the study programme.

Overall, the panel members strongly appreciate MGIMO's international orientation in teaching and learning as well as the alignment of the university's study programmes and management practices with European-wide standards.

Final vote of the expert panel

1. General Recommendations

Qualification Objectives and Programmes' Structures

- The Master's thesis should be more distinctly focused on theory-based research and innovative research questions.
- The qualification profiles and curricular structures of the Bachelor's programmes in the area of Management and Commerce should become more distinct.

Infrastructure and Study Conditions

- The experts strongly recommend a closer monitoring of workload estimates at course and programme level.
- MGIMO should provide an e-learning platform for all programmes and levels to support self-directed learning by students. In addition, an intranet should be set up to ease the exchange, storage etc. of learning materials.
- MGIMO should further improve its support for incoming students by providing more information (regulations, documents, handbooks etc.) and advisory service in English. MGIMO might also introduce forms of student tutoring for non-Russian students, e.g. 'buddy programmes'.
- The experts recommend improving hands-on training facilities in computer and natural sciences.
- A reduction of the high teaching loads for faculty members, especially in the language departments, is recommended. To further improve the research activities frequent sabbaticals and international exchanges should be offered to the teaching faculty.

Practical Phases and Internships

- Information, regulations and quality assurance of obligatory or facultative internships as well as integrated practical phases in the programmes should be included in the programme handbooks. The experts recommend including obligatory, credited internships on the Bachelor's and Master's level.

Mobility, Credit Transfer and Recognition

- The experts strongly recommend developing a binding and transparent institutional policy on the recognition of credits, periods of study and degrees. The criteria and

procedures for the recognition (including nostrification of degrees) should be published online and in English. In addition, the support for incoming students should be improved by providing more information (regulations, documents, handbooks etc.) and advisory service in English.

Transparency and Public Information

- The English version of the MGIMO website should be extended to include more detailed information regarding the study programmes, the central regulations and evaluation criteria for student assessment, the institutional quality assurance policy and information on student exchange and mobility.
- A description and course catalogue in English should be generated for each study programme within this cluster. The design and content of the course catalogues should follow the recommendations of the ECTS Users' Guide as closely as possible. Each course catalogue should also include detailed information on crediting of different curricular aspects/components, a descriptions of compulsory practical placements/internships and the examination system. All course catalogues should be published on the MGIMO website.

Quality Assurance

- Course evaluations should become more differentiated and students should receive feedback on the results of course evaluations. In addition, students (and other stakeholders) should be given the chance to increasingly participate actively in all phases of the quality assurance cycle and related institutional procedures.

2. Specific Recommendations

“Environmental Science” (Bachelor’s Programme)

- MGIMO should ensure that the necessary facilities for teaching the natural sciences' segments of the programme are adequately provided. In the short term MGIMO should establish cooperation with other higher education institutions to provide adequate laboratories, fieldwork opportunities etc. In the long term such infrastructure should be located at MGIMO itself.
- The name of the programme should be reconsidered as it currently does not entirely reflect the significant curricular segments on economics and commerce. Alternative names might be Environmental Economics or Environmental Management.⁸

“Management of Military and Technical Cooperation in Hi-Tech” (Master’s Programme)

- The admission procedure and the expected entry qualifications for this programme should be made transparent (ECTS handbook).
- The curricular content should be more focused on the requirements of military-technical innovations.

⁸ Name has been changed after the report into „International Environmental Policy and Management“.

“Management of Small and Medium Enterprises” (Joint Master’s Programme)

- The Joint Programme “Management of Small and Medium Enterprises” should be re-named to display more evidently its curricular structure and content, which is only to a limited amount focused on Small and Medium Enterprises.⁹

“International Management” (Joint Master’s Programme)

- A stronger curricular emphasis on the international aspect of management is recommended (e.g. legal, economic and customer-related differences between regions and countries or intercultural awareness).

“Sustainable Development and Strategic Management in Energy” (Joint Master’s Programme)

- The qualification goals, the curricular content and the forms of teaching and learning should be more closely integrated between the two partners. The experts recommend a common supervision of the Master’s thesis.

3. Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission

The expert group recommends towards the Accreditation Commission the accreditation of the study programmes in Management, Public Administration and Environment, as offered by the School of International Business and Administration, the School of Applied Economics and Commerce, the International Institute of Administration, the School of Business and International Proficiency, the International Institute of Energy Policy and Diplomacy (MIEP), and the Master’s Programme Department of MGIMO for the accreditation period of five years.

⁹ Now renamed into „MIEX Master in International Management“.